This is to certify that the

thesis entitled

WOMEN NEWSPAPER MANAGERS
AND COVERAGE OF WOMEN

presented by

Kay Morgan Robinson

has been accepted towards fulfillment
of the requirements for

Master's degree in Journalism

Major professor

Date February 14, 1992

Women Newspaper Managers And Coverage of Women

By

Kay Morgan Robinson

A THESIS

Submitted to
Michigan State University
in partial fulfillment of the requirements
for the degree of

MASTER OF ARTS

School of Journalism

1991

ABSTRACT

WOMEN NEWSPAPER MANAGERS

AND COVERAGE OF WOMEN

By

Kay Morgan Robinson

This study examines the relationship between percentages of women editors at six Michigan newspapers and the coverage of women and women's issues in these newspapers during one week of August 1991. Content analysis was used to relate the proportion of female editors to the number, length and prominence of stories with female sources and those with female topics. Factors used as controls included circulation, percentage of female bylines and percentage of females in selected leadership positions in each community.

The study found that higher percentages of female editors did make a difference in the amount of coverage given to female sources and topics. The effect was greater on stories with female topics than it was on stories with female sources.

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

Research projects are rarely the work of single individuals, and this project probably owes more than most to the efforts of individuals other than the author.

First acknowledgments are due to Frederick Fico, the thesis director. He spent generous amounts of time, patience and intellectual energy on aspects of the study that ranged from the broad conceptual view that defined its scope and logic to the editing minutiae that enhanced the precision and aesthetics of the paper. I appreciated both his help and the enthusiasm he lent the project whenever it was most needed.

My thanks also go to the other members of the committee. Lucinda Davenport's suggestions and insights about the issues involved in the study were invaluable. Steve Lacy's questions and comments opened new doors for exploration.

Without Mary Cronin's gift of a computer, the time and effort needed to complete this project would have been tripled. She has my earnest gratitude.

Finally, I would like to thank my husband, Ray Robinson, for cheerfully handling my chores as well as his whenever needed and for enthusiastically proofreading and

encouraging this project. Most of all, I would like to thank him for his steadfast faith in the value of my work and my ability to accomplish it.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Chapter		Page
I.	INTRODUCTION	1
II.	THE LITERATURE: A HISTORICAL PERSPECTIVE	7
	Stereotyping As Social Control	9
	Institutional Influences	18
	Engendering News Decisions	29
	News Control By Superiors	32
	Women's Pages As Resources for Change	36
	A Strategy Debate	38
III.	THEORETICAL FRAMEWORK	52
	Hypotheses	56
	Controls	57
	Predictions	58
IV.	STUDY METHODS	60
	Population	63
	Variables	64
	Reliability	69
	Statistical Analysis	70

Chapter Page

V. FINDINGS 71

Findings on Hypotheses 78

Weekly News Cycle and Use of Female Sources and Topics 82

Conclusions 90

VI. DISCUSSION 92

Study Limitations 94

Suggestions for Further Study 96

Recommendations 98

APPENDIX A 102

Newspaper Edition Coding Sheet 102

Coding Work Sheet 103

Prominence Rating Work Sheet 104

CODING INSTRUCTIONS 105

Universe 105

Procedure 107

Measuring 107

Definitions 108

Coding Work Sheet 111

Prominence Rating Work Sheet 114

Newspaper Edition Coding Sheet 116

Frequent Reference List 120

Chapter Page

APPENDIX B 122

Pearson's Correlation Coefficients Relating Treatment of Women Sources and Topics in News Content to Newspaper and Community Characteristics 122

BIBLIOGRAPHY 123

LIST OF TABLES

Table		Page
1.	DATA ON NEWSPAPER AND COMMUNITY CHARACTERISTICS . .	72
2.	DATA ON STORY CHARACTERISTICS	75
3.	DATA ON PROMINENCE OF STORIES	76
4.	DATA ON TOTAL NUMBER OF SOURCES USED IN STORIES . .	77
5.	PART CORRELATION COEFFICIENTS RELATING TREATMENT OF WOMEN SOURCES AND TOPICS IN NEWS CONTENT TO NEWSPAPER AND COMMUNITY CHARACTERISTICS	78
6.	PART CORRELATION COEFFICIENTS RELATING PROMINENCE OF FEMALE SOURCES AND TOPICS IN NEWS CONTENT TO NEWSPAPER AND COMMUNITY CHARACTERISTICS	81
7.	MONDAY THROUGH FRIDAY: PART CORRELATION COEFFICIENTS RELATING TREATMENT OF WOMEN SOURCES AND TOPICS IN NEWS CONTENT TO NEWSPAPER AND COMMUNITY CHARACTERISTICS	83
8.	MONDAY THROUGH FRIDAY: PART CORRELATION COEFFICIENTS RELATING PROMINENCE OF FEMALE SOURCES AND TOPICS IN NEWS CONTENT TO NEWSPAPER AND COMMUNITY CHARACTERISTICS	85
9.	SATURDAY AND SUNDAY: PART CORRELATION COEFFICIENTS RELATING TREATMENT OF WOMEN SOURCES AND TOPICS IN NEWS CONTENT TO NEWSPAPER AND COMMUNITY CHARACTERISTICS	86
TABLE 10.	SATURDAY AND SUNDAY: PART CORRELATION COEFFICIENTS RELATING PROMINENCE OF FEMALE SOURCES AND TOPICS IN NEWS CONTENT TO NEWSPAPER AND COMMUNITY CHARACTERISTICS	87

Table Page

11. PERCENTAGES OF WEEKEND STORIES WITH FEMALE SOURCES AND FEMALE TOPICS ON SATURDAY AND SUNDAY IN FOUR RELEVANT NEWSPAPERS 90

12. PEARSON'S CORRELATION COEFFICIENTS RELATING TREATMENT OF WOMEN SOURCES AND TOPICS IN NEWS CONTENT TO NEWSPAPER AND COMMUNITY CHARACTERISTICS 122

Chapter I

INTRODUCTION

As the women's movement resurfaced in the 1960s after a post-war lapse, feminists began to point out more insistently than ever that women were under-represented in newsrooms throughout the nation. Their complaints went deeper than the previous demands for more economic opportunities for women. They contended that women and women's issues had consistently been ignored or belittled by a predominantly male press.

Betty Friedan provoked widespread discussion of this issue when her best-selling book accused the media of portraying women as "young and frivolous, almost childlike, fluffy and feminine, passive, gaily content in a world of bedroom and kitchen, sex, babies and home."[1]

Even worse, the new crusaders for equal treatment of women contended, women were systematically excluded from the news sections of newspapers. The fact that women rarely appeared in first sections of newspapers reinforced the cultural stereotype that women are insignificant. When women

---

[1]Friedan, Betty, The Feminine Mystique (New York: W.W. Norton, 1963), 36.

did appear, they were most often shown as wives, socialites or objects of human interest stories. In a re-analysis of previous content studies showing an absence of women in news columns, Pingree and Hawkins used the theory of media's status conferral function along with studies of the effects of television viewing on audiences to hypothesize that readers could conclude that men were more important and more involved in significant behaviors than women.[2] Furthermore, the researchers found that coverage of women's rights and issues was scant, giving readers the impression that the issues were unimportant and that little support for change existed.[3] When coverage was given to women's issues, it generally appeared in newspapers' women's pages. The placement reinforced the notion that "a woman's place is different from a man's, less significant, and it is in the home."[4]

One solution, giving women a larger proportion of reporting and editing jobs, was offered with the reasoning that men are more likely than women to accept widely held caricatured stereotypes of the sexes. It was argued that male reporters and editors are more likely to exclude news about women's legal rights, crisis centers and non-

---

[2]Suzanne Pingree and Robert P. Hawkins, "News Definitions and Their Effects on Women," in Women and the News ed. Laurily Keir Epstein, ed. (New York: Hastings House, 1978), 125-26.

[3]Ibid., 127-29.

[4]Ibid., 131.

traditional occupations because "our typical women reader is a housewife who isn't interested in that lib stuff."[5]

Other scholars, however, countered that reportage of women would not change drastically until women gained more powerful positions in society because the event-oriented nature of news focuses on power centers that have excluded women during most of America's history.[6]

Furthermore, even among those who believe that increasing the representation of women in newsrooms will alleviate the problem, it is predicted that change will not occur until women occupy power positions in media organizations. Anderson's analysis of the available data led her to conclude that without a secure power base, women who are climbing organizational ladders will tend to share the ideology of their culture and to reinforce the values of the male power structure.[7] This conclusion was supported by Williams and Best in a rigorous study of sex-role stereotyping. Because "tokenism" -- the practice of hiring or promoting only a few members of a subordinated group -- tends to support the status quo, they reasoned, crossover of

---

[5]Ibid., 129-31.

[6]Gaye Tuchman, Making News: A Study in the Construction of Reality (New York: The Free Press, 1978), 134.

[7]Margaret L. Anderson, Thinking About Women (New York: Macmillan, 1983), 220.

occupational roles may not have an effect for a long time.[8] Although these hypotheses seem logical when circumstantial evidence and scientific evidence from a variety of fields are linked and applied to media organizations, no systematic, quantitative studies have been used to determine whether or how these theories operate in actual newsroom practice.

This exploratory examination can begin to fill that gap by examining the relationship of women's managerial strength to the treatment of women in news columns. The purpose of this study is to look for evidence that coverage of women and women's issues in Michigan increases as the number of women in decision-making positions at newspapers increases. Although previous studies have documented stereotypical treatment of women in news columns and have examined the question of whether female and male reporters or gatekeepers make different decisions, previous studies have not examined the effect of female news managers on newspaper content. Therefore, speculation that women who have the power to change news patterns will, in fact, make changes remains speculative.

In fact, there is a school of thought that argues that attempts by women managers to alter traditional news patterns will be inhibited by a number of factors. These

---

[8]John E. Williams and Deborah L. Best, Measuring Sex Stereotypes, Cross-Cultural Research and Methodology Series Vol. 6 (Newbury Park, Calif.: Sage, 1990), 308.

factors include the weight of newsgathering conventions, social control of news workers and the opposition of male peers who trivialize female authority by according it lower salaries and lower status. Consequently, it is suggested that a management team must include enough women to form a "critical mass" if women are to break out of male-created news constraints. The level of female participation in management that could create this "critical mass" has not been determined. This study will explore that issue as well.

The study, which will examine content of six newspapers, is important because learning about the influence of women managers may provide an insight into the methods available to publishers who want to change the tone or direction of news coverage in order to attract more readers and advertisers. Although no scientific surveys have documented that a substantial portion of newspaper readers would, in fact, be attracted by such coverage, there is anecdotal evidence that some Michigan women would welcome it. One women's group, for instance, wrote to a Michigan newspaper and asked specifically that the newspaper include broader and deeper coverage of women and women's issues and that women be cited more often as sources of news.[9]

In addition, the study could have important implications for the broader issues of stereotyping and exclusion of women in society. Scholars contend that the

---

[9]Elizabeth H. Giese, "More about women," Lansing State Journal, July 7, 1991, 11A.

media reinforce tradition and outline new social roles by showing and repeating old and new cultural patterns.[10] As an example of this ability, the media are capable of communicating social notions of men and women's roles. In addition, the media with its agenda setting function can define issues and events as appropriate topics of public discussion.[11] Portraying women in uniformly degrading or limited ways tells society that artificial restraints on abilities and opportunities are legitimate. The consequent thwarting of the ability of women to join the public discussion impoverishes public debate.[12]

---

[10]Warren Breed, "Mass Communication and Sociocultural Integration," in People, Society, and Mass Communications, Lewis Anthony Dexter and David Manning White, eds. (London: The Free Press of Glencoe, 1964), 187.

[11]Anderson, 223; and Tuchman, Making News, 3.

[12]Suzanne Pingree, Robert Parker Hawkins, Matilda Butler and William Paisley, "A Scale for Sexism," Journal of Communication 26 (Autumn 1976), 198.

Chapter II

THE LITERATURE: A HISTORICAL PERSPECTIVE

Webster's New World Dictionary defines "feminism" as "the movement to win political, economic and social equality for women,"[13] a definition that leaves the question of the meaning of "equality" unanswered. In previous centuries, campaigns for equality for women in the United States sometimes were centered around the issues of suffrage, birth control and property rights. In the past two or three decades, additional issues of job parity, educational opportunities and reduced home and family responsibilities were added to the mission of the movement, which accepted the goal of "women's liberation," a term implying complete freedom from sexism. Eventually, the term "feminism" took on a wide spectrum of philosophies that seemed to be centered around individual rights and self determination. In one reflective review of the movement's history, an avowed feminist focused her definition of feminism on the "struggle

---

[13]Webster's New World Dictionary, rev. ed. (1984), s.v. "feminism."

to end sexist oppression" and left the definition of "sexist oppression" up to the individual involved.[14]

In the 1960s and 1970s, however, women who lobbied public opinion in an effort to provoke discussion of these issues and forge changes in society got little help from the media. Using Lazarsfeld and Merton's idea that one function of the media is to support existing viewpoints and institutions,[15] researchers even accused the media of exercising "social control" over women through a succession of strategies. In one scientific content analysis of Canadian news broadcasts coupled with retrospective analysis of print content, for instance, Robinson concluded that the first tactic was silence or ignoring the issues. This tactic was replaced by ridicule or minimizing women's concerns. As women began to gain access to media in the late 1970s, social control continued to be imposed through a relatively narrow selection of women's issues and through trivializing such issues by relegating them to "soft" or "human" news sections which are less prestigious than "hard news" sections.[16]

---

[14]Bell Hooks, "Feminism: A Movement to End Sexist Oppression," in Feminism and Equality, Anne Phillips, ed. (Oxford: Basil Blackwell Ltd., 1987), 68-69.

[15]Paul H. Lazarsfeld and Robert K. Merton, "Mass Communication, Popular Taste and Organized Social Action," in Mass Communications, Wilbur Schramm, ed. (Urbana: University of Illinois Press, 1960), 501-06.

[16]Gertrude Jock Robinson, "Women, Media Access and Social Control," in Women and the News, Laurily Keir Epstein, ed. (New York: Hastings House, 1978), 101-04.

Molotch speculated that the treatment of women in news columns was not the result of a conspiracy, but of a natural inclination of males to fulfill their own needs. Men, he pointed out, were in control of the media, and men had no need for information that would help women abandon traditional roles. So news of women's liberation largely revolved around side issues such as the "burning of bras," which symbolized that women might abandon their roles as sexual objects for men. That aspect of the movement was of interest to men, but other issues about equal pay, discrimination, credit access and rape laws were not.[17]

As late as 1982, one researcher found that stories with women as main characters were shorter and had smaller headlines than stories about men. Additionally, women were characterized more often than men by comments on appearance, attire and marital or parental status. Men were more often identified by occupation, experience and background.[18]

Stereotyping As Social Control

These findings were consistent with earlier studies that showed newspapers trivializing women and their concerns through the use of stereotyping, a term coined by journalist

---

[17]Harvey L. Molotch, "The News of Women and the Work of Men," in Hearth and Home: Images of Women in the Mass Media, Gaye Tuchman, Arlene Kaplan Daniels and James Benit, eds. (New York: Oxford University Press, 1978), 181-82.

[18]Junetta Davis, "Sexist Bias in Eight Newspapers," Journalism Quarterly 59 (Winter 1982), 458-60.

Walter Lippmann.[19] Sex-trait stereotypes are groups of psychological traits that are believed to be more characteristic of one sex than the other.[20] Some stereotypes are false and have no objective data to support them. Others, however, have a truthful base. In either case, stereotypes do not allow for individual behavior differences within the group or in the overlap area between groups.[21] Lippmann added that stereotypes are never neutral short cuts but projections of a person's own sense of worth. A pattern of stereotypes, he said, "is the guarantee of our self-respect ... stereotypes ... are the fortress of our tradition, and behind its defenses we can continue to feel ourselves safe in the position we occupy."[22]

It is easy to find examples of the use of stereotypes to belittle women. For instance, since housewives must be able to change rapidly from one skill (housework) to another (child care), the skill is labeled "flightiness" and is given a negative evaluation. The trait is declared to be ingrained and is used to defend a belief that women are incapable of performing other kinds of jobs.[23]

---

[19]Ellen Seiter, "Stereotypes and the Media: A Re-evaluation," Journal of Communication (Spring 1986), 16.

[20]Williams and Best, 15.

[21]Ibid., 16

[22]Walter Lippmann, Public Opinion (New York: Macmillan, 1970), 96.

[23]Seiter, 17.

In news columns, stereotypes historically have been common. In a casual and unscientific perusal of only a few newspapers, Molotch found that women were portrayed as sex objects or sex stereotypes in that stories were about women who undressed, attempted to "get a man" for his money or used exotic wiles to steal. Molotch dismissed these stories as "locker-room talk" and complained that stories were selected to be only from a man's perspective.[24] Williams and Best pointed to the stereotype that a woman's identity is dependent on her marital status, and they illustrated this stereotype's strength by the amount of heat generated about the battle over the use of marital-status titles for women in news copy. As an example, they cited indignant complaints by male journalists who insisted that a woman's marital status must matter or "marriage does not matter." Williams and Best noted that the complainers never mention the implication resulting from failure to mention a man's marital status.[25]

Although no studies were conducted on the subject, Rice believes she found a stereotype that women must be either pleasing or shrewish dictating photo selection in some periods. She noticed that photographers who had always looked for the prettiest girl in a crowd began snapping photos of the ugliest woman in the parade when organized

---

[24]Molotch, 185.

[25]Williams and Best, 28.

groups of women began working for equal treatment in the early '70s.[26]

While sex stereotypes are often dismissed as being either harmless or only irritating to victims, social scientists find that such stereotyping can inflict serious and permanent damage. For instance, men and women use sex-role stereotypes in defining their own self concepts. Characteristics associated with male stereotypes are seen to be more desirable than those given to female stereotypes. Since women have more negative stereotypes, they tend to have lower self-concepts than do men.[27] Sex-role stereotyping can also impede women through the creation of occupational sex typing, which occurs when the majority in an occupation is of one sex and the situation is seen as proper. The excluded group can be prevented from acquiring job skills that seem to be inconsistent with self-image based on stereotypes.[28] In addition, the excluded group must overcome a focus on stereotypical limitations. For example, in a 1977 study of college students Drew and Miller found students were more likely to use qualifications when

---

[26]Patricia Rice, "Women Out of the Myth and Into Focus," in Women and the News, Laurily Keir Epstein, ed. (New York: Hastings House, 1978), 42-44.

