

ABSTRACT

AN EVALUATION OF THE RESEARCHES DONE BY THE ACADEMIES FOR RURAL DEVELOPMENT IN PAKISTAN

by S. M. Anwer

This study had for its purpose a critical examination of the researches conducted and published by the two Academies for Rural Development in Pakistan.

The fact that social research has to play a major role in the development of a country has come to be realized lately in Pakistan. As a result, in recent years in Pakistan a number of agencies of social research have come into existence, both within and outside of government. Although precise historical information about the origin and growth of such research is lost in oblivion the facts bear testimony that much of it is related directly to the problems of development, specially to rural development.

Though research in rural development is attempted by more than one agency in Pakistan, the main responsibility of such research lies with the two Academies for Rural Development, which are engaged very heavily in rural research. Like other research agencies in the country the Academies have not yet turned their attention to an evaluation of their research programs. The writer of the present thesis assumes that in absence of such a self-criticism and introspection the research activities of the Academies are lacking direction, coordination and consensus in approach. He further believes that there is a dire need of evaluating at least these researches

which form the backbone of the main body of rural sociological research in Pakistan. It was with these assumptions that a critique, particularly from the point of view of methodology, of all the research publications of both East and West Pakistan Academies was undertaken.

The value of an evaluation such as this, in the judgment of the author of the thesis, lies in the fact that it provides an opportunity of comparing the prescribed and achieved goals of research by these institutions. Such an evaluation may also set standards for better analysis of the problems in future in addition to spelling out the strong and weak points of the present material.

The method used for making this critique consists of content analysis of all the "Research" and "Technical" publications of the two Academies. The main focus of investigation, however, has been an examination of the circumstances which led to the particular types of research produced by the two institutions. Some of the steps followed in the study involve tracing a brief history of research in the Academies, a very brief review of some of the selected studies with an intention to give the readers a taste of contents and design of inquiry in the reports in the sample, and a critical examination of the methods employed by these studies in light of the basic tenets of methodology of social sciences.

Summarizing the examination a case has been made to improve upon some of the shortcomings which have been discovered during the course of evaluation. Some of the most prominent shortcomings which have been discovered are in the areas of characteristics and the treatment of the data. Recommendations and suggestions have been made for their improvement.

AN EVALUATION OF THE RESEARCHES
DONE BY THE ACADEMIES FOR RURAL DEVELOPMENT
IN PAKISTAN

By
S. M. Anwer

A THESIS

Submitted to
Michigan State University
in partial fulfillment of the requirements
for the degree of

MASTER OF ARTS

Department of Sociology and Anthropology

1964

21777
1-29-65

ACKNOWLEDGMENT

The author should like to express his deep sense of gratitude to all who helped him to make this study possible. He, however, especially wishes to acknowledge indebtedness to his major professor, Dr. Edgar A. Schuler, whose ready acceptance of the topic for research, and enthusiastic support, guidance and encouragement at every step led to the completion of study in time. Sincere thanks are also due to other members of the committee, namely Drs. Duane Gibson and John Donoghue, whose support and help were invaluable.

He is also thankful to Drs. Jay W. Artis and J. Allan Beegle for their continued interest and assistance in the preparation of design for this study. The special reading course which the writer took with Dr. Artis in this connection proved to be extremely helpful for the purposes of formulation and analysis of the problem.

An especial note of thanks goes to fellow graduate students in the department with whom discussions have been most helpful in stimulating my thinking about the problem. Mr. Wise B. Joseph, my good friend, has been most helpful at every stage. I owe a great deal to him for his most useful suggestions during the revision of first and second drafts.

Finally, the writer wishes to pay tribute to Mrs. Jean Van Dousser, whose patient and accurate typing supplied morale needed for the completion of this thesis.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

CHAPTER	Page
I. INTRODUCTION	1
Background and Necessity	1
Statement of the Problem	3
Purpose and Scope.	9
Methodology.	11
II. A DISCUSSION ON HOW RESEARCH WAS INITIALLY PERCEIVED IN THE TWO ACADEMIES	15
The West Pakistan Academy.	17
The East Pakistan Academy.	27
III. REVIEW OF SELECTED STUDIES	35
IV. REVIEW OF THE METHODS APPLIED IN THE RESEARCHES. . .	53
Orientation.	54
Characteristics of the Data.	61
Treatment of Data.	68
Conclusions of the Reports	71
V. CRITIQUE AND OBSERVATIONS.	74
VI. CONCLUSIONS.	90
APPENDIX A: Bibliography	93
APPENDIX B: Tables	97
APPENDIX C: List of Publications Reviewed.	102

CHAPTER I

INTRODUCTION

Background and Necessity

Histories of human thought and culture offer abundant evidence that throughout ages, mankind has been conscious about the perplexities of life and has searched for the answers to his myriad questions. Various ways of finding the answers are noted. These include accidental discoveries, occasional explorations, recurrence of events or mere speculation. With the advancement of civilization we find that specialization in observation and interpretation increased, and many concepts were developed and redefined.

A vigorous development, advancement and expansion of science in the past five hundred years is, however, related to industrial development. This can be held more for physical sciences; but the economic political and social needs in the form of industrial development, wars and many political and social reforms have given rise to an ever increasing demand for more sophisticated and useful means of prediction and control of social phenomena. While the social sciences are comparatively young and are often accused of lagging behind their physical counterparts, the accumulating literature since World War II bears testimony to the fact that tremendous strides have been made by this baby to establish herself as a young adult.

The world today is divided into developed and developing nations strictly from the point of view of science and technology. The developing nations have rich cultural heritage with force of tradition as a predominant factor in their socio-economic relationship with development. The nations

which are more technologically advanced, on the other hand, usually have fewer bonds with traditions or customs. In modern times development has become a joint enterprise, between the developing and developed nations, which involves a tremendous exchange of culture and technology.

Development in socio-cultural context of developing nations in Southern Asia has many dimensions. While material advancement in terms of increase in per capita income or raised standard of living becomes the primary objective of development, non-material advancement in terms of change in value orientations, attitudes and patterns of behavior of people is no less significant to the process of development. Under such circumstances development does not involve acceptance of only technology and mechanical means of speedy progress, but also requires institutional norms of efficiency and ethics of responsibility to make it brighter. It is at this stage that the role of social research in terms of gathering social facts, predicting and controlling social behavior becomes more important.

People at large living in rural communities are not concerned with economic motives and incentives alone. They have attachment and bonds with the traditional values, and are not easily accessible to change. Value orientation, attitudes, traditionalism, fatalism, etc., become factors which come in their way to accept change. This, therefore, becomes the second place where the role of social sciences and social research becomes important for the understanding of people and their institutions, their sensitivities and hesitancy, their fears and aspirations. This knowledge also helps in drawing and implementing more realistic plans of development.

Statement of the Problem

Such a realization of application of social science to human needs prompts great awareness in many nations that social research ought to play a major role in the development of a country. This is a sign of promise, but it also throws many challenges to the students of social science who are often asked to offer guide lines to the solutions of human problems. The methodology of social science has developed through a whole series of experiments, errors and corrections; but it has yet to go a long way to attain maturity and perfection. Many of the conclusions drawn by social researchers are still questioned because their validity and scientific methodology are still far from being sound enough to enable the prediction of behavior.

In recent years in Pakistan a number of agencies of social research have come into existence both within and outside of government. They are engaged in applied social research related to development. Most of them have sanctions and codes of reference from a broader National Plan; but there are some which are guided by the needs of their areas of discipline. Research in Public Administration, Social Welfare, for example, are motivated by the growth and development of these disciplines in the changing social order of the time. The field of rural development, though old enough to establish itself as a movement in the Indo-Pakistan sub-continent, lacked sufficiently in objective fact finding and scientific generalization till quite late. Consequently, rural social research is only very young in its development in Pakistan.

If we try to trace a brief history of such research, we might discover that even in United States, which is the main source of

parentage of such work in Pakistan, such a specialization is not very old. In U.S.A. the first funds made available for rural sociological research were paid to state colleges of agriculture under Purnell Act in 1924.¹ About a half century has gone by since this organized effort to study rural problems systematically was begun. Since then rural sociological research has gained sufficient momentum. To quote only one of the many authors on the subject, "...all told up to 1956 more than one thousand known rural social studies have appeared both in print and/or in restricted circulation."² This growing mass of data requires a constant bookkeeping and checking so as to note what has been added to the latest. Various attempts have been made to review this ever increasing information. Edmund Brunner, for example, in his book Growth of a Science has reviewed the growth of rural research in United States in the first fifty years of the century.³ T. Lynn Smith is another scholar who in 1957 provided a brief but excellent review of rise, development and trends of rural sociology and its research in U.S.A. and Canada.⁴

¹Brunner, E. S. The Growth of a Science, New York, Harper and Row, 1957, p. iii.

²Ibid, p. vii.

³Brunner, E. S. The Growth of a Science, Harper and Row, New York, 1957.

⁴T. Lynn Smith "Rural Sociology: A Trend Report and Bibliography," Rural Sociology, Vol. XXIV, 1959, pp. 1-10.

Olaf F. Larson of Cornell University improved upon all of these in 1959 and summarized various reviews which had come out till that time in addition to laying down what he calls "solid and substantial achievements of rural sociology" in his paper titled, Role of Rural Sociology in a Changing Society. Among some of the writers of thirties and early forties who tried to make the record of American rural research up to date, names of C. C. Taylor, C. E. Lively, Robin M. Williams, Lowrey Nelson and A. R. Mangus appear prominent on the scene.⁵

Mostly these reviews tried to do only a kind of stock-taking in checking what has been added in the field at the time of review. Only a very few of them, if any, attempted to determine the direction or destination of these studies. There came, however, a stage in the history of rural sociology in United States when such a realization of the need to know of this direction and goal started emerging. Recognizing this the Rural Sociological Society of America at its annual meeting in December 1948 passed a resolution empowering its Executive Committee to set up a sub-committee of fifteen members "...to appraise the whole field of rural sociology over two or more years and make recommendations for its more orderly and systematic development."⁶ The task which this sub-committee set for itself was a critical examination of rural sociological research as a whole. For some time the appraisal remained to be more general rather than being concerted on one particular aspect of research. Near the middle of 1950, a review along with the

⁵Larson, Olaf F. "The Role of Rural Sociology in a Changing Society," Rural Sociology, Vol. XXIV, 1959, pp. 1-10.

⁶Sewell, W. H. "Needed Research in Rural Sociology," Rural Sociology, Vol. XXV, 1950, p. 115.

critical evaluation of this committee's efforts was presented by Professor W. H. Sewell. This presentation was put to further criticism by Professor Raymon Sletto and Kingsley Davis. This set a stage for a constant vigilance and examination over and over of the shape the body of rural sociology, specially its research, was taking. As a result by 1951 we see Rural Sociological Society as a whole engaging itself in a critical examination of rural social research in United States, and its Research Committee beginning to concentrate on methodological appraisal of such research in rural sociology.⁷ The first attempt in this direction is reported in a paper by Taves and Gross which purports to examine critically research published in Journal of Rural Sociology. Since this was only a beginning, the sample was arbitrarily confined to research published only in 1950. Though modest, the scope of the sample covered about twenty-six studies.

The standard and criterion developed and utilized in this paper dealt namely with the orientation of the studies and the treatment of the data. Being a brief critique the analysis did not go into the details of methodological considerations. In the end the paper summarized some of the prominent shortcomings of the research reports as measured by the criteria utilized.

Since after the publication of this critique the trends of rural sociology have changed once again. The focus of research in the field shifted from evaluation and assessment to more elaborate investigation into specific problems. The interests of rural sociologist began to be focused on those areas of research which remained manifest and unexploited

⁷Taves, M. G. and Gross, Neal "A Critique of Rural Sociology Research 1950." Rural Sociology, Vol. XVII, 1952, p. 102.

in the past. As a result the emphasis on the proper examination of the efforts got lost into the researchers' ambitions to explore novel and specific problems.

The situation in Pakistan is not very different. Since its independence and formation as a nation state in 1947, and because of trans-national emphasis on economic and rural development, research in rural sociology seems to have developed concomitantly with the country. Though the rural reconstruction movement in undivided India was started formally in 1930's, the study of rural life in the sub-continent can be traced to even beyond that period. As a matter of fact the origin of such studies goes back to the descriptive social and anthropological studies and travel accounts by European scholars and civil servants in the nineteenth and beginning of this century. The pioneering efforts of such an analysis can be traced to Main's Comparative Study of East and West Communities undertaken to establish the evolution of patriarchal family in 1872. Then there are a whole series of reportings on villages including those of Panidan (1897), Darling (1925), Wieser and Ganguli (1935) and Pittman (1937). F. L. Brayne's Better Villages (1937) and Norman Walker's Indian Village Health are probably the latest among these pioneering efforts.⁸

This pioneering era is characterized with works which were not specifically confined to one village or two, but rather to general rural life. From 1951, with the beginning of rural community development

⁸The sources and years have been quoted here from an unpublished paper titled "Rural Sociological Development in Asia" by Mohammad Fayaz of Cornell University, 1961.

programs, the trend reversed from general to specific and a number of socio-economic and social surveys of conditions of villages and their people were produced. Examples of such work are publications of Boards of Economic Inquiry of the Universities of the Punjab and Peshawar, Social Science Research Center of University of Punjab and departments of various universities in the country. Although much of the information about the growth and development of this research is lost in oblivion, there is sufficient evidence to show that since after its initial inception the activity gained sufficient momentum. Today we find a much larger number of studies conducted under the rubric of rural development than they were about ten years before.

Recently a beginning has been made of more systematic and scientific studies explaining sociological, political and economic aspects of rural people. John Honingman's Three Pakistan Villages (1958), Walter Solocom's Village Life in Lahore District, Akhtar's Village Life in Lahore District and Egler's A Punjabi Village in Pakistan are examples of sophisticated sociological and anthropological inquiries. In addition, a good number of research publications from the two Academies for Rural Development contributed to a great extent to general body of rural sociological research in this country. This ever increasing mass of data, though useful, lacks coordination, direction and consensus in approach for want of an adequate bookkeeping. Hardly any attempt has been made in the past to evaluate or assess these efforts of inquiry and generalization. Such a situation may be satisfactory but is not very optimistic. Because of lack of direction and coordinated integration of information, there are gaps to be filled and spaces to be bridged.

Purpose and Scope

The task of reducing this very considerable mass of rural research information into an ordered body of systematic and integrated knowledge has been a major problem since the very beginning. In view of this a provision was made in the First Five Year Plan of Government of Pakistan for the establishment of a Council for Research in Social Sciences. The functions of this Council have been mentioned in the Second Plan which says, "The Council should have as its purpose the advancement of a broad research program in social science and assistance to the Government in the application of results of research to problems of development." The plan further states "...the progressing and evaluation of agrarian reform require the support of continuing research on some of the basic problems. Studies for the social impact of technical change will provide the basis for measures to prevent the development of social tensions."⁹ The proposed Council never came into being, but by suggesting the establishment of a Council such as this the First Five Year Plan gave clear indications of the areas in which social research was needed. In view of the changes taking place in social, economic, political or cultural spheres of our national life, it is important that our social scientists appreciate the significance of problems arising out of these changes. In doing this they will probably have to act apriori of the demands of time in Pakistan. Problem solving and practical utility will probably be the guiding principles for such efforts for quite some time to come; but to maintain neutrality, objectivity and unbiased examination of evidence some means of evaluation will have to be applied occasionally.

⁹Government of Pakistan: The Second Five Year Plan, Government of Pakistan Press, Karachi, 1960, pp. 120-121.

