

22697763



This is to certify that the

thesis entitled

An Assessment of the Integration/Exploitation
Framework for Understanding Women in the
International Division of Labor: The Case
of Third World Women Workers in Transnational
Factories presented by

Susan Joel

has been accepted towards fulfillment
of the requirements for

Masters degree in Arts

Melissa A Barker

Major professor

Date May 16, 1989

O-7639

MSU is an Affirmative Action/Equal Opportunity Institution

LIBRARY
Michigan State
University



RETURNING MATERIALS:

Place in book drop to remove this checkout from your record. *FINES* will be charged if book is returned after the date stamped below.

300 033 MAY 18 1998 APR 21 2001		
---------------------------------------	--	--

**AN ASSESSMENT OF THE INTEGRATION/EXPLOITATION
FRAMEWORK FOR UNDERSTANDING WOMEN IN THE
INTERNATIONAL DIVISION OF LABOR:
THE CASE OF THIRD WORLD WOMEN WORKERS
IN TRANSNATIONAL FACTORIES**

By

Susan Joel

A THESIS

**Submitted to
Michigan State University
in partial fulfillment of the requirements
for the degree of**

MASTER OF ARTS

Department of Sociology

1989

ABSTRACT

AN ASSESSMENT OF THE INTEGRATION/EXPLOITATION FRAMEWORK FOR UNDERSTANDING WOMEN IN THE INTERNATIONAL DIVISION OF LABOR: THE CASE OF THIRD WORLD WOMEN WORKERS IN TRANSNATIONAL FACTORIES

By

Susan Joel

The expansion of factories owned by transnational corporations into developing countries has had tremendous impact on the social, economic and cultural institutions of the countries within which they are located. One result of this expansion, not generally predicted or desired by host countries, has been the preference for female employees in various types of assembly operations.

The main objective of this project was to evaluate the theoretical framework through which the analysis of the employment and treatment of Third World women by transnational corporations has previously been conducted. The two primary theoretical perspectives of "integration" and "exploitation" were evaluated through a critical analysis of 15 case studies conducted between 1976-1989 in less developed countries with a significant number of transnational factories between.

The findings suggest that the experiences of female TNC employees cannot be placed within either the integration or

Susan Joel

exploitation framework and makes suggestions for the development of an improved conceptual framework for use in future research.

In memory of D.O.D.
Kenneth W. Joel
(1930-1987)

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I would like to thank my advisor, Melissa Barker, for her unfailing support, encouragement and guidance. Her timely and thoughtful reading of this work was greatly appreciated. I would also like to thank my committee members, Rita Gallin and Cathy A. Rakowski, for their helpful ideas and suggestions.

Thanks also to the many friends who have provided support and encouragement, especially to Rosanne Roraback. Special thanks to Dan, whose tolerance of my studies and belief in my abilities have eased my way.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	Page
LIST OF FIGURES	viii
 Chapter	
I. INTRODUCTION	1
II. LITERATURE REVIEW	5
Overview of the Theoretical Literature	7
Modernization Theory	7
Dependency Theory	8
World Systems Theory	9
Women, Patriarchy and Transnational Factory Employment	11
Definitions of Relevant Terms	19
Integration	19
Marginalization and Exploitation	21
III. FRAMEWORK FOR ANALYSIS AND METHODOLOGY	26
Methodology	30
Criteria for Case Selection	31
IV. EMPLOYMENT FINDINGS	37
Employment and Economic Indicators Factors Related to Inegration and Exploitation	37
The Emergence of Women's Industrial Employment	38
Why Women Work	43
Acceptance of Women's Wage Labor	46
Female Labor Force Participation	48
Job Opportunities for Women	51
Distribution of Women in the Labor Force	53
LDC Unemployment and TNCs	55
Discrimination Based on Gender, Age and Marital Status	61
Wages and Working Conditions in TNC Factories	65
TNC Work Hours	72
TNC Management and Supervisory Strategies	73
Opportunities for Promotion	75
TNC Worker Satisfaction	77
Summary	79

TABLE OF CONTENTS (continued)

Chapter		
V.	INTRA-FAMILIAL RELATIONSHIPS	82
	Characteristics of Female TNC Workers'	
	Households of Origin	83
	Division of Household Labor	84
	Economic Contributions of Mothers and	
	Daughters	85
	The Influences of Ethnicity and Religion .	92
	Values and Lifestyle Choices of Female TNC	
	Workers	93
	Marital Ideals	96
	Female-Headed Households	97
	Summary	99
VI.	CONCLUSION	100
	Integration or Exploitation?	106
	APPENDIX: Summary of Case Studies	113
	BIBLIOGRAPHY	119

LIST OF FIGURES

Figure 1.	Socio-Economic Conditions Supporting the Integration Perspective	28
Figure 2.	Guide to Case Studies	32

CHAPTER ONE

INTRODUCTION

The expansion of factories owned by transnational corporations into developing countries¹ has had a tremendous impact on the social, economic and cultural institutions of the countries within which they are located. Governments of developing countries, pressured to accumulate foreign currency for exchange, to meet foreign debt payments, and to provide jobs for their citizens often offer tax relief, low minimum wages, and other incentives to encourage these corporations to locate their assembly operations within their borders. One result of this phenomenon, not generally predicted or desired by host countries, has been the preference for female employees in various types of assembly operations. For example, the mid-1960s development of the

¹ The term "developed nations" is used here to describe those nations that have achieved what may be described as the highest level of capitalist development -- imperialism. Imperialism occurs when developed-country capital's acquisition of the means of production in less developed countries is "accompanied by the utilization of political and military resources to protect and maintain the means of production" which it now controls (Evans, 1979: 16). The more commonly used "west" or "western-style capitalism" is avoided for two reasons. First, transnational corporations are involved in economies in less developed areas of the west, specifically Mexico as well as other regions of Latin America. Second, Asian nations including Japan and Taiwan have situated assembly operations in parts of the less economically developed areas of the world.

Border Industrialization Program by the Mexican government was intended to absorb the young, mostly male Mexican workers who were unemployed as a result of the United States government's decision to end the Bracero Program (Van Waas 1982). And yet, women comprise the majority of employees in the electronics and textile industries -- not only in Mexico, but all over the world (Ward 1986).

The main objective of this project was to evaluate the theoretical framework through which the analysis of the employment and treatment of Third World women by transnational corporations (TNCs) has previously been conducted. This analysis has been most often framed around the following question: Are the women employed by transnational corporations in factories located in developing countries being integrated into or exploited by the international economic system?

Although the terms "integration" and "exploitation" are not necessarily mutually exclusive, the literature on this subject has tended to frame the debate as if the impact of the assembly work that women do in transnational factories must fit into either one or the other of these categories. For the purposes of this project the concepts of integration and exploitation were initially treated as if they were, in fact, at either end of a continuum in order to reflect the way the primary literature in this area has used

these conceptual categories. Later this dichotomy was critically examined and evaluated.

After the initial review of the literature was conducted, the following questions emerged as central to reaching an understanding of the nature of transnational factory employment for Third World women:

1. Has the introduction of transnational factory employment improved women's relative status in their respective societies?
2. Is the participation of Third World women in the international economy through their employment in transnational factories the "solution to women's oppression" or does it merely subject them to more "modern" forms of oppression (Tiano 1987)?

In pursuing these questions, the phases of this project included: an evaluation of the adequacy of the use of integration vs. exploitation as a strict dichotomy, an analysis of the limitations of the framework used to describe the women in transnational employment debate, an evaluation of Marxist-feminist theory in terms of its applicability to the position of Third World women, and the development of recommendations to improve the scholarly discourse so that it accurately reflects current theoretical and empirical knowledge of this phenomenon.

The material provided below is organized into five primary chapters: Literature Review, Framework for Analysis and Methodology, Employment Findings, Intra-Familial Relationships, and Conclusion. The Literature Review summarizes a bibliographic search in three areas. The first

section summarizes literature relevant to the underlying issues and definitions of the women in the international division of labor debate. The second section provides definitions of relevant terms and reviews the theoretical literature. The third section of the literature review explores the bibliographic search as it relates to case studies which report on female TNC employment in various parts of the less developed world.

Chapter Three provides a discussion of the methodological approach used to collect and analyze the data used in this project. The research findings are summarized in Chapters Five and Six. In the Conclusion, these findings are extended and assessed in light of the theoretical debate between integration and exploitation.

CHAPTER TWO

LITERATURE REVIEW

Literature on TNCs seems to take several forms. Much of what is written on these corporations is written by and for the managerial elite of transnational corporations themselves. This body of literature centers around the advantages of off-shore production, the advantages of one location over another, and how to obtain the lucrative tax and other benefits which LDC governments offer.² Another general category of writings about TNCs is critical of their philosophy and practices.³ Found mainly in the alternative press, these articles are indictments of TNC domination of the international economy, and often make connections between the conditions and circumstances of developed and developing country workers.

The third category, and the primary source of theoretical insights and empirical data for this project, is

² See for example, Clasen, T. F. 1981. "U.S. foreign-trade zone manufacturing and assembly: Overview and update." Law and Policy International Business 13(1): 339-348; Didsburg, H. H. 1985. The global economy: Today, tomorrow, and the transition. Bethesda, Maryland: World Future Society; and Dror, D. M. 1984. "Aspects of labor law and relations on selected export processing zones." International Labour Review 123: 705-722.

³ See for example, Bekken, J. 1984. "Where labor and life are cheap." Industrial Worker 81(3): 6; Christian Conference of Asia-Urban Rural Mission. 1983. Struggling to survive: Women workers in Asia. Hong Kong: CCA-URM; and Siegel, L. 1979. "Microelectronics does little for Third World." Pacific Research Review 10(2).

the literature found in scholarly journals, books, and unpublished documents which focus on the relationship between women and transnational corporations. Employment in TNCs in general and of women, in particular, is a recent phenomenon and currently affects only a small percentage of the world's workers. As a result, a relatively small body of literature on this subject exists. The emergent nature of the issue of employment of LDC women in TNCs made it an ideal subject for exploration. A review of the existing literature identified supporting and contradictory trends and conclusions, and pointed the direction for further research. However, much of the literature on this subject suffered from either being theoretical without applying the theories to real-life situations, or consisted of reports of field experiences which made broad generalizations based on narrow, time limited interactions with specific TNC employees and employers. This type of research often seemed to lack an explicit theoretical framework.

In reviewing this literature, three outcomes were generated. First, was simply to identify the existing sources of research on women in transnational corporation employment.⁴ The second outcome of the literature review was an assessment of the theoretical and empirical

⁴ Such an effort has not, to my knowledge, been done and the resulting bibliography will create a useful research tool.

directions of the research up to this point. This assessment of both the directions and the strengths and weaknesses of the various lines of research pointed to the need for further investigation. The third outcome was the identification of a specific theoretical framework and a set of indicators for further analysis of the empirical evidence.

The following sections of this chapter will summarize the existing literature on the theoretical frameworks used to understand women's waged labor, the kind of research on women's employment in TNC factories undertaken thus far, and definitions of the terms and concepts relevant to this project's objectives.

Overview of the Theoretical Literature

Three general perspectives -- Modernization Theory, Dependency Theory and World Systems Theory -- have been most commonly used by researchers interested in the process of development in less developed countries. Each of these approaches is reviewed and summarized below.

Modernization Theory

Modernization theory has until recently been the principal framework for most development/industrialization programs initiated by industries (TNCs), countries, and development agencies. This theory holds that developed countries should be used as models for the industrialization

and development of the Third World. Beginning with Boserup (1970) this theory came under criticism by many who felt that efforts designed with modernization in mind had been of only limited success. The main critique of modernization theory has been that developed countries industrialized and modernized under a different set of economic and historical circumstances. The very existence of a developed part of the world would have an impact on the possibilities and direction for development of the less developed countries (LDCs). LDCs would not be able to enter previously untapped markets or develop technologies without an understanding of the ways that they were already being used by developed countries. LDCs would be at a competitive disadvantage compared to the established industrial societies in North America and Western Europe.

Dependency Theory

The dependency school developed out of a critical analysis of development by Latin America researchers seeking to provide a more critical framework for assessing the impact of development efforts in LDCs. Work by Amin (1976) and Frank (1974) discussed the impact of colonialism and imperialist exploitation on the prospects for development for most LDCs. This perspective asserts that imperialism and colonial exploitation laid the groundwork for the continuing exploitation of LDCs. As LDCs gained their

independence and sought ways to establish a foothold in the international economy, the ruling elite and national bourgeoisie offered incentives to various transnational firms to situate their assembly operations in their countries. In this way, LDCs believed they could increase employment opportunities for an increasing number of displaced peasants migrating to cities as well as gain access to the foreign currency essential for participation in the international economy. Dollars, for example, were essential to obtain and repay World Bank loans which were offered as a quick and relatively painless way to speed up economic development and modernization during a time of economic expansion. As a result of this type of development, the bourgeoisie and ruling classes of developed and developing countries formed alliances which allowed for the exploitation of the LDCs' poor and powerless and resulted in capital accumulation for both. The industrialization and development that occurred as a result of these interactions was dependent on the developed country for the technology used to produce products, as well as the markets in which to sell the manufactured goods.

World Systems Theory

World Systems Theory as developed by Wallerstein (1974) extends many elements of the dependency perspective. With developed countries as the "core" of this international

economic system, semi-industrialized countries like Brazil as the "semi-periphery", and LDCs as "periphery", World Systems Theory provides an analytical framework which sees the world as a complex interrelated economic system where groups and individuals compete and cooperate, not on the basis of national ties but rather in ways that reflect commonalities based on class attributes such as access to power and wealth. World Systems Theory views the elites of the world (often through the actions of states and transnational corporations) working together to increase wealth and power, as well as access to and control of markets. Wallerstein and World Systems Theory, however, have been criticized for failing "to take account of the significance of production relations" while redefining "capitalism in terms of circulation and trade rather than as a mode of production" (Miles 1984) as well as for "interpreting social phenomena in underdeveloped countries as an automatic effect of the requirements of capital accumulation at a local level," ignoring "local diversity particularly among working class and class fractions" (Fernandez-Kelly 1983, 2).

The experience of Third World women workers in TNC factories is better understood when these theories are incorporated into an analytical framework that recognizes that workers' experiences and opportunities are shaped by the position of their countries in the international

economy. Modernization Theory provides a way of understanding the reasons why development agencies and LDC government officials have sought out foreign capital and provided opportunities for foreign manufacturing in the hopes that the jobs, technology and dollars provided would lead to a more modernized and wealthier citizenry. Dependency Theory and World Systems provide an explanation for why the hopes and expectations of modernization theorists have not yet, and probably will never, be realized.

Women, Patriarchy and Transnational Factory Employment

The recognition that national borders and motivations based on nationalist ideologies hold less weight in a time when the world has become smaller and the economy is increasingly internationalized lends support to both the Dependency and World Systems analytical frameworks. However, an additional factor of the internationalization of the economy is overlooked by both. These theories illuminate the advantages to developed country based transnational corporations in situating their labor-intensive assembly operations in developing countries. An alliance between the management of transnational corporations and the local bourgeoisie in developing countries is profitable for both. The local bourgeoisie, as a result of this alliance, is likely to obtain access to the

world market, subcontracting opportunities, profits from the lease of land and buildings to be used as assembly sites and/or housing for TNC managers and their families, development of businesses to provide services and products to TNC management and local TNC employees with increased resources and an increased demand for services as a result of reduced 'leisure' time. In addition, the local bourgeoisie is often recruited into management positions within the factories.

Local governments also benefit in the short term from an increase in the number of jobs which, at least symbolically, can result in decreased unemployment statistics. Wage earners are also required to pay taxes and a working person is less likely to be eligible for social services which can take the pressure off of financially-strapped governments. Local governments are also enticed by the promise of the transfer of technology, although this has been shown to occur infrequently (Lim 1978). With the expiration of tax holidays and other incentives offered to TNC management, governments can also expect to increase their revenues. However, governments cannot control the phenomenon of the "runaway shop", whereby factories relocate to countries which are currently offering incentives and concessions that TNC management find irresistible (Leung 1985).

Transnational corporations are the third group which benefits from incentives to locate factories in less developed countries. Such incentives are offered by local governments, and include: the provision of infrastructure, laws which restrict the activities of unions, low wages, limited or non-existent import and export tariffs, and tax holidays.

Critical, class-based frameworks are able to identify the potential problems that arise from this state-local-international capital alliance but they seem to focus, as suggested by Miles (1984), on the circulation aspects of capitalism, and overlook the production arena. When one looks at production in TNC factories what one discovers is the overwhelming concentration of women in the lowest paid assembly positions. Class-based analyses of this phenomenon are unable to explain this almost-universal preference for women workers in these jobs in transnational corporations. An understanding of the preference for women employees on the part of TNC-managers emerges from an integration of theoretical frameworks which recognize unequal and uneven development on international and national levels with those that help to explain the unequal position of women within families and societies and the division of labor. Feminist theories which recognize the role played by historical patterns of the patriarchal subordination of women all over the world add an essential dimension to the

conceptualization of the process of integration of women into "modern" forms of economic development (Hartmann 1981).