[27]Inge K. Broverman, Susan Raymond Vogel, Donald M. Broverman, Frank E. Clarkson and Paul S. Rosenkrantz, "Sex-Role Stereotypes: A Current Appraisal," Journal of Social Issues 28:2 (1972), 65-75.

[28]Virginia Ellen Schein, "The Relationship Between Sex Role Stereotypes and Requisite Management Characteristics," Journal of Applied Psychology 57:2 (1973), 95-96.

writing about male job appointees than when writing of female newsmakers. When interviewing newsmakers, the student reporters were more apt to ask female sources questions about combining a career and family, to probe for limitations on the appointee and to seek sex-role restrictions.[29]

Stereotyping by the media can also have the effect of penalizing women politicians and damaging the press' ideals of objectivity. The stereotype that women are interested in and committed to matters involving only the home and family can skew campaign coverage. Rice noticed in 1976 that news columns in California reported a female state candidate's recipe for pie but failed to report her endorsement by the governor.[30] The same year in Ohio, a successful female Congressional candidate was asked by a reporter, "By the way, Mary Rose Oakar, how's your love life?" Rice also found numerous incidents where women candidates were asked how their families would manage if they were elected.[31]

Furthermore, publishers and editors who subscribe to common stereotypes of women can fail miserably when trying to influence opinions of women voters. Women are portrayed as voting for men on the basis of looks, but studies have indicated that women put more emphasis on a candidate's

---

[29]Dan G. Drew and Susan H. Miller, "Sex Stereotyping and Reporting," Journalism Quarterly 54 (Spring 1977), 143-44.

[30]Rice, 47.

[31]Ibid., 48.

issues than men do. Voting patterns support that conclusion. The majority of women, for instance, voted for Nixon, not Kennedy, and for Ford rather than Carter. Both Nixon and Ford were considered less attractive than their opponents.[32]

Stereotypical coverage of women in the 1970s could not be excused by appealing to the difference in journalistic standards between hard and soft news. A study of randomly sampled stories from Dallas and Ft. Worth newspapers in 1976 and 1977 found no differences in the amount of female stereotyping seen in stories taken from all sections of the newspapers, including the women's sections, as opposed to the amount of stereotyping in stories found only in the first section of the papers. In all sections, it was found that stories about women were more likely to mention appearance, marital status, spouse, age and children. Researchers found that the difference between coverage of men and women could not be attributed to the greater numbers of men in the news or to sectional differences in the newspapers.[33]

Geographical differences have also been discounted as an influence in explaining stereotypical coverage of women. A 1979 newspaper study of sexist bias pitted four Oklahoma

---

[32]Ibid., 46.

[33]Karen G. Foreit, Terna Agor, Johnny Byers, John Larue, Helen Lokey, Michael Palazzini, Michele Patterson and Lillian Smith, "Sex Bias in Newspaper Treatment of Male-Centered and Female-Centered News Stories," Sex Roles 6:3 (1980), 475-79.

newspapers against four newspapers on the East Coast and the West Coast. Although the study was admittedly limited, it found only slightly more stereotypical coverage in the "heartland" than was found on the coasts. The researcher concluded, in fact, that in some areas, the Oklahoma papers did a better job than their coastal peers in reflecting reality.[34]

Whether blatant or subtle, stereotyping will not be easily overcome for a variety of reasons. The phenomenon of "self-fulfilling prophesy" wherein people behave in line with expectations of them tends to reinforce stereotyping.[35] Furthermore, sex stereotypes have been found to pervade the views of males and females without varying with age, sex, religion, education level or marital status.[36] In fact, the bulk of learning about sex-role stereotyping seems to occur in both males and females between the ages of 3.5 and 4.5 years.[37]

By the 1980s, however, there was evidence of some change in the pattern. Although a 1983 study found that sex-role stereotypes had not changed during the 1970s, attitudes

---

[34]Davis, 459.

[35]Williams and Best, 277.

[36]Broverman et al., 65.

[37]Harry T. Reis and Stephanie Wright, "Knowledge of Sex-Role Stereotypes in Children Aged 3 to 5," Sex Roles 8 (1982), 1055.

toward them had changed in that there was a lower level of acceptance of them.[38]

There is some evidence that coverage of women improved over time as well, but most researchers conclude that coverage of women declined after the 1970s and does not yet reflect reality. For instance, in one study coverage of men and women in the New York Times in 1885 was contrasted with the same paper's treatment of the sexes in 1985. The researcher found that progress was made in the areas of role categorization and genderless language.[39] A study of Time magazine covers from 1923 through 1987 showed that women, who appeared on covers only 14 percent of the time, had their most cover appearances during the 1970s, at the peak of the new women's political movement, than in any other decade.[40]

Longitudinal studies that included shorter time spans were even less encouraging. In 1974, Miller found that photographic coverage of women in the Washington Post and the Los Angeles Times did not reflect the roles women had.[41] A replication of the study seven years later found

---

[38]Thomas L. Ruble, "Sex Stereotypes: Issues of Change in the 1970s," Sex Roles 9 (1983), 401.

[39]Lee B. Jolliffe, "Comparing Gender Differentiation in the New York Times, 1885 & 1985," Journalism Quarterly 66 (Autumn 1989), 690-91.

[40]Sammye Johnson and William G. Christ, "Women Through Time: Who Gets Covered?" Journalism Quarterly 65 (Winter 1988), 896-97.

[41]Susan H. Miller, "The Content of News Photos: Women's and Men's Roles," Journalism Quarterly, 5 (Spring 1975), 70-75.

that the disparity between photographic coverage of men and women had grown. Although both papers showed a slight shift toward portraying women as professionals, imbalances grew in nine of 12 sections, with women photo ratios growing only in the Post entertainment section. Meanwhile, there was a shift of photos of women from the front page to the "lifestyle" sections.[42]

There is also some evidence that could point to a tendency of photographers to exhibit fewer stereotypical patterns of coverage than their editors do. A 1988 study of Associated Press photos of the 1987 Wimbledon tennis tournament did show differences in how male and female athletes were depicted. The differences, however, did not conform to stereotypes of women as being emotional, helpless or dominated. However, sports editors who used the photos "oversampled" emotional photographs of women and photographs depicting women as helpless, reinstating stereotypes that the photographers had overcome.[43]

A number of researchers point to education as a key for provoking change in stereotypes. The Broverman group, for instance, noted that daughters of women who are employed outside the home perceived significantly smaller differences

---

[42]Roy E. Blackwood, "The Content of News Photos: Roles Portrayed by Men and Women," Journalism Quarterly 60 (Winter 1983), 710-14.

[43]Wayne Wanta and Dawn Leggett, "Gender Stereotypes in Wire Services Sports Photos," Newspaper Research Journal 10 (Spring 1989), 106.

between men and women, particularly in areas dealing with competence. The impact of employed mothers did not seem to be as strong among sons, however.[44]

Institutional Influences

Beyond stereotyping, the institutional effects of the historical preponderance of men in the news business has weighed against women as well. Feminists contend that the maleness of the business created a bureaucratic lack of concern and sensitivity to factors that affect women. A Worldwatch Institute researcher reviewed statistics and studies from a number of nations, including Japan, Peru, the United States, Britain, France and Canada, and concluded that male blindness to information that affects women frequently biased even the way news was defined and sought.[45]

These ways of defining and seeking news are absorbed as journalists spend years of apprenticeship learning skills for building stories from role models.[46] Beginners develop understandings of how their jobs are to be done by working and socializing with their peers and "old hands" and by reading each other's work. News, which was created largely

---

[44]Broverman, 75.

[45]Kathleen Newland, "Women in Words and Pictures," in The Sisterhood of Man, Kathleen Newland, ed. (New York: W.W. Norton, 1979). Reprinted in Nieman Reports 33 (Summer 1979), 60.

[46]Tuchman, Making News, 105.

by males, is defined a certain way and then reported a certain way partly because that is the way it has always been done.[47]

In addition, the bureaucratic necessity of filling a daily newspaper requires that reporters spend time at places and institutions where daily occurrences can be transformed into events that reporters can relate in a practiced pattern. When journalists learn to do that well, the new ability blocks their insight to recognize other conditions as subjects for public discussion.[48]

Further, the deadline pressure of newswork demands that events be highlighted rather than issues. Professionalism requires that a reporter know what questions to ask sources to obtain facts needed for a particular type of story. The well-practiced who-what-when-where routine lends itself to gathering information about events quickly, but it is less successful in probing issues. This practice, therefore, promotes a "trained incapacity" in that other "facts" not included in the routine are not brought forth. Ongoing conditions, which tend to affect the powerless in society, can consequently be dismissed as unnewsworthy.[49]

In two studies of legislative coverage by print

---

[47]Ibid., 212-23.

[48]Ibid., 133.

[49]Gaye Tuchman, "The Exception Proves the Rule: The Study of Routine News Practices," in Strategies for Communication Research, Paul M. Hirsch, Peter V. Miller and F. Gerald Klines, eds. (Beverly Hills: Sage 1972), 45-48.

journalists, Fico found that the strength of editorial constraints such as deadline pressures and copy production demands directly affects the number and diversity of sources that are used in stories. Thus, these institutional demands can incline reporters to limit information gathering to routine reportage of events and to interviews with established leaders.[50]

Such editorial pressures contribute to news values that emphasize male concerns of power, politics and stratification, and topics about issues traditionally characterized as female are considered unworthy of serious attention.[51] Instead, serious attention of news workers traditionally has revolved around "those bloodless, remote-from-life decisions made at business lunches, meetings, and reported at press conferences." Knowledge that could help the "traditional" woman, who was called upon to perform the work of house and family, often failed to meet journalistic standards. This news included the processes of life and death rather than the events of life and death. Included here were subjects Molotch outlined as "diapers and suffering, vomit and dirt, serious intimacies and personal horrors." Women who needed information about these subjects

---

[50]Fred Fico, "A Comparison of Legislative Sources in Newspaper and Wire Service Stories," Newspaper Research Journal 5 (Spring 1984), 42; and "Replication of Findings in Newspaper and Wire Service Source Use in Statehouse Coverage," Newspaper Research Journal 7 (Fall 1985), 50.

[51]Tuchman, Making News, 138.

usually found their news relegated "separately and unequally" to the women's pages.[52]

Stories about managing the ongoing processes of living, however, were not the only items of interest to women excluded from the general news sections of newspapers. Tuchman reported that her field study of news workers found that news of the women's movement was often relegated to "women's pages" because it was identified as "soft" news. This designation was made because reporters did not learn of the events of the movement through routine contacts with institutions and because the news could be delayed for a day or two without losing value. News about issues can be subordinated to news about "facts" or events by defining issue news as "soft news" and event news as "hard news."[53]

For instance, when Cooper and Davenport compared coverage of the three major conferences of the United Nations-sponsored International Women's Decade in the New York Times and the Washington Post, they found mixed evidence of the newsworthiness accorded to the events. While the amount of coverage increased dramatically between the initial conference in 1975 and the final one in 1985, the placement of stories also changed. While the story was considered news in 1975, it was considered to be only partly

---

[52]Molotch, 181.

[53]Gaye Tuchman, "The Newspaper as A Social Movement's Resource," in Hearth and Home: Images of Women in the Mass Media, Gaye Tuchman, Arlene Kaplan Daniels and James Benit, eds. (New York: Oxford University Press, 1978), 201-02.

a news story in 1985. Half of the 1985 coverage was in lifestyle sections. Consequently, news about conflict and resolutions at the conference was sprinkled among fashion stories and recipes. The authors concluded that the trivialization that feminists found offensive in the 1970s had not disappeared by the 1980s.[54]

Both the shortage and the shallowness of coverage of the women's movement since the late 1960s has been well documented by diverse sources. A study of newspapers in England and Los Angeles, for instance, found that scant coverage was given to the early stages of the movement in 1968 through 1970. Although the author of the study declined to accuse the journalists responsible for the poor coverage of deliberately suppressing the news as a form of social control, she concluded that the effects of the blackout were the same as those that would result from a calculated strategy.[55]

A veteran journalist who witnessed the beginnings of the new women's movement from inside the newsroom, however, was less generous in analyzing the reactions of the journalistic bureaucracy to the movement. Using anecdotal evidence, Mills reported that the early protests of the

---

[54]Anne Cooper and Lucinda D. Davenport, "Newspaper Coverage of International Women's Decade: Feminism and Conflict," Journal of Communication Inquiry (Winter 1987), 110-11.

[55]Monica B. Morris, "Newspapers and the New Feminists: Black Out as Social Control?" Journalism Quarterly 50 (Spring 1973), 40-42.

women's movement in the 1960s were played by the "men on the desk ... strictly for laughs." Although no scholarly studies upheld this contention, she documented a number of examples of how the subject was dismissed as light or "soft" news. The emphasis, she said, was on the stereotype of women as hysterical creatures or cute toys of men. As examples, she cited the New York Daily News' coverage of women marching for equality in New York City in 1970. The headline read, "Gals Unbutton Their Lib." And when women objected to the cult of beauty in American society by dumping bras, girdles and eyelash curlers in trash cans at the 1968 Miss America Pageant, the Associated Press story called the protesters "girls." Some papers wrote of the "bra-burning" demonstration, an inaccurate representation that resulted in a stereotype that many people still believe is true.[56] As a participant in the 1968 protest at the Miss America Pageant, Morgan asserted that no bras were burned during the event. Instead, she said the demonstration she helped organize included flinging "dishcloths, steno pads, girdles and bras into a Freedom Trash Can." She said she believes that the event was reported as a "bra burning" so that it could be used as a symbol to enable journalists to avoid discussing the growing anger in women.[57]

---

[56]Kay Mills, A Place in the News (New York: Dodd, Mead & Co., 1988), 128-29.

[57]Robin Morgan, Going Too Far (New York: Random House, 1977), 65.

Another example of the male-dominated press's inability to report on the women's movement seriously was coverage in the Columbia Journalism Review of a Stanford University student group's debate over guidelines for reporting the women's movement. The prestigious trade journal headlined the articles "Person the Lifeboats! The Language is Sinking!" and "Kissing `The Girls' Goodbye: A Panel Discussion."[58]

Such belittling of the social movement was justified by citing professional norms of institutional coverage and timeliness that are ingrained in the bureaucratic structure of news organizations. "News is a product of men who are members of news-gathering bureaucracy," and that bureaucracy controls the process of critical evaluation of standards.[59] One example of how professional norms worked to block, not merely belittle, news of the women's movement in the 1960s and 1970s was the lack of coverage of the movement's goal of "consciousness raising." The process was regarded as unnewsworthy because it did not provide "observable events that symbolized the problems of organized, established institutions." In addition, there was no recognized representative to speak on behalf of consciousness raising.

---

[58]Boyd Wright, "Person the Lifeboats! The Language is Sinking!" and "Kissing `The Girls' Goodbye: A Panel Discussion," Columbia Journalism Review (May/June 1975), 28.

[59]Walter Gieber, "News Is What Newspapermen Make It," in People, Society, and Mass Communications, Lewis Anthony Dexter and David Manning White, eds. (London: The Free Press of Glencoe, 1964), 178-80.

Professional formulas simply could not succeed in getting the story.[60]

Journalists, however, seem to have little trouble covering stories of interest to women when it is apparent that the stories will have an impact on the male power structure. In a study of 10 newspapers' coverage of enactment of the 19th Amendment, which enfranchised American women and thereby affected the political fortunes of men, a researcher found relatively consistent amounts and tone of coverage without regard to geographical region, political viewpoint of the publisher or timing of local votes on the amendment.[61]

Some scholars believe, however, that professional norms can have the effect of moving women out of the discussion of women's issues once such topics are declared newsworthy by the male bureaucracy. Cirksena said she believes that when traditional women's issues, such as abortion or rape laws, are moved from women's pages to news sections to reach the foreground of the public debate, the debate tends to minimize the male-female distinction. She theorizes that the result is for men to begin to control the topic.[62]

---

[60]Tuchman, "The Newspaper," 191-93.

[61]Anne Messerly Cooper, "Suffrage As News: Ten Dailies' Coverage of The Nineteenth Amendment," American Journalism 1 (Summer, 1983), 77, 89-90.

[62]Kathryn Cirksena, "Women's Liberation from Spirals of Silence: The Need for Feminist Studies in Mass Communication Research," in Communications at the Crossroads: The Gender Gap Connection, Ramona R. Rush and Donna Allen, eds. (Norwood, N.J.:

Others contend that the male view, made parochial by its own hegemony, masks its own inherent bias. One scholar theorized that the rubric of objectivity established by males, particularly by scientists and journalists, excludes women by blocking any other paths to knowledge and emphasizing abstract principles rather than specific circumstances of everyday life. The result is that a woman's view of reality is dismissed as merely a variant of the male norm.[63]

The concrete circumstances of a newsman's everyday life tend to be the molds that shape the substance and form of news stories. The daily deadlines and events of news reinforce the tendency for journalism to be written in the language of male "winners" rather than that of women who have had to develop consensus and community values.[64] In fact, some press critics point to the media's heavy reliance on confrontation and conflict as a barrier to presenting news that can help anyone, male or female, make evaluations of current issues. In a rigorous content analysis of "prestige" newspapers, one research group concluded that significant news about ongoing issues often slips through

---

Ablex, 1989), 54.

[63]Nina Gregg, "Reflections on the Feminist Critique of Objectivity," Journal of Communication Inquiry 11 (Winter, 1987), 9-12.

[64]Maurine Beasley, "Newspapers: Is There a New Majority Defining the News?" in Women In Mass Communication: Challenging Gender Values, Pamela J. Creedon, ed. (Newbury Park: Sage, 1989), 187.

the bureaucratic network of news gatherers, leaving readers ignorant of social and human issues that need attention.[65]

The occupational values of "objectivity" and "timeliness" join with that of "visibility" to put women at a disadvantage when news sources are selected as well. Women historically have been less likely than men to hold visible, decision-making positions in society.[66] Sigal has said that one component of "objective reporting" is a reliance on routine channels of news gathering, which gives preference to sources with enough authority to call a press conference or issue a press release about a regularly covered beat. The "fairness" convention as well favors established news sources since they can more readily obtain news space to voice complaints of imbalance or unfairness.[67] Even when covering social movements, reporters do not look for grass-roots leaders. Instead, they seek out people with power, not people who are dissatisfied.[68] Journalists look for a speaker who represents a large number of people and rank the legitimacy of sources by the magnitude of people represented by each. The higher numbers of people represented

---

[65]Virginia Allen, Catherine East and Dorothy Jurney, New Directions for News (Washington, D.C.: American Society of Newspaper Editors and The Women Studies Program and Policy Center of George Washington University, 1983), 2.

