

THESIS

2

(1995)



This is to certify that the

dissertation entitled

Identification of Emerging New Workplace Skills for Community
College Marketing Students, As Identified by Employers And
Graduates: Implications for Community College Programs

presented by

John Leith Murray

has been accepted towards fulfillment
of the requirements for

Ph.D degree in Adult & Continuing Education

Major professor

Dr. Cas F. Heilman

Date 11-16-94

LIBRARY
Michigan State
University

PLACE IN RETURN BOX to remove this checkout from your record.
TO AVOID FINES return on or before date due.

DATE DUE	DATE DUE	DATE DUE
_____	_____	_____
_____	_____	_____
_____	_____	_____
_____	_____	_____
_____	_____	_____
_____	_____	_____
_____	_____	_____

MSU is An Affirmative Action/Equal Opportunity Institution

c:\circ\datedue.pm3-p.1

**Identification of Emerging New Workplace Skills for Community
College Marketing Students, As Identified by Employers And
Graduates: Implications for Community College Programs**

By

John Leith Murray

A DISSERTATION

Submitted to Michigan State University
in partial fulfillment of the requirements
for the degree of

DOCTOR OF PHILOSOPHY

HIGHER, ADULT AND LIFELONG EDUCATION

1994

IDENT
COLLE
GRA

For
in Onta
has dro
Decembe
been th
however
college
this de

Th
college
with t
to sec

A
placin
academ
Drawin
were s
compri

ABSTRACT

IDENTIFICATION OF EMERGING NEW WORKPLACE SKILLS FOR COMMUNITY COLLEGE MARKETING STUDENTS, AS IDENTIFIED BY EMPLOYERS AND GRADUATES: IMPLICATIONS FOR COMMUNITY COLLEGE PROGRAMS

By

John Leith Murray

For marketing graduates of typical large community colleges in Ontario, the job placement rate in program-related employment has dropped over the past four years from 80% to 52% as of December 1993. A major factor in this decline appears to have been the recent severe economic situation in the Province, however the question arose as to whether workplace-relevance of college marketing curriculum was also a factor contributing to this decline.

The purpose of this study was to determine if the existing college marketing program content and delivery were consistent with the needs of college marketing graduates in order for them to secure employment and to perform effectively in the workplace.

A review of the literature indicates that employers are placing new emphasis on "soft" skills, in addition to traditional academic skills, when interviewing prospective new recruits. Drawing on the literature, a group of sixty marketing skills were selected for examination in this study. These sixty skills comprised twenty skills taken from each of three groupings:

human r

Ma

Ember

identif

percept

the eff

survey

percept

skills

the six

placed

indicat

people

skills

job.

Fi

responc

as a ba

curricu

human relations skills, conceptual skills and technical skills.

Mail surveys were sent to recent marketing graduates from Humber College, and to those of their employers who could be identified. The surveys sought to obtain respondents' perceptions as to the importance of each of the sixty skills for the effective performance of the graduate in the workplace. The survey directed to graduates also sought to obtain their perceptions as to the degree they learned each of the sixty skills as part of their college marketing program.

Responses by employers and marketing graduates regarding the sixty skills were contrasted with the relative emphasis placed on these skills in college marketing curricula. Findings indicated that the college marketing curriculum is preparing people in reverse order of priority in relation to the kinds of skills which employers and graduates perceive to be needed on the job.

Findings have been arrayed to show the priorities placed by respondents upon each of the sixty skills examined in the study, as a basis for considering redesign of college marketing curricula.

gr

th

Vic

in

Mic

Edu

ad

st

be

ec

Ho

al

se

of

do

Ac

ha

th

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

The writer would like to express his indebtedness and gratitude to many people who made valuable contributions to this study:

Firstly, the writer is indebted to Dr. Roy Giroux, Vice President of Humber College, who was instrumental in introducing the writer, among other Canadians, to the Michigan State doctoral program in Adult and Continuing Education.

Dr. Cas Heilman, Chairman of the writer's doctoral advisory committee, has been most helpful in shaping the study and bringing the issues into clear focus, and has been very generous in providing his time, assistance and encouragement during the development of the study. Dr. Howard Hickey, Dr. Louis Hekhuis and Dr. Norman Bell have also been very helpful, both in conducting learning sessions with doctoral students during course work and in offering encouragement and advice as members of the writer's doctoral advisory committee.

At Humber College, Dr. Richard Hook, Vice President Academic, and Dean Lloyd Rintoul, School of Business, have provided support, assistance and encouragement during the study.

John Riccio, Chair - Marketing, and John McColl, Coordinator International Marketing, have provided advice, encouragement and support throughout the project.

Members of the Marketing Advisory Committee to the School of Business, Humber College, have made a significant contribution in bringing an industry perspective to skills needed in the workplace, sharpening the focus of this study. Among the members of this Advisory Committee, the writer is especially indebted to Mrs. Lynn Wilson, Ernst & Young; Mrs. Elyse Allan, Ontario Hydro; Mr. Stephen Long, Imperial Oil, Mrs. Angel Langmuir, Bank of Montreal and Mr. Alan Seager, Shell Canada Limited.

The writer was fortunate in having the contribution of eight of Humber's post-graduate students in Marketing Management, who assisted in interviewing survey respondents, tabulating, proofing, and assembling materials. These contributors were Kevin Berube, Shelly Bond, Kerri McCracken, John Nevins, Jo-Anne Rukavina, Vonia Tonin and Tracy Yates.

The writer would like to thank Dr. Peter Dietsche, Humber College, for his assistance in preparing the statistical data.

Lastly, the writer would like to express appreciation to his wife for her patience while this dissertation was being written, and to acknowledge his parents for the kindness, assistance and encouragement they have given over

the years, and his uncles, Dr. John Leith Murray,
formerly Principal, University of Exeter, and Sir William
Calder, formerly Professor, University of Edinburgh, for
the inspiration they have provided.

John Leith Murray
Oakville, Ontario

LI

CH

CH

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	<u>Page</u>
LIST OF TABLES	xii
CHAPTER I - INTRODUCTION	
Prologue	1
Background	2
The Ontario Community College System	2
The Community College Student	4
Programs Offered by Large Community Colleges	6
Curriculum Upgrading - Humber College	8
Statement of the Problem	13
The Ontario Economy	14
Emerging New Skills Needed in the Workplace	15
Implications for Marketing Graduates	17
Purpose of the Study	17
Research Questions 1 through 3	18
Research Questions 4 through 7	19
Significance of the Study	20
CHAPTER II - REVIEW OF RELATED LITERATURE	
Introduction	21
Changes in the Canadian Economy	22
The Context: North American Economy	22
The Canadian Economy	23
Industries Coping With Change	24

	<u>Page</u>
Emerging New Skill Sets Sought by Employers	27
U.S. Authorities on New Skills	27
Canadian Authorities on New Skills	30
"Soft" Skills in University Business Programs	39
Theoretical Frameworks of Skills	41
Data, People & Things	42
Three Domains: Cognitive, Affective & Psychomotor	43
Development of Skills List for Study	49
Summary	52
 CHAPTER III - METHODOLOGIES AND PROCEDURES	
Introduction	54
Research Questions	54
Populations	56
College Marketing Graduates	56
Employers of Marketing Graduates	58
Supervisors of Marketing Graduates	59
Samples	59
College Marketing Graduates	59
Human Resources Managers	60
Supervisors of Marketing Graduates	63
Research Instruments	63
Skills List	63
Instrument - College Marketing Graduates	65
Instrument - Human Resources Managers	66
Instrument - Supervisors of Graduates	66

	<u>Page</u>
Tabulation	67
Summary	68
CHAPTER IV - FINDINGS	
Introduction	70
Research Questions	71
Skills List Utilized in the Study	72
Findings: Research Questions	75
Research Question 1	75
Research Question 2	80
Research Question 3	86
Research Question 4	91
Research Question 5	94
Research Question 6	94
Supplemental Findings	102
"What Did You Think Of The Program?"	103
"Would You Take The Program Again?"	104
"Were The Faculty Helpful To You?"	105
"Did You Like The College"	106
Relating Responses to Research Questions	107
Statistical Significance	108
Survey of Human Relations Managers	108
Survey of Marketing Graduates	108
Summary	112

C

I

Su

Co

In

Re

B

A

A

A

A

A

	<u>Page</u>
CHAPTER V - CONCLUSIONS, IMPLICATIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS	
Introduction	113
Research Questions	114
Skills List Utilized in the Study	115
Survey Instruments	117
Samples	118
Summary of Findings	119
Conclusions	123
Implications	125
Recommendations	128
1. Marketing Program Content	128
2. Delivery of Marketing Learning	129
3. Evaluation of Learning	130
4. Additional Research	132
BIBLIOGRAPHY	133
APPENDIX A	
Interview Guidelines: Survey of Graduates	142
APPENDIX B	
Sample - Human Resources Managers	144
APPENDIX C	
Survey Instrument - College Marketing Graduates	154
APPENDIX D	
Survey Instrument - Human Resources Managers	158
APPENDIX E	
Survey Instrument - Supervisors of Graduates	162

APPENDIX F

Statistical Accuracy

166

LIST OF TABLES

Table	<u>Page</u>
1.1 Age: Humber College Students	4
1.2 Programs Offered - Large Community Colleges	6
2.1 The Ideal Job Candidate of the 21st Century	28
2.2 Workplace Basics: The Skills Employers Want	29
2.3 Skills: The Hottest & Most Transferable	31
2.4 The Bases of Competence, U.W.O.	32
2.5 Employability Skills Profile	34
2.6 Core Competency Framework - Imperial Oil	36
2.7 Critical Skills For New Recruits	37
2.8 Critical Workplace Skills	39
2.9 Data, People & Things	43
2.10 Bloom's Taxonomy - Cognitive Domain	45
2.11 Krathwohl's Taxonomy - Affective Domain	46
2.12 Dave's Taxonomy - Psychomotor Domain	47
2.13 Selection of Skills for Study	51
3.1 Population of Humber Marketing Graduates	58
3.2 Interview Questions - Telephone Re-survey	62
3.3 Employment Situation - Marketing Graduates	62
4.1 Selection of Skills for Study	74
4.2 Employers' Responses: Importance of 60 Skills	76
4.3 Employers' Responses: Importance of Skills Groupings	78

	<u>Page</u>
4.4 Employers' Emphasis in Skills Groupings	79
4.5 Course Subjects in Typical Marketing Program	82
4.6 Marketing Courses by Skills Grouping	83
4.7 Evaluation - Marketing I Course	84
4.8 Bases of Evaluation - Marketing Courses	85
4.9 Computerized Test Banks - Marketing Courses	86
4.10 Graduates' Responses: Importance of 60 Skills	87
4.11 Graduates' Responses: Importance of Skills Groupings	89
4.12 Response Differences: Employers vs Graduates	92
4.13 Skills Learned by Graduates in Program	96
4.14 Skill Importance vs Learned at College	98
4.15 Skills Learned in Other College Experience	100
4.16 Skills Learned - Experience Outside College	101
4.17 Telephone Re-survey - Program Improvement	108
4.18 Mean Values: Skill Importance vs Learned at College	110
5.1 Skills Selected for the Study	117
5.2 Skill Importance vs Learned at College	119
5.3 Bases of Evaluation - Marketing Courses	121
5.4 Perceived Skills Importance vs Course Subjects	122

D
E
t

a
a
a
k
c
a
w

a
D

tr
tr

la

Sec

CHAPTER I

INTRODUCTION

Prologue

On April 24, 1944, units of the U.S. 4th Infantry Division were embarked in LST's (landing ship - tanks) off England's coast, for a practice in assault landing, prior to the real thing on Omaha Beach.

Shortly before midnight, the Kriegsmarine's E-Boats attacked. In minutes, two LST's were left sinking and another crippled. Men jumped overboard without waiting to ascertain if their ships were sinking, many not thinking of kicking off their heavy boots. Many had thrown away the compressed gas capsule needed to inflate their Mae-Wests, and many wore their Mae-Wests too low, at waist level, which pitched them face-first into the water.

Seven hundred and forty-nine men were lost, which was a casualty rate many times more than the 4th Infantry Division would sustain on D-Day¹.

For lack of training in water safety, these highly-trained troops were never able to utilize their military training.

"Without development of skills in the four clusters of:

- . mobilizing innovation and change
- . managing people and tasks
- . communicating
- . managing self

...technical skills picked up previously, concurrently, or later may never be effectively utilized..."

"Making the Match between University
Graduates and Corporate Employers",
University of Western Ontario, May 1992

¹"The Secret Battle of Slapton Sands", Edwin Palmer Hoyt, Hale Publishing, London, England 1987

Background

The purpose of this study was to determine if the existing marketing program content and delivery, as typically offered in Ontario community colleges, were consistent with the needs and expectations of employers so as to enable college marketing graduates to secure employment and make an effective contribution in the workplace.

Before the specifics of the research were addressed, the role of community colleges in the Province's educational system was reviewed, a picture of the kinds of people comprising the student body was arrayed, and the kinds of educational programs offered by the colleges were reviewed as the context in which the study took place.

As additional background, an overview of the curriculum review practices utilized across the different divisional organizations in a typical college was conducted. The changing economic environment in Ontario was also reviewed because of its impact on demands for emerging new skills needed by recent college graduates who were seeking employment.

The Ontario Community College System

In Ontario, which has just under 40% of the Country's total population, the community college system was founded 27 years ago. Unlike the Province's universities, some of which pre-date the Nation's Confederation, community

colleges are relatively recent additions to Ontario's post-secondary educational system.

In the mid '60's the Ontario Ministry of Education determined that many more young Canadians needed better preparation for employment than could be acquired from high school education alone, and that the Province's universities by themselves could not meet the total demand for post-secondary education. The mandate of the Province's universities has not been expressly to prepare students for employment. Only slightly over 12% of Ontario's young people were enrolled full time in a university as of 1992².

In 1965 the Ontario Community College system was charged in the enabling legislation³ with the mandate to prepare the college students in the Province specifically for effective employment. The legislation established a system of colleges of applied arts and technology in Ontario to provide opportunity for the education and training of craftsmen, technicians and technologists in the absence of a formal apprentice program in the Province's industry. Unlike many European countries, Ontario has not had a formal apprentice program for providing industry-oriented training.

As of 1992, there were 23 community colleges in the Province, ranging in size from 1,600 full-time students up

²Statistics Canada, Catalogue 81-229, page 173, *Market Research Handbook*, 1992

³Introduction to enabling legislation, by the Honorable William G. Davis, Minister of Education, Province of Ontario Legislature, May 21, 1965

to 10,900 students⁴.

The Community College Student

Ontario colleges have traditionally drawn their students directly from the ranks of high school graduates. However since the establishment of the colleges in 1965 several factors have changed this traditional progression. The recent high unemployment situation in the Province has influenced many mature individuals to return to college to upgrade their skills and resultant job prospects. To illustrate this fact, age data for students at Humber College for 1991 were as shown in Table 1.1.

Table 1.1

Age: Humber College Students⁵

	<u>Under 21</u>	<u>21 to 24</u>	<u>25 to 29</u>	<u>30 & Over</u>
Percent of students	21	52	18	9

A more recent study⁶ by the Ontario Ministry of Colleges and Universities indicated that only half the 1992 student entrants came directly from high school; half

⁴CAAT2 Survey, Ontario Ministry of Colleges and Universities, 900 Bay Street, Toronto M7A 1L2, December 9, 1992

⁵Full-Time Enrolment at Humber College by Age, Corporate Planning and Services, Ontario Ministry of Colleges and Universities, Toronto, November 12, 1992

⁶Dr. Peter Dietsche, Task Force on Advanced Training, Ontario Ministry of Colleges and Universities, Toronto, March, 1993

entered college after spending some time either in the work force or engaged in seeking employment.

The trend towards a larger component of more mature students is expected to continue, driven in part by the facts that: two-thirds of those who will be in the Canadian labor force in the year 2005 are already in the work force today; half of the new jobs in this decade will require more than 12 years of education and training; and 60% of the work force in 1993 possessed no more than a high school education.⁷

Records on students' last permanent address prior to registration have similarly indicated a departure from the traditional student progression from local high school to college. Data for 1991 showed that 58%⁸ of Ontario students who were attending Humber College came from permanent addresses located beyond normal commuting distance. This incidence of living, studying and working away from home is believed to have exerted a maturing influence on these college students.

Another changing characteristic of Ontario's college students has been the increase in enrolment of students holding degrees from universities. In 1992 seven

⁷*Terms of Employment*, Royal Bank Letter, page 3, Volume 74, No. 1, Published by Royal Bank of Canada, January/February 1993

⁸*Full-time Enrolment at Humber College by Age, Corporate Planning and Services, Ontario Ministry of Colleges and Universities, Toronto, November 12, 1992*

s

H

C

f

p

C

M

w

percent⁹ of college students held university degrees, usually Bachelor Degrees in Arts. These individuals have enrolled in colleges specifically to obtain job-related skills that enabled them to gain employment.

Programs Offered By Large Community Colleges

The typical large community college offers a wide range of employment-oriented education, grouped under the following organizational divisions:

Applied & Creative Arts	Health Sciences
School of Business	Technology
Business & Industry Services	Human Studies

The data¹⁰ shown in Table 1.2 indicate the kinds of programs which are offered by a typical large community college. Each program obtains approval from the Ontario Ministry of Education, based on a justification of the workplace demand.

Table 1.2

Programs Offered - Large Community Colleges

Applied & Creative Arts Division

Creative Photography	Fashion Arts
Music	Theater Arts
Audio-Visual Technology	Film & T.V. Production
Journalism	Advertising Media Sales
Public Relations	Radio Broadcasting
Advertising & Graphic Design	Industrial Design
Interior Design	Package & Graphic Design
Cuisine Apprentice	Recreation Leadership

⁹Discussions with Mr. Barry Hemmerling, Associate Registrar, Humber College, April 1993

¹⁰Calendar 1992-1993, Humber College, Rexdale, Ontario, page 42

Table 1.2 Cont'd

Health Sciences Division

Early Childhood Education	Ambulance & Emergency Care
Funeral Services	Nursing Assistant
Nursing (post-graduate)	Allied & Community Health
Child & Youth Worker	

Human Studies Division

Communications	Arts & Science
General Education	Language & Math Development

Technology Division

Architectural Design	Mechanical Engineering
Electrical Engineering	Plastics Engineering
Heating & Air Conditioning	Safety Engineering
Chemical Engineering	Civil Engineering
Computer Engineering	Electronics
Welding	Industrial Maintenance

School of Business

Accountancy	Business Administration
Computer Information Systems	Human Resource Management
Marketing Management	International Business
Legal Assistant	Office Administration

The relevance of college programs to demands of the Ontario workplace has been an important issue to the Ontario Ministry of Education. As a method of generating feedback on program effectiveness, the Ministry requires all colleges to track the success rates of their graduates in obtaining program-related employment upon graduation. In instances where graduates of a particular program experienced difficulty in obtaining program-related employment as a result of a decline in employer demand, the tracking process has had the effect of ultimately causing the deletion of that program from college offerings. For example, after some years of declining demand for its

graduat

discont

On

instit

colleg

suppor

T

employ

averag

placem

Slight

rate

restr

this

relev

contr

Curri

educa

Colle

¹¹M
Depart

¹²M

¹³M

graduates, the Equine program at Humber College was discontinued in 1993.

On the other hand, where a community college seeks to institute a new program offering, the Ministry requires the college to justify that the proposed new program is supported by employment demand for program graduates¹¹.

The measured placement rate in program-related employment for marketing graduates at Humber College averaged 80% over the period 1986-1989¹². However the placement rate dropped in 1991 to 67% and to 50% in 1992. Slight improvement occurred in 1993, when the placement rate reached 52%. The recent economic recession and restructuring in Ontario appear to be important factors in this decline. However the question arose as to whether the relevance of marketing course curriculum was also a factor contributing to the decline in job placement.

Curriculum Upgrading - Humber College

Humber College has been committed to providing quality education, as exemplified in the following extract from the College mission statement¹³:

¹¹Minutes of Ministry approval to the proposed new Marketing Management Program, Marketing Department, School of Business, April 1988

¹²Ms Judy Harvey, Manager Placement Department, Humber College, March 15, 1994

¹³"Mission Statement" Humber College of Applied Arts and Technology, 1988

The
important
the miss
curricul
educatio
social e

The
communit
Division
influenc
in the f
curricul

The
nature o
majority
Applied
practiti
classroo
they hav
to assis
of emplo

"Informal"
Divisions, Hu

"...The College is accessible to a variety of clients, is responsive in its curriculum offerings, and flexible in its delivery modes. Humber College is committed to leadership in instructional excellence..."

The annual curriculum updating process has been an important vehicle for the realization of goals inherent in the mission statement, that is, ensuring that the curriculum was effective in relation to changing demands in education brought about by changes in the economic and social environment of the Province.

The curriculum upgrading process in a typical large community college has differed greatly from Division to Division because of differing internal and external influences on the process. These differences are apparent in the following overview of each Divisions' approach to the curriculum review process in 1992¹⁴.

The Applied & Creative Arts Division, because of the nature of its programs, has not utilized text books in the majority of its courses. Because course instructors in Applied & Creative Arts have been drawn from the ranks of practitioners in their respective fields, they bring to the classroom an orientation towards the workplace. Typically they have well-developed contacts in business and industry to assist them in maintaining program relevance to the needs of employers of program graduates.

¹⁴Information in this section has been drawn from discussions with the Deans of the respective Divisions, Humber College, December 1992

Mar
called
a student
pay for
restaurant
demands

Cun
programs
process
groups.

In
updating
require
Governme
standards

In
placed
discipl
e.g. ph
updating
and cha
usually
to prog
Arts Di
been of
Studies

Many of the programs in Applied and Creative Arts have called for student "placement", an arrangement under which a student has obtained practical experience working without pay for one or two months in a photographic studio, restaurant, etc., in order to orient themselves to the demands of the workplace.

Curriculum upgrading in Applied & Creative Arts programs has therefore tended to be an externally-driven process, strongly influenced by the demands of employer groups.

In the Health Sciences Division, curriculum design and updating has occurred directly as a result of the (external) requirements of the Ontario College of Nurses, a Provincial Government body which has been established to maintain standards for safe nursing practice.

In the Human Studies Division, emphasis has been placed on foundation courses of knowledge in the various disciplines for which the Division has been responsible, e.g. philosophy, social studies, and language. Curriculum updating has typically involved text selections from a wide and changing choice of available texts. Courses have usually been designed around the chosen text. In contrast to programs in Health Sciences and in Applied & Creative Arts Divisions, employers' needs for specific skills have been of lesser influence in curriculum redesign in the Human Studies Division.

In the
took place
discontin
the needs
the past
links wit
Professio
have enl
members
the Divi
programs

The
innovat
ahead o
faculty
updatin
demands

TH
driven
(Develo
captur
identi
to per
specia
proces
releva
coveri

In the Technology Division, a considerable down-sizing took place four years ago, reflecting the need to discontinue certain programs which no longer adequately met the needs of employers of the Division's graduates. During the past three years, the Division has developed stronger links with such industry associations as the Association of Professional Engineers of Ontario. Members of the Division have enlisted the assistance of industry professionals as members of College program advisory committees, to assist the Division in maintaining workplace relevance in their programs.

The Technology Division has found that technological innovation, as practiced in industry, frequently ran ahead of available textbook resources. This has driven faculty to work directly with industry practitioners in updating technology course content to meet changing employer demands.

The Technology Division has formalized an externally-driven curriculum updating process entitled "DACUM" (Developing A Curriculum). DACUM is a systematic process of capturing input from technology practitioners as a basis for identifying what must be learned by a technologist in order to perform effectively in a given technical occupation or specialty. The Technology Division believes that the DACUM process has proven useful in achieving a higher level of relevance in the design of curriculum for learning programs covering many technical job classifications.

The
based up
on knowl

In t
typically
packages
and compu
outlines
chosen te
book publ
teaching
Business.

In ma
Business,
establishe
updating.
more invol
with analy
to current

In or
curriculum
discussions
administrat
of these,
roughly the
have been e
process, and

The key point in the use of DACUM is that curriculum based upon that system has been externally-driven, focusing on knowledge and skills needed on the job.

In the School of Business, curriculum updating has typically involved an annual review of new offerings of packages of text, visuals, instructor guides, test banks and computerized support material. Course goals and outlines have usually been based on the content of the chosen text. As was the case in Human Studies Division, book publishers have offered a wide range of texts and teaching aids in support of courses offered by the School of Business.

In marketing, as in other departments of the School of Business, a formal advisory committee of employers has been established to provide advice on program design and updating. However, historically this committee has been more involved with developing new marketing programs than with analyzing existing programs and courses for relevance to current needs of the workplace.

In order to ascertain the practice in marketing curriculum updating at other Ontario community colleges, discussions were held in December 1992 with faculty and administrative staff at seven other community colleges. All of these, except Mohawk College in Hamilton, utilized roughly the same process as Humber College. Mohawk College have been experimenting with changes to the traditional process, and have established a task force to look into

alternat.

The

indicate

Humber Co

colleges

To s

curriculum

Ontario's

curriculum

needs has

of the Col

reviews ha

workplace-

whether th

is consist

of college

For ma

placement r

over the pa

factor in t

severe econ

rise to cha

in the workp

relevance of

alternatives. Preliminary results are expected mid-1994.

The discussions with other Ontario community colleges indicate that the marketing curriculum review practice at Humber College was relatively typical of that used by other colleges in the Province.

To summarize, in addressing the need to update curriculum to meet changing needs of the workplace, Ontario's community colleges have typically conducted annual curriculum reviews. The degree of orientation to workplace needs has varied considerably across the different Divisions of the Colleges. Specifically in marketing, the curriculum reviews have traditionally been more textbook-driven than workplace-driven. This gives rise to the question as to whether the existing marketing program content and delivery is consistent with the needs and expectations of employers of college marketing graduates.

Statement of the Problem

For marketing graduates of Humber College, the job placement rate in program-related employment has dropped over the past four years from 80% to 52% in 1993. A major factor in this decline appears to have been the recent severe economic situation in Ontario, which has also given rise to changes in the kinds of knowledge and skills needed in the workplace. The question arose as to whether the relevance of college marketing curriculum was also a factor

contribu

graduate

The

situatio

problem

The Onta

Ont.

economic

restructu

competiti

included

the manuf

and sever

products

exert hea

resulting

organizat.

realize co

The b

been chara

decision-m

led to dem

saving tim

communicat.

¹⁵Proceedings

contributing to the decline in job placement of these graduates.

The following overview of the Ontario economic situation has been arrayed as a context in which this problem was addressed in this study.