Although TNC employment comprises only a small percentage of available jobs in developing countries, an understanding of the implications of such employment is important. Transnational corporations in emergent capitalist countries set the tone for employment practices there. The experiences of women who work in these factories have important implications for the evolving status and living conditions for women. The economic and working conditions of Third World women in TNC factories can provide insight into the future of other workers as the number of these types of assembly jobs are created.

LDCs have their own patriarchal ideologies that are culturally specific and differ from those of developed nations as a result of different historical and material experiences. The spread of technology into developing countries involves the introduction of imperialist capitalism as well as western patriarchal ideologies which, on the surface, seem to conflict with the culturally-specific economic systems and patriarchal traditions of some less developed countries. One of the most interesting features of capitalist development is the way in which capitalism is able to adapt to existing cultural norms while at the same time providing the motivation for a shift in these norms, thereby developing the mechanisms for people to

adapt to changing material conditions. This phenomenon explains how capitalism and "old" and "new" forms of patriarchy work together in the name of development to open new territory in order to maximize profits.

The spread of technology into less developed countries involves the introduction of both imperialist capitalism and patriarchal ideologies through the promise of material rewards and increased status to those members of society who are recruited to participate in the technological development of host countries. The extent to which one is able to accumulate these rewards is contingent, however, on class affiliation, gender and access to power in a given society. By far the greatest beneficiaries of this form of investment are elites within host countries. Local industries and the state form an uneasy alliance with transnational corporations in order to maximize accumulation for all three. This is generally accomplished through the exclusion of the majority of citizens from the development process; reliance on the state to maintain an orderly and compliant work force; and the concentration of domestic capital in agriculture and manufacturing for local consumption which leaves the more capital intensive and profitable export-oriented production to the TNCs (Evans 1979; and Amin 1976). While TNC employment may be seen by many workers as secure and comparatively well-paid work, it

remains that the majority of these workers are still poor, even by Third World standards (Lim 1981).

TNC managers bring their own culturally-bound notions of men as societal and familial leaders into their interactions with representatives of LDCs. While these notions may indeed reflect the social organization of LDC societies, the impact of the usually unconscious and inadvertent introduction of western patriarchal ideologies into the development process has been known to have significant effects on the economic activities of Third World women. One commonly cited example is women's diminished access to agricultural land for subsistence activities as development plans encouraged and directed men into cash cropping activities (Boserup 1975). A second example is the TNC management practice in Southeast Asia of approaching male family heads to make their requests and strike their bargains for low-cost labor in the form of young female family members (Heyzer 1982). The process of negotiation between national and community leaders and TNC management results in the exposure of citizens of the host country to a western world view, especially among elites.

The relationship of patriarchy and capitalism contains points of contradiction and thus may be considered dialectical in nature. Although the goals of the two systems are often consistent, there is also conflict. Capitalism's objective of maximizing profits may be in

conflict with the patriarchal objective of maintaining men's traditional cultural and familial control over women.

Patriarchal authority and traditional social and familial arrangements may be affected by capitalism's preference for women employees, which is based on the belief that women will often work more "cooperatively" than men for lower wages. Women's wage labor results in more time spent outside the home and increased economic independence as a result of their wage earning activities through which they contribute to their family's economic resources (Tiano 1984). The family is the arena in which the effects of women's changing role in society is most profoundly felt, as all family members must adjust to the additional responsibilities of female household members. The degree to which a woman will experience increased economic independence as a result of her wage labor is dependent on whether or not her position in the family changes and if, as a result, she is able to make decisions about the disposal of her earnings (Lim 1981).

Transnational corporations generally situate their off-shore plants in countries for manifest as well as latent reasons. The primary manifest reason is economic. TNC managers and boards choose particular countries because they have garnered certain economic concessions from host governments in terms of taxes, minimum wage restrictions, and generous import and export policies. As a result,

operating costs are greatly reduced while the potential for profits is increased.

The latent reason may be that the chosen countries have a strong patriarchal tradition and those in control of TNCs assume that it will be possible to recruit the type of employees they prefer -- women who are docile, cooperative, and obedient and will work for low wages. There appears to be a contradiction here, however. It is difficult to understand on the face of it why patriarchal societies that have strict rules about the nature and scope of women's activities (i.e., primarily focused within the family) would condone as well as encourage the employment of women in these factories. An underlying objective of this project was to examine how capitalism and patriarchy work together in the name of development, specifically defining the areas in which they compete and cooperate.

Marxist theories of capitalist development, with their emphasis on economic relations, have tended to neglect the question of why women are singled out by TNC management as preferred employees. This preference may rest on the belief that women possess desirable traits such as timidity, docility, and deference. These are not directly economic characteristics. However, one benefit to TNC management of these characteristics, that women will work for very low wages, is the primary reason that they are the preferred employees.

One method of attempting to understand the incorporation of Third World women into the international division of labor, specifically through their employment in TNC factories, has been through a debate which attempts to discover if this form of employment results in the exploitation of or integration into the international economy of female employees. What follows is an exploration of this debate and the definition of the terms which are most relevant to it.

Definitions of Relevant Terms

Outside of the Dependency Theory literature, much of the scholarly writing on women focuses on Third World women in agricultural and/or domestic work, or women in the developed world as wage laborers and/or domestic workers. As a result, the emergence of the integration vs. exploitation debate has been highly significant. The discussion that follows defines the concepts that are frequently used in the women in development literature. These definitions are offered to provide a basis for understanding these concepts as they have been used and defined for the purposes of this project as well as to demonstrate how they fit with the theoretical frameworks discussed above.

Integration

"Integration" is used in reference to the attempt by development projects and others to facilitate the

incorporation of people and countries into the modern sectors of the economy. The concept of integration has evolved out of the applied-oriented work of social scientists and development specialists and is closely linked to Modernization Theory. The degree to which a society is engaged in productive activities related to, or included in, the global economy is often used as a measure of a country's "progress". A recognition that women were not included in development efforts to the same extent as men was first documented by Boserup (1970; 1975). Efforts to increase women's involvement in development programs grew out of a perceived private/public split between men and women. Women's responsibility for the home and nurturing of family members resulted in development efforts which sought to recognize and preserve this role for women. At the same time, there was an increasing recognition that women's subordinate status both in the home and in society in general was a product of women's lack of wage labor opportunities. It came to be believed that in order for women to become full partners both at home and in society they needed to be integrated fully into both the traditional and modern sectors of the economy. The introduction of assembly jobs for women in various regions of the Third World was seen as a great opportunity to increase women's access to wage labor and as a result their integration into the "public" realm as well as the formal economy (Elson and

Pearson 1981). Women's employment in transnational factories was considered one method for more fully utilizing women's productive potential while increasing their economic and personal well-being (Tiano 1987). "Access to stable waged employment presumably enhances a woman's self image and increases her personal autonomy" (Lim 1981, 187; 1983, 83).

Marginalization and Exploitation

In this context, "marginalization" relates to the concentration of certain workers on the "edge" or "margins" of the labor market into positions that are systematically and structurally denied access to power, prestige and higher levels of wages. Boserup (1970, 1975) was among the first to identify this phenomenon among Third World women. She noticed that the erosion of traditional female roles in the market, on the farm, in industry, and from other aspects of the development process had resulted in a decline in women's presence in the economic sectors of various societies. Marginalization is, in some instances, used interchangeably with the concept of exploitation. At other times, supporters of the exploitation argument assume that marginalization is at least an indicator of the existence of exploitation in a given economic system.

Marginalization as a theoretical concept suggests that this phenomenon is an irreversible, structural condition

within dependent capitalist development (Beneria 1982). It is a product of capitalist organization and the use of labor involving a separation between production (production of surplus value) and reproduction (production of use value, including reproduction of the labor force through childbearing and rearing as well as the nurturing of present and future wage laborers); a hierarchal structure of the labor process; a rise of surplus labor and an industrial reserve; and a mutual accommodation between capitalism and patriarchy.

There are several by-products of the marginalization process. They were first seen in developed capitalist countries around the turn of the century and include the following: the withdrawal of women from the labor force, particularly in the early stages of industrialization as a result of the efforts of male-dominated trade union movements to "protect" women and children on the job; the previously active women's labor force reconstituted as a secondary labor force and concentrated into inferior positions in occupational hierarchies and sectors of the economy at low wages; and women's employment destabilized and casualized as part of their deployment as a reserve army.

Marginality is a structural phenomenon which results from imbalances between the labor requirements of the capitalist sector and the available labor supply. These

imbalances are often an effect of the increased technological dependence of industry and manufacturing and continued social inequalities which deny access to technology-based jobs through, for example, inadequate education and training opportunities. Women have been particularly affected by this phenomenon and, as a result, most women are excluded from manufacturing jobs and are instead absorbed into the informal sector or subsistence fringe of the economy (Charlton 1984). A similar transition took place in the developed world during the Industrial Revolution. It is a product of rural-urban migration, which is, in turn, a result of decreasing access to land for women and others in response to the increased concentration of agricultural landholdings due to increased cash cropping for export.

Marginalization theorists point to several indicators of women's exclusion from the benefits of industrialization and a modernized economy to support this theory. First, they cite the general global reduction of women's participation rates in income producing labor. Second, they demonstrate that women are now concentrated into the informal and peripheral sectors of the labor market. They also point to a decline in women's share of capitalist -- wage labor and manufacturing -- employment. Finally, they cite the growing economic inequality between female and male workers (Beneria and Sen 1981).

This model of economic transition which involves the concentration of certain people at the bottom of the industrial employment hierarchy and the marginalization of peripheral industries at the fringes of the global industrial "second sector" is believed inadequate by some. The primary problem cited with this theory is that many of the terms are inadequately defined and are difficult to operationalize. The exploitation position, which emerged out of the more theoretically-oriented branches of social science and development, may be viewed, in some ways, as an attempt to overcome some of the limitations of marginalization theory.

One of the essential questions of this debate is whether or not transnational factory employment exploits women. In order to determine if this is the case one must have a clear understanding of what is meant by exploitation. For the purposes of this project, exploitation is defined in the traditional Marxian sense as the expropriation of surplus labor (Vogel 1983). However, there is much evidence to support the idea that transnational factory employment has differential effects on women and men. These differential effects are a product of imperialist capitalism as it combines with patriarchy. It is important to look beyond capitalist relationships between employers and prospective or current female employees. Looking beyond these economic relationships means observing how patriarchy

is used to exploit women's labor; how the income from their labor is distributed within their families; and the effects of wage labor employment on their lifestyles. These factors are important aspects of the nature of the exploitation of Third World women (Charlton 1984; Dixon, Martinez, and McCaughan 1985; Mies 1986; and Pena 1980).

The theoretical and conceptual material summarized in this chapter provides important background material for understanding how the integration and exploitation perspectives have attempted to explain and understand the employment of Third World women in TNC factories. This task is undertaken in Chapters Three and Four.

CHAPTER THREE

FRAMEWORK FOR ANALYSIS AND METHODOLOGY

Much attention has been paid to the issues of the impact of imperialist capitalism, through the introduction of TNC assembly operations, on the economic and social systems of LDC societies. However, previous efforts have not developed an analysis that combines the general societal costs and benefits with the very direct and specific costs and benefits to women and their families. In general, there have been two broad traditions in the literature on this subject. The first tradition emphasizes applied-oriented research, while the second takes a more theoretical approach. Applied-oriented research has tended to focus on benefits to women which accrue from this form of waged labor and look for indicators that women are being "integrated" into the formal economic system. On the other hand, theoretically-oriented research has tended to focus on its costs, and the ways in which women are "exploited" as a result of waged labor. However, a significant contribution to linking these two literatures is provided by Leung (1985).

In a study of women workers in the newly industrialized countries of Asia, Leung (1985) provided a skeletal framework for analyzing the multiple consequences of development. The goal of Leung's research was to examine

the issue of integration or exploitation⁵ in terms of the lives and experiences of female industrial workers in the newly industrializing countries of Asia (Taiwan, South Korea, Singapore and Hong Kong). In her study, Leung (1985) examined various family, economic and political factors which, when combined together, provided a picture of whether or not female TNC workers are alienated and/or marginalized or benefitted from this form of employment.

Leung's study operationalized the integration and exploitation perspectives in terms of the costs and benefits of TNC factory employment for women. The analysis conducted in this project adapted her model, using the specific socio-economic factors cited in her study, while adding others considered appropriate, to evaluate the conditions of Third World transnational factory employment. These indicators are listed in Figure 1 below and have been formulated to represent the perspective of the more applied-oriented integrationist researchers.

The indicators described in Figure 1 provided the basis for assessing the validity of the exploitation and the integration perspectives. That is, if the data suggested positive outcomes for the social/familial and employment factors of female TNC workers in LDCs, then the integration

⁵ Instead of the terms integration and exploitation, Leung describes these concepts as either beneficial to women (integration) or as alienating or marginalizing (exploitation).

FIGURE 1

SOCIO-ECONOMIC CONDITIONS SUPPORTING THE INTEGRATION PERSPECTIVE

I. Employment

- A. Women work as individuals to gain economic independence.
- B. Equal opportunity exists for all, regardless of sex, age, or marital status:
 - 1. no discrimination based on sex, age, or marital status
 - 2. equal access to all types of jobs for men and women
 - 3. employers are as likely to hire women as men for all jobs.
- C. Existence of equal promotion opportunities.
- D. Existence of equal pay for equal work.
- E. Equal hours of work for men and women:
 - 1. overtime is voluntary or, if mandatory, is required equally of male and female employees.
- F. Existence of opportunities to develop meaningful, transferable technical skills for use to facilitate either promotion or transfer.
- G. Existence of training programs equally available to both male and female workers.
- H. No occupational segregation by gender.
- I. Presence of labor-related policies including:
 - 1. right to strike
 - 2. right to form and join trade unions
 - 3. existence of legislated minimum wage standards
 - 4. protection from management retaliation against workers engaged in trade union activities.

II. Social/Familial

- A. Erosion of male-centered Confucian and/or patriarchal ethics which support notions that:
 - 1. women are inferior
 - 2. women are a source of trouble
 - 3. women should be subordinated to men under natural law.
- B. Redistribution of reproductive labor of society and the family.
- C. Increased social freedom for women in:
 - 1. marriage
 - 2. social activities
 - 3. lifestyle choices.
- D. Development of social norms supporting smaller family size.
- E. Existence of free, equal, and compulsory education.

perspective would be supported. However, if the evidence was contradictory to these indicators and, in fact, presented a picture of continued inequality for women at home, at work, at school, and in society, then the exploitation perspective would be supported.

Yet, a third alternative could also be anticipated. That is, the results could be mixed and support could be found for both perspectives. Leung's research concluded that the experience of female TNC factory workers in Hong Kong, Singapore, South Korea, and Taiwan has been paradoxical. That is, while these workers have been primarily responsible for the rapid and successful industrialization of their countries through their diligent and low-cost employment, they are still regarded as a secondary labor force and second class citizens in their countries. This secondary status results in continued exploitation, not only by their employers, but by society and their families as well. She concluded that women workers must recognize both the class and gender exploitation that is responsible for their secondary status and that they must organize to challenge their exploitation as a class and, at the same time, work to form a feminist movement that directly reflects their concerns as women dually exploited as workers and as women (1985, 86-87).

Taking Leung's research as a starting point, this project analyzed 15 case studies to provide an opportunity

for applying the theoretical constructs and indicators discussed above to the real-life situations faced by female TNC employees. The indicators discussed above, when applied to the data contained in these case studies, provided a critical assessment of the usefulness of the integration and exploitation perspectives. In addition, this analysis pointed the way to a clearer and more accurate framework for assessing the role of women under imperialist capitalism, as well as an attempt to replicate the conclusions found by Leung. Chapters Four and Five present a summary of the findings of a critical review of the case studies.

Methodology

As the intent of this project was to identify and explore the theoretical frameworks which seek to explain and understand the participation of women in transnational employment through a sample of relevant case studies, documentary methods were used to collect the data. A comprehensive bibliographic search was undertaken to identify case studies of women in transnational employment which specifically addressed the circumstances, characteristics, and conditions of this employment. The search was undertaken at four libraries (Michigan State University, the University of Michigan, the State of Michigan, and the University of Arizona) and included a detailed search through the card catalogs, review of various

social science indexes (i.e., indexes of sociological and social science journals, Public Affairs Information Service, The Alternative Press Index, and the Social Science Citation Index). In addition, works cited in footnotes and bibliographies of relevant books and articles were sought out.⁶

Criteria for Case Selection

The data set was selected on the basis of several criteria. The final list included 15 articles and books (see Figure 2 and Appendix). This list evolved from a determination of whether the various case studies included in the bibliography were available in the collections of the libraries listed above and whether or not they could be obtained from alternative sources in a timely manner.

The time period of 1976-1989 was selected in that it provided for more than a decade of analyses that begin at the time of the first serious foray into the investigation of women's employment in transnational factories situated in LDCs (for example, North American Congress on Latin America 1975; Takeo 1977; and Wheaton and Mays 1976) and ends with the present. In this way it was possible to determine the

⁶ The search process began under the direction of Dr. Richard Child Hill while I was a student in his Documentary and Bibliographic Methods course, Spring 1988.

