

“WHAT ONE MAN CAN INVENT, ANOTHER CAN DISCOVER”  
MUSIC AND THE TRANSFORMATION OF SHERLOCK HOLMES FROM  
LITERARY GENTLEMAN DETECTIVE TO ON-SCREEN ROMANTIC GENIUS

By

Emily Michelle Baumgart

A THESIS

Submitted to  
Michigan State University  
in partial fulfillment of the requirements  
for the degree of

Musicology – Master of Arts

2015

## ABSTRACT

### “WHAT ONE MAN CAN INVENT, ANOTHER CAN DISCOVER” MUSIC AND THE TRANSFORMATION OF SHERLOCK HOLMES FROM LITERARY GENTLEMAN DETECTIVE TO ON-SCREEN ROMANTIC GENIUS

By

Emily Michelle Baumgart

Arguably one of the most famous literary characters of all time, Sherlock Holmes has appeared in numerous forms of media since his inception in 1887. With the recent growth of on-screen adaptations in both film and serial television forms, there is much new material to be analyzed and discussed. However, recent adaptations have begun exploring new reimaginings of Holmes, discarding his beginnings as the Victorian Gentleman Detective to create a much more flawed and multi-faceted character. Using Sir Arthur Conan Doyle’s original work as a reference point, this study explores how recent adaptors use both Holmes’s diegetic violin performance and extra-diegetic music. Not only does music in these screen adaptations take the role of narrative agent, it moreover serves to place the character of Holmes into the Romantic Genius archetype.

Copyright by  
EMILY MICHELLE BAUMGART  
2015

## .ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I am incredibly grateful to my advisor Dr. Kevin Bartig for his expertise, guidance, patience and good humor while helping me complete this document. Thank you also to my committee members Dr. Joanna Bosse and Dr. Michael Largey for their new perspectives and ideas.

I am indebted to the British Film Institute and the Sir Arthur Conan Doyle Richard Lancelyn Green Collection for their invaluable materials that made this study possible.

I also need to acknowledge my family for their love, encouragement, and editing help, and my fellow Sherlockians for their feedback and support.

“Education never ends, Watson. It is a series of lessons, with the greatest for the last.”

-Sherlock Holmes, *The Adventure of the Red Circle*

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

LIST OF TABLES .....	vi
Chapter 1: Introduction .....	1
Adaptation Studies .....	4
Literary Archetypes .....	9
Chapter 2: Holmes the Musician on the Written Page.....	14
Chapter 3: Holmes the Performer in Screen Adaptations .....	24
Iconic Violin Usage .....	25
<i>The Private Life of Sherlock Holmes</i> (1970): Gay, Mistaken, and Taking Dope.....	28
<i>Sherlock Holmes</i> (2009); <i>Sherlock Holmes: A Game of Shadows</i> (2011): “Manic Verging on Psychotic” .....	32
<i>Elementary</i> (2011- ): Heroin and Sober Companions .....	35
<i>The Adventures of Sherlock Holmes</i> (1984-1994): “An Isolated, Lonely Man” .....	39
<i>Sherlock</i> (2010- ): “Sentiment is a Chemical Defect” .....	42
Chapter 4: Narration and the Extra-Diegesis .....	50
Narration and Character Identities .....	50
The Extra-Diegetic Score .....	56
<i>The Adventures of Sherlock Holmes</i> (1984-1994) .....	61
<i>Sherlock</i> (2010- ): .....	64
Conclusion .....	67
APPENDIX.....	69
BIBLIOGRAPHY.....	71

## LIST OF TABLES

Table 1: Chronological Table of Referenced Holmes Adaptations .....	70
---	----

## Chapter 1: Introduction

*“I have something for you, Herr Holmes,” Freud said as he re-entered the room, carrying a violin case. “Not a Stradivarius – it belonged to an uncle of mine. I thought you might like to use it while you are here.”*

*“Thank you for this.”*

*They expect Holmes to take the violin out and play, but he doesn’t. Instead, he carefully closes the catches of the case and sets it down. The others steal glances at each other as Holmes appears to be absorbed in his plate of cold food.*

*Next scene: Night. All the lights are out. Clearly everyone is asleep – But we hear the sound of a lone violin intoning the most unhappy, mournful air. It is heart-breaking. We hear a snatch of ‘The Blue Danube.’ At one point, the music stops, a string or two is plucked and tuned, then the music starts again for a few moments. Then it stops point blank in the middle of the note.*

*The house sits in silence.<sup>1</sup>*

In 2012, Guinness World Records reported that, after Dracula, Sherlock Holmes was the literary character most portrayed in film and television. Indeed, a staggering 254 adaptations take Sir Arthur Conan Doyle’s original text as their starting point.<sup>2</sup> It should come as no surprise, then, that Holmes is especially well-known, and has become almost synonymous with a collection of props: his deerstalker hat, his magnifying glass, and his Stradivarius violin. This excerpt, however, taken directly from the stage directions for Nicholas Meyers’ *The Seven-Per-Cent Solution*, showcases a Holmes who is far removed from the image many viewers may have of the famous fictional detective as “a paragon who can do all things well,” to borrow literature scholar Thomas Leitch’s description.<sup>3</sup> This adaptation, like many recent on-screen portrayals of Holmes, has taken a rather different vein, including a Holmes that is much more emotional and flawed than his literary predecessor.

Emphasizing Holmes’s identity as a musician has been typical of most screen adaptations. Indeed, as early as 1908, a reviewer described (in reference to the Italian production

---

<sup>1</sup> Nicholas Meyer, “Seven-Per-Cent Solution Screenplay,” (Los Angeles: Universal Studios, 1975).

<sup>2</sup> Guinness World Records, “Sherlock Holmes awarded title for most portrayed literary human character in film & TV,” May 14, 2012, <http://www.guinnessworldrecords.com/news/2012/5/sherlock-holmes-awarded-title-for-most-portrayed-literary-human-character-in-film-tv-41743>.

<sup>3</sup> Thomas Leitch, *Film Adaptation and Its Discontents* (Baltimore: The John Hopkins University Press, 2007), 223.

*Sherlock Holmes in the Great Murder Mystery*) how Holmes “play[s] fantastic music which puts him in a trance to solve [a] problem.”<sup>4</sup> Interestingly, Doyle references music in only twenty-one of the original sixty stories (written from 1887 to 1927 and collectively known by enthusiasts as the “Canon”) and only nine of them specifically describe Holmes playing the violin. Why, then, is music, specifically that performed by Holmes himself, central to most screen adaptations? How and to what ends is Holmes’s identity as a musician employed in these adaptations? To answer these questions, I discuss several classic and recent screen adaptations and the ways in which they refer to the Canon, portray Holmes, and use his identity as a musician narratively.

Significantly, recent adaptors such as Michael Cox’s *The Adventures of Sherlock Holmes* (1984-1994) and Steven Moffat and Mark Gatiss’s *Sherlock* (2010- ) use music to transform Holmes from a Victorian Englishman to a Romantic Genius, yielding a much more flawed and multi-faceted character than his Canonical predecessor.<sup>5</sup> Nearly every adaptor of *Sherlock Holmes* uses, for example, the character’s violin performance not only as a narrative element, illuminating a generally uncommunicative character’s personality, but also as a way to connect that particular iteration of Holmes back to the original literary source through the use of an iconic element, simultaneously reinforcing and altering his character. The ways in which adaptors accomplish these aims through violin performance is as diverse as the adaptations themselves and can involve variables like how Holmes holds the instrument, the level of care he shows it, the music he performs on it, and the people for whom he chooses to perform. In reimagining Sherlock Holmes, adaptors both reflect and expand upon the original text, relying on the violin to a considerable degree to describe his character and emotions. Exploring the dynamics of

---

<sup>4</sup> Robert W. Pohle, Jr. and Douglas C. Hart, *Sherlock Holmes on the Screen: The Motion Picture Adventures of the World’s Most Popular Detective* (New York: A. S. Barnes and Company, 1977), 28.

<sup>5</sup> See Appendix, page 70, for details on these adaptations.



Holmes's musicality in screen adaptations serves as a starting point for addressing the transformation of his character from Victorian to Romantic.

The questions I introduced above have shaped the overall structure of this study. In the remainder of the present chapter, I further introduce my topic, framing it with brief surveys of the existing literature on Holmes and adaptation studies. I also introduce working definitions of Victorian and Romantic characters that I use in the analytical chapters of this study.

In the second chapter, I address Doyle's portrayal of Holmes in the Canon. These written descriptions, depicting the detective as both a music-loving violinist as well as a Victorian gentleman, are the materials that adaptors either choose to emphasize or ignore. I detail specifically the instances in which Doyle discusses Holmes's violin performance and love of music, as well as several descriptions of the detective as a primarily Victorian character, to serve as a basis of comparison to the later adaptation studies.

I examine several recent Holmes adaptations in the concluding two chapters. The third chapter begins with an assessment of the violin as an iconic element, a prop along with the deerstalker and inverness cape meant to associate the character with an audience's mental image of Holmes. I then move on to specific examples of recent adaptations, namely *The Private Life of Sherlock Holmes* (1970), Granada's *The Adventures of Sherlock Holmes* (1984-1994), *Elementary* (2012- ), Warner Bros.' *Sherlock Holmes* and *Sherlock Holmes: Game of Shadows* (2009, 2011), and BBC's *Sherlock* (2010- ). These adaptations make significant use of Holmes's identity as a violinist as a tool to transform the character into a Romantic Genius, which I argue reflects a need to render Holmes problematic; the Gentleman Detective as a character is no longer compelling enough for twentieth- and twenty-first-century audiences. The fourth chapter focuses on extra-diegetic elements of Holmes adaptations, specifically the Granada and BBC

series. I argue that music, which replaces the Canon's narrator, rises to prominence in situations in which adaptors need to express Holmes's inner world, which is otherwise not represented in the narrative. In this case, Doyle's character is being inserted into a very old model of musical expressiveness that has a long pedigree.

### **Adaptations Studies**

The consistent musicality of Sherlock Holmes on the screen is remarkable considering the diversity of adaptations.<sup>6</sup> Compared to the three other most often adapted literary figures (Count Dracula, Tarzan, and Frankenstein's monster), Sherlock Holmes is the lone musician, one moreover associated with iconic props: his violin, pipe, hat and coat.<sup>7</sup> Although Doyle consistently relies on these identity-anchoring props, the stories of the Canon are hardly unified. The narrative tone imparted through Dr. Watson remains largely the same, but the length, time period, subject matter, and secondary characters constantly change between stories. Adaptors are challenged not by a single novel by a myriad of short stories written over a period of forty years. Moreover, short stories are, by their very brevity, difficult to bring to the screen, a problem compounded by textual inconsistencies that result from the chronological distribution of Doyle's stories.

Asking how creators addressed these and other problems from the standpoint of music nuances our understanding of adaptations, studies of which tend to be preoccupied with fidelity and narration. Significantly, scholars rarely address the technique of pastiche, for example: a more indirect imitation of a text and an extremely large part of the Holmes oeuvre.<sup>8</sup> Moreover,

---

<sup>6</sup> As a note, "adaptation" will be used in the context of this paper in a broad sense to cover all adaptation styles, including pastiche and parody.

<sup>7</sup> Leitch, *Film Adaptation*, 207.

<sup>8</sup> Patrick Cattrysse, *Descriptive Adaptation Studies: Epistemological and Methodological Issues* (Antwerp: Garant Publishing, 2014), 311.

few address the specific creative choices inherent in a character that is known for their musical performance, or one anchored by iconic props rather than narrative. Because of these aspects of Holmes's character, adaptations of these stories make especially interesting case studies and serve as bridges connecting musical study to adaptation theory.

Hence, scholarly focus on fidelity and authorship is not necessarily productive in the case of Holmes adaptations. This method of study is somewhat problematic, as it necessarily claims that there can be only one correct meaning of any text.<sup>9</sup> Part of this focus comes from the audience and consumers of media themselves who demand a strict adherence to a film or TV series' text; literary scholar Morris Beja, for instance, asserts that audiences "resent it if 'liberties' are taken, or if a movie 'distorts' or 'fools around' with a book of which they are fond."<sup>10</sup> The more subtly elitist side of this issue, however, equates fidelity and authority, valuing the original over any subsequent adaptation. In a way, this is understandable: a literary text, by nature, is a much more specific medium, and it is nearly impossible for any adaptation to address every aspect of a book without becoming unwieldy.<sup>11</sup> Elizabeth Trembley notes that many critics deride film adaptations as lesser than original films due to their dependency on a previous work.<sup>12</sup> Likewise, even Jeremy Brett, the actor who portrayed Holmes in the Granada Television series, criticized less faithful adaptations as "pretend Doyle."<sup>13</sup> Film and television are not alone in this respect, as Caryl Emerson identifies similar critical debates concerning Modest Musorgsky's operatic adaptation of Alexander Pushkin's *Boris Godunov*. One contemporary reviewer declared Musorgsky's altered libretto was "not poetry, not even prose, but some sort of

---

<sup>9</sup> Brian McFarlane, *Novel to Film: An Introduction to the Theory of Adaptation* (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1996), 8.

<sup>10</sup> Morris Beja, *Film and Literature: An Introduction* (New York: Longman, 1979), 81.

<sup>11</sup> McFarlane, *Novel to Film*, 12.

<sup>12</sup> Elizabeth A. Trembley, "Introduction," in *It's a Print!: Detective Fiction from Page to Screen*, ed. William Reynolds and Elizabeth A. Trembley (Bowling Green: Bowling Green State University Popular Press, 1994), 2.

<sup>13</sup> Neil McCaw, "Sherlock Holmes and a Politics of Adaptation," in *Sherlock Holmes and Conan Doyle: Multi-Media Afterlives*, ed. Sabine Vanacker and Catherine Wynne (New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2013), 44.

misshapen collection of words.”<sup>14</sup> Likewise, Richard Taruskin claims that music based on text is subservient to performing that text “as the author intended it;” the “music need no longer be ‘beautiful,’ but it must at all costs be accurate.”<sup>15</sup> Though the text is certainly an important basis for adaptation, privileging it as a paradigm against which to compare adaptations is an unproductive methodology. Indeed, as Brian McFarlane notes, “faithful adaptation can be intelligent and attractive, but is not necessarily to be preferred.”<sup>16</sup>

As noted, pastiche is absent from discussions of authorship and fidelity. Scholars often make it a point to distinguish between the concepts of story and plot, like Beja who emphasizes the differences of the chronological aspect of “story” and the causal aspect of “plot.”<sup>17</sup> However, there is almost no research on adaptations that use a completely new plot altogether, a technique quite common in Holmes adaptations (possibly due to their sheer number). However, pastiche is an even more extreme case in which adaptors extract characters from their original environment and place them in an entirely new context, sometimes problematizing their iconic features in the process. Indeed, Leitch cites this as one of the reasons that Sherlock Holmes has largely gone unresearched, finding a critical bias against more popular adaptations and pastiches.<sup>18</sup>

However, critiques of Holmes adaptations avoid questions of fidelity, and the reasons serve as a significant window into musical choices made in adaptations. As Leitch notes, many Holmes adaptations “enjoy in some measure an autonomous existence of which the original works are no longer anything more than accidental.”<sup>19</sup> Film scholar Harvey O’Brien likewise states that many screen adaptations set up a context in which “the median point of reference is

---

<sup>14</sup> Caryl Emerson, *Boris Godunov: Transpositions of a Russian Theme* (Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 1986), 142.

<sup>15</sup> Quoted in *Ibid.*, 147.

<sup>16</sup> McFarlane, *Novel to Film*, 11.

<sup>17</sup> Beja, *Film and Literature*, 4.

<sup>18</sup> Leitch, “Post Literary Adaptation,” *Post Script: Essays in Film and the Humanities* 23.3 (Summer 2004), 100.

<sup>19</sup> Leitch, *Discontents*, 207.

not the literary source but the ‘classical Holmes’,” allowing adaptors to introduce “variances on the classical [which] in some ways revise, and in other ways complement, the construction and deployment of this iconic figure.”<sup>20</sup> Steven Moffat, one of the creators of the 2010 BBC series *Sherlock*, emphasizes this dual identity of Holmes adaptations, saying they are “utterly recognisable, and utterly different at the same time.”<sup>21</sup> This trend began even before the age of the screen adaptation. Sidney Paget, in his well-known drawings, intentionally made the detective more handsome than Doyle had described him.<sup>22</sup> Paget made a large impression on the public at the time, causing Doyle to admit that he had “illustrated those stories so well that he made a type which the whole of the English-reading race came to recognise.”<sup>23</sup>

Perhaps even more important than Paget’s drawings, though, is the portrayal of American actor William Gillette. Not only did Gillette write and star in one of the first popular stage dramatizations of Holmes in 1899, but he is also responsible for the phrase “elementary, my dear Watson,” as well as the appearance of the iconic hat, cape, and pipe, turning them into the deerstalker, inverness, and calabash, respectively.<sup>24</sup> Doyle recognized what an impact Gillette’s portrayal of the detective had, saying “my only complaint is that you made the poor hero of the anemic printed page a very limp object as compared with the glamour of your own personality which you infuse into his stage presentment.”<sup>25</sup> The author had such confidence in Gillette that he willingly gave away creative rights and freedoms, stating that Gillette, upon asking whether

---

<sup>20</sup> Harvey O’Brien, “The Curious Case of the Kingdom of Shadows: The Transmogrification of Sherlock Holmes in the Cinematic Imagination,” in *Sherlock Holmes and Conan Doyle: Multi-Media Afterlives*, ed. Sabine Vanacker and Catherine Wynne (New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2013), 66, 64-65.

<sup>21</sup> Alan Barnes, *Sherlock Holmes on Screen: The Complete Film and TV History* (London: Titan Books, 2011), 7.

<sup>22</sup> Leitch, *Discontents*, 208.

<sup>23</sup> “Sherlock Holmes on the Screen,” from “Stoll’s Editorial News”, 6 October 1921, 11.

<sup>24</sup> Henry Zecher, *William Gillette: America’s Sherlock Holmes* (Bloomington: Xlibris Press, 2011), 289.

<sup>25</sup> Sir Arthur Conan Doyle, “Speech given at New Amsterdam Theatre,” New York: 25 November, 1929.

he could give Holmes a love interest, was free to “marry him, murder him, or do anything [he] liked with him.”<sup>26</sup>

The most important element of Holmes adaptations thus is not, as one might expect, plot or environment, but character. This tendency is evident even in the earliest of Holmes films. For example, Fenn Sherie’s review of Eille Norwood’s performance from a 1921 article in *The Strand* praises the actor’s “naturally calm and contemplative temperament” which was “extremely in keeping with the character of Holmes.”<sup>27</sup> Most critics, both professional and amateur, care little for the time period: though there was some consternation among the strictest of Holmes-lovers when BBC and CBS announced their respective modernized stories, this idea was hardly an original one. In fact, most adaptations in the early twentieth century were placed in contemporary settings as opposed to the Victorian period. This same situation arose in response to the Twentieth Century Fox and Universal Rathbone films – though audiences were at first put off by the lack of hansom cabs and Canonical plots, the fact that, as David Stuart Davies explains, “the playing and much of the writing were in character” appeased them.<sup>28</sup> Likewise, very few adaptations present faithful Canonical stories; even the Granada series starring Jeremy Brett, lauded for its close ties to the Canon, took liberties, especially toward the end of its run.