The Ontario Economy

Ontario has recently experienced the most severe economic recession since the '30's, as Canadian business restructured to reduce costs in order to meet global competition. The new market dynamics¹⁵ in Ontario have included a domestic recession, a shift in the economy from the manufacture of products to the provision of services, and severe global pressure on the prices which Canadian products and services have realized in the market.

Pressure on prices has forced Ontario employers to exert heavy downward pressure on all business expense, with resulting demands on employees at all levels in business organizations to develop new ways of working together to realize cost reduction.

The business environment of the past few years has also been characterized by a compression of time frames for decision-making and for new product development. This has led to demands for new approaches and new skills aimed at saving time in business analysis, decision-making and communications.

¹⁵*Proceedings of the Marketing Advisory Committee, Humber College, 22 November 29, 1993*

The
Ontario'
industry
organiza
prioriti

Emerging

The
business
to surviv
prioritie
for new w

For

Toronto,

"Careers &

authors c.

employment

find that

exhibit le

improved c

Additional

de-emphasi

simplicity

¹⁶Ibid

¹⁷Careers & the
September 23, 199

The drive for increased productivity and efficiency in Ontario's economy has caused employers in business and industry to effect reductions in employment in their organizations and to strive for a clearer focus on business priorities.

Emerging New Skills Needed In The Workplace

The market dynamics in the Ontario economy has forced business and industry to develop new priorities¹⁶ in order to survive and prosper in the early 1990's. These priorities, discussed above, have in turn driven the need for new workplace skills.

For the past several years The Financial Post, Toronto, has published an annual supplement entitled "Careers & the Job Market". In their 1992 issue¹⁷, authors claimed that Marketing graduates who sought employment in the new business environment were likely to find that there were immediate demands placed upon them to exhibit leadership, and to take the initiative in providing improved customer service and in generating cost reduction. Additionally, new graduates were likely to find a strong de-emphasis on lengthy reports and studies in favor of simplicity and brevity in analysis and communication.

¹⁶*Ibid*

¹⁷*Careers & the Job Market - What's In Store For '93 Grads?, The Financial Post, Toronto, Canada, September 23, 1992*

New

become h

decision

Many fir

organiza

function

Sim

Departme

group of

developi

revision

group,

consider

has ide

to be a

and oper

problem

effectiv

team lea

higher p

A r

of "soft

both in

directio

¹⁸Centraliz
Resources Con

¹⁹Proceedi

New graduates, the Post continued, were likely to become highly involved in team-oriented idea-generation and decision-making, often without reference to a supervisor. Many firms were then operating under so-called circular organizational structures¹⁸, in which the supervisor function had been formally removed.

Since January 1992, members of the Marketing Department at Humber College have been working with a small group of senior managers in industry with the objective of developing a process to provide a perspective in which revisions to marketing curricula would take place. This group, called the Marketing Advisory Committee, has considered the implications of Ontario's new environment and has identified the need for the college marketing graduate to be a quick learner and a self-starter; to be creative and open minded; to become customer-oriented; to possess problem-solving and analytical skills; to exercise effective listening skills; to operate successfully as a team leader and as a team facilitator; and to achieve higher productivity¹⁹.

A review of the literature revealed emerging new sets of "soft" skills which are being called for by employers both in Canada and the U.S.A. It also illustrates new directions now being taken in M.B.A. programs in Canadian

¹⁸Centralization of Financial Services, GE Canada, discussions with Eric Hotson, Manager Human Resources Corporate, GE Canada, Meadowvale, Ontario, April 23, 1993

¹⁹Proceedings of Marketing Advisory Committee, Humber College, November 29, 1993

universi
environm

In

typicall
in their
to the de
is releva
specifica
the kinds
published
outlines
relative)

Implicati

If e

providing
kinds of
workplace
firstly,
obtaining
their care
needed sk.

The p
existing m
typically
consistent

universities to meet changes in Canada's business environment.

In contrast, college schools of business in Ontario typically do not incorporate these emerging new skill sets in their courses. This absence also raises the question as to the degree to which existing college marketing curriculum is relevant to the needs of today's employers. More specifically, notwithstanding the emergence of demand for the kinds of knowledge and skills discussed above, the published goals and objectives appearing in the course outlines of college marketing courses have remained relatively unchanged over the past several years.

Implications For Marketing Graduates

If existing college marketing course curricula were not providing adequate opportunity for students to acquire the kinds of knowledge and skills which were in demand in the workplace, the implications for college graduates were firstly, that they may have experienced difficulty in obtaining employment and secondly, they may have found that their career progression was restricted by their lack of needed skills.

Purpose of the Study

The purpose of this study was to determine if the existing marketing program content and delivery, as typically offered in Ontario community colleges, were consistent with the needs and expectations of employers so

as to e
employ
workpla
seven r
which w

Research

Wha
graduate
function
employer

Research

What
marketing
effective
identified

Research C

What
college ma
their curre

as to enable college marketing graduates to secure employment and make an effective contribution in the workplace. In approaching this purpose, the following seven research questions were established to gather data which was used for analysis in this study:

Research Question 1

What are the skills needed by community college graduates for effective performance in the marketing function in today's business environment, as identified by employers?

Research Question 2

What is the relationship between existing college marketing program content and the skills needed for effective performance in today's business environment, as identified by employers in Research Question 1?

Research Question 3

What are the skills perceived to be needed by community college marketing graduates for effective performance in their current jobs, as identified by recent graduates?

Research

What
employers
3 above?

Research

To
communit
skills i

Research

Wh
marketi
the ski
(a
(b
(c

Research

Wh
employe
policy
program

Research Question 4

What are the differences between the responses of employers and those of graduates to Research Questions 1 and 3 above?

Research Question 5

To what degree do immediate supervisors perceive that community college marketing graduates demonstrate having the skills identified in Research Question 1, above?

Research Question 6

What are the perceptions of recent community college marketing graduates as to the degree to which they learned the skills they identified in Research Question 3, in

- (a) the courses in their college marketing program,
- (b) other college learning experiences, or
- (c) learning experiences outside of college prior to graduation?

Research Question 7

What are the implications of the responses of employers, supervisors and of recent graduates for college policy regarding curriculum updating in college courses and programs in marketing?

The s
provide th
that could
marketing
workplace.
college gr
colleges'

Addit
value thro
within the
programs,
interested

Significance of the Study

The significance of this study lay in its potential to provide the College Marketing Department with information that could be applied in the on-going development of marketing curricula so that it better met the demands of the workplace. This, in turn, was expected to benefit both college graduates and their employers, and strengthen the colleges' contribution to Ontario's economic health.

Additionally, the study was expected to contribute value through its prospective application in other Divisions within the College, in the College's general studies programs, and in other Ontario community colleges interested in curriculum development.

For
placement
over the
December
have been
the quest
college m
to the de

In t
Ontario's
discussio
which ha
result o
America.
sets, v
"workpla
reviewed

Lit
been re

Ms Judy Harvey

CHAPTER II

REVIEW OF RELATED LITERATURE

Introduction

For college marketing graduates in Ontario, the job placement rate in program-related employment has dropped over the past four years from a high of 80% to 52%¹ as of December 1993. A major factor in this decline appears to have been the recent economic situation in Ontario. However the question arose as to whether the workplace-relevance of college marketing curriculum was also a factor contributing to the decline in job placement of these graduates.

In this chapter, literature on recent changes in Ontario's economy has been reviewed, followed by a discussion on emerging new kinds of knowledge and skills which have increasingly been in demand by employers as a result of changes in the economic environment in North America. Next, the literature on emerging new skills sets, variously labelled as "employability skills" or "workplace skills", or "workplace basics", has been reviewed.

Literature on theoretical skills frameworks has also been reviewed in order to provide a perspective for the

¹Ms Judy Harvey, Manager Placement Department, Humber College, March 15, 1994

discussion

workplace

The

which have

Canadian

employers

Lastly,

skills set

order to

Ontario c

of graduates

by graduates

The Content

Since

undergoing

and reduction

employees.

Driving

on profits

streamlining

for speeding

quality.

North America

Clinton in

Award:

discussion of the kinds of skills needed in today's workplace.

The literature review highlights curriculum changes which have recently taken place in some American and Canadian university MBA programs in an effort to meet employers' demands for more emphasis in "soft" skills. Lastly, the literature review traces the development of the skills sets used in the survey instruments of this study in order to obtain the perceptions of employers of recent Ontario college marketing graduates, and also perceptions of graduates, as to the kinds of skills which were needed by graduates to perform effectively in the workplace.

Changes in the Canadian Economy

The Context: North American Economy

Since the late '80's, North American industry has been undergoing major change, with "delayering" of organizations and reductions in the numbers of both staff and operating employees.

Driving forces behind these changes included pressure on profits resulting from increased global competition; streamlining operations through use of computers; the need for speedier decision-making; and increased emphasis on quality. The transformation which has been taking place in North American industry was recently summarized by President Clinton in his endorsement of the 1994 Malcolm Baldrige Award:

The Canada

In

Porter³ o

comparing

Those tre

developme

colleges

high unit

investmen

Porter po

and thus

and that

economy m

Compe

continued,

in Canada

³Foreword, *The Making of the Canadian Standards and Quality, U*

⁴Canada at the Crossroads: Business Council on National Standards, October 1991

"To meet the challenges of the global economy, our most successful companies have been eliminating unnecessary layers of management, empowering front-line workers, becoming more responsive to their customers, and seeking constantly to improve the products they make, the services they provide, and the people they employ."

William J. Clinton²

The Canadian Economy

In "Canada at the Crossroads", Harvard's Professor Porter³ cited several worrisome performance trends comparing Canada to the seven leading industrial countries. Those trends most pertinent to the field of training and development in industry and to business education in colleges and universities were low productivity growth; high unit labor costs; unemployment; and lagging investments in upgrading skills and technology. Professor Porter pointed out that the underpinning of competitiveness, and thus of a country's standard of living, is productivity and that to achieve sustained productivity growth, an economy must continually upgrade itself.

Competitive success grows out of dynamism, he continued, and in the next several years, many industries in Canada will be forced to restructure and refocus, to

²Foreword, *The Malcolm Baldrige National Quality Award, 1994 Award Criteria*, National Institute of Standards and Quality, U.S. Department of Commerce, Gaithersburg, Maryland, 1994

³*Canada at the Crossroads - The Reality of a New Competitive Environment*, a study prepared by the Business Council on National Issues and the Government of Canada, Michael E. Porter, Harvard Business School, October 1991

rational
and to
toward

Pr

in Canada
science
barrier
The lev
sustain
for Cana
also tra
and adop

Industrial

Not

Canadian
global e

In

successf
economy⁴
simplici
in reven
reductio

*Speed, Simplicity,
Company, Harvard B*

*Ms Elyse Allan,
Marketing Advisory Bo*

rationalize product lines, exit from peripheral businesses, and to shift away from some industries and segments and toward others (page 86).

Professor Porter claimed that what was most troubling in Canada was the fact that in essential areas such as science, technology, education and training, significant barriers stood in the way of effective upgrading (page 6). The level of advanced skills in Canada, critical to sustaining and improving sources of competitive advantage for Canadian industry, was inadequate (page 49). Canada also trailed other industrialized countries in the creation and adoption of new technologies (page 51).

Industries Coping with Change

Notwithstanding Professor Porter's findings, many Canadian industrial firms are successfully coping in the new global economy.

In the electrical industry, General Electric has been successfully adapting to the challenges of the new global economy⁴. Between 1981-1989, G.E.'s drive for speed and simplicity in their operations resulted in a 117% increase in revenues, a 186% increase in net income, and a 26% reduction in numbers of employees. G.E. Canada⁵ have

⁴*Speed, Simplicity, Self-confidence: Keys to leading in the '90's, John F. Welch, Chairman, General Electric Company, Harvard Business Review, 4/89*

⁵*Ms Elyse Allan, Manager Commercial & Industrial Lighting, G.E. Lighting, addressing Humber College Marketing Advisory Board, October 13, 1992*

claimed t
productiv
has gener
new kinds
making,

The
change in
experien
petro-che
1990's,

In D
for staff
the previ
encourage
Shell Can
companies

Oil
has driven
leadership
the down-s

In th
in early 1
lay-offs,

Mr. Stephen Long,
November 1992.

Discussions: Mr. A. G.
76

claimed that their corporate drive for increased productivity, increased speed, and focus on globalization has generated a need for GE employees to be proficient in new kinds of business skills, such as faster decision-making, employee empowerment, and process leadership.

The Canadian oil industry has similarly faced severe change in its economic environment. Oil companies have experienced declining product demand in both the oil and petro-chemical sectors throughout the 1980's and into the 1990's, coupled with continuing low realized prices.

In December 1992, Imperial Oil announced new targets for staff reduction on top of a 15% employee reduction in the previous year, offering enhanced pension benefits as an encouragement towards retirement, among other strategies⁶. Shell Canada and Petro-Canada, Canada's other two major oil companies, have similarly down-sized their operations.

Oil industry members⁷ claimed that this down-sizing has driven new demands for creativity, problem-solving, leadership, and team-work from those employees remaining in the down-sized organizations.

In the automotive industry, General Motors announced in early 1992 a series of radical organizational changes, lay-offs, and plant closings. G.M.'s plans called for the

⁶Mr. Stephen Long, Imperial Oil's Designate to the Marketing Advisory Committee, Humber College, November 1992.

⁷Discussions: Mr. A. G. Seager, Vice President Marketing (retired), Shell Canada Limited, December 18, 1993

closing c

79,500 ir

G.M.

aimed at

This conc

approache

reduce wa

In t

environme

lead-time

on produc

a small no

three mont

product pr

reviews⁹.

simplicity

instituted

by employe

identified

clearer fo

process.

⁹G.M.'s "Warriors" On

¹⁰Ed

¹¹Continuous Quality
Quality. IBM Canada Ltd.

closing of 21 plants and a reduction in employment levels by 79,500 in 1992.

G.M.'s new "Purchased Input Concept Optimization"⁸ was aimed at generating over 60% improvement in productivity. This concept called on employees to develop new skills and approaches to improve product and process quality and to reduce waste.

In the computer industry, the change in the business environment has been characterized by the need for shorter lead-times in new product introduction and downward pressure on product prices. For example, although the life span of a small notebook computer has now shortened to as little as three months, it used to take IBM that long to send a product proposal through their management committee reviews⁹. IBM has experienced the same needs for speed and simplicity in their operations which General Electric instituted in the late '80's. Some of the new skills needed by employees in IBM to compete in the global market were identified¹⁰ as faster decision-making, better team-work, clearer focus on the customer and a clearer focus on process.

⁸G.M.'s "Warriors" On a Mission to Win, *Globe & Mail*, September 30, 1992

⁹*Ibid*

¹⁰*Continuous Quality Improvement in IBM*, presentation by Mr. Barry Goode, Manager Market Driven Quality, IBM Canada Ltd., July 14, 1992

chan

prov

prio

Duri

auth

indus

sets

perfo

conta

commo

skills

needs

U.S. A

Th

in Beth

trends

placemen

American

mandate

with pros

acquire a

regarding

In 19

published

Emerging New Skill Sets Sought By Employers

Previous sections of the review have traced recent changes in the Ontario economic environment and have provided anecdotal data on the resultant emergence of new priorities in the kinds of skills needed in the workplace. During this time period, various U.S. and Canadian authorities have communicated to audiences, both in industry and in education, on the subject of emerging new sets of employee skills which are needed for effective job performance in the 1990's. Although the literature did not contain a definition of these new skills sets, the one common characteristic among all of the published "new" skills sets has been that the authors have researched the needs of employers as the basis for their work.

U.S. Authorities on New Skills

The American College Placement Council, headquartered in Bethlehem, PA., collects and maintains information on trends and projections that affect career planning, placement, recruitment, and employment of graduates from American colleges and universities. The fulfillment of this mandate has required the Council to maintain close contact with prospective employers of college graduates in order to acquire a clear understanding of changes in employers' needs regarding job placement and recruitment.

In 1987 the American College Placement Council published an article entitled "The Ideal Job Candidate of

the 21st Century"¹¹, indicating that in discussions with employers on the skills they sought in candidates for recruitment, six kinds of skills tended to recur; these are shown in Table 2.1.

Table 2.1

The Ideal Job Candidate of the 21st Century

computer literacy	this skill is considered to be the most important ability for the '90's ¹²
generalist skills, rather than specialist	draw inferences; solve problems; think creatively
flexibility	the ability to be flexible and adaptable; to see change as an opportunity
creativity	the ability of the individual to influence the future by envisioning what he or she wants to achieve
communication and people skills	predicted to be the second most important job skill for the '90's
job search skills	the ability to search out employment opportunities and and match one's skills and abilities to the positions sought

The American Association of Community and Junior Colleges has also published a listing of the skills employers had been seeking in recruits, entitled "Workplace Basics: The Skills Employers Want"¹³. This listing was

¹¹By Rhea A. Nagle, Coordinator of the Resources Information Center, College Placement Council, 62 Highland Avenue, Bethlehem, PA 18017, 1987

¹²According to more than 100 personnel supervisors surveyed by the Chicago out-placement firm Challenger, Gray and Christmas, a source used by RIC in their article; see Footnote 9

¹³"Workplace Basics: The Skills Employers Want", by Anthony P. Carnavale, Leila J Gainer, Ann S. Meltzer & Shari L. Holland, American Association of Community and Junior Colleges, AACJC Journal, Feb/Mar 1989

based on research conducted as a joint project of the American Society for Training and Development and the U.S. Department of Labor.

The authors claimed that technological change, innovation and heightened competition have motivated business firms to adopt strategies that call for a work force which is innovative, adaptable and possessing strong interpersonal skills. The authors found that employers required employees to have not only the standard academic skills, but also the thirteen key basic skills shown in Table 2.2 as a basis for building broader job-related skills during employment.

Table 2.2

Workplace Basics: The Skills Employers Want

Learning to Learn	the ability to acquire the knowledge and skills needed to learn effectively, no matter what the learning situation
Listening	the ability to heed the key points of customers', suppliers' and co-workers' concerns
Oral Communications	the ability to convey an adequate response to those concerns
Problem-solving	the ability to think on one's feet
Creative thinking	the ability to come up with innovative solutions
Self-esteem	the ability to have pride in one's self and believe in one's potential to be successful
Goal-setting/motivation	the ability to know how to get things done
Personal & career development	the awareness of the skills needed to perform well in the workplace
Interpersonal skills	the ability to get along with customers, suppliers, and co-workers

Table 2.2 Cont'd

Teamwork	the ability to work with others to achieve a goal
Negotiation	the ability to build consensus through give and take
Organizational effectiveness	the understanding of where the organization is headed and how one can make a contribution
Leadership	the ability to assume responsibility and motivate co-workers

Canadian Authorities on New Skills

The Employment Office, Government of Canada, has also studied the kinds of skills needed for a successful job search. The Employment Office pointed out that while skills learned in educational courses are often very important, they are not the only kinds of skills that make the difference between whether or not an individual is successful in getting a job and keeping it. In "Skills: The Hottest and Most Transferable Ones"¹⁴, the authors cited the skills listed in Table 2.3 as highly desirable, if not crucial, to individuals seeking to make a successful break into Canada's labor market.

¹⁴*Skills - The Hottest and Most Transferable Ones*, by Linda D. Farris, *Occupational Outlook, Employment and Immigration Canada*, Volume 3, Fall 1988

Table 2.3

Skills: The Hottest & Most Transferable

Communication skills	the ability to read, write, speak and listen both clearly and informatively. Teaching, instructing and interviewing are included in communications skills
Math skills	the ability to use mathematics in monitoring complex processes at a computer terminal; the need to manage budgets; and the need to use mathematics to control processes, keep records and control results
Commercial Skills	knowledge and understanding of business systems and the use of office equipment
Computer Skills	computer literacy in common office functions; in industrial use using computer-controlled machinery and tools; and in developing new ways of utilizing computers
Attitudes, and People-Handling	attitudes include willingness to work hard and to learn; taking the initiative; cooperativeness; honesty; and being flexible

More recently, the University of Western Ontario undertook a joint study with the Ontario Ministry of Education with the objective of tracing the process of skills development in graduates as they progressed from early years in university through graduation to employment in Canadian industry. This study, "The Bases of Competence, Making the Match between University Graduates and Corporate Employers"¹⁵, involved 1,610 respondents comprising students from five universities and graduates in 20 corporations. The individuals who were studied represented five career stages established in the study:

¹⁵"The Bases of Competence: Making the Match between University Graduates and Corporate Employers - Phase II", a joint project by University of Western Ontario and Social Sciences and Humanities Research Council of Canada, Ontario Ministry of Education, May 12, 1992.

early university, pre-graduate; job entry; job change; and stabilized career.

Study authors selected eighteen skills, shown in Table 2.4, developed from literature and from interviews with students and business managers, as the basis for tracing the process of skills development. Students and graduates rated themselves on these skills over time. Once employed, graduates were also rated by their managers.

Table 2.4

The Bases of Competence, U.W.O.

Problem-solving	Decision-making
Planning & organizing	Personal organization/time management
Risk-taking	Oral communication
Written communication	Listening
Interpersonal skill	Managing conflict
Leadership/influence	Coordinating
Creativity/innovation	Visioning
Ability to conceptualize	Learning
Personal strengths	Technical skill

In the study report, the authors concluded that without basic literacy and numerical skills, development of the 18 skills listed in Table 2.4 is most difficult. Further, they claim that without development of those particular 18 skills, technical skills picked up previously, concurrently or later may never be effectively utilized.

The Conference Board of Canada has also been studying the kinds of skills which have been in demand by Canadian

employers. The Conference Board of Canada is the leading private applied research institution dedicated to enhancing the performance of Canadian organizations within the global economy.

In May 1992 the Corporate Council on Education, Conference Board of Canada, issued an array of the skills entitled "Employability Skills Profile: The Critical Skills Required of the Canadian Work Force"¹⁶. This skills set was prepared by the staff of the Conference Board based on discussions with senior managers of their member firms, which included medium-sized and large corporations across Canada. The Conference Board has indicated that their "Employability Skills" have been designed for application to all job classifications across all Canadian business and industry. This skills set is shown in Table 2.5.

¹⁶*Employability Skills Profile - The Critical Skills Required of the Canadian Workforce*, Corporate Council on Education, Conference Board of Canada, Ottawa, Ontario, May 1992

Table 2.5

Employability Skills Profile**Academic Skills****Communication**

Understand and speak the language in which business is conducted
 Listen to understand and learn
 Read, comprehend and use written materials, including charts and graphs
 Write effectively in the languages in which business is conducted

Thinking

Think critically and act logically to evaluate situations and solve problems
 Understand and solve problems involving mathematics and use the results
 Use technology, instruments, tools, and information systems effectively

Learning

Continue to learn for life

Personal Management Skills**Positive Attitudes and Behaviors**

Self-esteem and confidence
 Honesty, integrity and personal ethics
 A positive attitude toward learning, growth and personal health
 Initiative, energy and persistence to get the job done

Responsibility

The ability to set goals and priorities in work and in personal life
 The ability to manage time, money, and other resources to achieve goals
 Accountability for actions taken

Adaptability

A positive attitude toward change
 Recognition of and respect for peoples' diversity and individual differences
 The ability to identify and suggest new ideas to creatively get the job done

Teamwork Skills**Working With Others**

Understand and contribute to the organization's goals
 Understand and work within the culture of the group
 Plan and make decisions with others and support the outcomes
 Respect the thoughts and opinions of others in the group
 Exercise "give and take" to achieve group results
 Seek a team approach, as appropriate
 Lead when appropriate, mobilizing the group for high performance

The skill sets discussed in previous sections have been authored by educational institutions, by governments, and by industry associations. Individual corporations have also authored listings of skills which they considered important in the career development of their employees and also in the process of recruiting new employees. For example, Imperial Oil introduced their "Guide To Managing Your Learning"¹⁷, to assist employees to take charge of their own learning with the objective of continually strengthening the firm's human resources.

Imperial Oil has taken the position¹⁸ that the technical knowledge acquired in school by the average worker is out of date within five years of graduation. Further, Imperial holds that it is the employee's responsibility to keep him/herself as current as possible while employed at Imperial Oil, and that learning must be a lifelong process.

Imperial has created a package of planning tools to assist each employee to manage his/her learning, which involves two broad groupings of skills: (a) a set of "soft" skills, and (b) technical skills. The latter are defined by the individual's current job in the Company's work unit.

Imperial's planning documents have not been specific on any technical skills which the employee should consider;

¹⁷*Guide to Managing Your Learning*, Core Competency Framework, Imperial Oil Limited, Toronto, Revised February 24, 1993

¹⁸*Ibid*

however their documentation was very specific as to required soft skills. The soft skills have been labelled "Core Competency Framework" by Imperial Oil, and are shown in Table 2.6.

Table 2.6

Core Competency Framework - Imperial Oil

<u>Ability to Learn</u>	<u>Business Literacy</u>	<u>Communications</u>	<u>Thinking Skills</u>	<u>Self-Management</u>	<u>Group Effectiveness</u>	<u>Leadership & Influence</u>
Managing own learning	Knowing the business	Listening Writing	Problem-solving	Career Development	Participation in groups	Consulting leadership
Adapting to change	Economic literacy	Presentations	Decision-making	Ethics Work planning & Time management	Leading Teams Managing conflict	Collaboration Supervision Management Fundamentals
Helping others learn	Computer literacy	Negotiation Face-to-face communication	Continuous improvement	Self-awareness		Leadership
Managing change	Customer service	Interviewing	Creative thinking	Stress management	Managing interfaces	
Mentoring	Imperial & the industry	Dealing with media & publics	Independent judgement	Coaching & advising	Valuing diversity	
Creating change	Global view		Strategic thinking Visionary thinking	Balancing work & non-work issues	Designing organizations	

Another corporation, Procter & Gamble, undertook a study¹⁹ in 1990 to identify the critical skills their employees needed to make an effective contribution to the firm. Their research approach was to identify the kinds of skills which high-performing P & G employees at all levels and in all departments were demonstrating on the job. P & G

¹⁹*Critical Skills For Job Applicants to Possess*, Ms. Catherine McIntyre, Human Resources Department, Procter & Gamble, Toronto, 1992

then synthesized these into a set of skills which the firm firstly, sought when interviewing potential new recruits; secondly, used in their annual employee evaluation process; and thirdly, have incorporated into their employee training programs. This skills list is shown in Table 2.7.