FIGURE 2
GUIDE TO CASE STUDIES

<u>Case Study #</u>	<u>Country</u>	<u>Author</u>	<u>Title</u>
1	Mauritius	Hein	The feminization of industrial employment in Mauritius: A case of sex segregation.
2	Mexico	Fernandez-Kelly	For we are sold, I and my people: Women and industry in Mexico's frontier.
3	Mexico	Tiano	Maquiladoras in Mexicali: Integration or exploitation?
4	Mexico	Tiano	Maquiladoras, women's work and unemployment in Northern Mexico.
5	Singapore/ Malaysia	Foo & Lim	Poverty, ideology, and women export factory workers in Asia.
6	Malaysia	Grossman	Women's place in the integrated circuit.
7	Malaysia/ Singapore	Heyzer	From rural subsistence to industrial peripheral work force: An examination of female Malaysian migrants and capital accumulation in Singapore.
8	Singapore	Lim	Women in the Singapore economy.
9	Singapore/ Malaysia	Lin	Health, women's work and industrialization in the semi-conductor industry in Singapore and Malaysia.
10	Malaysia	McLellan	Reciprocity or exploitation? Mothers and daughters in the changing economy of rural Malaysia.
11	Taiwan	Arrigo	Economic and political control of workers in multinational electronics factories in Taiwan: Martial law coercion and world market uncertainty.
12	Taiwan	Arrigo	The industrial work force of young women in Taiwan.
13	Taiwan	Diamond	Women and industry in Taiwan.
14	Taiwan	Gallin	Women and export industry in Taiwan: The muting of class consciousness.
15	Taiwan	Kung	Factory work and women in Taiwan: Changes in self-image and status.

nature and extent of the changes that have occurred over the past decade.

The cases selected also focussed specifically on the employment of women in TNC-assembly operations in developing countries. Most of the cases chosen examine the electric/electronics industry and/or the apparel/garment industry.

It was also important that the cases selected were representative of the areas of the developing world with a significant transnational presence. Southeast Asia and Mexico were selected as two areas with a varied history of relations with TNCs. The countries ultimately selected reflect the amount of existing material on that country as well as an assessment that they represent an important aspect of the LDC-TNC relationship.

Taiwan was selected as representative of a country with a long history of TNC involvement (dating from the 1960s), as well as its status as a newly industrializing country ("semi-peripheral" in Dependency or World Systems analyses). Although technically two separate countries, the history and economic relations of Singapore and Malaysia are interrelated.⁷ The rich body of literature on this subject

⁷ In 1965, Singapore was expelled from the Malaysian Federation, and it has been an independent political entity ever since (Sundaram 1988). However, Singapore is an urban state, and its lack of an agricultural hinterland, as well as its common history and ethnic and social connections, have required that it maintain close economic ties to Malaysia (Jey Sundrum, personal communication, 4/6/89). As

in regard to Singapore and Malaysia made them ideal cases for inclusion here.

Literature that examined the transnational presence and its affects on women in Mexico has been comprehensively explored by several researchers, particularly Susan Tiano and Maria Patricia Fernandez-Kelly. In separate studies, these researchers have reported somewhat contradictory findings and the "exploitation" vs. "integration" debate is fairly clearly illustrated in their research. Mexico has also had a long history of transnational involvement, dating back to the middle 1960s. Its proximity to the United States is an important factor in understanding the nature and impact of this form of industrialization in Mexico. For example, the effect of TNC employment on illegal immigration to the U.S. from Mexico is an area of interest for social scientists in terms of the relative benefits of the presence of TNCs. Thus, the final list of countries included in this study is: Malaysia, Mauritius, Mexico, Singapore, and Taiwan.

a result, the research on these two countries necessarily overlaps and the case studies selected for this project often reported on the effects of TNC employment on women in both countries. Further compounding this phenomenon is the Singaporean practice of recruiting guestworkers from Malaysia, as well as other places, to meet their labor force requirements (Heyzer 1982). Therefore, the economic conditions of one country may have direct implications for the citizens and the economy of the other.

Finally, for purposes of comparison, two additional criteria were used. Studies by at least two different researchers were selected so that comparisons of their observations and conclusions would result in a more comprehensive picture of the situation. An attempt was also made to select researchers who looked at U.S.-owned enterprises in order that comparisons could be consistent across factories. TNC management practices, while varying from country to country, generally operate from similar management principles if they are based in the same countries. Managers are generally trained in institutions within that country and operate from compatible theoretical and philosophical perspectives. While not a factor in selecting the cases, it is important to note that data which provided evidence reflecting the social/familial and employment factors identified by Leung were present for all of the countries represented in this study.

This selection process was limited in four important ways which are based in the literature itself. First, most of the writings in this area have been either theoretical or applied in orientation. The theoretical articles rarely applied their frameworks to an existing example of the phenomena being conceptualized, while the case studies generally placed little importance on a theoretical orientation.

Second, limiting the cases to those which were most readily available may have introduced a certain degree of bias into the process. It may be that an important aspect or perspective on this phenomenon has been inadvertently overlooked because it may be confined to a particular region and as a result has not been cited in articles or books or librarians or faculty members were not aware of its existence and have not ordered it for their libraries or personal collections.

Third, researchers in their native areas writing in their native languages (i.e., Spanish, Chinese, etc.) may be on the forefront of new ways of examining this issue. By limiting the search to documents in English, important research may have been overlooked.

Finally, most of the case studies were conducted during the late 1970s and early 1980s and as a result the information contained in the documents may be somewhat dated. This suggests the need for fieldwork to update the data as the situation has inevitably changed over the last decade. However, it is believed that these limitations have had little impact on the overall findings of this project.

CHAPTER FOUR

EMPLOYMENT FINDINGS

The framework for critically reviewing the fifteen case studies contained in Figure 2 (also see the Appendix) focussed on two categories of data. For reasons related to clarity of the presentation, the indicators have been organized into two general categories. The first category includes all of the information specifically related to the employment and economic practices, conditions, and experiences of the female TNC employees reported in the case studies. The second category includes the data which present information describing social relations contained within the society, community, family and work site. Included in this section are indicators which define or illustrate economic relations within a family unit. This division is consistent with much of the literature related to women and employment which defines these categories variously as "separate spheres", private and public sectors of the economy, and reproductive and productive realms.

Employment and Economic Factors Related to Integration and Exploitation

As explained in Chapter Two, employment and economic indicators that aid in the assessment of women's position in the international division of labor focus on the nature of

women's work. These include: the range of employment opportunities available to women compared to men, the constraints on women's ability to work and/or receive training in the occupations they desire, and, most importantly, whether or not they receive equal treatment compared to men in terms of wages, working conditions, and promotion and transfer. Some of these factors are legislated by law (i.e., minimum wage laws, health and safety regulations); others are created through the ability to join or form independent trade unions (job security and protection); and others are products of the patriarchal values, beliefs and traditions of the host society in an interaction with the attitudes of TNC managers (e.g., job segregation by gender, restrictions on the type of work and/or the number of hours women are permitted to work per day). What follows is a summary of the findings from case study data that describe how the employment practices of various countries and TNCs fit into the integration/exploitation framework in terms of the indicators laid out above. References cited here are listed either by the author's name or by the number assigned to each case study as noted in Figure 2 and the Appendix.

The Emergence of Women's Industrial Employment

Women's lack of commitment to the labor force and society's perceptions about appropriate employment for women

leave them at the least skilled end of the labor hierarchy. In LDCs, women form a flexible potential source of labor that is attractive to labor-intensive corporations that need to keep such costs to a minimum. For the reasons cited above, women generally work for lower wages than men. At the same time, it is generally believed by TNC managers that women are more compliant, reliant, and hence, more productive employees (Hein 1986).

Women began to enter waged employment during the 1960s in Taiwan, Singapore, Mexico, and Malaysia for both supply and demand-related reasons (see cases 4, 5, 13, and 15). In her discussion of the Singapore economy, Lim (1981) reported that women's labor force participation rate increased as a result of a government-directed expansion in industrial production and the financial and service sectors of the country's economy. On the supply side, Lim pointed to structural changes in the economy and technological development which made cultural and biological beliefs about the types of work that were appropriate for each gender difficult to justify. For example, the introduction of machinery and automation made factory work less dependent on physical strength and, as a result, the notion that women were not strong enough to hold these jobs lost its relevance (1981, 5).

Changes in social policy also affected women's reproductive responsibilities through a "reduction in family

size to a 2-3 child family norm [which] limited the time and effort required for reproductive tasks such as childbearing, nursing, rearing, and housework" (Lim 1981, 5). Moreover, increased access to education as well as rising costs, standards, and aspirations in a modern urban environment resulted in favorable social attitudes toward female employment through the need for greater family income (Lim 1981, 5).

The introduction of TNC factories in Malaysia was shaped by a more specific goal than to increase general employment, increase the participation of the country in the international economy, or develop technological skills and resources. The Malaysian government's efforts at economic expansion were primarily concerned with increasing the labor force participation of Malays.⁸ The use of TNC employment to facilitate this resulted in an inadvertent and disproportionate increase in employment rates for young Malay women and an accompanying high unemployment rate for the young Malay males, which remains a concern for the Malaysian government (McLellan 1985).

⁸ There are three major ethnic groups in Malaysia: Malay, Chinese, and Indian. Since approximately 1969, Malays have held majority power in the government and have used this position to increase the participation of Malays in industry (primarily the domain of the Chinese) and in government, professional and service sector positions which have historically been dominated by Indians (Sundaram 1988).

In Mexico as well, the selection of young women as the preferred employees of TNC-managers was not a calculated objective of the Mexican government's Border Industrialization Program. The purpose of this program was to provide employment opportunities to male agricultural workers who had worked under the U.S. government's migrant guestworker program (Bracero Program) which was terminated in 1964 (Fernandez-Kelly 1983; and Tiano 1984).

Governments that host TNC assembly operations are in a difficult position. They desire the presence of TNCs for the jobs and other associated benefits they provide. While the preference for female workers may be problematic for these governments, they realize that their ability to retain and attract these operations is dependent on the presence of a large pool of low-cost, young, female workers. After nearly thirty years of experience with TNCs, government officials realize that the corporations will move their factories to more cooperative countries if it becomes difficult to maintain favorable employment and production policies (see cases 2, 4, 6, 7, 8, 10, and 11). Diamond (1979) pointed to the availability of a pool of underemployed female workers in Taiwan who will accept relatively low wages, desire only short-term employment, and are unlikely to organize and demand higher wages and seniority benefits, as a key factor in that country's industrial growth.

The perceived lack of commitment of women to the labor force as well as society's continued perceptions about appropriate employment for women continue to restrict women's options to jobs such as teaching, nursing, and domestic-related jobs including housecleaning, cooking, and child care. Nursing and teaching require formal training and, as a result, are available only to those women from families of relatively high socio-economic status. Families must be able to afford to send daughters to school as well as hire domestic servants to do the household work the daughters would normally do. Domestic jobs tend to pay little, require hard work under unpleasant conditions, and generally require workers to live-in (Lim 1981). The introduction of TNC factory assembly jobs provides a cleaner, higher paying, and higher status option for lower class women who do not want to work as domestics and cannot acquire the skills necessary to become nurses or teachers.

Tiano (1987) and other researchers indicated that the women selected for TNC-assembly work were generally not from the most vulnerable sector of the labor market. Women who were hired tended to have relatively high educational attainments and came from established urban families, as opposed to migrants recently relocated to the city. These workers form a flexible potential source of labor that is attractive to labor intensive corporations that need to keep costs to a minimum. Tiano asserted that this phenomenon is

an indication that TNC employment is not exploitative because it involves a segment of the labor force that is not necessarily desperate for income and whose incomes have not previously been required to meet family subsistence needs (1987, 17).

In support of the exploitation perspective, Kung (1976) reported that most women who worked in factories were those with the lowest educational attainments and from poor families. While education is compulsory in Taiwan, it is expensive and parents are least likely to continue funding a daughter's schooling when she could enter the labor market and become an economic asset rather than a drain on the family's resources.

Why Women Work

Fernandez-Kelly pointed out that contrary to the ideological belief that women do not need to work, many women have always had to work to meet their family's needs. The notion of women as secondary wage earners is an erroneous, albeit powerful justification and explanation of discriminatory employment policies toward women (1983, 88). When added to commonly-held beliefs about the kinds of work women are capable of performing, employment options for women become narrowly constrained. At the same time, women are deeply committed to their families and, as Fernandez-Kelly (1983) pointed out, they enter the labor force as

members of households, not as individuals. The societal and individual beliefs that women's primary obligations are to their families means that they see themselves and are seen by others as lacking commitment to the labor force.

Yet, while most female workers reported that their incomes were needed by their families, Foo and Lim asserted that "women don't work out of economic need in terms of absolute poverty or minimum physical subsistence. They work to improve consumptive standards and to contribute to their family's upward mobility" (1988, 4). Grossman (1980) supported this finding: Malaysian women stated that they worked because their families needed or wanted money. Factory work was reported by several researchers as providing opportunities for young women to exercise and express personal autonomy through consumer purchases and to acquire economic independence (see cases 5, 9, 10, 14, and 15). Some women in Malaysia and Singapore claimed that they would work even if their income was not needed (Foo and Lim 1987). However, rising standards of living and inflation have made it difficult for most families to survive without income from female household members (Lin 1986).

In all of the countries examined, women see their work as temporary. Tiano reported that women are in a vulnerable position within the labor force. She reasserted

Saffiotti's⁹ belief that because women are taught to view themselves as wives and mothers, their ambivalence regarding their roles as "wage workers" makes them willing to enter and leave the labor force according to management's requirements (1987, 4). Gallin (1989), and Foo and Lim (1988) characterized women's lack of commitment to the labor force as "rational" because their employment options are limited to dead-end, low paying jobs that do not offer realistic alternatives to marriage. In addition, women usually are expected to marry and are expected to take primary responsibility for child care. As a result, women tend to be primarily identified as wives and mothers, which leads to an underdeveloped proletarian consciousness that further limits their identification as workers.

These researchers emphasized the double bind that women experience as homemakers and wage laborers. Women are believed to belong at home; the few jobs they are able to get are monotonous and offer no prospects for promotion and/or self-fulfillment. Consequently, women look for fulfillment and satisfaction at home or in social relationships at work. The realization that their jobs hold few prospects for advancement and self-fulfillment is turned around by employers who assert that women are not interested in advancement or responsibility at their jobs. The

⁹ Quoted in Tiano (1984, 362).

justification for why women are not interested in more challenging jobs is that they obtain increased income and status from male breadwinners in their households. In addition, women are believed to be unsuited for responsible positions because they lack initiative, imagination, and daring (see cases 4, 8, and 14). The roles of women in the home reflect and reinforce their limited opportunities for waged labor. The reverse is also true, available employment opportunities caused them to seek fulfillment outside of the work place -- in the home and in social relationships.

Acceptance of Women's Wage Labor

In Mauritius, most TNC workers come from agricultural families. Forty-three percent of such workers reported that their families opposed their employment. The reluctance of family members to permit or support the employment of women in TNCs is cited by Hein (1986) as one reason for a labor shortage in that country. Moreover, it appears that parents are more reluctant for their daughters to work in TNC factories compared to other types of jobs. Hein's research found that only 29% of workers in other employment sectors such as teaching, service and domestic work, reported parental opposition to their waged labor.

In contrast to the high status afforded this form of work in other countries, most members of Taiwanese society believe that "factory work carries no status or prestige

whatsoever" (Kung 1976, 46). TNC factory workers are believed to be poorly educated, young and immature, and exploited and manipulated by factory owners.

Grossman (1980) and McLellan (1985) revealed that Malaysian parents welcomed their daughters wages, but not their increased independence. McLellan's research focused on the relationships between Malay mothers and daughters and explained how daughters' TNC work brings increased status to mothers through the high status consumer goods that daughters' salaries can buy. However, Lin (1986) reported that families are increasingly accepting decisions made by daughters in regard to their choices in jobs, marital partners, as well as in some family financial matters.

In all five countries, parents worried about damage to their daughters' reputations arising out of their TNC employment. McLellan (1985) suggested that factory work meant lowered status for young Malay women. Female factory workers were believed to risk their virginity and reduce their marriage opportunities. Other researchers in Southeast Asia supported this finding and pointed to the workers' acceptance of western ideas and practices as a factor in their diminished status (see cases 9, 10, and 13). Foo and Lim (1988) acknowledged that TNC employees adopt western styles of dress, values, and standards of beauty, but also asserted that this was true for most young

Southeast Asians and, as a result, this phenomenon could not be caused by factory work in and of itself.

The belief that prostitution is associated with TNC work was commonly held in all five countries and was mentioned as a factor in parental resistance to daughters' work in TNC factories. However, none of the researchers were able to offer any concrete evidence that such a relationship actually existed (see cases 2, 6, and 9).

Female Labor Force Participation

Cultural beliefs about whether or not, and where women should work are key factors in explaining the distribution and participation of women in the labor force. The following discussion explores the labor participation rates of women and the occupational segregation results from familial and societal beliefs about appropriate work for women.