The proposed Council of Research in Social Sciences never came into being, but the very idea of creating such a council suggested the need of some kind of stock taking of efforts in rural research in the country. In spite of this awareness for a long time now, as far as the knowledge of the student goes there is no record of any such evaluation. If the rural research is to devote itself to the scientific study of rural life in Pakistan it will probably have to evaluate itself through a process of periodic introspection and self-criticism. Such a process may involve both long and short term plans of critical research, but it seems that a stage has arrived where such an evaluation is an immediate and imperative need.

As also pointed out earlier, though research in rural development has been attempted by many agencies in Pakistan, the main brunt of the burden is borne by the two Academies for Rural Development. These Academies, established in 1959, are primarily training and research institutions engaged very heavily in rural research.¹⁰ Conducted by trained specialists, their research is high both in quality and quantity. These studies represent a wide spectrum of problems which can scientifically be studied and solved. Like other research agencies in the country, the Academies have not yet turned their attention to an evaluation of their research program. The present writer being a member of the research team of one of the Academies is conscious of the pitfalls arising out of this lack of evaluation and feels that there is a dire need of evaluating these research which form the backbone of the

¹⁰For a brief history of the Academies and research therein see Chapter II.

main body of rural sociological research in Pakistan. Such an evaluation may set standards for a better analysis in the future, in addition to spelling out the strong and weak points of the present material. The value of an evaluation study such as this also lies in the fact that it provides an opportunity of comparing the prescribed and achieved goals of research in these institutions. In addition, it is believed that this will also provide an academic exercise in critical and evaluative research to the student.

Briefly, in the judgment of the student, the value of such a study lies in:

1. making an appraisal of the nature, quality and direction of research conducted by the two Academies for Rural Development in Pakistan;
2. setting standards for better analysis and research efforts in the future;
3. comparing the prescribed and achieved goals of research conducted by these institutions;
4. helping to establish some kind of relationship between the abstract conceptual level and the grass root level of research operations in situations such as those in which the two Academies are conducting their research; and
5. helping to measure the validity of assumptions and expectations held by those who are responsible for initiating research, under particular circumstances.

Methodology

The methodology of this evaluation involves the content analysis of research reports, monographs, case studies, etc. The focus of the analysis, briefly, would be an examination of the circumstances which led to the particular types of research produced in the two Academies. Also, the relevance of theoretical and applied aspects of research under

the stated objectives of the two Academies will be investigated. Under this preview, the consideration of the validity or invalidity of the methodological approach also becomes important; and a review of the research methods applied in these researchers will, therefore, form a sizeable part of the analysis. Apparently the accepted view is that there should be a logical relationship between the abstract or conceptual level of research operations, and the grass root level of expectations of those who are directly or indirectly asking questions. Based on this assumption, the study also proposes to look into the possible differentials or possible congruence between the objectives and achievement of these research.

For determining as to what falls under the category of research reports, monographs or case studies the criterion chosen by the two Academies is followed. All the publications which have been classified as "Research Publications" in the case of West Pakistan Academy and "Technical Publications" in the case of East Pakistan Academy have been included for analysis. In the latter case the research activity has certain other dimensions as well, which are not reported under the title "Technical Publications." Examples of such research will be found in various subject matter reports such as Annual Reports of Cooperatives, Rural Works Program and Family Planning reports. These have not been included in the sample. Yet other reports not included are the articles based on field projects and published in the Academy Journal. This delineation is deliberate. Because of the limitation of time we preferred to confine the evaluation to only those publications

which represent Academies' research categorically. The present attempt is only a modest beginning which is limited to primarily setting a pattern for future efforts.

Some of the stages followed in the analysis can be summarized as under:

First, an attempt has been made to trace the history of research in the two Academies. In so doing various government and non-government documents pertaining to evolution of research in the Academies have been reviewed. Information on this history has also been collected through the responses to a mailed question sent to the Directors and selected faculty members of the Academies. In addition, such information has also been gathered through personal interviews with those Michigan State University staff members who were associated with the two Academies' program at various times.

Second, some of the selected studies have been reviewed briefly. Such a review is intended to give the readers a taste of the contents and designs of inquiry in the reports in the sample.

Third, an attempt has been made to examine the methodology employed in the studies undertaken by the Academies. A critical analysis of the methods in light of the basic tenets of methodology in social research has given a basis for evaluation. This included the examination of hypothesis formulation, rationale for it, the circumstances which gave perception for the type of hypotheses, the methods used to draw the sample and the techniques of launching upon the research and the interpretation.

Finally, summarizing the examination, a case has been made to improve upon some of the short-comings of these studies and suggestions have been made for these improvements.

CHAPTER II

A DISCUSSION ON HOW RESEARCH WAS INITIALLY PERCEIVED AND DEVELOPED IN THE ACADEMIES

Sometime in 1955 Choudhri Mohammad Ali, then the Prime Minister of Pakistan and Dr. George F. Gant, then the Ford Foundation Representative in Pakistan initiated a discussion which led to the establishment of two Pakistan Academies for Village Development four years later.¹ The first step taken after the initial discussions towards the implementation of the idea was to request a team of foreign scholars to help the Government of Pakistan shape the plan. As a consequence of this request a team of professors from Michigan State University visited Pakistan in 1956. The task which was set for this team was to advise the Government of Pakistan and the Ford Foundation on the establishment of training institutions for officials directly or indirectly concerned with rural development.² After making exhaustive tours of various locations, and consulting numerous key persons in the country, the team recommended setting up two such institutions, one for each wing of the country. The main recommendations of this team which were accepted in principle and to a large extent also in working details were:

¹Gant, George F. "The Ford Foundation in Pakistan quoted in Edgar A. Schuler Increasing Competence in Educational Institutional Building Through Cross Cultural Cooperation (unpublished paper, MSU, 1963, p. 37).

²Government of Pakistan: Scheme for Pakistan Academies for Village Development. Unpublished document, Karachi, 1956, p. 1.

"...The Government of Pakistan vide their orders dated July 4, 1957 have approved a scheme for establishing two Pakistan Academies for Village Development to conduct research and provide advance training for the administrative and supervisory personnel of Village AID* administration and for other Nation Building Departments as well as for CSP and PCS officers."**3

After initial training and orientation of the faculty for about one year the two Academies started their operation in the latter part of 1959. From the very beginning the recognition of the fact that research has to play a vital role in the operations and development of the Academies remained uppermost in the minds of the executors of the plan. Going over the recommendations of Michigan State University experts, and the finally accepted government resolution we notice that research was categorized as one of the primary objectives by both of these charters and codes of reference. But such questions as "what direction should research take in Academies" or "how it should be organized and implemented" could not be answered without painstaking experimentation and planning, and as such the pattern of research which was required emerged very slowly.

In spite of the fact that both of the Academies regarded research essentially as an integral part of the training, because:

1. The training was problem oriented and listing of problems preceding the training gave a local substance to it.
2. An integrated approach had to be developed for purposes of teaching, and coordination of activities between different departments. This could be achieved only through a continued process of research and documentation of facts.

*Village AID denotes Village Agricultural and Industrial Development.

**CSP and PCS denotes Civil Service of Pakistan and Provincial Civil Service respectively. These are the top two executive services in the country.

³The Director. First Annual Report, Pakistan Academy for Village Development, Peshawar, 1960, p. 21.

3. The discussion in classroom contained a wealth of personal experiences of participants that was to be utilized by faculty through scientific appraisal.
4. Information collected at village level provided insight in rural problems for the instructors in giving them an opportunity to verify textbook theories in the light of indigenous facts.

A difference in approach is evidenced in both scope and direction and the manner of implementation of research plans in the two Academies from the very beginning. This is mainly because of different priorities chosen by each of them. The selection of significance, and scope of the problems depended a great deal upon the circumstantial variables in each Academy; and as a result we find research activities in each of the two Academies taking two different slants even from their initial start. The broad themes conceived by the West Pakistan Academy as starting points appear to be at cross roads with those which were conceived by East Pakistan Academy. In the following, the discussion tries to trace, briefly, the evolution of research operations separately for each of them.

THE WEST PAKISTAN ACADEMY

The Academy in West Pakistan (at Peshawar) happened to be located against a background of cultural heterogeneity and physical diversities. The clientele which it had to feed came from all the four regions (namely Sind, Baluchistan, Punjab and North West Frontier) of which the state was formed. Each one of these regions, characterized by particular physical and geographical features faced different problems, and demanded specialized rather than general treatment. The officers represented in training program from these regions brought with them questions which were typical to that particular area, and the solutions offered could

not be applied to any other region. This situation was challenging and demanded complex analysis.

In the second place the very location of the Academy at the extreme North West corner of the country also created a few difficulties. The mere fact that it was placed in a culture which is distinctively different in traditions, customs and history, from those of the rest of the country put it into a dilemma of experimenting or not experimenting in absence of a possibility of a universal generalization. This region is so rich in its cultural heritage that the task of analyzing such intangible factors as value orientation, prejudices, fatalism, factionalism, resistance to change, etc., through the use of social sciences becomes fairly complex. Any effort to scientifically examine the problem and offer solutions or guide lines does not take the social scientist too far in terms of finding answers which are applicable to other areas of Pakistan as well.

The third factor which presents some problems in terms of a steady start of the research activity in Peshawar Academy was lack of knowledge of local language. The composition of the faculty at the beginning of the program was such that it did not include a single member who knew the local language. This created a situation where the whole team was handicapped by the lack of adequate communication between the problems and their answers.

In addition to these specific difficulties, the problems inherent in the society in general, like lack of initiative and confidence on the part of common villager, or his too much dependence upon government for help, or his apprehension of government sponsored research, which he thinks is conducted in order ultimately to increase his taxes or to

sieze his yield, also played an important part in determining the early shape of research program at this Academy.

As a consequence of these circumstances, in the first year of Academy operations the research activity had to be restricted to a certain extent and most projects undertaken during earliest stage emerged without a set plan. As a matter of fact a good deal of latitude and play had to be given, at such a stage, to the imagination of instructors to make them interested in research. Two major sources of this imagination are Academy's early identification with the V-AID program and the training of faculty at Michigan State University. Immediately after selection, the faculty members passed about three months in the field visiting different Village AID areas, before proceeding for training abroad. During these visits the problems which V-AID faced those days were analyzed by all the faculty members in a desultory manner. To most of them this was the first exposure which acquainted them with the nature and extent of problems of rural areas. This also set their thinking for scientific fact finding and objective observation, and although they did not get an opportunity to put their ideas to test immediately, this was a phase when earliest Academy research were in making.

While at Michigan State University the faculty members had two major activities; participation in faculty seminars and attendance of classes. Both of these sources provided them with opportunity for thinking more about the problems which were fermenting in their minds as a result of their exposure to field. The seminar meetings further stimulated their thinking about the topics and designs of probable research projects. The classes, on the other hand, gave good exercise in formulation of the problems and other working details. It was actually during these

exercises that the detailed designs of quite a few of research projects, which were later developed, implemented and published, were finalized.

Soon after their return the faculty members started thinking in terms of implementing these research ideas. This was the period when the foundations of a small Research Department were laid. This department, headed by a Research Specialist consisted of one Research Associate, three permanent Investigators and several temporary Investigators and Tabulators. The functions and goals of the department were drawn up as:

1. To initiate and implement research projects as an integral part of Academy training program.
2. To assist faculty members in the implementation of their individual research projects. This assistance included advice on research methodology, provision of research personnel for collecting, tabulating and analyzing data.
3. To assist the evaluation committee in evaluating all training programs carried out at the Academy.
4. To help the participants in carrying out small-group research projects.
5. To collect basic data about the local areas and to prepare and publish research monographs and reports.
6. To have a liaison on behalf of the Academy, with those agencies which are engaged in survey and research activities.

Once a code of reference was drawn in the form of goals and objectives of research department the progress of research was accelerated. The first annual report of the Academy mentions about this activity during the first year as:

"...It is gratifying indeed to note that since last four months more and more research activities are cropping up. The research section is expanding. Several sound research projects have been developed and are in the process of implementation. The research team is having more and more of autonomy in implementing research activities. Research activities, so far, have been carried out in three ways namely: (a) classroom research through assignments; (b) research in field as training exercise for the participants and (c) individual research in the field by faculty members. The last named has begun only recently."⁴

Soon a new phase of research was also introduced under the heading "Research by Participants." This was in conformity with the training philosophy of the Academy by which classroom learning was reinforced by field research. Since most of the participants in training were experienced field officers and had done considerable field work themselves it was thought that their interest in this type of work could be stimulated further only by introducing new dimension to it. This dimension could be to get them interested in research so that they begin to view their field assignments from a most scientific and objective angle. In this way they would get an opportunity of learning to use questionnaires, tabulation techniques, and preparing scientific reports. In short, in this way they could be prepared better to meet the demands of technological change.

By second year the above mentioned activities started taking a better shape, and the process of implementation of goals and objectives of the research department could be speeded up. Not only that several new projects developed, but we see a lot of new dimensions added to the three basic kinds of activities mentioned in the first year's report.

⁴Ibid, p. 39.

The Second Annual Report listed as many as six different activities as compared to three of the previous year. These were:

1. Classroom research through assignment.
2. Collection of basic material for training and other purposes.
3. Action research.
4. Individual or joint projects by faculty members.
5. Research by Academy in collaboration with other institutions.
6. Research by the participants.

The type of activities carried out under each of these headings are explained briefly in the following:

Classroom Research: The Research Department collected basic information about each group of the participants regarding the personal, social and general background, as well as their attitude towards development and training. This information gave an insight into the type of the clientele under training, and could also be utilized for continuously improving the training program. The data collected in this way also opened new areas for research in which faculty members could be involved in future. Again, in each course the participants were asked to list their problems. From this list some common problems were chosen and given back to the whole group as working assignments. These assignments proved very useful both to the participants and the faculty. Some very valuable material was collected through this method and was used as teaching material for incoming groups. A large number of case studies were prepared from such assignments.

Collection of Basic Material: Under this assignment the research department collected basic data about the country, district, or tehsil and

passed it on to the faculty for use in teaching. A beginning was made by collecting basic information about a number of selected villages around Peshawar city. The objective of collecting such information was thought to be many fold. For instance, it:

1. became the basis for building up reliable data about villages;
2. provided an opportunity to the Academy staff and participants for making personal contact with the local communities; and
3. served as guide to participants in techniques of collecting basic data, often needed by them.

In this connection, during second year the Research Department collected basic information pertaining to Nowshera Tehsil⁵ of Peshawar district. The intention was to have full information about the entire district, but the target could not be met.

Action Research: Mere collection of data was not considered sufficient for an active research program. Consequently, the Academy also embarked upon a program of action research in some villages in the vicinity of this Academy. The intention was to study different aspects of village life while it was being developed by government departments in collaboration with the Academy. For the first year of this program, one village was selected in the neighborhood of the Academy where such an action was launched. Through this a number of group of participants were enabled to examine the efforts which were being made by different government departments to develop rural areas.

⁵A tehsil is the smallest unit of administration in a district. Nowshera Tehsil is one of the three tehsils which form Peshawar District.

Individual of Joint Research Projects by Faculty Members

The tempo of faculty interest in individual and joint research projects accelerated during this period, and we find a fairly impressive list of completed research projects by the end of second year. There were two major categories of research carried out by faculty, the research reports and research monographs. Combining both of these there were twelve research projects completed and published during the year, in addition to nine such projects which were in hand.

Research in Collaboration with Other Agencies: Research is not an isolated activity. It is a vast field in which different agencies, research centers and universities play a vital role. While the Academy made its contribution in this field, it also realized that it must also benefit from the experiences of the others. With this background Research Department also undertook to initiate joint research projects in collaboration with other agencies. Some of the first agencies to share this experience with Academy were Board of Economic Inquiry, Peshawar University and UNESCO's Research Center in Delhi (India).

