

This is to certify that the

thesis entitled

A RHETORICAL ANALYSIS OF THE PREACHING OF
DR. CLARENCE EDWARD MACARTNEY, TWENTIETH CENTURY
EXPONENT OF THE TRADITIONAL ORTHODOXY

presented by

ARNOLD A. KURTZ

has been accepted towards fulfillment
of the requirements for

Ph. D. degree in Speech

K. A. Kurtz

Date June 27, 1966

ROOM USE ONLY

~~ADD TO ROOM~~ R38

~~XXXXXXXXXXXX~~

~~1111 1111 1111~~ 100

~~1111 1111 1111~~ U123

Copyright by
Arnold A. Kurtz
1966

ABSTRACT

A RHETORICAL ANALYSIS OF THE PREACHING OF
DR. CLARENCE EDWARD MACARTNEY, TWENTIETH CENTURY
EXPONENT OF THE TRADITIONAL ORTHODOXY

by

Arnold A. Kurtz

This study examines the Pittsburgh preaching (1927-1953) of Dr. Clarence Edward Macartney, pastor of the First Presbyterian Church of Pittsburgh, Pennsylvania, and a proponent of the traditional Christian Orthodoxy.

Employing the Historical-Critical method of research, the study posits the assumption that the theological stance of a Biblical literalist would be especially hospitable to those rhetorical devices that concern the communication of reality, and therefore takes special note of the factors of invention and style as they figure in the speaker's representation of reality and experience.

The study is organized under three divisions.

Part I provides a contextual background for an analysis of Macartney's preaching by taking under consideration biographical background, the speaker's personal views and beliefs, climate of opinion, and the Pittsburgh setting. Part II, employing recognized rhetorical criteria, analyzes Macartney's sermons for discernible elements of persuasion and generalizes from a large body of published sermons supplemented by a limited number of tape recordings. In Part III the re-

10

100

100

1. *Chlorophyll a* and *Chlorophyll b* were determined by the method of Arar and Collins (1987).

100

100

100

10

10

10

1998

— 2 —

10

10

...

1

2

10

sults of the investigation are drawn together. Inquiry is made first regarding the worth of Macartney's preaching as measured against the established principles of good speaking, and secondly, regarding the effectiveness of his preaching, following which a number of conclusions are submitted.

It is suggested that Macartney's techniques for the representation of reality and experience, particularly in his application of the function of the imagination to the preaching art, would seem to warrant study by preachers regardless of their theological biases:

1. The narrative form. The popular response to, and apparent effectiveness of, his imaginative dramatization of the Christian gospel by means of the narrative form (particularly Biblical narrative) would suggest that preachers might well recognize and use the narrative element in the gospel, the persons and events, more than they do--that possibly the power of assertion in preaching has been over-estimated, and the power of narrative to communicate meaning and to influence the lives of people is underestimated.

2. Description. Macartney, whose concept of "dramatic power" in preaching included the imaginative recreation of setting and situation through description, has demonstrated again the importance of conceiving and feeling a background in the communication of ideas. His method of creating emotional and physical setting in which to place his ideas would seem to merit careful study.

3. The imagination and feeling. Macartney demonstrated in his pulpit address the interrelationship of imagination and feeling and their reaction upon each other. Apart from the power of imagination to arouse feeling by vividly conceiving and communicating ideas as present

realities, there is its power to create in the speaker an identification with, and sympathy for, people. Macartney's preaching reflects this sensitive understanding of the inmost feelings, struggles, desires, and motives of men.

4. The imagination and style. A study of Macartney's application of imagination to preaching, as in comparison (giving rise to such figures as simile, metaphor, contrast, and antithesis), or the mental processes of making things live (personification, vision, apostrophe, allegory, and the like), should prove valuable to all who recognize that preaching cannot divorce form and content, and therefore must concern itself with style if the sermon is to speak truly.