Despite an increase in the industrial labor force participation of women in all five countries between 1970-1982, the female labor force participation rate, compared to men, remains low. Women with at least some secondary education have been identified as having experienced the greatest increase in these areas. Hein (1986) reported that in Mauritius, for example, the labor force participation rate is highest among unmarried workers, aged 20-34 (65%). In Singapore it is highest (78.4%) among women aged 20-24

(Lim 1981). The median age of female electronics workers in Mexico is 20, and the labor force participation rate among female workers aged 15-25 is 50% (Fernandez-Kelly 1983; and Tiano 1984).

Only in Mexico and Mauritius, where the percentage of female heads of households is high, did women report that they worked out of financial necessity as a result of the lack of male support due to death or desertion (Fernandez-Kelly 1983; and Hein 1986). One reason for the number of female-headed households in Mexico is the push and pull factors that encourage males to migrate illegally to the U.S. Women seek work across the border less frequently as a result of their reproductive responsibilities, especially related to child care (Tiano 1984). In Mauritius, the ease with which Muslim men obtain divorce was one explanation offered for the finding that 47.3% of female workers were separated or divorced (Hein 1986). The instability of marriage was also reported for Malay Muslims in Malaysia. However, divorced or separated women were less likely to work in factories there. Instead, they tended to rely on agricultural and domestic work, as well as income provided by daughters' factory work. This may change as the number of married women who are literate and have experience working in factories begins to increase (McLellan 1985).

Women also work for non-economic reasons. In all of the countries studied, women reported that they desired to

work to escape boredom at home, to avoid parental control, and for the opportunity for social interaction with peers. However, Hein (1986) reported that, among the Mauritian women she surveyed, only 23% said they would work after marriage. While the research in other countries is unclear in regard to whether or not currently employed single women desired to continue to work after marriage, data from Singapore and Taiwan indicated that this is a currently evolving trend. What is unclear is whether or not married women in these countries are returning to work is a result of their preference to do so or a matter of financial necessity (Lim 1981; and Arrigo 1980).

Evidence from Southeast Asian countries indicated that young women also work to secure a dowry in order to marry a man who would provide social mobility; to "pick up a veneer of big city sophistication and to meet new male friends;" to delay marriage and childbearing; to lead more independent social and economic lives; and to broaden their horizons through new experiences (see cases 2, 5, 9, 13, 14 and 15). McLellan (1985) revealed that the young women she studied reported that these social benefits were more of an inducement to work than the prospect of a cash income.

At the same time, many of the researchers revealed that a very large segment of adult women remain economically inactive. That is, they did not engage in any type of wage-earning activities. Lim (1981) reported that more than two-

thirds of the economically inactive population were female homemakers. Moreover, several researchers asserted that it was often difficult to determine the extent of female economic activity, as women were often became full-time workers in their households and/or became unpaid workers in family businesses during times of unemployment and disappeared from official unemployment records. As mentioned earlier, estimates of unemployment rates and rates of economic inactivity for women may underreport the extent of this phenomenon (see cases 2 and 4).

Job Opportunities for Women

Women worked in factories, despite the tedium and pressure of this type of work, because their secondary status in the labor market meant that they had fewer choices when it came to employment opportunities (Fernandez-Kelly 1983). In addition, Lim asserted that "women's employment opportunities are shaped by cultural stereotypes which say that women are patient, well-behaved, pay attention to detail, meticulous, and tolerant of routine, repetitive and monotonous tasks" (1981, 11). Factory work was associated with perceived feminine characteristics including: small hands, manual dexterity, and patience. Garment work, for example, was perceived to be an extension of traditional women's work in sewing, tailoring, spinning, weaving, and knitting (1981, 8). Women were preferred as electronics

workers because TNC managers believed that men disliked this type of work and would not do it (Hein 1986).

The introduction of electronics and other TNC industries has dramatically expanded the opportunities for young women to play independent economic roles, at times when brothers and fathers were unable to find work (Grossman 1980; and Kung 1976). The creation of industrial jobs in Mauritius, for example, is primarily responsible for the increased labor participation rate of women there. Forty-two percent of the women surveyed in Hein's study claimed that they had not been seeking employment before they began their first factory job, and 95% of the workers were working their first job at the time of the study (1986, 290).

However, the presence of this opportunity for young women, as well as the large number of young women seeking work in all of these countries means that employers can be selective as to which women they will hire (see cases 2 and 10).

The desirability of this type of work rested on its high status and relatively comfortable, clean and safe working conditions. As a result, female employees may be willing to tolerate the monotony and repetitive nature of the jobs (Fernandez-Kelly 1983). Lin (1986) further speculated that the ability of women to tolerate the monotony and repetition involved in assembly work derived from the female srotibtwihtre unroaff -stos qeiversally teaches women to be patient and tolerant. On the other

hand, women sought work in Taiwan, not because of its high status, but rather because it was the only waged labor available to them (Kung 1976).

Factory work was reported to be more desirable compared to other forms of wage labor, particularly in the service and agricultural sectors (see cases 1 and 10). Mauritian women described domestic work as similar to slavery and dirtier and less interesting than factory work (Hein 1986). McLellan (1985) reported that the Malaysian women she studied preferred factory work over fishing or agriculture because they felt that their educational levels overqualified them for such work. In general, electronics work in TNC-factories was recognized as stable, high status work that paid regular wages and benefits (see cases 2 and 14).

Distribution of Women in the Labor Force

The percentage of all economically active women who work in the "formal" sector of the economy is small in comparison to the number of women who work in the informal sector, for example, as domestic workers and/or unpaid workers in family businesses (Fernandez-Kelly 1983). The focus of this project, however, was female industrial workers and the following discussion is focused on the distribution of women in the "formal" sector of the economy, specifically in manufacturing.

Occupational segregation of women into specific sectors of the labor force was reported in all five countries. The largest percentage of female workers was found in manufacturing. In 1978, 76% of single working women were found in the electronics industry (Fernandez-Kelly 1983). The largest employer of women in Singapore was also the electronics industry where, in 1980, 90% of all workers were women (Lim 1981). In 1977, in Taiwan, 65.9% of manufacturing workers were women, aged 15-19. Export Processing Zones employed 67,000 workers in Taiwan of whom 85% were women in 1977 (Arrigo 1980). Only in Mexico, among garment workers, were workers more likely to be married and/or have children than single (Fernandez-Kelly 1983).

Lin related that "compared to both women's proportion in the general population and their employment in the manufacturing sector, the concentration of women in all branches of the electronics industry is disproportionately high" in both Singapore and Malaysia (1986, 4). Hein (1986) reported that women were concentrated into those segments of the employment market where wages were low. In particular, women were concentrated in production jobs within the manufacturing sector and constituted a majority of production workers. Women's share of the garment industry was disproportionately high (85%) in Mauritius in 1977¹⁰

¹⁰ For purposes of comparison, it was 76% in Britain and only 69% in Hong Kong.

This was generally attributed to ideological beliefs that garment making is women's work. However, tailoring and garment making in Mauritius has traditionally been considered men's work.

LDC Unemployment and TNCs

Tiano (1984; 1987) and Fernandez-Kelly (1983) suggested that it was important to acknowledge that the presence of TNCs was not responsible for unemployment problems at the Mexican border. Tiano (1984) stated that:

the border suffered from widespread unemployment before the maquiladora program started. The existence of the maquiladora program hasn't caused unemployment. Rather, the presence of large masses of unemployed workers led to the proliferation of maquiladoras (364).¹¹

TNC factories were often cited as the most effective way to increase unemployment and alleviate unemployment problems in less developed countries (see cases 2, 7, and 10). These authors pointed out that, while women may in fact experience unemployment, the official statistics tended to underreport female unemployment because women were generally reabsorbed into the household (see cases 2, 4, and 8).

Despite the official concern with male unemployment and the introduction of TNCs as one method of increasing the economic activity of economically active men, male unemployment remains high. Rather, TNCs provide jobs for women, and Tiano (1984)

¹¹ The term "maquiladora" used in this quotation is the Mexican word for transnational factory.

and Fernandez-Kelly (1983) both claimed that TNCs may in fact exacerbate male unemployment by attracting male migrants to border areas where they are unable to find jobs. Fernandez-Kelly (1983) reported that unemployment at the border had increased by 83% since the Border Industrialization Program began.

In addition, researchers including Fernandez-Kelly (1983) have been skeptical about the beliefs of government and TNC officials that this form of work alleviates unemployment at all. Since TNCs hire non-traditional members of the labor force -- daughters and wives who previously did not work for wages, the factories cannot have a significant effect on the original jobless rate. While Tiano (1984) agreed with Fernandez-Kelly (1983) that maquiladoras cannot resolve male unemployment because they rarely hire men, she asserted that the belief that women were non-productive was based

on a stereotypical image of women's ideal roles that bears little resemblance to the real circumstances of most working class Mexican women. The myth that only men work outside the home obscures the very real suffering that un- and underemployment can cause women who must work to support themselves and their families (349).

While this may be true for Mexico, it appeared that TNC managers in Southeast Asia actively recruited the type of workers that Fernandez-Kelly (1983) described.

Singapore was the only country in this data set that had an overall low unemployment rate. Even there, however,

the female unemployment rate was higher than the male rate in all categories except those jobs requiring no qualifications. Male unemployment was reported to be about 3.3%, while the female jobless rate was a slightly higher 3.8% (Lim 1981). The Singapore unemployment rate only counts Singapore citizens and does not include guestworkers. Moreover, during periods of low production demand, guestworkers are repatriated to their home countries. In this way, the government can disguise the real number of jobless workers in the country (Heyzer 1982).

It seems that the level of previous work experience of female TNC workers is a reflection of each country's economic development. Countries such as Taiwan, Mexico, and Singapore that have had women working in TNCs since the 1960s may no longer need to recruit inexperienced young women because an established pool of ready laborers already exists. On the other hand, newly industrializing countries such as Malaysia and Mauritius may not have a ready supply of experienced female workers.

Unemployment was identified as a very real problem for women in developing countries due to both the effects of modernization and the patriarchal traditions of LDCs. Modernization displaces women from traditional roles in agriculture, handicrafts production, and trade, yet it generally offers few options in the modern sector (Boserup 1975; and Tiano 1987). For example, despite the presence of

TNCs, unemployment rates for women at the Mexican border were no lower than the national average and were in fact higher for women over 35 years of age (Tiano 1987). In Singapore, single women (the preferred TNC-employees) comprised about 60% of the female labor force, but were 92% of unemployed females (Lim 1981). Women constituted 34.5% of the entire Singaporean work force, but were 38% of all unemployed persons (Lim 1981). These two examples do not support the assertion that TNC-employment alleviates unemployment problems, even for those who meet the factories' rigid criteria for employment. Rather, they illustrate that, despite the presence of TNC factory jobs, women are still disadvantaged in the labor force and have difficulties finding employment.

Patriarchal traditions which provided for differential education, training, and socialization for boys and girls also contributed to the problem of female unemployment (Hein 1986).¹²

Conflicting family responsibilities, preferential hiring of men over women, and legal proscriptions that exclude women from certain occupations

¹² Unemployment figures, particularly for women, are often not the most meaningful and accurate method of determining the level of participation and/or of lack for participation in the work force. As discussed by Tiano (1984), previously employed women who are not working for wages are left out of official unemployment statistics because they may not be actively seeking employment and are working within the household or as unpaid workers in family enterprises.

combine to limit women's employment options (Tiano 1984, 350).

While TNC employment may be the preferred work for women in these countries, most women continued to work in the informal sector and as unpaid workers in family businesses. These types of jobs tend to be insecure and provide unreliable incomes (Tiano 1984).

Researchers in all of the countries examined reported that turnover in TNC factories was quite high and that TNC employment may not be as secure as it seems. Tiano (1987) reported that 50% of garment workers had been at the job for less than six months at the time of her study. Turnover for electronics workers was reported at 39%, while it was 27% for service sector workers. At the same time, only 24% of service workers had been at their present jobs for four or more years. For garment and electronics workers, the percentages were 21% and 17%, respectively. Only 29% of electronics workers had worked at their jobs for more than eight years. In addition, Tiano (1987) reported that 80% of electronics workers reported regular layoffs during the fall. The data from other manufacturing sectors included a much lower incidence of plant shut-downs and/or layoffs (Tiano 1987, 21). However, the researcher acknowledged that her data were based on self-reports and that she was uncertain of their reliability.

Arrigo (1980) claimed that turnover¹³ at Taiwan-based TNCs was about 5-10% and was seasonal. Her data indicated that turnover was rarely less than 5% per month and was often as high as 15%. Kung indicated that turnover was also a function of individual workers' experience:

The turnover rate in the first two weeks following entry into a factory is consistently and extraordinarily high. . . . In contrast, the adjustment of women who have been working a number of years is far smoother: the cumulative effect of experience in other jobs is reflected in greater self-confidence which enables such women to assess a factory within a matter of days and to decide then whether they wish to remain (1976, 40).

Data for Singapore, Malaysia, and Mauritius were not presented. However, there was an indication that the low paying, low skill, low mobility nature of these jobs, as well as the eyestrain and tedium resulting from microscope and shift work resulted in high turnover at electronics TNCs in these countries (see cases 1, 7, and 9). Turnover in all five countries was controlled to some degree through the awarding of performance "bonuses". "Bonuses" were forfeited if workers left their jobs before the completion of the fiscal year, thus tending to limit mid-year resignations by factory operatives (see cases 8, 9, 10, and 12).

¹³ While the large number of workers reporting short lengths of employment at their current jobs may in some cases be a reflection of growth in the number of available positions, the research reported in this study reflect actual turnover.

Discrimination Based on Gender, Age and Marital Status

Discrimination against workers on the basis of gender, age, and/or marital status was characterized as common in the five countries studied. For example, TNC managers believed that young, single women, because of their lack of experience, were more conscientious, productive and malleable workers and, as a result, were the preferred employees in assembly operations (see cases 1, 2, 4, 9, and 10). "Women's socialization results in behavior, expectations and attitudes, relative youth and subordinate positions in the household mean that women are a highly vulnerable, docile and manipulatable work force" (Fernandez-Kelly 1983, 72). The belief that women are working temporarily between school and marriage means that they will be less committed to the labor force and will not demand or accrue seniority benefits which increase costs to employers (see cases 1, 8, and 12).

Single women were preferred over married women because of ideological beliefs about abilities and responsibilities of women to their families (Lin 1986). TNC-managers attempted to achieve two potentially conflicting objectives. First, they desired the least expensive and most cooperative labor force, and were committed to the belief that the ideal labor force would be composed of women. Second, they needed to gain the cooperation of the host country's citizens in order to create the labor force and have successful and

profitable factories. In order to do this they needed to respect the cultural traditions and ideological beliefs of the host country, including the role of women, especially within the family. Employers recognized that in most countries married women were socialized to put their obligations to their families first. Employing married women could threaten the traditional family and result in resentment directed against the factories, making their efforts to create and maintain a female labor force difficult (see cases 4, 8, and 12). In addition, managers expressed a belief that mothers would have higher rates of lateness and absenteeism as a result of illnesses among children as well as reduced productivity due to worry and concern over family matters (see cases 4, 5, 7 and 9). While this belief has remained consistent over time, statistics gathered in Mexico and Mauritius where a large number of single and married mothers work, indicate that there is no significant difference in absenteeism or lateness between female parents and non-parents or between the rates of female parents and single or married men (Fernandez-Kelly 1983; and Hein 1986). In fact, Hein reported that in Mauritius some TNC employers expressed a preference for married women and single mothers as workers because they believed that these women would be more conscientious employees since they had a greater responsibility to provide for their families.

The belief that women's familial obligations, whether married or single, are factors in their employability, potential productivity, and commitment to the labor force, meant that women were hired into the most poorly remunerated, insecure and deskilled jobs in manufacturing. At the same time, the resultant segregated work force strengthened stereotypes about what women were capable of, and in turn these stereotypes become a rationalization for maintaining sex segregation in the work force (Tiano 1984). Thus, women were trapped in poorly paid positions and had little opportunity to move into supervisory and managerial positions (see cases 5 and 10).

It was not clear whether employers had a conscious policy of screening out older, married workers in, for example, Malaysia and Singapore (Lin 1986). However, in Taiwan, factory owners refused to hire married women or permit women to work after marriage (Arrigo 1980; and Diamond 1979). Managers in all sectors of manufacturing expressed a preference for young, single women as employees in Mexico. However, the electronics TNCs which held the highest status were most able to select these preferred workers. Garment manufacturers, with greater needs for experienced workers, high production quotas, and less safe working conditions tended to employ older, married workers, even though they also expressed a preference for young, single women (see cases 2, 3, and 4). However, researchers

in Mexico reported that it has become increasingly difficult to fill even the preferred assembly jobs with young, single women since the number of factories continues to increase. In addition, the percentage of young workers in the available labor pool has been shrinking as the initial cohort of young workers begins to age and remains in the labor market, enabling younger siblings to continue in school or remain at home (see cases 2, 3, and 4).

Similarly, when the expansion of factories in Mauritius resulted in an acute shortage of prospective female employees, factory managers did not turn to the large pool of unemployed men in the country. Instead, they decentralized production, moving into areas with available female labor supplies. In an effort to attract previously non-working young women into available positions, TNC managers recruited door-to-door as well as used religious leaders and local dignitaries to make openings known to the community and to encourage their supporters to permit daughters to go to work in the factories. Wages also increased, working conditions were improved, and employees were given bonuses if they brought in family members and friends as workers (Hein 1986).