[66]Robinson, 90.

[67]Leon Sigal, "Defining News Organizationally: News Definitions in Practice," in Women and the News, Laurily Keir Epstein, ed. (New York: Hastings House, 1978), 113.

[68]Tuchman, Making News, 81.

corresponds to a higher level of legitimacy. A source must rank high on this scale to be quoted because editors are wary of disseminating views that challenge the political system.[69] Miller found that the number of people in a Congressional district will influence the amount of coverage given to the district's representative. Congressmen who represent very large districts are given more coverage than those in small districts, and the amount of coverage is directly proportionate to the number of people represented.[70] Anyone not holding office in an identifiable organization has no claim to media access. Unorganized, grassroots movements, however, rarely have official speakers.

Furthermore, pressure for "exclusives," another professional goal, means that reporters will try to please authority figures on regularly covered beats. Consequently, Sigal concludes that women will be at least partially excluded as sources in traditional news coverage until they occupy these bureaucratic power positions in numbers proportional to their numbers in society.[71]

There is quantitative evidence supporting Sigal's conclusion. In a 1986 study comparing coverage of male and

---

[69]Ibid., 92.

[70]Susan H. Miller, "News Coverage of Congress: the Search For the Ultimate Spokesman," Journalism Quarterly 54 (Autumn 1977), 464.

[71]Sigal, 114.

female state officials in Michigan, Silver found no differences in usage of descriptions and identification between male and female officials. Furthermore, when results were controlled for occupation and seniority, it was found that women received about the same amount of coverage as their representation in the pool of newsmakers. However, the study did find a discrepancy in coverage in that women officials, legislators in particular, were more often mentioned in non-job or feature contexts.[72]

Engendering News Decisions

In the face of institutionalized mechanisms that work against inclusion of women in news reports and historically entrenched stereotypical views of women, some observers have suggested that female newsworkers might have stronger tendencies than men toward working to break the traditional molds. Attempts to contrast the prejudicial tendencies against female newsmakers that are held by male journalists as opposed to those held by female journalists have not been decisive. Most studies on the subject have elicited mixed results. Not surprisingly, however, the preponderance of evidence seems to be that men are more discriminatory against women than women are.

---

[72]Diane Silver, "A Comparison of Newspaper Coverage of Male and Female Officials in Michigan," Journalism Quarterly 63 (Spring 1986), 145-49.

In 1977, Whitlow found that conflict rather than gender was the most consistent factor in influencing news selection by both male and female gatekeepers. For at least one category of news selectors, however, newsworthiness of the stories was reduced when the principal subject was female. Females as well as males were found to hold this news value, but the majority of gatekeepers who fell into this category were male.[73]

Whitlow reported in 1979 that he grouped gatekeepers into four categories of sex-role stereotyping and found that two of the categories tended to reject stories about women altogether. When these decision-makers did select stories about women who were in non-traditional roles, they used light or humorous headlines. Whitlow found no difference between male and female gatekeepers in one of the two categories, but the second category of sex-role stereotypists was entirely masculine.[74]

Differences have been found, however, in the ways male and female news workers treat news. Female journalists, for instance, have been cited for bias in covering the abortion issue. Although the abortion debate itself has male and female proponents on both sides of the issue, the "pro-choice" side that favors legalized abortion has been

---

[73]S. Scott Whitlow, "How Male and Female Gatekeepers Respond to News Stories of Women," Journalism Quarterly 54 (Autumn 1977), 579 and 609.

[74]S. Scott Whitlow, "Private Images Gatekeepers Bring to News of Public Women," Mass Comm Review 6 (Winter 1978/1979), 12.

strongly associated with women's rights activists. In analyzing print and broadcast coverage of the abortion debate during January through August 1989, the Center for Media & Public Affairs found a "gender gap" in coverage with men giving even coverage to the two sides of the debate while females weighted coverage toward pro-choice arguments by a margin of 2 to 1.[75]

A pattern of gender differences was found in studies of college newswriting students as well. In one study asking students to write stories about a political appointee, female students included nearly twice as many personal assertions, such as comments on appearance and family, as did males in all the stories. Stories written by both male and female students under the assumption that the appointee was female were nearly twice as long as stories written under the assumption that the appointee was male.[76]

In 1977, undergraduate communications students were asked to rate the interests of men, women and the general public in nine news categories that were divided into male-oriented and female-oriented groups. The students perceived women's news interests in accordance with sex-role stereotypes. The authors found, however, that female students' perceptions of the news interests of women were

---

[75]Center for Media & Public Affairs, "Roe v. Webster: Media Coverage of the Abortion Debate," Media Monitor 3 (October 1989), 6.

[76]Judy VanSlyke Turk, "Sex-Role Stereotyping In Writing the News," Journalism Quarterly 64 (Summer/Autumn 1987), 615.

less influenced by sex-role stereotypes than were those of male students.[77]

News Control By Superiors

The ideas that professional expectations could conflict with personal preferences and that women as well as men are influenced by male-molded professional norms do not seem contradictory to many media observers. Breed's pioneering analysis of the control of journalists in the newsroom has been affirmed and elaborated upon by other scholars during the years since its publication. That study showed that individual media workers tend to have less control over the articles they write than is often assumed by outsiders.[78]

Breed said that top editors and publishers were able to exert social control in the newsroom by a subtle system of rewards and punishments. The journalist's ethical prohibition against the publisher's requiring subordinates to slant news does not deter the publisher from setting and managing news policy.[79]

The process of social control begins when reporters first settle into a newsroom and become part of a "reference group" centered around an elite group of editors and respected veterans. Gratitude for guidance and esteem for

---

[77]Jack Orwant and Muriel G. Cantor, "How Sex Stereotyping Affects Perceptions of News Preferences," Journalism Quarterly 54 (Spring 1977), 100.

[78]Warren Breed, "Social Control in the Newsroom: A Functional Analysis," Social Forces (May 1955), 326-335.

[79]Ibid., 326.

these successful superiors become important factors in the training of the new reporter.[80] Reporters then learn the publisher's policy through imitation, oblique reprimands and gossip about the publisher's affiliation and philosophy. In addition, there are unspoken threats of firing or demotion balanced by hints of advancement as well as other rewards.[81] Sigal found that while reporters have a number of resources that can be used to help their own opinions prevail, editors have their own weapons for winning the battle. They can assign recalcitrant reporters dull stories or dull beats, lose or cancel stories or bury them on inside pages. They can also monopolize a reporter's time with tedious tasks and control expense budgets and rewards. Finally, editors can dismiss or threaten to dismiss reporters.[82] The result is that journalists operate in a socio-cultural environment that bestows rewards from peers and superiors rather than from readers. Therefore, reporters rarely can succeed by deviating from patterns established by the publisher.[83]

Other researchers support Breed's explanation of newsroom control by pointing out that the pattern reflects general theories of organizational behavior, which predict

---

[80]Ibid., 328.

[81]Ibid., 327.

[82]Leon V. Sigal, Reporters and Officials, (Lexington, Mass.: 1973), 49.

[83]Breed, 335.

that news policy should be imposed on reporters by editors who actively encourage attitudes in favor of the paper's policy and enforce policy decisions through hierarchical authority.[84] This hierarchical authority is exercised when editors assign stories to be covered and discard others. Control is extended farther when the editor chooses a reporter to cover the story. Editors exercise even more control by editing or revising the reporter's work and then deciding the placement and display of the story.[85] Throughout this exercise, news editors are able to allow readers to read only stories that they believe to be true.[86] Miller found in interviews with reporters that editors were readily given credit or blame for topic selection of stories and the prominence accorded various topics and sources.[87]

Among the primary factors that influence the wielding of editorial power is negotiation among editors who have power over conflicting hierarchies in the newsroom.[88] In large newspapers, editors are department heads who compete for power with each department having its own space and

---

[84]Lee Sigelman, "Reporting the News: An Organizational Analysis," American Journal of Sociology 79 (July 1973), 136.

[85]Ibid., 145.

[86]D.M. White, "The Gatekeeper: A Case Study in the Selection of News," Journalism Quarterly 27 (Fall 1950), 385.

[87]Miller, "News Coverage," 462-63.

[88]Tuchman, Making News, 191.

staff budget. Each editor is responsible for a geographical or topical preserve, and geographical editors are more powerful than topical editors. In fact, topical editors often must gain approval for decisions from geographical editors. Holders of these power positions negotiate each day to determine which stories will be run, how much space will be allocated to them and where they will appear in the newspaper.[89]

This negotiation is conducted most often in the daily editorial conference or "budget meeting," which has been called the most "organized, coherent, continuing and centralized process" among the newsroom mechanisms for social control.[90]

It is from publishers through editors then, particularly editors who attend the daily editorial conference, that the definition of news is created, refined and passed along to reporters. Historically, that process put males in charge of creating and transmitting the concept of news. The news concept is the basis for occupational and bureaucratic norms of news categories, and these norms influence story selection more than does personal bias.[91]

---

[89]Tuchman, "The Newspaper," 204.

[90]Sigelman, 138.

[91]Paul M. Hirsch, "Occupational, Organizational, and Institutional Models in Mass Media Research: Toward an Integrated Framework," in Strategies for Communication Research, Paul M. Hirsch, Peter V. Miller and F. Gerald Kline, eds. (Beverly Hills: Sage, 1977), 23.

Women's Pages As Resources for Change

Facing stereotypical coverage of women that included physical descriptions, recipes and wardrobe critiques, feminist critics of newspapers began in the early 1970s to turn toward women's pages as vehicles for change. Describing the existing women's pages as "repositories of trivia, advertisers' propaganda and so-called society news," women, nonetheless, found hope in the fact that some newspapers were converting women's pages to sections dealing with lifestyle issues. They believed they saw a tendency for news and features in women's sections to become more substantive.[92]

That hope faded quickly, however. Guenin and Miller studied the transition to lifestyle sections in 1975 and 1976, looking for inclusion of non-traditional content in the new sections. They found that the updated lifestyle sections did not cover nontraditional topics any better than the traditional pages did. Instead, in the new sections traditional content was replaced by entertainment news.[93]

In the light of such findings, Merritt and Gross set out to learn whether the sex of the section editor was a factor in content preferences. The study found that both

---

[92]Marian Ellias, "No Happy Medium: oPRESSion," in Rooms With No View: A Woman's Guide to the Man's World of the Media, Ethel Strainchamps, ed. (New York: Harper & Row, 1974), 236-37.

[93]Zena Beth Guenin, "Women's Pages in American Newspapers," Journalism Quarterly 52 (Spring 1975), 67-69; and Susan Miller, "Changes in Women's/Lifestyle Sections," Journalism Quarterly 53 (Winter 1976), 642.

male and female editors covered topics that relate to women only in the sections, but male editors were significantly more likely to cover subjects that pertain only to men. Women editors were much more likely to give a higher proportion of coverage to the women's movement.[94]

Surveyed editors also were asked to categorize their sections' present goals and their sections' ideal goals. Merritt and Gross found that a majority of editors of both sexes pointed to traditional reportage as the most important goal. Of those who differed, however, men were significantly more likely to choose leisure perspectives, and women were more likely to choose social change as goals.[95]

In addition, women showed far more divergence than did men between their answers about what the section goals are in contrast to what they should be. A smaller segment of the women editors said section goals should be traditional. Instead, women editors tended to want the sections to lead social change. Male editors, however, were more inclined toward setting goals that related to coverage of leisure activities. Since editors of both sexes said they were allowed to choose their own topics, Merritt and Gross interpreted those results to indicate that women have

---

[94]Sharyne Merritt and Harriet Gross, "Women's Page/Lifestyle Editors: Does Sex Make a Difference?" Journalism Quarterly 55 (Winter 1978), 512.

[95]Ibid., 513.

internalized professional expectations about content that override personal views.[96]

A Strategy Debate

Feminists and scholars have mapped out a number of paths that could lead to the goal of finding increased amounts of news for and about women in news columns. Most of the recommendations, however, can be divided into two broad categories: increasing the power of women in society generally or increasing the power of women in the newsroom particularly.

Robinson bases her argument in favor of pushing for societal equity by pointing out that media content reflects what journalists believe to be "commonly accepted ways of viewing and defining reality." These "ways of knowing" are dictated by social values expressed throughout the culture. Therefore, she asserts, the collective, societal view of women's roles will be influential in determining how women are portrayed in the press.[97]

Some social scientists even believe that changing society may be easier in the long run than changing bureaucracy. Since tokenism seems to support the status quo, they argue, crossovers of occupational roles may not have effect for a long time. A better strategy is to try to disengage stereotypes in decision-making, a strategy that

---

[96]Merritt and Gross, 510-11.

[97]Robinson,89.

may be easier than it appears. Most people use stereotypes in the absence of other information. If better information is provided, stereotypes may never become engaged.[98] This alternative may prove to be possible because despite people's need for cognitive consistency (which means people perceive primarily information that reinforces their beliefs), people can change their beliefs with additional information.[99]

Some researchers direct the critic's attention to evidence that society has already begun to bring about attitudinal changes that have affected the news business. Conflict theory predicts, for instance, that society will take over some aims of groups pushing for social change and that the mass media will begin to present some of the less radical and more respectable aspects of such groups. At least one social scientist suggests that events during the maturation of the mid-century women's movement fulfilled those predictions.[100] Tuchman asserts that as the women's movement gained increased success in electing feminist lawmakers, issues raised by the movement became newsworthy events: laws were proposed; court battles were enjoined; committee hearings opened.[101]

---

[98]Williams and Best, 308.

[99]Ibid., 277-78.

[100]Morris, 42.

[101]Tuchman, Making News, 153.

Another writer offers the notion that female journalists do not need to wait for changes in society or for changes in the newsroom. Sigal suggests that reporters who want to write in ways that "reflect the ideologies of the women's movement" should write for women's pages. He contends that only in sideline areas of the newsroom that are not so restricted by routine channels of conventional news gathering can reporters write "what they want" and "do so in the ideological trappings that they prefer."[102] Sigal's arguments, however, ignore the inequality involved in that solution as long as the male hierarchy is able to use the center of the newsroom to write what it wants in the ideological trappings that it prefers.

In recent years, however, the male dominance of newsroom has come to be challenged. Statistics gathered by Wilson show that women have been in a majority in journalism schools since 1977.[103] Women also began moving into newsrooms more rapidly during the 1970s.[104]

But women's progress into that daily editorial conference where definitions of newsworthiness are honed has been far slower. By 1975, women held 26.1 percent of the

---

[102]Sigal, 109-15.

[103]Jean Gaddy Wilson, "Future Directions for Females in the Media," in Communications at the Crossroads: The Gender Gap Connection, Ramona R. Rush and Donna Allen, eds. (Norwood, N.J.: Ablex, 1989), 161.

[104]William Eaton, "Scorecard," Nieman Reports 33 (Summer 1979), 49.

professional jobs on newspapers, but they held only 9.9 percent of the managers' positions. In 1978, a study of 1,700 daily newspapers showed women held only 5 percent of the supervising editors' jobs. Most of these were concentrated on newspapers with circulations below 25,000. In larger news organizations, women held only 2.7 percent of the managerial positions.[105] In 1987, Wilson found women had made little progress in their climb up the newsroom ladder. The management representation of women at large newspapers was even poorer. In late 1987, Wilson found there were five women in top editorial positions at 1,114 newspapers of 100,000 circulation or more, a representation of only 1.5 percent.[106] Schultz-Brooks further contends that the women who do hold departmental editorships are seldom actually in the pipeline toward top managerial roles since many of them are in feature departments, which she contends are excluded from consideration as training grounds for top management jobs.[107]

In an attempt to learn whether women are excluded from reporting on topics that would enhance their promotion chances, Schweitzer and Miller examined topics women reporters write about compared to those men write about and found no clear differences. The researchers, however, based

---

[105]Ibid.

[106]Wilson, 162.

[107]Terri Schultz-Brooks, "Getting there: Women in the newsroom," Columbia Journalism Review (March/April 1984), 25-26.

their conclusions on percentages of men's and women's bylines in each of several news categories. Since the authors did not determine proportions of men and women in the newsroom, it is difficult to understand how they reached their conclusions. Unless it is determined that women made up about 38 percent of the news staff, learning that women wrote 38 percent of the government stories does not mean that women were given equal access to government beats. A better approach might have been to compile female bylines and male bylines and then see what percentage of each set were in which category.[108]

There are students of the issue who offer successes won by women journalists as proof that women can succeed in storming the male news fortress despite the barriers. As examples of this phenomenon, Allen points to women who succeeded in covering women's issues despite the fact that they had little decision-making authority. Some examples include Eileen Shanahan, who covered Equal Rights Amendment Congressional hearings for the New York Times; Sarah McClendon, the White House reporter who repeatedly raised questions about discrimination against women by the government and the military; Marlene Sanders, who produced an ABC News segment focusing attention on women's health issues; and Sylvia Chase, whose coverage of a murder case for ABC focused network attention on battered women and

---

[108]John C. Schweitzer and Jay Miller, "What do newswomen cover?" Newspaper Research Journal 12 (Spring 1991), 72-80.

sexual abuse.[109] Tuchman adds Grace Lichtenstein, whose work as bureau chief of the New York Times included a series of stories on rape law reform.[110]

Tuchman, however, contends that news of the women's movement gained some exposure despite chauvinism of male editors only because these feminist advocacy reporters had gained male respect by being identified with the professional ideology held by male authorities. Even then, such advocacy journalism would not have been tolerated except for the fact that advocacy journalism was accepted and sometimes encouraged during the late 1960s. In later years, that style of reporting grew to be mistrusted.[111]

Schultz-Brooks offers anecdotal illustrations of the difficulties women have encountered during recent years in trying to maintain professional status as journalists while covering topics of interest to women. The anecdotes offer striking examples of discrimination patterns and of Breed's social control mechanisms at work. One story involved Carole Ashkinage shortly after she became a feature columnist with the Atlanta Constitution. Her first column was about President Carter's efforts to develop a pool of women for political appointments. She said her editors disapproved.

---

[109]Donna Allen, "From Opportunity to Strategy: Women Contribute to the Communications Future," in Communications at the Crossroads: The Gender Gap Connection, Ramona R. Rush and Donna Allen, eds. (Norwood, N.J.: Ablex, 1989), 68-69.