It is suggested, therefore, that contemporary homiletic theories which would tend to minimize the problem of communication in preaching, need the corrective influence of a careful look at a preacher like Dr. Clarence E. Macartney. Relying on nothing but "straight Bible preaching," against the considerable odds of the prevailing climate of opinion, and of the geographical or environmental location of his church, he was apparently successful over the long period of his Pittsburgh ministry in holding and building his congregation while at the same time attracting "throngs of people of every sort."¹

¹ Andrew W. Blackwood, Preaching From the Bible (New York: Abingdon-Cokesbury Press, 1941), pp. 31f.

A RHETORICAL ANALYSIS OF THE PREACHING OF
DR. CLARENCE EDWARD MACARTNEY, TWENTIETH CENTURY
EXPONENT OF THE TRADITIONAL ORTHODOXY

by

Arnold A. Kurtz

A THESIS

Submitted to
Michigan State University
In partial fulfillment of the requirements
for the degree

DOCTOR OF PHILOSOPHY

Department of Speech

1966

Preface

Casting a backward glance down a long road traversed toward a goal which admittedly appeared at times as distant and elusive as the rainbow's end, the writer places the final period to this dissertation with grateful appreciation to those whose guidance, inspiration, and support were blended with his efforts in the realization of this moment:

To a highly-esteemed and honored friend and teacher, Dr. Kenneth G. Hance, Director of Graduate Studies in Speech and Chairman of the Guidance Committee, who challenges his students to excellence and inspires them with confidence in their strivings toward its attainment.

To staff members of the Department of Speech, Michigan State University, whose classes provided the background out of which this study could emerge: Dr. David Ralph, Dr. Gordon Thomas, Dr. Fred Alexander, Dr. Murray Hewgill, and Dr. Craig Johnson; as well as to a staff member of the Department of Education, Dr. John Jordan, who directed course work in a cognate field.

To Dr. Harland E. Hogue, Carl Patton Professor of Homiletics, Pacific School of Religion, Berkeley, California, who encouraged the writer toward graduate study and in conversations with whom the topic of this study was crystallized.

.
Appreciation is expressed also to those who gave generous assistance in specific aspects of this study: Gerald W. Gillette, Research Historian for the Presbyterian Historical Society, Philadelphia; Mrs. J. D. Leighty, Librarian, McCartney Memorial Library, Beaver Falls, Pennsylvania; Mrs. Ruth Tabler, Pittsburgh, for many years Dr. Macartney's secretary; and to Dr. Robert J. Lamont, Pastor of the First Presbyterian Church of Pittsburgh, for assistance with the member-questionnaire

.
A personal note of thanks to my wife, Carol, and our children, Jeanne, Janet, and Don, who "lived through it" with me--hoping, believing, enduring. . . .

Arnold Kurtz

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	Page
PREFACE	ii
INTRODUCTION	v

PART I: CONTEXTUAL BACKGROUND

Chapter

I.	"THE MAKING OF A MINISTER"	2
	The Early Years	3
	Pomona to Princeton	10
	Paterson to Pittsburgh	30
II.	THE MOOD AND MIND OF MACARTNEY'S WORLD	37
	Historical Antecedents	39
	The Age of Reform, 1900-1920	47
	Years of Confusion and Disillusionment, 1920-1940	62
	"The Age of Anxiety," 1940--	81
III.	MACARTNEY'S RESPONSE TO HIS WORLD	91
	Basic Assumptions	91
	Issues that Mattered	111
IV.	MACARTNEY AND "FIRST CHURCH" OF PITTSBURGH	126
	Macartney's Inheritance	127
	Relationship to Church and Community	131
	The Image of the Man	141
V.	A PRACTITIONER'S VIEW OF HIS ART	146
	The Minister and His Calling	148
	His Audience	150
	His Message	153
	Formal and Functional Elements	156
	Preparing to Preach	159
	Preaching Without Notes	164
	Dramatic Power in Preaching	167

PART II: SERMON ANALYSIS

VI.	AN ANALYSIS OF THE ELEMENTS OF PERSUASION IN THE PREACHING OF CLARENCE MACARTNEY	177
-----	---	-----

Purpose, Audience, and Setting	186
Persuasion through Character	198
Persuasion through the Development of Ideas	214
Persuasion through Order	274
Persuasion through Language	302
Persuasion through Delivery	329