Research by Participants: As mentioned above, the training philosophy of the Academy demanded a closer relationship between the classroom learning and exposure of participants to field situations. This demand was met by introducing a new teaching technique. According to this all the participants of longer training courses had to do survey research on problems in which they were interested, under the guidance and advice of one faculty member. This practice provided the participants with an opportunity not only of learning techniques of designing questionnaires, collecting data, tabulating it and preparing reports, but also of developing a scientific and objective outlook which is so necessary for their jobs.

Having overcome some of the initial difficulties and physical handicaps the research activities gained further progress, and the Research Department started working with an added zest. Its position as a servicing agency to the faculty as a whole and to the instructors individually began to be appreciated, though gradually. Putting all the different kinds of research activities together, more and more research publications started coming out. In order to standardize the publications a definite policy along with detailed procedures was laid down, and we see that by about the end of the third year of Academy's operation the research publications started falling into set categories. The four major categories were: (1) Research Reports; (2) Research Monographs; (3) Case Studies; and (4) Research Practicals. A review of lists of completed and in hand research projects by the end of 1962 offer evidence to show that a substantial progress had been made both in quantity and quality of Academy's research. In all there were eighteen projects which were completed and published, in addition to eleven projects which were still in hand.⁶ The eighteen projects completed during the year can be classified as follows according to the set categories:

Research Reports	=	5
Research Monographs	=	9
Case Studies	=	2
Research Practicals	=	2

⁶These were at different stages of completion which ranged from collection of field data to revision of first or second draft.

In the areas of action research and research in collaboration with other agencies, the Academy also made steady progress. Starting from working in one selected village to accumulate direct empirical knowledge about village life, such program expanded to more villages and action research projects were started in two more villages during the third year. Similarly more research projects were initiated in collaboration with other research agencies. This was with the Bureau of National Reconstruction, Government of Pakistan with whom the Academy joined hands to study the functions of union, tehsil and district councils in a district.

Going over the performance of the Academy in respect to its research activity the first three years proved to be most striving and dynamic in terms of setting policies for its research. These years saw both enthusiasm and disappointments, ambitions and hesitations, and successes and failures. But before it could finally settle all its problems, this research activity in the Academy started losing its initial fervor. A stage had been reached in the functioning of this institution when its research activity remained almost static. In fact it was on the low side as compared to that of previous years. The initial spurt of enthusiasm yielded place to certain amount of questioning as "to why research" and "for what." There was more than one reason for this. These reasons will be discussed in Chapters IV and V in connection with the analysis of reasons for lack of congruence between the prescribed and achieved goals of research in the Academy, but the fact remains that the overall progress of research did not show signs of improvement. The total number of research projects completed and published remained

eighteen (just the same as of previous year) but the projects in hand rather showed a decline. There were only six projects in hand as compared to nine of the last year. There is no doubt, though, that with more maturity and passage of time the research results improved in sophistication and perfection. Through dogged perseverance and errors the researchers learned to conduct inquiries which won approbation of many foreign agencies.⁷ This is a very optimistic sign and gives a lot of courage to the promising researchers in the Academy who have yet to learn a great deal to master the trade.

THE EAST PAKISTAN ACADEMY

Research in East Pakistan Academy (at Comilla) from its very start was action oriented, although action started after initial exploratory research. The impetus to a steady start in terms of such an action program was gained through a number of sources. Foremost among them was probably the leadership and emphasis given to this activity by the Director and the faculty members respectively. Majority of the faculty members looked at their jobs as research oriented. Nearly all of the instructors, at their return home, realized the dearth of basic facts and information needed for starting a challenging training program. The wide range of experience and knowledge which they had of East Pakistan villagers was mostly based on non-professional observation and secondary sources. Such a situation could hardly be relied upon;

⁷For details see various issues of "Newsletters" of the Academy which record the compliments and appreciation of many scholars representing various agencies.

and very soon the faculty as a whole recognized the fact that if it had to offer a training which is practical, illustrative and effective it should better be based upon facts directly drawn from the field it was to serve. Founded on such a notion, from the very beginning the research in this Academy tried to cover as many relevant aspects of rural development as possible. During the first year individual instructors undertook mostly those projects which enriched their understanding of the villagers' problems, e.g., methods of improved agriculture, etc., and we find projects such as "Study of Village Factions," "Morale of Village Workers," and "Economic Study of Selected Farm Areas" initiated by social psychologist, sociologist, rural economists, etc., respectively. Similarly instructors in Public Administration undertook to work with and study Union Councils,⁸ and instructors in Education and Community Organization with schools, youth clubs and adult centers. The results of these inquiries proved to be more exploratory and a means for future thought and inquiry, rather than being end in themselves. They stimulated further thinking which led to subsequent research and action. One step led to the other and these research practically bred new problems.

The second factor to which the development and progress of action research owes a lot was the leadership which it got from the Director and the encouragement and support given by the Michigan State University advisors. The insight of the Director into the local problems, their extent and magnitude blended with the academic and research experience

⁸Union Council is the lowest most tier of the local government system called Basic Democracies. It is at the village level and is completely an elected body.

of the Michigan State University advisors attached with the Academy at that time built a solid ground for the type of research which was produced in the following years.

The Director of the Academy who combines rare qualities of dedication and productivity had served East Bengal (specially Comilla area) as government officer and as educator from 1950 to the present time in many kinds of roles (senior government administrator, teacher, college principal, village development administrator, etc.) had earned the confidence, trust and love of the local people.⁹ Working and living with them he shared their joys and sorrows, sweats and labors, thus feeling how they felt and appreciating what they needed. This gave him an insight into the problems which very few administrators from outside could have gained. On the other hand being once a member of the coveted Indian Civil Service his close ties with some of the most senior officers of the Government of Pakistan placed him in a situation where his practical ingenuity won him much high level support. Being in such a position, even from the earliest start he gave a new shape to the Academy program by adding an additional dimension of "extension" to it. Talking about it in the First Annual Report he says:

"Teaching and research were assigned to us in the original scheme. In our first year we added another dimension to the Academy, viz, extension work in the development area around us, the Comilla Thana, which we regard as our demonstration plot, our laboratory, our experimental station. By working close with village groups the instructors have acquired first hand knowledge of rural

⁹For a short but most lucid account of the Director's biography see Schuler, E. The Ford Foundation, Pakistan Project of Michigan State University: The Pakistan Academies for Village Development. Unpublished paper, Michigan State University, 1964, pp. 42-46.

problems and have endeavored to discover effective solutions. This has made their teaching realistic and has provided an incentive for further research. We began in October 1959 by associating ourselves with Comilla Thana V-AID area, and in February 1960 it was specially allocated to us for experimental planning."¹⁰

These statements give indication as to how the concept of an extension program coupled with the idea of demonstration or experimental planning gave new direction to the Academy research activity which became more and more deeply involved with village to meet the primary need of training. The first research project was started by the Research Section in September, 1959 and was completed in April, 1960. In addition to this two more reports on cost analysis were also completed during the year. Other significant efforts by the Research Section during the first year included a few smaller surveys, for example, enumeration of wheat and potato growers or survey of cottage industries in the thana.

As expected these exploratory surveys established contacts with the leading sections of rural society, in addition to studying their views and attitudes. In this connection the officers who came for training often times served as informants. They were interviewed individually by the instructors and case histories were completed. Talks and discussions were summarized and along with case histories they provided a living picture of the village groups and the rural setting. Based on these discussions various reports were published. Twelve non-technical reports were published only during the first year. As closer contacts between the Academy and villages developed, need for training was more important

¹⁰The Director, The Second Annual Report, Academy for Village Development, Comilla, 1961, p. 17.

to the Academy program, because the faculty discovered with greater clarity that the essence of development administration is the transformation of an officer into a change agent who is fully conversant with the problems of the area which he intends to change. The Director's view from the beginning, as some of his close associates think, was that the officer must become a teacher, a group worker, and a coordinator. Both he and the faculty through experience came to see more clearly and precisely what this role could consist of. Actually, Director and the staff in a way began a realistic role-playing operation in the laboratory area--actually discovering what the change agent is up against, through his own efforts to introduce change. The basic problem the agent faces is that of improvement of agriculture and inadequate food supply.

Guided by these principles the scope and significance of research became clearer in the overall program of the Academy. By the second year we see that the themes which were till now conceived rather broadly started fitting into more structured patterns of action and research. The problems explored through small surveys gave clues to the priorities for the work to be followed up in the coming years. By this exposure and orientation with the local problems the faculty members were provided with further insight for selecting and concentrating their research endeavors on particular areas. The areas selected by them for further investigation during the second and third year can be summarized as:

1. Adoption of improved methods of agriculture and farm planning.
2. Economics of cottage industries.
3. Economics of social effects of the use of tractors and pumps.

4. The fostering of cooperative organization.
5. Adoption of family planning programs in some villages.
6. Working of Basic Democracy Councils.
7. General socio-economic studies of selected villages.
8. Progress of adult literacy.

In the meanwhile, the ideas which had struck the faculty in the beginning continued to be pursued and the number of completed research projects accumulated to a respectable figure. There were seven projects which were completed and published as separate "technical publications" in addition to seven incompleted research projects and several articles published in the Academy Journal based on the instructors' experiences of field projects.

With the passage of more time and with more experience greater emphasis came to be placed on research whereby findings were aimed at producing and measuring social change. The research projects undertaken during the third year clearly point in the direction of this trend. In general, most of them concentrated on the study of socio-economic features of village life. Under this preview the research efforts during the third year appear to assume even a more action-oriented role, if this was possible, than ever before. Most of the completed studies either surveyed the existing nature of the problem in a particular area or made studies of the attitude of people towards these problems. Through these surveys the researchers tried to study the process of change. The Third Annual Report classified research activities during the year into three main categories. They are:

1. Completed Research Projects

- a. Published as separate research monographs. There were seven monographs published during the year.
- b. Published as brief reports in the Journal of the Academy. The number of these reports was five.
- c. Reports ready for publication. There were four such reports awaiting publication.
- d. Articles published outside the Academy. They were four.

2. Research Projects in Progress

The Annual Report lists ten such projects.

3. Research in Collaboration with Outside Agencies

Because of its constant flow of research publications the Academy attracted many Pakistan and foreign scholars. Their relationship gradually developed into intimacy and closeness, leading in some cases to collaboration in research. From among the Pakistani agencies the Bureau of National Reconstruction Dacca, Bureau of Economic Research University of Dacca and Institute of Development Economics Karachi were the first few to extend a hand of collaboration.

Among the foreign agencies the Pakistan-Ford Foundation Project at Michigan State University was the closest collaborator.

Even though focus continued to follow the same pattern of experimentation and demonstration, the quality of research improved a great deal. In one sense the year 1962-63 (which is the latest under review) had been a year of intense activity in the field of research and evaluation. This was a stage when the potentials of the Academy's research gave promise to many academicians. Professor McColly of Agriculture Engineering at Michigan State University was one among many foreign scholars who studied

a particular aspect of the Academy's work.¹¹ In addition, the nature of other projects completed during the year also testify the fact that research in the Academy was maturing every year. In this connection a proposal to the U.S. Government Department of Agriculture for a five-year research project is another evidence of the confidence the Academy had gained of its ability in research.

A brief review of the stages of evolution of the process of research such as this suggests that research at the Comilla Academy may be classified as applied and pragmatic. In all the studies attempts were made to study the process of change through existing social institutions and the methods of bringing about social change. In brief, it is the dynamics and the techniques of social change that are the focus of all the research projects. There was hardly any attempt on fundamental research in the sense of contributing significant knowledge to the social sciences, but any social scientist will discover a treasure of testable hypotheses in these technical publications.

¹¹Professor McColly studied the general problem of introduction of farm mechanization in Comilla Cooperatives. In addition to this Professors H. Kumata, C. Loomis, and H. Fairchild of Michigan State University and Dr. Ashford of Advanced International Studies at John Hopkins University, U.S.A. also contributed to the Academy research. For details see Fourth Annual Report, Academy for Rural Development, Comilla, 1964, p. 23.

CHAPTER III

REVIEW OF SELECTED STUDIES

The present section is devoted to the review of a selected few of the publications of which this thesis proposes to make an evaluation. The presentation has a very limited scope: to give the readers a general view of the contents, methods, and findings of each of these publications. This may give them an idea as to what these research are like.

Only eight reports, four from each Academy, have been selected for review. The criterion for selection has been "the earliest and the latest." Thus in the case of each Academy we have selected two of the most earliest and two of the most recent publications. In the case of both West and East Pakistan Academies the serial number of these publications are sometimes confusing. Occasionally it appears that though there is little difference between the time of publication of the two reports, there is quite a significant difference between the two serial numbers. This is due to many reasons, but probably the most prominent among them is the fact that the reports got the serial numbers not in sequence of their initiation, but in sequence of their coming out of press.

In the case of West Pakistan Academy there were only two publications which came out in the year 1959-60, while in the case of East Pakistan Academy there were five which were published during the year 1959-60. Of these we selected numbers one and five arbitrarily. Similarly the selection of the recent most has also been arbitrarily to some extent in the sense that we chose any two out of three which came out in 1962-63.

The West Pakistan Academy publications also get confused in their terminology. There seems to be no definite criterion for classifying a publication into one particular category. The list of publications, which have been selected for review here also includes one latest "Research Monograph." This inclusion is done to further substantiate the point made above.

Though no comparison is meant, it will be noticed that there is a difference in perfection, maturity and sophistication between the products of two time periods. At this stage there is also no effort to make a critical analysis of these reports. The reviews in the following may appear a little sketchy, but it is hoped that they would suffice to make clear the nature of works which are discussed in the following.

The eight publications selected for review are:

1. Absenteeism among Village Aid Workers (West Pakistan Academy Research Report No. 1).
2. Administrator Reviews Rural Development (West Pakistan Academy Research Report No. 2).
3. Rural Manpower Resources (West Pakistan Academy Research Monograph No. 11).
4. Experimental Foundations of Health Education (West Pakistan Academy Research Report No. 7).
5. A Comparative Study of Improved and Country Methods of Paddy Cultivation (East Pakistan Academy Technical Publication No. 1).
6. Village Dhanishwar (East Pakistan Academy Technical Publication No. 5).
7. Basic Democracies at Grass Roots (East Pakistan Academy Technical Publication No. 13).
8. Special Report on Introducing Farm Mechanization in Comilla Cooperative Project (East Pakistan Academy Technical Publication No. 15).

These reports and monographs have been reviewed in the following in the order in which they have been listed. No preference is intended for any particular order.

1. Absenteeism Among Village Aid Workers

The Village Aid, began in 1953, was Pakistan's version of international movement of Community Development. According to Pakistan First Five Year Plan the program was "designed to solve the problems of the villagers by helping the villagers to help themselves. It aims at coordinating the total resources of the government and the people for concerted and determined effort to reconstruct village life in Pakistan." In Village Aid administration Village Aid Worker was the key figure who worked to motivate and organize the people for some creative efforts based on felt needs by mobilizing local resources and coordinating them with that of government financial and technical help. The area of his responsibility spread over about five villages. He was also supposed to be a link between the rural people and the government.

Magnitude of absenteeism from duty among these workers was often exaggerated by the supervisory staff of the department who found this as an excuse for ineffective operation of the program. On the other hand there were those who refused to accept it as a problem. Existence of such doubts necessitated the need of studying the problem scientifically. The study under present review attempts to achieve this end. The scope of this investigation is restricted to the factors related to absenteeism among workers of only Peshawar region which included seven districts. The whole region consisted of sixteen development areas.