The increased demand for employees as a result of the rapid expansion of factories has made it possible for women in Singapore, Mexico and Taiwan to remain in and/or return to the labor force after marriage and childbirth. As a

result, discrimination on the basis of marital status appears to be diminishing. The experience of wage labor for women during their single years resulted in feelings of isolation when they stayed at home during marriage and/or childbirth. In addition, they believed that their families benefitted from, or needed the income that their return to work would provide (see cases 2, 7, 8, 12, and 15).

Wages and Working Conditions in TNC Factories

The existence of legislated minimum wage standards is one important indicator of a government's commitment to its country's workers. Where minimum wage standards exist, a guaranteed minimum standard of living for most workers is theoretically present. The absence of minimum wage standards indicates a lack of commitment on the part of the government to ensure that workers are afforded wages that at least meet subsistence needs. However, minimum wage standards in the countries studied, where they existed, were set at very low levels. In Mauritius, for example, the legislated minimum wage for women provided that women be paid about 57% of the median earnings of men over 18 years of age (Hein 1986). Mexico's minimum wage functions as both the ceiling and floor for female maquiladora workers with experience, since these workers seldom earned more than the legislated minimum. A separate wage standard or "training wage" for newly-hired TNC workers in Mexico permits the

companies to pay workers below the minimum wage for up to 90 days, although it was reported that, in Taiwan, most workers earned more than the minimum (see cases 2, 3, 4, and 14).

Lin (1986) reported that there is no legislated minimum wage in Malaysia. However, Grossman (1980) stated that TNC-managers paid trainees less than minimum wage for up to 6 months, while at the same time they acknowledged that it only took about two weeks to learn any assembly job in their factories.

Most of the researchers reported that women earned less than the minimum wage as a result of piece rate and "bonus-oriented" pay scales in countries where minimum wage standards existed. For example, Tiano (1987) found that only 47% of electronics workers employed more than 18 months received at least the minimum wage. The remaining workers (53%) earned less than the minimum wage (23%).

The concept of "equal pay for equal work" is legally recognized in Taiwan only, although women there were found to earn only about 62% of men's wages¹⁴ (Gallin 1989). It was a common practice in all of these countries for women to earn lower wages than men in all occupational categories. This was justified by the ideological belief that women are

¹⁴ This is on par with gender-based wage differentials reported for the U.S., Great Britain, Canada, and Australia (Ratner, R. S. 1980. "The policy problem: Overview of seven countries." In R. S. Ratner (ed.), Equal employment policy for women. Philadelphia: Temple University Press).

secondary wage earners who are supported by husbands and fathers, as well as the belief that women are temporary members of the work force. Fernandez-Kelly (1983) asserted that "maquiladora work is cheap because it is predominantly done by women, not because of some objective attribute that makes it inherently inferior" (85). The continued presence of TNC assembly operations is dependent on the legitimacy afforded to the notion that women can be paid low wages since labor costs are often the margin between success and failure in the competitive electronics industry.

It was reported that in all countries represented in the data set that the wages earned by female TNC workers did not meet subsistence needs nor provide for independence from men (see cases 3, 4, 6, 7, 10, and 12). Hein (1986) pointed to the fact that many TNC workers in Mauritius suffered from anemia and malnutrition as evidence to support this finding. Female workers in Malaysia were shown to be subsidized by their families during their first one to two years of assembly work (Grossman 1980). McLellan (1985) indicated that some TNC managers in Malaysia encouraged their workers to continue living in villages with their families and commute to work because the managers understood that the women's wages were inadequate to support them independently. "Free" bus transportation between villages and factories were provided to facilitate this possibility and resulted in lower real wages for workers. Workers were paid less per

hour in order for the factory to meet transportation expenses.

The majority of women in all five countries were found at the bottom of the wage scale. Lim (1981) reported that in Singapore 67.8% of female workers earned less than \$400 per month, while this was true for only 40.6% of male workers. In addition, Heyzer (1982) found that in 1974, 81% of female manufacturing workers in Singapore earned less than \$200 per month.¹⁵ Lin (1986) reported that female operatives' pay was lower than the average manufacturing pay. She found that women in Singapore and Malaysia manufacturing jobs earned an average of U.S.\$90 per month. Kung (1976) indicated that in 1971 a female factory worker with ten years experience earned the equivalent of U.S.\$57 per month.

Management's practice of providing performance "bonuses" so that TNC employees could increase their wages was found by most researchers (see cases 5, 6, 7, 8, 9, 10,

¹⁵ The difference in these figures can be attributed to the specific women studied by each researcher. In her studies, Lim primarily examined the lives of native Singaporean women, whereas Heyzer studied female migrant workers from Malaysia. While most women work at less desirable jobs and earn lower wages than men, this can be exacerbated by ethnic differences, as well as citizenship status (John D'Cruz, personal communication, 3/12/89). Fifteen percent of the total work force in Singapore is comprised of young Malaysian Chinese women recruited to perform menial electronics and garment work. During the 1970s recruitment efforts were extended to include young women from Indonesia, Sri Lanka, Philippines, and Thailand (Lin 1986).

12, and 13). Bonuses were paid to women for working at microscopes, working shifts, working mandatory overtime during periods of high demand, meeting quality and quantity targets, and for perfect attendance and punctuality. Bonuses, however, could be forfeited by being late, absent, not meeting production quotas, and leaving the job before the end of the fiscal year (Lin 1986). Bonuses can comprise a large portion of total wages. For example, in Taiwan, bonuses were reported to equal up to 20% of total wages (Arrigo 1980). The relative strictness with which bonuses were treated was depicted as being dependent on the level of production and the demand for increased productivity (McLellan 1985). For example, if a given factory had a large number of orders to fill and needed all of the experienced workers they had to meet this demand, supervisors were more likely to overlook employees' lateness and/or absenteeism (Grossman 1980).

Historically, unions have been the most effective way of improving the wages and working conditions of factory workers. However, few workers in the selected countries were organized. The largest percentage (24%) of organized female TNC workers was found in Ciudad Juarez, Mexico (Fernandez-Kelly 1983). Legal prohibitions, the lack of autonomy of existent unions, as well as traditional patterns of female socialization were all recognized as obstacles to the organization of these workers. In addition, Leung

(1985) reported that union leaders retained male chauvinistic attitudes and were reluctant to share leadership with women. Moreover, Arrigo (1985) characterized unions as being controlled by the Taiwan state. Unions must be registered with the government and incorporated under national central party-organized organizations of the same topic. If a union does not register with the government, it will be deemed illegal and potentially seditious. In Mexico, unions were described as an effective tool in labor-management interactions because unions generally cooperated with and understood management's positions (Fernandez-Kelly 1983).

Researchers have found that governments have adopted a paternalistic attitude whereby they assert that workers are too unsophisticated to participate in unions. The governments believe that they are best suited to negotiate for workers with factory management. For example, in Malaysia the government argues that at the present state of industrial development workers would only be manipulated by trade union leaders, which would be contrary to workers' and the state's interests (McLellan 1985, 8). Governments, however, cannot objectively represent the interests of workers as they must also represent the interests of local capital and facilitate the country's incorporation into the international economy. Recognition of the actual economic role that women play in this process would expose the

injustice of their low wages, low job status, unequal promotion opportunities, lack of skills training and job security and underrepresentation in unions, thus putting other objectives at risk (Leung 1985, 86).

In Malaysia, the existence of trade unions in "essential" industries (including TNCs) is prohibited by law (Grossman 1980). In Taiwan and Singapore, all unions are under the control of the government and there is little rank and file participation. In fact, elected union officials usually hold management positions within the factories and, as a result, unions support management policies (see cases 7, 8, 11, and 14).

In Mexico, where unions have the most autonomy, maquiladora workers reported being frustrated by the organizations' unwillingness to place women's issues on their agendas, the unions' consistent support of pro-management, pro-government policies and TNC-management objectives, and a history of union corruption (Fernandez-Kelly 1983).

In Taiwan, the ability of corporations to have workers work overtime, for women to work past 10 PM, and to override required paid sick and vacation leaves are dependent on obtaining union permission. As a result, the Taiwanese government encourages TNC-managers to establish unions at their plants. The union then becomes a tool for both management and the government to extract concessions from

workers (management) and from corporations (government) (Arrigo 1985).

Strikes in essential industries are illegal in Taiwan and Malaysia, so unions have few tools to bargain with (see cases 6 and 11). Moreover, attempts to organize TNC workers in all five countries generally resulted in the firing and/or arrest of union organizers (see cases 2, 9, and 11).

TNC Work Hours

The legislated length of the work week in Taiwan is 48 hours. However, the government reported that 43% of female industrial workers work between 49-56 hours per week, and 15% work more than 57 hours per week (Diamond 1979).¹⁶ Workers in most TNC factories were assigned a specific shift. They were not required to rotate shifts as were factory workers in the other countries. Compulsory overtime was a requirement for workers in many factories, and some countries that previously restricted women's night work have amended such legislation to permit night work for women who work TNC factories (see cases 1, 5, 7, and 15).

In Singapore and Malaysia, the work week varied by location and business demand. Assembly workers in most factories were required to work rotating shifts. Workers suggested to researchers that rotating shifts have negative

¹⁶ Comparable data for hours worked by men were unfortunately not presented in the case studies.

effects on their health. Physical complaints related to shift work reported by study respondents included: disruptions in sleeping and eating habits, family responsibilities and social activities. Rotating shifts were also reported to be the job requirement most likely to result in worker dissatisfaction (Lin 1986). Data for Mexico and Mauritius were not reported in the case studies used in this analysis.

The lack of control over and dissatisfaction with factors such as overtime, shift work, and the length of the work week present a picture that supports the exploitation perspective. While many factory workers, male or female, have little control over the aspects of the terms and requirements of their employment, the socialization of men which encourages and rewards assertiveness and taking control of their lives, as well as union representation tends to mediate undesirable working conditions. Thus, because women do not have the skills and support to protest undesirable labor practices, they are more likely to be exploited by them.

TNC Management and Supervisory Strategies

Management techniques used to supervise female employees were reported to differ from those used to supervise male employees (see cases 3, 4, 6, 8, 9, 10, and 12). Patriarchal ideology, including paternalism, was

described as influencing relationships between workers and supervisors, since most supervisors were men (see cases 2 and 10). In Southeast Asia, village heads, fathers and husbands were used to recruit female workers. Factory managers promoted the idea that male managers had the best interests of the young women at heart and promised responsible village and family males that the women would be closely supervised and protected from experiences which might threaten their attachment to traditional values (see cases 7, 9, 10, and 12).

Techniques for controlling female workers often exploited female vulnerability, inexperience, and traditional patterns of female-male interactions, including romance and sexual activity. Fernandez-Kelly (1983) reported that sexual harassment was common in TNC factories and that sexual favors were sometimes provided, as required, in exchange for job security. In addition, the "casting couch", or the trading of sex for work, was one method used by TNC managers to provide access to factory jobs.

Young women's inexperience in female-male relationships, especially in Southeast Asia, made them vulnerable to exploitative entanglements with supervisors. In Malaysia, supervisors acted like "elder brothers", thus reproducing the patriarchal features of Southeast Asian societies which demand that sisters obey their brothers (McLellan 1985).

Grossman (1980) described management practices in Malaysia that combined authoritarian and paternalistic discipline with sophisticated human relations techniques in order to encourage the continued passivity, submissivity, sentimentality and sexual desirability of female workers. The "emphasis on passive and ornamental femininity forestall[ed] the rise in a sense of independence and united strength among women workers" (30). The result was identification with the factory, low turnover, and competition between female workers which prevented organized and unified protests against inadequate wages and working conditions. These techniques all functioned to ensure the docility and efficiency of female workers on the job (see cases 2, 6, 8, 9, and 10).

Opportunities for Promotion

Even where women were interested in advancement and promotion, the sex segregation of occupations usually restricted them to jobs where such opportunities did not exist (Hein 1986). That is, women in all of the countries examined were disproportionately represented in manufacturing jobs, particularly in the least skilled assembly jobs in transnational electronics and garment factories. Lim (1981) reported that occupational segregation is lower in Singapore than in the U.S. Less than one-third of all factory operatives in the U.S. are

women, while the proportion for Singapore is one-half. However, she did not provide data which would enable a comparison between promotion rates for the percentage of female supervisors in either country. There may be more women who work in factories in Singapore compared to the U.S., but there is no way of knowing whether or not women in Singapore have better or worse chances for promotion. Heyzer (1982) sheds some light on this issue by reporting that female operatives, especially guestworkers, were disproportionately represented in the least desirable positions within these industries in Singapore. Tiano (1987) found that female electronics workers in Mexico believed that their assembly jobs were unlikely routes to upward mobility or to better paying industrial occupations. The women interviewed claimed that the kinds of jobs they held in the factories did not produce useful skills for other types of work due to their repetitive and deskilled nature. These women also recognized that skilled and semi-skilled jobs were reserved for men (24). However, unlike electronics workers, more than 59.6% of garment workers believed that they had acquired skills that would advance their careers (25).

In Singapore and Malaysia, promotions were reportedly difficult to obtain because operators in these countries, as in Mexico, did not acquire new skills. In addition, supervisory jobs were generally filled from outside the

factory by men with more education than the women employed as operatives had (see cases 6 and 9). Moreover, promotion opportunities in Singapore were greater for Singaporean citizens than for foreign guestworkers (Heyzer 1982). In contrast to Singapore, Malaysia and Mexico, 32% of Taiwanese workers in export processing zones reported attending school in order to develop career advancing skills including sewing, accounting, and foreign languages. This unique possibility was considered to be a product of factory organization which operated on set shifts. The opportunity to attend school to develop marketable skills was additionally characterized as one method of recruiting and retaining workers in Taiwanese factories (Arrigo 1980; and Diamond 1979). However, Kung (1976) reported that opportunities for promotion into preferred office jobs in factories in Taiwan had diminished, leaving few opportunities for women to utilize the skills they had acquired through school.

TNC Worker Satisfaction

Except in Mauritius where 56% of the workers claimed they were very satisfied with their jobs, female electronics workers generally found their work unrewarding (1, 4, and 9). The most frequent complaints about their jobs focused on physical ailments, including fatigue and health problems, rotating shifts and unrealistic production targets set by

management. In addition, workers were generally dissatisfied with their wages, but felt powerless to complain because they knew they had little job security and there was much competition for their jobs (Hein 1986; and Tiano 1984). For example, only 15% of female workers in Taiwan indicated that they would continue at the same job if they had other choices (Diamond 1979). Kung reported that there "is little job satisfaction to be derived from factory work" (1976, 46). In Malaysia, young female factory workers would prefer to work in supermarkets, offices, for the police, army, or government than at their present jobs (McLellan 1985). Job dissatisfaction in Taiwan was expressed in terms of interpersonal relationships, not class or political issues. That is, when Taiwanese factory workers became frustrated or dissatisfied with the conditions of their employment they did not place the blame on inadequate wages or unfair working conditions. Instead, they complained of difficulty in getting along with supervisors, co-workers, or family members (Arrigo 1985).

The Singaporean government has begun to address some of the TNC workers' complaints, especially in the area of health and safety. Factories have introduced biological and environmental monitors in order to assess workers' exposure to hazards (Lin 1986). However, existing regulations in Singapore, as well as other countries, tend to be structural and/or process oriented. They do not set standards, rather

they establish the composition and frequency of company safety meetings (see cases 3 and 9). For example, Heyzer (1982) summarized the results of a survey of factory workers set up with financial and technical assistance from the government of Singapore. Eighty-five percent of the surveyed factories were found to be 'unsafe and unhealthy' to workers (185). In Malaysia, the government has been reluctant to intervene in factory management as they do not want to risk alienating foreign investment (Grossman 1980).

Dissatisfied workers were reported to "vote with their feet" (Arrigo 1985). McLellan (1985) stated that "factory hopping is common, as is withdrawal to the kampong [village] to 'rest' during feast preparations, padi [rice] harvests or work problems" (5). In addition, cases of mass hysteria in TNC factories which halt production have been identified as one method through which workers have expressed dissatisfaction and exercised control over the production process (see cases 7, 9, and 10).

Summary

Thus far, female factory workers attitudes toward their employment and economic circumstances have been explored to determine whether the integration or exploitation perspectives could be supported. Factory jobs have, to some degree, increased women's independence from their families and led to control over some of their earnings, make

consumer decisions and, in some cases, further their education. It was also seen that women's employment has led to a decrease in arranged marriage, later age at marriage, and smaller family size. The presence of these factors lends support to the integration perspective.

However, significant evidence to support the exploitation perspective was also found. Women's continued secondary status in the labor force, occupational segregation, low wages, lack of union representation, unsafe and unhealthy working conditions, limited opportunities for jobs other than in assembly operations, and limited chances for promotion all point to exploitation of female workers. In addition, the maintenance of traditional values has led to a "double burden" of household and waged labor for women so that women were expected to meet their obligations to their family at the same time that they work long hours for low pay in factories.

At the same time, the evidence did not always clearly support either the integration or exploitation perspectives, and a mixed picture emerged. In some countries, waged labor has brought working women more authority in the family, while in others women remain excluded from family decision making. The recent increase in female-headed households in several countries implied that women's waged labor may be leading to increased independence or it may instead be a sign that waged labor is placing stress on households.