Table 2.7

Critical Skills For New Recruits

Priority setting	make the tough choices and focus time and resources on the most critical items
Initiative & follow-through	act as the impetus which gets (important) things started and show the persistence to keep working to get them completed, regardless of obstacles
Thinking & problem-solving	clarify the problem before starting to work on it; make data-based decisions; and combine strategic and intuitive thinking with data in making the best overall decisions
Communication	listen to understand; present ideas clearly, thoughtfully and persuasively in oral and written communication
Technical mastery	develop a solid grasp of key concepts in one's area of technical mastery; turn theory into practical solutions to move the business ahead
Working effectively with others	work as a team player, contributing to a team environment which helps everyone contribute their best work, even in times of conflict or frustration
Creativity & innovation	search and reapply proven, successful ideas; use data and intuition to create viable new ideas and solutions
Leadership	create and articulate a vision for one's business unit; get others to work towards fulfilment of that vision

Since January 1992, members of the Marketing Department at Humber College have been working with nine senior managers in industry with the intent of developing a

workplace perspective in which the College would undertake revisions to marketing curricula.

This group, called the Humber College Marketing Advisory Committee, decided on a three-stage sequence in their approach to developing an improved curriculum review process:

- (a) firstly, the Committee considered today's new global competitive business environment and the kinds of externally-driven demands on their firms as a result of this environment;
- (b) secondly, they endeavored to identify the kinds of new strategies needed in order to compete successfully in this environment; and
- (c) thirdly, the Committee endeavored to identify the kinds of knowledge and skills needed by their employees in order for them to contribute to the successful execution of those strategies.

Working through this sequence, the Committee identified a set of "Critical Workplace Skills" which they recommended should be learned in college marketing programs. A summary of the Committee's work is shown in Table 2.8.

Process
on February
= Survey

Table 2.8
Critical Workplace Skills²⁰

<u>Externally-driven Priorities Arising from Global Environment</u>	<u>New Strategies, for Competing in the New Global Environment</u>	<u>Critical Skills Needed in the Workplace</u>
Drive for productivity . increasing competition . sunrise/sunset industries . shift toward service industries	Motivating people to be their best Reducing head counts Constant cost pressure Adding value: focus on essentials "Right"-sizing New attitudes to employment: ...higher turn-over Customer-driven quality Focus on priorities	Self-starter, prioritizing Teamwork, inter-personal skill Quick learner; learn to learn Communication, listening Customer-orientation Passion for quality Sets/meets aggressive targets Computer skills Ethics: business & personal
Need for increased speed	Flatter organizations Quicker decision-making Working in teams Brevity in communications Process-focused orientation Eliminating functional boundaries	
Focus on globalization	Building diversity Shifting investments globally	
Culture change	Demand for better technology Communication with stakeholders	

"Soft" Skills in University Business Programs

The Economist²¹ has reported that the outlook for business education, coming into the '90's, was undergoing considerable change in the U.S.A. Corporate recruiters were reported to be wondering whether graduate business schools were producing the sort of managers they needed. For example, the Economist reported in 1991 that Harold Leavitt

²⁰*Proceedings of the Marketing Advisory Committee, Humber College, September 29 and November 23, 1992 and February 8, 1993*

²¹*Survey - Management Education, The Economist, March 2nd 1991, page 4*

of Stanford University claimed business schools were transforming "well-proportioned young men and women...into critters with lop-sided brains, icy hearts and shrunken souls". As of December 1993, however, the Stanford Graduate School of Business had finalized a new mission statement, with new directions in curricula.²²

The Economist also reported that McKinsey and Company, management consultants, perceived existing (1991) MBA curricula as containing many courses based on 1960's and 1970's thinking and that more emphasis was needed on the teaching of "soft" subjects, like ethics, environmentalism and leadership issues such as risk-taking, vision, communication, community awareness.

In 1992 Canadian Business Magazine reported²³ that changes in strategies were beginning to take place in Canadian university MBA programs. This source cited discussions with Deans of MBA programs, outlining the introduction of new courses in "soft skills sets" which parallel those cited by the American College Placement Council and the American Association of Community and Junior Colleges. The Ecole des Hautes Etudes in Montreal, University of Calgary, University of Western Ontario and Queens University were reported to have introduced in 1992

²²*Stanford Today*, open letter from A. Michael Spence, Dean Graduate School of Business, Stanford University, December 1993

²³*What's New in MBA Education?*, by Randall Litchfield, Editor, Canadian Business Magazine, Toronto, April 1992.

courses in interpersonal relations, teamwork, motivation and leadership.

Michael Stern, of Euram Consultants Group Ltd., Toronto, with offices in ten countries, reported²⁴ in early 1993 another instance of the need for change in Canadian business school curriculum. A number of senior Canadian executives at a management seminar were asked to identify the abilities most important for success in a senior management position. Their responses included communication, team-building, negotiation, strategic orientation, and a global perspective. The seminar leader then uncovered a transparency listing the courses in a specific Canadian M.B.A. program; not one of the courses met the needs cited by the senior Canadian executives.

The emerging emphasis on "soft skills" in certain Canadian university business curriculum, referenced above, is in contrast with the marketing curricula in Ontario community colleges, which generally do not offer courses in "soft skills" as an integral part of college marketing programs.

Theoretical Frameworks of Skills

The literature review has thus far discussed changes in the Canadian and Ontario business environment, new strategies which employers have been taking in order to

²⁴*Old-Style Leadership Is No Longer Good Enough*, by Michael Stern, Euram Consultants Group Ltd., February 8, 1993

compete in the new business environment, and subsequently the kinds of emerging new skill sets which employers have identified as needed by employees in order to perform effectively in the new global business environment. In order to place these emerging new skill sets in perspective, it was decided to reference theoretical frameworks of skills in the literature.

Four theoretical frameworks of skills were selected for review: the 1977 Dictionary of Occupational Titles, U.S. Department of Labor, and the affective, cognitive, and psychomotor domains appearing in literature on the learning of skills in education.

Data, People and Things

In the 1977 U.S. publication "Dictionary of Occupational Titles"²⁵, job skills were listed in skill groupings of data, people and things, on the premise that every job requires a worker to function in some degree in those three skills groupings. Skills in the three listings were arranged from the relatively simple to the complex so that each successive relationship included those that were simpler and excluded the more complex.

In this system a job's relationship to data, people and things was expressed by identifying the highest function in each listing in the array shown in Table 2.9.

²⁵"Dictionary of Occupational Titles", Fourth Edition, Employment and Training Administration, U.S. Employment Service, E.S. Department of Labor, Washington, D.C., 1977

1
2
3
4
5

T

at

De

fo

Th

pa

don

whi

Tacoma
and D

Table 2.9

Data, People & Things

<u>Data</u>	<u>People</u>	<u>Things</u>
Synthesizing	Maundering	Setting-up
Coordinating	Negotiating	Precision working
Analyzing	Instructing	Operation-controlling
Compiling	Supervising	Driving-operations
Computing	Diverting	Manipulating
Copying	Persuading	Tending
Comparing	Speaking-signalling	Feeding-offbearing
	Serving	Handling
	Taking instructions	

"Data, People & Things" differs from the various skill sets appearing in previous sections of the literature review as "employability skills" in that the former is a holistic approach, purporting to include all kinds of skills required in a given job, whereas "employability skills" tend to focus primarily on "soft" skills.

Three Domains: Cognitive, Affective and Psychomotor

In their "Taxonomy of Educational Objectives"²⁶, authors Bloom, Englehart, Hill, Furst, Krathwohl, and Dave established a classification of educational objectives for use in an analytical approach to developing curricula. Their plans called for a complete taxonomy in three major parts: the cognitive, affective, and psychomotor domains. The cognitive domain included those objectives which deal with the recall or recognition of knowledge or

²⁶"Taxonomy of Educational Objectives", by Benjamin S. Bloom, Max D. Englehart, Edward J. Furst, Walker H. Hill, and David R. Krathwohl, David McKay Company Inc., New York, 1956

the development of intellectual abilities and skills. The affective domain included educational objectives describing changes in human interest, attitudes, values, and the development of appreciations. The third domain was the manipulative or motor-skill area, which emphasized some muscular skill, some manipulation of tools, equipment, materials and objects. Each of the three taxonomies constituted arrays of skills or activities which appeared in order from basic (1) to the most complex (6).

Bloom's²⁷ taxonomy for the cognitive domain appears in Table 2.10.

²⁷*"Handbook on Formative and Summative Evaluation of Student Learning", by Bloom, B.S., Hastings, J.T., and Madaus, G. G., McGraw-Hill, New York, 1971*

1

app

Taxonom
Bom, Ben

Table 2.10

Bloom's Taxonomy - Cognitive Domain

<u>Categories</u>	<u>Examples of Verbs Describing Skills</u>
1. Knowledge	
remembering previously learned information	describe, label, identify, name, state, locate, list, define, outline
2. Comprehension	
understand the meaning of information	explain, give examples, summarize, rewrite, paraphrase, convert, distinguish, predict
3. Application	
using learned information in relevant situations	infer, change, discover, operate, predict, relate, show, solve, use, manipulate, modify, demonstrate, compute
4. Analysis	
breaking down information into component parts so that its structure may be known	analyze, break down, differentiate, discriminate, illustrate, identify, outline, point out, select, separate, sub-divide, categorize, classify
5. Synthesis	
putting component parts together to create a pattern or structure which could be new or different	devise, compile, design, compose, explain, re-arrange, plan, combine, categorize, show relationship, synthesize
6. Evaluation	
judging the value of information or material based on personal or given criteria	judge, compare, contrast, evaluate, criticize, justify, draw conclusions

Krathwohl's Taxonomy²⁸ in the affective domain, appearing in Table 2.11, constituted an array of skills or

²⁸*Taxonomy of Educational Objectives, Handbook II: Affective Domain*, by David R. Krathwohl, Benjamin S. Bloom, Bertram B. Masia, David McKay Company Inc., New York, March 1969

human responses to the content, subject matter, problems, or areas of human experience.

Table 2.11

Krathwohl's Taxonomy - Affective Domain

<u>Categories</u>	<u>Examples of Verbs Describing Skills</u>
1. Receiving	
being willing to pay attention being aware of importance of learning being sensitive to issues & viewpoints	listen, observe, follow, question, show willingness, concentrate
2. Responding	
complying with request respond willingly to request volunteer to perform a task enjoy the performance of a task	comply, answer, ask, question, respond, assist, perform, practice, present, search out, volunteer, enjoy
3. Valuing (object, attitude)	
recognizing the value of... appreciating the value of... expressing concern re value of... exercising commitment to value of...	recognize, accept, appreciate, discern, justify, defend, select, share, express concern, demonstrate
4. Organization	
conceptualizing a value bringing together different values resolving conflicts between values building a personal value system	compare, contract, relate, arrange, modify, combine, defend, explain, integrate, organize, synthesize
5. Characterization	
possessing a value system that has controlled an individual's behavior long enough for that individual to have developed a characteristic lifestyle that is consistent and predictable	act, display, practice, demonstrate
6. Evaluation	
judging the value of information or material based on personal or given criteria	judge, compare, contrast, evaluate, justify, draw conclusions

Develo
by

Dave's²⁹ taxonomy in the psychomotor domain, Table 2.12, constituted an array of skill performance involving the manipulation of objects, tools, supplies, instruments, machines or equipment.

Table 2.12

Dave's Taxonomy - Psychomotor Domain

1. Imitation

Observing skill and attempting
to repeat it

2. Manipulation

Performing a skill according to
instruction rather than observation

3. Precision

Reproducing a skill with accuracy,
proportion and exactness; usually
performed independently of original
source

4. Articulation

Combining more than one skill in
sequence with harmony and consistency

5. Naturalization

Completing one or more skills with ease
and becoming automatic with limited
physical or mental exertion

²⁹*Developing and Writing Behavioral Objectives*, as reported in *Educational Innovators' Press*, Tucson, Arizona, by Robert J. Armstrong, R. H. Dave et al, 1970

c

s

a

e

c

i

g

f

e

w

b

d

fr

th

th

ap

em

"We

hav

2.2

aut.

to h

What New
Dec 29

The literature on psychomotor skills cited the typing of a letter as an example of the application of psychomotor skills. However if one were to write a covering letter for a resume, designed with the objective of securing an employment interview, it follows that both psychomotor and conceptual skills would necessarily be involved. Moreover, if the writer structured the letter to appeal to the reader, generate reader interest and motivate the reader to react favorably to the writer, than the writer would necessarily employ skills in the affective domain.

The letter-writing example illustrates the fact that while there may be relatively clear definitional boundaries between the three domains, there can be practical difficulties in utilizing the three-category system.

Notwithstanding, the literature on theoretical frameworks of skills has provided a useful perspective for the design of the survey instruments in this study because this literature implies taking a holistic and balanced approach to the acquisition of research data rather than emphasis on "soft" skills alone. To illustrate, in "Workplace Basics: The Skills Employers Want", the authors have developed the array of thirteen skills shown in Table 2.2, page 29. In presenting the thirteen "new" skills, the authors stated³⁰ ... "Today's workplace requires employees to have not only the standard academic skills, say

³⁰*What New Skills?*, *Workplace Basics: The Skills Employers Want*, AACJC Journal, February/March 1989, page 29

1

S
C
M
S

employers, but also...other job-related skills (the 13 'Workplace Basics')..." Study authors were silent on the kinds of needed "standard academic skills".

For purposes of this study, however, it is intended to develop research information on both kinds of skills alluded to above, in order to determine the relative emphasis placed by respondents on both.

Development of Skills List for Study

The previous literature, other than that on theoretical frameworks, suggested there was a commonality of thinking as to the importance of "soft" skills, as opposed to standard academic and technical skills. To further examine the literature, a series of searches were conducted through the Center for Career and Technical Education, Michigan State University. Literature on key competencies and employability skills for individuals in marketing jobs were reviewed, drawing from the following sources:

"Key Competencies" of the MarkED competency data base, Marketing Education Resource Center Inc., Columbus Ohio, 1989

Student Performance Standards, Parts Marketing, July 1991

Performance Objectives, Hospitality Ontario, Ministry of Skills Development (undated)

Task List - Marketing and Distributive Education (Revised - 1986)

Curriculum Framework, Entrepreneurship, Florida
Department of Education, July 1991

Employability Skills: Task List and Profile,
Resource Center, Erickson Hall, Michigan State
University, April 9, 1993

Each of the above sources had organized their data on skills into three groupings: human relations, conceptual and technical. The kinds of skills appearing under the human resources grouping were very similar to the "soft" skills discussed earlier in the literature review. Skills appearing under the conceptual skills grouping and the technical skills grouping appeared to be combinations of academic marketing skills and psychomotor skills (e.g. operating computers, information processing, and read/use price sheets).

Based on data taken from all sources reviewed, the skills arrayed in Table 2.13 represented a judgement of the most frequently mentioned and important skills needed in today's marketing workplace in Ontario, and have been chosen as the basis for design of survey work sheets used in this study.

Table 2.13

Selection of Skills for Study

<u>Human Relations</u>	<u>Conceptual</u>	<u>Technical</u>
Communications: oral & written	Set goals & objectives	Marketing basics
Demonstrate initiative	Career Development	Distribution
Respect confidentiality	Risk management	Financing
Human Relations	Conceptual	Technical
Courtesy & respect for others	Product/service planning	Business mathematics
Honesty & integrity	Time management	Purchasing
Interpersonal skills	Understand entrepreneurship	Computer applications
Negotiation	Identify priorities	Business organization
Interest & enthusiasm	Learning to learn	Marketing strategy
Self-control	Visioning	Business law
Ethics	Interpret firm's mission	International trade
Empathy for others	Evaluate competition	Operations
Interviewing skills	Planning new business	Pricing
Values and lifestyle	Generating business ideas	Promotion
Positive work attitudes	Decision-making	Marketing research
Handling pressure & tension	Problem-solving	Market segmentation
Listening	Allocate resources	Public relations
Teamwork	Identify research need	Develop action plans
Persuasion	Evaluate own business unit	Business systems
Concern for customers' needs	Continuing education	Government regulation
Responsible behavior	Manpower planning	Business geography

The skills appearing in Table 2.13 were used in survey instruments designed to determine the perceptions of employers of recent college marketing graduates, and also perceptions of graduates, as to the kinds of skills which were needed by graduates to perform effectively in the workplace.

Summary

The literature on changes taking place in the Ontario economy as a result of new global competition makes reference to a growing demand by employers for new kinds of workplace skills needed by employees in order to make an effective contribution on the job. Several American and Canadian academic and government authorities have published sets of "new" skills demanded by employers; these skill sets have typically emphasized soft skills, as to be differentiated from technical skills and traditional academic skills. Private-sector corporations have also published listings of "new" skills sets they claim to be required by prospective applicants for employment and for those employees who aspire to more senior jobs in their firms.

The information gathered in this chapter has formed the basis of research instruments which have been developed to assess the degree to which existing college marketing curricula were consistent with the needs and expectations of employers, so as to enable college marketing graduates to

secure employment and make an effective contribution in the workplace.

CHAPTER III
METHODOLOGY AND PROCEDURES

Introduction

For marketing graduates of Humber College, the job placement rate in program-related employment has dropped over the past four years from 80% to 52%¹ as of December 1993. A major factor in this decline appears to have been the recent severe economic situation in Ontario. However the question arose as to whether the relevance of college marketing curriculum was also a contributing factor.

The purpose of this study was to determine if the existing marketing program content and delivery, as typically offered in Ontario community colleges, were consistent with the needs and expectations of employers so as to enable college marketing graduates to secure employment and make an effective contribution in the workplace.

Research Questions

In approaching the purpose of the study, the following seven research questions were established:

¹*Ms Judy Harvey, Manager Placement Department, Humber College, March 15, 1994*

Research Question 1

What are the skills needed by community college graduates for effective performance in the marketing function in today's business environment, as identified by employers?

Research Question 2

What is the relationship between existing college marketing program content and the skills needed for effective performance in today's business environment, as identified by employers in Research Question 1?

Research Question 3

What are the skills perceived to be needed by community college marketing graduates for effective performance in their current jobs, as identified by recent graduates?

Research Question 4

What are the differences between the responses of employers and those of graduates to Research Questions 1 and 3 above?

Research Question 5

To what degree do immediate supervisors perceive that community college marketing graduates demonstrate having the skills identified in Research Question 1, above?

Research Question 6

What are the perceptions of recent community college marketing graduates as to the degree to which they learned the skills they identified in Research Question 3, in

- (a) the courses in their college marketing program,
- (b) other college learning experiences, or
- (c) learning experiences outside of college prior to graduation?

Research Question 7

What are the implications of the responses of employers, supervisors and of recent graduates for college policy regarding curriculum updating in college courses and programs in marketing?

Populations

In addressing the research questions, three populations were included in the design of the study: graduates of marketing programs at Humber College for the years 1990 through 1992; Human Resources Managers of firms which had employed these graduates; and immediate supervisors of the marketing graduates on the job.

College Marketing Graduates

In selecting the population of graduates, the intent was to reach those individuals who had obtained at least one year of experience in the workforce, which would have

1

enabled them to provide informed opinions on the research questions relating to the workplace. Additionally, the intent was to survey only recent graduates, who could be expected to have a relatively good recollection of their college program and therefore have the ability to provide valid responses to survey questions relating to the college program.

Accordingly it was decided to select marketing graduates for the years 1990, 1991, and 1992 as the population of graduates for the study.

The College Registrar's Department provided names and addresses of selected graduates in the three marketing programs offered by the College. These programs were the two-year Marketing Diploma Program, the three-year Business Administration Program, and the one-year post-graduate Marketing Management Program.

If all of Humber's graduates in marketing were employed in program-related jobs at the time of the study fieldwork, theoretically the total population in the study would have been as shown in Table 3.1.

Table 3.1

Population of Humber Marketing Graduates

1990

Two-year Diploma Program - Fall Graduates	9	
Two-year Diploma Program - Winter Graduates	44	
Three-year Business Administration Diploma	30	
One-year Post-Graduate Marketing Management Certificate	<u>10</u>	93

1991

Two-year Diploma Program - Fall Graduates	14	
Two-year Diploma Program - Winter Graduates	45	
Three-year Business Administration Diploma	29	
One-year Post-Graduate Marketing Management Certificate	<u>13</u>	101

1992

Two-year Diploma Program - Fall Graduates	24	
Two-year Diploma Program - Winter Graduates	22	
Three-year Business Administration Diploma	31	
One-year Post-Graduate Marketing Management Certificate	<u>18</u>	95

Total		289
-------	--	-----

Employers of Marketing Graduates

The study called for determining employers' perceptions of the skills needed by community college graduates for effective performance in their current job. In order to obtain data on perceptions of employers, it was decided that the views of senior management rather than junior management should be sought. As a judgement, Human Resources Managers were identified as a group who could be expected to have had both the perspective of senior management and a professional interest in participating in

this study. For these reasons Human Resources Managers of firms employing 1990-1992 Humber graduates in marketing were selected as the population of employers in this study.

Supervisors of Marketing Graduates

The study called for obtaining data on employers' perceptions of the degree to which recent college graduates demonstrated possession of the knowledge and skills which employers identified as needed by graduates. It was decided that the graduates' immediate supervisors would have been the best group to make this assessment. Immediate supervisors of 1990-1992 Humber marketing graduates were therefore chosen as the third population in the study.

Samples

College Marketing Graduates

Regarding Marketing graduates, the intent was to develop as large a sample as possible from the total population. For this purpose, a list of names, addresses and phone numbers of all 289 marketing graduates was prepared from data supplied by the College Registrar. Because some of the graduates were likely to have moved residence since graduation, it was decided to undertake a telephone survey to verify mailing addresses of all graduates in the population.

The telephone survey revealed that in the time interval since graduation, there was substantial decay in the

validity of College records of graduates' addresses and phone numbers. For example, in the case of the 41 graduates in the Marketing Management Program, the telephone survey showed that College records were accurate in only 36% of cases. Additional effort was devoted to tracking down the missing members of this group, using techniques such as accessing other sets of College records, telephoning graduates' colleagues, telephoning graduates' parents, and enlisting the assistance of Bell Canada. These techniques resulted in tracking down two-thirds of the missing graduates, raising the level of valid addresses in this group from 36% to 78%. The same track-down techniques were applied in all other groups of graduates in an effort to improve the prospective response rate in the survey of marketing graduates.

At the conclusion of the telephone survey, results showed that despite repeated efforts no telephone contact could be made with 105 of the total 289 graduates and in most of those cases the College records of residence address were no longer valid. The sample of graduates used in the study was therefore the population of 289 less 105 who could not be reached, for a net of 184 graduates.

Human Resources Managers

Regarding the sample of Human Resources Managers of firms employing marketing graduates, the source of information on graduates' employment situations has

traditionally been the graduates. For the past several years the College has been in the practice of maintaining records of names of employers of all Humber graduates, generated by mail surveys addressed to graduates. However, when College records of graduates' employment data were referenced, it was found that these records were no longer valid. The average unemployment rate in Ontario, at 11.4%² in April 1993, was no doubt a contributing factor. At this point in the process, it became apparent that College records did not constitute a practical basis for developing the sample of Human Resources Managers for the study.

As an alternative approach to generating the sample of Human Resources Managers, it was decided to re-survey by telephone those graduates who had already been contacted for purposes of verifying mailing addresses and to endeavor to ascertain their employment situation directly. The interview methodology chosen for the telephone re-survey was to ask for graduates' attitudes and opinions on four dimensions of the marketing program, and at the conclusion of the telephone interview graduates were asked an open-ended question regarding their employment situation.

Interview guidelines, Appendix A, were prepared for the telephone re-survey in order to ensure a consistent approach to obtaining data from respondents. The key

²*Report on Business*, *Globe & Mail*, Toronto, Ontario, February 8, 1993

interview questions used in the telephone re-survey were as shown in Table 3.2.

Table 3.2

Interview Questions - Telephone Re-Survey

1. "What did you think of the program you took here at the College" (probe)
2. "Would you take the program again, if you had it to do all over again?" (probe)
3. "Were the faculty helpful to you? (probe)
4. "Did you like the College?" (probe)
5. "Are you one of the lucky ones with a job?" (probe)

The telephone re-survey produced information on graduates' employment situation which has been arrayed in Table 3.3.

Table 3.3

Employment Situation - Marketing Graduates

Unable to contact	105
Refused survey	4
Unemployed	23
Continuing education	15
Employed, but employer not divulged	35
Employed in non-business activity	7
Employed in business, non-marketing	15
Self-employed in marketing	6
Employed in marketing; employer stated	<u>79</u>
Total	289

For those 79 graduates who had indicated the name of their employer, reference was subsequently made to Bell's phone directory to determine the employer's address and phone number. Phone calls were then made to the 79 firms to determine the names of their Human Resources Manager. However during this process it was found that some of the employers identified by graduates were untraceable and others had gone out of business. At the conclusion of this telephone survey, a total of 52 Human Resources Managers had been identified; their names appear in Appendix B.

Supervisors of Marketing Graduates

The sample of immediate supervisors of graduates was 52, by virtue of the method chosen to access the supervisor, i.e., the intent was to ask the 52 Human Resources Managers to enlist the cooperation of the graduate's immediate supervisor in participating in the survey.

Research Instruments

Skills List

Drawing on the data in the literature review, a selection of sixty skills was identified as the basis for obtaining perceptions of the three populations as to the relative importance of each skill for effective on-the-job performance by the graduate. The literature suggested that there was a commonality of thinking as to the importance of

"soft" skills, as opposed to standard academic and technical skills. Literature on key competencies and employability skills for individuals employed in marketing jobs were reviewed in a series of searches conducted through the Center for Career and Technical Education, Michigan State University. These searches revealed an industry practice of arraying marketing skills data in three groupings: human relations, conceptual and technical.

Based on data taken from all sources reviewed in the literature, the skills arrayed in Table 2.13, page 51, Chapter II, represented a judgement of the most frequently mentioned and important skills needed in today's marketing workplace in Ontario. Those skills have been incorporated into the survey worksheets.

The structure of the research instruments directed to the three populations had elements in common. The purpose of the study was to obtain perceptions of employers of recent college marketing graduates, and of the graduates, as to the relative importance of the sixty skills selected for study. As a method of eliciting data on the relative importance, the following four-point scale of relative importance was built into the each of the three survey instruments:

4	3	2	1
Critical	Very Important	Somewhat Important	Not at all Important

Instrument - College Marketing Graduates

Appendix C comprises the covering letter and mail survey instrument addressed to the graduate group. The intent of this instrument was to obtain recent marketing graduates' perceptions on, firstly, the relative importance of each of the sixty selected skills to their effective job performance and secondly, the degree to which they learned each skill as part of their college program.

As a method of obtaining data on graduates' perceptions of the degree to which they learned each of the sixty skills in their college program, the following four-point scale was built into this survey instrument:

4	3	2	1
Learned Thoroughly	Learned Considerably	Learned Somewhat	Learned Not at all

It was recognized that there were opportunities for graduates to learn some of the "soft" skills through participating in activities outside of the college academic program while enrolled in the college. In order to capture data on these learning experiences, two additional response categories were added to the survey instrument addressed to graduates.