VII.	AN ANALYSIS OF THE SERMON, "COME BEFORE WINTER"	341
------	---	-----

PART III: EVALUATION AND CONCLUSIONS

VIII.	AN APPRAISAL--WITH CONCLUSIONS	366
APPENDICES		395
BIBLIOGRAPHY		455

INTRODUCTION

Men of our time, perhaps more than ever before, have had their attention drawn to problems of communication. More than a matter of surmounting the difficulties presented by many tongues in a shrinking world where peoples are thrown ever closer together, the situation involves a breakdown of communication within language itself--familiar words have lost their meaning for many, or the same word means different things to different people; jargon and clichés have usurped the place of discriminating speech.

It is not surprising, therefore, that the modern arts should wrestle today with problems of meaning, or that philosophy is occupied above all with language, or the social sciences with the methods of propaganda.

Similarly, an important concern of the Christian Church today is the problem of communication. The preacher, we are told, is speaking into a dead microphone. On every side we hear the need for a modernization of the Christian message, a translation of ancient ideas and images into terms of contemporary relevance, and a rediscovery of effective media of discourse.

This concern for communication on the part of the Christian Church has been further intensified by the revolution in Biblical studies and a radical reconstruction in theology witnessed the past fifty years. Religious speech, undisciplined by these, is no longer recognized as preaching in the proper sense by those who regard themselves as being on the "growing edge" of theological trends.

Clarence Edward Macartney as a Subject for Study

It has seemed worthwhile to make a study from the standpoint of the speech discipline of a person whose career as a religious speaker has spanned these fifty years of change, but who at the same time would seem to illustrate the phenomenon of continued success in spite of adamant resistance to these changes.

Clarence Edward Noble Macartney, Presbyterian divine, might well stand as a typical representative of the traditional orthodoxy so deeply ingrained from the beginning in American culture. A child of the manse, and one of four brothers who became Presbyterian ministers, Macartney had imbibed deeply a set of firm, old-fashioned, religious beliefs from his strict Scots Covenanter father and mother. A year before his retirement, Time magazine would note: "For 47 years Presbyterian Macartney, singularly unperplexed by theological doubts, scientists' criticism, or the pendulum swing of vogues, has been filling churches by preaching the same Gospel he learned at the seminary."¹

Macartney served three important city churches: the First Presbyterian church of Paterson, New Jersey, 1905-1914; Arch Street Presbyterian church of Philadelphia, 1914-1927; and the First Presbyterian church of Pittsburgh, 1927-1953. When elected Moderator of the General Assembly at the age of forty-five (William Jennings Bryan made the nominating speech), he was one of the youngest men ever to hold that high office. During the 1920's he was in the thick of the struggle for fundamentalism in the Presbyterian church, delivering many scathing attacks on modernism, which he labeled "perfumed ashes."

Macartney has been called a "prodigious worker" who amazed his

¹"Preach the West Wind," Time LX (July 21, 1952), 47.

colleagues with the quantity as well as quality of his work. Besides his parish duties as preacher, pastor, and administrator, he conducted religious conferences and lectured on many college and seminary foundations and, also, published historical, devotional, and apologetic treatises, nearly forty volumes of sermons, and countless pamphlets, addresses, and articles in religious, theological, and other magazines and journals.

Relying on nothing but "straight Bible preaching," for almost half a century Macartney addressed large audiences twice on Sunday. The crowds thronging his church in the heart of the industrial metropolis of Pittsburgh to hear him each Sunday evening continued to the end of his career to defy the national trend away from the evening church service.

Early in his Pittsburgh ministry he pioneered the unique Tuesday Noon Club for Businessmen, a mid-day religious service in which he addressed an average of six hundred, and upon occasion, one thousand men of many professions and denominations.

His best-known sermon, "Come Before Winter," was an "intellectual's revival call" first given in 1915 and preached annually thereafter in the month of October.