Indeed, as the vast majority of Holmes adaptations are pastiches, it is the characters themselves and not the plot that must adhere to the Canon, and more so Holmes than Watson. Though the creators are the ones ultimately making interpretive choices, as Jean-Paul Sartre reminds us, no one can create anything “without a public and without a myth.”<sup>29</sup> The public that Holmes adaptors must appease is a demanding one, as emphasized by the Baker Street Irregulars,

---

<sup>26</sup> “Stoll’s Editorial News”, 11.

<sup>27</sup> Fenn Sherie, “Sherlock Holmes on the Film: An Interview with Eille Norwood,” *The Strand*, July 1921, 73.

<sup>28</sup> David Stuart Davies, *Holmes of the Movies: The Screen Career of Sherlock Holmes* (New York: Bramhall House, 1968), 70.

<sup>29</sup> Quoted in George Bluestone, *Novels into Film* (Baltimore: The John Hopkins Press, 1957), 31.

an invitation-only “Sherlockian” society, are known for playing “The Grand Game” in which they assume Holmes to be an actual historical character and Dr. Watson his biographer.<sup>30</sup>

Adaptors put Holmes and Watson almost anywhere and in any time period, using almost any plot (as long as it is a mystery), be it simple or outlandish. It is the characters themselves, and not their environments, that must appeal to the audience; if adaptors introduce new details or interpretations of their personalities, these above all else must be believable.

In the majority of Holmes adaptations, music, specifically that performed by Holmes himself, is pervasive. Whether the adaptation is faithful to the plots of Doyle’s texts, like Granada’s *The Adventures of Sherlock Holmes*, or wildly different, such as Meyer’s *The Seven-Per-Cent Solution* with which I began, music conveys the detective’s emotions. As we will see, the violin rarely appears in the Canon, yet the instrument is a central feature of Holmes’s character. As noted, it, along with the detective’s signature deerstalker hat, inverness cape, and calabash pipe, make up a set of icons that easily distinguish Holmes even for those that are unfamiliar with the stories. Unlike these extracanonial costuming elements, however, the violin offers adaptors a way into the detective’s personality, a technique that began with Doyle and that I will show in more detail below.

### **Literary Archetypes**

Moreover, recent adaptations capitalize on this technique to transform Holmes from his original Victorian roots into a Romantic Genius archetype. As described below, there are certain notable features of characters from both literary time periods, and writers and adaptors can use these elements to cast their characters in a particular light.

---

<sup>30</sup> The Baker Street Irregulars are also well-known in fannish circles for referring to the Holmes Canon as “The Sacred Writings.”

Victorian upper- and middle-class literary characters can be summarized by one word: order. Authors impart a concern for and understanding of social and class rules through all characters across class lines, but it is those on the upper end of the spectrum whose anxiety over social unrest causes them to enforce these mores.<sup>31</sup> The detective genre itself emerged from this period (roughly 1830-1900), a formation of the desire to arrest criminals and protect the upper classes.<sup>32</sup> Male characters were especially important, as they cemented the gendered ideas of the times; to that end, both Holmes and Watson are typical in exhibiting different views of masculine concepts, with Holmes conveying “the aura of chivalry” and Watson exhibiting “the virtues of middle-class manhood: loyal, honest, and brave.”<sup>33</sup> Due to the social environment at the time, however, sex and sexuality were taboo topics; sexual self-discipline was considered a characteristic of the middle and upper classes, and hence characters of these classes appear almost repressed, at least from our later perspective.<sup>34</sup> Likewise, as Sharon Marcus explains that desire itself was seen as a “dangerous, anti-social force” associated with “flood and fire,” many Victorian characters seem to lack it entirely, leading to a strange sense of Victorian asexuality.<sup>35</sup> The end result of the social context in this period is a very restrained, knowledgeable, gentlemanly character.

Concurrent with these Victorian ideals are the Bohemian aesthetics that countered them. Bohemians, many of whom were artists of some form, rejected the established social and class rules and were often associated, as Daniel Cottom explains, with idleness and “vagabond

---

<sup>31</sup> Irene Morra, “‘Singing like a musical box’: Musical Detection and Novelistic Tradition,” in *The Idea of Music in Victorian Fiction*, ed. Sophie Fuller and Nicky Losseff (Burlington: Ashgate, 2004), 161.

<sup>32</sup> Christopher Clausen, “Sherlock Holmes, Order, and Late-Victorian Mind,” *The Georgia Review* 38.1 (Spring 1984), 111.

<sup>33</sup> Joseph A. Kestner, *Sherlock’s Men: Masculinity, Conan Doyle, and Cultural History* (Aldershot: Ashgate Publishing Limited, 1997), 14.

<sup>34</sup> Sharon Marcus, “Sexuality,” in *The Cambridge History of Victorian Literature*, ed. Kate Flint (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2014), 427.

<sup>35</sup> *Ibid.*, 433-434.



restlessness.”<sup>36</sup> While Holmes himself may sometimes appear to err more on the side of Bohemian than Victorian Gentleman (especially in reference to his eccentricities), it is clear that he is well aware of these social codes. In fact, as literature scholar Irene Morra explains, it is in his occasional tendency to “disregard social prejudices of class and station” that the reader becomes most aware “that he possesses a superior understanding of numerous, if not all, aspects of human nature and organization.”<sup>37</sup>

In contrast to the order that is essential for the Victorian Gentleman, the Romantic Genius is usually characterized by chaos in most facets of their personality. These characters are often rather misanthropic, similar to the Byronic Hero in their tendency to be “moody, cynical, with defiance on [their] brow and misery in [their] heart” along with a somewhat morally grey outlook on life.<sup>38</sup> The Romantic Genius is usually overly emotional, focused on the melancholic side of the spectrum perhaps due to not understanding how to handle their feelings; cultural geographer George Revill cites an “emotional angst that constitute[s] the wellspring of romantic genius.”<sup>39</sup> Jock Abra takes this idea even further, asserting that the stereotypical Romantic Genius exhibits a sort of “frenzy” which causes them to be “sentimental and explosively temperamental.”<sup>40</sup> Often, these geniuses with emotional difficulties descend into madness, incapable of coping with their intellect.<sup>41</sup>

Since the nineteenth century, the concept of genius has been closely associated with musicians such as Beethoven and (at least retroactively) Bach. Sociologist Tia DeNora traces

---

<sup>36</sup> Daniel Cottom, “Sherlock Holmes Meets Dracula,” *ELH* 79/3 (Fall 2012), 538.

<sup>37</sup> Morra, “musical box,” 161.

<sup>38</sup> Jane Moore and John Strachan, *Key Concepts in Romantic Literature* (New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2010), 146.

<sup>39</sup> George Revill, “Samuel Coleridge-Taylor’s Geography of Disappointment: Hybridity, Identity, and Networks of Musical Meaning,” in *The Place of Music*, ed. Andrew Leyshon, David Matless, and George Revill (New York: The Guildford Press, 1998), 205.

<sup>40</sup> Jock Abra, *God and Evolution: Creativity in Action* (Victoria: Friesen Press, 2015), 316.

<sup>41</sup> Arthur Schopenhauer, *The World as Will and Representation Volume II*, Translated E. F. J. Payne (New York: Dover Publications, 1966), 389.

Beethoven's appearance as "haughty, scowling, and disheveled" as a large part of the "iconography of genius."<sup>42</sup> Likewise, the musicological fervor over Josquin can be attributed to his genius status: Edward E. Lowinsky reads his creativity in a particularly Romantic fashion, citing a combination of intelligence, musical prowess, and a difficult temperament.<sup>43</sup> A contemporary critic of Paganini, one of Holmes's idols, described the virtuoso as a combination of "romance and mystery, as the inseparable attributes of genius."<sup>44</sup> As Barthes says of Beethoven:

the artist is brought forward as a complete hero, endowed with a discourse (a rare occurrence for a musician), a legend (a good ten or so anecdotes), an iconography, a race (that of the Titans of Art: Michelangelo, Balzac) and a fatal malady (the deafness of he who creates for the pleasure of our ears).<sup>45</sup>

The parallels between this romanticized, mythic description of Beethoven and Holmes are clear, especially in the areas of iconography and malady, though for Holmes the latter is usually his drug habit, the faults of a genius mind turning against itself.

This transposition of Doyle's Victorian detective to adaptors' Romantic Genius is a fairly recent phenomenon. For quite some time (and indeed, for some enthusiasts today) Basil Rathbone's cool and collected Holmes was the perfect representation. This version of Holmes, much closer to the Canon than more recent incarnations, was nearly perfect in every way. This almost omniscient character was likely a product of his time period: the series of films began in 1939, and several plots involved Holmes battling the Nazis. Hence, a character that exhibited certain values and traits was a necessity for wartime morale.<sup>46</sup> More current representations,

---

<sup>42</sup> Tia DeNora, *Beethoven and the Construction of Genius: Musical Politics in Vienna, 1792-1803* (Los Angeles: University of California Press, 1995), xi.

<sup>43</sup> Paula Higgins, "The Apotheosis of Josquin des Prez and Other Mythologies of Musical Genius," *Journal of the American Musicological Society* 57.3 (Fall 2004): 454.

<sup>44</sup> Moore and Strachan, *Romantic Literature*, 83.

<sup>45</sup> Roland Barthes, *Image-Music-Text* Translated Stephen Heath (New York: Hill and Wang, 1978), 151.

<sup>46</sup> Amanda J. Field, *England's Secret Weapon: The Wartime Films of Sherlock Holmes*, (London: Middlesex University Press, 2009), 8.

lacking the threat of a world war and seeking to throw off Rathbone's faultless Holmes, have elevated his flawed, genius aspects and deemphasized his gentlemanly traits. Holmes scholar Ashley D. Polasek agrees, stating that a more complex anti-hero type character is a necessity in later, especially 21<sup>st</sup> century adaptations of Holmes.<sup>47</sup> The Romantic Genius presents adaptors with just such a flawed character: an archetype that can combine Holmes's massive intellect and the need for an imperfect main character. By privileging and expanding upon certain aspects of Holmes's personality through the use of music, adaptors can discard his Victorian roots and mold him into the perfect Romantic Genius.

---

<sup>47</sup> Ashley D. Polasek, "Surveying the Post-Millennial Sherlock Holmes: A Case for the Great Detective as a Man of Our Times," *Adaptation* 6.3 (2013), 392.

## Chapter 2: Holmes the Musician on the Written Page

Before examining the screen adaptations that are the main focus of this research, it is important to establish the Canon baseline against which adaptors are designing their interpretation of Sherlock Holmes. Although the Canon itself is a rather loose collection of stories and sometimes Doyle even contradicts himself, it provides a fertile creative ground for adaptors, especially in the field of music.<sup>48</sup> The Holmes that Doyle puts forward in the text, despite the inconsistencies, is inherently Victorian, a gentleman detective and a product of his times.

The Sherlock Holmes stories have an unusually strong pull among fans of both the written work and adaptations. These narratives, are almost exclusively written from the point of view of Doctor John Watson (although two are narrated by Holmes himself and two are in third-person), were most often published in *The Strand* magazine from 1887 to 1927 and they are generally considered to cover a time frame from around 1880 to 1914.<sup>49</sup> As noted, the number of references to music in the Canon is relatively small: Doyle mentions music or the violin in fewer than half of the stories, and many only in passing, such as Holmes's request for Watson to "hand [him his] violin" in the Noble Bachelor.<sup>50</sup> Despite the relatively small number of music references, however, these scattered instances are central to forging Holmes's iconic character.

Connecting detective and violin was one of Doyle's earliest concerns. Upon their first meeting in "A Study in Scarlet," Holmes asks Watson anxiously if he considers violin-playing a "row," and considers the matter settled when Watson tells him "a well-played violin is a treat for

---

<sup>48</sup> There are occasional inconsistencies throughout the text: John Watson's wife refers to the man as "James" in "The Man with the Twisted Lip," Holmes's time at university is listed as different lengths in "Gloria Scott" and "The Musgrave Ritual," etc.

<sup>49</sup> Christopher Redmond, *The Sherlock Holmes Handbook* (Toronto: Dundurn Press, 2009), 286.

<sup>50</sup> Sir Arthur Conan Doyle, "The Noble Bachelor," in *Sherlock Holmes: The Complete Novels and Stories Volume I* (New York: Bantam Classics, 2003), 467.

the Gods.”<sup>51</sup> Through Dr. Watson, Doyle describes Holmes as “play[ing] the violin well,” but it is difficult to gauge his performance against that of other violinists as he never plays anything specifically written for violin.<sup>52</sup> Instead, his repertoire includes transcriptions of the Mendelssohn *Lieder ohne Worte* and his own improvisations, described by Watson as variously “exasperating solos” or “a remarkable gift,” as well as an unnamed collection of some of Watson’s favorite tunes.<sup>53</sup> Left to his own devices, though, he “seldom produce[s] any music or an attempt at any recognized air.”<sup>54</sup> Despite Watson’s often glowing praise of his skills, Holmes presumably does not think of himself as a virtuoso, as he uses this term to describe various real life violinists including Wilma Norman-Neruda and Pablo Sarasate and the fictional criminal Charlie Peace without using it to refer to himself. The only time Holmes remarks upon his own abilities at all is in response to Watson’s reservations about a badly played violin.<sup>55</sup> The overall impression is one of competence: a skilled amateur but not a professional.

Although his talented violin performance helps to cement the Canonical Holmes as an English gentleman, other elements of his musical portrayal reveal a sort of Bohemian existence. Though he certainly knows proper violin technique, as he praised Norman-Neruda for her own, Holmes routinely doesn’t play the instrument “correctly.” At one point, Watson even describes Holmes as “clos[ing] his eyes and scrap[ing] carelessly at the fiddle which was thrown across his knee.”<sup>56</sup> These untraditional techniques lead some Holmesian enthusiasts to wonder if the detective had multiple instruments (a possible second violin or even a viola or viola de gamba

---

<sup>51</sup> Sir Arthur Conan Doyle, “A Study in Scarlet,” in *Sherlock Holmes: The Complete Novels and Stories Volume I* (New York: Bantam Classics, 2003), 10.

<sup>52</sup> *Ibid.*, 14.

<sup>53</sup> Doyle, “Scarlet,” 10.

Sir Arthur Conan Doyle, “The Sign of Four,” in *Sherlock Holmes: The Complete Novels and Stories Volume I* (New York: Bantam Classics, 2003), 187.

<sup>54</sup> Doyle, “Scarlet,” 14.

<sup>55</sup> *Ibid.*, 9.

<sup>56</sup> *Ibid.*, 14.

seem to make more sense to some readers than Holmes simply playing the impressive Stradivarius in incorrect positions), though I believe the unusual methods to be Doyle's way of demonstrating Holmes's disregard for rules in general.<sup>57</sup> The specific position Doyle describes above is also one associated with fiddling technique, perhaps another sign of Holmes's Bohemian leanings. Watson also mentions, in addition to several other oddities and failings as a tenant, Holmes's "addiction to music at strange hours," presumably playing the violin in the middle of the night.<sup>58</sup> Regardless of how Holmes is playing it, Watson most often refers to the violin as a tool, with the resulting music "reflect[ing] the thoughts which possessed him."<sup>59</sup> At one point, he goes so far as to equate himself with the violin as a "habit" and "institution" Holmes used to solve cases.<sup>60</sup>

The way Holmes treats his violin is, likewise, a strange mixture of affection and abuse, and seems to reflect both a Victorian and Bohemian ideology. The detective purchased the Stradivarius for a paltry fifty-five Shillings, well under its value of five hundred guineas. Holmes evidently knows a fair bit about these famous violins, as Doyle, through Watson, mentions him discussing the differences of violin makers on three separate occasions. Despite its value, however, Holmes does not seem overly protective of the instrument. Although it has a case, it is little used. The instrument is furthermore the victim of Holmes's rage, as in "The Norwood Builder" Watson states that he "flung down the instrument."<sup>61</sup> Interestingly, Norwood is the only

---

<sup>57</sup> Edward Atkinson Merrill and Earl Bernard Murray, "That Monograph Upon the Polyphonic Motets of Lassus," *Baker Street Journal* 24.1 (1974): 23.

This rejection of Holmes's canonical unconventional methods might be attributed to portrayals like William Gillette and Jeremy Brett who always showcased Holmes using proper technique.

<sup>58</sup> Sir Arthur Conan Doyle, "The Dying Detective," in *Sherlock Holmes: The Complete Novels and Stories Volume II* (New York: Bantam Classics, 2003), 237.

<sup>59</sup> Doyle, "Scarlet," 14.

<sup>60</sup> Sir Arthur Conan Doyle, "The Creeping Man," *Sherlock Holmes: The Complete Novels and Stories Volume II* (New York: Bantam Classics, 2003), 333.

<sup>61</sup> Sir Arthur Conan Doyle, "The Norwood Builder," in *Sherlock Holmes: The Complete Novels and Stories Volume I* (New York: Bantam Classics, 2003), 792.

story after the so-called Great Hiatus (the period of time after Holmes's supposed death at the Reichenbach Falls in "The Final Problem" and his miraculous reappearance in "The Empty House") in which Watson specifically mentions Holmes playing the violin. This difference between pre-"Final Problem" and post-"Final Problem" Holmes has led some enthusiasts to wonder if either a physical injury or psychological trauma occurred during the Great Hiatus that silenced Holmes's playing.<sup>62</sup>

Moreover, Doyle's Holmes is both an avid consumer and researcher of music. His musical tastes are varied, but all concern classical music, a deliberate choice on Doyle's part to mark the detective as a cultured individual. Holmes enjoys listening to violin performance, noting for example the "attack and bowing" of the real-life violinist Wilma Norman-Neruda (whom Holmes hears at an imagined recital) and listening to Pablo de Sarasate "wrapped in the most perfect happiness."<sup>63</sup> Opera is also a favorite, and Doyle imagines Holmes and Watson making a trip to Covent Garden in time for the second act of a Wagner opera after the case they solve in "The Adventure of the Red Circle." A second instance in "The Hound of the Baskervilles" makes Holmes's love for opera clearer, as he has reserved a box for a performance of Meyerbeer's *Les Huguenots* amidst the casework necessary to solve that particular mystery. A more specific and telling reference is Holmes's professed love of German music over that of French and Italian, his attendance at Meyerbeer's opera notwithstanding. As he says in "Red-Headed League," "it is introspective, and I want to introspect."<sup>64</sup> His single contribution as a musicologist consists of writing the "last word" on the polyphonic motets of Lassus, a subject arcane enough to assure readers of Holmes's musical erudition. This particular instance, detailed

---

<sup>62</sup> Merrill Murray, "Motets of Lassus," 27.

<sup>63</sup> *Ibid.*, 37.

Sir Arthur Conan Doyle, "The Red-Headed League," in *Sherlock Holmes: The Complete Novels and Stories Volume I* (New York: Bantam Classics, 2003), 278.