One category called upon the respondent to identify those skills learned at college but outside of the academic program and to specify the nature of the applicable learning experience. The learning experiences anticipated in this

category were activities in student government, student residence and athletics.

The second category was designed to elicit data on skills learned outside of college during the period the graduate was enrolled in college. Learning experiences anticipated in this category were activities in community services, charitable organizations and part-time employment.

Instrument - Human Resources Managers

Appendix D comprises the covering letter and mail survey instrument designed to obtain information from Human Resources Managers of firms employing recent marketing graduates. The intent of this instrument was to obtain a senior management perception of the relative importance of each of the sixty selected skills which were suggested as needed by recent college marketing graduates in the workplace.

Instrument - Supervisors of Graduates

Appendix E comprises the covering letter and mail survey instrument designed to obtain perceptions of graduates' immediate supervisors as to firstly, the relative importance of each of sixty selected skills for effective job performance by recent marketing graduates and secondly, the degree to which the graduate under their

supervision had demonstrated proficiency in each of the sixty skills.

As a method of eliciting data on supervisors' perceptions of graduates proficiency in the selected skills, the following four-point scale of perceived proficiency was built into this survey instrument:

4	3	2	1
Highly Proficient	Proficient	Somewhat Proficient	Not at all Proficient

Tabulation

Of the 52 mailings to Human Resources Managers, ten responses (19%) were received. Response data on these questionnaires were hand-tabulated.

No responses were received from immediate supervisors of graduates.

The combined telephone survey and mail survey of recent Humber College graduates produced 81 responses, which represented a 44% response rate from those 184 graduates contacted in the telephone survey and a response rate of 28% of the total 289 marketing graduates from Humber College for the period 1990 through 1992.

Response data on graduates' perceptions of relative importance of the sixty skills and of the degree to which these were learned in the college marketing program were

tabulated in "SumQuest³" survey research computer software.

The research instrument called for graduate's responses regarding their learning of skills in college experiences other than the marketing program and in experiences outside of college. Responses to these questions were tabulated using Lotus spreadsheet software.

Summary

The study purpose was to determine if the content and delivery of existing Ontario college marketing programs were consistent with the needs and expectations of employers of marketing graduates, so as to enable college marketing graduates to secure employment and make an effective contribution in the workplace.

The populations for this study were marketing graduates in the years 1990 through 1992, the graduates' immediate supervisors on the job, and the Human Resources Managers of the graduates' employing firms.

Survey questionnaires were designed to obtain the perceptions of Human Resources Managers, marketing graduates, and graduates' immediate supervisors as to the relative importance of selected skills for the effective performance of the marketing graduate in the workplace. The selected skills totalled sixty; drawn from skills listings appearing in the literature and drawn equally from three

³"SumQuest", Survey Research Software, North Tonawanda, N.Y., version 4.0, 1990

groupings: human relations skills, conceptual skills and technical skills.

Findings from this study are reported in Chapter IV. Conclusions, implications, and recommendations are discussed in Chapter V.

CHAPTER IV

FINDINGS

Introduction

For marketing graduates of Humber College, the job placement rate in program-related employment has dropped over the past four years from 80% to 52%¹ as of December 1993. A major factor in this decline appears to have been the recent severe economic situation in Ontario, however the question arose as to whether workplace-relevance of college marketing curriculum was also a factor contributing to this decline.

The purpose of this study was to determine if the existing marketing program content and delivery, as typically offered in Ontario community colleges, were consistent with the needs and expectations of employers so as to enable college marketing graduates to secure employment and make an effective contribution in the workplace.

In approaching the purpose of the study, the following research questions were established to gather data for analysis:

¹*Ms Judy Harvey, Manager Placement Department, Humber College, March 15, 1994*

Research Question 1

What are the skills needed by community college graduates for effective performance in the marketing function in today's business environment, as identified by employers?

Research Question 2

What is the relationship between existing college marketing program content and the skills needed for effective performance in today's business environment, as identified by employers in Research Question 1?

Research Question 3

What are the skills perceived to be needed by community college marketing graduates for effective performance in their current jobs, as identified by recent graduates?

Research Question 4

What are the differences between the responses of employers and those of graduates to Research Questions 1 and 3 above?

Research Question 5

To what degree do immediate supervisors perceive that community college marketing graduates demonstrate having the skills identified in Research Question 1, above?

Research Question 6

What are the perceptions of recent community college marketing graduates as to the degree to which they learned the skills they identified in Research Question 3, in

- (a) courses in their college marketing program,
- (b) other college learning experiences, or
- (c) learning experiences outside of college prior to graduation?

Research Question 7

What are the implications of the responses of employers, supervisors, and of recent graduates for college policy regarding curriculum updating in college courses and programs in marketing?

Skills List Utilized in the Study

In Chapter II, the literature review, reference was made to the emerging demand in the workplace for new "soft" skills. Beginning in the late 1980's, educational authorities in the United States and Canada have been researching the kinds of skills which employers have identified as critical or very important for individuals to possess in order to obtain employment and to progress within the employers' organizations. These authorities have published lists of desirable skills bearing titles such as "Workplace Basics: The Skills Employers Want"; "Skills - The Hottest and Most Transferable", and "Employability Skills Profile". The literature indicated that when seeking

recruits, employers have been calling for proficiency in these new "soft" skills in addition to the standard academic skills².

Literature reviewed at the Center for Career and Technical Education, Michigan State University, contained many references to skills listings pertaining specifically to marketing jobs. Most of these marketing skills listings have been published during the period 1991-1993 and therefore can be presumed to reflect current industry practice regarding skills content in marketing jobs. All authors of these marketing skills listings have arrayed job skills under the same three groupings: human relations skills, conceptual skills, and technical skills. The "soft" skills appearing in the literature authored by educational authorities were very similar to those skills appearing in the human relations group in the literature on marketing jobs reviewed at the Center for Career and Technical Education, M.S.U.

In this study, the objective was to take a holistic approach to the acquisition of research data on the relative importance of selected skills in today's marketing workplace. Therefore in selecting the skills for inclusion in the research instruments of this study, it was decided to adopt the three-grouping skills format found in recent

²*What New Skills?*, *Workplace Basics: The Skills Employers Want*, AACJC Journal, February/March 1989, page 29

literature on skills required for effective performance of marketing jobs in the Canadian and U.S. workplace.

Based on data taken from all sources reviewed, the skills arrayed in Table 4.1, were chosen as the basis for the design of research instruments in this study.

Table 4.1
Selection of Skills for Study

<u>Human Relations</u>	<u>Conceptual</u>	<u>Technical</u>
Communications: oral & written	Set goals & objectives	Marketing basics
Demonstrate initiative	Career Development	Distribution
Respect confidentiality	Risk management	Financing
Courtesy & respect for others	Product/service planning	Business mathematics
Honesty & integrity	Time management	Purchasing
Interpersonal skills	Understand entrepreneurship	Computer applications
Negotiation	Identify priorities	Business organization
Interest & enthusiasm	Learning to learn	Marketing strategy
Self-control	Visioning	Business law
Ethics	Interpret firm's mission	International trade
Empathy for others	Evaluate competition	Operations
Interviewing skills	Planning new business	Pricing
Values and lifestyle	Generating business ideas	Promotion
Positive work attitudes	Decision-making	Marketing research
Handling pressure & tension	Problem-solving	Market segmentation
Listening	Allocate resources	Public relations
Teamwork	Identify research need	Develop action plans
Persuasion	Evaluate own business unit	Business systems
Concern for customers' needs	Continuing education	Government regulation
Responsible behavior	Manpower planning	Business geography

In the survey instruments, skills from the three groupings were mixed so that no group clustering would have been apparent to respondents. As a method of obtaining respondent's perceptions of the relative importance of each skill, the following four-point scale was built into each of the three survey instruments:

4	3	2	1
Critical	Very important	Somewhat important	Not at all important

Similarly, the following four-point scale was built into the survey instrument addressed to marketing graduates to obtain data on the degree to which they perceived they had learned each of the sixty skills while at College:

4	3	2	1
Thoroughly	Considerably	Somewhat	Not at all

Appendices C, D and E contain the survey instruments which show the arrays of the four-point scales used in the study.

Findings: Research Questions

Research Question 1

Research Question 1 sought to determine what are the skills needed by community college graduates for effective performance in their current marketing jobs, as identified by employers.

This research question called upon the firms' Human Resources Managers to identify the relative importance of sixty selected skills as needed by graduates for their effective performance on the job. Survey worksheets were

mailed to the 52 firms identified by graduates as their employers; responses were received from ten firms (19%).

In order to produce a meaningful array of response data from Human Resources Managers, the method chosen for display was to rank order the sum of responses under "critical" and "very important", as shown in Table 4.2. In this manner, the top nine skills in Table 4.2 were considered "critical" or "very important" by 100% of respondents; the next eleven were considered "critical" or "very important" by 90% of respondents; etc. Within those two groupings, skills were arrayed in descending order of relative importance based on the percentage of respondents who rated each skill as "Critical".

Table 4.2

Employers' Responses: Importance of 60 Skills (N: 10)

	Percent Respondents			
	4	3	2	1
	<u>Critical</u>	<u>Very Important</u>	<u>Somewhat Important</u>	<u>Not at all Important</u>
Positive work attitudes	50	50	0	0
Teamwork	50	50	0	0
Decision-making	50	50	0	0
Listening	40	60	0	0
Honesty & integrity	40	60	0	0
Demonstrate initiative	40	60	0	0
Handling pressure & tension	30	70	0	0
Time management	30	70	0	0
Problem-solving	30	70	0	0
Communications	60	30	10	0
Concern for Customers' needs	60	30	10	0
Interpersonal skills	50	40	10	0
Courtesy & respect for others	30	60	10	0
Set goals & objectives	30	60	10	0
Interest & enthusiasm	30	60	10	0
Identify priorities	20	70	10	0
Responsible behavior	10	80	10	0

Table 4.2 Cont'd

Develop action plans	10	80	10	0
Self-control	0	90	10	0
Generate business ideas	0	90	10	0
Respect confidentiality	20	60	20	0
Ethics	20	60	20	0
Marketing basics	20	60	20	0
Marketing promotion	0	80	20	0
Computer applications	20	50	20	10
Learning to learn	20	50	30	0
Interpret firm's mission	20	50	30	0
Empathy for others	10	60	20	10
Evaluate competition	10	60	30	0
Allocate resources	20	40	40	0
Negotiation	10	50	40	0
Product/service planning	10	50	40	0
Marketing strategy	10	50	40	0
Market segmentation	0	60	40	0
Pricing	0	60	40	0
Values & lifestyle	0	60	40	0
Identify research need	0	60	40	0
Public relations	20	30	50	0
Persuasion	20	30	50	0
Evaluate own business unit	20	30	40	0
Marketing research	10	40	50	0
Business systems	10	40	50	0
Career development	0	50	50	0
Business organization	0	50	50	0
Risk management	0	50	40	10
Understanding entrepreneurship	10	30	50	10
Continuing education	0	40	60	0
Visioning	0	40	60	0
Government regulation	0	40	60	0
Marketing financing	0	40	50	10
Marketing operations	0	40	60	0
Purchasing	0	40	40	20
Planning new business	0	30	60	10
Marketing distribution	0	30	40	30
Interviewing skills	0	20	60	20
Business mathematics	0	10	90	0
Business geography	0	10	80	10
Manpower planning	0	10	80	10
International trade	0	0	60	40
Business law	0	0	70	30

The 60 skills appearing in the survey worksheets were drawn equally from three groupings: human relations skills, conceptual skills and technical skills. In Table 4.3,

responses from Human Resources Managers have been arrayed under each of these three skills groupings.

Table 4.3

Employers' Responses: Importance of Skills Groupings (N: 10)

	Percent Respondents			
	4	3	2	1
	Critical	Very Important	Somewhat Important	Not at all Important
<u>Human Relations Skills</u>				
Positive work attitudes	50	50	0	0
Teamwork	50	50	0	0
Listening	40	60	0	0
Honesty & integrity	40	60	0	0
Demonstrate initiative	40	60	0	0
Handling pressure & tension	30	70	0	0
Communications	60	30	10	0
Concern for Customers' needs	60	30	10	0
Interpersonal skills	50	40	10	0
Courtesy & respect for others	30	60	10	0
Interest & enthusiasm	30	60	10	0
Responsible behavior	10	80	10	0
Self-control	0	90	10	0
Respect confidentiality	20	60	20	0
Ethics	20	60	20	0
Empathy for others	10	60	20	10
Negotiation	10	50	40	0
Values & lifestyle	0	60	40	0
Persuasion	20	30	50	0
Interviewing skills	0	20	60	20
Means	28.5	54	16	1
<u>Conceptual Skills</u>				
Decision-making	50	50	0	0
Time management	30	70	0	0
Problem-solving	30	70	0	0
Set goals & objectives	30	60	10	0
Identify priorities	20	70	10	0
Generate business ideas	0	90	10	0
Learning to learn	20	50	30	0
Interpret firm's mission	20	50	30	0
Evaluate competition	10	60	30	0
Allocate resources	20	40	40	0
Product/service planning	10	50	40	0
Identify research need	0	60	40	0
Evaluate own business unit	20	30	40	0
Career development	0	50	50	0
Risk management	0	50	40	10
Understanding entrepreneurship	10	30	50	10
Continuing education	0	40	60	0
Visioning	0	40	60	0
Planning new business	0	30	60	10

Table 4.3 Cont'd

Manpower planning	0	10	80	10
Means	13.5	50	34	2
<u>Technical Skills</u>				
Develop action plans	10	80	10	0
Marketing basics	20	60	20	0
Marketing promotion	0	80	20	0
Computer applications	20	50	20	10
Marketing strategy	10	50	40	0
Market segmentation	0	60	40	0
Pricing	0	60	40	0
Public relations	20	30	50	0
Marketing research	10	40	50	0
Business systems	10	40	50	0
Business organization	0	50	50	0
Government regulation	0	40	60	0
Marketing financing	0	40	50	10
Marketing operations	0	40	60	0
Purchasing	0	40	40	20
Marketing distribution	0	30	40	30
Business mathematics	0	10	90	0
Business geography	0	10	80	10
International trade	0	0	60	40
Business law	0	0	70	30
Means	5	40.5	47	7.5

To illustrate the relative emphasis placed by Human Resources Managers on each of the three skills groupings, response values for "critical" and for "very important" skills were averaged and arrayed in Table 4.4 for comparison:

Table 4.4

Employers' Emphasis in Skills Groupings (N: 10)

Mean Values: Critical + Very Important Skills

Human Relations Skills	82.5%
Conceptual Skills	63.5%
Technical Skills	45.5%

Regarding the statistical accuracy of the findings related to Research Question 1, because of the small number of respondents (ten) the findings should be considered as directional rather than definitive.

Research Question 2

Research Question 2 sought to determine the relationship between existing college marketing program content and the skills needed for effective performance in today's business environment as identified by employers in Research Question 1.

In addressing Research Question 2, the findings on perceptions of Human Resources Managers were taken as indications of skills needed for effective performance in the workplace. These data were then compared with data on (a) the subjects and (b) the content of courses in typical college marketing programs.

(a) Subjects - Typical Marketing Courses

Two typical marketing programs at Humber College were selected for this analysis: the two-year Marketing Diploma Program and the one-year Post-Graduate Marketing Management Program. The approach was to review published course outlines applicable to these two programs with the intent of classifying their component courses into one of the three skills groupings in the study: human relations skills, conceptual skills and technical marketing skills.

Most of the courses in typical college marketing programs are *prima facie* technical marketing courses. Some courses, however, are not readily classifiable on the basis of their titles and the logic for their assigned classification is therefore discussed below.

The two-year college marketing program includes a course entitled Communications 200, which "...focuses on the writing process and the development of grammar, punctuation and spelling...". This course was therefore classified as involving technical skills.

College policy has called for the inclusion of two general education courses in all two-year programs. These courses were electives drawn from three categories: arts & literature; social science & humanities; and science and technology³, e.g., "Acid Rain"; "Portrait of the Arts"; and "Multiculturalism: The Mix of Cultural Values". Policy also called for the inclusion of a Humanities course in all two-year programs; the Humanities course "...focuses on some of the fundamental questions individuals ask of themselves as they proceed through life: Why are we here?⁴" By intent, these courses were not designed to engender learning in the three skills groupings which are the subject of this study.

³1994-1995 Calendar, Humber College, page 72

⁴Humanities course outline, page 1, Humber College, 1993/94

The foregoing outlined the basis for classifying marketing course subjects according to the emphasis in skills grouping applicable to each course. The classification is shown in Table 4.5.

Table 4.5

Course Subjects in Typical Marketing Programs

<u>Skill Grouping</u>		<u>Skill Grouping</u>	
<u>(a) Two-year Marketing Diploma Program</u>			
Business mathematics	Technical	Professional Selling	Technical
Information systems concepts	Technical	Organizational Management	Technical
Advertising	Technical	Principles of Management	Technical
Micro-economics	Technical	Retailing	Technical
Marketing administration	Technical	Communications 200	Technical
Marketing 1	Technical	Communications 300	Human Relations
Personal computing	Technical	Human Resources	Human Relations
Accounting	Technical	Humanities (culture)	Not applicable
Marketing 2	Technical	General education 1	Not applicable
Marketing Research	Technical	General education 2	Not applicable
<u>(b) One-Year Post-graduate Marketing Management Program ⁴</u>			
Fundamentals of Marketing	Technical	Personal Computing 2	Technical
International Trade	Technical	Advertising	Technical
Professional Selling	Technical	Marketing Management	Technical
Marketing Research	Technical	Seminar 1	H.R./Conceptual
Marketing Distribution	Technical	Seminar 2	H.R./Conceptual
Personal Computing 1	Technical	Marketing Operations	H.R./Conceptual

Considering firstly the two-year Marketing Diploma Program, 15 courses (75%) involved learning predominantly in technical marketing skills; two courses (10%) involved predominantly human relations skills (Human Resources Management and Communications 300); and three courses (15%)

⁵Information Sheet, Humber Program and Career Facts, 1992, Marketing Management, page 2

were by intention not related to any one of the three skills groupings in the study.

Of the twelve courses comprising the one-year Marketing Management Program, nine courses (75%) involved predominantly technical skills, and three courses (25%) (Marketing Operations and the two Seminar courses⁶) were directed towards developing a mix of conceptual and human relations skills. To summarize the data in Table 4.5, the break-down of program courses by skills grouping is shown in Table 4.6. Data on employers' emphasis of desired skills, taken from Table 4.4, is shown for comparison.

Table 4.6

Marketing Courses by Skills Grouping

<u>Skills Grouping</u>	<u>Two-Year Diploma Program</u>	<u>One-Year Post-Grad Program</u>	<u>Human Resources Managers Critical & V. Important</u>
Human Relations	10.0%	12.5%	82.5%
Conceptual	-	12.5%	63.5%
Technical	75.0%	75.0%	45.5%
Not Applicable	15.0%		

(b) Content - Typical Marketing Courses

The previous section arrayed data on course subjects in typical college marketing programs relative to response data from Human Resources Managers with regard to Research

⁶Course objectives and course outlines were designed by the study author, Humber College, 1990

Question 2. This section deals with data on marketing course content relative to response data from Human Resources Managers.

In developing data on course content, it was decided to examine the bases of evaluation in technical marketing courses on the premise that course evaluation is by definition designed to assess the kinds of knowledge, skills and attitudes learned as a direct result of the delivery of marketing course content.

Technical marketing course outlines published by Humber College were examined to determine the bases of evaluation for purposes of arriving at student grades. These course outlines typically contain a section entitled "Evaluation", in which the student is advised of the bases upon which his/her performance will be graded. The following extract from the 1991/2 course outline for Marketing I is shown in Table 4.7 as an example:

Table 4.7

Evaluation - Marketing I Course

Evaluation

Grading will be based on tests, class activities and assignments, and the completed major business assignment by due date, according to the following schedule:

<u>Grade Component</u>	<u>Value</u>
Tests	60%
Class activities	10%
Major business assignment	<u>30%</u>
	100%

Data on evaluation have been extracted from eight marketing courses and arrayed in Table 4.8 to show the structure of evaluation in typical college courses in technical marketing subjects.

Table 4.8

Bases of Evaluation - Marketing Courses

Marketing Course	Basis of Evaluation-----					
	<u>Text tests</u>	<u>In-class work</u>	<u>Library project</u>	<u>Marketing plan</u>	<u>Major project</u>	<u>Total</u>
Marketing 1 ('92)	60%	10%			30%	100%
Marketing 2 ('92)	40%	10%		25%	25%	100%
Advertising ('94)	75%				25%	100%
Marketing research ('94)	50%	25%			25%	100%
Professional selling ('91)	40%	45%			15%	100%
Retailing ('94)	40%	20%	15%		25%	100%
Mktg. Fundamentals ('93)	70%	10%			20%	100%
Mktg. Management ('94)	62%			38%		100%
(average of text tests	54.4%)					

The tests used for evaluating student performance in college marketing courses are typically true/false and multiple-choice tests, utilizing computerized test banks which have been furnished by marketing text book publishers. After students have "bubbled in" answers to test questions, the tests are graded by computer. Table 4.9 displays the range of true/false; multiple-choice tests⁷ which are typical of those used at Humber College for grading tests in marketing subjects.

⁷Menu of computerized test banks, marketing computers, Marketing staff computer room, Humber College, March 1994

Table 4.9

Computerized Test Banks - Marketing Courses

Canadian Advertising in Action, 2nd edition, by Keith Tuckwell, Easytest Version 3.10, 1991

Marketing, by Armstrong, McDougall & Kotler, 2nd edition, Prentice Hall Test bank, 1992

Business, first Canadian edition, by Griffin, Ebert & Stark; Easytest, by Davis, Ory & Stark, Prentice Hall, 1993

Fundamentals of Marketing, by Stanton, 6th edition, version 2.1, 1989, 1990, & 1993, McGraw-Hill, Inc.

Marketing Research, by McDaniel, 2nd edition; Westest, by West Publishing Co, Version 2.11, 1990-1993

Canadian Business, by Appelbaum, Beckman, Boone & Kurtz, Holt Rinehart & Winston of Canada Ltd., Study disk software, 1990

Sales Management, by Futrell, 3rd edition, ExaMaster, version 1.2, Holt, Rinehart & Winston, 1989

Professional Selling, by Oberhaus, ExaMaster version 1.2, 1989

Canadian Retailing, by Richard D. Irwin, Computest 3, Version 2.1, 1990

The data in this section indicates that the emphasis in college marketing course content, as deduced from course evaluation, has been on knowledge of technical content, rather than in proportion to the relative emphasis sought by Human Resources Managers, as displayed in Table 4.4, page 79.

Research Question 3

Research Question 3 sought to determine the kinds of skills needed by community college marketing graduates for

their effective performance in today's business environment, as identified by recent college marketing graduates.

In an effort to array response data meaningfully, the method chosen for displaying the data was to sum the percentage responses under the "critical" and "very important" scales of the four-point scale used in the instrument and to rank the sums in descending order, in the same manner as responses from Human Resources Managers. The rank order thus produced is arrayed in Table 4.10, grouped in deciles in order to facilitate analysis.

Table 4.10

Graduates' Responses: Importance of 60 Skills (N: 81)

	4	3	2	1	
	Critical	Very Important	Somewhat Important	Not at all Important	No Response
Communications	72.8	24.7	1.2	0.0	1.2
Interpersonal skills	44.4	50.6	2.5	1.2	1.2
Positive work attitudes	56.8	35.8	6.2	0.0	1.2
Listening	64.2	27.2	6.6	1.2	1.2
Concern for Customers' needs	63.0	27.2	7.4	1.2	1.2
Handling pressure & tension	56.8	33.3	7.4	0.0	2.5
Courtesy & respect for others	42.0	46.9	8.6	0.0	2.5
Decision-making	46.9	42.0	4.9	2.5	3.7
Identify priorities	46.9	40.7	8.6	1.2	2.5
Time management	51.9	34.6	9.9	2.5	1.2
Honesty & integrity	43.2	43.2	11.1	1.2	1.2
Problem-solving	42.0	43.2	11.1	1.2	2.5
Teamwork	51.9	32.1	9.9	3.7	2.5
Responsible behavior	37.0	45.7	12.3	1.2	3.7
Self-control	27.2	54.3	16.0	0.0	2.5
Interest & enthusiasm	29.6	50.6	14.8	2.5	2.5
Set goals & objectives	39.5	40.7	18.5	1.2	0.0
Business organization	23.5	53.1	18.5	3.7	1.2
Learning to learn	35.8	39.5	16.0	6.2	2.5
Evaluate competition	30.9	43.2	18.5	3.7	3.7
Computer applications	39.5	34.6	21.0	2.5	2.5
Product/service planning	27.2	45.7	19.8	4.9	2.5

Table 4.10 Cont'd

Public relations	25.9	46.9	21.0	3.7	2.5
Continuing education	32.1	40.7	17.3	7.4	2.5
Respect confidentiality	25.9	46.9	22.2	3.7	1.3
Generate business ideas	21.0	51.9	19.8	4.9	2.5
Demonstrate initiative	17.3	51.9	18.5	4.9	7.4
Career development	17.3	50.6	19.8	7.4	4.9
Negotiation	29.6	38.3	23.5	4.9	3.7
Ethics	24.7	42.0	24.7	3.7	4.9
Marketing promotion	28.4	38.3	25.9	4.9	2.5
Marketing strategy	30.9	35.8	25.9	6.2	1.2
Allocate resources	17.3	48.1	22.2	9.9	2.5
Develop action plans	17.3	48.1	23.5	7.4	3.7
Persuasion	19.8	44.4	27.2	6.2	2.5
Marketing financing	11.1	50.6	25.9	8.6	3.7
Marketing operations	16.0	44.4	28.4	4.9	6.2
Marketing basics	19.8	38.3	35.8	3.7	2.5
Interpret firm's mission	23.5	34.6	33.3	7.4	1.2
Interviewing skills	25.9	32.1	23.5	13.6	4.9
Business mathematics	14.8	40.7	35.8	6.2	2.5
Evaluate own business unit	7.4	46.9	23.5	17.3	4.9
Pricing	19.8	32.1	29.6	13.6	4.9
Market segmentation	18.5	32.1	37.0	9.9	2.5
Marketing research	16.0	34.6	34.6	12.3	2.5
Visioning	17.3	33.3	35.8	4.9	8.6
Values & lifestyle	9.9	39.5	34.6	12.3	3.7
Empathy for others	12.3	37.0	43.2	4.9	2.5
Government regulation	12.3	35.8	29.6	18.5	3.7
Marketing distribution	7.4	38.3	38.3	11.1	4.9
Risk management	7.4	38.3	37.0	12.3	4.9
Manpower planning	6.2	39.5	24.7	23.5	6.2
Business geography	8.6	37.0	29.6	19.8	4.9
Planning new business	16.0	28.4	32.1	18.5	4.9
Identify research need	7.4	35.8	42.0	12.3	2.5
Business systems	9.9	32.1	35.8	16.0	6.2
Purchasing	9.9	28.4	42.0	16.0	3.7
Understanding entrepreneurship	7.4	29.6	42.0	18.5	2.5
International trade	8.6	22.2	37.0	30.9	1.2
Business law	3.7	25.9	43.2	23.5	3.7

Table 4.11 displays graduates' responses organized under the three skills groupings, human relations skills, conceptual skills and technical skills.