In the words of the author himself "there existed no theoretical basis for the formulation of hypotheses...(and) as a result the concepts used in this study are entirely our own innovation." Based on such a notion the study states about seventeen hypotheses which try to establish some correlation between such factors as occupational choice and actual occupation, job satisfaction and absenteeism, absenteeism and administrative leaderships, understanding of principles and concepts of Village Aid and absenteeism, etc.

The material in the text divides itself into six major parts which deal separately with "Characteristics of the Group," "Nature of Absenteeism," "Attitude Towards Job," "Administration of Development Area," "Attitudes and Values," and "Some Characteristics as Variables." In each of these sections, the discussion is pursued under separate sub-heads. Statements, most of the time, are validated by statistical tables. There are in all about eighty-seven tables in the sixty-four page body of the report.

The section on "Nature of Absenteeism" goes in detail on the method of obtaining correct information as to how frequently a worker is absent from his duty. The nature of work of a village worker confronts the researcher with some methodological problem of finding a mechanism to get true information on the number of absences. The description, however, does a nice job of going into details of this method. This includes definition of many terms and concepts as well as description of some of the shortcomings of each of the methods suggested in this connection.

Similarly in the section on "Attitudes Towards Jobs" the discussion revolves around the workers choice of occupation, their satisfaction or dissatisfaction with the job and their perception of the public image

of Village Aid program and the role of the worker. About twenty-two tables in a span of fourteen pages illustrate the different kinds of relationships between various variables involved to explain the attitudes.

Other areas of discussion include leave policy, understanding of basic concepts of Village Aid, workers' ambitions in life, etc. There is a separate section dealing with what it calls "Some Characteristics as Variables." The five variables selected here are home attachment, background of public service, marital status, satisfaction with residential arrangements and distance between the home village and the circle.

In the end the report summarizes various findings, in addition to discussing briefly the hypotheses which were proved positively. Out of a total of seventeen stated hypotheses only seven could be proved positively; the other ten remained unproved.

The methodology of the study consisted of collecting data through an interview schedule. A random sample of 25% was drawn from among the total sixteen areas of the region. Thus four of these sixteen regions formed the universe for investigation. Most of the interviews were conducted by the two investigators of the Research Department.

2. Administrator Reviews Rural Development

One of the tasks which the West Pakistan Academy was assigned from the beginning was the reorientation of administrators towards the demands of changing social order of the country, through training. To accomplish this the Academy had to determine the kind of orientation needed for government administrators engaged in development work to enable them to improve their own speed and efficiency as well as of those with whom they had to collaborate. For this the faculty needed

guidance from those who were themselves engaged in development work. Consequently very early in their career they decided to consult those administrators who were experienced enough to know the impediments and the problems of the field. This consultation was sought through a questionnaire sent to about sixty-two such administrators. The primary objective of this inquiry was to document the view of these officers so that by using them the faculty could make its training programs realistic and effective.

"Administrator Reviews Rural Development" is a report based on the analysis of these questions. The questionnaire contained fourteen questions which were divided into three sections. The first part dealt with the nature of agencies carrying out development work in the areas of jurisdiction of the respondents and the extent of latter's own involvement in the development activities. The second part dealt with the type of relations that existed among various governmental agencies, nature of this involvement of people, qualities and attitude of persons engaged in development work and the question whether these qualities and attitudes can be inculcated through a process of training, and if so what type of training should be imparted and how. The third part dealt with the Village Aid Program, its feature and impact on the people and the role which different persons in Village Aid hierarchy should play to make the program successful.

Of the thirty-two questionnaires sent, only twenty-nine replies were received. The analysis of the data is based only on these responses. In most cases the responses have been classified and recorded verbatim and hardly any attempt is made to introduce correlation between two or more variables.

The main body of the report is classified according to the three main parts of the questionnaire; and whatever little discussion there is, is in the form of introductory or concluding remarks to the verbatim recordings of the statements.

Chapter I classifies and tabulates responses to questions one through three. The focus of the inquiry in this part has been on the "nature of development work," "administrators' involvement in the work" and "factors influencing the development enterprise." There are three simple tables in this chapter.

In Chapter II "Interdepartmental Relations and Public Participation" has been discussed under the sub-headings "Nature of Relationship," "Public Participation" and "Stimulating Participation." Once again the responses have been tabulated and recorded verbatim and no co or multiple variant analysis is used in the discussion. The remaining portion of part two of the questionnaire has been separated from Chapter II and has been incorporated as Chapter III titled "Training for Development Work." Chapters II and III thus include analysis of questions from four through eight. Counting in both the chapters there are a total of five tables, exactly equal to the number of questions under discussion.

Chapter IV, which in fact is the third part of the questionnaire, deals with the views of respondents on Village Aid and its impact on development factors, like features of Village Aid, Role of Village Aid Workers, Impact of the Program have been included for discussion.

There are three appendices. Appendix A gives a list of the respondents. Appendices B and C give copies of the letters written

in this connection and the questionnaire respectively. Including the appendices the report has sixty-seven pages.

3. Rural Manpower Resources

This short monograph is one of the two latest publications of the West Pakistan Academy selected for review in this section. In the author's own words "...in this report the attention is directed primarily to a study of rural working force--what it is, what pressures are shaping it today, and how it is related to village development."

The report is concerned with the totality of the workers in one village, whether employed or unemployed and discusses to show as to how many of them there are, what works they do, and what services they produce.

The study, which makes the contention of reporting on rural manpower resources, is based on interviews conducted by the author and two volunteer interviewers in a selected portion of the population (one third of the entire village). No mention has been made of the manner in which this sample was drawn. The section on "Methodological Considerations" discusses the scope of the study by mentioning about the place of investigation, time and manner of data collection, but never does indicate the total number of persons actually interviewed. Tabulation at other places, however, shows a total of thirty-six responses which suggest the size of the sample.

Sections following the "Theoretical and Methodological Considerations" have titles such as "Concepts and Definitions," "Structure of Families," "Employment Status of Workers," etc., which are very brief in discussion. The chapter on "Concepts and Definitions," for example, lists only eight

co

de

ha

a

su

and

to

br

ent

of

tic

"un

or "

been

some

of o

tabl

thei

thir

I

but ha

T

Appen

Appen

concepts along with a very brief definition of each. Apparently these definitions are framed by the author himself as no theoretical references have been quoted.

Similarly chapters on characteristics of workers and family size have a series of tables which do an ordinary job of simple tabulation of factors such as age range, marital status, number of children, family size, income and expenditure and extent of dependence on agriculture.

In the last six or seven pages of the report an attempt has been made to analyze whatever small amount of data has been collected through the brief questionnaire. This has been done very briefly in two chapters entitled "Analytical Considerations" and "Satisfaction and Dissatisfaction of Workers." The analysis is mostly descriptive and one finds no statistical interpretation of the findings except very general statements like "under employment exists to the extent of 52.8 per cent in this village" or "plane of the living of people is very low." Important concepts have been discussed, surprisingly, in an extremely short and brief manner--sometimes only one in paragraph.

The last chapter "Satisfaction and Dissatisfaction of Worker" consists of only one page. After a brief introduction of a few lines, a simple table showing "Workers' opinion in regard to the work they liked most for their future" has been presented which records opinion of nineteen out of thirty-six respondents.

Lastly, section on conclusion lays down about seven strongly worded but hardly precise and practical suggestions.

The whole report runs into thirty pages including two appendices. Appendix I is the specimen of the questionnaire used in the study, while Appendix II is a brief statement of the social setting of the village.

4. Experimental Foundations of Health Education

Intrigued by the widely different views on the importance of health education in a rural development program the author of this study initiated a modest experiment of action research on health education in a village near the Academy in Peshawar. The study is a report of this action program. The major research tools used were "interviews and observation." Interviews were done, according to the report, with the help of two interview schedules; one of which was used before the action and the other after the action.

There is no mention, whatsoever, of the total number of interviews conducted or number of responses recorded. The section on methodology is content to state that "all the houses which were at that time occupied by people were included in the survey." It does not even mention the population of the village or the number of houses surveyed.

The interview schedules, both of which have been reproduced as Appendices I and II consist of sixteen structured questions. Most of these have three choices to make from for a reply.

The portion which constitutes theoretical background for the study is based on researcher's own observations about the conditions in that village. This includes a description of the social setting of the village which discusses "the Village Scene," "Climatic Conditions," "Means of Communication," "Housing," and "Education."

Analysis of data is done in two parts. Part one deals with the research before action which is an elaboration of the responses to questions in the first schedule (one meant for research before action). Most of the responses are recorded in the form of simple tables which give consolidated statements of frequencies along with respective

percentages. The object of investigation at this stage was mainly to determine the relative frequency of one disease, i.e., malaria in that village. The important question was "where did malaria stand in comparison to other diseases." A number of more questions consequently emerged out as a part of the investigation. Most of the time the discussion only elaborated upon the responses without driving at any significant inferences. After going over the findings and the various tables in this section a common reader gets the impression that the village has no problem at all, or if it has any problem its people know all the solutions. The majority of the responses very conveniently fit themselves in categories such as "less frequent," "somewhat convenient," "partly," or "somewhat worthwhile."

Part II of the analysis, namely research after action apparently describes the details of the demonstration experiment.

Chapter on conclusion is rather elaborate and suggestive. It lists about twenty-five recommendations for "the organization and reorganization of health education campaigns in Pakistan."

5. A Comparative Study of Improved and Country Methods of Paddy Cultivation in Comilla

Transplanting paddy seedlings in lines, using fewer seedlings per cluster and using fertilizer are regarded as improvement over the traditional country method of paddy cultivation. Such "improved methods" adopted by some farmers of the Comilla area, in the cultivation of "Amon Paddy" in the year 1959 produced increased yield. This study is a "provisional report" on the cost profit analysis of improved and country methods of Amon paddy cultivation. The analysis is based upon a 15% sample data collected by members of Research Section of the Academy.

The method employed to gather the data consisted of collecting detailed information on farming operations, materials used, cost, etc., on each of two sets of plots through a questionnaire. During the harvesting period a random sample of forty-two plots were selected from the plots under the improved method. Yields in these forty-two plots and the corresponding forty-two plots under country methods were estimated by a crop experiment.

The analysis of data collected in this manner has been done in the report under the following scheme:

1. Comparison of plots under the improved method and plots under country method.
2. Comparison of cash expenditure incurred by farmers in various farming operations.
3. Comparison of the total value of raw material used.

Comparability of improved methods and the country methods plots deals with the plot size and distribution, elevation, and fertility of land and previous crop yield. Table I under this section shows the distribution of plot sizes in class intervals. Tables II and III show distribution of plots by elevation of land and fertility. They point out that 90% and 88% of the total plots are of medium elevation in improved method plots and in country method plots respectively.

Total yields in maunds in Aus paddy is shown in Table IV. The last column of the table which shows per acre yield indicates very negligible difference. On the basis of these analyses the author puts forth the assumption that there is no difference in the overall natural productivity of the land in improved method plots and country method plots.

The section on cash expenditure compares cost of farming operations including the costs involved in ploughing, transplanting, harvesting

and values of seeds and fertilizers used. Table V shows that in each farming operation the percentage of plots where hired laborers were used were slightly higher in the case of improved method plots than in the country method plots. The total amount of money actually spent in ploughing, transplanting and harvesting is tabulated in Table VI.

In the summary the report briefly discusses differences in variety of paddy, yield, and economic gains.

Appendices contain two graphs and eleven tables.

6. Village Dhanishwar

The publication as the main title suggests is the case study of a village in Comilla Development Area. As such the study goes in detail to comprehend, and in some sense observe the relationship of the people to their land with some historical depth. The first part of the study which consists of three chapters and comprises of half of the main body of the report is exclusively devoted to tracing the history of the village from the sixteenth century. The second main part deals with the analysis of opinion of the villagers regarding their attitude towards agriculture improvement, interest of the present day youth in cultivation, children's future, joint family system, and land litigation.

The first part after dealing with the purpose of the study, method of inquiry and timing of the survey in an introductory section, goes in detail to make a resume of land system in Bengal with special reference to village Dhanishwar. In so doing it discusses the land system in the area at various times together with the revenue and political histories of the land from the time when famous revenue toll of Todar Mall was applied.

Er

be

su

Er

ps

on

in

l:

T

A

S

s

t

t

c

l

Todar Mall's great settlement of the revenues of Bengal, Behar and Orissa have been quoted as the earliest systematic assessment to have been known in the province to form the basis of revenue policy of successive governments. The first change brought in this system by the British, the report holds, was in 1769 when although no new revenue policy was introduced an attempt was made to secure a better control on revenues. This attempt was in the form of many acts which were introduced from time to time. The prominent acts which have been listed and briefly reviewed in this section are Rent Act of 1859, Tenancy Act of 1885, Bengal Tenancy Amendment Act of 1928, and Amendment Act of 1938.

This review is followed by discussion on the effects of permanent settlement along with the general description of characteristics of the village. Various statements made about the area in general, and the village in particular are substantiated by a number of tables, charts and maps. Charts like "genological and kinship chart of Dhanishwar families" add a great deal of color to the history told so comprehensively. Similarly the tables on "length of generation determined by land property division" gives most exhaustive classification of average age of decedents generation wise.

Section three of the first part deals with the social and economic characteristics of village in relation to land owners. Features like "privilege of service," "privilege of education," and "family characteristics" are dealt somewhat in detail.

The second part of the report contains analyses of the replies received from the available seventy-four heads of families in Dhanishwar. The questionnaire consisted of about nineteen open ended questions.

Broadly divided into two parts, it consists of, first questions of general nature, and then the question which tend to solicit information on the attitudes and opinions of the respondents. These include areas such as use of land, interest of youth in villager's consideration about the future plans of their daughters. The analyses of the responses takes use of a lot of statistical tabulations and tests.

7. Basic Democracies at the Grass Roots

The administrative system of Bengal, primarily designed to collect revenue and maintain law and order was slightly different from that of other provinces in India from the very beginning. There was no government revenue staff, for example. At the village level Zamindars were made fully responsible for collecting the revenue and maintaining law and order in the village. By the middle of the 19th century Zamindars stopped taking active interest in these matters and as a result we see the introduction of local bodies by Britishers as early as in 1871. The local bodies functioned effectively for quite some time, but since the beginning of World War II they started deteriorating and degenerating. This degeneration reached at its height in 1960 when Government of Pakistan decided to replace it by an altogether different system called Basic Democracies. This new system provides involvement of people at five different levels of governmental planning and action.

The report under review tries to study and explain in detail the working of the lower most tier of this new system. This tier is called Union Council and operates at village level. The researcher contends that such an explanation should be particularly useful for providing basic material for constructive thinking about Union Councils. The study presents a detailed picture of the work done by three selected

Union Councils since their inception in 1959. In doing this an attempt has been made to provide as much of a background, both historical as well as theoretical, as possible. The nine chapters present one of the most complete and comprehensive accounts of some of the details about the councils. These cover practically everything from a historical review of local bodies in the area to the execution of councils' budget.

After reviewing the literature on the local bodies, and describing the socio-economic characteristics of the three councils the presentation turns its attention towards analyzing each item concerning the working of these councils. The items selected for discussion are "Union Council Meetings," "the Union Council Budget," "Execution of Union Council Budget," "Coordination between Union Councils and Government Departments," "Union Council and People," and "Union Council Chairmen and Members." The conclusion of the report at the end, summarizes excellently the whole report in six pages. Most of this summary has been reported in a point-wise manner.