<sup>64</sup> *Ibid.*, 276.

in “The Bruce-Partington Plans,” is a rare instance when Holmes privileges something else above his casework, though this may also be due to the implication that the Queen herself asked him to undertake this project.<sup>65</sup> Though most of the music performances Holmes attends with Watson function as a diversion from the “weary workaday world,” clearly the detective’s love of classical music goes farther than simple entertainment.<sup>66</sup>

Doyle enforces elements of this emotionless, purely intellectual state through his use of music. This choice was present from the start of Holmes’s creation, as the earliest sources point to Doyle’s intention of making Holmes (even before he was given his name) a violinist, with very early drafts referencing a violin virtuoso playing an Amati.<sup>67</sup> Irene Morra agrees; in addition to showing a strong connection to his mental state in the form of improvisation (a method she characterizes as Holmes withdrawing from society), she claims Holmes’s status and abilities as a musician are how Doyle set his detective apart from other contemporary characters like Dickens’s Night Inspector and Collins’s Sergeant Cuff.<sup>68</sup> Holmes’s greater success is due to his ability to interpret and understand abstract connections in evidence, an ability that his musical performance heightens.<sup>69</sup> Despite Watson’s perceptions, Morra continues, Doyle shows “no real dichotomy between Holmes’s musical meditation and his detection,” the two almost merging into an instinctual, intuitive method of reason.<sup>70</sup> This state of being is seen in small doses in secondary characters, as well. For example, Holmes once claimed to deduce that a woman was a musician simply by looking at her fingers and the “spirituality about the face.”<sup>71</sup> It is telling, in

---

<sup>65</sup> Trevor H. Hall, *Sherlock Holmes: Ten Literary Studies* (London: Gerald Duckworth and Company, 1969), 91.

<sup>66</sup> Sir Arthur Conan Doyle, “The Adventure of the Retired Colourman,” in *Sherlock Holmes: The Complete Novels and Stories Volume II* (New York: Bantam Classics, 2003), 728.

<sup>67</sup> Martin Booth, *The Doctor and the Detective* (New York: St. Martin’s Press, 1997), 106-107.

<sup>68</sup> Morra, “musical box,” 160, 134.

<sup>69</sup> *Ibid.*, 155.

<sup>70</sup> *Ibid.*, 165.

<sup>71</sup> Sir Arthur Conan Doyle, “The Solitary Cyclist,” in *Sherlock Holmes: The Complete Novels and Stories Volume I* (New York: Bantam Classics, 2003), 833.



light of this conclusion, that Irene Adler, one of the very few people (and only woman) to ever best Holmes in a battle of wits, was also a musician. Though the original reference to a contralto prima donna in “A Scandal in Bohemia” may serve to place “The Woman” in a certain derogatory social class, it could also very well be an indicator of this same intuition.<sup>72</sup> Indeed, the King of Bohemia, the man she threatens to blackmail, describes her even after the fact as “quick and resolute,” at which point Holmes drily remarks that the woman was “on a very different level.”<sup>73</sup> Many readers seem to forget, however, that Holmes never considered his own abilities to be unique. He frequently refers to his observations as “elementary,” and, upon explaining them, even Watson can understand how Holmes reaches a certain conclusion. His prowess as a detective is not due to unattainable genius but rather a learnable forensic method.

Despite Doyle’s description of the unfeeling side of the detective’s personality and Watson’s assertions to the contrary, however, there is a definitive connection between music and emotion. Watson admits in “Scarlet” that he is unsure of whether the “music aided Holmes’s thoughts, or whether the playing was simply the result of a whim or fancy,” but he continually refers to the violin performances with a number of emotional adjectives.<sup>74</sup> He describes the violin performance in “Scarlet” as “low, melancholy wailings,” and another instance in which Holmes seems to be intentionally putting Watson to sleep is described as a “low, dreamy, melodious air.”<sup>75</sup> When Holmes seems “haggard and anxious” in “The Norwood Builder,” he plays again, and although it was “for an hour [that] he droned away on his violin, endeavoring to soothe his own ruffled spirits,” he is unsuccessful.<sup>76</sup> Similarly, when he is “taciturn” and

---

<sup>72</sup> Morra, “musical box,” 168.

<sup>73</sup> Sir Arthur Conan Doyle, “A Scandal in Bohemia,” in *Sherlock Holmes: The Complete Novels and Stories Volume I* (New York: Bantam Classics, 2003), 262.

<sup>74</sup> Doyle, “Scarlet,” 14.

<sup>75</sup> Ibid.

Doyle, “Sign of Four,” 187.

<sup>76</sup> Doyle, “Norwood Builder,” 792.

“morose” in a later story, his attempts to lift his own spirits involve “incessantly smoking” and “play[ing] snatches” upon the violin.<sup>77</sup> Listening to music has a similar effect: the detective appears jubilant following a performance of Norman-Neruda in “Scarlet,” and once describes attending a concert as entering “violin-land, where all is sweetness and delicacy and harmony.”<sup>78</sup> Holmes even admits the power music holds over him and others, citing Darwin’s contention that music evolved before speech as the reason humans are “so subtly influenced by it.”<sup>79</sup>

Music also plays a role in some of Doyle’s more probing examinations of Holmes’s character. Music has a very calming effect on Holmes, as seen by his reaction to Sarasate’s performance in “Red-Headed League” in which Watson describes “[Holmes’s] gently smiling face and his languid, dreaming eyes...as unlike those of Holmes, the sleuth-hound, Holmes the relentless, keen-witted, ready-handed criminal agent, as it was possible to conceive.”<sup>80</sup> It is important to note that Sidney Paget also chose this particular instance, one where Holmes is obviously affected by music and not one in which he is performing himself, to depict in his sole drawing pertaining to music. This reaction is odd to many Sherlock enthusiasts who focus solely on the detective’s cold, analytical side. Conductor and enthusiast Guy Warrack, one of the first to address the connection between Holmes and music, diagnosed the character with schizophrenia due to the seeming disparity of on-the-case Holmes and listening-to-music Holmes.<sup>81</sup> Trevor Hall imagined that the detective was manic-depressive, citing periods of lethargy during which he would hardly speak or move.<sup>82</sup> Even Jeremy Brett, the star of Granada’s *Adventures of*

---

<sup>77</sup> Sir Arthur Conan Doyle, “The Adventure of the Second Stain,” in *Sherlock Holmes: The Complete Novels and Stories Volume I* (New York: Bantam Classics, 2003), 1045.

<sup>78</sup> Doyle, “Red-Headed,” 278.

<sup>79</sup> Doyle, “Scarlet,” 39.

<sup>80</sup> Doyle, “Red-Headed,” 278.

<sup>81</sup> Hall, *Literary Studies*, 86.

<sup>82</sup> *Ibid.*, 87.

*Sherlock Holmes* series, describes Doyle's Holmes as a "combination of genius and madness."<sup>83</sup> Yet even Watson himself disabuses the readers of such notions, stating that Holmes was "admirably balanced" and this dual nature can be explained away simply by the fact that Holmes was incredibly passionate about music, "his chief and most consistent relief."<sup>84</sup> Doyle alludes to these musical powers in "Valley of Fear," stating that even the most dispassionate of criminals could be "moved...to tears" by "the tender or pathetic in music."<sup>85</sup>

Watson's intervention notwithstanding, Doyle rendered his protagonist mysterious, surrounding him with intriguing references and leaving key biographical questions unanswered, choices that gave readers (and, as we will see, adaptors) wide creative latitude. A favorite among Holmes enthusiasts is "The Giant Rat of Sumatra," a case that Watson mentions in "The Adventure of the Sussex Vampire" only to teasingly claim that it is a story "for which the world is not prepared."<sup>86</sup> Indeed, Doyle leaves much to the reader's imagination: where and when did Holmes learn the violin, what was his family life like, what happened to Watson after he and Holmes parted ways? Perhaps not surprisingly, these are the questions that fired the imaginations of Holmes enthusiasts and, most importantly for the present study, the creators of screen adaptations. As Leitch says, many of these adaptations cease focusing on the original stories and instead "aim to present a Holmes more definitive than Doyle's."<sup>87</sup>

Despite Doyle's vagueness, there are nevertheless several clues throughout the stories that indicate Holmes is an English gentleman, the perfect Victorian hero. The very nature of Holmes's detective work places him in a Victorian context as someone dedicated to preserving

---

<sup>83</sup> Katie Ekberg, "It's Holmes and Away!" *TV Times* 141.7 (16 Feb 1991), 10.

<sup>84</sup> Hall, *Literary Studies*, 87, 92.

<sup>85</sup> Sir Arthur Conan Doyle, "The Valley of Fear," in *Sherlock Holmes: The Complete Novels and Stories Volume II* (New York: Bantam Classics, 2003), 274.

<sup>86</sup> Sir Arthur Conan Doyle, "The Adventure of the Sussex Vampire," in *Sherlock Holmes: The Complete Novels and Stories Volume II* (New York: Bantam Classics, 2003), 594.

<sup>87</sup> Leitch, *Discontents*, 230.

order and preventing crime, work that often went hand in hand with addressing the strained class tensions in Victorian society.<sup>88</sup> He often praises English gentlemen, and Doyle has him admonish a particular set of gentlemen who corrupt their station through crime. Indeed, multiple stories showcase Holmes working directly with the British government, and one, “His Last Bow,” describes the detective coming out of retirement to take on a spy mission at the beginning of World War I. Holmes was well-educated, a necessity for someone in his profession, and took at least some university courses. It appears that he had quite a bit of disposable income, as well, often dining out, attending concerts, and even owning an early phonograph.

These instances cementing him as a Victorian hero are often coupled with less traditional actions on Holmes’s part that reflect a Bohemian attitude. For example, Watson details a scene in “The Musgrave Ritual” in which Holmes is calmly emptying the contents of a revolver into their sitting room wall out of boredom; however, he is spelling out “V. R” (Victoria Regina) in homage to the queen. Similarly, though Holmes’s knowledge is vast and impressive, it is also incredibly unorthodox; Watson describes his knowledge of literature and philosophy as “nil,” his knowledge of politics as “feeble,” and makes special mention of his general familiarity with poisons.<sup>89</sup>

This characterization of Sherlock Holmes can also be seen in his lack of romantic attachments, a sort of asexuality in the Victorian sense taken to extremes. Doyle even went so far as to explain in a letter to his mentor Joseph Bell that “Holmes is as inhuman as a Babbage’s calculating machine and just about as likely to fall in love.”<sup>90</sup> Doyle, through Watson, is also careful to impart this idea to his audiences in “A Scandal in Bohemia,” the one story where Holmes may appear to show romantic interest in another character.

---

<sup>88</sup> Clausen, “Late-Victorian Mind,” 111.

<sup>89</sup> Doyle, “Scarlet,” 10.

<sup>90</sup> Ely M. Liebow, *Dr. Joe Bell: Model for Sherlock Holmes*, (Madison: Popular Press, 2007), 173.

It was not that he felt any emotion akin to love for Irene Adler. All emotions, and that one particularly, were abhorrent to his cold, precise but admirably balanced mind. He was, I take it, the most perfect reasoning and observing machine that the world has seen, but as a lover he would have placed himself in a false position. He never spoke of the softer passions, save with a gibe and a sneer...Grit in a sensitive instrument, or a crack in one of his own high-power lenses, would not be more disturbing than a strong emotion in a nature such as his.<sup>91</sup>

Holmes himself takes this disdain of romance a step further and denounces any feeling as illogical, stating in “A Sign of Four” that he is a “brain” and denying any connection to love, since it is “an emotional thing, and whatever is emotional is opposed to that true cold reason which [he] place[s] above all things.”<sup>92</sup> These claims denying love and emotion seem to fly in the face of Watson’s flowery descriptions of Holmes’s musical performance described above, and present adaptors with a wide range of possibilities and choices for addressing the detective’s character.

Doyle’s characterization of Holmes in the Canon places the detective firmly in the Victorian Gentleman category. Despite some eccentric forays into Bohemian ideas, it is often through music that Doyle accomplishes these descriptions. The literary Holmes is a learned member of the upper class, one who understands music and its ties to emotions but completely disregards emotional connections with other people.

---

<sup>91</sup> Doyle, “Scandal,” 239.

<sup>92</sup> Doyle, “Sign of Four,” 235.

### Chapter 3: Holmes the Performer in Screen Adaptations

Regardless of the relative lack of violin performance in the Canon, nearly every Holmes adaptation makes use of the detective's musicality. In adaptations there is a strong presence of Holmes-the-performer (and, at least in *Sherlock's* case, Holmes-the-composer), but Holmes as consumer and researcher of music — aspects Doyle establishes in the Canon — are absent. To be sure, a few adaptations reference the detective's love of listening, but these instances are marginal compared to the detective's own activities as a performer. Holmes's identity as a scholar of music is similarly in the background, briefly acknowledged only in the Granada series' version of "The Bruce-Partington Plans." In other words, adaptors have privileged some aspects of Doyle's musical detective over others, generally those that concern the violin and hence can more easily be tied to the detective's emotions. R. R. Thomas even argues that Holmes is better understood as "a fictional machine rather than a literary character."<sup>93</sup> It can be difficult for adaptors to grapple with such a character associated with very specific props and with such a literary history.

A creative challenge facing Holmes adaptors is thus the preservation of iconic elements that anchor the character. Like the aforementioned cape, hat, and pipe, "every Sherlockian movie...takes pains to set apart its hero by means of a series of iconic visual signatures," as Thomas Leitch argues.<sup>94</sup> He even ventures that Holmes's appeal as a character lies not in the psychological realm but the iconic one.<sup>95</sup> Peter Lewis, a critic with the *Daily Mail* takes it a few unkind steps further to call Holmes "a collection of props."<sup>96</sup> W. Somerset Maugham agrees, stating that Holmes's longevity is due to the idiosyncrasies that Doyle continued using with "the

---

<sup>93</sup> Bran Nicol, "Sherlock Holmes Version 2.0: Adapting Doyle in the Twenty-First Century," in *Sherlock Holmes and Conan Doyle: Multi-Media Afterlives*, ed. Sabine Vanacker and Catherine Wynne (New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2013), 132.

<sup>94</sup> Leitch, *Discontents*, 213.

<sup>95</sup> *Ibid.*, 207.

<sup>96</sup> Peter Haining, *The Television Sherlock Holmes* (London: Virgin Publishing, 1994), 31.

same pertinacity as the great advertisers use to proclaim the merits of their soap, beer, or cigarettes.”<sup>97</sup> Indeed, these signatures constantly reappear in screen adaptations and even, as Maugham’s claim might suggest, in advertisements. Holmes’s cape, pipe, and hat surface in war propaganda and advertisements for clothing, tobacco, and tires; a 1950s advertisement for fake leather furniture even features the detective’s violin.<sup>98</sup>

### **Iconic Violin Usage**

Even in adaptations that seem to adapt Holmes in name only, ignoring most of the Canon like parodies and looser pastiches, the iconic violin is still present. One such pastiche is Anthony Harvey’s chaotic *They Might Be Giants* from 1971. Here the character of Sherlock Holmes is not Holmes at all, but Justin Playfair, who believes himself to be Holmes after losing his mind when he became a widower, a fantasist sort of Holmes that follows in the footsteps of Buster Keaton’s *Sherlock Jr.*<sup>99</sup> During a psychiatric consult (with a doctor aptly named Mildred Watson), Playfair/Holmes picks up a violin and begins an abrasive attempt to play it. In this instance, the lack of proficiency is unimportant. The violin is acting in the same capacity as Playfair’s deerstalker hat and inverness cape: a physical connection to the personality he has assumed.

Several cartoon adaptations and parodies also use the violin in this iconic manner, helping the audience associate the character as Sherlock Holmes regardless of the context Holmes is placed in. The after-school-special *Sherlock Holmes in the 22<sup>nd</sup> Century* lifts Holmes out of Victorian England, places him in New London in 2103, and pairs him with a robot version of Watson. Though Holmes loses his signature cape and hat, he picks up a new modern “violin,”

---

<sup>97</sup> Amanda J. Field, “The Case of the Multiplying Millions: Sherlock Holmes in Advertising,” in *Sherlock Holmes and Conan Doyle: Multi-Media Afterlives*, ed. Sabine Vanacker and Catherine Wynne (New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2013), 19.

<sup>98</sup> *Ibid.*, 26, 28.

<sup>99</sup> Barnes, *Holmes on Screen*, 290.

albeit a strange keytar version. Holmes and Watson also make an appearance in an episode of *The Real Ghostbusters*, one in which they are not ghosts themselves but rather brought into a quasi-existence through “collective belief.”<sup>100</sup> This belief allows Holmes to retain his violin, and is even why the character Winston recognizes the detective. Even cartoon animal versions of Sherlock Holmes employ the instrument, such as the animalistic Holmes found in Disney’s *The Great Mouse Detective*. Here the mouse, known as Basil of Baker Street, stands in for the human Holmes, beneath whose flat he lives. Basil, like his human counterpart, enjoys playing the violin. Also noteworthy from *The Great Mouse Detective* is the brief cameo of Holmes himself, voiced by Basil Rathbone. Only a silhouette is visible, but that silhouette is clearly playing a violin.

Looser adaptations, in which creators dispense with the cape and hat and pipe (and sometimes even the detective’s name and profession), still often retain some kind of musical instrument. Gregory House of *House, MD*, a medical drama based loosely on Holmes, is a jazz pianist. In *House, MD*’s case, at least, this choice seems to align more with showing emotions (especially as this particular version of “Holmes” is even more acerbic than usual) and genius intellect rather than tying this character back to the Canon.

Enthusiasts have long considered Basil Rathbone’s Holmes (1939-1946) one of the most definitive portrayals of the character.<sup>101</sup> This may be because Rathbone had the good fortune to look startlingly similar to Paget’s drawings of Holmes; one reviewer stated that, aside from Arthur Wontner (the Holmes of several films 1931-1937), “probably no one has been so happily cast.”<sup>102</sup> Critics also praised Rathbone’s ability to show a Holmes that “manages to outwit all

---

<sup>100</sup> Ibid., 263.

<sup>101</sup> Even later adaptors occasionally allude to him: Basil of *The Great Mouse Detective*, for instance, is named after Rathbone, and the Sherlock Holmes in the new 2013 Russian series uses the name as an alias.

<sup>102</sup> Pohle and Hart, *Motion Picture*, 171.



others without being over-mannered, rude, or neurotic.”<sup>103</sup> This version of Holmes, however, stays strictly within the realm of the Victorian Gentleman. Rathbone’s Holmes lacks the same emotional connections of some later adaptations, notably the one put forward by Jeremy Brett in Granada’s series. Instead, the series focuses more on mental abilities by emphasizing his practically “omniscient nature [which] reached almost unbelievable but amusing heights,” as described by enthusiast David Stuart Davies.<sup>104</sup> Even Rathbone’s violin performance remains firmly in the land of logic and not emotion, as he is most often remembered for playing chromatic scales to a group of houseflies, attempting to find a pitch that annoys them in the hopes that he can simply play that note and “all the houseflies [will] disappear!”<sup>105</sup>

These examples demonstrate adaptors generally try to adhere to Holmes’s character, but, considering the diversity of Doyle’s stories, defining that prototypical character is challenging. As actor Jeremy Brett explains, “the definitive Sherlock Holmes is really in everyone’s head. No actor can fit into that category because every reader has his own ideal.”<sup>106</sup> Given the sheer number of Holmes adaptations, then, originality necessarily trumps fidelity for many adaptors. Indeed, as I show below, while serving as an identifier of Holmes’s character, the violin can be a tool that differentiates a new Holmes from previous incarnations. In the specific ways that the character plays the instrument, whom they perform for, and even why and in what circumstances they play the violin, nuances of each iteration’s character are revealed.

More meaningfully, however, these differences in his character give adaptors the chance to transform him from the Victorian gentleman detective to a more flawed Romantic character. Maintaining a character easily recognizable as Holmes and yet still updating him into this

---

<sup>103</sup> Scott Allen Nollen, *Sir Arthur Conan Doyle at the Cinema* (Jefferson: McFarland & Company, 1996), 126.