The student of rhetoric is intrigued by the implications of this long and apparently successful career of a speaker whose basic assumptions often appeared to fly in the face of the prevailing mood and temper of his times. A corollary question which suggests itself toys with the possibility of a rhetoric of Christian orthodoxy--the possibility that the stance of the Biblical literalist is particularly hospitable to certain specific rhetorical devices, namely those that

concern the communication of reality. If it might be posited that the rhetoric of a representative Biblical literalist will tend to deal in the concrete, close to the actuality of daily life (since the Bible operates with detailed reality even when dealing with sublime matters²), such a context would appear to offer a fruitful field for rhetorical research.

Purpose and Limitation of the Study

The primary purpose of this study is to describe, analyze, interpret, and evaluate the preaching of Dr. Clarence E. Macartney. It employs the Historical-Critical method of research, which has been defined as: "The study of a period, person, or phenomenon in human development, in order to record discovered facts in an accurate, coherent, and critical narrative that posits causations and probabilities."³ Specifically, the study seeks to achieve its purpose through the method of rhetorical criticism which has been described as:

a comparative study in which standards of judgment deriving from the social interaction of a speech situation are applied to public addresses to determine the immediate or delayed effect of the speeches upon specific audiences, and, ultimately, upon society.⁴

Three steps are apparent, then, in the process of rhetorical criticism: the search for facts pertaining to the speech, the speaker, the audience, and the occasion; the establishment of standards of

²For a significant work of literary criticism touching on the influence of Biblical literature as it has affected the attempts of Western culture to grasp and represent reality and experience through the strategies of language and rhetoric, see Erich Auerbach, Mimesis (Garden City, N. Y.: Doubleday and Company, Anchor Book Paperback, 1957).

³John Jeffery Auer, An Introduction to Research in Speech (New York: Harper and Brothers Publishers, 1959), p. 28.

⁴Lester Thonssen and A. Craig Baird, Speech Criticism (New York: The Ronald Press Company, 1948), p. 16.

judgment; and finally, the subjection of the data which have been assembled to analysis, interpretation, and evaluation against the selected criteria.

This study concerns itself primarily with the product of rhetoric, that is, the live speech as delivered. Evaluative judgments are based upon a study of a wide representation of the speaker's output, as well as upon an examination in depth of selected samplings, thus employing the method of generalization.

Underlying this investigation is the awareness that rhetorical theory itself undergoes scrutiny or judgment in every such undertaking--that the justification of rhetorical criticism lies in its practical confirmation or modification of established theory.

This study of the preaching of Dr. Clarence E. Macartney is concerned with the faculty of the speaker to discover all the available means of persuasion, with particular attention to the factors of inventional proof and style as they figure in the speaker's representation of reality and experience. After determining as closely as possible what was actually said, the enterprise entails a study of such matters as the prevailing climate of opinion, biographical factors, basic assumptions of the speaker, general and specific preparation, aspects of delivery, the specific audience and its response to the speaker--all of which are active forces impinging on the final product of rhetoric.

While the career of our speaker must be considered in its entirety with respect to biographical and related aspects, limitations will necessarily be imposed upon the study. Macartney was in demand as an occasional speaker, particularly because of his interests in history and

biography. This study, in the main, however, is concerned with his preaching; and to reduce to manageable scope the investigation of the speech event--speaker, message, audience, and occasion--it will be limited to the Pittsburgh preaching of Dr. Clarence Macartney, 1927-1953.

Justification of the Study

From the first, preaching has been prominent in America as a form of public address; and the number of Americans who hear sermons weekly appears to be on the increase. Specifically, however, several reasons would suggest the merit and value of a study of the preaching of Dr. Clarence Macartney:

1. His leadership of the forces of religious conservatism in America: In the fundamentalist-modernist controversy of the early 'twenties Macartney led the movement that resulted in the resignation of Harry Emerson Fosdick from the First Presbyterian Church of New York. The well-known religious journal, The Christian Century chose Macartney to represent the conservative view in its special series, "How My Mind Has Changed in This Decade," published in 1939.

2. His reputation as a preacher: Anthologies on preaching which have featured his work have characterized Macartney as, a "master preacher in a downtown pulpit,"⁵ "in the front rank of Biblical preachers in America,"⁶ and "a natural born preacher."⁷

3. Specific characteristics of his preaching: Students of his

⁵Andrew W. Blackwood, Preaching in Time of Reconstruction (Great Neck, N.Y.: The Pulpit Press, 1945), p. 42.