While some women have control of their income, most women indicated that their wages were turned over to fathers or mothers and their control was limited to the small amount a parent returned to the worker to meet weekly expenses. Moreover, while it has become relatively easy for single women to find waged work, the same is not true for married women who are constrained by society's perception that they are inefficient workers due to their familial obligations. The following chapter summarizes support for the integration and exploitation perspectives specifically related to the social and familial experiences of female TNC workers.

CHAPTER FIVE

INTRA-FAMILIAL RELATIONSHIPS

The nearly universal belief that men are the primary breadwinners of families and that women, if they work, do so only to supplement the incomes of their male family members has important repercussions for the involvement of women in waged labor, as well as its study. Norms and values of the family and the roles family members play are based in patriarchal ideologies. A key element of these ideologies is the biological fact that women bear children and lactate. From this biological fact, women are believed to be innately suited to the home and to the labor and skills necessary for its maintenance (Boserup 1975; and Hartmann 1981). While TNC workers may idealize a life that varies little from that of their parents, in that they desired to marry and have children, the increasing phenomenon of daughters employed by TNCs may be particularly problematic within the context of the family.

Modernization theorists have asserted that women's integration into wage labor would have a dramatic effect on the patriarchal control exercised over women within their families. One concrete example, predicted by these theorists, is the emergence of a more equitable division of household labor. That is, women's cash incomes would increase their status in the family and enable them to

become more assertive within the household. The research examined in this project, however, does not in general support this assertion.

Characteristics of Female TNC Workers' Households of Origin

The families and households of origin of female TNC workers in all of the countries in the data set shared some important characteristics. In Mauritius, Mexico, Taiwan, and Singapore, for example, TNC employees tended to come from families where the male members of the household were unskilled laborers (see cases 1, 2, 3, 7, and 8). In Mexico, male members of maquiladora households held jobs such as: unskilled construction and general laborers, petty clerks and street vendors (Fernandez-Kelly 1983). In Mauritius, male household members worked as skilled and unskilled manual laborers and as agricultural workers. None of the TNC workers in Hein's study indicated that their fathers were white collar workers.

In Taiwan, two-thirds of TNC workers were from agricultural and fishing families (Diamond 1979). However, while their fathers continued in these lines of work, over 45% of female Taiwanese factory workers had brothers who were in senior high school, attending college or university, or technical school. Twenty-two percent of the sample had brothers who were white collar workers or highly skilled factory workers. Only 10% of the brothers took over their

father's work. At the same time, 55% of these young women had sisters who worked as they did, in factories, or at home or in farm work. The fact that their brothers were able to pursue educational and vocational training, and ultimately obtain skilled or white collar jobs was attributed to the economic contributions made by working sisters (see cases 12 and 13).

In all five countries, fathers generally held authority and made decisions regarding family life. They also imposed discipline on wives and children. Mothers, as part of their duties as managers of households, received daughters' earnings and decided, within the limits of the authority vested in them by husbands, where and how these funds would be used (see cases 1, 2, 6, 9, 10, and 12).

Division of Household Labor

The household division of labor is strongly entrenched in traditional values and is slow to change (Lin 1986). Fernandez-Kelly (1983) observed that, while the material realities in women's and men's lives have been modified by the Border Industrialization Program, expectations and norms related to gender roles remain untouched (137). For all countries in the data set, researchers reported that women wanted to meet and marry men who would support them and believed that marriage would bring security and upward mobility (see cases 2 and 14). A woman's status, especially

in the Southeast Asian countries, was found to be enhanced, not by having a job, but by marrying and having children (see cases 8, 9, 12, and 15).

In Mexico and Singapore, researchers reported that as women work more hours for wages there was no accompanying decrease in responsibility for domestic duties (Fernandez-Kelly 1983; and Lim 1981). Fernandez-Kelly (1983) established that married women with young children worked an average of 15 hours per day. While single women worked significantly less (about 11 hours per day), domestic tasks continued to be exclusively performed by the household's female members. Fathers, brothers and sons in Malaysia and Mexico, even if unemployed, did not engage in household labor traditionally performed by women (Fernandez-Kelly 1983; and McLellan 1985). Women continued to be responsible for the lion's share of household labor, without assistance from men or machines. For example, less than one-half of TNC workers in Mexico and Malaysia owned washing machines or other labor-saving devices. Except for about 16% of TNC-workers who had hired help, Mexican women continued to do the household's laundry on washboards (Fernandez-Kelly 1983).

Economic Contributions of Mothers and Daughters

Fernandez-Kelly (1983), Diamond (1979) and McLellan (1985) reported that women's waged work was an extension of

their family duties. Women worked, not as individuals, but as members of households. McLellan (1985) reported that periods of unemployment, daughters laid off from the factory would return home. It was asserted that peasant households "can sometimes support workers who are laid off for short periods because life . . . in the village is cheap, whereas everything in town must be paid for in cash" (9). However, Tiano (1984) and others believed that ultimately the instability of TNC work may strain families' economic resources. Moreover, the resultant increased economic independence of female workers may make the goal of stable families unrealistic if daughters either refuse to return home during lay-offs and/or slow down or stop their remittances home (McLellan 1985).

Foo and Lim (1988) disagreed with the idea that young women work as household members. They alone believed that it was the women, not their families, who decided to work in TNCs and that this decision was made even when families did not need their prospective incomes. However, Heyzer (1982)

reported that guestworkers in Singapore from the Chinese "New Villages" of Malaysia¹⁷ came from families

governed by the three rules of Confucianism: an unmarried girl should obey her father and elder brother; a married woman her husband; a widow her son. Obedience, timidity and adaptability are the main virtues for women (191).

The threat of land seizure (because New Village settlers are leaseholders and do not own their land), the continued reduction in landholding size, and increased rural poverty resulted in the migration of young able-bodied men to tin mines and urban areas. The New Villages were primarily inhabited by elders, young women and children. In the Malay kampongs (rural villages), heads of households were least likely to migrate in search of employment because of their responsibility for farming the land. In both the New Villages and kampongs, young women were the least likely to be missed in terms of their productive labor. As a result, they were most likely to be sent to work at TNC factories in both Singapore and Malaysia. The result was both an additional wage laborer (and the associated income) for the

¹⁷ The "New Villages" were created by the British Military Administration in the early 1950s to deny the Communist guerrillas an important base and source of supplies and intelligence. About 65,000 people, mainly of Chinese ethnic origin, were rounded up and settled into about 600 "New Villages" situated on part of Malay reservation land. Malay sultans made the resettlement of the rural Chinese conditional on the offer of temporary occupation licenses which meant that when the guerilla problem was solved, the resettled Chinese had to move out of these areas. However, the New Village remain to this day (Heyzer 1982, 180-181).

family and one less mouth to feed at home (see cases 7 and 10).

Daughters in all of the Southeast Asian countries believed that they were obligated to repay their families for the costs of rearing them. The availability of TNC employment has, in fact, served to increase the economic value of daughters in these areas. Diamond (1979) reported that "young girls [in Taiwan] have more visible value to families. Daughters are no longer useless, they can earn wages while brothers are students, soldiers, and unpaid craft apprentices" (318). Kung (1976) supported this finding and added that a daughter's obligation to contribute to family income was considered to be natural and legitimate. This feeling, however, seemed to be more strongly supported in women who were unable to complete school due to inadequate family support. McLellan (1985) suggested that employment in free trade zones in Malaysia was directed toward "socially useless and invisible virgin girls" who were now able to help support households with cash contributions. In poor families, remittances from daughters were essential to the families maintenance, and in wealthy families they were expected as a token of respect and honor. Girls who did not support their mothers ran the risk of shaming them, because it was believed that only daughters who were improperly raised would behave so irresponsibly (10-11).

Foo and Lim (1988) characterized the tradition of daughters sending remittances as a "rational" way of guaranteeing financial and emotional security in places such as Malaysia, Mauritius, and Mexico, where marriage bonds are weak. While they also suggested that the status of daughters has increased as a result of their entry into waged labor, they asserted that it was in fact the cash contribution, not the labor, that was responsible because women had always participated in family production. In keeping with their position that it was the women themselves who decided to go to work, they asserted that it was also the women who decided to give parents money. Parents did not necessarily expect these financial gifts; daughters were motivated to work in order to repay parents for the costs of their upbringing. While the other researchers recognized the strongly held belief that women needed to repay their parents for their upbringing, they also asserted that, at least in rural areas, most women went to work at their parents' request or at least with their permission (see cases 1, 6, 7, 9, and 10).

The economic contributions of daughters working in TNC factories were used to meet work-related expenses such as food, clothing, transportation, to improve the parental house, provide for family household needs, buy bicycles for carrying crops to market, provide cash for gifts and food during religious festivals, and to pay tuition for siblings

(especially brothers) and, in Taiwan, for the workers' tuition (see cases 2, 3, 4, 7, 9, 12, 14 and 15). At the least, the employment of daughters was reported to decrease the economic burden on families, and, at the most, functioned to help families move out of the peasantry (Lin 1986).

The percentage of household income that was contributed by working daughters was reported to depend on the number of providers within each household. TNC workers were seldom reported to be the sole support of families. However, in Mexico, 20% of apparel workers and 15% of electronics workers claimed to be their families' single income earner (Fernandez-Kelly 1983). Although exact figures were unavailable, the contribution of TNC workers averaged approximately one-third of total family income (see cases 1, 2, 6, 7, 12, 13, and 14). In many TNC worker households, their incomes were reported to be the most reliable (Hein 1986).

Several researchers reported that the amount that was saved and/or sent to families was more than they should have been able to send, given their incomes (see, for example, Hein 1986). The women "often did not have adequate diet in order to be able to save and to return to their village during the annual leave with gifts and money as demonstration of their success (Heyzer 1982, 194).

The assertion of modernization theorists that women's integration into waged labor would lead to increased independence was refuted by the data contained in the selected case studies. Female TNC workers did not, in general, retain control of their incomes. Only 5% of Diamond's (1979) Taiwanese sample indicated that they had control over their wages. Those workers who lived at home reported handing 70-80% of their income over to their mothers, while those who lived in dorms sent an average 46% of their gross earnings home. Arrigo (1980) and Kung (1976), while not providing actual percentages, reported that many workers gave their entire checks to their mothers. The amount of money that they had actual control over amounted to that which was allocated by their mothers for meeting their personal expenses. Twenty percent of Mexican TNC workers gave all of their wages to their mothers as well. Other workers claimed that 55% of their weekly wages went to meet household needs (Fernandez-Kelly 1981). Tiano (1984) indicated that 17% of her sample were exclusively responsible for their family's financial support. Malaysian factory workers who lived alone returned home on pay-days to distribute their wages. They gave goods and/or money to their households in return for rice, coffee and fruit (McLellan 1985). Grossman (1980) reported that at least 50% of wages were sent home by Filipina workers and between 25-50% of wages were sent home by Malaysian TNC workers. Given

the high percentages of remittances as well as the high costs of work-related expenses, it was clear that female TNC-workers were left with only a small sum of money that was under their exclusive control. This phenomenon, along with the low wages of maquiladora workers in general, means that the amount of money that can be injected into the local economy as a result of these jobs is quite limited (Tiano 1984, 1987).

The Influences of Ethnicity and Religion

Foo and Lim (1988) pointed out that ideologies about gender roles were influenced by ethnicity. They found that Chinese women tended to disagree with the belief that husbands should be heads of households, while Malay and Indian women agreed with it. Heyzer (1982), in her study of migrant Malaysian workers in Singapore, did not report any differences between Malaysian Chinese and Malay women's identification of fathers and husbands as household heads. She reported that most women identified men as the authorities in their families, while mothers controlled the distribution of resources through household management. These somewhat contradictory findings may be attributed to the urban/rural differences between the two samples.

Religion was also a factor in women's identification of men as legitimate heads of households. Families which subscribed to Confucianism, Islam, Hinduism as well as some

branches of Christianity were more likely to be concerned about the effects of TNC-employment on their daughters' marriageability and continued attachment to traditional beliefs about the role of women in society and the family (Hein 1986).

There are three major religious groups in Mauritius: Hindu, Islam, and Christianity. In all of these groups, "the father is considered the main authority within the family and women are accordingly accustomed to being in a subordinate position" (Hein 1986, 306). This researcher also indicated that the only difference in female employment among these religious groups was that Hindu girls began working at 17-18 years of age, while Christian girls started at age 15-16 (Hein 1986, 289).

Values and Lifestyle Choices of Female TNC Workers

Modernization theorists also believed that the experience of waged labor would result in significant changes in the values, social activities, and lifestyle choices of young female workers. The research examined in this study indicated that, while some changes have occurred, women in general continued to hold traditional values (Tiano 1984). In addition, where workers may hold changing values they are not usually matched by changes in the social order (Lin 1986). The perception that female TNC workers are promiscuous, that work in the factories will affect a

woman's opportunities for marriage, and that women are still expected to marry and take primary responsibility for management of the household are all indications that societies have been slow to change (see cases 2, 6, 8, and 10).

Migrating workers were observed to be more likely to experience changes in their lifestyles and values. One change noted by Heyzer (1982) was that daughters who migrated for factory work experienced weakened direct control by elders, which resulted in the growth of personal choice and romance as the foundation of courtship and marriage. Lin supported this finding by pointing out that migrating workers must deal with men. The tradition in Malay society is "for family and village life to control male/female interactions" (1986, 7). Away from the village and absent from the family, young women were forced to manage their own interactions with men.

In Mauritius, as well as in rural areas of Malaysia where TNC factories have been established, social contacts outside of the family continued to be limited to family events such as weddings, religious ceremonies, and visits with relatives (see cases 1 and 10). Hein reported that 87% of her study's respondents indicated that they never or rarely went to movies, while only 10% met socially with friends from work (1986, 293).

Fernandez-Kelly observed that women tended to joke more about men and interactions with them, but their actual behavior was less likely to stray from traditional limits. She reported, for example, that her respondents believed that to accept a ride from a man, especially at night was "to look for trouble" (1983, 131). Moreover, the sexual mores of female maquiladora workers continued to follow conventional notions of "decent" and "indecent" behavior. Tiano (1984) also indicated that maquiladora workers continued to subscribe to traditional values. Similarly, Diamond indicated that most female Taiwanese workers continued to take pride in being obedient and loving daughters who followed their parents' advice and plans for them. However, she also related that daughters hid the "use of cosmetics, new fashions in dress, recreational activities, and choice of friends from parents to avoid confrontations" (1979, 331). Kung also reported similar patterns in the Taiwanese women in her sample. She indicated that

women now have a greater say about whom they will marry; they are able to buy more clothes; they have more opportunities to "play"; and they have greater freedom of movement in the "outside world" (1976, 54).

However, she attributed these changes not to the women's factory work, but rather to general improvements in the country's standard of living over recent years.

Yet Foo and Lim reported that

young Asian women's concerns with beauty, sexual attractiveness and relationships with men don't necessarily originate with the emphasis in some factory social activities on fashion, beauty, romance and intermingling between the sexes. Beauty and social attractiveness are important in traditional Asian cultures (except those which practice female seclusion) (1988, 17).

They went on to assert that women's subscription to traditional and modern ideologies was "rational" given the socio-economic context in which men were able to earn larger incomes and were granted more political and social power than women. In general, women's employment in TNCs has not been very successful in dramatically changing the values and beliefs of either the workers or the societies examined as a whole.

Marital Ideals

One major change in marital ideals observed by these researchers is that women desired to choose their marital partners (see cases 5, 10, 14 and 15). Arranged marriages, except in some areas of Malaysia and Taiwan, have become less frequent. However, the preference for arranged marriages, where they still existed, was less a preference than a reflection of the women's lack of opportunities to meet eligible men (see cases 5, 8, 9, 10, and 13).

Female-Headed Households

Some researchers, including Baerrensens,¹⁸ believe that the presence of TNC factories has led to an increased number of female-headed households. He asserted that factory work increases tensions in terms of the distribution of power and resource allocation between husbands and wives.

Additionally, he suggested that women with independent incomes demand greater participation in family matters and that this threatens the authority of fathers and husbands. Women have also been criticized for neglecting their proper role as nurturers and caretakers of families (see cases 2, 3, 5, and 10). Tiano's (1984) research shed some light on this subject. Her findings indicated that over 90% of female-headed households existed before the women went to work in factories. Thus, at least for Mexico, it can be concluded that marital discord and other forms of conflict in the family cannot be directly attributed to the presence of TNC employment for women.

While the majority of female TNC workers were single, there was evidence that the number of workers who are married and/or had children was increasing, especially among Mexican apparel workers. Women who experienced the loss of a male breadwinner due to death, desertion, and the illegal

¹⁸ Baerrensens, D. W. "Unemployment and Mexico's Border Industrialization Program." Inter-American Economic Affairs 29(Autumn): 75-90.

migration of men to the U.S., have begun to turn to garment factories for needed wages. Seventy-three percent of married workers in Mexico reported that all of their income was used to meet family and work expenses (Fernandez-Kelly 1981). Married workers, as well as single parents, find it difficult to work in factories due to the somewhat inflexible schedules and rotating shifts. Child care services were reported to be limited and expensive. The Singapore government has made some effort to provide these services in order to make it easier for married women and mothers to work (Foo and Lim 1988).