<sup>104</sup> Davies, *Holmes of the Movies*, 74.

<sup>105</sup> Barnes, *Holmes on Screen*, 20.

<sup>106</sup> “It’s Holmes” *TV Times* 7.141 (16 Mar 1991), 10.

Romantic Genius archetype can be particularly difficult. Fortunately, many adaptors choose to accomplish both of these tasks through Holmes's performance on the violin. In the following examples, the use of the violin is essential to this transformation.

### ***The Private Life of Sherlock Holmes* (1970): Gay, Mistaken, and Taking Dope**

Billy Wilder's *The Private Life of Sherlock Holmes* was groundbreaking for intentionally treating the characters differently than Doyle's texts. In many ways, *The Private Life of Sherlock Holmes* was the first to treat the detective as flawed, embracing the concept of Romantic Genius and brushing aside the decades of hero worship spurred on by the Rathbone films to present a Holmes capable of making mistakes. This trend continued for much of the 1970s, influencing similar films such as Nicholas Meyer's *Seven-Per-Cent Solution* (1976) and Bob Clark's *Murder by Decree* (1979). The choice to, as Wilder explains, "treat Holmes and Watson with respect but not reverence" resulted in a very different approach to the characters.<sup>107</sup>

However, Wilder's treatment elicited an overall negative response. Many critics took issue with both the possibility that Holmes could make mistakes and the other elements of the detective's personality that Wilder included, such as his drug history and possible homosexuality. Film critic Oscar Rimoldi, for instance, derided the film as "a ridiculous attempt to debunk the Holmes legend, presenting him as an inveterate drug addict, homosexual, and a fake who bluffs his famous deductions."<sup>108</sup> Wilder himself accepted that the film had some flaws, explaining that he had "prematurely reviv[ed] Holmes" and that he had erroneously cut large amounts of the story because the "larger, more elaborate picture...did not seem to work in

---

<sup>107</sup> "The Private Life of Sherlock Holmes 'Exhibitors' Campaign Book," United Artists Corporation Ltd, London, 3.

<sup>108</sup> Oscar Rimoldi, "The Detective Movies of the 30s and 40s," *Films in Review* 44.7/8 (August 1993), 226.

[the] previews.”<sup>109</sup> Barnes reveals that these cuts were actually mandated by the corporate heads and not a choice made by Wilder, as two of the stories, the prologue, and several other scenes were stricken from the picture.<sup>110</sup>

Despite its rather lackluster critical reception, *The Private Life of Sherlock Holmes* greatly influenced the adaptations that followed it. Although critics rejected the flawed Holmes, Wilder explains that this characterization is the main focus of the film, stating

I wanted to show Holmes as vulnerable, as human. He falls into an emotional dither over a woman and so his mind does not function as well,- and actually, you see, in my picture, he does *not* solve the mystery. No, he is deceived. Sherlock Holmes has failed to be Sherlock Holmes precisely because he has fallen in love, and yet he is a better human being than he was ever before.<sup>111</sup>

Wilder’s biographer Gerd Gemunden agrees, explaining that Wilder’s version of Holmes, as opposed to Doyle’s, makes Holmes more human, but it also turns him into a tragic figure, a closeted romanticist as it were.”<sup>112</sup> Likewise, this version of Watson claims that Holmes “elevated a science to an art,” implying that the latter is above the former for this film.<sup>113</sup> It is meaningful, however, that Wilder chose to do so by ignoring most of the Canonical history.<sup>114</sup>

Although the film is (or rather, was, in its first incarnation) set up in an episodic format much like Doyle’s stories, it interacts with the characters in a much different way; Holmes’s musicality is furthermore a focus of one of the “episodes.” As the title of the film suggests, most of the content here is the more intimate and personal material left out of the stories published by Watson. Holmes even makes several comments to that effect, stating that Watson has “saddled [him] with this improbable costume, which the public now expects [him] to wear” and made him

---

<sup>109</sup> Gilbert Adair, “Wilder Bewildered,” *Sight and Sound* 46.1 (Winter 1976/77): 53.

<sup>110</sup> Barnes, *Holmes on Screen*, 145.

<sup>111</sup> Allen Eyles, *A Centenary Celebration* (London: John Murray, 1986), 111.

<sup>112</sup> Gerd Gemunden, *A Foreign Affair: Billy Wilder’s American Films* (New York: Berghahn Books, 2008), 155-156.

<sup>113</sup> *Ibid.*, 161

<sup>114</sup> Harvey O’Brien, “Kingdom of Shadows,” 69.

out to be a violin virtuoso, when in fact Holmes turns down a request to perform Mendelssohn's Violin Concerto as he claims he can "barely hold [his] own in the pit orchestra of a second-rate music hall." These references not only emphasize the "behind-the-scenes" sort of look the film aims for but also pokes fun at the idea that even Doyle's Watson was a bit of an unreliable narrator.

It should also be noted that this is one of the first major adaptations that addresses the possibility of a homosexual Holmes, a trait associated with Romantic Genius through the literary hero Byron, in a very real and plausible way.<sup>115</sup> A gay Sherlock Holmes, especially one in a relationship with Dr. Watson, is an idea that has been associated with the texts for some time, as there is no information in the stories about Holmes's sex life. Most adaptations, however, cast Holmes as heterosexual; *The Private Life of Sherlock Holmes* broke several boundaries when it engaged with a different possibility on-screen. Wilder readily admitted that a gay Sherlock Holmes was his intention for this film, stating: "I should have been more daring. I have this theory. I wanted to have Holmes homosexual and not admitting it to anyone, including maybe even himself. The burden of keeping it secret was the reason he took dope."<sup>116</sup> Here, several of the Romantic Genius tropes collide, including a turn toward drugs and chaotic emotional responses. Although the longest and final "episode" of this film, titled the "Adventure of the Dumbfounded Detective" in the earlier draft, implies that Holmes has romantic feelings for the spy Ilse von Hoffmanstal, going so far as to play what the script describes as "infinitely romantic, infinitely sad" violin music upon learning of her deception, an earlier episode called "The Singular Affair of the Russian Ballerina" makes it clear that a homosexual Holmes is also

---

<sup>115</sup> Andrew Elfenbein, *Byron and the Victorians*, (New York: Cambridge University Press, 1995), 207.

<sup>116</sup> Gemunden, *Foreign Affair*, 147.

plausible.<sup>117</sup> Holmes claims to be homosexual here to avoid a sexual liaison with a ballerina named Madame Petrova who is searching for the perfect husband to produce a child with; it is unclear whether this is actually the truth or merely a ruse to escape an undesirable relationship. When Watson asks afterward about Holmes's history with women, the detective evades the question, simply informing Watson that he is being "presumptuous."

It is also this story, most of which was unfortunately left on the cutting room floor, in which occurs one of the most telling and interesting uses of violin performance in *The Private Life of Sherlock Holmes*. Gemunden notes that the violin in this film is often used in connection with romantic and sexual themes, and this story is the largest example of that technique.<sup>118</sup> Here Wilder details how exactly Holmes obtained his Stradivarius in a very different explanation than the one given in the textual Canon. Petrova's agent, Rogozhin, presents Holmes with the instrument for "services rendered." Holmes, assuming that he is being asked to do some kind of detective work, inspects the violin and declares it authentic, "a genuine Stradivarius of the best period." Rogozhin then explains that, in reality, they are searching for a sexual partner for Petrova. They had made the offer to several other men, including Tchaikovsky, when they learned that women were "not his glass of tea." Holmes then equates himself with the composer, stating "Tchaikovsky is not an isolated case" and implying that he is in a relationship with Watson. Where the official script ends, the original provides a much more fascinating coda to the story. Rogozhin goes to Baker Street, looking for "Mr. and Mrs. Sherlock Holmes," in order to give Holmes the instrument. When Holmes claims he did nothing to deserve it, Rogozhin explains that Tchaikovsky did not, either, but Petrova still gave him a grand piano. The Russian then presents Dr. Watson with flowers and asks him on a date; while Watson splutters about

---

<sup>117</sup> Billy Wilder and I. A. L. Diamond, "The Private Life of Sherlock Holmes – Temporary Script," 25 August, 1969.

<sup>118</sup> Gemunden, *Foreign Affair*, 160.

these implications, Holmes begins playing Tchaikovsky's Violin Concerto. This choice of repertoire further cements the sexual parallels to Tchaikovsky and, with them, the connections to drugs and emotion that Wilder intended.

***Sherlock Holmes (2009); Sherlock Holmes: A Game of Shadows (2011): "Manic Verging on Psychotic"***

The Sherlock Holmes portrayed by Robert Downey, Jr. in the 2009 and 2011 films by Guy Ritchie is Hollywood's take on the detective; though more action-oriented than many previous adaptations, the presence of the Holmes icons help make him recognizable. His status as a Romantic Genius is emphasized through his chaotic personality and angst-ridden emotions. Indeed, a writer from the film magazine *Empire* summed up the difference between this version of Holmes and earlier ones:

In the hands of Guy Ritchie, this latest vehicle for Arthur Conan Doyle's Sherlock Holmes character will *not* resemble the elegant detective stories that enjoyed cinematic vogue during the '50s. As played by Basil Rathbone he was a gentleman sleuth. As played by Downey Jr. he's frankly more like a raggy-boy, loose-cannon Miss Marple with an unerring nose for trouble.<sup>119</sup>

This turn toward the realm of action heroes is, in a way, a sort of reaction against the popular but restrained series created by Granada, which was itself a reaction against looser adaptations like *The Private Life of Sherlock Holmes*.<sup>120</sup> Ashley D. Polasek goes so far as to call Downey Jr.'s Holmes an unlikable antihero, "more of a child prodigy than a seasoned professional."<sup>121</sup> Polasek is not alone in her dislike for this particular adaptation: literature scholar Bran Nicol claims that

---

<sup>119</sup> "Sherlock Holmes," *Empire Magazine* 243 (Sept 2009), 75.

<sup>120</sup> Benjamin Poore, "Sherlock Holmes and the Leap of Faith: The Forces of Fandom and Convergence in Adaptations of the Holmes and Watson Stories," *Adaptation* 6.2 (2013), 163.

<sup>121</sup> Polasek, "Post-Millennial," 387.

this take on the detective would hardly pass as Holmes were it not for the iconic elements like the violin, taken too far into the land of action thrillers and James Bond.<sup>122</sup>

The creators of this version of Holmes, however, emphasize that their creation is more faithful than many have assumed. For director Guy Ritchie, a connection to the Canon specifically had to do with the spirit of the film itself. As he explained in an interview in *Empire*, “Conan Doyle wrote popular novels, and the idea is that we’re trying to make a popular, accessible entertaining film. I think we’re being authentic to the spirit of Conan Doyle in that respect, in that what we’re after is essentially an accessible, intelligent hero.”<sup>123</sup> Likewise, the producer and writer Lionel Wigram believed that updating Holmes faithfully could be easily done through simply changing which aspects of the detective were visible to the audience. As he explains, “Given the needs and demands of the modern event-action-adventure movies, [he] can make Holmes an action hero without actually betraying the character or betraying what Conan Doyle set out to do. All [he] needed to do is put on screen what [Doyle] made happen off-screen.”<sup>124</sup> For Wigram, this now on-screen action includes some of Holmes’s physical attributes and hobbies, such as his swordsmanship bareknuckle boxing, elements that Watson mentions briefly in the texts but upon which he never elaborates. This film also, as many Hollywood films do, embellished upon Holmes’s connection with Irene Adler to transform her into a romantic interest for the detective.<sup>125</sup> These differences between on-screen Holmes and Doyle’s textual are emphasized in *Game of Shadows*, as well, in which Watson, typing up a very restrained account of their adventures, is directly opposed by the bombastic action occurring during the film.<sup>126</sup>

---

<sup>122</sup> Nicol, “Adapting Doyle,” 130.

<sup>123</sup> Damon Wise, “The Game’s Afoot...” *Empire* 247 (January 2010), 82.

<sup>124</sup> Peter Clines, “The Game’s Afoot,” *Creative Screenwriting* 16.6 (November 2009), 31.

<sup>125</sup> Clines, “Game’s Afoot,” 33.

<sup>126</sup> Poore, “Leap of Faith,” 164.

Downey, Jr.'s Holmes is one with an overabundance of restless energy, whom Watson describes in the 2011 sequel as “manic verging on psychotic,” the obsession of Doyle’s Holmes’s taken to extremes. Both Downey, Jr. and Ritchie focus on this aspect of Holmes’s character; Ritchie describes the man as “game to try anything in order to deduce what he needs to deduce,” while Downey, Jr. states that Holmes is “pretty much always in control.”<sup>127</sup> He goes on to clarify that he “think[s] Holmes is primarily an archetype, because mostly, you only ever hear about people like him, who are such super-specific geniuses...it’s a pathetic, isolated existence, in that he does it to the exclusion of life, love, and all other endeavours. Except a little bit of opera when he’s feeling less than inspired.”<sup>128</sup> This is a Holmes for whom detective work is the most important element, and it makes sense that, for him, music is simply an assistance to this work.

Ritchie’s Holmes uses music not only to connect back to the Canon but also to emphasize Holmes’s heightened emotional states, especially when the detective will not admit to these feelings. The love of opera Downey Jr. mentions is certainly present in the films, as Holmes mentions wanting to see *Don Giovanni* with Watson.<sup>129</sup> Holmes’s performance on the violin, however, is more intimate. We first see Holmes holding the instrument like a guitar, attempting to serenade a group of flies with “music theory,” a nod to the Holmes of Basil Rathbone as he uses musical scales to make “order out of chaos.” Nearly all of Holmes’s violin performance is done without a bow and the nervous way he plucks at his violin echoes his almost twitchy, obsessed persona, described by Downey Jr as simply “driven.”<sup>130</sup> All of Holmes’s own playing, however, is confined to the first of the two films. In the sequel, the violin is absent bar a passing

---

<sup>127</sup> Wise, “Game’s Afoot,” 81,  
“Sherlock Holmes” *Empire*, 76.

<sup>128</sup> *Ibid.*, 75.

<sup>129</sup> This opera even becomes almost a bit of a plot point in the sequel film, along with Schubert’s *Lied* “Die Forelle.”

<sup>130</sup> *Ibid.*, 76.



comment from Mycroft, Sherlock's elder brother, who claims he can tell that Sherlock has recently acquired a new bow (though Sherlock insists it was only new strings). The lack of music performance on Holmes's part in the second film may be explained the fact that he is travelling, likely without his violin, for the majority of the film.

Near the end of the first film, Holmes engages with the violin in a sort of inner dialogue, a sophisticated technique that reveals his troubled emotional state. It is unclear whether this performance is in Holmes's mind or not, but the audience observes a man thinking through all the elements of the case and plucking the violin almost like a viola de gamba. As Watson describes in the Canon, this is Holmes using the violin to "ponder over the strange problem which he had set himself to unravel."<sup>131</sup> However, when he remembers Watson, who was injured in an explosion not long before, Holmes actually throws the violin to the ground. He has certainly inconvenienced the doctor during other cases, but to see him seriously wounded because of Holmes's fault is apparently more than the detective can handle. Though Holmes would never admit it to anyone, perhaps even himself, he cares greatly about Watson, and this is reflected in the rough treatment of his instrument. Music is, for Ritchie's Holmes, a way to express both his chaotic, rather Bohemian sensibilities and, moreover, the melancholic emotions he cannot otherwise articulate.

### ***Elementary* (2011- ): Heroin and Sober Companions**

CBS's *Elementary* is an updated version of the Sherlock Holmes stories in a much more overtly flawed sense than Ritchie's action-packed Hollywood films. Since the main storylines are set in present-day New York, this Holmes can seem, at times, very distant from his Victorian English origins. In keeping with this contemporary reimagining, *Elementary* is often praised for its

---

<sup>131</sup> Doyle, "Scarlet," 44.

diverse cast of secondary characters, among them the transgender woman Ms Hudson and African American detective Marcus Bell. Rob Doherty even transformed Dr. Watson into Joan, an Asian American woman played by Lucy Liu. This diversity, reflecting a later ethos, was a clear and intentional change, as the executive producer John Polson states that “it really wasn’t that much of a stretch when [they] were updating the Sherlock Holmes universe to make it inclusive.”<sup>132</sup> *Elementary* also transforms Holmes into both a passionate and sexual character: in addition to several sexual liaisons, this version of the character had an ardent and meaningful romance with Irene Adler before the start of the series.

Despite the obvious differences Doherty introduces in some characters in the process of this adaptation, it is perhaps Holmes himself who is the most changed. *Elementary* is one of the few adaptations that focuses on, and indeed amplifies, Holmes’s drug use in direct connection with his genius intellect. What began in the stories as recreational cocaine usage has transformed into a full-fledged heroin addiction in *Elementary*, leading to Holmes’s partnership with Watson, as she begins the series as his sober companion. If, however, he appears kinder than some other Holmes incarnations, that is an intentional choice. Although this Holmes certainly will not refrain from insulting someone’s intelligence, he has also weathered several difficult experiences that have somewhat tempered his caustic attitude. As Doherty explains, “[*Elementary’s*] Sherlock is a few years past your standard Sherlock, to whom everything came easily...He’s discovered he’s not a machine in bottoming out – and being surprised that he’s capable of bottoming out” which in turn makes Holmes a much more emotional character, capable of both empathy and rage.<sup>133</sup>

---

<sup>132</sup> Megan Townsend, “Candis Cayne Accepts at #GLAAD Awards,” [glaad.com, http://www.glaad.org/blog/video-candis-cayne-accepts-glaadawards-talks-parts-you-can-really-sink-your-teeth-trans-actors](http://www.glaad.org/blog/video-candis-cayne-accepts-glaadawards-talks-parts-you-can-really-sink-your-teeth-trans-actors) (accessed June 10, 2014).

<sup>133</sup> Polasek, “Post-Millennial,” 391.

Since classical music is not as obviously connected to this version of Holmes as some others, its relatively fewer uses in *Elementary* impart greater meaning to his character. In the very first episode, Holmes and Watson indulge in a live performance of *Tristan und Isolde*, though Holmes claims later in the third season that he does not actually like opera because of its “tedious history,” emphasizing his rejection of the rules and elitism of the upper classes. An episode in the first season, “Leviathan,” features Holmes not only listening to a recording of Beethoven’s Ninth Symphony but also playing Robert Schumann’s *Kinderszenen*, perhaps a tie to another piano-playing American version of Holmes in *Gregory House*.<sup>134</sup> This gamut from Beethoven’s celebration of brotherhood to Schumann’s calm introspection echoes this Holmes’s somewhat larger emotional range, showcasing his greater empathy relative to other Holmes versions while still not revealing most of his more intimate feelings. True to *Elementary*’s updated nature, Holmes also occasionally indulges in popular music as well.

Doherty restricts Holmes’s violin performance in *Elementary* (at least thus far) to one significant moment, one that is central to his portrayal of the detective as a drug addict. This episode, “While You Were Sleeping,” comes only a week into Joan’s cohabitation with Holmes as his sober companion (or, as Holmes describes her, the woman who “keeps [him] from doing heroin”), but it is already clear to both Watson and the audience that Holmes does not handle emotions well. This deficiency becomes even clearer when Joan discovers Holmes’s violin tucked away in the hall closet. After suggesting that Holmes play it again as a form of stress relief, the detective actually attempts to burn the instrument, declaring: “You were right about the stress relief, I felt like Jimi Hendrix for a second there!”