[110]Tuchman, Making News, 143.

[111]Tuchman, "The Newspaper," 209-10.

She recalled that they said, "We hope you're not going to do that kind of story as a steady diet." At the Detroit News Mary Lou Butcher received a different sort of punishment for writing a story on sexual stereotyping. Butcher's editors said they were sending her on an assignment to cover a speech on sex stereotyping in education because they wanted a light story and could "get away" with it by sending a woman. When she wrote a straight news story about the event, it was buried in the newspaper.[112]

Anecdotal evidence of other uses of Breed's social control mechanisms on female journalists who fought to bring women's issue to the forefront of public discussion is common. Peggy Simpson, an Associated Press reporter, asserted that women's efforts were often undermined by the press service bureaucracy. She offered evidence of this in incidents reported in interviews with prominent female journalists. One incident occurred when Frances Levine asked President Ford during a press conference about his patronizing of a men-only golf club despite administration guideline forbidding membership in segregated facilities. Simpson said Ronald Nessen, Ford's press secretary, later complained bitterly that Levine had used the question to advocate a personal point of view. Associated Press

---

[112]Schultz-Brooks, 26-27.

executives were also upset about the question, and Levine was subsequently removed from the White House beat.[113]

During the United Nation's international conference on women in 1975 in Mexico City, Simpson got a first-hand view of the bureaucracy's treatment of women's news. Her opening day story, which dealt with background issues and the keynote address, was set aside by her editors. Instead, a flowery feature about a Soviet cosmonaut's sex appeal was inserted under Simpson's byline. Later Simpson's plans to write a story about Cuban women's battle against male supremacy were scuttled, and she was told to interview a male movie star about his views on liberated women instead.[114]

While the notion that such sexism will disappear in the media when women decision-makers arrive is tempting, such a conclusion may be simplistic. This idea accepts the male model of power and control while rejecting the difficulties women face in pursuing masculine goals in a man's world at work while attempting to fulfill feminine goals in the home.[115] Furthermore, the supremacy of professional norms makes it difficult for women to ignore attitudes associated

---

[113]Peggy A. Simpson, "Covering the Women's Movement," Nieman Reports 33 (Summer 1979), 20-21.

[114]Ibid., 21-22.

[115]Margaret Gallagher, Unequal opportunities: The case of women and the media (Paris: Unesco, 1981), 166.

with success even when these ideas demean women.[116] Tuchman records that in the early days of the mid-century women's movement, women reporters sometimes contributed to ridicule of the movement to identify themselves with the attitudes of their editors.[117] In fact, the female minority in the news media often must choose between changing careers or succumbing to pressure to perpetuate male values.[118]

Acquiescence to male values, however, is seldom enough to overcome prejudice against women journalists. In the University of Maryland's 1985 study, employers rated the males' job performances a point or two higher than the females'. However, female employers evaluated female employees significantly higher than did males in a number of job classifications.[119]

Male executives defend such ratings by citing a lack of "team play" during childhood as a reason that women are ill suited for management positions requiring an ability to think of organizational goals rather than personal ones.[120] However, women newspaper managers' attitudes toward job performance and characteristics have been found to be

---

[116]Ibid., 110.

[117]Tuchman, Making News, 137.

[118]Wilson, 166.

[119]Beasley and Theus, New Majority, 59.

[120]Christine L. Ogan, "On Their Way to the Top? Men and Women Middle-Level Newspaper Manager," Newspaper Research Journal 1 (May 1980), 58.

"surprisingly" like those of males.[121] Some women journalists themselves protest that women do not define or approach news differently from men. A published assertion that they do define news differently drew irate letters to the offending editor.[122] Furthermore, Greenwald's 1987 content analysis contrasting a business section with a woman as editor with a comparable section headed by a man found no difference in gender representation in the content.[123]

Joseph, however, has found that women newspaper editors do treat subordinates differently from men. Joseph hypothesized that female editors, because they are fighting harder to maintain status and to advance, would want more control over reporters than male editors.[124] He found the opposite to be true, and he concluded that women may be more sensitive to needs of subordinates than men.[125] In addition, Greenwald found in a comparison between male and female editors that the female editor's section used significantly more female bylines than the male's section

---

[121]Ibid., 61.

[122]Susan H. Miller, "Was `Pink Collar' ghetto study deliberate sensationalism?" Editor & Publisher (November 23, 1985), 33; and Beasley, "Newspapers," 190.

[123]Marilyn S. Greenwald, "Gender Representation in Newspaper Business Sections," Newspaper Research Journal 11 (Winter, 1990), 73.

[124]Ted Joseph, "Reporters' and Editors' Preference Toward Reporter Decision Making," Journalism Quarterly 59 (Summer 1982), 219.

[125]Ibid., 222.

did even though the male editor supervised more female reporters.[126]

Despite heavy opposition, the male hierarchy has been surprisingly adept at fending off encroachments on their power structure throughout the 1980s. Even in the face of legal challenges to male supremacy in the newsroom, some organizations responded by trying to offer an appearance of equality rather than the substance of it. Women at Newsday, for instance, reported that after that paper's 1982 out-of-court settlement in a sex discrimination suit, the house newsletter began to list lateral moves by women as "promotions." In another case, the lawyers who handled the Associated Press sex discrimination suit learned in 1982 that men were given inflated experience ratings so they could be hired at higher salary levels than women. The U.S. Commission on Civil Rights found in 1977 and 1979 that broadcast stations were inflating job categories held by women to "upper level" management status when the jobs rarely entailed such responsibility.[127]

Mere admittance to the power circles, however, also may not assure ability to make changes. Even when women are able to attain management positions, their power to make changes is often thwarted by a lack the support needed for leadership. One barrier to full partnership in management is

---

[126]Greenwald, 73.

[127]Schultz-Brooks, 29.

the belittling of women's efforts through a lack of respect and through lower salaries that keep women from moving into the high-status, high-power echelons of their peers.[128]

Low salaries for women can reinforce the perception that a woman need not be taken seriously. Salary differences between men and women journalists both reflect and reinforce status differences between peers. If women receive lower salaries, they cannot achieve equal status and influence in policy decisions.[129] In study after study, researchers have found that inexplicably lower pay for women journalists is almost universal even when controlled for educational levels, professional experience, age, number of employees reporting to the manager, degree of budget control, circulation of the newspaper and group ownership. Salary differences remain significant across time and geography.[130] One pair of researchers even investigated the possibility that the lower salaries for women were the result of women's attitudes toward salary. They found, however, that top-level women managers at daily newspapers

---

[128]Mills, 293, and Wilson, 166.

[129]Merritt and Gross, 514.

[130]Won H. Chang, "Characteristics and Self Perceptions of Women's Page Editors," Journalism Quarterly 52 (Spring 1975), 62; Ogan, "On Their Way," 55; Christine L. Ogan, "Life at the Top for Men and Women Newspaper Managers: A Five-Year Update of Their Characteristics," Newspaper Research Journal 5 (Winter 1983), 67; Merritt and Gross, 511-12; and Wilson, 168.

placed as much importance on tangible rewards as did men.[131]

Mills, whose career at the Los Angeles Times has provided an insider's view into male-female journalists' roles, said salary differences are among several factors that keep women from gaining the same support among managers that their male colleagues enjoy. She said the result is that a man's suggestion is greeted with hearty approval even though the same suggestion may have been made by a woman ten minutes earlier. The male club simply never hears her.[132]

When all else fails, men may squeeze a woman manager out altogether. An example of this tactic came when Patricia O'Brien was appointed to the Chicago Sun-Times editorial board with a public flourish. When O'Brien actually tried to attend one of the board's meetings, her boss sputtered and stammered. There was no chair for her.[133]

Because of the attitudes of male "club members," salary differences and the fact that women often must take on male values in order to succeed, Mills believes that promoting a few "token" women into management positions will have little effect on news decisions that might begin to include women. Women managers must be appointed in enough numbers to feel

---

[131]Christine L. Ogan and David H. Weaver, "Job Satisfaction in Selected U.S. Daily Newspapers: A Study of Male and Female Top-Level Managers," Mass Comm Review 6 (Winter 1978-79), 25-26

[132]Mills, 235, 253.

[133]Ibid., 340-41.

comfortable in the structure of male hegemony before they can make changes.[134] Once there is a "critical mass" of women in key jobs, women will have enough support to implement their ideas.[135]

Although no one has yet defined the percentage of women in these jobs that would constitute an effective level, one researcher believes she has found evidence that supports a 50-percent level as producing change. Gallagher studied the Sri Lanka Broadcasting Corporation in 1980 and found the image presented of women grew more positive as the rate of women participating in the service grew. The English language service of the organization rated best in non-negative portrayal of women. That service included 50 percent female staff. While the corporation as a whole had no women board members, women held 60 percent of positions as director and assistant director in this service. Gallagher argues that the figures represent a "critical mass" that allows women to combat cultural and professional values that those scattered in a media organization must accept.[136]

---

[134]Ibid., 294.

[135]Ibid., 341.

[136]Gallagher, 108-09.

Chapter III

THEORETICAL FRAMEWORK

It has been nearly a century since Susan B. Anthony told a reporter from the Chicago Tribune: "Just as long as newspapers and magazines are controlled by men, every woman upon them must write articles which are reflections of men's ideas. As long as that continues, women's ideas and deepest convictions will never get before the public."[137]

During those decades, women have shouldered their way into newsrooms in larger and larger numbers. Since 1977, there has been a female majority in journalism and mass communications programs in the nation's colleges and universities. That majority reached the 60-percent level by the early 1980s. This "gender switch" has also been reflected in a number of entry-level mass communication employment categories, and some observers predict many mass media fields will be predominantly female by the end of the millennia.[138] Despite these observances, content studies of

---

[137]E. Stanton, S. Anthony and M. Gage, eds., History of Women Suffrage Vol. 4 (Rochester, N.Y.: Charles Mann, 1889), 312.

[138]Pamela J. Creedon, "The Challenge of Re-Visioning Gender Values," in Women in Mass Communication: Challenging Gender Values, Pamela J. Creedon, ed. (Newbury Park: Sage, 1989), 14.

newspapers indicate that newspapers are written primarily by and about men.[139]

Adjustments in the way news is defined may be required for newspapers to include news about women in their columns. News beats largely remain centered around conflict and calamity while the timely event is judged more important than social trends that affect more people.[140]

The definition of news depends on who is giving and who is receiving information. Both the teller and the hearer have needs, and these needs do not always coincide. One theory holds that if the generator of news has more power than the receiver, the needs of the receiver can be largely ignored. Under that theory, it is asserted that the mass media represent a powerful force communicating with the less powerful. This has meant men talking to men because news generators have shaped the news to conform to the interests of powerful men and, to a lesser extent, to the interests of powerless men. Women have not influenced the process as news producers or as news consumers because they have held the least power on both sides of the process.[141]

Proponents of more inclusion of women in news reports theorize that the nature of news might change once women

---

[139]Matilda Butler and William Paisley, Women and the Mass Media: Sourcebook for Research and Action (New York: Human Sciences Press, 1980), 115.

[140]Wilson, 169.

[141]Molotch, 178-80.

become a large segment in newsrooms and management ranks. They add, however, that this change cannot take place if women are required to follow the male model of advancement.[142] Even if women overcome bureaucratic obstacles, there is only a little evidence that women, who often must assume male values to succeed, alter the male pattern of news as conflict.[143] In addition, women share cultural perspectives with men. Therefore, opening media management to women may not change media content unless it is accompanied by changing cultural perceptions of women.[144]

Other researchers and observers, however, contend that it is important to open management positions to women anyway. Since media cannot be neutral in presenting values, they contend, it is necessary to give media access to people with diverse views and values.[145] Media products are not likely to become less sexist than are the organizations that produce them. A newsroom that does not respect women cannot show respect for them in its columns.[146]

Until recently, however, it has been impossible to ascertain whether women decision-makers would be able to

---

[142]Beasley, 189.

[143]Ibid., 192.

[144]Gallagher, 109.

[145]Newland, 69.

[146]Butler and Paisley, 341.

have an impact on the exclusion of women and their interests from news columns. Women had not been allowed into the power positions of media management in great enough numbers to share substantial control of the news columns with male journalists. It was not the idea had been tried and found wanting. Instead, the idea had been found threatening and left untried.[147]

However, newspaper owners and executives, facing declining penetration of the mass media market, have begun to question the unwritten policy of excluding women from news reports. Al Neuharth, whose tenure at Gannett's helm was marked by a policy of promoting women, told Mills that too many male editors have been editing newspapers for themselves and their male friends. "A segment of our reading audience or potential audience that wasn't being adequately considered in our treatment of news was the majority segment - females. It seemed to me that it made professional sense to have more females make these decisions and see if their orientation would be different."

The purpose of this study is to gain insights that might support or refute Neuharth's reasoning. In Michigan, there are now newspapers with female decision-makers in numbers ranging from 0 to 50 percent of the editorial departments' key positions. These key positions are identified as those editors who regularly attend the daily

---

[147]Newland, 60; and Mills, 277.

editorial conference since that meeting has been found to be a critical point in the social control of the newsroom.[148] A comparison among varying levels of women management representation, which was impossible earlier because of low levels of female management participation, is now possible.

Hypotheses

In this project, content analysis will be used to compare the treatment of women as sources and of topics of interest to women in six Michigan newspapers with varying percentages of women decision-makers. The comparison will test the following hypotheses:

1. The percentage of stories including women as sources will increase as the percentage of women in decision-making positions at newspapers increases.

2. The percentage of space devoted to publishing stories including women as sources will increase as the percentage of women in decision-making positions at newspapers increases.

3. The percentage of stories that identify themselves as relating to women will increase as the percentage of women in decision-making positions at newspapers increases.

4. The percentage of space devoted to stories that identify themselves as relating to women will increase as

---

[148]Sigelman, 138.

the percentage of women in decision-making positions at newspapers increases.

5. The prominence of stories that include female sources will increase as the percentage of women in decision-making positions at newspapers increases.

6. The prominence of stories that identify themselves as relating to women will increase as the percentage of women in decision-making positions at newspapers increases.

Controls

Percentage of stories and percentage of space devoted to stories that include female sources are only rough measures of resource commitment to coverage of female sources since a 10-inch story including one female source among a dozen sources would be counted the same as a 10-inch story including 10 female sources among a dozen sources. To obtain a more complete picture of a newspaper's use of female sources, the percentage of female sources among the total number of sources used will also be measured as a refinement for hypothesis testing.

Furthermore, the number of female journalists is increasing rapidly,[149] and the influx of women into entry-level positions at newspapers may be providing an atmosphere in which female middle-managers have more awareness of and support for coverage of women and their interests. Female

---

[149]Creedon, 14.

reporters, in fact, may have as much influence on inclusion of female sources and female content as do female managers since reporters have a direct "gatekeeping" control over news sources and topics. Therefore, percentage of female bylines will be coded for use as a control.

In addition, the review of literature suggests that social forces and professional norms will dictate managerial behavior more than personal choice will. Previous studies have attributed source selection, for instance, to prominence of individuals among possible sources for the story topic.[150] To control for this effect, a gauge for prominence of females in each community's governmental pool will be used.

Both newspaper circulation and available space are indicators of resources available to a newspaper. Having increased space obviously provides room to explore more subjects, and circulation can roughly indicate how much revenue might be available for hiring reporters, subscribing to wire services and obtaining other resources. Both will be coded as controls.

Predictions

Since there are a number of pressures that researchers and commentators believe will inhibit the influence of female editors on news decisions, it is possible that little

---

[150]Silver, 145-49; Fico, 50, and Sigal, "Defining News," 130.

difference will be found from one percentage bracket of female editors to the next. On the other hand, Gallagher's research does indicate that in some circumstances a 50-to-60-percent level of female participation will have an effect on the portrayal of women in media content. It is expected that the newspaper with a 50-percent level of female management participation will display decidedly different amounts of coverage of women and their interests than will the newspaper with 0-percent participation. Furthermore, the degrees of inclusion of women in the newspapers will generally have a positive correlation with percentages of women managers.

Chapter IV

STUDY METHODS

The purpose of this study is to determine if the proportion of coverage of women as sources of news or the proportion of women as topics of news increases as the percentage of women decision-makers at newspapers increases. Consequently, a quantitative study of content was selected as the study method since content analysis has been found to be a valid method of relating known characteristics of sources to the messages the sources produce.[151] The study was designed to employ the steps recommended for content analysis by Wimmer and Dominick and by Holsti.[152]

Several considerations were weighed before determining a population to be studied.First, since there is evidence that prominence of women in a particular culture is a determinant of coverage,[153] the study was limited to one geographical area. Michigan was selected because it would allow ready access to newspapers and information about

---

[151]Ole R. Holsti, Content Analysis for the Social Sciences and Humanities (Reading, Mass.: Addison-Wesley Publishing, 1969), 48.

[152]Roger D. Wimmer and Joseph R. Dominick, Mass Media Research (Belmont, Calif.: Wadsworth Publishing Co., 1987), 171; and Holsti, 94-149.

[153]Silver, 148.

newspapers to the researcher. Secondly, since the study is exploratory in nature, the choice was made to study a small population in its entirety rather than choosing a wide time frame requiring the use of sample selection and inferential statistics. The week of August 5 through August 11, 1991, was chosen in advance as being convenient and allowing a full range of publication days in order to encompass days when space is tight as well as days when space tends to be more available for stories that fall outside traditional journalistic "hard" news categories, thereby allowing editors more latitude in decision-making.

The next level of universe selection was choosing specific publications to be analyzed. A telephone survey was conducted of daily newspaper editors in Michigan in order to ascertain proportions of women managers. For the purpose of this study, it was decided that "decision-makers" or managers would be limited to those editors who regularly attend the daily editorial planning conference, sometimes called the "budget meeting." That decision was made because different publications have widely varying internal definitions of "manager" or "editor." By limiting managers in this study to those who attend the planning meeting, the study pinpoints the people who, no matter what their titles are, actually exercise the majority of the power in daily decision-making and news judgments since it is in these meetings that negotiations for space and prominence of

stories takes place.[154] When an editor reported that a particular department's place at the meeting was shared by two editors who alternately attended, the editor was asked to report which editor had the primary responsibility of attending the conference since the editor with primary responsibility would have more power to exercise authority than would a stand-in. If two editors were listed as being equally responsible, both were included in the totals even though it would be rare for both to be in the same conference.