8. Special Report on Introducing Farm Mechanization in Comilla Area

This is a short report, apparently based on a brief fact finding and observation trip of the author to Comilla area. As put by the author himself "conferences and discussions were held with staff members of the Academy for Rural Development, Comilla, Michigan State University advisors, Peace Corps Volunteers and U.S. AID group in Dacca before initiating the study." The ideas suggested in these conferences and meetings helped the author first to enumerate and then to discuss the problems, procedures, desires and accomplishments of the area. At the very outset the author lists about five major areas on which the discussion is pursued in the following sections. The five areas mentioned

include "Tractor Drivers," "Reception of Demonstration by the Villagers," "Problems of Small Ownership," "Water Control," and "Specific Accomplishments." Each of these major areas in turn is tied up with the main problem as to how farm mechanization can best be introduced.

Starting from the general assumption that manpower for industrialization, commerce, defense and all other activities of progress and development must come from the agriculture in countries where the greatest percentage of population is engaged in agriculture, the author builds up a case that some decrease in agriculture work can remove pressure from the manpower problem. He further assumes that this can only be accomplished through mechanization of farm work. In making his point the author points to the desires of the villagers who, he believes, are eager to evolve a means of:

1. Joining contiguous plots of different ownership to form a block for tractor cultivation.
2. Joint harvesting to clear fields for block cultivation.
3. Preventive and curative spraying over a contiguous area as against individual field spraying.

After presenting these assumptions, a major portion of the study is devoted to describing details of tractor operation. Sufficient attention has been paid to the suggestion about the training of operators, maintenance of shop, stocking of spare parts and repair facilities. A brief mention of small tractors with details about engine size, methods of propulsion and equipment type is both interesting and useful.

The remaining portion of the study considers a number of minor but important items like depreciation of machinery, interest on investment, taxes, insurance, housing for tractors, fuel, oil, lubrication, etc.

Various cost analyses have been worked out and about three or four tables summarize various cost items. At places percentage values and depreciation cost values have been worked out with the help of some formulas which have been explained after the derivation.

CHAPTER IV

REVIEW OF METHODS APPLIED IN THE RESEARCHES

The first requirement for any noteworthy appraisal or examination is a set of standards against which the material, which has to be examined, can be measured. Setting up of such standards for examining a research work may many times involve examiner's bias--positive or negative towards the material. It may also involve the difficulty of selecting proper criterion for evaluation besides allowing discrepancy from person to person in interpreting both criteria and the contents of the material. The criteria which some would consider important might not appear so important to another person who evaluates the same research from a different point of view. It becomes, therefore, difficult to adopt a standard which is universal or which can be generalized. The closest which we can get to, under such circumstances, is probably a situation where we include those research standards on which there is a considerable consensus among the wise men of social research methodology. It is for this reason that the standards which have been applied to this evaluation are those which are laid down in the contemporary literature on research methods.

The standard of evaluation utilized here has four main parts. The first deals with the orientation of the studies, the second with the characteristics of the data, the third with the treatment of the data and the fourth with the conclusion of the reports.

A few words also seem to be in order in regard to how the several research were put to the appraisal. The basic question which was put in this connection was "is it necessary to apply this particular

criterion to these researches?" If it appeared that the criterion is appropriate then it was asked "whether or not the researcher made any effort to meet the criterion?" The answers to this were classified in four categories namely "adequate," "inadequate," "none," and "does not apply." It was actually at this stage that the writer of this thesis assumed the role of a critic, and his judgment came into play. Two examples may illustrate the point. If a report, for example, without mentioning adequate reasons for choosing a particular sample only states "...all the houses which were at that time occupied by the residents were included in the survey" does not satisfy the writer for meeting the criterion of a representative sample. As another example we can consider the criterion of the legitimate use of analytical techniques. If there was evidence that the basis involved in the use of techniques were not fulfilled, the research was judged inadequate.

There were in all thirty-four research publications which are under review in this section. Eighteen of them belonged to West Pakistan Academy and sixteen to East Pakistan Academy. In order to avoid confusion with the stated objectives of research in each Academy, the two sets have been classified and treated separately in each major section selected as criteria.

ORIENTATION

In order to evaluate the adequacy or inadequacy of the orientation of the studies five basic questions were asked. (1) Is there a direct and clear statement of objectives? (2) Is there a specific and clear

statement of hypotheses? (3) Is the research oriented towards general theory of sociology or other related fields? (4) Are the key concepts used in the text sufficiently defined? (5) Is the present study tied with previous research?

Based on these fundamental questions the analysis of the research reports presents a very interesting picture. None of the thirty-four studies examined really omitted to state their objectives. Of the eighteen reports from the West Pakistan Academy eleven had clear statements of the purposes and seven had vague statements and were therefore judged to be inadequate. The East Pakistan Academy publications are even more clear about their objectives and aims. Of the sixteen reports examined twelve met the criteria of "adequate" statement of purposes (Tables I and II in Appendix B). In all, then about 32% of the reports were judged to fall below minimum acceptable standards on this criterion. An example of one of the more acceptable statements may be:

"In this study the aim of the author is to clarify the meaning of such important variables as roles and role definition, values and attitudes, because of their significant relationship with administrative behavior. In order to illustrate the meaning of these variables data have been collected from the participants under study. The illustrative data have been based on an analysis of the participants' job experiences, level of aspiration, values and attitudes towards administration in general and the basic democracies in particular.... Hence, this study is meant for administrators working in the field to bring about a realistic partnership of government and the people in the task of national development."¹

¹Ansari, Salam, Assistant Directors in Basic Democracies, Pakistan Academy for Village Development, Peshawar, 1961, pp. 2-3.

One of the vague statements of objectives could be quoted as:

"Information collected by this survey of rural manpower resources is an important factor in solving under employment and unemployment problems. It is also a barometer of prevailing economic conditions and an indicator of rural prosperity and well being. It is no exaggeration to say that social planners will benefit from the data given in this report."²

The next consideration in connection with the orientation of the studies was, whether or not there is a statement of relationships or associations between variables which the study proposed to test.

Unless propositions are clearly formulated it is difficult to understand how the investigator can decide as to what he wants to carry his investigation upon. This criterion is so essential that it becomes really the backbone of any piece of scientific investigation. We cannot take a single step forward in any inquiry unless we begin with a suggested explanation or solution of the problem which originated it. Such tentative explanations are suggested to us by something in the subject matter and by our previous knowledge. When they are formulated as formal propositions, they are called hypotheses.³ The function of hypothesis is generally regarded as directing search for the order among facts. The suggestions formulated in the hypotheses may or may not be proved. To prove or not to prove is not the task of hypothesis. Whatever the outcome, the hypothesis is a question put in such a way that an answer of some kind can be forthcoming.

²Haider, S. M., Rural Manpower Resources, Pakistan Academy for Village Development, Peshawar, 1962, p. 3.

³Cohen, N. R. and Nagel, E., An Introduction to Logic and Scientific Method, Harcourt, Brace and World, Inc., New York, 1934, p. 201.

In directing an inquiry a hypothesis must of necessity regard some facts as significant and others as insignificant. The distinction between the two is sometimes difficult to make and might very well involve some problems in formulating good testable hypothesis. No rules can be generalized for formulating a particular kind of hypothesis. Certain characteristics have, however, been laid down by some authors as formal conditions of a usable hypothesis. They may be summarized as: (1) the hypotheses must be conceptually clear; (2) the hypotheses should have empirical referants; (3) the hypotheses must be specific; (4) the hypotheses should be related to available techniques; and finally (5) the hypothesis should be related to a body of theory.⁴

When put to test against these basic tenets of hypothesis formulation most of the studies under examination fell short of meeting the required standards. Of the eighteen research studies undertaken by the West Pakistan Academy only about 17% reflected any efforts to meet the criterion. There were only three studies which adequately met the criterion, while there were nine which did not state any proposition. The remaining six fell in the category of "does not apply," since they merely surveyed certain facts and did not try to establish any kind of relationship or association. In the case of East Pakistan Academy's publications the proportion of stated hypotheses were almost the same. Of the sixteen studies only two stated their hypotheses adequately. There were other two which stated but the statements were rather vague, nine did not

⁴Goode, W. J. and Halt, P. K., Methods in Social Research, McGraw Hill Book Co., Inc., New York, 1952, pp. 68-70.

state at all and three were purely surveys which did not make any mention of the necessity of any proposition. In all, only 15.6% of the total number of the studies really met this criterion. The rest were either too ambiguous or did not include any clear statements of hypotheses or formal proposition.

The next criterion was "were the hypotheses related to a conceptual framework?" As William has said, "It is literally impossible to study anything without having a conceptual scheme, explicit or implicit. This being true best results are to be expected when (1) the scheme is clearly formulated, and (2) the theoretical framework is one which already contains concepts proven useful and from which the widest possible scientific implications can be drawn."⁵ William further emphasized, "that a main road to added scientific stature for rural sociology is that of sharper and more systematic theory."⁶

The fundamental question in this section, then, was whether or not the hypotheses emerged from a theoretical scheme. Only seven out of eighteen West Pakistan Academy's publications, and seven out of sixteen East Pakistan Academy's publications showed adequate attempts at the theoretical orientation. The remaining eleven of the West Pakistan and nine of the East Pakistan publications respectively lacked adequate theoretical orientation. This paucity of theory ranged from "inadequate" to "does not apply." However, the very fact that such an effort is evinced is an indication that the assumptions in these studies are not

⁵Robin M. Williams, "Review of current research in Rural Sociology," Rural Sociology, Vol. XI, 1946, p. 108.

⁶Ibid, p. 109.

only subjective hunches or guesses of investigators, but have at least some bearing on theory.

The effectiveness of communication is directly related to the degree to which a common interpretation is given to the symbols of communication by writer and reader.⁷ The concepts of sociology are frequently not crystalized to a point where they have an unequivocal and identical meaning for all in the profession. Consequently, it becomes essential to define key concepts adequately so that the social phenomenon being considered may be made explicit. The findings of the review of the above mentioned studies indicate that very few authors defined the key concepts at all, or if they did, the attempt was "inadequate" in the sense that the explanation or the definition was not clear enough. The situation in the East Pakistan Academy's publications in this case, was better than the West Pakistan Academy. In the latter case there were only two reports out of eighteen which defined the concepts clearly. Twelve of them did not define at all and the remaining four defined them but rather ambiguously. In East Pakistan Academy's publication there were nine of a total number of sixteen studies which gave a definition, three did it vaguely and four did not mention it at all.

The final criterion of orientation required relating the project to previous research in the same area. It is not only through observed facts that research can offer solution to all the problems. It does so also through repeated observation of the hitherto neglected facts and integrating them with the existing theories. Robert Merton has emphasized

⁷Randal, Harrison, "Non Verbal Communication," unpublished paper, Department of Communication Arts, Michigan State University, 1963, p. 1.

this fact by saying that "whereas the serendipity pattern centers in an apparent inconsistency which presses for resolution, the reformulation centers in the hitherto neglected but relevant facts for an extension of conceptual scheme."⁸ Any discipline which has to build a body of knowledge through research and scientific inquiry, as a matter of fact, should not ignore the importance of surveying the existing literature in the field and if possible incorporating conceptual referants used in them in the new inquiry. It is incumbent upon the researcher not only to acquaint himself thoroughly with such work but also to summarize them for the readers.

This criterion was thought to be important for reviewing the orientation of the researchers under examination. Of the total thirty-four studies twelve surveyed the literature as compared to thirteen of those which did not survey any previous research. The remaining nine were those which made only passing remarks about previous works.

Adequacy in this case was interpreted as meaning the inclusion of reference to, and a summary of related published work. The following quotation from one of the studies under evaluation may illustrate as to what is judged to be a more adequate statement in this regard.

"Research in the social sciences has attempted to measure the effects of motivational appeals on the effectiveness of communication. Hartman (2) Menafee and Grahneberg (6) compared the effects of emotional and rational messages. The studies concluded that emotion loaded messages were comparatively more effective than those which exclusively depended upon rational argumentation. Knower (5) presented evidence in contradiction

⁸Robert K. Merton, "The Bearing of Empirical Research on the Development of Social Theory," American Sociological Review, Vol. XIII, 1948, p. 509.

to the above results and suggested that the rational appeals are more effective. Hovland (3) criticizes such studies for not giving clear-cut operational definitions of emotional and rational appeals..."⁹

Examining them separately we see that the list of West Pakistan Academy contained only three studies which were adequately oriented towards previous research. Six others fell in the category of "inadequate orientation" and nine did not have any orientation at all. In the case of East Pakistan Academy's list there were nine reports which surveyed the research literature, three did it inadequately and four fell in the category of "none."

On the whole it is interesting to note that except in stating the objectives there were more than half of the studies which failed to meet the required standards. Nevertheless there are attempts in other studies which give promise for a more systematic effort in the future.

CHARACTERISTICS OF THE DATA

The second major aspect to which the evaluation directed its attention was that of the characteristics of the data. The questions asked in this section were: (1) Have the researchers made any effort to make a concrete definition of the universe? (2) Have the sampling procedures been reported adequately and the representativeness of the sample properly assured? (3) Has the adequacy and meaningfulness of data been judged in terms of standardized instruments, validity of measures, competent use of instruments and use of secondary sources?

⁹Sajid, M. S., Learning Under Threatful Situation, Pakistan Academy for Village Development, Peshawar, 1962, pp. 2-3.

Unless there is a concrete conception and a clear definition of the population universe from which the data has been drawn it becomes difficult to generalize the findings. It also becomes difficult to apply the conclusion of any study to any other situation if the characteristics of the original population are not known adequately. It was with this assumption in mind that an attempt was made to ascertain whether or not the researches under review tried to define concretely the population universe for the reader. On the whole about 61% of the reports did attempt to make such a definition very concretely. The remaining 39% also attempted but were not clear enough to be categorized as "adequate definition." Once again the East Pakistan Academy's reports were more careful in meeting this criterion. Fourteen out of sixteen reports made clear statements about the definition of universe, while the remaining two remained vague and ambiguous. In the case of West Pakistan Academy this proportion was more differentiated. Two thirds of their publications met the requirements of "adequate" definitions while one third, namely six reports out of eighteen did not state the definitions so concretely. Briefly, a large number of them did a commendable job of defining their universe.

Only about less than one third of the total thirty-four reports utilized original data involving sampling. In the nine reports which involved adequate sampling method there was also a report on the procedure utilized for selecting the sample. Similarly in eight of these nine, sufficient efforts were made to assure the representativeness of the data. The remaining two-thirds either did not make any adequate effort towards this or did not employ the sampling procedure at all.

Breaking down to the data gathered from the two Academies separately we find that in West Pakistan Academy's reports five reported the sampling procedures adequately, nine made an inadequate attempt, three did not make any attempt at all, and one surveyed the whole universe and did not involve any sampling. The representativeness of data was assured adequately in five reports, nine did an inadequate job, three did not make any attempt to assure the representativeness at all and in one case since there was no sampling at all the question of representativeness or unrepresentativeness does not apply.

The picture which the East Pakistan Academy reports present is more or less the same. Four of the sixteen reports, recorded very adequately the procedure employed in selecting the particular sample, ten made an attempt but were not clear enough, while there were two reports which did not involve any sampling. The representativeness of sample was adequately assured in only three out of the sixteen reports. Leaving the two which did not involve sampling, there were eleven reports which did not explain the representativeness adequately. In most of the cases, in this section only a very casual reference is made of either the procedure of sampling employed or the mechanism of assuring the representativeness. Most of the time general remarks like, "a random sample of 15% has been selected..." was made without specifying the justification for a particular selection. Though such selections of sample also involved some statistical implications, but it was not considered at this stage of evaluation as an essential handicap since we were not concerned here with the validity of statistics involved. Of the different types of sampling procedures only one has been mentioned.

This is the random method and its use is very conveniently mentioned in any study where a selection from the universe population is involved. No principles or characteristic requirement are ever stated in discussing such a procedure.