---

<sup>134</sup> This is not the first version of Holmes to have an affinity for Beethoven symphonies: the Holmes of Basil Rathbone solved “The Voice of Terror” with his knowledge of Beethoven’s Symphony Number 5.

Fortunately, Watson rescues the instrument before any real damage can be done, and it soon becomes clear that Holmes has forced himself to stop playing the violin as a form of penance for his drug addiction: the instrument itself has become a victim of Holmes's substance abuse. When Joan presses Holmes on the issue, the detective lovingly removes the violin from its case, metaphorically coming to terms with his addiction in the process. He tears up before the scene cuts away to Watson listening to him play Bach's *Partita 2 in D Minor*.<sup>135</sup>

*Elementary's* Holmes is an incredibly flawed character. Although he is recovering, Holmes's drug addiction, and indeed addictive personality in general, affect many aspects of his personality. Doherty goes so far as to call his drive to solve crimes "obsession to the point you might call it addiction."<sup>136</sup> (To be sure, this drug addiction was not a creative option for Doyle, who, although he does make several references to Holmes's cocaine use, notably in "Sign of Four" when the cocaine bottle is all that remains for Holmes after Watson marries Mary Morstan. Cocaine usage was not made illegal until 1920 and was often associated with "brainy, highly-strung" people before then, hence not imparting the sense of a lack of control that it does today.)<sup>137</sup> This modern view of drug usage greatly alters our perception of the character; significantly, *Elementary* and *The Private Life of Sherlock Holmes* share this trait of Holmes turning to drugs in response to romance or sexuality, as it was not until after Irene Adler's supposed death that this Holmes became an addict. By updating Holmes in this way, Doherty creates a Holmes that loses control of that drug habit and, thus, essentially loses control of his own mind.

---

<sup>135</sup> Philiana Ng, "Emmys: 'Elementary's' Jonny Lee Miller Revels in the Idiosyncrasies of Sherlock Holmes," *The Hollywood Reporter*, <http://www.hollywoodreporter.com/race/emmys-elementarys-jonny-lee-miller-567712> (accessed June 17, 2014).

<sup>136</sup> Polasek, "Post-Millennial," 391.

<sup>137</sup> Tom de Castella, "100 Years of the War on Drugs," *bbc.com* <http://www.bbc.com/news/magazine-16681673> (accessed 29 November, 2014).

### ***The Adventures of Sherlock Holmes (1984-1994): “An Isolated, Lonely Man”***

Holmes enthusiasts have held up Granada Television’s take as the most faithful to Doyle’s Canonical stories, and with good reason. Michael Cox, the creator of the series, endeavored, as he put it, “to do the best Sherlock Holmes series *ever*,” remaining “faithful to the original stories and the original atmosphere.”<sup>138</sup> This choice involved not only staying true to Doyle’s Canon, but also directly copying the Sidney Paget drawings. This adaptation also covers the largest amount of the Canon, with forty-one episodes and forty-two Canonical stories. Moving from short story texts to fifty-minute television episodes necessitated additional material, which Cox justified in an interview: “we did depart from the text at times. We added things or changed things. There’s often a difference between what works on the page and what works in a dramatic medium. I hope that we’ve never done anything which went against the spirit of what Conan Doyle wrote.”<sup>139</sup> Cox was not alone in insisting on Canonical fidelity. Brett himself was unrelenting in his ideas of what Holmes should be like, stating that “adaptors have a right to do their own thing. But they will sometimes miss out important words and that’s when I get reminders from Conan Doyle. And I’ll battle to get them back.”<sup>140</sup>

Since the Granada series is closely tied to the Canon, it is not surprising that many of Doyle’s musical scenes play out in the episodes. Indeed, Cox even references Holmes’s oft-ignored Renaissance music research, alluding to the detective’s Lassus research in “The Bruce-Partington Plans,” which features Holmes singing Palestrina’s “Sicut cervus desiderat,” and a shot of the detective’s desk littered with musical scores. In homage to Paget’s solitary music

---

<sup>138</sup> Nollen, *Doyle at the Cinema*, 229.

<sup>139</sup> Elizabeth A. Trembley, “Holmes is Where the Heart Is: The Achievement of Granada Television’s Sherlock Holmes Films,” in *It’s a Print!: Detective Fiction from Page to Screen*, ed. William Reynolds and Elizabeth A. Trembley (Bowling Green: Bowling Green State University Popular Press, 1994), 12.

<sup>140</sup> Quoted in Haining, *Television*, 155.

drawing, this series also retains Sarasate's concert in "The Red-Headed League," and Brett's Holmes seems just as pleased to be hearing it.<sup>141</sup>

Although there is certainly a strong fidelity to the Canon in Granada's version of the stories, Brett's portrayal of Holmes as a deeply emotional character casts this version as a clear Romantic Genius type. Brett once described Holmes as "a tortured creature" and "not a happy man," apt descriptions for Cox's Holmes, though the script also called for the detective to laugh, an element that surprised Brett.<sup>142</sup> In another interview Brett called Holmes "vulnerable," "an isolated, lonely man, and a difficult one to live with for an actor."<sup>143</sup> Likewise, Terry Manners, one of Brett's biographers, described how this emotional characterization of Holmes affected the audience and even other characters when he explained that "Jeremy wore his loneliness and alienation openly enough for Watson and the viewers to recognise them for what they were, cloaking them with an air of aloof superiority that was frequently cold, inflexible, and cruel."<sup>144</sup> For Brett the distinction between the Romantic Genius he portrayed and the Victorian gentleman of the Canon was a clear one:

My Sherlock streaks through the night sky, - not naked, you understand, but like a magnesium flare, with all the world trying to keep up with him. A man of utter genius, not a depressant [sic]. Other people see me as the Sherlock who twitches and looks stoned. They tell me I managed to get the combination of genius and madness. But there is another type of Holmes: thinking man's Holmes, who works through things logically, - spasmodically puffing on his pipe, as ashes tumble down his waistcoat. That's the one I've never been able to capture.<sup>145</sup>

Brett's Holmes, in many ways, became the defining portrayal of the character (despite the actor's misgivings about his own performance), exerting a strong influence on other recent adaptations.

---

<sup>141</sup> Barnes, *Holmes on Screen*, 27.

<sup>142</sup> Barnes, *Holmes on Screen*, 24.

<sup>143</sup> Haining, *Television*, 157.

<sup>144</sup> Terry Manners, *The Man Who Became Sherlock Holmes* (London: Virgin Books, 1997), 131.

<sup>145</sup> Ekberg, "Holmes and Away!" 10.

The isolation and vulnerability that Brett portrayed is especially evident in connection with his violin performance. A subtle instance occurs in “The Resident Patient,” where Holmes plays part of the third movement cadenza from Beethoven’s Violin Concerto, an impressive display of virtuosity (albeit with rather exaggerated bowing). However, Watson disappoints Holmes by asking him to practice elsewhere, so he can write up the notes from their case without distraction. Here Cox uses Beethoven rather than Bach – the favorite of other adaptors – to evoke pathos rather than mathematical logic. We also observe Holmes’s emotional connection to the violin even when he is not playing it. Toward the end of “The Norwood Builder,” Watson observes Holmes “at his lowest ebb,” depressed, melancholy, and clearly having been awake the entire night with the violin on the floor by his feet.<sup>146</sup> This scene echoes the Canon; though we do not see Holmes “fling down the instrument” in distress, the implication is clear. It is Watson who rescues the instrument from its precarious position in front of the fireplace. In this case, the violin has failed in its traditional role of cognitive aid and emotional balm.

The ending of “A Scandal in Bohemia” epitomizes the isolated, lonely Holmes, alone in Baker Street after being beaten in a battle of wits with Irene Adler. Here Adler retains her operatic roots, and Holmes fittingly spends the final minutes of the episode “reprising her aria on his violin and then gazing mournfully into the fire,” a photograph of Adler visually cementing the connection.<sup>147</sup> The Granada adaptation is one of the few that foregoes any kind of romantic connection between Holmes and Adler; however, the emotional connection remains, made palpable by the violin. Not only has Holmes’s intellect been bested, and by a woman, no less, he has also lost the connection with a woman with whom he identified. Significantly, Brett anticipated critical blowback for this scene, concerned as he was that the drugs, disguises, and

---

<sup>146</sup> Michael Cox, *A Study in Celluloid: A Producer’s Account of Jeremy Brett as Sherlock Holmes* (Cambridge: Rupert Books, 1999), 70.

<sup>147</sup> *Ibid.*, 45.

violin was like “trying to do the Holmes things all at once.”<sup>148</sup> Nevertheless, Miv Schaff, a critic writing in the *Los Angeles Times*, singled out music in this scene for its emotional impact, praising the “slow, sad melody” as “a sober one that Holmes himself might have composed.”<sup>149</sup>

### ***Sherlock* (2010- ): “Sentiment is a Chemical Defect”**

Steven Moffat and Mark Gatiss’s *Sherlock* is another modern adaptation, though it carries a stronger tie to the literary Canon than *Elementary*. Their version of Holmes resides in twenty-first century London, seems glued to his ever-updating smart phone, and keeps a blog in which he describes how to tell the differences between 243 types of tobacco ash. Gatiss states that, from its inception, *Sherlock* was intentionally anti-Victorian, as Holmes had especially “become so much about the trappings – the hansom cabs, the fog, Jack the Ripper...”<sup>150</sup> Instead, the creators wanted their version to “literally blow away the fog and get back to the idea of these two unlikely men and this unlikely friendship.”<sup>151</sup> To that end, Moffat and Gatiss updated several other elements: Mrs. Hudson has been elevated from their housekeeper to their landlady, Moriarty threatens the country through terrorism and computer codes, and the “V. R.” Holmes shoots into the wall in boredom has been replaced by a gaudy smiley face, effectively mocking the Victorian patriotism shown by Doyle’s literary Holmes. This adaptation also owes much to Wilder’s *The Private Life of Sherlock Holmes*, which Moffat and Gatiss acknowledge as a

---

<sup>148</sup> David Stuart Davies, *Bending the Willow: Jeremy Brett as Sherlock Holmes* (Ashcroft: Calabash Press, 1996), 37.

<sup>149</sup> Quoted in Haining, *Television*, 163.

<sup>150</sup> Barnes, *Holmes on Screen*, 168.

<sup>151</sup> Neil Wilkes and Nick Levine, “Mark Gatiss talks ‘Who’, ‘Sherlock,’” [digitalspy.com http://www.digitalspy.co.uk/british-tv/s7/doctor-who/tubetalk/a214862/mark-gatiss-talks-who-sherlock.html#ixzz3UUclMDzE](http://www.digitalspy.co.uk/british-tv/s7/doctor-who/tubetalk/a214862/mark-gatiss-talks-who-sherlock.html#ixzz3UUclMDzE) (accessed 6 October 2014).



source; this connection between the two adaptations can be seen in Moffat's assertions that Doyle's Canon is not "holy writ" and "irreverence is important to Sherlock Holmes."<sup>152</sup>

Although Benedict Cumberbatch, who plays Holmes in Moffat and Gatiss's series, portrays the title character as cold and emotionless, especially toward the beginning of the series, the viewer learns that this appearance is the outward face of emotional deficiencies. Holmes often seems almost inhuman, admitting in "The Empty Hearse," the first episode of the third season, that he has no understanding of human nature. Likewise, Watson calls him a "machine" in a fit of rage during "The Reichenbach Fall." There are clues that Holmes's condition results from trauma; for instance, police sergeant Sally Donovan's favorite nickname for Holmes is "freak," and a college "friend" named Sebastian Wilkes admits that everyone there hated Holmes. In contrast to the several characters who describe him as a psychopath, Holmes self-servingly (and erroneously) claims to be a "high-functioning sociopath" on several different occasions. As Moffat explains:

he'd really like to be a sociopath. But he's so fucking not...He's repressed his emotions, his passions, his desires, in order to make his brain work better — in itself, a very emotional decision, and it does suggest that he must be very emotional if he thinks emotions get in the way. I just think Sherlock Holmes must be bursting!<sup>153</sup>

This characterization of Holmes echoes a tie back to Moffat and Gatiss's interpretation of the Canon, as Moffat asserts that "[Conan Doyle] never said [Holmes] was unemotional, he said that

---

<sup>152</sup> Polasek, "Post-Millennial," 390.

<sup>153</sup> Denise Martin, "Steven Moffat Explains the Origins of Sherlock's Best-Man Speech," Vulture.com, <http://www.vulture.com/2014/01/steven-moffat-sherlock-holmes-best-man-speech-interview.html> (accessed June 3, 2014).

he disdains such things as distractions. If they are distractions to him, that means he's aware of them."<sup>154</sup>

Cumberbatch's Holmes is one that is flawed in other ways, as well. Like those seen in *Elementary* and *The Private Life of Sherlock Holmes*, he abuses drugs. What was implied throughout the first two seasons with comments from Mycroft about so-called "danger nights" and a fake drugs bust by Detective Inspector Lestrade is confirmed in the third season when Watson finds Holmes in a crack den. As the series progresses, however, the drugs and danger nights become less about recreation and more about Holmes's inability to deal with his emotions, such as when Irene Adler appears to be killed and Holmes loses contact with Watson after the latter's marriage to Mary Morstan. This version of Sherlock Holmes also flirts with the boundaries of good and evil: Nicol describes him as "comparable to the obviously unhinged villains he confronts," and indeed he goes so far as to inflict pain on one such villain in the very first episode in order to gain information.<sup>155</sup> These morally questionable choices culminate in the ninth episode with Holmes shooting a blackmailer in the head; this action, however, was done not for information but to protect the Watsons, a choice that almost leads to his own death. For Polasek, these moral decisions are at the heart of *Sherlock's* interpretation of Holmes, as she explains that "*Sherlock* not only interrogates the transgression of the hero/antihero boundary, it deconstructs those labels by making the transgression the key to understanding the character."<sup>156</sup> This is not the gentleman detective of the Doyle's Canon, but rather a much more flawed character whose drive and emotions cause him to make questionable decisions.

From the very beginning of the series, BBC's *Sherlock* makes consistent and diverse use of the violin. When he meets Watson in the first episode Holmes asks, in a nod to the Canon

---

<sup>154</sup> Polasek, "Post-Millennial," 389.

<sup>155</sup> Nicol, "Adapting Doyle," 129.

<sup>156</sup> Polasek, "Post-Millennial," 390

story, “how do you feel about the violin?” He then tells Watson that he plays the violin when he’s thinking, a trait he ironically characterizes as his worst quality from a flatmate’s perspective; nevertheless, his musicality is foregrounded. Moffat and Gatiss, in contrast to Cox and Brett, actively play with the Canonical elements, often subverting them or turning them on their head, but Holmes’s violin performance remains constant. (In fact, this adaptation’s connection to the violin is obvious enough that Cumberbatch’s official *Sherlock* figurine, marked alongside the series, comes with its own miniature instrument, described in the packaging as one of his “signature accessories.”<sup>157</sup>)

Moffat and Gatiss’s invent a strong relationship between Sherlock and his elder brother Mycroft, a sort of sibling rivalry taken to extremes and shaped by a significant role for the violin. The brothers in the Canon enjoyed an amicable relationship, with Sherlock even willingly admitting that Mycroft is smarter than he. In the *Sherlock*, the Holmes brothers behave antagonistically, an interpretive departure emphasized by the violin. For example, in the series one finale, “The Great Game,” Mycroft asks Sherlock to look into a case of treason (checking up on him in the process following a nearby building explosion). Sherlock drives him out of the flat with a pattern of rapid, discordant string crossings: technically impressive but musically abrasive. In “A Scandal in Belgravia,” Mycroft asks his brother to look into a case, refusing to give the name of the client but making vague references to the Royal Family. Upon Mycroft’s departure, Sherlock asks his brother to “give her my love,” and proceeds to play “God Save the Queen,” ensuring that everyone in the room knows exactly who the secret client is.

Throughout the series, Holmes gradually becomes more willing to allow people to hear his more intimate performances. He initially seems to mostly keep his playing to himself, only

---

<sup>157</sup> “Sherlock Holmes 1:6 Scale Figures,” Bigchiefstudios.co.uk <http://www.bigchiefstudios.co.uk/collectables/sherlock/sixth-scale-figures/sherlock-holmes> (accessed 2 February 2014).

letting Watson and Mrs. Hudson, their landlady, hear him practice out of necessity. However, as in the Canon, he can occasionally be convinced to give impromptu performances. Two of these occur again in “A Scandal in Belgravia”: one during a Christmas Party where Holmes plays through some simple carols, and a second instance on New Year’s when Holmes plays “Auld Lang Syne” for John at midnight. These performances are more for his audience’s benefit than Holmes’s; the detective is still a “performer” in the literal sense of the word, providing live holiday entertainment. The fact that he is willingly participating in the activity at all, however, demonstrates a growing acceptance of the emotions of others.

A more sinister and emotionally jarring violin performance comes in the finale of series two, “The Reichenbach Fall,” as Holmes confronts his nemesis Moriarty. Although the detective puts up a stoic, unshakeable front, it is obvious that he is frightened of Moriarty. Holmes’s drug-induced hallucination of the man in the previous episode, “The Hounds of Baskerville,” is met with unadulterated terror. When Moriarty rigs the jury and walks away from his trial in “Reichenbach,” Holmes correctly deduces that the criminal is coming to him. After the required British act of preparing tea, Holmes picks up his violin and begins to play, perhaps to calm his nerves over the impending meeting, though it is telling that the work he performs is not one of his own but rather the first movement of Bach’s *Sonata in G Minor*, a somewhat less personal choice that allows Holmes to hide his terror behind contrapuntal competence, revealing far less about his emotional state than his own compositions. The piece is brought to a halt, however, in mid-phrase when Moriarty arrives, Holmes unable to complete the calming act. This scene directly parallels the confrontation between Holmes and Moriarty in the Basil Rathbone film “The Woman in Green,” although the piece Holmes is playing in that adaptation is Anton Rubinstein’s “Melody in F.” The choice to replace Rubinstein with Bach in this instance is

curious, considering that much of the music Holmes performs in *Sherlock* leans toward the Romantic side. In this case, composer Michael Price evokes what he identifies as the common perception of Bach's music as logical.<sup>158</sup> Not only does Bach showcase the connection to genius exhibited by both Holmes and Moriarty, but it also lets Holmes hide his emotions, especially fear, behind a smokescreen of contrapuntal rigor.

The most meaningful performances are those of Holmes's own compositions, as they furnish an emotional outlet that transcends his apathetic mask. As noted, Holmes puts on an air of emotionlessness and constantly derides love and sentiment, calling the former "a dangerous disadvantage" and the latter "a chemical defect found on the losing side" during "A Scandal in Belgravia." However, these lines follow an emotional roller coaster of an episode for the detective. Irene Adler (in this incarnation, a dominatrix with a penchant for blackmail) appears to have been murdered, moving Holmes to compose a memorial piece, during which he foregoes food and communication. The work's mourning tone and its longing implications are immediately evident to John, Mrs. Hudson, and the audience.<sup>159</sup> This expression of affection, a chink in Holmes's self-proclaimed sociopathic armor, can only be communicated musically; verbalizing the desire is too difficult for someone so reserved. This music might seem out of place for such a cold character, but, as Price explains, "It's easy to imagine a character like Sherlock expressing himself in music in a way that he doesn't in other parts of his life. Many composers of very romantic music have been decidedly frosty in real life."<sup>160</sup>

Although the composition for Irene remains firmly behind the closed doors of Baker Street, Holmes performs a second, even more emotional composition in public. When John and

---

<sup>158</sup> Michael Price, email correspondence, 6 February, 2015.