Table 4.11

Graduates' Responses: Importance of Skills Groupings (N: 81)

	4	3	2	1	
	Critical	Very Important	Somewhat Important	Not at all Important	No Response
<u>Human Relations Skills</u>					
Communications	72.8	24.7	1.2	0.0	1.2
Interpersonal skills	44.4	50.6	2.5	1.2	1.2
Positive work attitudes	56.8	35.8	6.2	0.0	1.2
Listening	64.2	27.2	6.6	1.2	1.2
Concern for Customers' needs	63.0	27.2	7.4	1.2	1.2
Handling pressure & tension	56.8	33.3	7.4	0.0	2.5
Courtesy & respect for others	42.0	46.9	8.6	0.0	2.5
Honesty & integrity	43.2	43.2	11.1	1.2	1.2
Teamwork	51.9	32.1	9.9	3.7	2.5
Responsible behavior	37.0	45.7	12.3	1.2	3.7
Self-control	27.2	54.3	16.0	0.0	2.5
Interest & enthusiasm	29.6	50.6	14.8	2.5	2.5
Respect confidentiality	25.9	46.9	22.2	3.7	1.3
Demonstrate initiative	17.3	51.9	18.5	4.9	7.4
Negotiation	29.6	38.3	23.5	4.9	3.7
Ethics	24.7	42.0	24.7	3.7	4.9
Persuasion	19.8	44.4	27.2	6.2	2.5
Interviewing skills	25.9	32.1	23.5	13.6	4.9
Values & lifestyle	9.9	39.5	34.6	12.3	3.7
Empathy for others	12.3	37.0	43.2	4.9	2.5

Mean value of the sum of responses for "Critical" & "Very Important" is 78.1 (+/- 5.6)

Conceptual Skills

Decision-making	46.9	42.0	4.9	2.5	3.7
Identify priorities	46.9	40.7	8.6	1.2	2.5
Time management	51.9	34.6	9.9	2.5	1.2
Problem-solving	42.0	43.2	11.1	1.2	2.5
Set goals & objectives	39.5	40.7	18.5	1.2	0.0
Learning to learn	35.8	39.5	16.0	6.2	2.5
Evaluate competition	30.9	43.2	18.5	3.7	3.7
Product/service planning	27.2	45.7	19.8	4.9	2.5
Continuing education	32.1	40.7	17.3	7.4	2.5
Generate business ideas	21.0	51.9	19.8	4.9	2.5
Career development	17.3	50.6	19.8	7.4	4.9
Allocate resources	17.3	48.1	22.2	9.9	2.5
Interpret firm's mission	23.5	34.6	33.3	7.4	1.2
Evaluate own business unit	7.4	46.9	23.5	17.3	4.9
Visioning	17.3	33.3	35.8	4.9	8.6
Risk management	7.4	38.3	37.0	12.3	4.9
Manpower planning	6.2	39.5	24.7	23.5	6.2
Planning new business	16.0	28.4	32.1	18.5	4.9
Identify research need	7.4	35.8	42.0	12.3	2.5
Understanding entrepreneurship	7.4	29.6	42.0	18.5	2.5

Mean value of the sum of responses for "Critical" & "Very Important" is 65.5 (+/- 6.2)

Table 4.11'Cont'd

<u>Technical Skills</u>					
Business organization	23.5	53.1	18.5	3.7	1.2
Computer applications	39.5	34.6	21.0	2.5	2.5
Public relations	25.9	46.9	21.0	3.7	2.5
Marketing promotion	28.4	38.3	25.9	4.9	2.5
Marketing strategy	30.9	35.8	25.9	6.2	1.2
Develop action plans	17.3	48.1	23.5	7.4	3.7
Marketing financing	11.1	50.6	25.9	8.6	3.75
Marketing operations	16.0	44.4	28.4	4.9	6.2
Marketing basics	19.8	38.3	35.8	3.7	2.5
Business mathematics	14.8	40.7	35.8	6.2	2.5
Pricing	19.8	32.1	29.6	13.6	4.9
Market segmentation	18.5	32.1	37.0	9.9	2.5
Marketing research	16.0	34.6	34.6	12.3	2.5
Government regulation	12.3	35.8	29.6	18.5	3.7
Marketing distribution	7.4	38.3	38.3	11.1	4.9
Business geography	8.6	37.0	29.6	19.8	4.9
Business systems	9.9	32.1	35.8	16.0	6.22
Purchasing	9.9	28.4	42.0	16.0	3.7
International trade	8.6	22.2	37.0	30.9	1.2
Business law	3.7	25.9	43.2	23.5	3.7

Mean value of the sum of responses for "Critical" & "Very Important" is 55.0 (+/- 4.8)

In Table 4.11, the figures in brackets adjoining the mean values for the sum of "Critical" and "Very Important" represent the statistical accuracy of the mean values.

In considering the question of statistical significance of response data in the mail survey of graduates, the intent of the study was not to discuss absolute values pertaining to each skill in the listing of sixty skills. Instead, the intent was to determine if the balance of skills was in conformance with the needs of the workplace. Referring again to the literature, in "Workplace Basics: The Skills Employers Want" the authors discussed only 13 job-related skills which they claimed were required in addition to (undefined) standard academic skills. In contrast, this study sought to obtain a perspective of

relative importance of skills across three skills groupings: human relations skills, conceptual skills, and technical skills, as a basis for curriculum design. This approach was considered appropriate because the learning of human relations skills, for example, calls for different kinds of course content, delivery and evaluation than the learning of technical skills.

Details on the statistical accuracy data pertaining to Table 4.11 appear in Appendix F.

Research Question 4

Research Question 4 called for the determination of the differences between the responses of employers and those of graduates as to the kinds of skills they perceive to be needed by marketing graduates for their effective performance in today's business environment.

The method of examination for this research question was to focus on responses which appeared in the "critical" and "very important" categories of the four-point scale used in the instruments.

In Table 4.12, Differences in Responses: Employers vs Graduates, the data on employers responses has been organized in eleven groupings of descending order of importance, which corresponded to the 90th decile of employer responses, the 80th decile, etc. For purposes of comparison, the equivalent percentage responses from

graduates have been arrayed for each of these skills identified by employers.

Table 4.12

Response Differences: Employers (N: 10) vs Graduates (N:81)

	<u>Skill Group</u>	<u>% Employers Critical & V.Imp't</u>	<u>% Graduates Critical & V. Imp't</u>	<u>Difference</u>
Positive work attitudes	HR	100	92.6	
Teamwork	HR	100	84.0	
Decision-making	C	100	88.9	
Listening	HR	100	91.4	
Honesty & integrity	HR	100	86.4	
Demonstrate initiative	HR	100	69.2	
Handling pressure & tension	HR	100	90.1	
Time management	C	100	86.5	
Problem solving	C	100	85.2	
Mean		100	86.3	13.7
Communications	HR	90	97.5	
Concern for customer's needs	HR	90	90.2	
Interpersonal skills	HR	90	95.0	
Courtesy & respect for others	HR	90	88.9	
Set goals & objectives	C	90	80.2	
Interest & enthusiasm	HR	90	80.2	
Identify priorities	C	90	87.6	
Responsible behavior	HR	90	82.7	
Develop action plans	T	90	65.4	
Self-control	HR	90	81.5	
Generate business ideas	C	90	72.9	
Mean		90	83.9	6.1
Respect confidentiality	HR	80	72.8	
Ethics	HR	80	66.7	
Marketing basics	T	80	58.1	
Marketing promotion	T	80	66.7	
Mean		80	66.1	13.9
Computer applications	T	70	74.1	
Learning to learn	C	70	75.3	
Interpret firm's mission	C	70	58.1	
Empathy for others	HR	70	49.3	
Evaluate competition	C	70	74.1	
Mean		70	66.2	3.8
Allocate resources	C	60	65.4	
Negotiation	HR	60	67.9	
Product/service planning	C	60	72.9	
Marketing strategy	T	60	66.7	
Market segmentation	T	60	50.6	

Table 4.12 Cont'd

Pricing	T	60	51.9	
Values & lifestyle	HR	60	49.4	
Identify research need	C	60	43.2	
Mean		60	58.5	1.5
Public relations	T	50	72.8	
Persuasion	HR	50	64.2	
Evaluate own business unit	C	50	44.3	
Marketing research	T	50	50.6	
Business systems	T	50	42.0	
Career development	C	50	67.9	
Business organization	T	50	76.6	
Risk management	C	50	45.7	
Mean		50	57.9	(7.9)
Understanding entrepreneurship	C	40	37.0	
Continuing education	C	40	72.8	
Visioning	C	40	50.6	
Government regulation	T	40	48.1	
Marketing financing	T	40	61.7	
Marketing operations	T	40	60.4	
Purchasing	T	40	38.3	
Mean		40	52.7	(12.7)
Planning new business	C	30	44.4	
Marketing distribution	T	30	45.7	
Mean		30	45.1	(15.1)
Interviewing skills	HR	20	58.0	(38.0)
Business mathematics	T	10	55.5	
Business geography	T	10	55.6	
Manpower planning	C	10	45.7	
Mean		10	52.2	(42.2)
International trade	T	0	30.8	
Business law	T	0	29.6	
Mean		0	30.2	(30.2)

The composition of the 20 highest-ranking skills appearing in Table 4.12 is 65% human relations skills, 30% conceptual skills and 5% technical skills. The mean difference between employers' perceptions and graduates' perceptions of importance is 9 percentage points; i.e., graduates' perceptions of importance of these skills are an

average of 9 percentage points lower than those of employers.

The 20 lowest-ranking skills in Table 4.12, in terms of importance as perceived by employers, comprise 60% technical skills, 35% conceptual skills and 5% human relations skills. The mean difference between employers' perceptions and graduates' perceptions of importance of these skills is (22.9) percentage points; i.e., graduates' perceptions of the importance of these skills are an average of 22.9 percentage points higher than those of employers.

Research Question 5

Research Question 5 called for the determination of the degree to which immediate supervisors of college marketing graduates perceived that graduates demonstrated having the skills identified as important by Human Resources Managers, in Research Question 1.

No response data were received from immediate supervisors of college marketing graduates.

Research Question 6

Research Question 6 sought to determine the perceptions of recent community college marketing graduates as to the degree to which they learned the skills they identified as important for their effective performance in the workplace in:

- (a) courses in their college marketing program,
- (b) other college learning experiences, or
- (c) learning experiences outside of college prior to graduation?

(a) Courses in Marketing Program

The survey instrument addressed to graduates called for them to identify the degree, on a four-point scale, to which they perceived having learned each of the sixty skills as part of their college marketing program. The rank-order chosen for displaying their responses to this question was the same as that chosen for displaying graduates' perceptions of skills importance, Table 4.10, with responses grouped in deciles of rank-order perceived importance by the graduates.

Table 4.13

Skills Learned by Graduates in Program (N: 81)

	<u>% Graduates</u> <u>Critical V. Imp't</u>	<u>Learned</u> <u>Thoroughly</u>	<u>Learned</u> <u>Considerably</u>	<u>Learned</u> <u>Somewhat</u>	<u>Learned</u> <u>Not At All</u>	<u>No Response</u>
Communications	97.5	7.4	50.6	37.0	1.2	3.7
Interpersonal skills	95.0	9.9	46.9	30.9	4.9	7.4
Positive work attitudes	92.6	18.5	30.9	29.6	16.0	4.9
Listening	91.4	16.0	45.7	28.4	6.2	3.7
Concern for Customers	90.2	30.9	33.3	24.7	6.2	4.9
Handling pressure	90.1	13.6	23.5	34.6	23.5	4.9
Courtesy & respect	88.9	11.1	27.2	34.6	14.8	12.3
Decision-making	88.9	22.2	43.2	30.9	0.0	3.7
Identify priorities	87.6	12.3	39.5	32.1	13.6	2.5
Time management	86.5	21.0	48.1	25.9	1.2	3.7
Honesty & integrity	86.4	9.9	21.0	42.0	18.5	8.6
Problem-solving	85.2	22.2	46.9	21.0	6.2	3.7
Teamwork	84.0	33.3	40.7	17.3	2.5	6.2
Responsible behavior	82.7	13.6	32.1	38.3	6.2	9.9
Self-control	81.5	8.6	22.2	35.8	23.5	9.9
Interest & enthusiasm	80.2	11.1	25.9	39.5	19.8	3.7
Set goals & objectives	80.2	19.8	48.1	24.7	3.7	3.7
Business organization	76.6	14.8	54.3	25.9	3.7	1.2
Learning to learn	75.3	14.8	28.4	35.8	17.3	3.7
Evaluate competition	74.1	9.9	39.5	44.4	2.5	3.7
Computer applications	74.1	27.2	40.7	28.4	1.2	2.5
Product/service plans	72.9	14.8	53.1	22.2	3.7	6.2
Public relations	72.8	14.8	16.0	48.1	17.3	3.7
Continuing education	72.8	7.4	34.6	30.9	16.0	11.1
Respect confidentiality	72.8	4.9	16.1	43.2	32.1	3.7
Generate business ideas	72.8	12.3	34.6	44.4	7.4	1.2
Demonstrate initiative	69.2	8.6	34.6	46.9	3.7	6.2
Career development	67.9	4.9	24.7	50.6	12.3	7.4
Negotiation	67.9	1.2	21.0	46.9	24.7	6.2
Ethics	66.7	6.2	25.9	37.0	23.5	7.4
Marketing promotion	66.7	39.5	40.7	16.0	1.2	2.5
Marketing strategy	66.7	35.8	49.4	12.3	2.5	0.0
Allocate resources	65.4	7.4	34.6	42.0	9.9	6.2
Develop action plans	65.4	11.1	48.1	35.8	1.2	3.7
Persuasion	64.2	8.6	21.0	48.1	17.3	4.9
Marketing financing	61.7	3.7	44.4	40.7	8.6	2.5
Marketing operations	60.4	21.0	49.4	21.0	2.5	6.2
Marketing basics	58.1	53.1	33.3	12.3	0.0	1.2
Interpret mission	58.1	14.8	45.7	25.9	11.1	2.5
Interviewing skills	58.0	7.4	25.9	32.1	30.9	3.7
Business mathematics	55.5	18.5	43.2	32.1	4.9	1.2
Evaluate business unit	54.3	2.5	23.5	51.9	16.0	6.2
Pricing	51.9	14.8	34.6	33.3	9.9	7.4
Market segmentation	50.6	28.4	40.7	25.9	2.5	2.5
Marketing research	50.6	27.2	44.4	17.3	4.9	6.2
Visioning	50.6	2.5	17.3	49.4	22.2	8.6

Table 4.13 Cont'd

Values & lifestyle	49.4	17.3	16.0	33.3	28.4	4.9
Empathy for others	49.2	1.2	17.3	43.2	28.4	9.9
Government regulation	48.1	3.7	16.0	45.7	27.2	7.4
Marketing distribution	45.7	18.5	49.4	25.9	0.0	6.2
Risk management	45.7	2.5	16.0	53.1	24.7	3.7
Manpower planning	45.7	1.2	18.5	50.6	22.2	7.4
Business geography	45.6	1.2	16.0	49.4	25.9	7.4
Planning new business	44.4	13.6	32.1	39.5	9.9	4.9
Identify research need	43.2	17.3	35.8	32.1	11.1	3.7
Business systems	42.0	3.7	24.7	46.9	18.5	6.2
Purchasing	38.3	7.4	17.3	54.3	19.8	1.2
Entrepreneurship	37.0	14.8	25.9	30.9	23.5	4.9
International trade	30.8	6.2	16.0	35.8	40.7	1.2
Business law	29.6	8.6	30.9	44.4	12.3	3.7

For purposes of analysis, data on graduate's perceptions of relative importance of skills has been arrayed together with data on their perceptions of the degree to which they learned the various skills as part of their college program. In order to produce a meaningful data display, graduates' responses for "critical" and "very important" skills were summed, and the sums of their responses for "learned thoroughly" and "learned considerably" were arrayed against the respective skills. Data on employers' perceptions of skill importance were also included in this array. These data, organized under the three skills groupings of the study, appear in Table 4.14.

Table 4.14

Skill Importance vs Learned at College (N: 81)

	Skills Critical & Very Important			% Graduates Learned Thoroughly & Considerably	Graduates: Diff. Importance vs Learned
	<u>% Employers</u>	<u>% Graduates</u>	<u>Diff.</u>		
<u>Human Relations Skills</u>					
Positive work attitudes	100	92.6	7.4	49.4	43.2
Teamwork	100	84.0	16.0	74.0	10.0
Listening	100	91.4	8.6	61.7	29.7
Honesty & integrity	100	86.4	13.6	30.9	55.5
Demonstrate initiative	100	69.2	30.8	43.2	26.0
Handling pressure & tension	100	90.1	9.9	37.1	53.0
Communications	90	97.5	(7.5)	58.0	39.5
Concern for Customers	90	90.2	(0.2)	64.2	26.0
Interpersonal skills	90	95.0	(5.0)	56.8	38.2
Courtesy & respect for others	90	88.9	1.1	38.3	50.6
Interest & enthusiasm	90	80.2	9.8	37.0	43.2
Responsible behavior	90	82.7	7.3	45.7	37.0
Self-control	90	81.5	8.5	30.8	50.7
Respect confidentiality	80	72.8	7.2	21.0	51.8
Ethics	80	66.7	13.3	32.1	34.6
Empathy for others	70	49.3	20.7	18.5	30.8
Negotiation	60	67.9	(7.9)	22.2	45.7
Values & lifestyle	60	49.4	10.6	33.3	16.0
Persuasion	50	64.2	(14.2)	29.6	34.6
Interviewing skills	20	58.0	(38.0)	33.3	24.7
Means	82.5	78.1	4.4	40.8	37.3
<u>Conceptual Skills</u>					
Decision-making	100	88.9	11.1	65.4	23.5
Time management	100	86.5	13.5	69.1	17.4
Problem-solving	100	85.2	14.8	69.1	16.1
Set goals & objectives	90	80.2	9.8	67.9	12.3
Identify priorities	90	87.6	2.4	51.8	35.8
Generate business ideas	90	72.8	17.2	46.9	25.9
Learning to learn	70	75.3	(5.3)	43.2	32.1
Interpret firm's mission	70	58.1	11.9	60.5	(2.4)
Evaluate competition	70	74.1	(4.1)	49.4	24.7
Allocate resources	60	65.4	(5.4)	42.0	23.4
Product/service planning	60	72.9	(12.9)	67.9	5.0
Identify research need	60	43.2	16.8	53.1	(9.9)
Evaluate own business unit	50	54.3	(4.3)	26.0	28.3
Career development	50	67.9	(17.9)	29.6	38.3
Risk management	50	45.7	4.3	18.5	27.2
Understanding entrepreneurship	40	37.0	3.0	40.7	(3.7)
Continuing education	40	72.8	(32.8)	42.0	30.8
Visioning	40	50.6	(10.6)	19.8	30.8
Planning new business	30	44.4	(14.4)	45.7	(1.3)
Manpower planning	10	45.7	(35.7)	19.7	26.0
Means	63.5	65.5	(2.0)	48.0	17.5

Table 4.14 Cont'd

<u>Technical Skills</u>					
Develop action plans	90	65.4	24.6	59.2	6.2
Marketing basics	80	58.1	21.9	86.4	(28.3)
Marketing promotion	80	66.7	13.3	80.2	(13.5)
Computer applications	70	74.1	(4.1)	67.9	6.2
Marketing strategy	60	66.7	(6.7)	85.2	(18.5)
Market segmentation	60	50.6	9.4	69.1	(18.5)
Pricing	60	51.9	8.1	49.4	2.5
Public relations	50	72.8	(22.8)	30.8	42.0
Marketing research	50	50.6	(0.6)	72.6	(22.0)
Business systems	50	42.0	8.0	28.4	13.6
Business organization	50	76.6	(26.6)	69.1	7.5
Government regulation	40	48.1	(8.1)	19.7	28.4
Marketing financing	40	61.7	(21.7)	48.1	13.6
Marketing operations	40	60.4	(20.4)	70.4	(10.0)
Purchasing	40	38.3	1.7	24.7	13.6
Marketing distribution	30	45.7	(15.7)	67.9	(22.2)
Business mathematics	10	55.5	(45.5)	61.7	(6.2)
Business geography	10	45.6	(35.6)	17.2	28.4
International trade	0	30.8	(30.8)	22.2	8.6
Business law	0	29.6	(29.6)	39.5	(9.9)
Means	46.0	55.0	(9.0)	53.5	1.5

(b) Skills Learned In Other College Experience

Research Question 6 also sought to determine the perceptions of recent community college marketing graduates as to the degree to which they learned the skills they identified as important through other college experiences apart from program courses.

Only five graduates responded to this question. Their responses, which include multiple mention, appear in Table 4.15.

Table 4.15

Skills Learned in Other College Experience (N: 5)

<u>Skill</u>	<u>College Experience Cited</u>
Demonstrate initiative	Student Association Council
Respect confidentiality	College residence; Student Association Council
Courtesy & respect for others	College residence; Student Association Council
Interpersonal skills	Student Association Council; Sports (2)
Interest & enthusiasm	Student Association Council; Sports (2)
Self-control	Sports
Empathy for others	College residence; Sports
Evaluating competition	Sports
Interviewing skills	Student Association Council
Decision-making	Student Association Council; Sports
Listening	College residence; Student Association Council; Sports
Teamwork	Student Association Council; Sports
Persuasion	Student Association Council; Sports
Responsible behavior	Student Association Council

(c) Skills Learned In Experience Outside of College

Research Question 6 also sought to determine the perceptions of recent community college marketing graduates as to the degree to which they learned the skills they identified as important through other learning experiences outside of the college prior to their graduation.

Graduates' responses to this question numbered 61, or 75% of the total graduate respondents. Responses tended to cluster in four discrete categories: work experience; education at other colleges and at university; family and friends; and general life experience. Responses to this survey question were highest in the category of work experience and for this reason the data were arrayed in descending order of mention in this category, in Table 4.16.

Table 4.16

Skills Learned - Experience Outside College (N: 61)

	<u>% Work</u>	<u>% Other Education</u>	<u>%Family Friends</u>	<u>% Life Experience</u>	<u>% No Response</u>
Computer applications	18.5	3.7	0.0	1.2	76.5
Communications:	16.0	8.6	0.0	1.2	71.6
Demonstrate initiative	16.0	0.0	0.0	1.2	82.7
Respect confidentiality	13.6	0.0	1.2	4.9	80.2
Honesty & integrity	12.3	1.2	4.9	7.4	74.1
Identify priorities	12.3	1.2	1.2	0.0	85.2
Handling pressure/tension	1.1	3.7	0.0	1.2	84.0
Interpersonal skills	11.1	2.5	1.2	2.5	82.7
Negotiation	11.1	0.0	0.0	1.2	87.7
Problem solving	11.1	3.7	0.0	2.5	82.7
Purchasing	11.1	1.2	0.0	0.0	87.7
Decision making	9.9	2.5	0.0	1.2	86.4
Empathy for others	9.9	0.0	2.5	3.7	84.0
Manpower planning	9.9	0.0	0.0	1.2	88.9
Pricing	9.9	0.0	0.0	0.0	90.1
Concern for customer	8.6	1.2	0.0	2.5	87.7
Courtesy and respect	8.6	0.0	7.4	9.9	74.1
Ethics	8.6	3.7	1.2	4.9	81.5
Evaluate competition	8.6	0.0	0.0	0.0	91.4
Government regulation	8.6	2.5	0.0	1.2	87.7
Interviewing skills	8.6	1.2	0.0	1.2	88.9
Public relations	8.6	1.2	0.0	0.0	90.1
Teamwork	8.6	1.2	0.0	4.9	85.2
Marketing distribution	7.4	0.0	0.0	0.0	92.6
Marketing finance	7.4	1.2	0.0	1.2	90.1
Marketing promotion	7.4	1.2	0.0	0.0	91.4
Responsible behavior	7.4	0.0	1.2	3.7	87.7
Risk management	7.4	1.2	0.0	1.2	90.1

Table 4.16 Cont'd

Self-control	7.5	2.5	1.2	4.9	84.0
Time management	7.4	3.7	0.0	2.5	86.4
Entrepreneurship	7.4	1.2	1.2	1.2	88.9
Business law	6.2	2.5	0.0	3.7	87.7
Business organization	6.2	0.0	0.0	0.0	93.8
Develop action plans	6.2	2.5	0.0	0.0	91.4
Evaluate own business unit	6.2	2.5	0.0	0.0	91.4
Market segmentation	6.2	0.0	0.0	0.0	93.8
Marketing basics	6.2	2.5	0.0	0.0	91.4
Marketing operations	6.2	0.0	0.0	1.2	92.6
Marketing strategy	6.2	0.0	0.0	0.0	93.8
Persuasion	6.2	3.7	0.0	0.0	90.1
Positive work attitudes	6.2	2.5	0.0	7.4	84.0
Product/service planning	6.2	1.2	0.0	0.0	92.6
Values & lifestyle	6.2	0.0	6.2	1.2	86.4
Business geography	4.9	2.5	0.0	1.2	91.4
Business mathematics	4.9	4.9	0.0	1.2	88.9
Career development	4.9	2.5	0.0	1.2	91.4
Continuing education	4.9	3.7	0.0	1.2	90.1
Generating business ideas	4.9	2.5	0.0	2.5	90.1
Generating enthusiasm	4.9	1.2	1.2	3.7	88.9
International trade	4.9	1.2	0.0	1.2	92.6
Interpret firm's mission	4.9	1.2	0.0	0.0	93.8
Listening	4.9	1.2	0.0	0.0	93.8
Visioning	4.9	2.5	1.2	1.2	90.1
Allocate resources	3.7	0.0	0.0	1.2	95.1
Identify research need	3.7	0.0	0.0	0.0	96.3
Learning to learn	3.7	7.4	0.0	6.2	82.7
Set goals & objectives	3.7	4.9	0.0	3.7	87.7
Establish business systems	2.5	0.0	0.0	0.0	97.5
Marketing research	2.5	2.5	0.0	1.2	93.8
Planning new business	2.5	1.2	0.0	0.0	96.3

Supplemental Findings

The research methodology, as described in page 61, Chapter III, included a telephone re-survey of graduates for the purpose of expanding the list of graduates' employers, as a basis for executing the mail survey directed to employers of marketing graduates. This telephone survey included the following four probe questions which were designed to obtain graduates' attitudes and opinions on their College sojourn:

"What did you think of the program you took here at the College?"