The next series of criteria concerning the characteristics of the data are those relating to the meaningfulness. The basic question here was, "Has the data been judged adequate or inadequate in terms of use of instruments, validity of measures and use of secondary sources?"

Since most of the data were collected through the use of such instruments as questionnaires, interviews, participant observation, etc., the adequacy or inadequacy of these instruments and their application becomes pertinent to any attempt on evaluation. Most of the time a convenient way for the researchers to meet this problem is to use the standardized instruments rather than designing instruments of their own. Such an approach may help him in many ways. It may relieve him from the risk of being criticized for the validation of his instruments in addition to providing him with an opportunity of comparing his data and findings with those of his colleagues who have used the same instruments else where. The use of standardized instruments will also ensure the researcher that his findings will always be related to the research and findings of others who used same instruments.

Of the eighteen reports of West Pakistan Academy practically all used standardized instruments. Fourteen of these used the instruments adequately while four, fell in the category of "inadequate." The adequacy of the instruments here was judged according to accuracy and precisions with which the instruments has been constructed or designed.

In doing this the basic principles of the construction of these tools were kept in mind. The construction of a questionnaire or interview schedule may be a much more subtle and frustrating task than is generally believed by those who have not actually attempted, and may involve many difficulties. When it comes to individual judgment the precision or accuracy may have more than one standard and therefore it becomes essential to ascertain whether or not these instruments were refined enough to meet the standardized criteria.

Judged on these, the East Pakistan Academy reports tried more to meet this criterion of the sixteen reports eleven proved themselves to be adequately qualified for being classed as using standardized instruments. In the case of remaining five the standards of construction or design was, in the judgment of the author of the thesis, not fine enough. There were either some weakness in the design or some inadequacy in the precision or accuracy of the tool.

Since in both of the Academies the researchers relied more upon using the standardized instrument there is no indication of the design of any new instrument in either of the two Academies' work.

Another serious shortcoming of a research report could be the lack of attention given to the validity of measures used in research. The question of validity has been discussed at length by many scholars and the genesis of these discussions does point to the fact that the question must not only elicit stable or reliable answers, but it must also provide the kind of information which the researcher wants.¹⁰ The problem of

¹⁰Herbert Hyman, "Do They Tell the Truth," Public Opinion Quarterly, Vol. VIII, 1945, p. 559.

validity is a little complex one because it involves various aspects of the problem. It may, for example, involve a situation where the statements may be technically true but really false. Or it may involve a weakness in the mechanism of eliciting information. The reconstruction of ideas or opinions is a difficult process and sometime the disappointments are not because of lack of information, but probably because of a limitation upon the questioning techniques. Various cross checks are employed to eliminate the errors, but sometimes it beomes rather difficult to control all the variables and secure a completely valid answer.

In examining the validity of measures of the studies under review no attempt is made here to classify the instruments used as either valid or invalid but the object is to determine whether or not the report indicated concern over the reliability of measures. Approximately more than half of the total number of studies showed signs of concern over the validity of questions one one hand and on findings on the other. The West Pakistan Academy publications recorded nine reports out of eighteen which showed concern and tried to use some kinds of measure for ascertaining validity. The remaining nine did not show any evidence of any such attempt. The other set namely the East Pakistan Academy's publications showed signs that the results were validated in case of more than half the studies. Nine out of the sixteen reports met the required criterion. The remaining seven also tried to measure the validity but were rather inadequate in their attempts.

A second prerequisite for obtaining meaningful data is the competent application of the instruments. The first essential in this connection is the use of trained interviewers and observers. For a

systematic data collection it is assumed that the tools of data collection are safest in the hands of a trained investigator. In both the Academies the Research Sections are equipped with trained field investigators and tabulator. Still in many cases it is noticed that the data was sometimes collected through a bunch of officers under training, a group of voluntary workers, or some interviewers which were hired temporarily for a certain project. The results of such a practice is that out of a total of thirty-four studies almost more than half fell short of what can be called as competent use of instruments. The practice of using the participants of the training as interviewers or observers seemed more common in West Pakistan Academy than in East Pakistan Academy. The analysis of the studies from this point of view indicates that about two thirds of the West Pakistan Academy's researches lacked in adequacy of the use of instruments. Only seven out of a total of eighteen studies had used the instruments adequately. In the case of East Pakistan Academy's research the situation was not so bad. Eleven out of sixteen had used the instruments adequately and only five researches fell in the category of "inadequate." Examined minutely it is noticed that an even smaller proportion of these reports reassured the readers regarding the researcher--subject rapport by indicating conditions under which the interviewing or testing had been done.

The final query in this area was whether or not the secondary sources utilized judiciously and acknowledged. It is surprising to note that though these researchers were, most of the time, pioneering efforts in their respective field very little attempt has been made to correlate them with some of the existing secondary sources. Both sets of research lacked sufficiently in a proper orientation towards the use and

acknowledgement of secondary source materials. Only five out of a total of eighteen in the West Pakistan Academy's reports and six in the East Pakistan Academy's reports used and acknowledge these sources adequately. The remaining thirteen and ten reports, respectively in each Academy, either did not use and acknowledge them at all, or if they did it was inadequate.

Too much importance cannot be placed on the characteristics of the data alone, since inadequacy at this point also involves the limitation of the reliability and validity of the treatment of data. It, therefore, also becomes important to make an assessment of the manner in which the data has been treated.

TREATMENT OF DATA

In order to evaluate the treatment of data in any particular study one must first of all be conversant not only with the nature of that data, their adequacy and limitations, but also with the specific objectives to be achieved by the analysis. The main questions asked in this section were about the adequacy of mathematics used, the use of analytical techniques and control of associated variables.

The use of mathematical computation is basic and obvious. Practically all of the reports made use of some computation, even if it were to be only percentage calculations. In this evaluation the accuracy of these computations were assumed to be adequate.

The question of legitimate use of analytical techniques for the analysis of data is one which prompts special attention in the case of empirical studies. There are occasions where the reports are legitimately criticized

for the mal-application of analytical techniques, particularly in the areas of statistics. Such errors could be classified either as omission or commission. In the case of Academies' reports there was not much problem as to this effect, because hardly anyone of them involved any advanced statistical techniques. In most of the cases only the frequency distribution were computed and calculated against percentages and hence did not involve any difficulty or doubts as to the use and applicability of one or the other statistical methods. In some cases certain statistical tests like chi square test, t-tests, etc., were used which proved to be quite applicable to the situation.

Another problem in the treatment of data is the control of explanatory variables other than the one to which the dependent variable is being related. In any investigation that attempts to discover relationships between two or more phenomenon, the control of other possibly significant influences on the dependent variables is essential. Such control may be secured in a number of ways. One can use (1) a three-way table (i.e., investigate the relationship between two factors, holding a third possibly explanatory factor constant); (2) partial correlation or (3) co-variance technique.

None of the thirty-four studies under review utilized the three-way cross tabulation. In the case of both the Academies there were a few studies which needed such cross tabulation, but the researchers did not use the technique. In the West Pakistan Academy's publication there were only three reports which did not need cross tabulation, but the remaining fifteen needed it but did not apply. Similarly the East Pakistan Academy's researches also ignored its use and in the case of

ten reports which actually needed some kind of correlation, there was no utilization of any such technique. In this case there were six such reports in whose case such a relationship was not applicable.

Another way of controlling the different variables is through the application of correlation tests and finding out the significance of relationships. One of the most useful statistics to understand the relationship between variables is the coefficient of correlation. There are many ways of finding it but the most commonly used one is the Pearson Coefficient of Correlation associated with the name of Dr. Pearson. The measure indicates to what extent the variation of one phenomenon is related, may or may not be causally, to the variation in the other phenomenon. For example, how far an increase or decrease in the amount of a particular fertilizer applied in the plots increases or decreases the yield of the crop. Looking at the overall picture we find that there was a general lack of application of correlation technique to the data. Only five out of eighteen and two out of sixteen research reports from the West and East Pakistan Academies respectively adequately utilized the correlation measures. The remaining thirteen from the West Pakistan and fourteen from the East Pakistan Academy did not apply any such test.

The analysis of co-variance also becomes important in studies in which the interest is to show the effect of one factor while statistically eliminating the influence of other factors. The correlation of one factor, say experience, with the criterion say decision making, or efficiency in job determines the actual process of decision making or efficiency if this is to be held constant (or its influence eliminated). Very few studies from the Academies utilized the analysis of co-variance

procedure. Only two studies out of a total of thirty-four indicated the use of this technique. The rest either totally ignored its use or their design did not require any such analysis. The two studies which utilized the procedure were from the West Pakistan Academy and employed quite adequate statistical inferences. The remaining sixteen of this Academy's publications can be divided into two groups of thirteen and three. Thirteen did not utilize any co-variance analysis at all, while three fell in the category in which where there was no need of their application. Nine of the East Pakistan Academy's reports fell in the category of "none" and the remaining seven in the category of "does not apply."

The failure to use these techniques to control other possibly relevant variables may be attributed to at least two factors: (1) some of these techniques are relatively unfamiliar to sociologists and their utility and correct use is not generally known and (2) the data is often thought not to warrant what sometimes is referred to as the application of "high powered" analytical techniques.

CONCLUSIONS OF THE REPORTS

Concerning the conclusion of the reports the following questions were asked: (1) Is there a clear statement of conclusion? (2) Has the researcher clearly stated the probable limits of generalization of data? (3) Is he aware of the limitations of the study and has made suggestions or recommendations for the improvement? (4) On the basis of his experience and findings of the present study, has he made any statement as to suggest some future studies? (5) Did he make any effort to orient his finding towards: (a) the general problem area and (b) general sociological theory?

A high proportion of the studies, twelve out of eighteen and nine out of sixteen studies from the West and East Pakistan Academies, included a clear statement of the conclusion and the findings of the study. Three in the case of West and three in the case of East Pakistan Academy were such reports which attempted at such an explanation but did it inadequately. The remaining three and four reports from the respectively West and East Academies reflected no attempt at such summarization.

Also a great majority of these studies made clear statements about the probable limits beyond which the data might not be generalized safely. The list of West Pakistan Academy Publications contained eleven such studies. The remaining seven were those in which either there was no attempt at spelling out the limits of generalizations, or if there was one it was inadequate. In the case of East Pakistan there were nine studies which attempted this adequately as compared to the remaining seven which could not do so and were categorized under the class "inadequate."

Limitations of the research discovered during the process of study or recommendation for improvement were mentioned by just twelve and nine studies from the West and East Pakistan Academies respectively. The rest of the report fell short to meet the criterion of statements and were consequently classed in other categories. Approximately a similar number from each Academy indicated the suggestions for further studies in the field.

Nearly all of the studies included a statement concerning the implications of the findings of the study to the problem area, but in only seven reports from the West Pakistan Academy and ten reports from

the East Pakistan Academy was there any consideration of the theoretical implications of the research. The remaining eleven and six studies from each Academy respectively lacked in any such orientation. It is very important to orient research findings to the theory, if a body of empirically verified theory is to be developed in such areas of investigation.

Reviewing all these reports it appears that there is a general tendency in these publications to leave this integration of research with theory for someone else. Researchers such as those who are in the Academies should accept at least some of the responsibilities of this interpretation because of the fact that he is in the best position to do so on the basis of his acquaintance with the data which he has gathered. As a matter of fact such an investigator is in a much better position than any other person who attempts to theorize on facts supplied by someone else.

CHAPTER V

CRITIQUE AND OBSERVATIONS

Scientific inquiry into the problems of society has a long history of doubts and skepticism. There was a time when scientists and philosophers doubted the possibility that a science of society was possible and they contended that experimentation for a science of society is not worthwhile.¹ But the history of science repeatedly demonstrated that an area which one age takes to be incapable of treating scientifically is treated so by a succeeding age. Ever since these initial doubts the students of sociology have been asking themselves questions, "Is research necessary?" or "What and how will it contribute to our knowledge of society or its specific problems?" These questions are not original and have been asked in various other ways many times before. Robert Merton, for example, has questioned a long time ago (in 1939 in his "Science and Economy of Seventeenth Century England") the notion that needs precipitate appropriate inventions and canalize scientific interests. He pointed out that though specific emergencies have focused upon certain fields, many human needs have gone unsatisfied throughout the ages. Merton believed that it is only when the goal is actually a part and parcel of the situation in question, only when it actually is conceived as such by some members of the society, that one may properly speak of a need directing scientific and technological interests in certain channels.³

¹Ackoff, R., The Design of Social Research, the University of Chicago Press, Chicago, 1953, p. 1.

²Robert K. Merton, Social Theory and Social Structure, Free Press, N.Y., p. 610.

³Ibid.

Such a situation puts social scientists, specially those who are engaged in research, into the difficult dilemma of asking themselves whether the inquiry which they are pursuing is oriented towards some specifically stated objective or are pursued just for the sake of conducting an inquiry. As a matter of fact a clear conception of the purpose of the inquiry may to a great extent determine the nature and quality of the inquiry. In previous sections we have been discussing the origin and nature of research in the two Academies for Rural Development in Pakistan. In an attempt to trace the history and development of research in these Academies we discovered that both of them defined and stated clearly the purposes of their research. From the very beginning they saw the role of their research as specifically tied up with the overall purpose of the institutions, namely rural development.

Since rural development involves a holistic approach any project could be rationalized as important for immediate attention, but limited resources and urgency of some of the problems led the researchers to establish some priorities. Those who are engaged in development and policy making need answers and they need answers in a hurry. In these situations, while a research orientation becomes a highly desirable quality for all those who are engaged in this activity, the brunt of the burden of analyzing the situation with clarity, skill and ingenuity falls mainly on the specialists. The process of creative study is a complex and difficult one and requires critical evaluation and examination over and over again. It also requires training, skill and originality, and if the specialists have to determine the shape of the things

on the basis of their observations and analysis their responsibility becomes even graver.

Under such circumstances the surveys and the research have to fulfill the accepted standards in order to give insights and proper perspective to the administrators for shaping the policies and administration of the programs. At this point if one does not stop to make a critique of surveys and research which are used for these purposes he might be lacking in his role of a scientific assessor and might be deemed to be contributing insufficiently towards the research and method in social science as well as he might seem not be fully conscious of the factors, problems, and weaknesses involved in the studies under review.

The research conducted and published by the two above mentioned Academies state their purpose primarily as helping the administrators to have a better perspective of the rural problems, and therefore, also need critical evaluation and appraisal. Nevertheless, such a critique does not mean in any way an acrimonious libel on the works, but is only meant to be an unbiased evaluation in the sociological parlance entailing the following steps:

1. A critique of the development of the process of research;
2. A critique of the policy and the method of research;
3. An examination of the circumstances favoring or disfavoring the particular type of research;
4. An overall critique of the relationship between the stated objectives and the present status of the research in the Academies; and
5. An examination of:
 - a. research consumers' objectives,

- b. researchers' objectives, and the
- c. objectives of those who are affected by the research.

Looking back at our discussion of initial perception and development of research in the two Academies in Chapter II, we notice that from the very start research in these institutions originated as a basis for training and extension. Though a difference is noted between the scope, approach and direction of the researches of the two institutions, the main purpose of this activity remained fundamentally the same in both the institutions. The difference was mainly because of various circumstantial variables which led to different priorities. Coming from the above, the directives which the Academies got in respect to research was to initiate projects which could help analyze the rural and administrative problems. Such a task was both challenging and complex, and as a result each of the two institutions utilized its own imagination and formula for meeting the challenge.