<sup>159</sup> Mary Jo Watts, "Music to Picture: An Interview with Composer Michael Price," Mid0nz Wordpress Blog, <http://mid0nz.wordpress.com/2014/04/16/music-to-picture-an-interview-with-composer-michael-price/> (accessed May 1, 2014).

<sup>160</sup> Price, email correspondence.

Mary Morstan marry in “The Sign of Three,” the second episode of series three, Sherlock forgoes a purchased gift, instead offering the couple an original composition. Holmes performs this piece, a waltz, during the well-attended reception. Like every other part of the wedding, Holmes has ensured that this gift is perfect, and an earlier scene depicts him “road-testing” the piece, dancing along to a version he recorded to test the speed and suitability. Even the manuscript is immaculately written; where other compositions seen on the Baker Street set have mostly been illegible pencil scribbles, this one is flawlessly transcribed in ink. His care demonstrates the extent to which his public persona is at odds with his inner world: indeed, he publically derides weddings as “celebration[s] of all that is false and specious and irrational and sentimental” while laboring over the intimate gift he will give John and Mary. He is a man who can and does experience deep emotion, finally admitting to love John in his best man speech, the plain devotion in the waltz intensifying this sentiment.<sup>161</sup> It is precisely this sentiment that leads Holmes to make an almost fatal mistake: upon his return from the dead in “The Empty Hearse,” his love for John causes him to ignore the deduction he makes about Mary’s past as an assassin, a mistake that earns him a gunshot wound.

*Sherlock* is unique in focusing on Holmes’s identity as a composer, and it is no coincidence that Gatiss and Moffat’s Holmes is also one of the best at hiding his emotions. In a recent interview, Price spoke about Sherlock’s role and influences as a composer:

I sparingly used it’s...incredibly effective because it allows, or we think it allows us a glimpse into Sherlock’s character, because the sort of music that someone would write, if they could write music, is an incredibly direct route to their tastes and their subconscious in a way....There’s a slightly off-center element to the tunes that Sherlock “writes”. His language is still tonal but... Neither [of the compositions] are squared off at the edges. They’re sort of slightly unbalanced and...I think it’s interesting from the performances, particularly in the “Woman” episode [*A Scandal in Belgravia*], that there’s a sense, listening to Mrs. Hudson’s reaction and to John’s reaction, that the piece for Irene is sort of more romantic probably than they’ve heard Sherlock play before, which is why they

---

<sup>161</sup> Martin, “Sherlock’s Best-Man Speech.”

all sort of go, “Ooh ah. You’re writing a piece for her.” So if I was going to guess, it would be a route through Bach, through Bartók, to Sherlock.<sup>162</sup>

The connection to Bartók may seem strange and out of place, but Price connects the composer to Holmes’s tonal yet “slightly off-center” compositional technique.<sup>163</sup> Eos Chater, the professional violinist who taught Cumberbatch how to play (and performs on the soundtracks), likewise calls Irene’s theme “a beautiful and forlorn melody,” and recognizes the connection between that composition and Holmes’s emotional state, recalling that “when it comes to the close up of Sherlock’s face when he’s playing this sad theme – he looks so forlorn and so deep in his own sorrow.”<sup>164</sup> The Waltz, though not as melancholic as Irene’s theme, holds a similar emotional value: a charmingly simple piece that carries a bit of romance and nostalgia, as well. BBC’s Sherlock Holmes is certainly a genius, a man with an almost eidetic memory who can solve any crime, but he has also been transformed from the Canonical Victorian gentleman to a morally grey vagabond-like character, one who is slowly learning to accept his own emotions and faults.

Although each of these adaptors uses Holmes’s musicality in very different ways, they do so in order to foreground the detective’s new status as Romantic Genius. Whether this connection is through drug abuse, sexuality, a disdain for social rules, melancholic emotions, or some combination thereof, the violin is an excellent tool for emphasizing certain elements of Holmes’s personality. Through privileging these aspects, adaptors can retain Holmes’s Canonical roots while still discarding the personality of Doyle’s Gentleman Detective.

---

<sup>162</sup> Watts, “Music to Picture.”

<sup>163</sup> Ibid.

<sup>164</sup> Eos Chater, “Sherlock on the Fiddle,” Earth Observing System Blog <http://earthobservingsystem.tumblr.com/post/15188532235/sherlock-on-the-fiddle> (accessed May 1, 2014).

## **Chapter 4: Narration and the Extra-Diegesis**

Although Holmes's violin performance, an element of the diegesis, is a large factor for shaping and describing his character, there are extra-diegetic elements such as narration and music to consider, as adaptors do not usually have access to Watson's first-person narration. Some adaptors, particularly Cox in Granada's *The Adventures of Sherlock Holmes*, employ a voice-over narration style, this choice is not the only option available. Indeed, a more subtle narration is often tied very closely to the musical score, especially the extra-diegetic elements therein. In their literary form, these first-person frame narratives depend on the character of Watson to tell the stories; on-screen, the third-person narration is taken up by filmic techniques including the extra-diegetic score and Watson's role shifts to one of a foil of his companion. To advance my argument that extra-diegetic music takes up the role of main narrative agent, I first look at other narrative strategies and further emphasize Holmes's connection to both music and the violin.

### **Narration and Character Identities**

Among the icons available to adaptors to remain faithful to Holmes's essentially Romantic character, the violin alone holds the potential for narrative function. Holmes adaptations are further complicated by the inclusion of frame narration, a technique in which the focus is on a character other than the narrator, and the use of the short story, a genre in which much of the material is internalized.<sup>165</sup> The frame narration technique, however, also elevates Watson's status, as literary critic Seymour Chatman states that "the [literary] narrator, by definition, does not see things in the story world; only characters can do that, because only they occupy that

---

<sup>165</sup> Ben Brady, *Principles of Adaptation for Film and Television* (Austin: University of Texas Press, 1994), 4.



world.”<sup>166</sup> However, Watson is capable of precisely such a dual function. In his frame narration, Watson is both outside of Holmes’s character, unable to understand his emotions and mental processes but also firmly within the realm of the story itself. Because Watson’s main role in the Canon is as a narrator and biographer, screen adaptations must find a way to compensate.<sup>167</sup> Brian McFarlane, in a case study of David Lean’s adaptation of Dickens’s *Great Expectations*, calls attention to voice-over and subjective camera work, two of the most common methods for depicting a first-person narrator in film.<sup>168</sup> Though many Holmes adaptors utilize these methods, the addition of musical performance adds new options.

For example, adaptors use Holmes’s performances to illuminate thoughts or emotions that would otherwise be lost without the narrator. As George Bluestone asserts, “the rendition of mental states...cannot be as adequately represented by film as by language.”<sup>169</sup> The violin performance inherent in many Holmes adaptations serves to externalize these mental states; though explicit language is not present, the emotional implications are much more observable. For the audience, experiencing Holmes’s “low, melancholy wailings” may even be more effective on screen than in the original text.<sup>170</sup> The connection between characters and items may also be more successful on film. Bluestone further argues that “relationships between humans are illuminated by words – actors’ relationships to objects is of special interest in film.”<sup>171</sup> This is certainly true of Holmes’s relationship with his violin in screen adaptations. There is a significant difference between Watson telling us about the detective improvising on the

---

<sup>166</sup> Quoted in Jerrold Levinson, “Film Music and Narrative Agency,” in *Post-Theory: Reconstructing Film Studies* edited by David Bordwell and Noël Carroll, (Madison: University of Wisconsin Press, 1996), 252.

<sup>167</sup> Trembley, “Where the Heart Is,” 18.

<sup>168</sup> McFarlane, *Novel to Film*, 122-126.

<sup>169</sup> Bluestone, *Novels into Film*, 47.

<sup>170</sup> Doyle, “Scarlet,” 14.

<sup>171</sup> Bluestone, *Novels into Film*, 26.

instrument and actually experiencing the sort of dialogue that takes place between Holmes and violin.

Adaptors frequently employ voice-over narration, a significant usage considering narration is generally accomplished with framing, camerawork, cuts, and extra-diegetic music.<sup>172</sup> Its prevalence in Holmes adaptations is an element that firmly connects the on-screen adaptations to their literary predecessor, and can be seen in several of the adaptations discussed in Chapter Three. Often, the style of these narrations reflect the tone and mood of the adaptation. Granada's television production often used voice-over narration directly quoted from the Canon, like much of the other dialogue. Likewise, the narration in between "episodes" of *The Private Life of Sherlock Holmes* sounds as if it *could* come from Doyle's original text, as Watson imparting a new, unheard story to his readers. Ritchie's Hollywood Holmes, in the spirit of its Victorian yet contemporary style, contrasts Watson's "prim and proper" narration against the barely controlled chaos occurring in real time.<sup>173</sup>

Adaptors of screen works can also use voice-over narration in new functions that would not have a place in the Canon, such as the recap in Doherty's *Elementary*. These segments, which refer the viewer to the preceding episode, not only remind the audience of key events but afford the opportunity for Watson or Holmes to speak outside of the diegesis. From this space, the characters become separated from their on-screen selves, fulfilling the role of a chronicler or story-teller and reminding the audience that the story is fictional. That adaptors place the recap before the opening theme is also significant, as they strictly separate the narrative style in the recap from that of the episode proper. Such an arrangement presupposes that episodes flow from one to the next, which is not always the case as in Granada's program, since those episodes,

---

<sup>172</sup> Guido Heldt, *Music and Levels of Narration in Film*, (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2013), 62.

<sup>173</sup> Poore, "Leap of Faith," 164.

functioning as Canonical short stories, are not necessarily interconnected. Another function of these voice-overs, and one that was absent from the Canon, is a way to let the audience into Holmes's deductions in real-time. The films starring Downey, Jr. feature Holmes himself in voice-over narration for his own deductions, especially during the fight scenes.<sup>174</sup> *Sherlock*, through use of on-screen text, also allows the audience into Holmes's thought processes. In this way, the on-screen narrators of these adaptations actually know more than the literary Watson, who constantly reminds his readers that he does not understand how Holmes's mind works, and indeed almost become omniscient in their presentation of the characters and the story.<sup>175</sup>

With the shift from the written page to the screen, adaptors grapple with the purpose of Dr. Watson. In the literary frame narration, his role is a clear and obvious one: to tell the readers about Holmes's adventures. Although Watson certainly becomes a valuable person to Holmes, a friend and companion, he is first and foremost the detective's biographer. As such, Watson is tellingly absent in three of the four stories ("The Blanched Soldier," "The Lion's Mane," and "His Last Bow") that are either narrated in first-person by Holmes or entirely in third-person. Indeed, by the time Holmes has retired in "The Lion's Mane," he and Watson have not even seen each other for several years, a fact that is omitted from nearly every on-screen adaptation. Likewise, Holmes expresses affection for Watson only once throughout the whole of the Canon and shows blatant distrust, or at least doubt, in Watson's mental abilities on several occasions.<sup>176</sup> Even Watson's role as audience surrogate, necessary in the literary version, is negated by the screen's arguably third-person point of view structure.

---

<sup>174</sup> Poore, "Leap of Faith," 165.

<sup>175</sup> James Krasner, "Watson Falls Asleep: Narrative Frustration and Sherlock Holmes," *English Literature in Transition, 1880-1920* 40.4 (1997), 430.

<sup>176</sup> In "The Three Garridebs," "For God's sake, say you are not hurt!"

In both "The Hound of the Baskervilles" and "The Naval Treaty" Holmes sends Watson on errands designed to get him out of the way.

It is only in the advent of the new, updated Romantic Genius Holmes that Watson has a clear function in adaptations. The further an adaptation takes Holmes's character from its original "supremely competent, realistically human" literary beginnings, as Elizabeth Trembley describes them, the more important Watson becomes.<sup>177</sup> It is no longer the doctor's position as chronicler that is key, though most adaptors reference this position, be it as a "blogger" in BBC's *Sherlock* or Watson compiling notes on her client in *Elementary*. Instead, adaptors transform Watson into a non-genius anchor for the detective. As Steven Moffat explains of his adaptation, "Sherlock Holmes doesn't need another brain. He needs the most reliable, competent, dependable, human being in the world, and in the judgement of a genius that is what Dr Watson is."<sup>178</sup> This *need* for Watson in Holmes's life is not limited to the BBC adaptation: Peter Haining says of Jeremy Brett's characterization that

[w]ithout Watson, Holmes would probably have gone mad. With his all consuming [sic] interest in crime he would have driven himself mad if he didn't have this sensible fellow by his side to keep his feet on the ground, to get him to eat, to remind him to dress properly, to wean him off his addiction to cocaine.<sup>179</sup>

This more recent pairing of a Romantic Genius Holmes and humanizing Watson also accounts for the stark difference between the characterization of both Holmes and Watson in the Rathbone series. Nigel Bruce's Watson, known for his tendency to mumble inarticulately and sure to cause a misstep at least once per film, was present more for comedic effect than any kind of humanizing character. Indeed, Doyle's daughter Dame Jean once described this version of Watson as "appalling," claiming that Holmes's friendship with such a bumbling character was not believable.<sup>180</sup> In the light of such a perfect Holmes in Rathbone, one known for associating

---

<sup>177</sup> Trembley, "Where the Heart Is," 11.

<sup>178</sup> Steven Moffat, "Unlocking Sherlock" *Sherlock* Season 3 Extra Created by Mark Gatiss and Steven Moffat. Richmond, UK: Hartwood Films, 2014, DVD.

<sup>179</sup> Haining, *Television Sherlock Holmes*, 154.

<sup>180</sup> Nollen, *Doyle at the Cinema*, 120.

Holmes with a sense of perfection and his own “sincere, polite warmth,” Watson is hardly needed as a foil.<sup>181</sup> In this transformation from Victorian literary character to Romantic Genius, it is not only Holmes that adaptors must change.

Holmes’s current status of Romantic Genius and its association with musical performance becomes so imperative that, in most cases, Irene Adler is stripped of her own musicality to emphasize his. In the adaptations mentioned in chapter three, only Granada’s, the epitome of textual fidelity, retains Irene’s opera career. In Ritchie’s Hollywood films, she is, as can be expected of the genre, transformed into a *femme fatale* type with an off-again on-again relationship with Holmes. Moffat and Gatiss, likewise, attempt to update the questionable image opera singers had during the Victorian Period by making Irene a professional dominatrix. In *Elementary* Adler exhibits some artistic qualities as a painter, but is moreover merged into Moriarty, both the love of Holmes’s life and his greatest enemy. Her musicality, the very thing Morra cited as the indicator of her intellect, has been removed; it should come as no surprise, then, that the “updated” version of her fails when put in a battle of wits with the male genius characters.<sup>182</sup> This alteration and indeed devaluation of her character is a fairly recent trend, as many fans and enthusiasts have been keen to explore Irene’s wit and musicality. Indeed, Guy Warrack goes so far as to trace an imaginary career for her, citing performances in *Aida*, *Norma*, and *Orfeo*, among others, at La Scala.<sup>183</sup>

The image of Moriarty in Ritchie and Moffat and Gatiss’s adaptations, too, cements the ideals of music and genius. Here, music is *added* to his character through both diegetic and

---

<sup>181</sup> Ibid., 126.

This Holmes famously made only one mistake in the entire run of films, when he inadvertently caused the theft of a priceless artifact in *The Pearl of Death*.

<sup>182</sup> Morra, “musical box,” 168.

<sup>183</sup> Margo Miller, “Musical Chairs: When ‘The Woman’ was an American Contralto,” *Boston Globe* 30 December, 1964, 9.

quasi-diegetic techniques. In Ritchie's sequel, *Sherlock Holmes: Game of Shadows*, Moriarty is, despite his official career as a professor of mathematics, narratively associated with opera: a performance of *Don Giovanni* is involved in his plot to blow things up, assassinate people, and generally be maximally destructive. Ritchie's Moriarty also appreciates Schubert's "Die Forelle," a *Lied* about a fish and fisherman that is playing on his gramophone during his first confrontation with Holmes. In a particularly gruesome and unsettling scene, Moriarty later sings along to a recording of this song as he tortures Holmes for information with the use of a large hook, metaphorically transforming Holmes into the fish and himself into the musical narrator who catches the fish.<sup>184</sup> *Sherlock's* Moriarty, likewise, exhibits knowledge and enjoyment of music. In their confrontation at Baker Street, Moriarty subverts Holmes's performance of Bach by introducing an anecdote about the composer's death, stealing Bach's genius connection away from Holmes and associating it with himself. Several of Moriarty's lines throughout the series are also delivered in a singsong, almost operatic voice.<sup>185</sup> In an earlier scene, Moriarty introduces the overture to Rossini's *The Thieving Magpie* at a quasi-diegetic level, as it accompanies both his stylized theft of the Crown Jewels through music piped into his headphones, as well as extra-diegetically accompanying the police as they scramble to stop him. Moriarty, a chaotic genius with an intellect to certainly rival Holmes's, is the only character that to whom adaptors add music.

### **The Extra-Diegetic Score**

Music's role as narrative agent in fiction films has been the subject of much recent musicological attention. Claudia Gorbman, in her seminal *Unheard Melodies*, was the first musicologist to

---

<sup>184</sup> In a bizarre bit of dialogue from "Pursuit to Algiers," Rathbone's Holmes claims that Moriarty was a bassoon virtuoso and implies a connection between musical talent and criminal actions.

<sup>185</sup> Steve Tribe, *Sherlock Chronicles* (London: BBC Books, 2014), 194.

address the subject in-depth, and her work has influenced much of the current views of music for the screen. Her taxonomy of diegetic and nondiegetic, as well as her association of film music as a suturing device (a Lacanian technique to connect the audience to on-screen narrative), remain in place today.<sup>186</sup> More recently, researchers have addressed the music that falls between diegetic and nondiegetic, the use of music to create mood or realism, and music's ability to elicit pleasure. Yet, in general, scholars of film music continue to focus on narrative aspects of a film's score.

It comes as no surprise that the extra-diegetic soundtrack is the source of much of the emotional material of a film or television program. The emotions transmitted through the film's story, coupled with practices of film music that are generally based on late Romantic art music based on programmatic techniques and musical codes, heighten these emotive qualities for screen music.<sup>187</sup> In a narrative sense, the feelings film music evokes are necessary to clarify elements of character or plot that may be unclear, or, according to James Buhler, those things that "must otherwise remain unseen and unsaid: psychology, mood, motivation."<sup>188</sup> Often, an audience will respond to these film practices instinctively, as composer George Antheil explains: "You *see* love, and you *hear* it. Music suddenly becomes a language for you, without your knowing it."<sup>189</sup> Film music is also capable of expressing the emotions of a character as well as initiating the emotions of the audience, creating a strong bond between the fictional being and

---

<sup>186</sup> Claudia Gorbman, *Unheard Melodies*, (Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 1987), 5.

<sup>187</sup> Anahid Kassabian, *Hearing Film*, (New York: Routledge, 2001), 24.

<sup>188</sup> Annabel J. Cohen, "Music as a Source of Emotion in Film," in *Music and Emotion: Theory and Research* edited by Patrik N. Juslin (New York: Oxford, 2001), 258.

James Buhler, "Analytical and Interpretative Approaches to Film Music (II): Analysing Interaction of Music and Film" In *Critical Approaches*, in *Film Music: Critical Approaches*, edited by K. J. Donnelly (Edinburgh: University of Edinburgh Press, 2001), 47.