Once the percentages of female managers were determined, a selection of six publications was made with the primary criterion being finding as wide a range of proportions of women managers as possible. The survey did uncover newspapers with proportions of women managers ranging from 0 to 50 percent. The publications on the extremes were selected, and then four more newspapers were chosen to represent reasonable intervals between the extremes. Although the two daily newspapers published in downtown Detroit did not have a wide variance in proportion of women managers, they were included because they did show some variation and because having two newspapers in the exact same market might provide an opportunity for a direct comparison of influence of women managers when cultural differences were eliminated.

---

[154]Tuchman, "The Newspaper," 204.

Population

The selection process, therefore, gleaned the following publications with their percentages of women decision-makers: Lansing State Journal, 50 percent;[155] Battle Creek Enquirer, 38 percent;[156] Detroit Free Press, 33 percent;[157] Detroit News, 27 percent;[158] Muskegon Chronicle, 10 percent;[159] and Bay City Times, 0 percent.[160]

The population was then further refined to eliminate advertising, syndicated copy and other material that is either beyond the editors' daily concerns or too routine to merit daily consideration. Therefore, it was determined that the universe should include only bylined articles that appear in the front section, the local news section or the business section. The byline requirement excluded editorial page copy, photographs without accompanying copy and news roundup or briefs columns. In addition, signed, regularly published columns of opinion or entertainment were

---

[155]Jennifer Carroll, managing editor, Lansing State Journal, telephone interview by author, August 2, 1991.

[156]Ellen Leifeld, executive editor, Battle Creek Enquirer, telephone interview by author, August 1, 1991.

[157]Joe Grimm, assistant managing editor, Detroit Free Press, telephone interview by author, April 8, 1991.

[158]James Gatti, deputy news editor, Detroit News, telephone interview by author, August 1, 1991.

[159]Lee Lupo, assistant metro editor, Muskegon Chronicle, telephone interview by author, August 1, 1991.

[160]Robert Longstaff, editor, Bay City Times, telephone interview by author, August 1, 1991.

eliminated because featured columnists are usually given more latitude in content than are general assignment and beat reporters. Therefore, editors' influence over them is weakened somewhat.

Since the two Detroit publications selected have, under a joint operating agreement, combined publications on weekends, each of the weekend days was assigned to a particular publication's category on the basis of which newspaper has responsibility for the news sections on Saturday or Sunday. Therefore, each Detroit paper contributed only six editions for analysis, giving a total of 40 editions to be considered instead of 42.

The units of analysis were these 40 editions. In order to produce percentages in these editions for various categories in the study, enumeration units were determined to be numbers of stories and square inches of copy by story increments. The number and square inches of all the stories considered in each edition were totaled so that category totals could be converted into percentages for each unit of analysis.

Variables

The primary independent variable for the study, then, was the percentages of female decision-makers at the newspapers. Dependent variables were percentages of stories and space including female sources, percentages of stories and space devoted to stories with topics of interest to

women and prominence accorded stories with female sources or with topics of interest to women. To refine the study of source usage, the first references to sources were coded by number and gender. Since stories would be dichotomized into groups as having or not having female sources, computing the percentage of female sources used might uncover differences that would not otherwise appear.

Content categories were constructed to serve these variables and to comply with the rubric that categories must be mutually exclusive, exhaustive, independent and derived from a single classification principle.[161] To meet these requirements, categories were divided into several groups or levels of analysis. There were category groups for source gender, topic gender and governmental topics.

At the first level, stories were coded by number and by square inches as having or not having female sources. As a further refinement of source use, stories were also coded by the number of female sources used and the total number of sources used. These categories were used in analysis of the first and second hypotheses.

The second level of analysis involved female-based topics. To qualify as a story with a female-based topic, the story had to designate itself as gender-based by specifically referring to women as individuals, in groups or as a societal division. For instance, stories about health

---

[161]Holsti, 99.

programs for women and infants, stories about "glass ceiling" levels that bar women from corporate executive offices and stories about individual women newsmakers would be included here. Stories about day care centers, for instance, would not be included since child care does not specifically refer to women. If, however, the story is about a particular women who is advocating day care center regulation or about a day care center operated by Women for Safe Child Care, the story would be included since the topic identifies itself as involving one or more women. Stories and their square inches were coded to be primarily related to women or not primarily related to women. These categories were used to test the study's third and fourth hypotheses.

To test the fifth hypothesis, stories coded as having female sources or as having topics relating to women were analyzed for prominence by use of an index patterned after the one recommended by Budd.[162] Scores ascertained by this method were averaged for each edition.

To weight the influence of other factors that might affect the results, secondary independent variables were established for prominence of women in the community, newspaper circulation and percentages of female bylines. For this secondary analysis, a telephone survey was performed of the cities where the newspapers are located in order to determine percentages of female governmental officials in

---

[162]Richard W. Budd, "Attention Score: A Device for Measuring News `Play'," Journalism Quarterly 44 (Spring 1964), 260.

each community. This survey was limited to learning the percentages of women who held positions in the community as mayor, city council members or board of education members. This second independent variable was used in order to provide a controlling measure of prominence of women in the community. The percentages ascertained from that poll (with rankings for women managers in parentheses) were: Lansing, 44 percent[163] (1); Bay City, 29 percent[164] (6); Muskegon, 27 percent[165] (5); Detroit, 26 percent[166] (3 and 4); and Battle Creek, 12 percent[167] (2).

For this analysis, enumeration units were coded for governmental topics. Each story was either included or excluded in this category on the basis of whether or not it referred to one of the governmental units covered by the

---

[163]Tina Gallanti, Lansing City Council secretary, telephone interview by author, August 9, 1991, and Judy Brown, Lansing Board of Education secretary, telephone interview by author, August 9, 1991.

[164]Lorraine Walker, Bay City Commission secretary, telephone interview by author, August 9, 1991, and Melissa Revette, Bay City Board of Education secretary, telephone interview by author, August 9, 1991.

[165]Marilyn Wernstron, Muskegon city clerk's secretary, telephone interview by author, August 9, 1991, and Laura Humphrey, Muskegon education superintendent's secretary, telephone interview by author, August 9, 1991.

[166]Beverly Haynes, Detroit City Council secretary, telephone interview by author, August 9, 1991, and Pat Nicholson, Detroit Board of Education secretary, telephone interview by author, August 9, 1991.

[167]Marilyn Calbaugh, Battle Creek city clerk's secretary, telephone interview by author, August 9, 1991, and Kathy Karaba, Battle Creek Board of Education secretary, telephone interview by author, August 9, 1991.

telephone poll of communities. This category was used in conjunction with the community telephone poll data to see if cultural influences could be eliminated as correlatives of source usage and topic selection, the subjects of the first four hypotheses.

In addition, circulations of the newspapers were taken from the Editor and Publisher Company's reports. They are: Lansing State Journal, 69,804;[168] Battle Creek Enquirer, 29,225;[169] Detroit Free Press, 636,182;[170] Detroit News, 500,980;[171] Muskegon Chronicle, 47,644;[172] and Bay City Times, 40,223.[173]

To relate the influence of bylines to the content categories, the coding instrument included categories for male, female and indeterminate bylines. This coding was done for the convenience of researchers who might want such information for future analysis as well as for use as a control for the hypotheses in this study. For the same reasons as well as for identification of units of analysis, edition dates were also coded. Negative values, stories showing no female sources or topics, were also coded to

---

[168]Editor and Publisher Co. The International Yearbook (New York: Editor & Publisher Co., 1991), I-168.

[169]Ibid., I-162.

[170]Ibid., I-164.

[171]Ibid.

[172]Ibid., I-170.

[173]Ibid., I-162.

provide a method of cross checking mathematical totals through a balance sheet approach for each unit of analysis.

Operational definitions for all the categories used are included in the coding material found in Appendix A.

Reliability

Before coding of the population began, intercoder reliability was established in a pre-test using comparable material and procedures recommended by Krippendorff and by Stempel.[174] After adjustments in the coding instruments were made, the intercoder reliability for the study was tested. Intercoder reliability for enumeration units ranged from 90 percent for prominence and source numbers to 100 percent agreement for articles with female topics.[175] For units of analysis in which enumeration units were aggregated, standard deviations between coder measurements ranged from no deviation on number of stories with female sources or topics to 17.4 square inches for total coded space in the edition.[176] In addition, tests for intracoder

---

[174]Klaus Krippendorff, Content Analysis: An Introduction to Its Methodology (Beverly Hills: Sage Publications, 1980), 146; and Guido H. Stempel III, "Increasing Reliability in Content Analysis," Journalism Quarterly 32 (Fall 1955), 450-51.

[175]Other intercoder agreements were 96 percent for numbers of female sources, 94 percent for government topics and 94 percent (plus or minus one square inch) for measurements.

[176]Other standard deviations were: 13.6 square inches for space for stories including female sources, 1.72 for number of sources used in the edition, .68 square inches for space for stories with female topics and .37 for average prominence of stories.

reliability were performed at intervals during the coding process. Results similar to those found in the intercoder tests were determined. Intracoder agreements ranged from 90 percent for total sources found to 100 percent on number of stories with female topics.[177]

Statistical Analysis

To analyze study results, correlation techniques were used, according to criteria outlined by Pagano.[178] The analysis included gauging the strength of the correlation between the proportions of women managers at the newspapers and the proportions of stories or space used for stories with female sources. The calculation was repeated for proportions of women managers in relation to proportions of space used for stories with female topics and for management proportions in relation to average prominence given to such stories.

Furthermore, proportions of stories with female sources and proportions of stories with female topics were related to proportions of female governmental officials in the community as well as to percentages of female bylines and to circulation figures. These results were compared with the

---

[177]Other intracoder agreements were: 96 percent for measurements (within one square inch) and for stories with female sources, 92 percent for prominence scores, and 98 percent for governmental topics and gender of bylines.

[178]Robert R. Pagano, Understanding Statistics in the behavioral sciences (St. Paul: West Publishing Col, 1981), 134-36.

first sets of correlation measurements to see if any of these factors had a stronger relationship with the content than did female management ratios. The proportions of coverage of governmental topics were also compared to determine if one or more of the papers carried abnormally high amounts of governmental coverage that might account for differences.

Chapter V

FINDINGS

The study population included 407 articles comprising 10,119 square inches in 40 newspaper editions. Each of the two Detroit newspapers contributed only six editions because they alternate publication responsibilities on Saturday and Sunday. The number of locally produced by-lined articles ranged from 35 in the Battle Creek Enquirer to 122 in the Detroit News. Those publications also had the lowest and highest total square inches with 844 in the Enquirer and 3,097 in the News. (See Table 1.)

The Battle Creek Enquirer with the least amount of space for the study also ranked lowest in circulation at 29,200. The Detroit News, which ranked highest in space devoted to local copy, ranked only second in circulation, with a circulation of 501,000 compared to the Detroit Free Press, with a circulation of 636,200. Circulation and space had a .75 correlation.

With only a small difference between the two measures, it was decided that circulation is a better indicator of resources available to a publication than space since higher circulation should generate expanded personnel resources as

well that could influence the dependent variables in this study. Therefore, circulation was used to control for such available resources and to assess its independent effects on the study's dependent variables.

TABLE 1. DATA ON NEWSPAPER AND COMMUNITY CHARACTERISTICS

Newspaper Name	Circulation in thousands	Percent Female Editors	Percent Female Bylines	Percent Women Community Leaders
Lansing State Journal	69.8	50	44	44
Battle Creek Enquirer	29.2	38	26	12
Detroit Free Press	636.2	33	32	26
Detroit News	501.0	27	46	26
Muskegon Chronicle	47.6	10	29	27
Bay City Times	40.2	0	48	29

The percentage of female bylines was also coded for use as a control since reporters have a direct "gatekeeping" control over news sources and topics. It was found that the percentages of female editors bore no correlation (-.04) to the percentages of female bylines found in the study. In

fact, the lowest ranking publication in percentage of female editors, the Bay City Times, exhibited the highest percentage of female bylines, having no women editors at all and 48 percent of the stories headed by obviously female bylines. Battle Creek with the second highest percentage of female editors, 38 percent, showed the lowest percentage of female bylines with only 26 percent. Therefore, the female-byline ratio provided a competing explanation for differences in dependent variables.

Since previous studies attribute source selection to prominence of individuals in the topic field,[179] the percentages for women in community government positions were analyzed as rival hypotheses for the amounts of female sources or topics used. These percentages bore no relation (-.05) to circulation. They did have a slight relationship to percentage of female editors (.18) and percentages of female bylines (.19). It is understandable that some relationship would be found between prominence of women in the community and prominence of women in the newspaper since the same cultural influences that produce high prominence of women in elected positions would probably influence percentages of female editors and percentages of female reporters as well. However, these relationships were not considered strong enough to preclude usage of community prominence of women as a control in this study. Therefore,

---

[179]Silver, 145-49.

community prominence of women was also used in hypothesis testing.

Surprisingly, edition dates, which originally were coded primarily as edition identifiers, produced correlations that frequently competed in strength with other independent variables. This suggests the possibility that weekend space is treated differently than weekday space in terms of this study's dependent variables. These figures had no correlation with percentage of women editors (-.02), female byline percentages (-.13) or circulation (-.10). Dates, therefore, also were analyzed as explanations for dependent variables.

The newspapers averaged 10 stories per issue or 253 square inches per issue devoted to locally produced, bylined stories. Of those, almost five stories and 135 square inches per issue included female sources somewhere in each story, for a total of 197 stories or 5,400 inches with female sources, about half of the total. The Detroit Free Press had the lowest percentage of articles with female sources, 36 percent, and the lowest percentage of space devoted to stories including female sources, 41 percent. The highest percentage of articles with female sources was found in both the Lansing State Journal and the Bay City Times, each having 54 percent in this category. Space devoted to stories with female sources, however, was 63 percent in the Lansing State Journal and only 47 percent of the Bay City Times. Therefore, the space measurement in this category gave the

Bay City Times a fifth-place ranking following all newspapers except the Detroit Free Press. (See Table 2.)

TABLE 2. DATA ON STORY CHARACTERISTICS

Newspaper Name	Total Local, Bylined Stories		Percent of Stories, Space With Female Sources		Percent of Stories, Space With Female Topics	
	Stories N=407	Space S=10,119	Stories	Space	Stories	Space
Lansing State Journal	72	1,439	54	63	6	8
Battle Creek Enquirer	35	844	49	54	14	12
Detroit Free Press	85	1,993	36	41	11	10
Detroit News	122	3,097	50	54	16	17
Muskegon Chronicle	45	1,377	51	55	0	0
Bay City Times	48	1,369	54	47	4	3

Only 40 stories comprising 964 inches were found in the population to be devoted to female topics. The highest percentages of such stories, 16 percent of the stories and 17 percent of the space, were found in the Detroit News. The Muskegon Chronicle published no such stories at all for the lowest ranking among the six publications. In fact, only two stories with female topics appeared in either of the

newspapers with the lowest percentages of female editors, the Muskegon Chronicle and the Bay City Times. The other 38 stories with female topics appeared in the four newspapers with more than 25 percent female editors. The top-ranked newspaper for percentage of female editors, the Lansing State Journal, published only four stories with female topics.

On the six-point prominence scale, the average prominence given to stories with female sources was 3.7 while the average prominence given to stories with female topics was 3.6. The remainder of the stories, those that contained neither female sources nor female topics, had an average prominence of 3.2. (See Table 3.)

TABLE 3. DATA ON PROMINENCE OF STORIES

Newspaper Name	Average Prominence for Stories With Female Sources	Average Prominence for Stories With Female Topics	Average Prominence for Stories Without Female Sources or Topics
Lansing State Journal	3.8	4.3	3.0
Battle Creek Enquirer	4.2	4.5	3.4
Detroit Free Press	3.4	3.2	3.4
Detroit News	3.4	3.0	3.1
Muskegon Chronicle	3.6	N/A*	3.4
Bay City Times	3.6	3.0	3.0

*Not Applicable: No stories dealing with female topics were found in this newspaper

All sources named in each story were also counted and coded by gender to give a more complete picture of source usage by the newspapers. The study identified 1,189 sources, including 327 female sources, in all editions during the week. The numbers do not necessarily represent different people since a source used in one story might also be used in a second story. That source would be counted twice. The highest percentage of female sources was found in the Lansing State Journal, 38 percent. The Detroit Free Press and the Muskegon Chronicle used the lowest percentage of female sources, 21 percent. (See Table 4.)

TABLE 4. DATA ON TOTAL NUMBER OF SOURCES USED IN STORIES

Newspaper Name	Total Number of Sources Used	Percentage of Females Among Sources
Lansing State Journal	214	38
Battle Creek Enquirer	91	25
Detroit Free Press	238	21
Detroit News	383	29
Muskegon Chronicle	130	21
Bay City Times	133	27

Pearson's correlations for independent and dependent variables were calculated from the data before partial and part correlation coefficients were ascertained. (See Appendix B.) The part correlations are reported in Table 5 and represent a conservative measure of the correlation of

two variables controlling for the effects of other key variables.

Findings on Hypotheses

HYPOTHESIS 1

> The percentage of stories including women as sources will increase as the percentage of women in decision-making positions at newspapers increases.

No support for this hypothesis was found in the data. (See Table 5.) The part correlation was .01. Surprisingly, the prominence of women in community governmental offices also showed almost no correlation with the number of articles with female sources (.05). No other variables seemed to have any effect except date (.21), suggesting such stories are more likely to appear at the end of the week.

TABLE 5. PART CORRELATION COEFFICIENTS RELATING TREATMENT OF WOMEN SOURCES AND TOPICS IN NEWS CONTENT TO NEWSPAPER AND COMMUNITY CHARACTERISTICS

Percentage of:	Percentage of Females as			Newspaper	
	Editor	Bylined Reporters	Community Officials	Circu-lation	Date
Articles with female sources	.01	.00	.05	-.12	.21
Space with female sources	.11	.01	.08	-.16	.26
Female sources among total sources	.20	.14	.23	-.20	.16
Articles with female topics	.23	.19	-.33	.10	.18
Space with female topics	.28	.15	-.28	.03	.25

Hypothesis 2

> The percentage of space devoted to publishing stories including women as sources will increase as the percentage of women in decision-making positions at newspapers increases.

The data at best marginally support this hypothesis. (See Table 5.) The part coefficient was .11, larger than any other except date (.26), but too small to affirm the hypothesis confidently. Newspaper dates showed the highest correlation with space for female sources, once more indicating that these stories were more likely to appear in weekend editions.