As noted in Chapter II, the research in the West Pakistan Academy assumed a different direction as compared to that of East Pakistan from the beginning. The nature, scope and contents of the research in the West indicated that the problem formulation, analysis and interpretation in its case started from the top and came all the way down to problems at the village level. They started off by analyzing problems pertaining to the administration of the program rather than attacking the lowest level and incorporating the findings into the policies which could indirectly help to solve the problems. In reviewing the East Pakistan Academy's research quite an opposite effect is noticed. Most of the researches undertaken by them dealt only with the village level data

and their findings could not be generalized over any larger universe. Consequently, no indication is available as to how this valuable basic data is, or could be, utilized in either policy making or training of the administrators. Most of the time the data contained in these reports do not speak satisfactorily of their significance or insignificance.

Operating at these extremes the two sets of researches seem to be completely isolated from each other in terms of means for achieving the common ends. The process of development of any research activity involves three principal components. First is the originating question, a statement of what one wants to know. Second is the rationale, stating why one wants to have the particular question answered. And, third are the specifying questions that point towards possible answers to the originating question in terms that satisfy the rationale for having raised it. If these basic components are essential for the development of every research program then there should be at least some degree of congruity between the means used to achieve the stated purposes. If these means are widely divergent, then it would appear that the most effective means of achieving the stated goals is not being utilized, at least in one of the two Academies. It is not the intent of this discussion to pass a judgment over the value or quality of one or the other approach, but our only concern here is to question the dichotomy which has occurred. This dichotomy is explained by those who are responsible for initiating and implementing these research programs by more than one reason. The West Pakistan Academy justifies its action by saying:

"In concurrence with the philosophy of the Academy, the faculty considers that one of the functions of the Academy is to collect, sift and make available to Government information necessary for framing administrative policies in development matters. A natural continuation of this function would be for the faculty to assess scientifically the job requirements of a group of administrators sent to it for training and to draw up a training program for them which is best suited for the purpose of the course."⁴

The East Pakistan Academy believed more in concentrating their research for the purpose of extension, rather than collecting facts for furnishing them to administrators. In emphasizing this they contended:

"After having worked with the training for some time it was felt that there should be another aspect of Academy's activities, taking the information derived through research to the people. This is what is termed as extension."⁵

These differences in approach appear simple and innocent as long as they do not become the themes for success or failure of one of the other aspect of the program, but the very success of one sometimes generates suspicions and doubts about the potentials and capabilities of the other. The cultural diversities and ecological differences, which sometimes are used as excuses, should not be taken as barriers for preventing achievement of common ends.

Closely tied to the problem of the development of the process of research are the variables of policy and methods employed by the Academies. Guided by broad objectives of analyzing problems related to rural development, the researchers most of the time use their own judgment for determining what forms a good researchable problem and how it can best be

⁴The Director, Annual Report, West Pakistan Academy for Village Development, (unpublished mimeographed report), 1960, p. 30.

⁵Zaidi, S. M. H., et. al., Evaluation Report 1960, Pakistan Academy for Village Development, Comilla, 1960, p. 1.

investigated. The review in Chapter IV containing the discussion on methodology employed by the Academies' researches points out the shortcomings and weaknesses. Most of these shortcomings are in the areas of treatment and the characteristics of the data. Without a set plan or policy for determining the shape of research the discrepancies such as were pointed out in the chapter above are not very unusual and can creep in quite easily. This may be partly due to the absence of a policy-oriented research which might tend to answer the questions with more clarity and precision.

The publications mentioned above lacked not only in specifying what standards they had to meet for publishing their results, but also did not seem to care much about being particular in the use of research methods. The method of employment of research workers, their training, their use and the unknown reliability of data which they gathered are matters which raise points which are open to criticism. In many cases the researchers have admitted that the field data were collected either by the officers under training of the Academy or by temporarily employed enumerators. In the case of officers, who originally belong to different civil, military, or technical departments, it may be doubted that they have adequate orientation in methodology of social research to be relied upon for scientific fact finding. The enumerators, usually picked up from the local villages, were in most cases not adequately educated and one or two days' briefing was nothing more but a handicap to be able to acquire relevant data. Under such circumstances one wonders how a set of data which passes through such irregularities can be relied upon for policy making, or for that matter, for any scientific endeavor. The author of the present thesis, being a member of the research team of one

of the two Academies, is aware of some of the cases where the whole research was planned, designed and executed so informally that scarcely any interpretation based on the findings can be trusted.

Much of the research under review, and specially much of the research by the West Pakistan Academy can be classified under the broad heading of attitudes and values. This type of research, as is usually the case employs survey technique. Attitudes and values are the major considerations in rural development. However, a major fallacy in conducting such research by survey method is that the results often tend to indicate the ideal rather than the real situation. Perhaps more accurate and meaningful indicators of real attitudes and values can be obtained by observing and recording what people do, inasmuch as their actions are the best indicators of their real values and attitudes.⁶

Rural development is essentially a social phenomenon. Situations change from day to day, village to village, community to community. These changing situations throw a challenge to the researchers who adapt according to the changing needs of the time. Social scientists do not carry on research in a vacuum; they are concerned with the flow and change in society, they are concerned with the factors which dominate the process of change. Hence they have to look for the threads which will be useful for weaving the fabric of the society..

✓ Since there were not many systematic attempts at rural social research in Pakistan before the establishment of the Academies, any setting proved to be attractive for those who had aspired for an opportunity for doing research. Though there were problems which

⁶Daniel W. Sturt, "Research and Rural Development," Social Research in National Development, Peshawar, Pakistan Academy for Rural Development, 1962 - 2/1

were almost crying for investigation, and the social scientists had the advantage of an abundance of opportunities, yet it seems that certain difficulties came in the way of really sophisticated research. Due to the lack of a research tradition, there were many problems which had remained unsolved, but any attempt to offer solutions did not meet with great success. Many reasons are noted for such failures. Prominent among these are:

1. A tendency on the part of some groups of villagers to exaggerate the facts.
2. A doubt about the genuineness of cooperation by the villagers and consequent unreliability of the data collected.
3. The fact that there are certain areas of life on which no data can be collected from a village population at all. Whatever the research agency, one cannot try to collect information on taboo subjects without being snubbed or manhandled.
4. Difficulties in communication between village people and the investigators.
5. Language barrier between the educated and the illiterate persons.
6. The general resistance to outsiders in any community.

In view of these limitations there is all the more reason to ensure that early attempts of the Academies at research are sound, clear and precise. Quite contrary to this the early attempts appear to be neglecting the basic requirements of establishing a satisfactory rapport between the observer and the observed. The first few research projects undertaken, for example, by the West Pakistan Academy did not even bother to direct their attention to the village scene. In most cases they continue to be interested in the values and attitudes of the functionaries of the government. Similarly East Pakistan Academy's publications,

except for a few studies, mostly confined their area of investigation to conducting small sample surveys round the periphery of social change.

While these short cuts to research did discover some of the necessary areas of investigation, probably the researchers could have discovered more important answers through the process more commonly called "Action Research."

In action research various arrangements and various combinations are tested as the researcher continues to seek workable solutions. As a social researcher tries various approaches to any program, whether it is literacy, youth, cooperative or any other, he learns through a process of recording and evaluation. Such an approach becomes doubly more useful because it forces the researcher to consider the total community and the interrelatedness of various aspects of development.

The East Pakistan Academy utilized to some extent this technique and experimented with their ideas in a selected area which they called a "Development Area." This gave them on one hand an opportunity to assess their efforts over and over and on the other hand a chance to demonstrate to others what field oriented research could contribute towards analyzing and understanding the problems comprehensively, as well as handling them in actual life situations.

Another important aspect of research which circumstances such as those mentioned above needed was "evaluation." For a program which is to be measured and assessed over a long period of time, it is necessary that inspection and checking of the efforts be made frequently to ensure validity.

Evaluation is a highly vulnerable weakness in rural development programs and specially in its research. Not only that the early efforts of Academies lacked evaluation but even at a later stage there is hardly any serious attempt towards such an activity. Of all the thirty-four reports examined in the previous chapter (combining both East and West Pakistan Academies' research) only one report from East Pakistan Academy recorded any attempt at evaluation.

In terms of the research objectives two things seem to run counter to each other. One, the stated objectives of the research in the Academies as originally perceived by the planners of the program and, two, the status of the research which has evolved during the course of the Academies' five years of operation, and which is being pursued presently. It seems as if the original objectives of building a body of knowledge shedding light on the problems of rural development has been overlooked in the enthusiasm of the social scientists' (faculty members in the two Academies) pursuing their own personally motivated researches which were conducted within the framework of their own professional norms. Research workers in a situation such as this, where their obligation is toward interdisciplinary studies, and their ambitions are toward professional recognition, are caught between the intense need by policy makers for more and useful information and the paucity of knowledge. It is at this stage probably, that the ambitious researcher will have to put some restraint over his temptations to bring out quick and easy results. If the stated policy and purpose of Academies' research is to provide basis for an integrated knowledge, its research should better concentrate on this aspect rather than any other.

Many researchers claim that research is meant only for obtaining information for its own sake. They assert that in such cases the researcher should not be concerned with the use to which such information may be put. In other words they tend to segmentalize the whole research activity into different parts and thus try to emphasize that one party is quite independent of the other. This position may be true in a theoretical sense but in a situation where the research is field oriented and all the participants are involved, it is rather difficult to isolate various parties from each other. The researcher, for example, on one hand has an obligation towards understanding, appreciating and fulfilling the objectives of those who sponsor research, and on the other is also obliged to look out for the interests of those who have been the subject of his inquiry and are looking forward to learning how their responses contributed towards the solution of the problem. Thus the researcher and his activities can be separated neither from the sponsoring agency nor from the people for whom the research has greater value in terms of shaping the policies for eradicating their innumerable problems.

The Academies in their role of sponsors had only one statement of their objectives, viz., to conduct research in a few glaring problems of ruralites. In some respects such a purpose defies its definition. This is true because rural development consists of a combination of different disciplines, is approached by a variety of means and inspired by change agents who have an assortment of ends in mind. In line with this, to some people rural development is motivation, to others it is education, to some others it is training in community development, and to still others it is extension. Consequently, the research undertaken

may have more than one dimension. It may range over anything--from studies in adult education to an analysis of variables favoring or disfavoring the acceptance of family planning practices.

Much of the success of a program depends on its proper conception by those who are responsible for initiating and executing it. The primary task of the sponsor of a program in such a situation is to define, delineate and specify its objectives as clearly as possible in the initial stages of its development. The statement of the purpose of research by the Academies, though defined clearly, appears rather vague in the absence of specific descriptions as to how the findings of this research are going to be used. As a result the conception of the themes for study and investigation appear to be left to the imagination of individual researchers. While professional autonomy and operational freedom help in giving encouragement to the researchers, such freedom from direction may also lead the organization into a position where its different research works might end up in disjointed pieces of a pattern which have no identity as individual research. Such unintegrated research activity also involves a risk of getting lost in the already published work without being utilized for the purpose for which it was originally designed. It is possible that the objectives of any program, even though not very specifically stated, are understood and met adequately. This happens when the findings or the end results of any research activity are channeled to something which might have an indirect bearing upon its uses as research. In the case of Academies' research, for example, if the research findings are utilized in dealing with the problem situation,

even through the administrators who came to the Academy for training, the objective of conducting such research is partly met. It can also be met if the participants in the rural development program--namely the people, the administrators, and the trainers--are made aware of the ultimate reason why research is needed by the Academies.

The responsibility for this definition does not lie only with the sponsor; it also lies to a great extent with the researcher himself. If the sponsor's objectives are not systematically formulated it is the obligation of the participating researchers, who are better acquainted with the techniques of problem formulation, to help the sponsor formulate his objectives as clearly as possible. It seems that the research workers in both the Academies failed in this aspect of their obligation towards the research activity. Being equipped with knowledge and techniques for probing into the problems it was their responsibility to help the Academies meet their research goals properly but, as it happens, they got involved more in their own pursuits of professional recognition rather than in drafting guide lines for integrated research schemes for their respective institutions.

It is frequently argued that a researcher should be completely impartial; that is, he shall not permit his personal interest to influence his research decisions. Taken literally, such advice is not practical. Because he is a human being himself, the researcher's desires for prestige, status, self-education, promotion in his job, increased income, etc., cannot be eliminated totally and are operative in all his activity even if he is not conscious of this fact.

The researchers in the two Academies are no exceptions. They had their own motivations, ambitions and desires which they wanted to fulfill. As a consequence, when the opportunity offered them a license for free lancing, they preferred to select projects which best fitted into the framework of their individual interests rather than the overall objectives of the institution to which they owed the service of their knowledge and skill.

It is often difficult for a person to understand his own motives and to recognize his interests as they operate in his own decision making. For this reason it is desirable to have others cooperate in this phase of research design procedure.

The relationship between the researcher and the sponsor of the research program, hence, becomes all the more significant in terms of making a decision about the nature and quality of the inquiry.

The researcher is not only a person; he is also a scientist, and hence when examining his objectives in the role of researcher, science's objectives should also be taken into account. The object of science is not only to increase knowledge but to provide an opportunity to continue to increase knowledge. If a researcher assumes the role of a scientist he should conduct each investigation in such a way that it contributes to an improvement in the method of inquiry. This aspect of the researcher's role is seen to be missing in the reports published by the Academies. The researches are more in the nature of ultimate entities, rather than including suggestions for further research. This dimension also relates to the obligation which research has towards those who will be affected by its results. The failure to take into account the interests of the ultimate consumers of the research sometimes results in consequences

which create problems for subsequent research activities. Those who make the decision are only the intermediate consumers and those who are ultimately affected by these decisions are the ultimate consumers. It is essential that the interests and objectives of the ultimate consumers also be respected and incorporated in the research design.

It appears that the two Academies now, after the exploratory work and five years of operation in their respective areas, are in a position to appreciate the problems of different types of participants involved in the process and can evolve a pattern of research which will be practical and useful. There is both challenge and opportunity; what is needed is perseverance and dedication and devotion to the original purposes of the scheme of the Pakistan Academies for Rural Development.

CHAPTER VI

CONCLUSION

It is not a disputed truth that the application of social sciences to human needs prompts great awareness that social research may play a major role in providing first-hand information about human problems and an incentive for their solution. Any attempt in the field of social research is but a clear indication of the scientist's concern for mankind. But a serious reviewing of the researches done by others also opens horizons contributing to the field of research and stimulating for new concepts and precepts which can be utilized to attack the difficulties and shortcomings in a particular approach of research.

The present review of the research studies in Pakistan, produced by the two Academies for Rural Development has aroused the author's deeper interest in research methodology of sociology. An analysis and critique of the published material issued by the above mentioned Academies has provided the student, not only with a sound training in critical research but has also provoked him to think and devise methods which, if applied in sociological research in Pakistan, might produce rich material and might also prove an appropriate step toward solving the complex problems facing the rural development agencies.

Any recommendations in this regard would remain incomplete in absence of a discussion of shortcomings investigated during the review. Some of the most prominent weaknesses discovered may be listed as follows:

1. An apparent lack of theoretical orientation in the development of the research problems.
2. A lack of concern with the adequacy of reporting the sampling procedures.

3. A lack of use and awareness about the measurement instruments.
4. A lack of concern for, or reporting of, field or testing conditions.
5. A lack of control of other possibly explanatory variables.
6. A lack of concern for orienting findings to a general theory.

Several positive suggestions emerge from this appraisal:

1. A sound development of the theory pertaining to researches in the problems of village level research, in the particular situations involved, is highly desirable.
2. A higher research standard in the areas of sampling and research reporting needs to be maintained.
3. Beside the need of proper use of measurement instruments and statistical tools, the researchers should be urged to produce studies which are predictable and are in line with standardized research material available from other parts of the world.
4. Instead of stereotyped research, the research should be in support of teaching at the two Academies in Pakistan, it should contribute for advising farmers, it should investigate traditional practices and flow of information on devices to find solutions of the rural problems.
5. In the particular situation of the two Academies there is a need of close relationship between the research departments, researchers and farmers. The research should be directed more vigorously toward the socio-economic aspects of the farmers and should contain predictable validity to envisage the particular problems facing a certain rural area.
6. The research responsibility should rest in the hands of trained and able personnel in research methodology. It will be highly beneficial if the research work is pursued only by those who possess high training and aptitude in research methodology.