<sup>189</sup> Quoted in Kassabian, *Hearing Film*, 8.

the physical spectator.<sup>190</sup> The viewers, whether they particularly want to be or not, become invested in the character's story.

The connection that forms between audience and character allows Holmes adaptors to transform him into a much more flawed character while ensuring the audience will identify with him. The Romantic Genius version of Holmes is, in many cases, unkind or manipulative. Dame Jean Doyle once criticized Jeremy Brett's portrayal for that very reason, telling him: "I don't think my father meant Sherlock Holmes to be quite so rude, Jeremy."<sup>191</sup> However, even as adaptors turn him nearly into an antihero, Holmes remains the main character in his stories, and the emotional connection in the music and violin performance ensures that audiences identify with him despite his flaws.

Adaptors consistently equate Holmes with the violin, both diegetically and extra-diegetically. Composers and adaptors reinforce the iconic usage and diegetic performances I described in the previous chapter through the extra-diegetic score. Wilder, in *The Private Life of Sherlock Holmes*, actually conceived of the entire film according to a piece of music, Miklós Rózsa's Violin Concerto, Op. 24. The composer recalls how Wilder had "written it around [Rózsa's] concerto, inspired by the fact that Holmes liked playing the fiddle" and states that the first movement, especially "is somewhat nervous and this apparently suggested to Wilder Holmes's addiction to cocaine."<sup>192</sup> Wilder also utilizes Holmes's violin to comment on the detective's sexuality, connecting the instrument to potential partners for Holmes through the visual shot or extra-diegetic music.<sup>193</sup> Hans Zimmer, likewise, explains that his score for

---

<sup>190</sup> Kathryn Kalinak, *Settling the Score: Music and the Classical Hollywood Film*, (Madison: University of Wisconsin Press, 1992), 87.

<sup>191</sup> Quoted in Manners, *Sherlock Holmes*, 124.

<sup>192</sup> Quoted in Simon Frith, "Mood Music: An Inquiry into Narrative Film Music," *Screen* 25.3 (1984), 80.

<sup>193</sup> Leland Poague, "Billy Wilder, Leo McCarey," *Hollywood Professionals Volume 7* (San Diego: A. S. Barnes and Company, 1980) 138.



*Sherlock Holmes* contains “a lot of virtuoso playing...I was trying to do what goes on in Holmes’s head, in a way. The other thing about him is that, you know, if he doesn’t keep moving, he’s going to get very depressed, so there’s an element of forward motion all the time.”<sup>194</sup> Even the solo violin of Patrick Gowers’s opening theme, paired with Holmes staring thoughtfully out the windows, suggests this connection between detective and instrument from the start of each episode.

Holmes is, however, certainly not unique in that creators intimately associate with music. Ben Winters discusses how Indiana Jones’s main musical theme, despite being firmly rooted in the extra-diegetic realm, is still just as “quintessentially Indy-esque” as his costume and mannerisms.<sup>195</sup> *A Song is Born* and *My Fair Lady* both feature characters that directors equate with their musical voices; likewise, Susan Alexander’s failure as an opera singer in *Citizen Kane* has far-reaching influences on the negative aspects of her character.<sup>196</sup> The connection between Holmes and his instrument, however, one that is capable of reaching into nearly every adaptation of the character, is a much stronger and more meaningful one. In a character so caught up in musical performance himself, this distinction between diegetic and non-diegetic actually begins to break down for the audience.

I argue, then, that the violin itself functions as the agent of narration for these Holmes adaptations. Philosopher George M. Wilson cites instances where the narrator character of a piece of literature is a horse or a computer; likewise, the brook of Schubert’s *Die Schöne Müllerin* can be seen as a narrator character for that song cycle.<sup>197</sup> Edward Branigan agrees that a

---

<sup>194</sup> “Track by Track – Sherlock Holmes” *Empire Magazine* 249 (March 2010), 161.

<sup>195</sup> Ben Winters, “The Non-Diegetic Fallacy: Film, Music, and Narrative Space,” *Music and Letters* 91.2 (May 2010), 224.

<sup>196</sup> Buhler, “Analysing Interaction,” 48.

Irene Kahn Atkins, *Source Music in Motion Pictures*, (Toronto: Associated University Presses, 1983), 23.

<sup>197</sup> George M. Wilson, “Elusive Narrators in Literature and Film,” *Philosophical Studies: An International Journal for Philosophy in the Analytic Tradition* 135.1 (August 2007), 76.

film's narrator does not need to be biologically human or indeed, even strictly identifiable in the frame.<sup>198</sup> Coupled with the history of musical instrument anthropomorphism in films, such as the comedic instance of a violin and piano sabotaging a performance in Charlie Chaplin's *Limelight*, it is not a stretch to consider a musical instrument to be a story's narrator.<sup>199</sup> Adaptors not only connect the violin to Holmes's characterization through his musical performance, but they moreover privilege the instrument with an intimate knowledge of both the workings of Holmes's mind and his emotions in a way that no human character, perhaps even Holmes himself, can approach. Since the violin can traverse both the diegetic and extra-diegetic worlds, adaptors use it to emphasize Holmes's status as Romantic Genius, through emotions, intellect, and flaws. This necessarily means that we as an audience see and hear the story through a "character" of internal focalization, with knowledge only of what another character (in this case, Sherlock Holmes) is aware, as well as causing Holmes to be in the center of our attention.<sup>200</sup> However, given Holmes's detective prowess, his observations about the people and world around him are a nearly omniscient narrative presence. Watson's completely external narration may have sufficed for the old model of Holmes as Gentleman Detective. However the new model, the Romantic Genius steeped in emotional angst and impenetrable intellect, requires a narrator that can account for these attributes.

The following examples showcase two different ways adaptors utilize this narrative voice. The first, Patrick Gowers's score from *The Adventures of Sherlock Holmes*, deals primarily with the "genius" element of the Holmes's character, delving into his intellect and

---

<sup>198</sup> Celestino Deleyto, "Focalisation in Film Narrative," *Atlantis* 13.1/2 (November 1991), 163.

<sup>199</sup> Ben Winters, *Music, Performance, and the Realities of Film: Shared Concert Experiences in Screen Fiction* (New York: Routledge, 2014), 84.

<sup>200</sup> Heldt, *Levels of Narration*, 121.

detection. The second, David Arnold and Michael Price's score for *Sherlock*, deals primarily with the "Romantic" side, focusing on Holmes's unspoken and often turbulent emotions.

### ***The Adventures of Sherlock Holmes (1984-1994)***

Cox's unique Holmes adaptation balances the Victorian world with the Romantic Genius character, and Patrick Gowers's music for the series reflects this duality. Throughout, Gowers places exact quotations of Beethoven and the chant "Dies Irae" alongside octatonic scales: the old and new sonically collide. The opening theme itself epitomizes this aural combination; it begins in a tonal style, outlining tonic triads like an early Romantic Period violin concerto reminiscent of Felix Mendelssohn's, and then subtly transforms into a more contemporary idea when the accompaniment enters with added dissonances and non-resolving chords.<sup>201</sup>

Cox and Gowers make the connection between Holmes and his violin apparent even in this opening theme where the concerto-like music is paired against Holmes staring out at the window into the activity of the street below. Music theorist Robert Gauldin goes so far as to call the violin an "associate protagonist," and Gowers privileges it in both the diegetic and extra-diegetic music.<sup>202</sup> In contrast to other, perhaps showier adaptations, however, Cox did not want Holmes to sound like a virtuoso: in a very telling interpretative choice, the violinist actually heard throughout the series is Kathy Gowers, the composer's teenage daughter. The idea here was to present a performer that would most sound like "a gifted amateur – the status accorded to Sherlock Holmes."<sup>203</sup>

---

<sup>201</sup> K. J. Donnelly, *The Spectre of Sound: Music in Film and Television* (London: British Film Institute, 2005), 117.

<sup>202</sup> Robert Gauldin, "Quaerendo Invenietis: Patrick Gowers' Music for the *Sherlock Holmes* Television Series" (paper presented at the annual meeting for the Society for Music Theory, Minneapolis, Minnesota, 27-30 October 2011).

<sup>203</sup> Haining, *Television*, 162.

The music accompanying this adaptation, much like the literary work it stems from, is primarily episodic. Cox and Gowers avoid stock music, a decision that would have been more financially sound but negatively impact the aesthetic and narration. Instead, Gowers pairs each episode with a self-contained score for chamber ensemble, often bookended by a second instance of the main theme that resolves in the closing credits.<sup>204</sup> Although much of the music is subtly based on the opening theme, as Gauldin has discovered, like the lament during “The Final Problem” which mimics a Bachian solo violin sonata and adds triple and quadruple stops, and the arpeggiated piano chamber music for John Hector McFarlane during “The Norwood Builder,” most motifs associated with particular characters are only used in whichever episode the character appears in.<sup>205</sup> This dependence on the main theme music, the one that characterizes Holmes himself, reinforces the idea that Gowers’s music is narrating the episodes from Holmes’s point of view. Kevin Donnelly mentions that “serious” British television programs at this time used extradiegetic music incredibly sparingly, mostly as an aesthetic device for color or beauty.<sup>206</sup> *Sherlock Holmes* fits this serious category, despite its status as a period piece, so Cox’s inclusion of a large musical presence directly reflects upon the genius violinist protagonist. Gauldin also traces several musical “pastiche,” instances in which Gowers mimicked the sound of either a specific composer, such as Elsie Cubitt’s theme that is reminiscent of the slow movement of Dvořák’s *New World Symphony* or the “regal seventeenth century French overture” found in “The Musgrave Ritual.”<sup>207</sup> Gauldin likens these moments to a musical form of

---

<sup>204</sup> Donnelly, *Spectre of Sound*, 117.

<sup>205</sup> Gauldin, “Quaerendo Invenietis.”

<sup>206</sup> Donnelly *Spectre of Sound*, 115.

<sup>207</sup> Gauldin, “Quaerendo Invenietis.”

Holmes's disguises, though it could also be an external reference to the fact that this is, despite Cox's devotion to the Canon, an adaptation of Doyle's original.<sup>208</sup>

Holmes's musical performance in this series, as described in the previous chapter, is often associated with his volatile emotions; the musical narrator, however, is not only emotional but moreover incredibly knowledgeable. Gowers's score often provides commentary on the characters and plot, revealing clues of what will occur later on. Like Holmes himself, Gowers's music, both diegetic and extradiegetic, detects and comments upon characters and plot that the audience may fail to see, mirroring Holmes's genius intellect. A particularly obvious example in "The Priory School" features a group of choirboys singing a polyphonic setting of *Libera me* (a chant asking for mercy from God) from the Requiem Mass. Although *Libera me* could certainly reference Holmes's knowledge of Renaissance counterpoint or even his depression, in this instance it foreshadows the kidnapping of one of the boys.<sup>209</sup> Likewise, Gowers connects the particularly unpleasant character of Albert Gruning in "The Illustrious Client" with Leporello's "catalogue aria" from *Don Giovanni*, letting the audience know even before the plot itself confirms it that the man is a womanizer and a murderer.<sup>210</sup> Irene Adler's theme, in a nod to her opera career and possibly "forbidden desire," quotes Wagner's famous "Prelude" to *Tristan und Isolde*.

Most aligned with the concept of genius is the inherent "puzzle" in the program's score. Gowers titles a collection of music from the series released in 1987 as "Quaerendo Invenietis," stating "the concept of the whole album was that it was a puzzle only Sherlock himself would immediately recognize and solve, and as far as I know, it has remained unsolved now."<sup>211</sup> The

---

<sup>208</sup> Ibid.

<sup>209</sup> Donnelly, *Spectre of Sound*, 117.

<sup>210</sup> Gauldin, "Quaerendo Invenietis."

<sup>211</sup> Ibid.

title is a reference to Bach, specifically the two-part puzzle canon of *Musical Offering* and all of the genius contrapuntal technique that comes with this association. However, Gauldin believes he has solved the decades-old puzzle, finding several structural and melodic similarities between Frederick the Great's theme and the one Gowers created for Holmes. Both melodies open by outlining a fifth, and then fall chromatically through a five-line *Urlinie*.<sup>212</sup> This connection further cements the genius of the detective, especially the mathematical logic associated with Bach, to have Holmes's own theme mimic the subject at the heart of this work. The whole of the series, with Gowers's continuing transformations on the main theme, would become a presentation of different variations upon the great Romantic Genius detective himself.

### ***Sherlock* (2010- )**

Where Gowers's music focuses on Holmes's genius intellect, David Arnold and Michael Price focus on his emotional side via Holmes's musical compositions. The musical narrator here is much more concerned about the music's emotive qualities than with plot-based musical commentary. This interpretative choice may be because Cumberbatch's Holmes, even more so than those that came before him, is incredibly closed off, conveying very little of the emotional angst that the character experiences.

Arnold and Price's music for *Sherlock*, like much current screen music, is based on themes associated with specific characters, although it focuses on the violin. Arnold describes how this particular adaptation compares to others, venturing that "I suppose it's not unusual to have a violin-led approach to the character of Holmes. It's not unusual for composers to come up with a similar approach to a character, and he was a high-functioning drug user, so there's a bit of

---

<sup>212</sup> Ibid.

madness involved.”<sup>213</sup> This madness they portray though the music is another way Moffat and Gatiss connect Holmes to the Romantic Genius. Arnold continues, explaining that much of the music itself, whether specifically focused on Holmes or not, is a direct reflection of his mental abilities:

A lot of the pace comes from figures initially devised to reflect Sherlock's thought processes...they return to the show quite a lot... The busy-ness of Sherlock's thought process drives the style of music...when we are outside Sherlock's mind then the music becomes story telling, atmosphere setting, emotionally hand-holding music. Inside, it all gets frantic.”<sup>214</sup>

Just like Holmes’s drug use and “madness” is contained within the overall musical soundspace, several characters have their own specific theme that accompanies them throughout the series. Holmes himself, however, as fitting for the title character, has two themes. Michael Price explains that this was an intentional duality:

But I think there’s something about that hero theme which is quite external and it always works terribly well when Sherlock is being Sherlock, whatever we perceive that to be. There’s moments when he puts his deerstalker on and goes out to meet the press and he’s *being* Sherlock and that theme, because it’s a very extrovert theme, is umbilically linked with that side of being Sherlock, whereas we felt in season three that the opening titles theme is kind of slightly more internal Sherlock...”<sup>215</sup>

This distinction between Holmes as he wants the world to view him and Holmes’s emotional inner turmoil is a reflection of his Romantic Genius, and one that does not exist for any other character in the series.

Arnold and Price cement the emotional link between Holmes and both the diegetic and extradiegetic worlds through the detective’s compositions, especially those for Mary Morstan and Irene Adler. As I described in the previous chapter, these are especially emotive compositions; however, the relationship these works share with the rest of the score is

---

<sup>213</sup> Garrett Tiedemann, “David Arnold and Michael Price talk about composing for ‘Sherlock’” Classicalmpr.org <http://www.classicalmpr.org/story/2014/03/17/sherlock-bbc-composers-interview> (accessed 6 May 2014).

<sup>214</sup> Ibid.

<sup>215</sup> Watts, “Music to Picture.”

meaningful. The presence of Holmes's own music within this extradiegetic world raises the possibility that the rest of the music has been composed by him, as well, despite our not having seen it on screen as source music. For instance, Price describes giving Watson's theme a prominent placement during a particularly intense, inwardly focused scene in Holmes's own mind in which the detective is convinced he is about to die. Price's statement that "it's the connection *with* John that's giving [Holmes] the motivation to recover from that situation" seems to imply that Holmes is, at least on some level, aware of this connection between the musical theme and the character.<sup>216</sup> Robyn Stilwell notes a distinction between these two types of music, explaining that nondiegetic music is subjective, source music is objective.<sup>217</sup> However, when Price and Arnold write Holmes's own musical compositions into the soundtrack, it seems to destroy this difference. Likewise, Sergei Miceli notes that in a "switch from internal [diegetic] to external [extradiegetic], result is that the latter, thanks to the former, loses part of its artificial character."<sup>218</sup> The presence of two of Holmes's own compositions in the extradiegetic sound space, coupled with the possibility of further, unknown compositions, legitimizes the rest of the musical score and presents the audience with a believable musical narrator. Moffat and Gatiss, through the use of Holmes's musicality, allow the audience access to the inner thoughts and feelings of their Romantic Genius.

---

<sup>216</sup> Ibid.

<sup>217</sup> Robynn J. Stilwell, "The Fantastical Gap between Diegetic and Nondiegetic," in *Beyond the Soundtrack: Representing Music in Cinema* edited Daniel Goldmark, Lawrence Kramer, and Richard Leppert (Los Angeles: University of California Press, 2007), 190-191.

<sup>218</sup> Sergio Miceli, *Film Music: History, Aesthetic – Analysis, Typologies* (London: Ricordi LIM, 2013), 520.



## Conclusion

“A hero for the 21<sup>st</sup> century, the 22<sup>nd</sup>, the 23<sup>rd</sup>, the 24<sup>th</sup>; history would seem to suggest that Sherlock will outlive us all, and well he should.”<sup>219</sup> Although it is obviously too soon to tell whether Rob Doherty’s prophetic words will prove true, the character’s track record certainly seems to imply that they will. Doyle’s Canon provides adaptors with a fluid starting point for their characterization of the detective, meaning that Holmes can constantly be reinvented without worrying overly much about fidelity to the original text.

In a literary figure as historically uncommunicative as Sherlock Holmes, the signature violin performance offers an essential window into the character’s mindset. Although the Holmes portrayals of Stephens, Brett, Downey, Jr., Cumberbatch, and Miller are all very different, each reveals something of their persona through music performance, be it a weakness for drugs, concealed emotions, or a capacity for failure. In the shift between Dr. Watson telling the reader about Sherlock Holmes and the camera of screen adaptations showing the viewer Sherlock Holmes, the violin functions narratively, portraying Holmes’s hidden thoughts and emotions to a degree inaccessible by visuals or dialogue alone. The violin itself is a sort of musical narrator, entering both the diegetic and extra-diegetic soundspaces to assist and augment the work done by the actors, dialogue, camera and any potential voice-over narration.

Sherlock Holmes has changed drastically since his inception in 1887. Throughout this lengthy period, he has fought the Nazis, sold faux leather furniture, had a consult with Sigmund Freud, rode a torpedo, and journeyed to both the twenty-second *and* twenty-third centuries. The character has been at the forefront of several cinematic innovations: he was present for the first detective film, the Mutoscope *Sherlock Holmes Baffled* of 1900, he contributed to new

---

<sup>219</sup> Doherty, quoted in Polasek “Post-Millennial,” 392-393.

sophisticated devices such as flashbacks in 1921's *The Adventures of Sherlock Holmes*; the first sound-on-Holmes film, *The Return of Sherlock Holmes*, appeared in 1929, though he was late on the scene of color films with the 1959 rendition of *The Hound of the Baskervilles*. Over the years, Holmes has appeared in countless novels, comic books, stage plays, musicals, radio productions, video games, and on the large and small screen on five different continents. He has changed genders and races and even been transformed into an anthropomorphic corgi and a talking cucumber.<sup>220</sup> Despite the extensive differences between Holmes's many forms, the character has remained well-loved and instantly recognizable through the use of icons. In recent years, screen adaptors have sought to transform him from his Victorian origins into a Romantic Genius archetype, a flawed and multi-faceted character better fitting the ideals and demands of current audiences. By focusing on certain elements of this characterization, such as Holmes's drug use, outwardly cold attitude, volatile emotions, and musical performance, they can recast him into this Romantic archetype while still retaining all of the aspects that make the character Sherlock Holmes.