"Would you take the program again, if you had it to do all over again?"

"Were the faculty helpful to you?"

"Did you like the College?"

Thirty-one graduates were contacted during the telephone re-survey; their verbatim responses are shown for each of these five questions.

"What Did You Think Of The Program?"

"...Program was good....I took it to improve my language skills...material was very interesting.."

"...feel I need more work experience and university education to actually be a marketer..."

"...feel communication skills are most important, but did not learn enough at Humber College..."

"...fairly good overall...hard to compare since I haven't taken other programs..."

"...good in some areas; others need work (improvement)...I needed more hands-on experience..."

"...I feel I could carry on a conversation with a marketing professional, but would have difficulty in actually doing the marketing...I need more work on (applying) actual concepts..."

"...I liked it...was originally in Business Administration program then transferred into marketing...I didn't like accounting, however I am using it in my present job..."

"...it was okay...the overall program was good, but it was not real world information, too academic (test oriented)...not beneficial..."

"...I liked it...started in Business Administration and then I specialized in marketing..."

"...it was very good...above average...a good overall picture of business and marketing..."

"...very good program...it was general enough so you get a taste in all different areas, therefore finding the one you like best, which was accounting...I did not like the multiple choice tests, useless..."

"...I thought it was a good overview...I refer back to things and apply them at my job...I liked multiple choice tests because I faked it most times because I did not study..."

"...I liked it...after this long it is tough for me to remember...I enjoyed some of my third year courses..."

"...pretty good...I liked the ability to pick my own courses...broad range program...some courses were specific some general..."

"...I went on to University...everything at Humber helped me prepare for University...able to focus more on a business environment...practical courses..."

"...very helpful...a lot of practical work...a little hard...covered a lot of topics, very broad...I found companies were looking for specific...but broad was good..."

"...yes...was good to prepare you for work...but there was a lot of theory...do not use it at work..."

"...I liked it a lot...more practical...I learned more about business in one month than one semester at University..."

"...all right...first year was way too easy...it could have been more challenging, and prepared me for a job..."

"...It was good..." (eleven respondents)

Refused (one)

"Would You Take The Program Again?"

"...no...(program) needs more learning (course offerings) in communications..."

"...I might take something else...employers want business administration skills...experience is important to employers...I might take business administration program..."

"...perhaps at another school...I would compare programs, see if another school does anything different..."

"...I would take parts over again like promotions or human resources...not marketing or marketing research...need more hands-on projects...get kids into real companies..."

"Yes...but it needs more computer work..."

"Not at Humber"

"...it lacked accounting background...more difficult at Lakehead..."

"...I would take it over...but I would specialize in one part of business, like accounting or human resources..."

"...I don't know if I would take business administration program again...there are other fields where you could do just as well or better like dental hygiene..."

"...I would have done things differently...I would go to university..."

"...No...I need more learning in communications..."

"...Yes..." (20 respondents)

Refused (one)

"Were The Faculty Helpful To You...?"

"...the help was okay...there were approachable teachers...I had only one problem..."

"...good teachers...an advertising teacher was the only one that gave hands-on experience..."

"...some faculty was helpful and some were awful...I did not use any other facilities in the school...I would come to school and would leave after class..."

"...the Coordinator was a very nice man, helped me get exempted from a course...found all teachers very nice and knowledgeable..."

"...used career services but I had no luck...I would have liked to learn about more job search techniques..."

"...some were helpful; some were not...some teachers were knowledgeable in their field; I liked that a lot..."

"...yes...but I did not get any help in job search techniques..."

"...yes...I think more students should ask for reference letters, they help get a job...I did use the Career center but nothing there interested me..."

"...yes, some teachers helped me with my resumes..."

"... 90% seemed genuinely interested in teaching..."

"...yes they were...they offered their home numbers for extra help...we could meet them after hours..."

"...certain teachers made themselves more available to students...some teachers made themselves available to students at the students' convenience..."

"...most of the time...always got one or two that were bad...I had to make appointments for after class...they made them a little unaccessible..."

"...quite helpful...not as much one-on-one as I would have liked...I liked the classes..."

"...yes, they were...they all had real life experiences which they could relate directly to the lessons that they taught..."

"...Very helpful..." (four respondents)

"...Yes..." (ten respondents)

Refused (one)

"Did You Like The College"

"Yes...the registration system was very screwed up..."

"Yes...sports, food services, everywhere...perhaps they should make more quiet space to study..."

"Yes...good extracurricular facilities...parking was crazy..."

"Yes...parking is crazy...I did not do work on campus..."

"...not bad...I think the parking is a major problem..."

"...I never really used the facilities...library was good...cafeteria was good..."

"...College itself was good...bookstore, study rooms...I was not involved in extracurricular activities..."

"I was there only for school...there was a lot of help available...very friendly...I enjoyed the college..."

"...very much...I loved the people, there was a large variety...the library was great...great facilities..."

"Yes...I hung around the Pipe a lot...I was a cheerleader for a semester but it was dropped...I am still taking courses for Business Administration Diploma..."

"...it was okay...I had problems with registration lines and parking..."

"Yes...I had no problem with registration or parking..I did not get involved in any extracurricular activities..."

"Yes...I am now attending University taking administrative studies..."

"Yes....there was a gradual improvement...there was construction while I was there..."

"...I am disappointed that I (now) miss the library...the college lacked a party atmosphere..."

"...facilities are great for college...couldn't ask for more...library is good...parking is lousy...the school is growing but the parking is shrinking..."

"Yes....parking was a problem...not enough passes are distributed..."

"I liked the college and residence...I met a lot of great people..."

"...Yes... (12 respondents)

Refused (one)

Relating Supplemental Findings to Research Questions

The purpose of this study was to determine if the existing marketing program content and delivery, as typically offered in Ontario community colleges, were consistent with the needs and expectations of employers so as to enable college marketing graduates to secure employment and make an effective contribution in the workplace.

Responses to the first two questions asked during the telephone re-survey of 31 graduates related most directly to the purpose of the study, that is, responses to the questions: "What did you think of the program?" and "Would you take the program again...?"

Of the total responses to these two questions, 60% of responses were very positive; 21% indicated need for improvement; 8% were of no opinion; and 5% gave other responses, such as "...I should have gone to university".

Data in the 21½ responses which indicated need for program improvement have been arrayed in Table 4.17.

Table 4.17

Telephone Re-Survey - Program Improvement (N: 31)

<u>Indicated Need for Improvement</u>	<u>Number of Respondents</u>
More training in communications	2
More hands-on learning	2
More application (less theory)	3
(alternatives to) multiple choice tests	2
More preparation for employment	1
More computer training	1
Improved accounting training	1

Statistical Significance

Survey of Human Relations Managers

Because of the small number (10) of responses from Human Resources Managers, results of this survey of Human Resources Managers have been taken as directional rather than definitive. In direction, the survey results parallel the data appearing in definitive surveys such as the 1989 study by the American Association of Community and Junior Colleges entitled "Workplace Basics: The Skills Employers Want⁸", discussed in Chapter 2.

Survey of Marketing Graduates

In considering the question of statistical significance of response data in the mail survey of marketing graduates,

⁸Workplace Basics: The Skills Employers Want", AACJC Journal, February/March 1989

the intent of the study was not to discuss absolute values pertaining to each skill in the listing of sixty skills. Instead, the intent of the study was to determine if the balance of skills in the college program was in conformance with the needs of the workplace. Referring again to the literature, in "Workplace Basics: The Skills Employers Want" the authors discussed only 13 job-related skills which they claimed were required in addition to (undefined) standard academic skills. In contrast, this study sought to obtain a perspective of relative importance of skills across three skills groupings: human relations skills, conceptual skills, and technical skills, as a basis for curriculum design. This approach was considered appropriate because the learning of human relations skills, for example, calls for different kinds of course content, delivery and evaluation than the learning of technical skills.

Accordingly, statistics on graduates' perceptions of importance of skills, and of the degree to which those skills have been learned at college, have been arrayed on the basis of the three skills groupings in Table 4.14, page 98, which has been summarized in Table 4.18 for easy reference.

Table 4.18

Mean Values: Skill Importance vs Learned at College (N: 81)

	<u>Graduates' Perceptions</u>	
	<u>Critical & Very Important</u>	<u>Learned Thoroughly & Considerably</u>
<u>Human Relations Skills</u>		
Mean of responses	78.1 (+/- 5.6)	40.8 (+/- 5.7)
<u>Conceptual Skills</u>		
Mean of responses	65.5 (+/- 6.2)	48.0 (+/- 6.3)
<u>Technical Skills</u>		
Mean of responses	55.0 (+/- 4.8)	53.5 (+/- 8.6)

Details on the statistical accuracy pertaining to the above table appear in Appendix F. Based on data in Appendix F, the range of statistical accuracy applicable to each mean response value in Table 4.18 has been inserted in brackets beside the mean response value.

A comparison of the data in Table 4.18 on graduates' perceptions of skill importance with data in Table 4.6, page 83, on course content in a typical two-year college marketing program indicates that although 78.1% (+/- 5.6%) of graduates perceive human relations skills to be critical or very important to their effective performance in the workplace, only 10% of course subjects are in human relations skills. If one were to consider the lowest level of response to this parameter within the range of statistical accuracy, 78.1% less 5.6%, or 72.5% of graduates perceived skills in the human relations grouping to be critical or very important to their effective

performance on the job. It remains that the value of 72.5% is disproportional to the 10% weight of course subjects in human relations skills in the two-year marketing diploma program.

Considering the degree to which graduates perceive they learned skills in college marketing courses, the "best case" for graduates responses pertaining to learning human relations skills thoroughly or considerably would be 40.8% plus 5.7%, or 46.5%. This 46.5% response rate is significantly below the 72.5% response rate for graduates' perceptions of the importance of this skills grouping.

Similarly, 75% of the courses in the existing two-year college marketing diploma are in technical marketing subjects (Table 4.6, Page 83). In contrast, data in Table 4.18 show that only 55.0% of graduates perceive technical marketing skills to be critical or very important to their effective performance in the workplace. Considering the "best case" within the limits of statistical accuracy pertaining to graduates' responses, the mean value of graduates' responses for perceived critical or very important technical skills would have been 55.0% plus 4.8%, or 59.8%. To restate, 75% of marketing course subjects are in technical marketing skills, which contrasts with (best case) the 59.8% response rate for graduates' perceptions of the importance of technical marketing skills for effective performance in their current jobs.

These data indicate that, within the limits of statistical accuracy, there is an imbalance between the existing college marketing program content, delivery and evaluation and the kinds of skills perceived to be needed by college marketing graduates for their effective performance in the workplace.

Summary

A sample of recent college marketing graduates and their employers were surveyed to determine their perceptions of the skills needed by graduates in order to perform effectively in the workplace. A total of sixty skills were addressed in the survey process; these skills comprised 20 skills drawn from three skills groupings: human relations skills, conceptual skills and technical skills. Survey results were presented in this chapter and these results were arrayed against data on college marketing program content and evaluation.

Both marketing graduates and their employers perceived human relations skills to be higher in priority than technical marketing skills. In contrast, college marketing program content and evaluation place greater emphasis on technical skills than on human relations skills, which is disproportionate to the perceived needs of the workplace.

Marketing graduates perceived that they had learned human relations skills to a lesser degree than technical skills in their marketing program.

CHAPTER V
CONCLUSIONS, IMPLICATIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Introduction

For marketing graduates of typical Ontario community colleges, the job placement rate in program-related employment has dropped over the past four years from 80% to 52%¹. A major factor contributing to this decline appears to have been the recent severe economic situation in Ontario. However the question arose as to whether the skills which graduates possessed at the time they sought employment were also a factor contributing to the decline in job placement.

The purpose of this study was to determine if the existing marketing program content and delivery, as typically offered in Ontario community colleges, were consistent with the needs and expectations of employers.

The two information sources selected for this study were recent marketing graduates from Humber College and employers of those graduates.

¹*Ms Judy Harvey, Manager Placement Department, Humber College, March 15, 1994*

Research Questions

The following research questions were established to gather data for analysis:

1. What are the skills needed by community college graduates for effective performance in the marketing function in today's business environment, as identified by employers?
2. What is the relationship between existing college marketing program content and the skills needed for effective performance in today's business environment, as identified by employers in Research Question 1?
3. What are the skills perceived to be needed by community college marketing graduates for effective performance in their current jobs, as identified by recent graduates?
4. What are the differences between the responses of employers and those of graduates to Research Questions 1 and 3 above?
5. To what degree do immediate supervisors perceive that community college marketing graduates demonstrate having the skills identified in Research Question 1, above?

6. What are the perceptions of recent community college marketing graduates as to the degree to which they learned the skills they identified as needed in:
- (a) courses in their college marketing program,
 - (b) other college learning experiences, or
 - (c) learning experiences outside of college prior to graduation?

7. What are the implications of the responses of employers, supervisors, and of recent graduates for college policy regarding curriculum updating in college courses and programs in marketing?

Skills List Utilized in the Study

Beginning in the late 1980's, educational authorities in the United States and Canada have been researching the kinds of skills which employers have identified as critical or very important for individuals to possess in order to obtain employment and to progress within the employers' organizations. These authorities have published lists of desirable skills bearing titles such as "Workplace Basics: The Skills Employers Want"; "Skills - The Hottest and Most Transferable", and "Employability Skills Profile". The literature indicated that when seeking recruits, employers

have been calling for proficiency in these new "soft" skills in addition to the standard academic skills².

Recent literature reviewed at the Center for Career and Technical Education, Michigan State University, contained many references to skills listings pertaining specifically to marketing jobs. These marketing skills listings are generally clustered into three groupings: human relations skills, conceptual skills, and technical skills.

Based on data taken from all sources, the skills arrayed in Table 5.1 were chosen as the basis for the design of research instruments in this study.

²*What New Skills?*, *Workplace Basics: The Skills Employers Want*, AACJC Journal, February/March 1989, page 29

Table 5.1

Skills Selected For The Study

<u>Human Relations</u>	<u>Conceptual</u>	<u>Technical</u>
Communications: oral & written	Set goals & objectives	Marketing basics
Demonstrate initiative	Career Development	Distribution
Respect confidentiality	Risk management	Financing
Courtesy & respect for others	Product/service planning	Business mathematics
Honesty & integrity	Time management	Purchasing
Interpersonal skills	Understand entrepreneurship	Computer applications
Negotiation	Identify priorities	Business organization
Interest & enthusiasm	Learning to learn	Marketing strategy
Self-control	Visioning	Business law
Ethics	Interpret firm's mission	International trade
Empathy for others	Evaluate competition	Operations
Interviewing skills	Planning new business	Pricing
Values and lifestyle	Generating business ideas	Promotion
Positive work attitudes	Decision-making	Marketing research
Handling pressure & tension	Problem-solving	Market segmentation
Listening	Allocate resources	Public relations
Teamwork	Identify research need	Develop action plans
Persuasion	Evaluate own business unit	Business systems
Concern for customers' needs	Continuing education	Government regulation
Responsible behavior	Manpower planning	Business geography

Survey Instruments

In the survey instruments, skills from the three groupings were mixed so that no group clustering would have been apparent to respondents. As a method of obtaining respondent's perceptions of the relative importance of each skill, the following four-point scale was built into the survey instruments:

4	3	2	1
Critical	Very important	Somewhat important	Not at all important

Similarly, the following four-point scale was built into the survey instrument addressed to marketing graduates to obtain data on the degree to which they perceived they had learned each of the sixty skills while at College:

4	3	2	1
Thoroughly	Considerably	Somewhat	Not at all

The intent in the design of the survey instruments was to obtain data on perceived relative importance of the sixty skills as a basis for comparison to existing marketing program content, delivery and evaluation. The results of the comparison, in turn, were intended for use in identifying any needed modification to existing college marketing curricula.

Samples

The intent was to mail survey worksheets to all 289 Humber College marketing graduates from 1990 through to 1992. Attempts by telephone were made to verify the mailing addresses of all graduates, and through this process it was found that 105 of the 289 graduates could not be reached. Survey instruments were mailed to the remaining 184 graduates, of whom 81 (44%) provided responses.

As part of the process of telephoning graduates to verify their mailing addresses, information on graduates' employment situation was elicited. Based on this

information, survey instruments were mailed to 52 employers, from whom responses were received from ten (19%). No responses were received from supervisors of college marketing graduates (research question 5).

Summary of Findings

Data on research questions 1, 3, 4, and 6, (cited on page 114) relating to the importance of the sixty skills as perceived by employers and by graduates, and the degree to which graduates perceive they learned these skills in college programs, have been summarized in Table 5.2.

Table 5.2

Skill Importance vs Learned at College

	Skills			% Graduates Learned Thoro'ly & Considerably	Graduates: Diff. Importance vs Learned
	Critical & Very Important		Diff.		
	% Employers	% Graduates			
<u>Human Relations Skills</u>					
Positive work attitudes	100	92.6	7.4	49.4	43.2
Teamwork	100	84.0	16.0	74.0	10.0
Listening	100	91.4	8.6	61.7	29.7
Honesty & integrity	100	86.4	13.6	30.3	56.1
Demonstrate initiative	100	69.2	30.8	43.2	26.0
Handling pressure & tension	100	90.1	9.9	37.1	53.0
Communications	90	97.5	(7.5)	58.0	39.5
Concern for Customers	90	90.2	(0.2)	64.2	26.0
Interpersonal skills	90	95.0	(5.0)	56.8	38.2
Courtesy & respect for others	90	88.9	1.1	38.3	50.6
Interest & enthusiasm	90	80.2	9.8	37.0	43.2
Responsible behavior	90	82.7	7.3	45.7	37.0
Self-control	90	81.5	8.5	30.8	50.7
Respect confidentiality	80	72.8	7.2	21.0	51.8
Ethics	80	66.7	13.3	32.1	34.6
Empathy for others	70	49.3	20.7	18.5	30.8
Negotiation	60	67.9	(7.9)	22.2	45.7
Values & lifestyle	60	49.4	10.6	33.3	16.1
Persuasion	50	64.2	(14.2)	29.6	34.6
Interviewing skills	20	58.0	(38.0)	33.3	24.7
Means	82.5	78.1	4.4	40.8	37.3

Table 5.2 Cont'd

	Skills			% Graduates	Graduates: Diff.
	Critical & Very Important			Learned Thoroughly & Considerably	Importance vs. Learned
	% Employers	% Graduates	Diff.		
<u>Conceptual Skills</u>					
Decision-making	100	88.9	11.1	65.4	23.5
Time management	100	86.5	13.5	69.1	17.4
Problem-solving	100	85.2	14.8	69.1	16.1
Set goals & objectives	90	80.2	9.8	67.9	12.3
Identify priorities	90	87.6	2.4	51.8	35.8
Generate business ideas	90	72.8	17.2	46.9	25.9
Learning to learn	70	75.3	(5.3)	43.2	32.1
Interpret firm's mission	70	58.1	11.9	60.5	(2.4)
Evaluate competition	70	74.1	(4.1)	49.4	24.7
Allocate resources	60	65.4	(5.4)	42.0	23.4
Product/service planning	60	72.9	(12.9)	67.8	5.1
Identify research need	60	43.2	16.8	53.1	(9.9)
Evaluate own business unit	50	54.3	(4.3)	26.0	28.3
Career development	50	67.9	(17.9)	29.6	38.3
Risk management	50	45.7	4.3	18.5	27.2
Understanding entrepreneurship	40	37.0	3.0	40.7	(3.7)
Continuing education	40	72.8	(32.8)	42.0	30.8
Visioning	40	50.6	(10.6)	19.8	30.8
Planning new business	30	44.4	(14.4)	45.7	(1.3)
Manpower planning	10	45.7	(35.7)	19.7	26.0
Means	63.5	65.5	(2.0)	48.0	17.5
<u>Technical Skills</u>					
Develop action plans	90	65.4	24.6	59.2	6.2
Marketing basics	80	58.1	21.9	86.4	(28.3)
Marketing promotion	80	66.7	13.3	80.2	(13.5)
Computer applications	70	74.1	(4.1)	67.9	6.2
Marketing strategy	60	66.7	(6.7)	85.2	(18.5)
Market segmentation	60	50.6	9.4	69.1	(18.5)
Pricing	60	51.9	8.1	49.4	2.5
Public relations	50	72.8	(22.8)	30.8	42.0
Marketing research	50	50.6	(0.6)	72.6	(22.0)
Business systems	50	42.0	8.0	28.4	13.6
Business organization	50	76.6	(26.6)	69.1	7.5
Government regulation	40	48.1	(8.1)	19.7	28.4
Marketing financing	40	61.7	(21.7)	48.1	13.6
Marketing operations	40	60.4	(20.4)	70.4	(10.0)
Purchasing	40	38.3	1.7	24.7	13.6
Marketing distribution	30	45.7	(15.7)	67.9	(22.2)
Business mathematics	10	55.5	(45.5)	61.7	(6.2)
Business geography	10	45.6	(35.6)	17.2	28.4
International trade	0	30.8	(30.8)	22.2	8.6
Business law	0	29.6	(29.6)	39.5	(9.9)
Means	45.5	55.0	(9.5)	53.5	1.5

Research Question 2 called for determining the relationship between existing college marketing program content and skills needed in the workplace, as identified by employers. The basis of evaluation of student performance for grading purposes constitutes a measure of marketing program content. Table 5.3 depicts the basis of evaluation for marketing courses in a typical two-year diploma program.

Table 5.3

Bases of Evaluation - Marketing Courses

Marketing Course	----- Basis of Evaluation -----					
	<u>Text tests</u>	<u>In-class work</u>	<u>Library project</u>	<u>Marketing plan</u>	<u>Major project</u>	<u>Total</u>
Marketing 1 ('92)	60%	10%			30%	100%
Marketing 2 ('92)	40%	10%		25%	25%	100%
Advertising ('94)	75%				25%	100%
Marketing research ('94)	50%	25%			25%	100%
Professional selling ('91)	40%	45%			15%	100%
Retailing ('94)	40%	20%	15%		25%	100%
Mktg. Fundamentals ('93)	70%	10%			20%	100%
Mktg. Management ('94)	62%			38%		100%
(average of text tests	54.4%)					

Data in Table 5.3 indicate that evaluation of student performance in typical college marketing courses emphasizes technical skills.

The course subjects of typical college marketing programs provide another measure of relative emphasis on the three skills groupings in this study. Table 5.4 compares employers' perceptions of skill importance to course

subjects in typical college marketing programs, as appeared in Table 4.5, page 82.

Table 5.4

Perceived Skills Importance vs Course Subjects

<u>Skills Grouping</u>	<u>Employers' Perceptions Critical & V.Important Skills</u>	<u>Two-Year Diploma Program</u>	<u>One-Year Post-Grad Program</u>
Human Relations	82.5%	10.0%	12.5%
Conceptual	63.5%	-	12.5%
Technical	45.5%	75.0%	75.0%
Not Applicable		15.0%	

Table 4.5 indicates that the skill emphasis in typical college marketing program subjects is in inverse proportion to the skills emphasis needed in the workplace, as identified by employers.

CONCLUSIONS

- Employers and college marketing graduates agree on the priority of human relations skills, conceptual skills and technical skills, in that order, as to their importance to the graduate in obtaining employment and making an effective contribution in the workplace.
- The three groupings of skills: human relations, conceptual and technical skills, constitute an effective method of clustering skills for purposes of contrasting skills needed in the workplace with skills learning offered in college marketing curricula.
- Experiences outside of college prior to graduation contribute to learning skills which are important for effective job performance. The experiences cited tended to cluster in four categories: work;

education at other colleges and at university;
experiences with family and friends; and general
life experiences.

- The college marketing curriculum is preparing people in reverse order of priority in relation to the kinds of skills which employers and graduates perceive to be needed on the job.

IMPLICATIONS

The study results indicate a need for a revision of college marketing curricula, and in methods of course delivery and evaluation for grading purposes, in order to engender more learning of human relations skills and conceptual skills.

If college marketing curricula were revised in order to enable graduates to acquire skill sets more in proportion to workplace needs, the implications are that graduates increase their prospects of both securing employment and also successful progression in the firm once hired.

Dr. David Ponitz³, President of Sinclair College, Dayton, Ohio, has pointed out that there are perceptions in business and industry that community college programs are not delivering the kinds of learning needed in the workplace. This situation, he continued, has led to a growth in private-sector educational entrepreneurs who have been moving more quickly than colleges towards delivering educational programs that meet the changing needs of business and industry. One of the implications of this

³"Best Practices of Innovative Colleges", by Dr. David Ponitz, President of Sinclair College, Dayton, Ohio, presented at League of Innovation Session, Humber College, June 7, 1994

study is an opportunity for colleges to upgrade existing marketing curricula, delivery and evaluation to preclude loss of revenue to the kind of emerging new private-sector education which Dr. Ponitz has discussed.

It was pointed out⁴ that the Ontario Ministry of Education requires all colleges to track the success rates of their graduates in obtaining program-related employment upon graduation. In instances where graduates of a particular program experienced difficulty in obtaining employment, this tracking process has had the effect of ultimately causing the deletion of that program from college offerings.

If college marketing program content and delivery are not modified to conform more closely to the needs of employers, future government funding of some marketing programs may be at risk.

Graduates' and employers' perceptions of skill importance constitute potentially useful information as a basis for reformulating educational policy and practice.

It was also found in this study that College records of recent graduates' addresses have not been kept current. In the process of this study, it was found that 105 (36%) of the total 289 marketing graduates for the years 1990 - 1991 could not be located. The implication is that the existing system of maintaining College records of graduates may

⁴Chapter I, page 8

preclude the College from obtaining graduates' input as a basis for on-going updating of curricula.

College records of employers of graduates were also found to have had substantial error. The implication is that this aspect of College record systems may similarly preclude the College from obtaining input from graduates' employers which could contribute to the strengthening of college curricula.

The literature has made reference to the increased speed with which the business environment has been changing as a result of the impact of increasing global competition in the marketplace. For example, IBM Canada have pointed out that although the life span of a small notebook computer has now shortened to as little as three months, it used to take IBM that long to send a product proposal through their management committee reviews.⁵

The implication of data on the speed of change in the marketplace is that the market-relevance of the findings in this study may similarly be expected to have a short life. Further, the implication is that there may be a need for regularized follow-up research to track changes in the perceptions of both employers and graduates as to the skills which are critical and very important in the changing workplace.