Sociological research is not a simple mechanism to be handled by anyone. Above all, the survey and research report is doubly significant in the interest of the two Academies and for the policy makers. It is only the training, skill, acumen and ingenuity of the researchers, kept

to a good standard, that can provide worthwhile research material and can provide a sound base for policy making.

However, the review of the researches done by the two Academies, as presented by the student in this thesis, might also have its own limitations, if judged by good research standards. The student is well aware of these shortcomings yet it is the best effort of which he is now capable, having achieved certain training and guidance in research methodology from his able professors.

A few of the student's limitations can be listed as:

1. The student had limited time to complete this thesis, since he had to return to his research position in Pakistan.
2. The studies under review were judged in accordance with the evaluation criteria, only by the student himself and the judgment of one individual may scarcely be taken as the final word in this connection.
3. The student, being conscious that he is a member of the faculty of one of the two Academies, tried to review the studies with as much neutrality as possible and, therefore made use of research techniques for which he thinks himself not a highly qualified person. This furthermore may be a reason for some shortcomings.
4. Both the Academies have other dimensions of their research activities which are recorded under different headings and published elsewhere as, for example, parts of the Academies' periodicals, etc. Due to the limitations of resources and time, the student reviewed only those research materials which are published categorically under name of "Research" or "Technical" publications. This evaluation may therefore be regarded as a review of only a part of the Academies' research.

APPENDIX A

BOOKS

1. Ackoff, Russel L., The Design of Social Research, Chicago, University of Chicago Press, 1953.
2. Ansari, M. A. (ed.), Social Research in National Development, Peshawar, West Pakistan Academy for Rural Development, 1963.
3. Brunner, Ed S., The Growth of a Science, New York, Harper and Row, 1957.
4. Churchman, C. W., Theory and Experimental Inference, New York, MacMillan and Co., 1948.
5. Cohen, M. R. and Nagel, E., An Introduction to Logic and Scientific Method, New York, Harcourt, Brace and World, Inc., 1934.
6. Festinger, L. and Katz, D., Research Methods in Behavioral Sciences, New York, Dryden Press, 1953.
7. Goode, W. J. and Hatt, P. K., Methods in Social Research, New York, McGraw-Hill Book Co., 1952.
8. Government of Pakistan, The Second Five Year Plan, Karachi, The Government of Pakistan Press, 1960.
9. Herbert Hyman, Survey Design of Analysis, New York, The Free Press, 1960.
10. Johnson, P. O. and Rao, M. S., Modern Sampling Methods, Minneapolis, University of Minnesota Press, 1959.
11. Madge, John, Origin of Scientific Sociology, New York, Free Press, 1962.
12. Merton, R. K., Social Theory and Social Structure, New York, The Free Press, 1961.
13. _____ (et. al.), Sociology Today, New York, Basic Books, Inc., 1961.
14. Mills, C. W., The Sociological Imagination, New York, Grove Press, 1959.
15. Roger Ackoff, Scientific Method, New York, John Wiley and Sons, 1962.
16. Seltiz, Claire (et. al.), Research Methods in Social Relations, New York, Holt, Rinehart and Winston, 1959.
17. Travers, Robert M. W., An Introduction to Educational Research, New York, The MacMillan and Co., 1958.

JOURNAL ARTICLES

1. Brunner, E. S., "Sociology Tomorrow," Rural Sociology, Vol. X, 1945.
2. Duncan, "Rural Sociology: Coming of Age," Rural Sociology, Vol. XIX, 1954.
3. Hamilton, "Some Current Problems in the Development of Rural Sociology," Rural Sociology, Vol. XV, 1950.
4. Hoffer, C., "The Development of Rural Sociology," Rural Sociology, Vol. XXVI, 1961.
5. Larson, O. F., "The Role of Rural Sociology in a Changing Society," Rural Sociology, Vol. XXIV, 1959.
6. Nelson Lowrey, "Rural Sociology--Dimensions and Horizons," Rural Sociology, Vol. X, 1945.
7. Robert K. Merton, "The Bearing of Empirical Research on the Development of Social Theory," American Sociological Review, Vol. XIII, 1948.
8. Sewell, W. H., "Needed Research in Rural Sociology," Rural Sociology, Vol. XXV, 1950.
9. Taves, M. G., and Gross, Neal, "A Critique of Rural Sociology Research 1950," Rural Sociology, Vol. XVII, 1952.
10. T. Lynn Smith, "Rural Sociology: A Trend Report and Bibliography," Current Sociology, Vol. VI, 1957.
11. Williams, Robin M., "Review of Current Research in Rural Sociology," Rural Sociology, Vol. XI, 1946.

UNPUBLISHED PAPERS

1. Fayyaz, M., Rural Sociological Development in Asia. Unpublished paper, Department of Sociology, Cornell University, 1963.
2. Hambir, Phadtare, Community Development in India Analyzed as a Systemic Linkage. Unpublished paper, Department of Sociology and Anthropology, Michigan State University, 1962.
3. Khan, Akhter Hameed, Crucial Issues in Education. Address to graduate students and visitors at Michigan State University, 1964.
4. Loomis, C. P., Uses of Rural Sociology. Unpublished paper, Department of Sociology and Anthropology, Michigan State University, 1964.
5. Micheal, Raj (et. al.), Community Development Program in India. Unpublished paper, Department of Sociology and Anthropology, Michigan State University, 1962.
6. Niehoff, Richard O., Instructional and Research Programs of the Academies as Related to Development for Improvement of Public Administration in Pakistan. Draft memo, Michigan State University, no date.
7. Schuler, Edgar A., The Origin and Nature of Pakistan Academies for Village Development. Unpublished paper, College of Education, Michigan State University, 1964. (This manuscript has been accepted for publication and since then published in September issue of Rural Sociology).
8. _____, Increasing Competence in Educational Institutional Building Through Cross Cultural Cooperation. Unpublished paper, College of Education, Michigan State University, 1963.
9. Sturt, D. W., Unfulfilled Efforts and Reasons Therefor. Unpublished memo, Peshawar, West Pakistan Academy for Rural Development, 1960.
10. _____, Suggestions for an Extension Program for the Academy. Unpublished memo, Peshawar, West Pakistan Academy for Rural Development, 1960.
11. _____, Improving Academy's Public Relations Program. Unpublished memo, Peshawar, West Pakistan Academy for Rural Development, 1960.
12. _____, Improving the Academy's Teaching Program. Unpublished memo, Peshawar, West Pakistan Academy for Rural Development, 1960.

APPENDIX B

TABLE I

DISTRIBUTION OF WEST PAKISTAN ACADEMY RESEARCH REPORTS
ON THE BASIS OF SELECTED EVALUATION CRITERIA

Criteria	Efforts to Meet Criteria				
	Adequate	Inadequate	None	Does Not Apply	Total
A. <u>Orientation</u>					
1. Statement of the objectives	11	7	--	--	18
2. Statement of the hypotheses	3	--	9	6	18
3. Theoretical orientation	7	4	7	--	18
4. Definition of key concepts	2	4	12	--	18
5. Orientation to previous research	3	6	9	--	18
B. <u>Characteristics of Data</u>					
1. Concrete definition of universe	12	6	--	--	18
2. Sampling					
a. Procedure reported	5	9	3	1	18
b. Representativeness assured	5	9	3	1	18
3. Meaningfulness of data					
a. Adequacy of instruments					
(1) Standardized instruments	14	4	--	--	18
(2) New instruments	--	--	18	--	18
(3) Validity of measures	9	--	7	--	18

TABLE I Continued

Criteria	Efforts to Meet Criteria				
	Adequate	Inadequate	None	Does Not Apply	Total
b. Competent use of instruments	7	11	--	--	18
c. Secondary sources judiciously used and acknowledged	5	3	10	--	18
C. <u>Treatment of Data</u>					
1. Accuracy of mathematics			Assumed Accurate		
2. Legitimate use of analytical technique	12	6	--	--	18
3. Control of associated variables					
a. Cross tabulation by 3-way tables	--	--	15	3	18
b. Statistical controls					
(1) Correlation	5	--	10	3	18
(2) Co-variance	2	--	13	3	18
D. <u>Conclusions</u>					
1. Clear statement of conclusions	12	3	2	1	18
2. Limits of generalization	11	5	1	1	18
3. Limitations of study and recommendations	7	5	5	1	18
4. Statement to suggested further studies	4	3	10	1	18
5. Orientation of conclusion towards					
a. Problem area	10	7	--	1	18
b. General theory	3	4	10	1	18

TABLE II

DISTRIBUTION OF EAST PAKISTAN ACADEMY RESEARCH REPORTS
ON THE BASIS OF SELECTED EVALUATION CRITERIA

Criteria	Efforts to Meet Criteria				
	Adequate	Inadequate	None	Does Not Apply	Total
A. <u>Orientation of Study</u>					
1. Statement of objectives	12	4	--	--	16
2. Statement of hypotheses	2	2	9	3	16
3. Theoretical orientation	7	4	5	--	16
4. Definition of key concepts	9	3	4	--	16
5. Orientation to previous research	9	3	4	--	16
B. <u>Characteristics of Data</u>					
1. Concrete definition of universe	14	2	--	--	16
2. Sample					
a. Procedure reported	4	10	--	2	16
b. Representativeness assured	3	11	--	2	16
3. Meaningfulness of data					
a. Adequacy of instruments					
(1) Standardized instruments	11	5	--	--	16
(2) New instruments	--	--	16	--	16
(3) Validity of measures	9	7	--	--	16

TABLE II Continued

Criteria	Efforts to Meet Criteria				
	Adequate	Inadequate	None	Does Not Apply	Total
b. Competent use of instruments	11	5	--	--	16
c. Secondary sources judiciously utilized and acknowledged	6	10	--	--	16
C. <u>Treatment of Data</u>					
1. Accuracy of mathematics	Assumed Accurate				
2. Legitimate use of analytical techniques	12	--	--	4	16
3. Control of associated variables					
a. Cross tabulation by 3-way tables	--	--	10	6	16
b. Statistical controls					
(1) Correlation	2	--	8	6	16
(2) Co-variance	--	--	9	7	16
D. <u>Conclusion</u>					
1. Clear statement of conclusion	9	3	4	--	16
2. Limits of generalization	9	7	--	--	16
3. Limitations of study and recommendations	4	3	9	--	16
4. Statement of suggested further studies	8	2	6	--	16
5. Orientation of findings to					
a. Problem area	15	1	--	--	16
b. General theory	1	9	6	--	16

APPENDIX C

WEST PAKISTAN ACADEMY'S RESEARCH PUBLICATIONS

1. Ansari, M. A. S., Assistant Directors in Basic Democracies. Peshawar, West Pakistan Academy for Village Development, 1961.
2. _____, Impact of Training of Basic Democracies on the Councillors. Peshawar, West Pakistan Academy for Village Development, 1961.
3. _____, Village Workers and Rural Development. Peshawar, West Pakistan Academy for Village Development, 1962.
4. Haider, S. M., Analysis of Development Projects. Peshawar, West Pakistan Academy for Village Development, 1962.
5. _____, Decision Making in Administration. Peshawar, West Pakistan Academy for Village Development, 1962.
6. _____, Rural Manpower Resources. Peshawar, West Pakistan Academy for Village Development, 1962.
7. _____, Studies in Community Development. Peshawar, West Pakistan Academy for Village Development, 1962.
8. _____, Experimental Foundations of Health Education. Peshawar, West Pakistan Academy for Rural Development, 1963.
9. Inayatullah, Absenteeism Among Village AID Workers. Peshawar, West Pakistan Academy for Village Development, 1961.
10. _____, An Analysis of Functioning of Seven Union Councils in Peshawar Tehsil. Peshawar, West Pakistan Academy for Village Development, 1961.
11. _____, An Experiment in Village Development. Peshawar, West Pakistan Academy for Village Development, 1961.
12. _____, Study of Union Councils in Nowshera Tehsil. Peshawar, West Pakistan Academy for Village Development, 1961.
13. _____, Study of Selected Union Councils in Rawalpindi Division. Peshawar, West Pakistan Academy for Village Development, 1962.
14. Rizvi, S. M. Z., A Study of Attitude of People Towards Zakat in Village Gharibabad. Peshawar, West Pakistan Academy for Village Development, 1961.
15. Sabzwari, M. A., Administrator Reviews Rural Development. Peshawar, West Pakistan Academy for Village Development, 1961.

16. Sajid, M. S., Learning Under Threatful Situation. Peshawar, West Pakistan Academy for Village Development, 1962.
17. _____, Diffusion and Adoption of Modern Poultry Farming Techniques. Peshawar, West Pakistan Academy for Village Development,
18. Sharif, C. M., A Pilot Study on the Effects of Increasing Magnitude of Paper Work in a Development Office. Peshawar, West Pakistan Academy for Village Development, 1961.

EAST PAKISTAN ACADEMY'S TECHNICAL PUBLICATIONS

1. Anwaruzzaman Khan, Introduction to Tractors. Comilla, Academy for Rural Development, 1962.
2. McColly, H. F., Special Report on Introducing Farm Mechanization in Comilla Cooperative Projects. Comilla, Pakistan Academy for Rural Development, 1962.
3. McDonough, Peter, An Interim Report for the Communication Section. Comilla, Academy for Rural Development, 1963.
4. Qadiw, S. A., Village Dhanishwar. Comilla, Pakistan Academy for Rural Development, 1960.
5. Rahim, S. A., A Comparative Study of Improved and Country Methods of Paddy Cultivation in Comilla. Comilla, Pakistan Academy for Rural Development, 1959.
6. _____, A Follow-up Survey on Seed Multiplication Scheme. Comilla, Pakistan Academy for Village Development, 1960.
7. _____, Diffusion and Adoption of Agricultural Practices. Comilla, Pakistan Academy for Rural Development, 1961.
8. _____, Voluntary Group Adoption of Power Pump Irrigation in Five East Pakistan Villages. Comilla, Pakistan Academy for Village Development, 1961.
9. Rahman, A. T. R., Basic Democracies at the Grass Roots. Comilla, Pakistan Academy for Village Development, 1962.
10. Zaidi, S. M. H. (ed.), Annual Evaluation Report 1960. Comilla, Pakistan Academy for Village Development, 1961.
11. Zaidi, Wiqar H., An Investigation into Factors Related to Adoption of Improved Methods of Paddy Cultivation. Comilla, Pakistan Academy for Village Development, 1960.
12. _____, A Survey of Cottage Industries in Comilla Development Area. Comilla, Pakistan Academy for Village Development, 1960.
13. _____, Adult Education Centres in Comilla Development Area. Comilla, Pakistan Academy for Village Development, 1961.
14. _____, Adoption of Improved Methods of Paddy Cultivation in Comilla Development Area III (Amon 1960). Comilla, Pakistan Academy for Village Development, 1961.

15. _____, A Survey of Attitude of Rural Population Towards Family Planning. Comilla, Pakistan Academy for Village Development, 1961.
16. _____, Adoption of Improved Methods of Paddy Cultivation in Comilla Development Area II (Aus 1960). Comilla, Pakistan Academy for Village Development, 1961.

ROOM USE ONLY

~~ROOM USE ONLY~~

~~MAR 15 1969~~ 007

~~APR 23 1971~~ 113