Women Sources as a Proportion of Total Sources

Since the proportion of sources who are female can vary within stories coded as having female sources, the total number of sources and the percentages of women sources were used for another perspective on the data dealing with the first two hypotheses. When the percentage of female editors was correlated with the percentage of total sources who were female, a part correlation of .20 was found, much higher than the correlations with number of stories or space for stories containing female sources. This correlation was surpassed, however, by the .23 correlation of total female source percentages and percentages of women as community leaders. This suggests that percentage of female sources used in news stories is likely to reflect the community's

political power composition no matter what the staffing of the newsroom is.

Hypothesis 3

> The percentage of stories that identify themselves as relating to women will increase as the percentage of women in decision-making positions at newspapers increases.

This hypothesis was supported by the data. (See Table 5.) A .23 part correlation was found between percentages of female editors and percentages of stories with female topics. Percentages of female bylines also had a relatively high part correlation of .19 with female topics. The two, taken together, indicate that women in the newsroom, women editors especially, definitely contributed to an increase in such stories.

HYPOTHESIS 4

> The percentage of space devoted to stories that identify themselves as relating to women will increase as the percentage of women in decision-making positions at newspapers increases.

Support for this hypothesis was also found in the data. (See Table 5.) The part correlation was .28. The part correlation for space for female topics and ratio of female bylines (.15) dropped slightly from that found between female bylines and numbers of female-topic stories (.19). An explanation is that editors have far more control over space allocation than do reporters. Reporters can often sell a suggestion for a story, but they rarely are able to decide the amount of space allocated to the subject.

TABLE 6. PART CORRELATION COEFFICIENTS RELATING PROMINENCE OF FEMALE SOURCES AND TOPICS IN NEWS CONTENT TO NEWSPAPER AND COMMUNITY CHARACTERISTICS

Average of:	Percentage of Females as			Newspaper	
	Editor	Bylined Reporters	Community Officials	Circ.	Date
Prominence of stories with female sources	.16	.11	.19	-.04	-.05
Prominence of stories with female topics	.25	-.04	-.02	.19	.04

Hypothesis 5

> The prominence of stories that include female sources will increase as the percentage of women in decision-making positions at newspapers increases.

Some support was found for this hypothesis, but the correlation involved was surpassed by the correlation of prominence and percentage of females who are community leaders. (See Table 6.) The part correlation between prominence of stories including female sources and percentage of women editors was .16. The correlation of average prominence of stories including female sources and percentage of women among community leaders was .19. It seems, therefore, that female editors influence prominence of these stories, but, as Silver's study suggests, female

success in community leadership positions has a greater impact on female source prominence.[180]

Hypothesis 6

The prominence of stories that identify themselves as relating to women will increase as the percentage of women in decision-making positions at newspapers increases.

Stronger support was found for this hypothesis in the data. (See Table 6.) The part correlation between percentage of female editors and prominence of stories with female topics was .25. Prominence of women as community leaders had no relationship to prominence of female topics with a part correlation of -.02. Newspaper circulation, an indicator of available resources, had a higher correlation here, .19.

Weekly News Cycle and Use of Female Sources and Topics

Date of story publication showed the strongest association of all the independent variables with two of the dependent variables, number of articles with female sources and space for articles with female sources. It ranked second with another dependent variable, space for female topics. One possibility is that female sources and topics were more apt to appear on weekends. This suggests the further possibility that female editors could be having the greatest impact during these times.

Since newspapers typically have more space available, particularly on Sundays, it would seem that this phenomenon could be related to increased space. In this study, however,

---

[180]Ibid.

space devoted to locally produced, bylined articles did not relate to date (-.02). More space for local copy, therefore, does not appear to explain increased usage of female sources and female topics toward the end to the week. Rather, it seems that space available for local copy is used differently on weekends, and female editors may account for this difference.

TABLE 7. MONDAY THROUGH FRIDAY: PART CORRELATION COEFFICIENTS RELATING TREATMENT OF WOMEN SOURCES AND TOPICS IN NEWS CONTENT TO NEWSPAPER AND COMMUNITY CHARACTERISTICS (N=328 stories; S=7,880 square inches)

Percentage of:	Percentage of Females as			Newspaper Circulation
	Editor	Bylined Reporters	Community Officials	
Articles with female sources	-.09	.23	.22	-.04
Space with female sources	-.03	.20	.27	-,05
Female sources among total sources	-.00	.21	.62	-.01
Articles with female topics	.14	.15	-.19	.37
Space with female topics	.21	.01	-.14	.25

To explore the question further, part correlations were calculated for weekday issues alone and for weekend issues

alone. (See Tables 7, 8, 9 and 10.) In addition, percentage of female editors, ratios of female bylines, percentages of females as community officials and circulation were again examined as controls.

During week days, the relationships between percentages of female editors and all of the dependent variables dealing with source become negative or nonexistent. (See Table 7.) On the other hand, the influence of female staffers continued to hold or increase with these dependent variables during the five-day workweek. Also on weekdays, percentages of women as community officials showed strong relationships with the three source-usage categories, including a significant jump in the percentage-of-total-sources variable (from .23 overall to .62 on weekdays). This pattern suggests the possible influence of the "beat" reporting system in which reporters select sources from among a pool of largely governmental decision makers.

The relationship of percentage of women editors to percentage of women's topics also lost strength from overall levels of .23 and .28, dropping to .14 and .21. For stories and space with women's topics, circulation became the primary independent variable on weekdays with part correlations of .37 and .25.

Female editors retained some relationship to prominence of weekday stories with female sources and topics. (See Table 8.) The relationship with prominence for stories with female sources increased slightly from an overall part

correlation of .16 to a weekday correlation of .22, but the prominence relationship for female topics decreased from an overall level of .25 to .11 on weekdays.

TABLE 8. MONDAY THROUGH FRIDAY: PART CORRELATION COEFFICIENTS RELATING PROMINENCE OF FEMALE SOURCES AND TOPICS IN NEWS CONTENT TO NEWSPAPER AND COMMUNITY CHARACTERISTICS

Average of:	Percentage of Females as			
	Editor	Bylined Reporters	Community Officials	Newspaper Circulation
Prominence for female sources	.22	.22	.19	-.21
Prominence for female topics	.11	-.17	.07	.51

Most of the relationships between female editors and the dependent variables became far stronger on weekends and the strongest among all variables tested. (See Table 9.) Even though the weekend relationship between percentage of women editors and percentage of articles with female sources was negligible (.04), it was the highest among the independent variables tested and was also higher than the weekday rate of -.09 and the overall rate of .01. The relationship of space for female sources with female editor percentage was much higher on the weekend, .27 compared to -.03 on weekdays and .11 overall.

On weekends, the relationship between female editors and the percentage of women sources among total sources

jumped from the overall rate of .20 and the weekday rate of .0 to .74. In this category, effect of percentage of women as community officials, a variable that weighed .62 on weekdays, became negative on weekends. In fact, prominence of females in the community had negative relationships with

TABLE 9. SATURDAY AND SUNDAY: PART CORRELATION COEFFICIENTS RELATING TREATMENT OF WOMEN SOURCES AND TOPICS IN NEWS CONTENT TO NEWSPAPER AND COMMUNITY CHARACTERISTICS (N=79 stories; S=2,239 square inches)

Percentage of:	Percentage of Females as			Newspaper Circulation
	Editor	Bylined Reporters	Community Officials	
Articles with female sources	.04	.03	-.24	-.51
Space with female sources	.27	.05	-.21	-.54
Female sources among total sources	.74	.20	-.29	-.46
Articles with female topics	.69	.26	-.55	-.29
Space with female topics	.59	.16	-.38	-.11

all the dependent variables on the weekends, as did newspaper circulation, again possibly reflecting the "beat" system that focuses on governmental decision-makers mostly during weekdays.

Of all the independent variables, percentage of females as editor also had the strongest relationships with the number and space categories for stories with female topics published on weekends (.69 and .59). These part correlations were by far the highest associations found in the topic categories with percentage of females as bylined reporters having second highest relationships in both categories (.26 and .16) In fact, no stories with female topics were published on the weekends by the two newspapers with the lowest percentages of female editors, the Muskegon Chronicle (10 percent) and the Bay City Times (0 percent).

TABLE 10. SATURDAY AND SUNDAY: PART CORRELATION COEFFICIENTS RELATING PROMINENCE OF FEMALE SOURCES AND TOPICS IN NEWS CONTENT TO NEWSPAPER AND COMMUNITY CHARACTERISTICS

Average of:	Percentage of Females as			Newspaper Circulation
	Editor	Bylined Reporters	Community Officials	
Prominence for stories with female sources	.03	.02	.24	-.21
Prominence for stories with female topics	.75	-.02	-.11	-.14

In the examination of prominence of stories with female sources, the relationship with percentage of women's editors dropped from being the highest of independent variables

during the week at .21 to an almost nonexistent part correlation of .03 on weekends. (See Table 10.) However, the influence of women's editors on prominence for female topics jumped from a weekday rate of .11 to .75.

The drop in correlation between percentage of female editors and prominence of stories with female sources on weekends is puzzling, especially in light of the findings that the correlation between percentage of female editors and space for stories with female sources increased on weekend days. The relationship between percentage of females as community leaders and prominence for stories with female sources, however, held its importance on the weekends. In fact, it increased from the weekday level of .19 to a weekend level of .24.

One explanation for the substantial increase in correlation between percentage of female editors and number, space and prominence for stories with female topics might be that editors reserve stories with female topics for Sundays, a day when circulations increase.[181] Another explanation might be that the female editors' freedom to select story topics is restricted to a day with little copy competition and low readership, Saturday.

To examine this question, percentages of stories on each day were computed. Because each of the two Detroit newspapers publish on only one weekend day, they were

---

[181]Editor and Publisher Company, I162-70.

omitted from the analysis. Editors there would have no choice between weekend days. Consequently, numbers of editions and stories became too small for valid correlation computations. It is also possible in such a small number of cases for one unusual decision to have an untoward effect on the results. (See Table 11.)

Of the stories with female sources published during the weekend in the four relevant newspapers, slightly more than half were published on Sunday. These stories, however, represented 65 percent of the space involved in weekend stories with female sources. Among weekend stories with female topics, however, 60 percent of the stories and 70 percent of the space devoted to them were published on Saturdays, seeming to indicate that editors in this study who had a choice between weekend days did not reserve stories with female topics for Sunday publication and did not show a clear preference for reserving stories with female sources for Sunday publication.

TABLE 11. PERCENTAGES OF WEEKEND STORIES WITH FEMALE SOURCES AND FEMALE TOPICS ON SATURDAY AND SUNDAY IN FOUR RELEVANT NEWSPAPERS

	Saturday	Sunday
Articles with female sources (Total article number with female sources = 33)	45	55
Space with female sources (Total space with female sources= 1,031)	35	65
Articles with female topics (Total article number with female topics= 5)	60	40
Space with female topics (Total space with female topics = 103.5)	70	30

It is not possible to conclude that editors on these newspapers prefer one weekend day over the other for publication of stories with female sources or topics because the number of cases is too small to indicate a pattern. The data suggest, however, that the subject could produce intriguing possibilities for exploration.

Conclusions

The study results were divided along subject lines. Hypotheses dealing with female topics were supported, but those dealing with female sources received substantially less support. The percent of female editors was clearly the strongest element among the independent variables tested when assessing numbers, space and prominence of articles with female topics.

Percentage of female editors, however, had no effect on the numbers of articles including female sources. The effect of the percentage of female editors on space for stories with female sources was minimal. Only when female percentages of total sources were considered did the correlation with female editors and female source usage rise to the .20 level. Even then, however, the relationship was surpassed by the relationship shown with percentage of women as community officials. When prominence for stories with female sources was assessed, the role of women editors again failed to dominate among independent variables with percentage of female bylines surpassing it and percentage of females as community officials nearly equaling it.

In general, the more female editors there are, the more likely it is that stories with female sources and topics will be published, and published prominently.

However, female staffers and community leaders also have an important influence on this, especially on weekdays.

On weekends, the increased presence of female editors exerts even stronger effects on the publication of stories with female topics and the prominence of those stories.

Chapter VI

DISCUSSION

The findings on source usage indicate that professional values and training were better predictors of source usage than gender of editors or reporters. Previous studies have documented that professionalism requires journalistic source selection to rely on routine news channels and established, visible leaders.[182] Silver also found that gender of news sources was not a factor in amounts of coverage when the relative power of newsmakers was controlled.[183] It is understandable that female editors, who must undergo the same newsroom socialization that men undergo -- including all the subtle and not-so-subtle pressures to conform to organizational values described by Breed and Sigal[184] -- would evaluate sources in conformity to professional rubrics. Since percentages of females among community leaders provided a competing explanation for female source usage, it would seem that data from this study supports the notion that women will become more visible as news sources when they achieve more power in society.

---

[182]Sigal, "Defining News," 130; Fico, 50; and Robinson, 90.

[183]Silver, 145-49.

[184]Breed, "Social Control," 226-35; and Sigal, Reporters and Officials, 49.

The fact that the hypotheses dealing with female topics were supported means, however, that diversity in the newsroom can have an impact on content despite the strength of professional training and socialization. There could be several reasons that this is true in relation to story topics and not true when dealing with sources. One reason may be that female editors find the conventions of source usage to be sensible and useful when trying to gather information quickly but find conventional news definitions to be confining or boring. Another possibility is that professional norms are simply not as strong in relation to topic selection as they are in relation to sources. There may not be as much resistance to overcome.

Yet a third explanation may be offered in light of the surprising findings that women editors apparently make a far greater impact on topic selection on weekends than they do during the week: It may be that women tend to agree with the male pattern of news selection at some times, but not at others. This variation is partially explained when weekly rhythms of practical newsgathering are examined. Journalists tend to be taught news judgment in relation to building beats, beats designed to produce enough news to rapidly fill the daily run, according to Tuchman. Spotlighting this sort of news can blind a journalist to other conditions that could be newsworthy.[185] Tuchman's idea seems to hold for

---

[185]Tuchman, Making News, 133.

weekday coverage. But on weekends, the daily run evaporates. Usually the building beats, with the exception of the police station, are closed on the weekends. The professional news judgment criteria cannot be applied as easily. Like the stars that appear only after the sun sets, non-traditional news stories tend to appear when the spotlight on traditional news criteria is turned off. At those times, editors can no longer allow the newsroom to operate on "automatic pilot." Editors must then look for ideas to turn into stories that can fill the news hole. It is not surprising that when searching for stories outside the traditionally covered buildings, women editors will think of stories that interest women, and men editors will think of stories that interest men.

Study Limitations

This study was limited in scope, applying only to certain Michigan newspapers in one particular week. No inferences can be drawn from results found here to populations that encompass broader boundaries of time or space.

Furthermore, the variance of female editors was limited by the 0-to-50-percent range of this population. It was not possible within this study's limits to discern a level of female editors representing a "critical mass." There was no indication of a dividing line for percentage of female editors when use of female sources or topics was examined. Since the Gallagher study of the image of women presented in

Sri Lanka Broadcasting Corporation content found that a level of 50 percent female workers coupled with 60 percent female managers had an impact,[186] it may be that the 50-percent ceiling on women managers found in this study is too low to have the effect on treatment of women sources and topics that a higher rate would find.

The conceptual basis of the study may also have limited its usefulness as well. While this study examined the impact of female managers on treatment of female sources and topics about women, the literature suggests that a major difference between the way men and women monitor their environments involves actions versus processes or events versus issues.[187] It may be that women treat news differently in that they place higher values on issues and processes than they do on actions and events.[188] Certainly, there is face validity in the assumption that, all other things being equal, women would tend to be more interested in stories about women than in stories about men. This study's examination of such gender differences in news copy, however, probably touches only a small aspect of news that is of particular interest to women.

---

[186]Gallagher, 108-09.

[187]Molotch, 181; and Tuchman, "The Newspaper," 201-02.

[188]Beasley, 187.

Suggestions for Further Study

In light of the limitations of this study, it would be valuable to examine the treatment of female sources and topics in a much larger sample of newspapers and over wider or different territories and times. It would also be interesting to see if women editors affect treatment of women in news columns more in group-owned newspapers than they do in independent newspapers. Independent newspapers would tend to be controlled more by individual personalities, while corporate goals often include an emphasis on having diversity in the newsroom.

A study including a wider variance in proportions of female editors would also be useful, but such a study might be difficult since editorial staffs with more than 50 percent females could be rare and difficult to find.

Since this study found a preference for use of female sources and topics on the weekends, it would also be interesting to focus study on the treatment of female sources and issues in relation to the building-beat structure of most newsrooms. It would be relatively easy to identify news cycles that produce little building-beat news: weekends and holidays. Content that appears after those cycles could be compared with content that appears after regular work-day cycles. Police news, which occurs throughout the week and on holidays, could be eliminated to take that factor out of the equation.

Since data in this study hinted that as much or more copy on women's topics may appear on Saturdays than on Sundays, a larger study that focuses on that question would be valuable. If this phenomenon were found to be true, it could be indicate a restriction on such stories or on women editors. Since the Sunday editions of the newspapers in this study have much higher circulation figures than their weekday counterparts,[189] it would be logical to assume that planning for Sunday editions would be emphasized by editors who are at the top of the managerial hierarchy. Saturday, a day when readership is not particularly high and when top editors are off from work, would probably receive less attention. It may be that women's topics thrive more when shaded from the glare of a male-dominated top management as well as when shaded from the glare of building-beat norms. This idea would echo Sigal's suggestion that women who want to depart from traditional reportage should gravitate toward sideline areas of the newsroom (such as women's pages) where traditional newsgathering routines do not dominate.[190] No conclusions about this issue can be drawn, however, without further study.

Furthermore, given the limitations of content analysis, a follow-up study that analyzes interview responses from editors of the newspapers included in this study might

---

[189]Editor and Publisher Company, I162-70.

[190]Sigal, "Defining News," 113-15.

provide some insight to explanations for the data that was found. Some areas to explore include the increased power or inclination of female editors to publish stories on female topics on weekends and their decreased power or inclination to give prominence to stories with female sources on weekends.

Also interesting would be a study of opinions of male and female editors and newspaper readers on the relative values of issues as opposed to events. While a gender difference is perceived on this subject by a number of commentators, no studies actually measure whether this difference exists, or to what extent it exists, among newspaper reporters and editors or among readers. Readership studies tend to center around standard divisions that sort news by topics (such as crime or health) rather than by type (such as event coverage or issue coverage). Such studies also typically fail to include news that does not regularly appear in newspapers. It is extremely difficult to determine if female readers are being served adequately by a newspaper without knowing what female readers want or need from a newspaper.