“Here dwell together still two men of note  
Who never lived and so can never die:  
How very near they seem, yet how remote  
That age before the world went all awry...”<sup>221</sup>

---

<sup>220</sup> The corgi version of Holmes can be found in the Japanese anime production *Sherlock Hound*; the cucumber version is in an episode of the *VeggieTales* series, “Sheerluck Holmes and the Golden Ruler.”

<sup>221</sup> Vincent Starrett, “221B,” always1895.net, <http://always1895.net/post/11857862603/starrett1-birthday-week-2011> (accessed May 15, 2014).

## APPENDIX

Table 1: Chronological Table of Referenced Holmes Adaptations

Name	Date	Production Company	Director/Creator	Holmes	Watson	Composer
<i>Sherlock Holmes – A Drama in Four Acts</i>	Premiered 1899	N/A	William Gillette	William Gillette	Bruce McRae	?????
<i>Sherlock Holmes and the Great Murder Mystery</i>	1908	Crescent Film Manufacturing Company	?????	?????	?????	N/A
<i>The Hound of the Baskervilles</i>	1921	Stoll Picture Productions Ltd.	Maurice Elvey	Eille Norwood	Hubert Willis	N/A
<i>Sir Arthur Conan Doyle’s The Hound of the Baskervilles; The Adventures of Sherlock Holmes</i>	1939	Twentieth Century Fox	Sydney Lanfield	Basil Rathbone	Nigel Bruce	David Buttolf
<i>Sherlock Holmes and the Voice of Terror; Sherlock Holmes and the Secret Weapon; etc.</i>	1942- 1946	Universal Pictures Company	John Rawlins	Basil Rathbone	Nigel Bruce	Frank Skinner
<i>The Private Life of Sherlock Holmes</i>	1970	Compton Films	Billy Wilder	Robert Stephens	Colin Blakely	Miklós Rózsa
<i>They Might Be Giants</i>	1971	Universal Pictures/Newman-Foreman	Anthony Harvey	George C. Scott	Joanne Woodward	John Harvey
<i>The Seven-Per-Cent Solution</i>	1976	Universal Studios	Herbert Ross	Nicol Williamson	Robert Duvall	John Addison
<i>The Adventures of Sherlock Holmes</i>	1984- 1994	Granada UK	Michael Cox	Jeremy Brett	David Burke; Edward Hardwicke	Patrick Gowers
<i>The Great Mouse Detective</i>	1986	Walt Disney Company	Ron Clements, Burny Mattinson, Dave Michener, John Musker	Barrie Ingham	Val Bettin	Henry Mancini
<i>Slimier! and the Real Ghostbusters – “Elementary My Dear Winston”</i>	1989	Columbia Pictures	Will Meugniot	Maurice LaMarche	Frank Welker	Ray Parker, Jr.
<i>Sherlock Holmes in the 22<sup>nd</sup> Century</i>	1999- 2001	Scottish Television Enterprises	Paul Quinn	Jason Gray Stanford	John Payne	Eric Allaman
<i>House, M.D.</i>	2004- 2012	Universal Television Studio	David Shore	Hugh Laurie	Robert Sean Leonard	Jason Derlatka, Jon Ehrlich
<i>Sherlock Holmes; Sherlock Holmes: A Game of Shadows</i>	2009, 2011	Warner Bros’ Pictures, Roadshow Entertainment	Guy Ritchie	Robert Downey, Jr.	Jude Law	Hans Zimmer
<i>Sherlock</i>	2010-	Hartwood Films, BBC Wales	Steven Moffat, Mark Gatiss	Benedict Cumberbatch	Martin Freeman	David Arnold, Michael Price
<i>Elementary</i>	2012-	CBS Television Studios	Rob Doherty	Jonny Lee Miller	Lucy Liu	Sean Callery

Appendix: Chronological Table of Referenced Holmes Adaptations

## BIBLIOGRAPHY

## BIBLIOGRAPHY

- Abra, Jock. *God and Evolution: Creativity in Action*. Victoria: Friesen Press, 2015.
- Adair, Gilbert. "Wilder Bewildered." *Sight and Sound* 46.1 (Winter 1976/77): 52-3.
- Atkins, Irene Kahn. *Source Music in Motion Pictures*. Toronto: Associated University Presses, 1983.
- Barnes, Alan. *Sherlock Holmes on Screen: The Complete Film and TV History*. London: Titan Books, 2011.
- Barthes, Roland. *Image-Music-Text*. Translated by Steven Heath. New York: Hill and Wang, 1978.
- Beja, Morris. *Film and Literature: An Introduction*. New York: Longman, 1979.
- Brady, Ben. *Principles of Adaptation for Film and Television*. Austin: University of Texas Press, 1994.
- Bluestone, George. *Novels into Film*. Baltimore: The John Hopkins Press, 1957.
- Booth, Martin. *The Doctor and the Detective*. New York: St. Martin's Press, 1997.
- Buhler, James. "Analytical and Interpretative Approaches to Film Music (II): Analysing Interaction of Music and Film." In *Film Music: Critical Approaches*, edited by K.J. Donnelly, 39-61. Edinburgh: University of Edinburgh Press, 2001.
- Cattrysse, Patrick. *Descriptive Adaptation Studies: Epistemological and Methodological Issues*. Antwerp: Garant Publishing, 2014.
- Chater, Eos. *Sherlock on the Fiddle* (blog). Earth Observing System Blog <http://earthobservingsystem.tumblr.com/post/15188532235/sherlock-on-the-fiddle> (accessed May 1, 2014).
- Clausen, Christopher. "Sherlock Holmes, Order and Late-Victorian Mind." *The Georgia Review*, Spring 1984: 104-23.
- Clines, Peter. "The Game's Afoot." *Creative Screenwriting* 16.6 (November 2009): 30-5.
- Cohen, Annabel J. "Music as a Source of Emotion in Film." In *Music and Emotion: Theory and Research*, edited by Patrik N. Juslin, 249-72. New York: Oxford, 2001.

- Cottom, Daniel. "Sherlock Holmes Meets Dracula," *ELH* 79/3 (Fall 2012): 537-567.
- Cox, Michael. *A Study in Celluloid: A Producer's Account of Jeremy Brett as Sherlock Holmes*. Cambridge: Rupert Books, 1999.
- Davies, Stuart David. *Bending the Willow: Jeremy Brett as Sherlock Holmes*. Ashcroft: Calabash Press, 1996.
- *Holmes of the Movies: The Screen Career of Sherlock Holmes*. New York: Bramhall House, 1968.
- de Castella, Tom. "100 Years of the War on Drugs." *bbc.com*.  
<http://www.bbc.com/news/magazine-16681673> (accessed November 29, 2014).
- Deleyto, Celestino. "Focalisation in Film Narrative." *Atlantis* 13.1/2 (November, 1990): 159-77.
- DeNora, Tia. *Beethoven and the Construction of Genius: Musical Politics in Vienna, 1792-1803*. Los Angeles: University of California Press, 1995.
- Donnelly, K.J. *The Specter of Sound: Music in Film and Television*. London: British Film Institute, 2005.
- Doyle, Sir Arthur Conan. *Sherlock Holmes: The Complete Novels and Stories*. Two Volumes. New York: Bantam Classics, 2003.
- Elementary*. Created by Robert Doherty. Los Angeles, CA: CBS Television Studios, 2012, DVD.
- Ekberg, Katie. "It's Holmes and Away." *TV Times* 141.7 (February 16, 1991).
- Elfenbein, Andrew. *Byron and the Victorians*. New York: Cambridge University Press, 1995.
- Emerson, Caryl. *Boris Godunov: Transpositions of a Russian Theme*. Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 1986.
- Eyles, Allen. *A Century Celebration*. London: John Murray, 1986.
- Field, Amanda J. "The Case of the Multiplying Millions: Sherlock Holmes in Advertising." In *Sherlock Holmes and Conan Doyle: Multi-Media Afterlives*, edited by Sabine Vanacker and Catherine Wynne, 19-35. New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2013.
- *England's Secret Weapon: The Wartime Films of Sherlock Holmes*. London: Middlesex University Press, 2009.
- Frith, Simon. Quoted in Simon Frith, "Mood Music: An Inquiry Into Narrative Film Music." *Screen* 25.3 (1984): 78-87.

- Gauldin, Robert. "Quaerendo Invenietis: Patrick Gowers' Music for the *Sherlock Holmes* Television Series." Paper presented at the annual meeting for the Society for Music Theory, Minneapolis, Minnesota, October 27-30, 2011.
- Gemunden Gerd. *A Foreign Affair: Billy Wilder's American Films*. New York: Berghahn Books, 2008.
- Gorbman, Claudia. *Unheard Melodies*. Bloomington: Indiana University Press, 1987.
- "Guinness World Records." *Sherlock Holmes awarded title for most portrayed literary human character in film & TV*. May 14, 2012.  
<http://guinnessworldrecords.com/news/2012/5/sherlock-holmes-awarded-title-for-most-portrayed-literary-human-character-in-film-tv-41713>.
- Haining, Peter. *The Television Sherlock Holmes*. London: Virgin Publishing, 1994.
- Hall, Trevor H. *Sherlock Holmes: Ten Literary Studies*. London: Gerald Duckworth and Company, 1969.
- Heldt, Guido. *Music and Levels of Narration in Film*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2013.
- Higgins, Paula. "The Apotheosis of Josquin des Prez and Other Mythologies of Musical Genius," *Journal of the American Musicological Society* 57.3 (Fall 2004): 443-510.
- Kalinak, Kathryn. *Settling the Score: Music and the Classical Hollywood Film*. Madison: University of Wisconsin Press, 1992.
- Kassabian, Anahid. *Hearing Film*. New York: Routledge, 2001.
- Kestner, Joseph A. *Sherlock's Men: Masculinity, Conan Doyle and Cultural History*. Aldershot: Ashgate Publishing Limited, 1997.
- Krasner, James. "Watson Falls Asleep: Narrative Frustration and Sherlock Holes." *English Literature in Transition, 1880-1920* 40.4 (1997): 424-36.
- Levinson, Jerrold. Quoted in Jerrold Levinson, "Film Music and Narrative Agency." *Post-Theory: Reconstructing Film Studies*. Edited by David Bordwell and Noël Carroll, 248-82. Madison: University of Wisconsin Press, 1996.
- Leitch, Thomas. *Film Adaptation and Its Discontents*. Baltimore: The John Hopkins University Press, 2007.
- "Post Literary Adaptations." *Post Script: Essays in Film and the Humanities*. 23.3 (Summer 2004): 99-117.



- Liebow, Ely M. *Dr. Joe Bell: Model for Sherlock Holmes*. Madison: Popular Press, 2007.
- Manners, Terry. *The Man Who Became Sherlock Holmes*. London: Virgin Books, 1997.
- Marcus, Sharon. "Sexuality." In *The Cambridge History of Victorian Literature*, edited by Kate Flint, 422-43. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2014.
- Martin, Denise. "Steven Moffat Explains the Origins of Sherlock's *Best-Man Speech*." Vulture.com. <http://www.vulture.com/2014/01/steven-moffat-sherlock-holmes-best-man-speech-interview.html>, (accessed June 3, 2014).
- McCaw, Neil. "Sherlock Holmes and a Politics of Adaptation." In *Sherlock Holmes and Conan Doyle: Multi-Media Afterlives*, edited by Sabine Vanacker and Catherine Wynne, 36-48. New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2013.
- McFarlane, Brian. *Novel to Film: An Introduction to the Theory of Adaptation*. Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1996.
- Merrill, Edward Atkinson and Earl Bernard Murray. "That Monograph Upon the Polyphonic Motets of Lassus." *The Baker Street Journal* 24.1 (1974): 23-8.
- Meyer, Nicholas. *Seven-Per-Cent Solution, Screenplay*. Los Angeles: Universal Studios, 1975.
- Miceli, Sergio. *Film Music: History, Aesthetic – Analysis, Typologies*. London: Ricordi LIM, 2013.
- Miller, Margo. "Musical Chairs: When 'The Woman' was an American Contralto." *Boston Globe*, December 30, 1964.
- Moffat, Steven. "Unlocking Sherlock." *Sherlock Season 3 Extra, DVD*, created by Mark Gatiss and Steven Moffat. Richmond, UK: Hartswood Films, 2014.
- Moore, Jane and John Strachan. *Key Concepts in Romantic Literature*. New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2010.
- Morra, Irene. "Singing like a musical box': Musical Detection and Novelistic Tradition." In *The Idea of Music in Victorian Fiction*, edited by Sophie Fuller and Nicky Losseff, 151-172. Burlington: Ashgate, 2004.
- Ng, Philiana. "Emmys: 'Elementary's Jonny Lee Miller Revels in the Idiosyncrasies of Sherlock Holmes." *The Hollywood Reporter*. <http://www.hollywoodreporter.com/race/emmys-elementarys-jonny-lee-miller-567712> (accessed June 17, 2014).
- Nicol, Bran. "Sherlock Holmes Version 2.0: Adapting Doyle in the Twenty-First Century." In *Sherlock Holmes and Conan Doyle: Multi-Media Afterlives*, edited by Sabine Vanacker and Catherin Wynne, 124-139. New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2013.

- Nollen, Scott Allen. *Sir Arthur Conan Doyle at the Cinema*. Jefferson: McFarland & Company, 1996.
- O'Brien, Harvey. "The Curious Case of the Kingdom of Shadows: The Transmogrification of Sherlock Holmes in the Cinematic Imagination." In *Sherlock Holmes and Conan Doyle: Multi-Media Afterlives*, edited by Sabine Vanacker and Catherine Wynne, 64-79. New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2013.
- Poague, Leland. "Billy Wilder, Leo McCarey." *Hollywood Professionals Volume 7*. San Diego: A.S. Barnes and Company, 1980.
- Pohle, Jr., Robert W. and Douglas C. Hart. *Sherlock Holmes on the Screen: The Motion Picture Adventures of the World's Most Popular Detective*. New York: A. S. Barnes and Company, 1977.
- Polasek, Ashley D. "Surveying the Post-Millennial Sherlock Holmes: A Case for the Great Detective as a Man of Our Times", *Adaptation* 6.3 (2013): 384-393.
- Poore, Benjamin. "Sherlock Holmes and the Leap of Faith: The Forces of Fandom and Convergence in Adaptations of the Holmes and Watson Stories." *Adaptation* 6.2 (2013): 158-71.
- Redmond, Christopher. *The Sherlock Holmes Handbook*. Toronto: Dundurn Press, 2009.
- Revill, George. "Samuel Coleridge-Taylor's Geography of Disappointment: Hybridity, Identity, and Networks of Musical Meaning." In *The Place of Music*, edited by Andrew Leyshon, David Matless, and George Revill, 197-221. New York: The Guildford Press, 1998.
- Rimoldi, Oscar. "The Detective Movies of the 30s and 40s." *Films in Review* 44.7/8 (August 1993): 204-33.
- Sherie, Fenn. "Sherlock Holmes on the Film: An Interview with Eille Norwood." *The Strand*, July 1921."
- "Sherlock Holmes 1:6 Scale Figures." Bigchiefstudios.co.uk  
<http://www.bigchiefstudios.co.uk/collectables/sherlock/sixth-scale-figures/sherlock-holmes> (accessed February 2, 2014).
- "Sherlock Holmes on the Screen," from "*Stoll's Editorial News*." October 6, 1921.
- Sherlock*. Created by Mark Gatiss and Steven Moffat. Richmond, UK: Hartwood Films, 2010, 2012, 2014, DVD.
- Sherlock Holmes*. Directed by Guy Ritchie. Burbank, CA: Warner Brothers, 2009, DVD.
- "Sherlock Holmes." *Empire Magazine* 243 (Sept., 2009).

- Sherlock Holmes: The Complete Granada Television Series*. Created by Michael Cox. MPI Home Entertainment, 2007, DVD.
- Schopenhauer, Arthur. *The World as Will and Representation Volume II*. Translated by E.F.J. Payne. New York: Dover Publications, 1966.
- Starrett, Vincent. "221B." Always1895.net. <http://always1895.net/post/11857862603/starrett1-birthday-week-2011> (accessed May 15, 2014).
- Stillwell, Robynn J. "The Fantastical Gap Between Diegetic and Nondiegetic." In *Beyond the Soundtrack: Representing Music in Cinema*, edited by Daniel Goldmark, Lawrence Kramer, and Richard Leppert, 184-202. Los Angeles: University of California Press, 2007.
- The Complete Sherlock Holmes Collection*. Starring Basil Rathbone. MPI Home Entertainment, 2010, DVD.
- "The Private Life of Sherlock Holmes 'Exhibitors' Campaign Book." London: United Artists Corporation Ltd.
- Tiedemann, Garrett. "David Arnold and Michael Price Talk About Composing for 'Sherlock.'" Classicalmpr.org. <http://www.classicalmpr.org/story/2014/03/17/sherlock-bbc-composers-interview> (accessed May 6, 2014).
- Townsend, Megan. "Candis Cayne Accepts at #GLAAD Awards." glad.com. <http://www.glaad.org/blog/video-candis-cayne-accepts-glaadawards-talks-parts-you-can-really-sink-your-teeth-trans-actors> (accessed June 10, 2014).
- "Track by Track – Sherlock Holmes." *Empire Magazine* 249 (March, 2010).
- Trembley, Elizabeth A. "Holmes is Where the Heart Is: The Achievement of Granada Television's Sherlock Holmes Films." In *It's a Print!: Detective Fiction from Page to Screen*, edited by William Reynolds and Elizabeth A. Trembley, 11-30. Bowling Green: Bowling Green State University Popular Press, 1994.
- Tribe, Steve. *Sherlock Chronicles*. London: BBC Books, 2014.
- , "Introduction." In *It's a Print!: Detective Fiction from Page to Screen*, edited by William Reynolds and Elizabeth A. Trembley, 1-9. Bowling Green: Bowling Green State University Popular Press, 1994.
- Watts, Mary Jo. *Music to Picture: An Interview with Composer Michael Price* (blog). Mid0nz Wordpress. <http://mid0nz.wordpress.com/2014/04/16/music-to-picture-an-interview-with-composer-michael-price/> (accessed May 1, 2014).

- Wilder, Billy and I.A.L. Diamond. "The Private Life of Sherlock Holmes – Temporary Script," 25 August, 1969.
- Wilson, George M. "Elusive Narrators in Literature and Film." *Philosophical Studies: An International Journal for Philosophy in the Analytical Tradition* 135.1 (August, 2007): 73-88.
- Wise, Damon. "The Game's Afoot..." *Empire* 247 (January 2010).
- Wilkes, Neil and Nick Levine. "Mark Gatiss Talks 'Who,' 'Sherlock,'" digitalspy.com <http://www.digitalspy.co.uk/british-tv/s7/doctor-who/tubetalk/a214862/mark-gatiss-talks-who-sherlock.html#ixzz3UUclMDzE> (accessed October 6, 2014).
- Winters, Ben. "The Non-Diegetic Fallacy: Film, Music, and Narrative Space." *Music and Letters* 91.2, (May, 2010): 224-44.
- Music, Performance, and the Realities of Film: Shared Concert Experiences in Screen Fiction*. New York: Routledge, 2014.
- Zecher, Henry. *William Gillette: America's Sherlock Holmes*. Bloomington: Xlibris Press, 2011.