Female-headed households are rare in Southeast Asia. Although Muslim countries, such as Malaysia and Mauritius, where divorce is relatively easy for men, may experience a higher rate of these household arrangements. For example, in Mauritius, 47.3% of female workers claimed to be separated or divorced, and 25% were single heads of households (Hein 1986). At the same time, 70% of the women working at the Mexican border were reported to be single (Tiano 1987). In 1974, in Taiwan, 61% of workers were unmarried, while 34% were married (Diamond 1979). McLellan (1985) reported that 17% of factory workers in Malaysia were from female-headed households.

Summary

The examination of the data for factors related to the social and familial experiences of female TNC workers has resulted in a fairly clear picture. That is, the income that women are able to contribute to household resources has resulted in only marginal increases in their status in the family. While women are more likely, as a result of their waged labor, to choose their marital partners, engage in a small amount consumer spending, and participate in social activities outside the family, the patriarchal authority of most families remains unchanged. At the same time, young women, particularly in Southeast Asia, are trapped in factory work in order to meet their family's rising expectations for increased goods and status which come from the income contributions of daughters.

CHAPTER SIX

CONCLUSION

All of the research cited in this study found evidence that supported the potential for expanded wage opportunities extended to women as a result of the introduction of TNC factories in LDCs. This suggested "new economic roles for women, potentially increased status, and an undermining of the patriarchal structure which makes families oppressive for women" (Grossman 1980, 46). At the same time, researchers also recognized that these changes have been slow in developing and have produced contradictory results.

The underlying assumption of women's TNC employment held by modernization theorists is that once women were integrated into modern waged labor a dual process for their emancipation would be generated. First, women would be removed from traditional patterns of patriarchal exploitation and, second, access to technology would create opportunities for gaining experiences that would qualify them for skilled jobs (Heyzer 1982). However, the research examined in this study clearly indicated that this has not been the case. Women, in all five countries, continued to be excluded from both the training necessary to qualify them as skilled workers and access to the skilled jobs themselves.

The modernization view also asserted that as women joined the international division of labor they would have a basis for organizing collectively for their rights as workers (Heyzer 1982). However, the data indicated that both TNC management and government policies operated in such a way that organizing as workers was either prohibited by law and/or placed workers' jobs at risk. Where unions existed, they were eager to facilitate the objectives of both management and government (see cases 2, 7, 10, 11, and 14). For example in Mexico, TNC-employees who struck were faced with the relocation of their factory and the loss of their jobs (Fernandez-Kelly 1981). In addition, factory management practices encouraged competition between workers and fostered paternalistic attitudes which tended to diffuse any self-empowerment that might result from earning a wage. Moreover, the complaints of female TNC workers toward unsatisfactory wages and working conditions tended to be expressed in terms of personality conflicts and not discussed openly with co-workers. As a result, dissatisfied workers did not think of their problems in terms of worker/management conflicts that could be resolved through collective bargaining and/or joining or organizing trade unions.

Workers reported that they had little power with which to collectively bargain with management. The unstable nature of TNC-employment due to the factories reliance on

production contracts that reflected the economies and consumption patterns in developed countries made high turnover common. In addition, workers (and management) believed that there was an overabundant supply of potential workers in the community. As a result, strikes or slow downs were considered ineffective; management could always replace striking workers with those from the surplus pool of unemployed (Fernandez-Kelly 1983).

Lin (1986), however, believed that some positive developments would arise out of the development of TNC-factories in Malaysia. She asserted that the development of multi-ethnic assembly lines in Malaysia would lead to a breakdown of the colonial legacy of ethnic segregation and to a new multi-cultural working class. In her view, this multi-cultural working class would lead to a coherent and successful labor movement in Malaysia. Similarly, Tiano (1987) indicated that the ability of assembly work to eventually lead to the development of a feminist working class consciousness was clearly superior to chances of it occurring in isolating informal sector employment such as of domestic service, petty trade or prostitution.

On an individual level, TNC employment was reported to result in increased self-confidence, greater personal and economic independence and greater self-fulfillment outside of the home (see cases 8 and 9). Women in Singapore and Malaysia reported that they believed they were better off

than non-TNC workers such as domestic servants, agricultural workers, helpers in small shops, and unpaid family labor (Foo and Lim 1988). In Malaysia, female TNC employees saw their labor as a means of being valued as productive beings. In addition, TNC workers were more likely to see work as a permanent fixture in their lives and planned to continue working after marriage; marriages that were more likely to occur at a later age as a result of women entering the work force as TNC operatives (see cases 2, 8, 9, and 12).

However, Diamond (1979) and Fernandez-Kelly (1983) concluded that other researchers may be reading too much into the benefits of increased economic usefulness to women. They suggested that earning an income did not necessarily lead to autonomous decision making and/or independence for young women, and much of the data reported here lends credence to this position. While Diamond and Fernandez-Kelly's critiques are important, the benefits that were reported by the women who worked these jobs must be awarded some value and must be included in any evaluation of the relative costs and benefits of this phenomenon.

In some cases, the social costs of increased economic independence were very high. TNC factories that encouraged their employees to adopt western habits in clothing, make-up, and norms for female/male relationships resulted in some women being castigated and outcast from their communities and families of origin (Grossman 1980, 246). This was

characterized by the widely-held belief that female TNC-workers were immoral and would be unworthy as wives and/or mothers (see cases 2, 6, 7, 9, 10, 12, and 13).

On the household level, women's employment was reported as having led to increased family incomes and improved living standards in Malaysia, Singapore and Taiwan (see cases 5 and 13). At the same time, it was clear that these improvements often came at the expense of the health, education, and leisure time of the women. Women did not, in general, control their incomes and left school early in order that their wages could be added to the family resource pool as well as fund the educations of younger, especially male, siblings. Although the TNC factories were valued for their relatively clean work environments, the health effects of straining to work through microscopes as well as exposure to toxic chemicals used in the factories were serious for most working women and led to rapid and irreversible deterioration of their eyesight, disabling them from further employment (Grossman 1980; and Lin 1986). Factory workers who did not live at home were reported to live in crowded dormitories, guest houses, or squatter settlements with inadequate sanitary and cooking facilities. Living conditions, along with the pressure to save money, was reported to result in an inadequate diet for many factory workers, for example, resulting in malnutrition for workers in Mauritius (Hein 1986). Female TNC workers who did live

at home were reported to suffer seriously from the "double duty" of women's waged and household labor. These women, in general, did not get any help from male household members in managing and accomplishing meal preparation, childcare, housecleaning, laundering, or any other task involved in maintaining a household.

One major problem with TNC employment that can be observed from the data was that the companies have not lived up to their promises to host governments. For example, the preference for women employees has not led to a decrease in unemployment (see cases 2, 3, 4, 6, and 10). In fact, some researchers argued that TNC employment has led to an introduction of a new category of workers -- young, high school educated women (Fernandez-Kelly 1983; and Grossman 1980). Nor has TNC employment led to the benefits promised to women if they became factory employees. In general, the researchers suggested that "TNC employment doesn't create or worsen gender inequality" (Foo and Lim 1988, 22). However, it also does nothing to alleviate it. Foo and Lim suggested that TNC employment temporarily alleviated the "subordination women suffer as a result of gender inequality," not through TNC jobs specifically, but rather through benefits obtained through increased educational opportunities, migration and wage employment (1988, 22).

At the same time, Lim (1981) recognized that women's involvement in wage labor has not led to an end to the sex-

based division of labor, women's continued inequality in the labor force in terms of access to education and attainment, labor force participation, occupational choice, lifetime career paths, and income. Women are still restricted in terms of where they will work and their opportunities to become sole supporters or primary breadwinners of their families remain severely constrained. Training opportunities that could lead to promotions into responsible positions of creativity and authority remain out of reach for most women in the countries examined. At the same time that women experience these constraints in the productive sectors of society, changes in who is responsible for reproductive tasks have been slow or have yet to occur. The societal assumption that women's reproductive role takes primacy over their productive roles remain strong in all five countries. Lim suggested that women will remain secondary citizens and secondary workers as long as these ideologies continue to dominate cultural beliefs.

Integration or Exploitation?

The findings of this study indicated that the experiences of female TNC employees, at least in the countries contained in this data set, cannot be placed completely within either the integration or exploitation framework. For each example illustrating TNC work liberated women from oppressive family structures and provided

opportunities for independent wage labor, there was counter evidence describing how TNC factory work substituted one form of oppression for another equally confining one. Since a theoretical framework should serve to help interpret the phenomenon under investigation, it would appear that the integration/exploitation dichotomy is an inadequate framework for understanding female TNC employment.

Most of the researchers agreed that their argument was not against women's participation in paid work as such, but rather against the perpetuation of sex segregation in the labor market which continued to restrict women's employment opportunities and keep them at the lowest end of the wage scale (all cases, excluding 12). Researchers believed that a sex segregated labor market was responsible for the continued underdevelopment and economic atrophy in LDCs because it limited the flexibility and availability for workers for certain jobs and restricted certain groups into the least desired and lowest paid positions. Rigid rules about which groups were eligible for promotions and training as well as the job opportunities available to groups had the effect of demoralizing workers and decreasing productivity.

While Fernandez-Kelly recognized that maquiladora work (and TNC employment in other LDCs) assured survival, it was an inadequate "vehicle for expanding the choices of working people on whose shoulders rest the advancement of a nation" (1983, 192). Her assertion that the internationalization of

production did not necessarily result in improved working environments, conditions, and/or opportunities for citizens of LDCs was supported by data supplied by other researchers in this data set (see cases 2, 3, 6, 9, and 10). The fact that TNC factories in LDCs tended to do the labor intensive work, while the factories in the home countries retained control over technology had not resulted in the increased ability of local capital to develop industries and products that are competitive with those of TNCs.

The evidence presented suggested that, despite the advances female TNC workers have made in the areas of personal choice and economic independence, women continue to be "losers" in their countries' economic development (Lin 1986). The position of LDC women is not unlike that of early factory workers in the U.S., Britain and Australia (Lim 1981). This evidence suggested that the internationalization of production, despite its promises, does not create good paying jobs under safe working conditions available to citizens of LDCs. Rather, what has been seen so far is worsening working conditions, less stringent health and safety regulations, the exacerbation of urban problems and, in the long run, as factories become automated and/or relocate to countries offering lower wages and other operating costs, increased unemployment (Fernandez-Kelly 1981, 194).

What remains unclear, however, is the relative value of the experiences and opportunities offered to women who work in TNC factories, and the net benefits of this form of employment continue to be debated. Some researchers believed that, at the least, wage work resulted in freedom from women's traditional confinement to the home and the monotony of household labor (Foo and Lim 1988). Hein asserted that

The concentration of women in [TNC] industry does involve the exploitation of a weaker socio-economic group, yet it has provided women an opportunity to increase their participation in the modern formal sector of the economy (1986, 309).

Yet Fernandez-Kelly (1983) reported that expanded economic opportunities for women have generated social tensions and painful dilemmas as women are forced to make choices between responsibilities arising out of their productive and reproductive labor, respectively.

It seems that the time has come to re-examine how the position of women in transnational employment has been investigated. The research completed under the integration/exploitation frameworks has resulted in a debate that has extensively explored the relative costs and benefits of female TNC employment. What is clear is that this dichotomy does not fully capture the experiences of female factory employment nor provide a framework for proposing solutions to the continued disadvantaged position of women in the work world and their families.

Transnational factories are not going to go away, change their preference for female employees, or modify either their occupational hierarchies or wage structures. Moreover, the women who work in these factories, while generally dissatisfied with their wages and working conditions, do not want to stop working for wages. A framework should be developed that is able to explore the dialectical characteristics of wage labor for women without either legitimizing the management practices of TNCs or calling for an end to offshore production facilities. This framework can only evolve from a theoretical perspective that recognizes that women are a unique subset of workers, with a specific relationship to production that is an outgrowth of their secondary status as citizens. Future research should attempt to understand both the costs and benefits of this form of employment. In that way, a clear understanding of how scholars and others concerned about female TNC factory workers can lobby and organize for recognition of the unique experiences of female TNC workers and set an agenda for change, at the same time that a way for TNC workers to organize can be developed that recognizes their fragile position in the international labor hierarchy and ensures the continued presence of their factory employers.

An improved conceptual framework should be able to bridge the gap between conclusions drawn by the applied-

oriented (integrationist) researchers who focuses on readily observable, measurable and concrete changes found in individuals or groups of women as a result of their waged labor and the theoretically-oriented (exploitationist) researchers who are concerned with building theories which can explain a phenomenon for a broad range of workers and countries. Both approaches have much to contribute to this endeavor and much to learn from each other.

What seems clear is that women's waged labor in and of itself is not enough to change the household division of labor. It is also true that if the status of women and an expansion of their opportunities and rights (so that they become equal to men) were to improve, changes must occur within the household, where women and men play out their gendered, and societally-sanctioned roles and where children are socialized into the roles, values and beliefs they will take with them into adulthood. As a result, factors which can facilitate and measure changes in household relations are most important to the development of an improved framework. Education, as the second most important socializing agent for children, would also be important to examine and exert pressure for reform in the direction of more egalitarian opportunities and treatment of girls and boys.

It appears that the work place tends to respond to existing social norms, rather than lead the way toward

change and as such it is less important in terms of changing patterns of socialization. However, factors which influence workers' rights, wages, and working conditions are important in terms of describing and directing activists and researchers to areas that are responsible for the continued exploitation of women workers. Employment-related factors are important for the resolution of short-term issues, while family and education-related factors are critical to the facilitation of long-term changes in women's position in the family, in the work place and in society.

APPENDIX

APPENDIX

Summary of Case Studies

Contained in this Appendix are summaries of the case studies which comprise the data set for this project. The summaries are offered as a way of understanding the nature of the research undertaken in each case study.

The Appendix was organized in the following manner. The case studies were first divided by region and country. Within each country, they were alphabetized by author. In addition, each case study was given a number which was used as a reference in the body of this text (also see Figure 2).

AFRICA

Mauritius

(1)

Hein, Catherine. 1986. "The Feminization of Industrial Employment in Mauritius: A Case of Sex Segregation." In C. Hein, Sex Inequalities in Urban Employment in the Third World, Chapter 7.

This chapter examined census and survey data from the 1970s on the nature of industrial employment policies and practices in Mauritius. The author's objective was to identify the factors which explain the high participation rates of women in labor intensive export-oriented industries given the traditional Muslim culture of the country.

NORTH AMERICA

Mexico

(2)

Fernandez-Kelly, Maria Patricia. 1983. For We Are Sold, I and My People: Women and Industry in Mexico's Frontier. Albany, New York: State University of New York Press.

Placing her experiences as a participant observer among maquiladora workers in Ciudad Juarez, Mexico within the context of political economy, Fernandez-Kelly provided an analysis of the phenomenon of women's employment in transnational corporations that focused on the social relations of production.

(3)

Tiano, Susan. 1987. "Maquiladoras in Mexicali: Integration or Exploitation?" In Vicki Ruiz and Susan Tiano (eds.), Women on the U.S.-Mexico Border. Responses to Change. Boston: Allen & Unwin.

Using data from a 1982 study of female electronics, apparel and service sector workers, Tiano assessed the validity of the exploitation and integration explanations of the effects of industrial employment on women workers and their families. Her findings suggested that there is evidence to support both interpretations of women's TNC employment and additional work needs to be undertaken in this area.

(4)

Tiano, Susan. 1984. "Maquiladoras,, Women's Work and Unemployment in Northern Mexico." Aztlan 15(2): 341-378.

Tiano used a Marxist-feminist theoretical framework to interpret data on women's labor force participation in Northern Mexico. She is particularly interested in the commonly-held belief that maquiladoras are unable to solve the problem of unemployment in the area because unemployment is perceived as a male problem and maquiladoras mostly hire females.

SOUTHEAST ASIASingapore and Malaysia

(5)

Foo, Gillian H.C. and Linda Y.C. Lim. 1988. "Poverty, Ideology and Women Export Factory Workers in Asia." In H. Afshar and B. Agarwal (eds.), Women and Poverty. London: McMillan.

This essay examined the role of poverty and ideology in the participation of Malaysian women in factory work. While dismissing the commonly-held position that women are forced to work as a result of decreased family resources, Foo and Lim acknowledged the role of family, gender, individual and class ideologies in this phenomenon.

(6)

Grossman, Rachel. 1980. "Women's Place in the Integrated Circuit." In Radical America 14(1): 29-49.

This research project examined the relationship between Third World women and transnational factories using the case study of transnational electronics assembly operations in Penang, Malaysia.

(7)

Heyzer, Noeleen. 1982. "From Rural Subsistence to an Industrial Peripheral Work Force: An Examination of Female Malaysian Migrants and Capital Accumulation in Singapore." In L. Beneria (ed.), Women and Development. New York: Praeger Press.

Using a framework of uneven development, Heyzer analyzed the results of a participant observation study conducted between 1974-75 at a transnational textile factory in Singapore. In an attempt to ascertain whether the 'modernization' theory that women's wage labor will lead to women's emancipation, Heyzer reported that, at least in this case, it does not. While recognizing that wage labor may increase women's relative status, at the same time their conception of themselves as temporary workers strongly identified with the ideologies and practices of their rural villages precludes the development of identities as workers.