Recommendations

Education, of course, is one of the most important factors in changing news patterns that might exclude groups from coverage. While this study found that prominence of women in the community might affect their usage as sources more than gender of editors does, stories about women seem

to disappear when few women editors are around to promote them. One solution to that problem is to hire and promote more women. While this goal seems fair given the present composition of most news staffs, an ideal world would include men and women editors who are able to identify stories of particular interest to either gender. Female journalists have been required to learn to make news judgments that conform to criteria established by men. There is no reason that male journalists cannot learn to make news judgments that conform to female criteria as well. No studies have shown that male journalists are more difficult to train than female journalists. Furthermore, rigorous studies have shown that stereotypical thought processes can be overcome when better information is provided.[191] Education, along with research, would be the key to providing better information.

In the meantime, hiring and promoting women at newspapers seems to produce more news of interest to women, and such practices continue to be a relatively easy way to include more women's news -- at least on weekends.

Female editors should be alert to find stories that would be of interest to women. It may be that male editors sometime assume that they do not have to worry about including news for women if a female editor is available to worry about it. When female editors do find stories they

---

[191]Williams and Best, 328.

think would interest women, they should confidently negotiate to have such stories included in the budget. Male editors might ridicule the notion of elevating subjects such as parenting, women's careers or consumerism to the level of "important" news,[192] but few male editors quarrel with the notion of elevating the World Series or the Super Bowl to the category of "important" news. If coverage of male sports can make the front page even when it means sacrificing coverage of governmental meetings, it seems fair that coverage of news about day care availability for children or reports about the "glass ceiling" barring women from corporate advancement could make the front page as well.

Most importantly, women who care about the treatment of women in news columns should support one another and avoid giving up the battle in the face of discouragement. The late Joseph Campbell, professor of comparative mythology and author or editor of more than 20 books in the field, has said that men began dominating Indo-European society since about 1750 B.C. when the patriarchal Semites conquered Babylon, substituting male-oriented mythologies for the Mother Goddess mythologies that had prevailed in the areas of the Nile, the Tigris-Euphrates, the Indus and the Ganges. With the invasions, which began in the fourth millennium B.C. and became increasingly devastating to local societies, matriarchal societies were conquered. The male-dominated

---

[192]Carl Sessions Stepp, "When Readers Design The News," Washington Journalism Review (April 1991), 23.

societies of the invaders enforced a notion of paternalism that turned women into "booty" or "goods."[193] Whether Campbell - who is not associated with feminist scholarship - is correct about the timing of the appearance of male-dominated society, it is evident that male social domination has existed through most of the history of Western civilization. Social patterns that have existed for millennia cannot be changed easily or quickly.

Progress, however, is being made. At the opening of this century, women in the United States were not allowed to vote. At the end of this century, there is at least one newspaper in Michigan that has women in half of its editors' positions and at least one Michigan community in which women hold 44 percent of some key governmental positions. The results of this study show, too, that women in journalism not only can, but do, make a difference. That is an astonishing amount of progress in a time span that is merely a moment in terms of human history. Women should be encouraged by these gains. Those whose expectations outrun their possibilities could become too discouraged to attempt to make changes.

Such a failure would be a grave mistake. Today seems to be a time when newspaper managers are ready and willing to make changes. Trade publications are full of articles outlining steps managers are taking to change their

---

[193]Joseph Campbell, The Power of Myth (New York: Doubleday, 1988), 170-71.

publications in the face of declining readership.[194] Publishers seem willing to change focus, graphics, emphasis and even news definitions in an effort to attract new readers and retain old ones. They are looking for answers from marketing experts, focus groups, competitors and even television. Maybe, just maybe, they might soon be willing to ask women.

---

[194]Examples include Louis Peck, "Anger In The Newsroom," Washington Journalism Review (December 1991), 22-27, and Stepp, 20-24.

APPENDICES

APPENDIX A

APPENDIX A

Newspaper Edition Coding Sheet

CODER NAME_____

V1.(1-2) Newspaper Number _____ V2. (3-4) Date_____

V3.(5-6) Community percentage of female officials _____

V4.(7-8) Total number of articles _____

V5.(9-13) Total square inches_____

V6.(14-15) Number of articles with female sources _____

V7.(16-20) Square inches of articles with female sources ____

V8.(21-22) Article number without female sources _____

V9.(23-27) Square inches of articles without female sources _____

V10.(28-30) Total number of sources used _____

V11.(31-33) Total number of female sources used _____

V12.(34-35) Number of stories relating to women _____

V13.(36-40) Square inches of stories relating to women _____

V14.(41-42) Number of stories not related to women _____

V15.(43-47) Square inches of stories not related to women _____

V16.(48-49) Number of stories related to government _____

V17.(50-54) Square inches of stories related to government _____

V18.(55-57) Average prominence for female sources or topics _____

V19.(58-60) Average prominence for stories without female sources, topics _____

V20.(61-62) Number of male bylines ____

V21.(63-64) Number of female bylines _____

V22.(65-66) Number of undetermined bylines ____

V23.(67-71) Circulation in thousands _____

APPENDIX A

Coding Work Sheet

Newspaper _____ Date _____ Day_____

Art #	Female Sources					Topic		P	Byline		
	Yes	No	T#	#FS	F	NF	G		M	F	?
Total											

APPENDIX A

Prominence Rating Work Sheet

Use the following formula to compute prominence rating for stories relating to women:

Newspaper _____ Date_____ Art. #_____

Appears on page 1 (1 point)	___
Appears on page 1 or section front (1 point)	___
Headline of 2 or more columns (1 point)	___
First line runs above the fold (1 point)	___
At least 3/4 column used (1 point)	___
Runs with related art (1 point)	___
Total Prominence Score	____

Prominence Rating Work Sheet

Use the following formula to compute prominence rating for stories relating to women:

Newspaper _____ Date_____ Art. #_____

Appears on page 1 (1 point)	___
Appears on page 1 or section front (1 point)	___
Headline of 2 or more columns (1 point)	___
First line runs above the fold (1 point)	___
At least 3/4 column used (1 point)	___
Runs with related art (1 point)	___
Total Prominence Score	____

Prominence Rating Work Sheet

Use the following formula to compute prominence rating for stories relating to women:

Newspaper _____ Date_____ Art. #_____

Appears on page 1 (1 point)	___
Appears on page 1 or section front (1 point)	___
Headline of 2 or more columns (1 point)	___
First line runs above the fold (1 point)	___
At least 3/4 column used (1 point)	___
Runs with related art (1 point)	___
Total Prominence Score	____

APPENDIX A

CODING INSTRUCTIONS

Universe

Publications selected for this study are The Lansing State Journal, The Battle Creek Enquirer, The Detroit Free Press, The Detroit News, The Muskegon Chronicle and The Bay City Times. The study will examine one edition of each newspaper on each day from August 5, 1991, through August 11, 1991, giving a total of seven editions of each publication.

Only the first section, the local news section and the business section are included in this study. Omit sports, lifestyle, television guides, weekend supplements and the like. Excluded also are all articles in special, supplemental or advertising sections published in relation to a season, product or event. Examples are Christmas gift guides, spring clean-up or gardening sections, annual automobile buying guides and county fair supplements.

Since this is a study of the influence of women managers on news coverage produced by reporters and editors who work under them, only locally produced stories with name bylines will be selected for coding. Excluded will be wire-service and syndicated copy, editorial page copy, news round-up or briefs columns, photographs without accompanying stories and advertising. If a story has a byline without a

APPENDIX A

wire or syndication credit line or emblem, assume that it was produced locally by a staff member or some other local reporter or writer under the supervision of local editors. Therefore, the story should be included in the selected universe of the study. Stories credited, however, to nameless "staff", "staff and wire reports" or any description of news service or wire service will be excluded since they tend to be either event round-ups where discretionary source and topic selection is limited or stories produced by reporters who are not directly influenced by the paper's management. Include state capital bureaus, but exclude foreign and Washington bureaus.

Also excluded will be signed, regularly published columns by journalists and members of the public. This exclusion eliminates standing columns containing opinion or advice, including letters to the editor and op-ed columns. The reason for this exclusion is that columnists generally have more autonomy in column writing than staff writers have. Therefore, influence or direction by managers is usually minimal.

APPENDIX A

PROCEDURE

Measuring:

Measure from the beginning of the type at the left margin to the widest point at the right margin, rounding to an eighth of an inch. Then measure from the top of the first capital letter at the story beginning to the lowest descender below the bottom line, rounding to an eighth of an inch. Repeat the measurements for each column of type, including the jumps (but not the jump reference lines), while excluding any graphic items inserted within the type. Convert fractions into decimals as in the following list:

1/8 = .125; 1/4 = .25; 3/8 = .375; 1/2 = .5;

5/8 = .625; 3/4 = .75; 7/8 = .875

Multiply each width section by each length section and add the products together for the article figure.

Total each square-inch column and then round the total to the nearest half inch before recording the total at the foot of the column. If the total equals exactly at a quarter-inch level, round up.

The square inches of the coded stories should include only body copy. Headlines, bylines, pull quotes in larger type and other graphic paraphernalia are excluded. Tables and lists accompanying stories are to be excluded as graphic paraphernalia.

APPENDIX A

Definitions

Source: A source is defined as a person who is credited with providing any information in the story. A source may be quoted directly, indirectly or through any other form of attribution. Any verbs of attribution are accepted here as long as it is clear that the source rather than the author is providing the information. For instance, "he felt" would normally be considered as a source attribution unless it is obvious that the writer is speculating about the feelings of someone who is dead or otherwise unavailable for comment. Do not include as sources generic and documentary sources such as "police," "the company" or "court records." Someone who is listed as refusing to comment is also a source, but someone who was unavailable for comment is not. A person quoted by another person is not a source. A person quoted from court documents or during a trial is.

Female Source: To be identified as a female source, the source must have an obviously feminine first name. If the name seems ambiguous, the source must be identified as a female either directly or by other means such as a photograph, the use of a title (such as "Mrs."), a pronoun ("she") or a job description or social classification ("authoress", "waitress" or "mother"). For the sake of consistency, "other means" does not include personal knowledge of the source.

APPENDIX A

Primary Topic: The topic of a story is the subject being reported or discussed in the article. To be a primary topic, the topic must occupy 50 percent or more of the story.

Stories that relate to women: Stories must identify themselves as relating to women. They are stories with primary topics that recount the actions of or information about women or that relate or predict the effects of news on women. The category of "women" includes women in general, one or more particular woman, one or more women's organizations or any social or political category of women. Examples could include stories that deal with the life span of women in America, actions of the League of Women Voters, women who are registered as Republicans, women with breast cancer, poor mothers, abortion or career women. In addition, individual women newsmakers will be included if the focus of the story is about one or more women or their accomplishments, experiences or opinions. Examples might include stories about a woman who has reared two dozen foster children or a woman who has been honored by the American Institute of Architects or the National Association for the Advancement of Colored People. Whether the portrayal is positive or negative is not a factor.

Stories that relate to government: A story is defined as relating to government if the entire story or any portion

APPENDIX A

of it deals with the actions, reactions or information about the city mayor, the city council or the board of education. These stories must be about the city in which the newspaper is located rather than suburban or outlying towns.

APPENDIX A

Coding Work Sheet

The coding work sheet is to be used to record coding of numbered articles, and the article number should be listed under the left-hand column.

Sources: In the sources section, the coder should fill in the square inches of each article in the appropriate box under Female Sources.

Columns are labeled "Yes" for stories that contain one or more identifiable female sources and "No" for stories that do not contain female sources. The total number of persons named as sources should be listed under the column headed "T#." The total number of female sources should be listed under the column "#FS."

Vague and broad references to sources such as "police said," "the company said" and "leaders said" should be ignored entirely. If such references are the only sources used in a story, the story will contain no sources and zero should be entered in the "T#" column.

Topic/Gender: This category concerns topics of stories or of information contained in stories rather than sources of stories. To avoid confusing the different level of coding decision, the coder may prefer to code all the articles according to source usage and then go back through them to record according to topic.

APPENDIX A

In the topic category columns, the coder should enter square inches under "F" for primary topics that relate to women and "NF" for primary topics that are not designated as feminine. This means the square inches of the story will be recorded twice on each horizontal line. This is necessary to accommodate totals for the coding sheet.

Remember that primary topics are those that occupy 50 percent or more of the story.

Note that a person's action as a source is not included in this category. Exclude stories that report the actions of a woman when her action is simply giving information on a non-female topic. She would here be coded only as a source. A story that uses quotes from a woman who is being profiled in a feature on her job or life or career in crime would be included because the topic of the story is the life or actions of the woman. She, too, would be coded as a source, but she would also be coded as a female story topic. However, if the story simply quotes a woman on the subject of zoning regulations or education reform, the topic of the story is not the woman but the subject under discussion. In these examples, the subjects of discussion do not relate particularly to women and, therefore, would be listed in the "NF" column.

Whether the story portrays women in a positive or negative light is not a factor in the coding.

APPENDIX A

Topic/Government: Under Topic, the coder should also enter the square inches of the story in column "G" if the topic relates to government. Please refer to the definition of government as including only the listed segments of government: mayor, city council and board of education. If the story does not relate to one of these entities, its square inches should be listed under the "NG" for "not governmental" column.

Note that each story must be coded on two different topic questions or levels. Therefore, each story can be placed in two topic columns. First, every story is listed in a gender column. Then the coder must decide if the story relates to a coded government category. If so, it is also placed in the government column.

Prominence: The prominence score for all stories should be listed according to the score compiled from the prominence rating work sheet as outlined below.

Bylines: Check whether the byline is male (M), female (F) or indeterminate (?). Count the byline as male if it is an obviously male name, such as Patrick, Sam or Mike. Count it as female if it is obviously female, such as Joan, Susan or Elaine.

If the name can be male or female, such as E.B., Chris or Pat, count it as not determined and list it under the column headed by a question mark. Also list bylines under the "?" column if a story has a multiple or double byline

when the author's names do not fall into the same category. This will occur if one name is female and the other male or if one is male and the other indeterminate.

Totals: In the last line on the work sheet, list the total square inches in each source category, the number of female sources, the square inches of each topic category and the number of bylines in each of the three byline columns.

Prominence Rating Work Sheet

Coder should note on each article selected the newspaper number, the daily date, the day of the week and an article number, starting with 1 and continuing through the selection. Then the location of the article should be noted in order to complete the prominence scale giving points for the following criteria:

1. Page 1 defines itself.

2. Section fronts are pages that are identified as the beginning of a news category. Examples are front page, first page of local news section or first page of business section even when the section fronts appear inside the fold of the paper. Note that by giving front page stories an additional point here, the total score for front page display is doubled.

3. Headlines of two or more columns should be apparent.

4. Ignore headlines and art here. Give a point only if the first line of the text is below the fold.

APPENDIX A

5. A point is given for stories that use more than 3/4 of the column. In this estimate, include all graphic paraphernalia. This includes pull quotes, photographs, drawings, tables, boxes with lists or statistics, headline and byline. All such material must be packaged together, but copy that jumps to another page is included in the measurement.

Three-fourths of a column in each newspaper in this study is the following quantity of square inches:

The Lansing State Journal	33.5
The Battle Creek Enquirer	31.5
The Detroit News	32.25
The Detroit Free Press	32.25
The Muskegon Chronicle	33.5
The Bay City Times	32

6. A point for related art is given for photographs, line drawings, tables and the like, but no point is given under "related art" for headlines and pull quotes. Make sure to note, however, art that may be run on the first page or the section page with a "refer" note guiding the reader to an inside story. Such art should be included here even though it does not run next to the story.

Add the points listed for the total score.

APPENDIX A

Newspaper Edition Coding Sheet

The newspaper edition coding sheet is used to code all articles selected as a part of the universe in any day's edition of a particular publication. There is one newspaper edition coding sheet for each edition of each newspaper. Totals for cumulative blanks on the form can be ascertained by use of the coding work sheet.

Coded items are listed by variable number with column numbers for computer loading enclosed in parentheses. Zeros must be entered to fill out unneeded columns at the beginning of variables.

The coder name is not assigned a variable number because it will not be a factor in this study beyond the establishment of inter-coder reliability. It is included, however, for future reference.

V1. (col. 1-2) Newspapers are assigned the following numbers that correspond to the percentage of women decision makers at the publications:

The Lansing State Journal	50
The Battle Creek Enquirer	38
The Detroit Free Press	33
The Detroit News	27
The Muskegon Chronicle	10
The Bay City Times	00

APPENDIX A

V2. (col. 3-4) Since all articles were published in the same month, August 1991, only the two-digit daily date is needed here.

V3. (col. 5-6) The percentage of females occupying governmental positions that include mayor, city council or commission and board of education have been ascertained by the author. They are:

Battle Creek	12%	Lansing	44%
Detroit	26%	Muskegon	27%
Bay City	29%		

V4.(col. 7-8) The number of all the articles coded in the edition should be listed here.

V5. (col. 9-12) Total square inches coded in the edition is entered here. Compute the this amount by adding together the totals found at the bottom of the first two columns of each coding work sheet used for the edition.

V6. (col. 13-14) List the number of articles that include female sources.

V7. (col. 15-18) Transfer the total square inches of articles that use female sources to this position.

V8. (col. 19-20) Total the number of articles without female sources.

V9. (col. 21-24) Total the square inches of articles without female sources.

V10. (col. 25-27) Total the number of sources used in the edition.

APPENDIX A

V11. (col. 28-30) List the total number of female sources.

V12. (col. 31-32) Total the number of stories that relate to women.

V13. (col. 33-36) Total the square inches of articles that relate to women.

V14. (col. 37-38) List the number of stories that do not relate to women.

V15. (col. 39-42) Enter the square inches of stories that do not relate to women.

V16. (col. 43-44) Give the number of stories that relate to government.

V17. (col. 44-48) Total the square inches of stories relating to government.

V18. (col. 49-50) Find the prominence scores for stories with female sources or topics. Add them together and divide by the number of stories in the category. Round to one decimal place. This gives the average prominence score.

V19. (col. 51-52) Find the prominence scores for stories with no female sources or topics. Add them together and divide by the number of stories involved. Round to one decimal place. This gives the average prominence score.

V20. (col. 53-54) Total the number of male bylines.

V21. (col. 55-56) Total the number of female bylines.