⁵*Continuous Quality Improvement in IBM, presentation by Mr. Barry Goode, Manager Market Driven Quality, IBM Canada Ltd., July 14, 1992*

RECOMMENDATIONS

1. Marketing Program Content

Consideration should be given to altering the content of college marketing programs so that they include stand-alone courses in selected human relation and conceptual skills which have been ranked highly in perceived importance by employers of college marketing graduates.

In this regard, the new (December 1993) Queens' University Executive Business Program devotes fully one-third of program time to leadership skills, mentioning specifically the skills of teamwork, decision-making, motivation, visioning, objectives-setting, managing change, leadership, and communications.

The literature review has cited new (1992) courses in interpersonal skills, teamwork, motivation, and leadership which have recently been introduced in Ecole des Hautes Etudes, Montreal, University of Calgary, and University of Western Ontario⁶. The above information showing that Canadian universities are moving towards stand-alone courses in human relations skills suggests a precedent

⁶*"What's Next in MBA Education?", by Randall Litchfield, Canadian Business Magazine, Toronto, April 1992*

for recommending that Colleges should similarly move in that direction, or alternatively increase the component of human relations skills in existing marketing courses.

The structure of existing college marketing programs should be reviewed against the findings data on relative importance of the skills identified as needed by graduates in the workplace. In this regard, study findings indicated that employers of college graduates ranked human relations skills higher in importance than technical marketing skills, yet the existing marketing program content in human relations skill subjects was disproportionately much lower.

2. Delivery of Marketing Learning

Consideration should be given to alternative methods of the delivery of marketing learning in college programs in order to provide students more opportunity to develop human relations skills and conceptual skills.

Community Colleges should encourage the development of liaisons between college faculty and training practitioners in industry in order to broaden the Faculty's awareness of alternative methods of delivering the learning of marketing skills.

For example, Procter & Gamble⁷ undertake regular training sessions with their employees on:

⁷*Concepts in Delivery of Learning*, by Tammy Sturge, Manager Training, Procter & Gamble, May 17, 1994

- . Team skills
- . Decision-making
- . Barriers to progress
- . Action planning
- . Problem-solving
- . Creative problem-solving
- . Developing session/lesson plans
- . Workshop management

For their training sessions, Procter & Gamble have developed a learning sequence comprising (a) a brief lecture; (b) a workshop case or study; (c) instituting a de-briefing session in which team members, not the instructor, look back and note in writing their comments on team members' performance; and (d) the facilitator or trainer will make comments only after the team members have completed their own de-briefing.

This information is presented as just one alternative to the traditional lecture method of delivering learning, and illustrates the potential value of the recommendation to develop liaisons with training practitioners in industry as a method of expanding the college's compendium of learning techniques for application in the college classroom.

3. Evaluation of Learning

Community Colleges should investigate the suggestions of the Learning Consortium as to the feasibility of instituting alternative evaluation techniques in addition to the traditional tests on text book content which are now typically used for about half the total course grades obtainable by college marketing students.

The Learning Consortium⁸, University of Toronto, is a partnership of innovative school boards and universities which was formed in 1988 to initiate new programs in teacher education. The Consortium was an outgrowth of Canada's Corporate Council on Education, who authored "Employability Skills Profile: The Critical Skills Required of the Canadian Work Force", which was discussed (page 32) in the literature review.

One of the Consortium's current projects is the development of alternative methods of evaluation of students' performance for grading purposes, with emphasis on the soft skills appearing in the "Employability Skills Profile". The Learning Consortium offered the following alternatives to traditional "pencil & paper" tests:

- | | |
|--|---------------------------------|
| . Benchmarking | . Portfolios |
| . Student reflective journals | . Student self-assessment |
| . Evaluation of collaborative learning | . Interviews: teacher & student |
| . Peer assessment | |

Community colleges should undertake research to benchmark the best practices in evaluation in the State school systems of Vermont and Michigan, in order to identify opportunities for experimentation in alternative evaluation methods for college marketing courses in Ontario.

The Learning Consortium claim⁹ that their research indicates that the States of Michigan and Vermont are well

⁸*Discussions with Ms Ethne Cullen, Coordinator, The Learning Consortium, Toronto, Ontario, May 1993*

⁹*Ibid*

advanced in developing alternative methods of evaluation in K12 classes in their State school systems.

4. Additional Research

An additional survey of employers should be undertaken, with different criteria than were used in this study. The intent would be to obtain more broadly based information on employers' perceptions of the kinds of skills needed by employees in order to make an effective contribution in the workplace.

Because of the methodology used in this study for determining the sample of employers of college marketing graduates, the number of respondents in the survey was too small to provide definitive response data.

A follow-up survey with essentially the same objectives of this study should be undertaken in, say, 1997. The results of the follow-up study would track further change in the kinds of skills which employers identify as needed in the workplace. A follow-up study would also track evidence of improvement in the degree to which graduates perceive they have learned the kinds of skills which are needed for them to make effective contributions in the workplace.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

BIBLIOGRAPHY

Akers, John, Former Chairman, IBM, (1993) *Total Quality in Education*, Quality Progress, October 1993

Alcoa, (1992) *The Alcoa Eight Step Quality Improvement Process*, Aluminum Company of America, Pittsburgh, Pennsylvania

Alcoa, (1982) *Staff Performance Review System: Job Knowledge and Skills*, Aluminum Company of America, Pittsburgh, Pennsylvania

Allan, Elyse (1992), *Manager Commercial and Industrial Lighting*, G.E. Lighting, *Proceedings of Marketing Advisory Committee*, Humber College, Rexdale, Ontario

Armstrong, Robert J and Dave, R.H., (1970) *Developing and Writing Behavioral Objectives*, Tucson, Arizona

Asea Brown Boveri (1992) *Mission Statement*, ABB, Montreal, Quebec

Asgar, Dr. Jack, Practical Management Inc., (1990) *Give Me Relevance Or Give Me Nothing*, Training, July 1990, Lakewood Publications, Minneapolis, Minnesota

Bloom, B.S. and Hastings, J.T., (1971) *Handbook on Formative and Summative Evaluation of Student Learning*, McGraw-Hill, New York

Bailey, Earl L. (1989) *Getting Closer to the Customer*, Research Bulletin No. 229, The Conference Board of Canada, Ottawa, Ontario

Baker, Dr. George A, (1993) *Continuous Quality Improvement in Education*, Department of Adult & Community College Education, North Carolina State University, Raleigh, North Carolina

Bell Canada, (1990) *Business Units: Our Framework For The Future*, Bell Canada, Toronto, Ontario

Bennett, Barrie and Rolheiser-Bennett Carol and Stevahn, Laurie (1991) *Cooperative Learning: Where Heart Meets Mind*, Educational Connections, Toronto, Ontario

Bloom, Benjamin S.; Englehart, Max D.; Furst, Edward J.; Hill, Walker H. and Krathwohl, David R. (1956) *Taxonomy of Educational Objectives*, David McKay Company Inc., New York

Bossidy, Lawrence A., Vice Chairman, General Electric Company (1990) *New Ways of Working Together*, Harvard Business Review, November 1989

Brandt, Ronald S (1992) *Performance Assessment: Readings from Educational Leadership*, American Society for Counselling and Development, Alexandria, Virginia

Brown, Rexford (1989) *Testing Thoughtfulness*, Educational Leadership, Volume 46, No 7, Toronto, Ontario

Burge, Tammy, Manager Training, Procter & Gamble, *Seminar on Training - Humber College, May 17, 1994*, Rexdale, Ontario

Carnavale, Anthony P.; Gainer, Leila J.; Meltzer, Ann S. and Holland, Shari L. (1989) *Workplace Basics: The Skills Employers Want*, American Association of Community and Junior Colleges, AACJC Journal

Churchill, Gilbert A. (1988) *Basic Marketing Research*, Dryden Press, Chicago, Illinois

Clauson, James C.; Kotter, John P.; Faux, Victor A. and McArthur, Charles C. (1992) *Self-Assessment and Career Development*, Prentice-Hall, Englewood Cliffs, New Jersey

Corporate Council on Education (1992) *Employability Skills Profile - The Critical Skills Required of the Canada Workforce*, Conference Board of Canada, Ottawa, Ontario

Covey, Stephen R., (1990) *Seven Habits of Highly Effective People*, Simon & Shuster, New York

Crookes, T.J., *The Impact of Evaluation Practices on Students*, Review of Educational Research, Ontario Institute of Studies in Education, Winter 1988, Volume 58, Number 4, Toronto, Ontario

Demming, Dr. W. Edwards, (1982) *Fourteen Obligations Of Management*, Center for Advanced Engineering Study, Massachusetts Institute of Technology, Boston, MA

Dietsche, Peter (1993) *Task Force on Advanced Training*, Ontario Ministry of Colleges and Universities, Toronto, Ontario

The Economist (1991) *Survey - Management Education*, London, England, March 2, 1991

Employment and Training Administration (1977) *Dictionary of Occupational Titles, Fourth Edition*, U.S. Department of Labor, Washington, D.C.

Ernst & Young (1990) *TQM Workshop*, Toronto, Ontario

Farris, Linda D. *Skills-The Hottest and Most Transferable Ones*, Occupational Outlook, Employment and Immigration Canada, Ottawa

Erskine-Cullen, Dr. Ethne (1993) *Expanding the Range of Assessment Strategies*, Business and Education Conference, The Conference Board of Canada, Toronto, Ontario, April 27, 1993

Financial Post (1992) *Careers and the Job Market - What's In Store For '93 Grads?*, August 1993, Toronto, Ontario

Fitz-Enz, Jac (1993) *Benchmarking: How Staff Departments Can Enhance Their Value to the Customer*, Jossey Bass, San Francisco

Froiland, Paul (1993) *TQM Invades: Attempts to Introduce TQM Courses and Classroom Methods into Business Schools Have Caused a Flurry of Change --- and Resistance*, Training, July 1993, Lakewood Publications, Minneapolis, Minnesota

Fullan, Michael and Park, Paul B., (1981) *Curriculum Implementation: Resource Booklet*, Ontario Ministry of Education, Toronto, Ontario

Fullan, Michael, (1972) *Thornlea: A Case Study of an Innovative Secondary School*, Ontario Ministry of Education, Toronto

Gandz, Jeffrey, Director, Western MBA Program (1992) *Knowledge Is Not Enough*, University of Western Ontario, London, Ontario

Globe and Mail (1992) *G.M.'s Warriors On a Mission to Win*, Toronto

Goode, Barry (1992), *Manager Market Driven Quality, Continuous Quality Improvement in IBM*, IBM Canada Ltd., Toronto

Gordon, Dr. Robert A., President Humber College (1989) *Humber Mission Statement*, Humber College, Rexdale, Ontario

Gower, Carol-Anne, Director of Marketing, (1992) *Financial Controls in Marketing - Nestle*, Nestle Enterprises Limited, Don Mills, Ontario

Gregory, Gayle, (1994) *Innovations in Assessment*, Halton Board of Education, Burlington, Ontario

Harvey, Judy (1993), *Manager Placement Department*, Humber College, Rexdale, Ontario

Haynes, Arden R., Chief Executive Officer (1992) *Our Corporate Ethics*, Imperial Oil Limited, Toronto, Ontario

Hittman, Jon A. (1993) *TQM and CQI in Post-Secondary Education*, Quality Progress, October 1993, American Society for Quality Control, Milwaukee, Wisconsin

Horine, Julie E. and Rubach, Laura (1993) *Shaping America's Future: Total Quality Management in Higher Education*, Quality Progress, October 1993, American Society for Quality Control, Milwaukee, Wisconsin

Hotson, Eric (1993) *Discussions on the Centralization of Financial Services*, GE Canada, GE Corporate, Meadowvale, Ontario

Houston, Michael J (1985) *Marketing Communications - Theory and Research*, Proceedings of the AMA's 1985 Winter Marketing Educators Conference, Marketing Education Division, AMA, Phoenix, Arizona

Hoyt, Edwin Palmer (1987) *The Secret Battle of Slapton Sands*, Hale Publishing, London, England

Humber College (1992-1993) *Calendar*, Humber College, Rexdale, Ontario

Humber College School of Business (1988) *Minutes of Ministry Approval to the Proposed New Marketing Management Program*, Marketing Department, Humber College

Humber College (1993) *Proceedings of the Marketing Advisory Committee*, Humber College, Rexdale

- Heilman, Dr. Casimir, (1992) *Life Role Competencies*, Michigan State University, East Lansing, Michigan
- Imperial Oil Limited (1993) *Guide to Managing Your Learning, Core Competency Framework*, Toronto
- Johnson, David W., (1978) *Human Relations and Your Career: A Guide to Interpersonal Skills*, Prentice Hall, Toronto
- Johnson, David W., (1992) *Learning Through Controversy: Creative Conflict*, Prentice Hall, Toronto
- Johnson, David and Johnson, Frank (1991) *Joining Together: Group Theory and Group Skills*, Allyn & Bacon, Toronto & Boston
- Johnston, Catherine (1993) *Applying Total Quality Principles to Empower People in Schools*, Business and Education Conference, The Conference Board of Canada, April 27, 1993
- Kasperazicius, Aldona (1990) *Checking Out My Social Skills*, Dufferin-Peel Roman Catholic School Board, Toronto, Ontario
- Kennedy, James, Senior Accounts Manager, Bank of Montreal (1993) *Tools to Support Continuous Improvement*, Toronto, Ontario
- Kouzes, James M. and Posner, Barry Z., (1987) *The Leadership Challenge*, Jossey-Bass, San Francisco
- KPMG Peat Marwick (1991) *Aware: A career Planning Guide for Managers and Professionals*, Toronto, Ontario
- Lavin, Douglas and Choi, Audrey (1993) *North America Unveils Latest Trade Weapon: Quality Exports*, The Wall Street Journal, October 18, 1993
- Lawrence, TERNY, Coordinator - Hot Idea Program, Amp of Canada, Ltd. (1992) *Generating Ideas for Improvement in Quality*, Seminar, Humber College, Rexdale, Ontario, May 14, 1992
- Lea, Nattalia, (1991) *Business Schools Change With The Times*, Globe & Mail, Business Section, April 23, 1991, Toronto, Ontario
- Litchfield, Randall (1992) *"What's New in MBA Education?"*, Canadian Business Magazine, April 1992 issue, Toronto, Ontario

Long, Stephen (1992), *Imperial Oil Limited, Proceedings of the Marketing Advisory Committee*, Humber College, Humber College, Rexdale, Ontario

Massengale, James, General Manager, Milliken Industries of Canada (1992) *Benchmarking Best Practices*, Seminar, Humber College, Rexdale, Ontario, March 19, 1992

McCamus, David, Chairman, Xerox Corporation, (1993) *Improving Productivity in Canada*, Conference Board of Canada, Toronto, Ontario

McDaniel, Carl and Gates, Roger (1991) *Contemporary Marketing Research*, West Publishing Company, St. Paul, Minnesota

Marketing Management Information Sheet, (1992) Humber Program and Career Facts, Humber College, Rexdale, Ontario

Magrath, A.J., (1988) *Financial Literacy for Marketers*, Sales & Marketing Management Magazine, Toronto, Ontario

McIntyre, Catherine (1992) *Critical Skills For Job Applicants to Possess*, Human Resources Department, Procter & Gamble, Toronto, Ontario

(1993) *Teamwork Skills Benchmark 9: Team Communicating*, Portfolio Assessment Guide for Employability Skills, Michigan Department of Education, Lansing, Michigan

Michigan State University (1989) *Mission Statement*, East Lansing, Michigan

Ministry of Colleges and Universities (1992) *Full-Time Enrolment at Humber College by Age*, Corporate Planning and Services, Ontario Ministry of Education, Toronto, Ontario

Murray, J.L., (1990) *Course Objectives and Course Outlines*, Post-Graduate Marketing Management Program, Humber College, Rexdale, Ontario

Murray, Bruce W.L., Director Magnesium Sales, (1993) *Hydro-Magnesium Monthly Activity Reports*, Norsk Hydro, Montreal, Quebec

National Institute of Standards and Quality (1994) *The Malcolm Baldrige National Quality Award, 1994 Award Criteria*, U.S. Department of Commerce, Maryland

Ontario Ministry of Colleges and Universities (1992) *CAAT2 Survey*, Ontario Ministry of Education, Toronto, Ontario

Parry, Terence and Gregory, Gayle (1993) *Development Approach to Assessment*, Halton Board of Education, Burlington, Ontario

Perlin, John C., President, (1990) *Strategic Planning*, Duke of Edinburgh's Award in Canada, Toronto, Ontario

Peters, Tom (1991), *Meeting The Challenges For 1990's And Beyond*, Globe & Mail, May 13, 1991

Porter, Michael E. (1991) *Canada at the Crossroads - The Reality of a New Competitive Environment*, The Business Council on National Issues and the Government of Canada, Harvard Business School, Cambridge, Mass.

Queens University: *Executive Development Program*, December 1993

Robinson, James D. (Amex) and Akers, John F. (IBM) and Artzt, Edwin L. (Procter & Gamble) and Poling, Harold A. (Ford) and Galvin, Robert W. (Motorola) and Allaire, Paul A. (Xerox) (1991) *An Open Letter: TQM on the Campus*, Harvard Business Review, November/December 1991

Rockwell International (1993) *The Memory Jogger: A Pocket Guide of Tools for Continuous Improvement*, Automotive Operations, Rockwell International Corporation, Troy, Michigan

Royal Bank Letter (1993) *Terms of Employment*, Royal Bank of Canada, Toronto, Ontario

Schein, Lawrence (1990) *The Road to Total Quality: Views of Industry Experts*, Research Bulletin No. 239, The Conference Board of Canada, Ottawa, Ontario

Seager, A.G. (1993), Vice President Marketing (retired), Shell Canada Limited, Calgary, Alberta

Senge, Peter M. (1992) *The Fifth Discipline: The Art and Practice of the Learning Organization*, Doubleday, New York

Senge, Peter M. (1992) *Building Learning Organizations*, Journal of Quality and Participation, March 1992

Shaskin, Marshall (1984) *Participative Management is an Ethical Imperative*, Organizational Dynamics, American Management Association

Shell Canada Ltd. (1992) *Guidelines For Quality In Tough Times*, Shell Pecten, Calgary, Alberta, October 1992

Shell Canada Ltd., (1991) *Empowering Shell People*, Shell Pecten, Calgary, Alberta

Sierk, James E., Senior Vice President - Quality and Productivity, Allied Signal (1994) *Bold Strategies for Uncertain Times*, MBA Business Conference, University of Toronto, Toronto, Ontario

Smith-Windsor, Arthur, Senior Vice-President and General Manager (1993) *Quality as a Competitive Weapon*, London & Midland Insurance, London, Ontario

Spence, A. Michael (1992), *Stanford Today*, Dean, Graduate School of Business, Stanford University, Stanford, California

Statistics Canada (1992) *Market Research Handbook Catalogue 81-229*. Government of Canada, Ottawa

Stern, Michael (1993) *Old-Style Leadership Is No Longer Good Enough*, Euram Consultants Group Ltd, Toronto

Stiggins, Richard J. (1993) *Types of Assessment in Education*, Northwest Regional Educational Laboratory, April 1993

"SumQuest", Survey Research Software, North Tonawanda, N.Y. version 4.0, 1990

University of Western Ontario and Research Council of Canada (1992) *The Bases of Competence: Making the Match between University Graduates and Corporate Employers - Phase II*. Ontario Ministry of Education, Toronto, Ontario

Walker, Robert (1990) *Peer Evaluation of Another Group's Presentation*, Durham Board of Education, Oshawa, Ontario

Walsh, Francis J. Junior (1989) *Current Practices in Measuring Quality*, Research Bulletin No. 234, Conference Board of Canada, Ottawa, Ontario

Walton, Mary (1990) *Deming Management at Work*, Putnams & Sons, New York

Walton, Richard E. (1985) *From Control to Commitment in the Workplace*, Harvard Business Review, March/April 1985

Welch, John F. (1989) *Soft Values for a Hard Decade: A View on Winning in the '90's*, General Electric, Harvard Business Review, November 1989

Welch, John F. (1989) *Speed, Simplicity, Self-confidence: Keys to leading in the '90's*, General Electric, Harvard Business Review

APPENDICES

APPENDIX A

INTERVIEW GUIDELINES: SURVEY OF GRADUATES

Date _____

Name of Respondent _____ Graduate Group _____

I. Objectives

To re-survey graduates to determine (a) that they were working in marketing, as opposed to some other business function or non-business activity, and (b) to ascertain the name of their employer, as a basis for developing the sample of Human Resources Managers.

II. Telephone Interview Guidelines

"Hello, my name is....., from Humber College, and I believe one of our research team members has talked with you a while back about our survey of graduates to get their views on the critical workplace skills the need on the job..."

"We would like to take a few more minutes of your time, if we may, to get your overall viewpoint on the program:

Question 1. "What did you think of the program you took here at the College?" (probe...)

Question 2. "Would you take the program again, if you had it to do all over again,?" (probe...)

Question 3. "Were the faculty helpful to you?" (probe...)

Question 4. "Did you like the College? (probe...)"

Question 5. "Are you one of the lucky ones with a job in marketing?" (probe...)"

Question 6. "We believe we sent you our one-page questionnaire on this project...however it may be that it went astray in the mails...would you like us to send you another copy?"

"Thanks very much for helping us with our project..."

APPENDIX B**SAMPLE - HUMAN RESOURCES MANAGERS**Grad GroupEmployer

BizAd '92

Mr. Sheldon Isenberg, Store Manager
 Rosedale Wall Covering
 8241 Keele Street Unit 9-11
 Concord, Ontario L4K 1Z5

Tel: 660-0808

Ms. Ester Zdolec,
 Human Resources Manager
 Ontario Lottery Corporation
 33 Bloor Street East Suite 200
 Toronto, Ontario M4W 3T7

Tel: 961-6262

Mr. J. P. Suys, Human Resources Manager
 Rothmans, Benson & Hedges Inc.
 1500 Don Mills Road
 North York, Ontario M3B 2L1

Tel: 449-5525

Ms. Jan Kloosterhuis
 Human Resources Manager
 Arthur Anderson & Co.
 P.O. Box 29
 Toronto Dominion Center
 Toronto, Ontario M5K 1B9

Tel: 863-1540

Ms. Sandra Lennon
 Regional Human Resources Manager
 Wendy Restaurants of Canada Inc.
 6715 Airport Road Suite 301
 Mississauga, Ontario L4V 1X2

Tel: 677-7023

Grad GroupEmployer

Ms. Jill Smith
 Manager Human Resources
 C.P. Express & Transport
 2255 Sheppard Avenue East Suite E-335
 Willowdale, Ontario M2J 4Y1

Tel: 497-7900 (no answer)

Ms. Barb McDowell
 Human Resources Manager
 Tip Top Tailors
 100 The East Mall Unit 9
 Etobicoke, Ontario M8Z 5X2

Tel: 259-4621

BizAd '91

Ms. Mary Anne Drummond
 Human Resources Manager
 McDonalds Restaurants of Canada Ltd
 McDonald Place
 Toronto, Ontario M3C 3L4

Tel: 443-1000

Ms Debbie Macklem (no title)
 Odessey Aviation
 2450 Derry Road East Hanger 9
 Mississauga, Ontario L5S 1B2

Tel: 672-0880

BizAd '91

Miss Jill Kitchen
 Human Resources Manager
 Lansing Buildall
 1170 Martingrove Road
 Etobicoke, Ontario
 M9W 4X1

Mr. Bruce Tobin
 Human Resources Manager
 Imperial Life Assurance
 95 St. Clair Ave. W. 4th Floor
 Toronto, Ontario
 M4V 1N7

Grad GroupEmployer

Mr. Bob McLein
 Human Resources Manager
Matshusita Electronics of Canada Ltd.
 5770 Ambler Drive
 Mississauga, Ontario
 L4W 2T3

BizAd '90

Ms. Sandra Haigh
 Secretary to the President
 Quick-X Transportation
 5753 Coopers Avenue
 Mississauga, Ontario L4Z 1R9

Tel: 905-568-8811

Hettie O'Donnell
 Manager of Work Place Equality and Recruitment
 Center of Human Resource
Bank of Montreal
 55 Bloor St. W. 6th Floor
 Toronto, Ontario
 M4W 3N5

Ms Ann Dennis
 Human Resources Manager
Shoppers Drug Mart
 225 Yorkland Blvd.
 Willowdale, Ontario M2J 4Y7

Tel: 490-2880

Mr. George Weber
 Human Resources Manager
Peterson, Howe & Heather Canada Inc.
 350 Burnhamthorpe Rd. W.
 Etobicoke, Ontario
 L5B 3P9

Mr. John Field
 Human Resources Manager
Magnetronics
 252 Britannia Road
 Mississauga, Ontario L4Z 1S6

Tel: 905-890-2679

First National Bank of Chicago
 2 First Canadian Place, Suite 2300
 Toronto, Ontario M5X 1G4

Grad GroupEmployer

Mrs. Gilda Sutton
 Human Resources Manager
 McMichael Canadian Art Collection
 10365 Islington
 Kleinburg, Ontario
 L0J 1C0

Canadian Securities Plus

No trace of this firm

Derek Morrison
 Personnel Manager
 Tele-Direct Publications Inc.
 325 Milner Ave.
 Scarborough, Ontario
 M1B 5S8

Ms. Liz McLean
 Manager Recruitment
 Toronto Dominion Bank
 Head Office
 55 King St. W.
 TD Tower 14th Floor T.D. Tower
 Toronto, Ontario
 M5K 1A2

Mr. David Prentice
 Bank Manager
 Toronto Dominion Bank
 Branch
 1169 St. Clair Ave. W.
 Toronto, Ontario
 M6E 1B2

Lawrence Electronics Canada
 919 Matheson Blvd East
 Mississauga, Ontario L4W 2R7

Miss. Linda Beattie
 Human Resources Manager
 Beckman Instruments Canada Ltd.
 1045 Tristar Drive
 Malton, Ontario
 L5T 1W5

Grad GroupEmployer

Mr. Don Casey
Director of Human Resources
Shoppers Drug Mart
 225 Yorkland Blvd.
 Willowdale, Ontario
 M2J 4Y7

Mktg Dip F92

Mr. Grant Lowndes
General Manager
Summit Ford Sales Ltd.
 12 Carrier Drive
 Rexdale, Ontario
 M9V 2C1

Mktg Dip W92

Ms. Lynn Wright
Corporate Recruiting Manager
Business Depot
 30 Centurion Drive Suite 106
 Markham, Ontario L3R 8B9

Tel: 905-513-6116

Mktg Dip F91

Ms. Judy Howse
Human Resources Manager
Marriott Hotel (Airport)
 901 Dixon Road
 Rexdale, Ontario
 M9W 1J5

Price Club
 (Unable to obtain phone #)

Ms. Pat Arppe
Vice President - Human Resources
Eatons (Buyer, Head Office)
 250 Yonge Street
 11th Floor
 Toronto, Ontario
 M5B 1C8

Tel: 343-2424

Mr. Columba McAlary
Human Resources Manager
National Carpet Mills of Canada
 5195 Maingate Road
 Mississauga, Ontario
 L4W 1G4

Grad GroupEmployer

Mktg Dip W91

Wild Goose Aviation
 Hazleton Lanes
 (.... out of business)

Mrs. Pat Downie

Mrs. Pat Downie
 Human Resources Director
 Marathon Realty Company Ltd.
 200 Wellington St. West
 Suite 400
 Toronto, Ontario
 M5V 3C7

Tel: 348-1500

Ms. Liz McLean
 Manager Recruitment
 Human Resources Division
 Toronto Dominion Bank
 TD Tower 14th Floor
 55 King Street West
 Toronto, Ontario M5K 1A2

Tel: 982-8222

Mr. Stuart McDonald
 Human Resources Manager
 Eatons, Sherway Gardens
 25 The West Mall
 Etobicoke, Ontario
 M9C 1B8

Tel: 343-3311

Ms. Pat Arppe
 Vice President - Human Resources
 Eaton's, Head Office
 11th Floor
 250 Yonge Street
 Toronto, Ontario
 M5B 1C8

Tel: 343-2424

Regent Holidays

Now out of business

Mktg Dip F90

Nil

Grad GroupEmployer

Mktg Dip W90

"Today's Seniors Paper"

Tel: 238-0555

(No answer at this phone # - No other number listed)

Ms Debbie Morbeck
Personnel Department
Engineered Foam Products Canada Ltd
150 Turo Road
Downsview, Ontario M3J 2A9

Tel: 630-6633

Mr. Steve Azzopardy
Store Manager
Willson Stationery
100 City Center Drive
Mississauga, Ontario
L5B 2C9

Tel: 277-0351

Ms. Susan Purser
Human Resources Manager
The Gap Clothing Store
Head Office Canada
170 Bloor St. West
Suite 804
Toronto, Ontario
M5S 1T9

Tel: 921-2711

Ms. Susan Spain
Human Resources Manager
Young & Rubicam
60 Bloor St. West
Toronto, Ontario
M4W 1J2

Tel: 323-6888

Mr. Larry Easton
Controller
Kango International Inc.
93 Advance Road
Etobicoke, Ontario
M8Z 2T1

Tel: 236-2531

Grad GroupEmployer

Price Club
(unable to find #)

Mr. Earl Lillie
Human Resource Manager
Olympia Tile
1000 Lawrence Avenue West
Toronto, Ontario
M6B 4A8

Tel: 789-4122

Ms. Lorraine Tonna
Human Resources Manager
K-Mart Canada Ltd.
2225 Erin Mills Parkway Store 5428
Mississauga, Ontario
L5K 1V1

Tel: 822-4922

Mr. J. McDermott
General Manager
Trans Canada Credit Corporation Ltd.
2292 Islington Avenue
Rexdale, Ontario
M9W 3W8

Tel: 741-4310

"Comark" ??? (phone first)

MMP's '90-'92

Mrs. Jenny Power
Human Resource Manager
The Body Shop (Head Office)
33 Kern Road
Don Mills, Ontario
M3B 1S9

Tel: 441-3202

Kraft General Foods Canada

Mrs. Janice Anderson
Human Resource Manager
95 Moatfield Drive
Don Mills, Ontario
M3B 3L6
Tel: 441-5000

Grad GroupEmployer**Moore Business Forms**

Tel: 863-6502

(no answer)

Human Resources Manager (would not give name)

Canada Post Corporation

1 Dundas Street West

Toronto, Ontario M5G 1Z3

Tel: 979-8822

Mr. Joel Halbert

General Manager

Linda Lundstrom Ltd.