(8)

Lim, Linda Y.C. 1981. Women in the Singapore Economy.
Singapore: Singapore National University Research Center,
ERC Occasional Paper Series #4.

Lim ascribes to the "separate spheres" or private-public dichotomy and used this framework for her discussion of the role of women in the Singapore economy. She asserted that while there have been improvements and changes in the position of women workers recently, women's responsibility for reproductive work in the family and society, as well as the cultural stereotypes attached to this role, continues to support the perception of women as secondary wage earners who are less productive than men. Although she was optimistic that women's position in the economy will continue to improve, Lim recognized that real change in women's economic position can only occur as a result of a reorganization of the household division of labor -- whereby men and women share equally in the reproduction-related labor of society and family.

(9)

Lin, Vivian. 1986. "Health, Women's Work and Industrialization: Women Workers in the Semi-Conductor Industry in Singapore and Malaysia." East Lansing: Michigan State University, Women in International Development Working Paper #130.

Lin used a political economy of health perspective to analyze the health impacts on women working in the semi-conductor industry. The author recognized the preferred status of young, single operators in the electronics industry in Singapore and Malaysia and used this example to explore how world capitalism affects people's health.

(10)

McLellan, Susan. 1985. "Reciprocity or Exploitation? Mothers and Daughters in the Changing Economy of Rural Malaysia." East Lansing: Michigan State University, Wrijae in International Development Working Paper #93.

McLellan examined the strong traditional bond between Malay mothers and daughters. She asserted that the exploitation of kin is the only way to ensure survival in a rapidly changing economic environment whose goal is the decline of the peasant and the rise of the wage laborer. Since marriage ties are weak and males are expected to conduct their lives outside the home, the strongest bonds are between mothers and daughters. Daughters are expected to generously contribute to their mothers who use the money to

purchase material goods which increase their status in the village. Daughters are also encouraged to live at home to assure their virginity and marriageability. The need for cash has convinced mothers that daughters can and should work in factories, despite Malay-Muslim traditions which assert the opposite.

Taiwan

(11)

Arrigo, Linda Gail. 1985. "Economic and Political Control of Women Workers in Multinational Electronics Factories in Taiwan: Martial Law Coercion and World Market Uncertainty." Contemporary Marxism 11: 77-95.

In her discussion of multinational factories in Taiwan, Arrigo explored the ways that the Taiwanese government and multinational management use martial law to control and maintain a low paid, predominantly female multinational factory labor force.

(12)

Arrigo, Linda Gail. 1980. "The Industrial Work Force of Young Women in Taiwan." Bulletin of Concerned Asian Scholars 12: 25-38.

Unmarried female factory workers in Taiwan have helped to raise the standard of living for many families in the lower socioeconomic strata by sending home remittances. Arrigo reported that the preference for young, single female workers has resulted in the increased value of educating daughters -- more education brings better, higher paying jobs -- as well as a trend toward later marriage. Young women who live independently feel pressure to contribute to their families of origin at the same time that they enjoy increased independence to control the money that is leftover after meeting family obligations. Arrigo also explored the effects of a shortage of young, single women as a result of rapid industrialization on Taiwanese society. She reports that more young married women who are entering the labor force.

(13)

Diamond, Norma. 1979. "Women and Industry in Taiwan."
Modern China 5(3): 317-340.

Using data from interviews conducted at a Taiwan textile mill in 1970, Diamond examined the commonly-held belief that the increased participation of women in the labor force will lead to increased power and status within the household.

(14)

Gallin, Rita. 1989. "Women and Export Industry in Taiwan: The Muting of Class Consciousness." Forthcoming in Kathryn B. Ward (ed.), Women workers and global restructuring. Ithaca, New York: ILR Press.

Gallin provided a three-part explanation for the absence of class conscious labor activism among women factory workers in Taiwan. She identified the primary factors responsible for women's lack of organization and collective action as government policies, managerial practices, and family processes which reproduce a patriarchal ideology that fosters women's lack of organization and collective action.

(15)

Kung, Lydia. 1976. "Factory work and women in Taiwan: Changes in self-image and status." Signs: Journal of Women in Culture and Society 2(1): 35-58.

In this article, Kung focuses on the perceptions of female Taiwanese factory workers in regard to the effects of their employment on their status and independence. The author's objective was to demonstrate that understanding social change requires not only examining objective indicators but also to ascertain "how the events of change are interpreted by the individuals who confront them."

BIBLIOGRAPHY

BIBLIOGRAPHY

- Acker, Joan. 1988. "Class, gender, and the relations of distribution." Signs: Journal of Women in Culture and Society 13(3): 473-497.
- Afshar, Haleh. (ed.). 1985. Women, work and ideology in the Third World. London and New York: Tavistock Publications.
- Amin, Samir. 1976. Unequal development: An essay on the social formations of peripheral capital. New York: Monthly Review Press.
- Armstrong, Pat and Hugh Armstrong. 1983. "Beyond sexless class and classless sex: Towards feminist Marxism." Studies in Political Economy 10: 7-43.
- Arrigo, Linda Gail. 1980. "The Industrial work force of young women in Taiwan." Bulletin of Concerned Asian Scholars 12: 25-38.
- _____. 1985. "Economic and political control of women workers in multinational electronics factories in Taiwan: martial law coercion and world market uncertainty." Contemporary Marxism 11: 77-95.
- Baerrensen, Donald W. "Unemployment and Mexico's Border Industrialization Program." Inter-American Economic Affairs 29(Autumn): 75-90.
- Barrett, Michelle. 1980. Women's oppression today: Problems in Marxist feminist analysis. New York: Schocken Books.
- Beechy, Veronica. 1979. "On patriarchy." Feminist Review 3: 66-82.
- Bekken, J. 1984. "Where labor and life are cheap." Industrial Worker 81(3): 6.
- Beneria, Lourdes. 1982. "Class and gender inequalities and women's role in economic development: Theoretical and practical implications." Feminist Studies 8: 157-176.
- Beneria, Lourdes and Gita Sen. 1981. "Accumulation, reproduction, and women's role in economic development: Boserup revisited." Signs: Journal of Women in Culture and Society 7(2): 279-298.

- Blumberg, Rae Lesser. 1984. "A general theory of gender stratification." In R. Collins (ed.), Sociological Theory. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass Publishers.
- _____. 1988. "The 'triple overlap' of gender stratification, economy, and the family." Journal of Family Issues 9(1): 3-7.
- Boserup, Ester. 1970. Women's role in economic development. London: George Allen and Unwin.
- _____. 1975. Integration of women in development: Why, when, how. New York: United Nations Development Programme.
- _____. 1976. Traditional division of work between the sexes: A source of inequality. Geneva: International Institute for Labour Studies.
- Burris, Val. 1982. "The dialectic of women's oppression: Notes on the relationship between capitalism and patriarchy." Berkeley Journal of Sociology 27: 51-74.
- Buvinic, Mayra. 1976. Women and world development. Washington, D. C.: Overseas Development Council.
- Chapkis, Wendy and Chris Enloe. 1983. Of common cloth: Women in the global textile industry. Washington, D. C.: Institute for Policy Studies.
- Charlton, Sue Ellen M. 1984. Women in Third World Development. Boulder, Colorado: Westview Press.
- Christian Conference of Asia-Urban Rural Mission. 1983. Struggling to survive. Hong Kong: CCA-URM.
- Clasen, Thomas F. 1981. "U.S. foreign-trade zone manufacturing and assembly: Overview and update." Law and Policy International Business 13(1): 339-348.
- Diamond, Norma. 1979. "Women and industry in Taiwan." Modern China 5(3): 317-340.
- Didsburg, Howard H. 1985. The global economy: Today, tomorrow and the transition. Bethesda, Maryland: World Future Society.
- Dixon, Marlene, Elizabeth Martinez and Ed McCaughan. 1985. "Theoretical perspectives on Chicanas, Mexicanas and the transnational working class." Contemporary Marxism 11: 46-76.

- Dror, David M. 1984. "Aspects of labor law and relations on selected export processing zones." International Labour Review 123: 705-722.
- Eisenstein, Zillah. 1979. Capitalist patriarchy and the case for socialist feminism. New York: Monthly Review Press.
- Elson, Diane. and Ruth Pearson. 1981. The latest phase of international capital and its implications for women in the Third World. Brighton: IDS.
- Evans, Peter. 1979. Dependent development: The alliance of multinational, state and local capital in Brazil. Princeton, New Jersey: Princeton University Press.
- Eviota, Elizabeth U. 1985. "Women, work and sex: Gender relations and societal transitions in the Philippines." Dissertation. New Jersey: Rutgers University.
- Feldberg, Roslyn L. and Evelyn N. Glenn. 1982. "Male and female: Job versus gender models in the sociology of work." In R. Kan-Hunt, A. Kaplan Daniels and R. Colvard (eds.), Women and work: Problems and perspectives. New York: Oxford University Press.
- Fernandez-Kelly, Maria Patricia. 1982. Feminization, Mexican border industrialization and migration. Berkeley, California: Center for the Study, Education and Advancement of Women, University of California.
- _____. 1983. For we are sold, I and my people: Women and industry in Mexico's frontier. Albany, NY: State University of New York Press.
- Foo, Gillian H. C. and Linda Y. C. Lim. 1988. "Poverty, ideology and women export factory workers in Asia." In Haleh Afshar and Bina Agarwal (eds.), Women and poverty. London: MacMillan.
- Foord, Jo and Nicky Gregson. 1986. "Patriarchy: Towards a reconceptualization." Antipode 18(2): 186-211.
- Ford-Smith, H. 1987. "Jamaica's free trade zones -- We a feel it." International Labour Reports 24: 21.
- Frank, Andre Gunder. 1974. "The development of underdevelopment." In J. D. Cockcroft and D. Johnson (eds.), Dependence and underdevelopment: Latin America's political economy. New York: Anchor Books.

- Friewald, Aaron. 1985. "Mexico: A multinational haven." In Multinational Monitor 6(16): 1-6.
- Gallin, Rita. 1989. "Women and export industry in Taiwan: The muting of class consciousness." Forthcoming in Kathryn Ward (ed.), Women workers and global restructuring. Ithaca, New York: ILR Press.
- Grossman, Rachel. 1980. "Women's Place in the integrated circuit." Radical America 14(1): 29-49.
- Hartmann, Heidi. 1981. "The unhappy marriage of Marxism and feminism: Towards a more progressive union." In L. Sargent (ed.), Women and Revolution. Boston: South End Press.
- Hein, Catherine. 1986. "The Feminization of industrial employment in Mauritius: A Case of Sex Segregation." In C. Hein, Sex inequalities in urban employment in the Third World, Chapter 7.
- Heyzer, Noeleen. 1982. "From rural subsistence to an industrial peripheral work force: An examination of female Malaysian migrants and capital accumulation in Singapore." In L. Beneria (ed.), Women and Development. New York: Praeger Press.
- Jenkins, Rhys Owen. 1977. Transnational corporations and their impact on the Mexican economy. Norwich: School of Development Studies, University of East Anglia.
- Joekes, Susan P. 1986. Industrialization, trade and female employment in developing countries. Experiences of the 1970s and after. New York: United Nations Research Study, 1J.
- Kelly, M. 1983. "Down on the border." Multinational Monitor 4(8): 10.
- Kelly, P. 1980. "The Maquila women." NACLA 14(5): 14.
- Kuhn, Annette and Ann Marie Wolpe. 1978. Feminism and materialism: Women and modes of production. Boston: Routledge and Paul.
- Kung, Lydia. 1976. "Factory work and women in Taiwan: Changes in self-image and status." Signs: Journal of Women in Culture and Society 2(1): 35-58.
- Leacock, Eleanor and Helen I. Safa. 1986. Women's work: Development and the division of labor by gender. South Hadley, Massachusetts: Bergin and Garvey.

- Leung, Trini W. Y. 1985. "Women workers in newly industrialized countries of Asia: Problems and issues." ISIS International Women's Journal 4: 71-87.
- Lily, F. B. 1985. "Garment industry and its workers in Bangladesh." ISIS International Women's Journal 4: 41-47.
- Lim, Linda Y. C. 1978. Women workers in multinational corporations: The case of the electronics industry in Malaysia and Singapore. Ann Arbor: Women's Study Program, University of Michigan.
- _____. 1981. Women in the Singapore Economy. Singapore: Singapore National University Research Center, ERC Occasional Paper Series #4.
- _____. 1983. "Capitalism, imperialism and patriarchy: The dilemma of Third World women workers in multinational factories." In J. Nash and M. P. Fernandez-Kelly (eds.), Women, men and the international division of labor. Albany, New York: State University of New York Press.
- Lin, Vivian. 1986. "Health, women's work and industrialization: Women workers in the semi-conductor industry in Singapore and Malaysia." East Lansing, Michigan: Michigan State University, Women in International Development Working Paper #130.
- McLellan, Susan. 1985. "Reciprocity or exploitation? Mothers and daughters in the changing economy of rural Malaysia." East Lansing, Michigan: Michigan State University, Women in International Development Working Paper #93.
- Mies, Maria. 1986. Patriarchy and accumulation on a world scale: Women in the international division of labor. London: Zed Books, Inc.
- Miles, Robert. 1984. "Marxism versus the sociology of race relations." Ethnic and Racial Studies 7(April): 24-43.
- Nash, June. 1977. "Women in development: Dependency and exploitation." Development and Change 8: 161-182.
- Nash, June and Maria Patricia Fernandez-Kelly (eds.). Women and change in Latin America. New York: Praeger Publishers.

- North American Congress on Latin America. 1975. "Hit and run: U. S. runaway shops on the Mexican Border." Latin America and Empire Report (July-August): 11.
- Nicholson, Linda. 1986. "Feminism and Marx: Integrating kinship with the economic." Praxis International 5(4): 367-380.
- O'Donnell, Carol. 1984. "Major theories of the labour market and women's place within it." Journal of Industrial Relations 6: 147-165.
- Omvedt, Gail. 1986. "Patriarchy: The analysis of women's oppression." The Insurgent Sociologist 13(3): 30-50.
- Pena, Devon G. 1980. "Las Maquiladoras: Mexican women and class struggle in the border industries." Aztlan 11(2): 159-229.
- Pollert, Anna. 1981. Girls, wives, factory lives. London: MacMillan.
- Safa, Helen I. 1976. Sex and class in Latin America. New York: Praeger Press.
- Salaff, Janet W. 1981. Working daughters of Hong Kong: Filial piety or power in the family? Cambridge, England: University of Cambridge Press.
- Sassen-Koob, Saskia. 1984. "Notes on the incorporation of Third World women into wage labor through immigration and off-shore production." International Migration Review 18(4): 1144-1167.
- Scott, A. M. 1986. "Women and Industrialization: Examining the 'female marginalization' thesis." Journal of Development Studies 22: 649-680.
- Seligson, Mitchell A. and Edward J. Williams. 1981. Maquiladoras and migration: Workers in the Mexico-United States Border Industrialization Program. Austin: University of Texas Press.
- Sen, Gita. 1987. Development, crises and alternative visions: Third World women's perspectives. New York: Monthly Review Press.
- Siegel, Lenny. 1979. "Microelectronics does little for Third World." Pacific Research Review 10(2).

- Sundaram, Jomo K. 1988. A question of class: Capital, the state, and uneven development in Malaysia. New York: Monthly Review Press.
- Takeo, Tsuchaya. 1977. "What is the Free Trade Zone?" AMPO: Japan-Asia Quarterly Review: 1.
- Tiano, Susan. 1984. "Maquiladoras, women's work and unemployment in northern Mexico." Aztlan 15(2): 341-378.
- _____. 1987. "Gender, work, and world capitalism: Third World women's role in development." in Beth B. Hess and Myra Marx Ferree (eds), Analyzing Gender. Beverly Hills: Sage Publishers.
- _____. 1987. "Maquiladoras in Mexicali: Integration or exploitation?" In V. Ruiz and S. Tiano (eds.), Women on the U.S.-Mexico border. Responses to change. Boston: Allen & Unwin.
- Van Waas, Michael. 1982. "Multinational corporations -- Labor supply." Insurgent Sociologist 11(3): 49.
- Vogel, Lise. 1983. Marxism and the oppression of women: Toward a unitary theory. New Brunswick, New Jersey: Rutgers University Press.
- Wallerstein, Immanuel. 1974. "The rise and future demise of the world capitalist system, concepts for comparative analysis." Comparative Studies in History and Society 16(4).
- Ward, Kathryn. 1984. Women in the world system: Its impact on status and fertility. New York: Praeger Press.
- _____. 1986. "Women and transnational employment: A world system and feminist analysis." East Lansing, Michigan: Michigan State University, Women in International Development Working Paper #120.
- Wheaton, Philip and Jeb Mays. 1976. "Puerto Rico: A people challenging colonialism. In Ecumenical Program for Inter-American Communication and Action. Washington, D.C., 23-24.
- Young, Gay. 1986. The social ecology and economic development of Ciudad Juarez. Boulder, Colorado: Westview Press.

MICHIGAN STATE UNIV. LIBRARIES



31293005677582