V22. (col. 57-58) Total the number of stories with ambiguous bylines.

APPENDIX A

V23. (col. 59-62) Insert the circulation total for the newspaper in thousands. Rounded to one decimal point, the circulation figures are:

Lansing State Journal	69.8
Battle Creek Enquirer	29.2
Detroit Free Press	636.2
Detroit News	501.0
Muskegon Chronicle	47.6
Bay City Times	40.2

APPENDIX A

Frequent Reference List

Convert fractions into decimals as in the following list:

1/8 = .125; 1/4 = .25; 3/8 = .375; 1/2 = .5;

5/8 = .625; 3/4 = .75; 7/8 = .875

Three-fourths of a column in each newspaper in this study is the following quantity of square inches:

The Lansing State Journal	33.5
The Battle Creek Enquirer	31.5
The Detroit News	32.25
The Detroit Free Press	32.25
The Muskegon Chronicle	33.5
The Bay City Times	32

Newspapers are assigned the following numbers that correspond to the percentage of women decision makers at the publications:

The Lansing State Journal	50
The Battle Creek Enquirer	38
The Detroit Free Press	33
The Detroit News	27
The Muskegon Chronicle	10
The Bay City Times	00

APPENDIX A

The percentage of females occupying governmental positions that include mayor, city council or commission and board of education have been ascertained by the author. They are:

Battle Creek	12%	Lansing	44%
Detroit	26%	Muskegon	27%
Bay City	29%		

Rounded to one decimal point, the circulation figures are:

Lansing State Journal	69.8
Battle Creek Enquirer	29.2
Detroit Free Press	636.2
Detroit News	501.0
Muskegon Chronicle	47.6
Bay City Times	40.2

APPENDIX B

APPENDIX B

TABLE 12. PEARSON'S CORRELATION COEFFICIENTS RELATING TREATMENT OF WOMEN SOURCES AND TOPICS IN NEWS CONTENT TO NEWSPAPER AND COMMUNITY CHARACTERISTICS

Percentage of:	% of Females as			Newspaper	
	Editor	Community Officials	Bylined Reporters	Circ.	Date
Articles with female sources	-.09	.06	.03	-.21	.23
Space with female sources	.02	.13	.02	-.20	.29
Female sources used	.24	.39	.07	-.14	.13
Articles with female topics	.27	-.25	.05	.29	.10
Space for female topics	.32	-.17	-.04	.22	.16
Articles with government topics	-.13	.02	.02	-.18	-.14
Space for government topics	-.16	-.01	.10	-.16	-.08

BIBLIOGRAPHY

BIBLIOGRAPHY

Allen, Donna. "From Opportunity to Strategy: Women Contribute to the Communications Future." In Communications at the Crossroads: The Gender Gap Connection, Ramona R. Rush and Donna Allen, eds. Norwood, N.J.: Ablex, 1989: 59-79.

Allen, Virginia, Catherine East and Dorothy Jurney. New Directions for News. Washington, D.C.: American Society of Newspaper Editors and The Women Studies Program and Policy Center of The George Washington University, 1983.

Anderson, Margaret L. Thinking About Women. New York: Macmillan, 1983.

Beasley, Maurine H. "Newspapers: Is There a New Majority Defining the News?" In Women In Mass Communication: Challenging Gender Values, Pamela J. Creedon, ed. Newbury Park: Sage, 1989: 180-94.

_____ , and Kathryn T. Theus, The New Majority. Lanham, Md.: University Press of America, 1988.

Blackwood, Roy E. "The Content of News Photos: Roles Portrayed by Men and Women." Journalism Quarterly 60 (Winter 1983): 710-714.

Breed, Warren. "Mass Communication and Sociocultural Integration." In People, Society, and Mass Communications, Lewis Anthony Dexter and David Manning White, eds. London: The Free Press of Glencoe, 1964: 183-204.

_____. "Social Control in the Newsroom: A Functional Analysis." Social Forces (May 1955): 326-335.

Brown, Judy. Lansing Board of Education secretary. Telephone interview by author, August 9, 1991.

Broverman, Inge K., Susan Raymond Vogel, Donald M. Broverman, Frank E. Clarkson and Paul S. Rosenkrantz. "Sex-Role Stereotypes: A Current Appraisal." Journal of Social Issues 28:2 (1972): 59-78.

Budd, Richard W. "Attention Score: A Device for Measuring News `Play'." Journalism Quarterly 44 (Spring 1964): 259-62.

Butler, Matilda, and William Paisley. Women and The Mass Media: Sourcebook for Research and Action. New York: Human Sciences Press, 1980.

Calbaugh, Marilyn. Battle Creek city clerk secretary. Telephone interview by author, August 9, 1991.

Campbell, Joseph. The Power of Myth. New York: Doubleday, 1988.

Carroll, Jennifer. Managing editor, The Lansing State Journal. Telephone interview by author, August 2, 1991.

Center for Media and Public Affairs. "Roe v. Webster: Media Coverage of the Abortion Debate." Media Monitor 3 (October 1989): 1-6.

Chang, Won H. "Characteristics and Self Perceptions of Women's Page Editors." Journalism Quarterly 52 (Spring 1975): 61-65.

Cirksena, Kathryn. "Women's Liberation from Spirals of Silence: The Need for Feminist Studies in Mass Communication Research." In Communications at the Crossroads: The Gender Gap Connection, Ramona R. Rush and Donna Allen, eds. Norwood, N.J.: Ablex, 1989: 46-58.

Cooper, Anne Messerly. "Suffrage As News: Ten Dailies' Coverage of the Nineteenth Amendment." American Journalism 1 (Summer 1983): 75-90.

_____ and Lucinda D. Davenport. "Newspaper Coverage of International Women's Decade: Feminism and Conflict." Journal of Communication Studies 11:1 (1987): 108-115.

Creedon, Pamela J. "The Challenge of Re-Visioning Gender Values." In Women in Mass Communication: Challenging Gender Values, Pamela J. Creedon, ed. Newbury Park: Sage, 1989: 13-33.

Davis, Junetta. "Sexist Bias in Eight Newspapers." Journalism Quarterly 59 (Winter 1982): 456-460.

Drew, Dan G., and Susan H. Miller. "Sex Stereotyping and Reporting." Journalism Quarterly 54 (Spring 1977): 142-146.

Eaton, William. "Scorecard." Nieman Reports 33 (Summer 1979): 49-50.

Editor and Publisher Company. The International Yearbook. New York: Editor & Publisher, 1991.

Ellias, Marian. "No Happy Medium: oPRESSion." In Rooms With No View: A Woman's Guide to the Man's World of the Media, Ethel Strainchamps, ed. New York: Harper & Row, 1974: 235-245.

Fico, Frederick. "A Comparison of Legislative Sources in Newspaper & Wire Service Stories." Newspaper Research Journal 5 (Spring 1984): 35-43.

_____. "Replication of Findings in Newspaper & Wire Service Source Use in Statehouse Coverage." Newspaper Research Journal 7 (Fall 1985): 45-51.

Foreit, Karen G., Terna Agor, Johnny Byers, John Larue, Helen Lokey, Michael Palazzini, Michele Patterson and Lillian Smith. "Sex Bias in Newspaper Treatment of Male-Centered and Female-Centered News Stories." Sex Roles 6:3 (1980): 475-480.

Friedan, Betty. The Feminine Mystique. New York: A.W. Norton, 1963.

Gallagher, Margaret. Unequal opportunities: The case of women and the media. Paris: UNESCO, 1981.

Gallanti, Tina. Lansing City Council secretary. Telephone interview by author, August 9, 1991.

Gatti, James, deputy news editor, The Detroit News. Telephone interview by author. August 1, 1991.

Gergen, Mary McCanney. Feminist Thought and the Structure of Knowledge. Albany, N.Y.: State University of New York Press, 1988.

Gieber, Walter. "News Is What Newspapermen Make It." In People, Society, and Mass Communications, Lewis Anthony Dexter and David Manning White, eds. London: The Free Press of Glencoe, 1964: 173-182.

Giese, Elizabeth H. "More about women." Lansing State Journal. July 7, 1991, 11A.

Greenwald, Marilyn S. "Gender Representation in Newspaper Business Sections." Newspaper Research Journal 11 (Winter, 1990): 68-74.

Gregg, Nina. "Reflections on the Feminist Critique of Objectivity." Journal of Communication Studies 11:1 (1987): 8-18.

Guenin, Zena Beth. "Women's Pages in American Newspapers." Journalism Quarterly 52 (Spring 1975): 66-69.

Haynes, Beverly. Detroit City Council secretary. Telephone interview by author, August 9, 1991.

Hirsch, Paul M. "Occupational, Organizational, and Institutional Models in Mass Media Research: Toward an Integrated Framework." In Strategies for Communication Research, Paul M. Hirsch, Peter V. Miller and F. Gerald Kline, eds. Beverly Hills: Sage, 1977: 13-42.

Holsti, Ole R. Content Analysis for the Social Sciences and Humanities. Reading, Mass.: Addison-Wesley Publishing, 1969.

Hooks, Bell. "Feminism: A Movement to End Sexist Oppression," in Feminism and Equality, Anne Phillips, ed. Oxford, Basil Blackwell Ltd., 1987: 62-76.

Humphrey, Laura. Muskegon education superintendent secretary. Telephone interview by author, August. 9, 1991.

Jolliffe, Lee B. "Comparing Gender Differentiation in the New York Times, 1885 and 1985." Journalism Quarterly 66 (Autumn 1989): 683-691.

Johnson, Sammye, and William G. Christ. "Women Through Time: Who Gets Covered?" Journalism Quarterly 65 (Winter 1988): 889-897.

Joseph, Ted. "Reporters' and Editors' Preferences Toward Reporter Decision Making." Journalism Quarterly 59 (Summer 1982): 219-222, 248.

Karaba, Kathy. Battle Creek Board of Education secretary. Telephone interview by author, August 9, 1991.

Krippendorff, Klaus. Content Analysis: An Introduction to Its Methodology. Beverly Hills, Calif.: Sage Publications, 1980.

Lazarsfeld, Paul H., and Robert K. Merton. "Mass Communication, Popular Taste and Organized Social Action." In Mass Communications, Wilbur Schramm, ed. Urbana: University of Illinois Press, 1960: 501-506.

Leifeld, Ellen. Executive editor, The Battle Creek Enquirer. Telephone interview by author, August 1, 1991.

Lippmann, Walter. Public Opinion. New York: Macmillan, 1970.

Longstaff, Robert. Editor, The Bay City Times. Telephone interview by author, August 1, 1991.

Lupo, Lee. Assistant metro editor, The Muskegon Chronicle. Telephone interview by author, August 1, 1991.

Merritt, Sharyne, and Harriet Gross. "Women's Page/Lifestyle Editors: Does Sex Make a Difference?" Journalism Quarterly 55 (Winter 1978): 508-514.

Miller, Susan H. "Changes in Women's/Lifestyle Sections." Journalism Quarterly 53 (Winter 1976): 641-647.

_____. "News Coverage of Congress: the Search For the Ultimate Spokesman." Journalism Quarterly 54 (Autumn 1977): 459-465.

_____. "The Content of News Photos: Women's and Men's Roles." Journalism Quarterly 52 (Spring 1975): 70-75.

_____. "Was `Pink Collar' ghetto study deliberate sensationalism?" Editor & Publisher 118 (November 23, 1985): 52, 32-33.

Mills, Kay. A Place in the News. New York: Dodd, Mead & Co., 1988.

Molotch, Harvey L. "The News of Women and the Work of Men." In Hearth and Home: Images of Women in the Mass Media, Gaye Tuchman, Arlene Kaplan Daniels and James Benit, eds. New York: Oxford University Press, 1978: 176-185.

Morgan, Robin. Going Too Far. New York: Random House, 1977.

Morris, Monica B. "Newspapers and the New Feminists: Black Out as Social Control?" Journalism Quarterly 50 (Spring, 1973): 27-420.

Newland, Kathleen. "Women in Words and Pictures." In The Sisterhood of Man, Kathleen Newland, ed. New York: W.W. Norton, 1979. Reprinted in Nieman Reports 33:2 (Summer 1979): 59-69.

Nicholson, Pat. Detroit Board of Education secretary. Telephone interview by author, August 9, 1991.

Ogan, Christine L. "Life at the Top for Men and Women Newspaper Managers: A Five-Year Update of Their Characteristics." Newspaper Research Journal 5 (Winter, 1983): 57-68.

_____. "On Their Way to the Top? Men and Women Men Mid-Level Newspaper Managers." Newspaper Research Journal 1:3 (May y 1980): 51-62.

_____ and David H. Weaver. "Job Satisfaction in Selected U.S. Daily Newspapers: A Study of Male and Female Top-Level Managers." Mass Comm Review 6:1 (Winter 1978-79): 20-26.

Orwant, Jack E., and Muriel G. Cantor. "How Sex Stereotyping Affects Perceptions of News Preferences." Journalism Quarterly 54 (Spring 1977): 99-108, 139.

Pagano, Robert R. Understanding Statistics in the behavioral sciences. St. Paul, Minn.: West Publishing Co., 1981.

Peck, Louis. "Anger In The Newsroom." Washington Journalism Review. (December 1991): 22-27.

Pingree, Suzanne, and Robert P. Hawkins. "News Definitions and Their Effects on Women." In Women and the News, Laurily Keir Epstein, ed. New York: Hastings House, 1978: 116-133.

_____, Robert Parker Hawkins, Matilda Butler and William Paisley. "A Scale for Sexism." Journal of Communication 26:4 (Autumn 1976): 193-201.

Reis, Harry T., and Stephanie Wright. "Knowledge of Sex-Role Stereotypes in Children Aged 3 to 5." Sex Roles 8:10 (1982): 1049-1056.

Revette, Melissa. Bay City Board of Education secretary. Telephone interview by author, August 9, 1991.

Rice, Patricia. "Women Out of the Myth and Into Focus." In Women and the News, Laurily Keir Epstein, ed. New York: Hastings House, 1978: 38-49.

Robinson, Gertrude Jock. "Women, Media Access and Social Control." Women and the News, Laurily Keir Epstein, ed. New York: Hastings House, 1978: 87-107.

Ruble, Thomas L. "Sex Stereotypes: Issues of Change in the 1970s." Sex Roles 9:3 (1983): 397-402.

Schein, Virginia Ellen. "The Relationship Between Sex Role Stereotypes and Requisite Management Characteristics." Journal of Applied Psychology 57:2 (1973): 95-100.

Schultz-Brooks, Terri. "Getting there: women in the newsroom." Columbia Journalism Review. (March/April 1984): 25-31.

Schweitzer, John C., and Jay Miller. "What do newswomen cover?" Newspaper Research Journal 12 (Spring 1991): 72-80.

Scola, Debbie Sazerzan. Assistant to the managing editor, The Detroit Free Press. Telephone interview by author, August 1, 1991.

Seiter, Ellen. "Stereotypes and the Media; A Re-evaluation." Journal of Communication (Spring 1986): 14-26.

Sigal, Leon V. "Defining News - Organizationally: News Definitions in Practice." In Women and the News, Laurily Keir Epstein, ed. New York: Hastings House, 1978: 109-115.

_____. Reporters and Officials. Lexington, Mass.: D.C. Heath & Co., 1973.

Sigelman, Lee. "Reporting the News: An Organizational Analysis." American Journal of Sociology 79 (July 1973): 132-151.

Silver, Diane. "A Comparison of Newspaper Coverage of Male and Female Officials in Michigan." Journalism Quarterly 63 (Spring 1986): 144-49.

Simpson, Peggy A. "Covering the Women's Movement." Nieman Reports 33:2 (Summer 1979): 19-23.

Stanton, E., S. Anthony and M. Gage, eds. History of Women Suffrage 4. Rochester, N.Y.: Charles Mann, 1889.

Stempel, Guido H. III. "Increasing Reliability in Content Analysis." Journalism Quarterly 32 (Fall 1955): 449-455.

Stepp, Carl Sessions. "When Readers Design The News." Washington Journalism Review (April 1991): 20-24.

Tuchman, Gaye. Making News: A Study in the Construction of Reality. New York: The Free Press, 1978.

_____. "The Exception Proves the Rule: The Study of Routine News Practices." In Strategies for Communication Research, Paul M. Hirsch, Peter V. Miller and F. Gerald Kline, eds. Beverly Hills: Sage, 1972: 43-62.

_____. "The Newspaper as a Social Movement's Resource." In Hearth and Home: Images of Women in the Mass Media, Gaye Tuchman, Arlene Kaplan Daniels and James Benit, eds. New York: Oxford University Press, 1978: 186-215.

_____. "Women's Depiction by the Mass Media." Signs 4 (Spring 1979): 528-542.

Turk, Judy VanSlyke. "Sex-Role Stereotyping in Writing the News." Journalism Quarterly 64 (Summer/Autumn 1987): 613-617.

Wanta, Wayne, and Dawn Leggett. "Gender Stereotypes in Wire Services Sports Photos." Newspaper Research Journal 10 (Spring 1989): 105-114.

Walker, Lorraine. Bay City Commission secretary. Telephone interview by author, August 9, 1991.

Webster's New World Dictionary, rev. ed. S.v. "feminism."

Wernstron, Marilyn. Muskegon city clerk's secretary. Telephone interview by author, August 9, 1991.

White, D. M. "The Gatekeeper: A Case Study in the Selection of News." Journalism Quarterly 27 (Fall, 1950): 383-390.

Whitlow, S. Scott. "How Male and Female Gatekeepers Respond to News Stories of Women." Journalism Quarterly 54 (Autumn, 1977): 573-579, 609.

_____. "Private Images Gatekeepers Bring to News of Public Women." Mass Comm Review 6:1 (Winter 1978/1979): 10-16.

Williams, John E., and Deborah L. Best. Measuring Sex Stereotypes. Cross-Cultural Research and Methodology Series 6. Newbury Park, Calif.: Sage, 1990.

Wilson, Jean Gaddy. "Future Directions for Females in the Media." In Communication at the Crossroads, Ramona R.Rush and Donna Allen, eds. Norwood, N.J.: Ablex, 1989: 160-174.

Wimmer, Roger D., and Joseph R. Dominick. Mass Media Research. Belmont, Calif.: Wadsworth Publishing Co., 1987.

Wright, Boyd. "Person the Lifeboats! The Language is Sinking!" and "Kissing `The Girls' Goodbye: A Panel Discussion." Columbia Journalism Review (May/June 1975): 28-33.