33 Mallard

Toronto, Ontario

M3B 1S4

Tel: 391-2828

Ms. Catherine Brooks

Special Employment Coordinator

Human Resources Department

Minister of the Attorney General

720 Bay Street 3rd Floor

Toronto, Ontario M5G 2K1

Mr. Robert Lichtenstein

Human Resources Manager

B.S.D. International Marketing

644 Petrolia Road

Downsview, Ontario

M3J 2W3

Tel: 665-0782

Senior Office Manager (would not give name)

Compusearch (research outfit)

330 Front Street West Suite 1160

Toronto, Ontario M5V 3B7

348-9180

Grad GroupEmployer

Mr. Randy Garrett
Human Resources Manager
National Rubber Company Inc.
394 Symington Ave.
Toronto, Ontario
M6N 2W3

Mailed Jan 10

Tel: 657-1111

Mrs. Susan Lanz-White
Human Resources Manager
Burke International Research Ltd.
1075 Bay Street
Toronto, Ontario
M5S 2X5

Tel: 924-5454

Jackie Ditz
Human Resource Manager
Hudsons Bay Company
2 Bloor Street East
Toronto, Ontario
M4W 3H7

Tel: 972-4000

Mr. J. S. Magri
Director of Human Resources
C.I.B.C.
C.I.B.C. Resourcing
750 Lawrence Ave. W.
East Tower, 1st Floor
Commerce Court Postal Station
Toronto, Ontario
M5C 1A2

Tel: 980-2211

Ms. Marget McLean
Chief Executive Officer
Crabtree & Evelyn
1010 Adelaide Street West
London, Ontario N6E 1R6

Long Distance 1-519-685-1112

National Brands Marketing
Sales and Marketing
(No # Found)

APPENDIX C**SURVEY INSTRUMENT - COLLEGE MARKETING GRADUATES**

Date

Dear (Graduate):

DEVELOPMENT OF MARKETING EDUCATION - HUMBER COLLEGE

We would like to ask for your help, as a Humber graduate in Marketing, in connection with our efforts to strengthen our marketing program to meet the changing needs of the workplace in the '90's.

We believe your experience with us as a student, and later in the workforce, provides you with an ideal perspective for helping us in this effort.

Many employers are telling us that today's highly competitive business environment in Ontario is generating demands for new kinds of knowledge and skills needed by our graduates. We would like your views on this.

The attached survey worksheet contains a list of kinds of knowledge and skills which various employers and other sources claim to be needed by marketing practitioners in order for them to make an effective contribution in the workplace.

Thinking of your present job in marketing, would you please tell us your views on the **relative importance** of those skills in order for you to be effective in the job.

We are also interested in your views on the degree to which these skills were learned in your college marketing coursework. Please note your perceptions on this in section (a).

You may feel that you learned some of these skills in other college experience apart from course work. If so, would you please note in section (b) what was the experience.

Similarly, you may feel that you learned some of these skills in other experience outside of the college. If so, would you please note in section (c) what was that experience.

Thereafter, we would much appreciate it if you would mail us the completed survey in the enclosed self-addressed, postage-paid envelope.

Responses from individual graduates are strictly voluntary and will be treated confidentially. A summary of all responses will be used by Humber's Marketing Department in strengthening marketing program and course design.

If you have any questions on this, please do not hesitate to call me at 675-3111, extension 4318. Thank you for your assistance.

Yours very truly,

J. L. Murray, P.Eng., M.B.A.
School of Business

Attachments: Survey worksheet
Reply card

Survey Reply Card
College Marketing Graduates

A postcard will be included with the survey instrument,
bearing the following message:

To: Mr. J. L. Murray
Marketing Department
School of Business
Humber College
205 Humber College Blvd
Rexdale, Ontario M9W 5L7

Dear Mr. Murray:

I have completed your survey and mailed it
on _____ (date)

I understand that you will keep my individual
responses confidential.

KNOWLEDGE, SKILLS & ATTITUDE NEEDED IN THE WORKPLACE OF THE '90'S
RESEARCH PROJECT FOR STRENGTHENING COLLEGE MARKETING CURRICULA

SURVEY WORKSHEET - RECENT MARKETING GRADUATES OF HUNTER COLLEGE

Following is a list of kinds of knowledge and skills which various authorities claim to be needed by practitioners in marketing in order to make an effective contribution to their firms.

Thinking of your present job in marketing, would you please note below your assessment of the relative importance of these skills in order for you to make an effective contribution in performing your job?

Also, to what extent did you learn these skills (a) in your college program, (b) other college experiences, or (c) other experiences outside of college?

	Relative Importance			(a) Learned in College Program				(b) Learned in other college experience (specify)		(c) Learned in other experience outside of college (specify)	
	Critical	Very Important	Somewhat Important	Not at all Important	Learned Thoroughly	Learned Considerably	Learned Somewhat	Learned not at all			
Communications: oral & written											
Setting goals & objectives											
Marketing basics											
Administrative techniques											
Computer applications											
Marketing distribution											
Product knowledge											
Respect confidentiality											
Risk management											
Marketing finance											
Courtesy & respect for others											
Product/service planning											
Business mathematics											
Honesty & integrity											
Time management											
Purchasing											
Interpersonal skills											
Understanding entrepreneurship											
Computer applications											
Negotiation											
Identifying priorities											
Business organizations											
Generating interest & enthusiasm											
Learning to learn											
Marketing strategy											
Self-control											
Self-esteem											
Violence											
Business law											
Ethics											

This exhibit depicts the structure of the research instrument. In the actual instrument, all sixty skills appearing in Table 2.13, page 50, were arrayed.

APPENDIX D**SURVEY INSTRUMENT - HUMAN RESOURCES MANAGERS**

(Date)

Mm/Mr.
Manager Human Resources
Firm name
Firm address & postal code

Dear (name):

Development of Marketing Education- Humber College

We are writing to ask if you would kindly give us some advice in our efforts to improve the marketing education programs we offer at Humber College.

Data from many sources indicate that today employers are looking for college marketing recruits who possess so-called soft skills in addition to the technical marketing skills which have traditionally formed the basis of college marketing curricula.

First, our objective is to obtain your views, as a Human Resources Manager, on the kinds of knowledge, skills and attitudes needed by the workforce today in order to contribute to your firm's effectiveness. We would also like your own views as to the kinds of knowledge, skills and attitudes you would seek to find specifically in recruits from college marketing graduates.

Secondly, we are pleased that your firm has hired a marketing graduate from Humber College at some time during the past three years. For this reason we would ask if you would kindly pass a survey worksheet to the immediate supervisor of the graduate, so that we might learn the degree to which the supervisor perceives the graduate demonstrates possession of those skills.

For your information, we are writing separately to recent graduates to get their views on the kinds of skills and knowledge they need to perform effectively in the first two years on the job after graduation, and to ask the degree to which they perceive they learned those skills during their

CO

Re
in
to

We
v.
w
a

A
a
H

F
Y
a
M
C

college marketing program.

Responses to these surveys should of significant help to us in our efforts to update college marketing curricula to meet today's workplace needs.

We are therefore asking if you would kindly give us your views on the skills arrayed in the attached one-page worksheet, and return it to us in the enclosed self-addressed, postage-paid envelope.

Attached also is a survey worksheet package which we would ask you to kindly pass to the immediate supervisor of our Humber marketing graduate.

Responses from individual participants are strictly voluntary and will be treated confidentially. A summary of all responses will be prepared for use by Humber's School of Business in developing modifications to marketing course designs.

If you have any questions on this, please do not hesitate to call me at Humber College, 675-3111, extension 4318.

Thank you for your assistance.

Yours very truly,

J.L. Murray, P.Eng., M.B.A.
School of Business

Attachments

Questionnaire Form - Human Resources Manager
Questionnaire Form - Immediate Supervisor of Humber
College Marketing Graduate
Survey Reply Card

Survey Reply Card
Human Resources Managers

**A postcard will be included with the survey instrument,
bearing the following message:**

**To: Mr. J. L. Murray
Marketing Department
School of Business
Humber College
205 Humber College Blvd
Rexdale, Ontario M9W 5L7**

Dear Mr. Murray:

**I have completed your survey and mailed it
on _____ (date)**

**I understand that you will keep my individual
responses confidential.**

**I would like _____ (please check) to receive
a copy of the summary report.**

R

R

Folld
mark

Thun
woul

KNOWLEDGE, SKILLS & ATTITUDE NEEDED IN THE WORKPLACE OF THE '90'S
RESEARCH PROJECT FOR STRENGTHENING COLLEGE MARKETING CURRICULA
SURVEY WORKSHEET - MANAGER HUMAN RESOURCES

Following is a list of kinds of knowledge and skills which various authorities claim to be needed by practitioners in marketing in order to make an effective contribution to their firms.

Thinking of a college marketing graduate in the first two years of employment in a marketing job in your firm, would you please note below your assessment of the relative importance of these skills

	Critical	Very Important	Somewhat Important	Not at all Important
Communications: oral & written				
Setting goals & objectives				
Marketing basics				
Demonstrate initiatives				
Career development				
Marketing distribution				
Respect confidentiality				
Risk management				
Marketing finance				
Courtesy & respect for others				
Product/service planning				
Business mathematics				
Honesty & integrity				
Time management				
Purchasing				

This exhibit depicts the structure of the research instrument. In the actual instrument, all sixty skills appearing in Table 2.13, page 50, were arrayed

Business organization				
Generating interest & enthusiasm				
Learning to learn				
Marketing strategy				
Self-control				
Visioning				
Business law				
Ethics				
Interpreting firm's mission				
International trade				
Empathy for others				
Evaluating competition				
Marketing Operations				
Interviewing skills				
Planning new business				
Pricing				

APPENDIX E**SURVEY INSTRUMENT - SUPERVISORS OF GRADUATES**

(Date)

To Supervisor of Humber Marketing Graduate:

Dear Supervisor:

Development of Marketing Education - Humber College

The School of Business, Humber College, is undertaking a study with the intent of improving the marketing courses so that future marketing graduates will be able to make a more effective contribution to their employers.

To meet this objective, we would like to obtain employers' views on the kinds of knowledge, skills, and attitudes needed in today's workplace. After we have input from the employer group, we intend to review our marketing course curriculum and alter it as needed in order to better prepare our students to be effective employees in firms such as yours.

We have asked Human Resources Managers of firms employing recent marketing graduates for their views on the kinds of knowledge, skills and attitudes needed in the workplace. We also would like your viewpoint, as a supervisor of a recent college marketing graduate, on:

- (a) The kinds of knowledge, skills and attitudes needed by a college marketing graduate in the first two years on the job, in order to make an effective contribution to the firm; and
- (b) The degree to which you perceive the marketing graduate under your supervision to be proficient in the these skills.

We would therefore ask if you would kindly give us your views on the skills arrayed in the attached one-page worksheet, and return it to us in the enclosed self-addressed, postage-paid envelope.

Responses from individual supervisors are strictly voluntary and will be treated confidentially. A summary of all

responses will be prepared for use by Humber's School of Business in developing modifications to marketing course designs.

If you have any questions on this, please do not hesitate to call me at 675-3111, extension 4318. Thank you for your assistance.

Yours very truly,

Attachments: Survey worksheet
Survey reply card

J. L. Murray, P.Eng., M.B.A.
School of Business

Survey Reply Card
Supervisors of Graduates

**A postcard will be included with the survey instrument,
bearing the following message:**

**To: Mr. J. L. Murray
Marketing Department
School of Business
Humber College
205 Humber College Blvd
Rexdale, Ontario M9W 5L7**

Dear Mr. Murray:

**I have completed your survey and mailed it
on _____ (date)**

**I understand that you will keep my individual
responses confidential.**

RESEARCH PROJECT FOR STRENGTHENING COLLEGE MARKETING CURRICULA

SURVEY WORKSHEET - SUPERVISORS OF RECENT MARKETING GRADUATES

Following is a list of kinds of knowledge and skills which various authorities claim to be needed by practitioners in marketing in order to make an effective contribution to their firms.

Thinking of a college marketing graduate now under your supervision, would you please note below your assessment of the relative importance of these skills in order for him/her to be effective in the present job?

Also, how would you assess the graduate's proficiency in each of these skills?

	RELATIVE IMPORTANCE				RELATIVE PROFICIENCY			
	Critical	Very Important	Somewhat Important	Not at all Important	Highly Proficient	Proficient	Somewhat Proficient	Not at all Proficient
Communications: oral & written								
Setting goals & objectives								
Marketing basics								
Demonstrate initiatives								
Career development								
Marketing distribution								
Respect confidentiality								
Risk management								
Marketing finance								
Courtesy & respect for others								
Product/service planning								
Business mathematics								
Honesty & integrity								
Time management								
Purchasing								
Interpersonal skills								
Understanding entrepreneurship								
Computer applications								
Negotiation								
Identifying priorities								
Business organization								
Generating interest & .								
Learning to learn								
Marketing strategy								
Self-control								
Visioning								
Business law								
Ethics								
Interpreting firm's mission								
International trade								
Empathy for others								
Evaluating competition								
Marketing Operations								
Interviewing skills								
Planning new business								
Pricing								
Values and lifestyle								
Generating business ideas								
Marketing promotion								
Positive work attitude								
Decision-making								
Marketing research								
Handling pressure & tension								
Problem-solving								

This exhibit depicts the structure of the research instrument. In the actual instrument, all sixty skills appearing in Table 2.13, page 50, were arrayed

1st Sur
Professor
SumQue.

APPENDIX F**STATISTICAL ACCURACY**

Statistical data pertaining to the responses from the mail survey of recent college marketing graduates has been generated using "SumQuest"¹, a computer program designed for survey research. This program was used to define user fields for data tabulation and analysis.

"Excel" computer software was used to sort the data and to print data arrays, and to generate the measures of statistical accuracy which appear in the following tables.

Graduates Responses Regarding Importance of Sixty Skills

Table 4.10, page 87, indicates Graduates' perceptions of the importance of the sixty skills examined in this study. Data in Table 4.10 has been arrayed under the four-point scale used in the study, with an additional column to show the degree of non-response.

For purposes of analysis, the sum of responses under "critical" and "very important" for each skill were utilized. Calculations of confidence level were therefore made on the basis of the sum of responses in these two categories of the four-point scale. Results are as follows:

¹"SumQuest", survey research software designed for the IBM PC and compatibles, by Ross MacNaughton, Professor, School of Business Management, Ryerson Polytechnical Institute, Toronto, and published 1992 by SumQuest Software, Toronto, Ontario

C
L
P
L
C
H

I
C
I
T
I
I
T
I
S
C
S

I
I
C
I
C
C
I
I

I
N
C
M
E
M
A
D
P
M
M

Statistical Accuracy Graduates' Perceptions of Skill Importance

Skill	Critical & Very Important - % Graduates	
<u>90th Percentile</u>		
Communications: oral & written	97.5	Mean 93.88
Interpersonal skills	95.0	Standard error 0.99
Positive work attitudes	92.6	Standard deviation 2.43
Listening	91.4	Confidence level (90%) 1.63
Concern for customer's needs	90.2	
Handling pressure & tension	90.1	
<u>80th Percentile</u>		
Decision-making	88.9	Mean 84.80
Courtesy & respect for others	88.9	Standard error 1.00
Identify priorities	87.6	Standard deviation 3.32
Time management	86.5	Confidence level (90%) 1.65
Honesty & integrity	86.4	
Problem-solving	85.2	
Teamwork	84.0	
Responsible behavior	82.7	
Self-control	81.5	
Generating interest & enthusiasm	80.2	
Setting goals & objectives	80.2	
<u>70th Percentile</u>		
Business organization	76.6	Mean 73.81
Learning to learn	75.3	Standard error 0.45
Computer applications	74.1	Standard deviation 1.36
Evaluate competition	74.1	Confidence level (90%) 0.75
Product & service planning	72.9	
Generating business ideas	72.9	
Continuing education	72.8	
Respect confidentiality	72.8	
Public relations	72.8	
<u>60th Percentile</u>		
Demonstrate initiative	69.2	Mean 65.56
Negotiation	67.9	Standard error 0.83
Career development	67.9	Standard deviation 2.74
Marketing strategy	66.7	Confidence level (90%) 1.36
Ethics	66.7	
Marketing promotion	66.7	
Allocate resources	65.4	
Develop action plans	65.4	
Persuasion	64.2	
Marketing finance	61.7	
Marketing operation	60.4	

Int
Ma
Int
Bu
Ex
Pr
M
V
M

V
E
C
M
F
M
I
I
I

M
M
M

20th Percentile

Interpret firm's mission	58.1
Marketing basics	58.1
Interviewing skills	58.0
Business mathematics	55.5
Evaluate own business unit	54.3
Pricing	51.9
Market segmentation	50.6
Visioning	50.6
Market research	50.6

Mean	54.19
Standard error	1.12
Standard deviation	3.37
Confidence level (90%)	1.85

40th Percentile

Values & lifestyle	49.4
Empathy for others	49.3
Government regulation	48.1
Manpower planning	45.7
Risk management	45.7
Marketing distribution	45.7
Business geography	45.6
Planning new business	44.4
Identify research need	43.2
Establish business systems	42.0

Mean	45.81
Standard error	0.73
Standard deviation	2.30
Confidence level (90%)	1.20

30th Percentile

Purchasing	38.3
Understanding entrepreneurship	37.0
International Trade	30.8
Business law	29.6

Mean	36.18
Standard error	1.88
Standard deviation	3.77
Confidence level (90%)	3.10

Statistical Accuracy

Graduates' Perceptions of Skill Importance vs Skill Learned

	Skill Critical & Very Important <u>% Graduates</u>	Learned Thoroughly & Considerably <u>% Graduates</u>
<u>Human Relations Skills</u>		
Communications	97.5	58.0
Interpersonal skills	95.0	56.8
Positive work attitudes	92.6	49.4
Listening	91.4	61.4
Concern for Customers' needs	90.2	64.2
Handling pressure & tension	90.1	37.1
Courtesy & respect for others	88.9	38.3
Honesty & integrity	86.4	30.9
Teamwork	84.0	74.0
Responsible behavior	82.7	45.7
Self-control	81.5	30.8
Interest & enthusiasm	80.2	37.0
Respect confidentiality	72.8	21.0
Demonstrate initiative	69.2	43.2
Negotiation	67.9	22.2
Ethics	66.7	32.1
Persuasion	64.2	29.6
Interviewing skills	58.0	33.3
Values & lifestyle	49.4	33.3
Empathy for others	49.3	18.5

Conceptual Skills

Decision-making	88.9	65.4
Identify priorities	87.6	51.8
Time management	86.5	69.1
Problem-solving	85.2	69.1
Set goals & objectives	80.2	67.9
Learning to learn	75.3	43.2
Evaluate competition	74.1	49.4
Product/service planning	72.9	67.9
Continuing education	72.8	42.0
Generate business ideas	72.9	46.9
Career development	67.9	29.6
Allocate resources	65.4	42.0
Interpret firm's mission	58.1	60.5
Evaluate own business unit	54.3	26.0
Visioning	50.6	19.8
Risk management	45.7	18.5
Manpower planning	45.7	19.7
Planning new business	44.4	45.7
Identify research need	43.2	53.1
Understanding entrepreneurship	37.0	40.7

	Skill Critical & Very Important <u>% Graduates</u>	Learned Thoroughly & Considerably <u>% graduates</u>
<u>Technical Skills</u>		
Business organization	76.6	69.1
Computer applications	74.1	67.9
Public relations	72.8	30.8
Marketing promotion	66.7	80.2
Marketing strategy	66.7	85.2
Develop action plans	65.4	59.2
Marketing financing	61.7	48.1
Marketing operations	60.4	70.4
Marketing basics	58.1	86.4
Business mathematics	55.5	61.7
Pricing	51.9	49.4
Market segmentation	50.6	69.1
Marketing research	50.6	71.6
Government regulation	48.1	19.7
Marketing distribution	45.7	67.9
Business geography	45.6	17.2
Business systems	42.0	38.4
Purchasing	38.3	24.7
International trade	30.8	22.2
Business law	29.6	39.5

Statistical Accuracy

Graduates' Perceptions of Skill Importance vs Skill Learned

	Skill Critical & Very Important % Graduates	Learned Thoroughly & Considerably % Graduates	
<u>Human Relations Skills</u>			
Communications	97.5	58.0	Human Relations Statistical Summary Critical & Very Important Mean 78.13 Standard Error 3.43 Median 82.10 Mode 92.60 Standard Deviation 15.32 Variance 234.76 Range 49.80 Confidence Level (90%) 5.64
Interpersonal skills	95.0	56.8	
Positive work attitudes	92.6	49.4	
Listening	91.4	61.4	
Concern for Customers' needs	90.2	64.2	
Handling pressure & tension	90.1	37.1	
Courtesy & respect for others	88.9	38.3	
Honesty & integrity	86.4	30.9	
Teamwork	84.0	74.0	
Responsible behavior	82.7	45.7	
Self-control	81.5	30.8	Human Relations Statistical Summary Learned Thoroughly & Considerably Mean 40.85 Standard Error 3.45 Median 37.05 Mode 33.30 Standard Deviation 15.44 Variance 238.28 Range 55.50 Confidence Level (90%) 5.68
Interest & enthusiasm	80.2	37.0	
Respect confidentiality	72.8	21.0	
Demonstrate initiative	69.2	43.2	
Negotiation	67.9	22.2	
Ethics	66.7	32.1	
Persuasion	64.2	29.6	
Interviewing skills	58.0	33.3	
Values & lifestyle	49.4	33.3	
Empathy for others	49.3	18.5	
<u>Conceptual Skills</u>			
Decision-making	88.9	65.4	Conceptual Statistical Summary Critical & Very Important Mean 65.49 Standard Error 3.77 Median 70.35 Mode 87.60 Standard Deviation 16.87 Variance 284.64 Range 51.90 Confidence Level (90%) 6.21
Identify priorities	87.6	51.8	
Time management	86.5	69.1	
Problem-solving	85.2	69.1	
Set goals & objectives	80.2	67.9	
Learning to learn	75.3	43.2	
Evaluate competition	74.1	49.4	
Product/service planning	72.9	67.9	
Continuing education	72.8	42.0	
Generate business ideas	72.9	46.9	
Career development	67.9	29.6	Conceptual Statistical Summary Learned Thoroughly & Considerably Mean 47.96 Standard Error 3.84 Median 48.15 Mode 67.90 Standard Deviation 17.17 Variance 294.77 Range 50.60 Confidence Level (90%) 6.31
Allocate resources	65.4	42.0	
Interpret firm's mission	58.1	60.5	
Evaluate own business unit	54.3	26.0	
Visioning	50.6	19.8	
Risk management	45.7	18.5	
Manpower planning	45.7	19.7	
Planning new business	44.4	45.7	
Identify research need	43.2	53.1	
Understanding entrepreneurship	37.0	40.7	

MICHIGAN STATE UNIV. LIBRARIES



31293014172005