⁶Faris Daniel Whitesell, The Art of Biblical Preaching (Grand Rapids, Michigan: Zondervan Publishing House, 1950), p. 144.

⁷Edgar Dewitt Jones, American Preachers of Today (Indianapolis: The Bobbs-Merrill Company, 1933), p. 175.

preaching note particularly his

- a) preaching of Biblical biography
- b) techniques of illustration
- c) facility with the English language
- d) preaching without notes

4. His published works: Approximately forty volumes of sermons were published--a feat perhaps unequalled in this century⁸--aside from a number of books on history, homiletics, and biography.

In its search for elements of persuasion, including the speaker's representation of reality and experience by means of the strategies of rhetoric and language, this study is not oblivious to the age-old tension existing between rhetoric and homiletics which recent theological trends have revived. In the opinion of the writer, a vindication of rhetoric as a study essential to the future of preaching would appear to lie in the area of these emphases.

Materials and Sources of the Study

A wealth of primary and secondary materials is available for a study of Dr. Macartney. These sources may be categorized as follows:

- (1) his own published works, (2) his personal library and private papers, (3) sermons and addresses both printed and voice-recorded, (4) references to Macartney in books on preaching, periodicals, and newspapers, (5) academic studies prepared by seminary students, (6) denominational records, and (7) information from surviving relatives, friends, colleagues and former ministerial assistants.

⁸See Appendices I, II, III for letters from publishers and book sellers relative to the popularity of Macartney's sermon volumes. The Abingdon-Cokesbury Press reports almost one-half million copies sold through November, 1965.

Macartney's library and personal files are housed in the McCartney Memorial Library of Geneva College in Beaver Falls, Pennsylvania. Here his sermons may be studied in their original typescript form.

Tape recordings of six sermons were made available by a former assistant, the Reverend James H. Blackstone, Jr. A seventh recording was acquired from the Reigner Recording Library in Richmond, Virginia. It is, therefore, possible to trace the sermon from its original manuscript form, through the vocal delivery, to the final, permanent published form.

Files of personal papers, including hundreds of letters, provided valuable data. An unpublished biographical manuscript, prepared by his sister, the late Wilhelmina Guerard, and made available by her son, Dr. Albert J. Guerard of Stanford University, supplemented the biographical material available in Macartney's autobiography, The Making of a Minister.

By means of the personal interview and questionnaire, information was gathered from friends, relatives, and former assistants of Macartney, as well as from parishioners of First Church who knew and heard him.

Other works heavily relied upon in this study include general reference works and studies in the areas of history, theology, homiletics, communication, and rhetoric.

Distinctiveness of this Study

While a few studies by seminary students have examined various aspects of Dr. Macartney's preaching, none, however, has employed the procedures of rhetorical criticism or has attempted anything as comprehensive as this study professes to do.

Richard D. Lucas prepared a Th.D. study of the preaching of

Clarence E. Macartney at the Southern Baptist Theological Seminary.⁹

This 200-page study, employing homiletical criteria, was confined largely to a survey of Macartney's published sermons.

A Master's thesis by P.A.O. Boecler deals with the "preaching of the law" in the sermons of four preachers including Dr. Macartney,¹⁰ and another Master's thesis written by James W. Averitt at the Louisville Presbyterian Theological Seminary compares Macartney's preaching to that of six other contemporary ministers in America.¹¹ These studies were understandably quite limited in their treatment of the preaching of Dr. Macartney.

No study, to this point, has utilized the rich store of primary materials recently made available for research by the Macartney Memorial Library at Beaver Falls, Pennsylvania; nor has any study attempted to

⁹Richard D. Lucas, "The Preaching of Clarence E. Macartney" (unpublished Th.D. dissertation, Southern Baptist Theological Seminary, Louisville, Kentucky, 1959).

¹⁰P. A. O. Boecler, "The Preaching of the Law in the Sermons of Geisemann, Fosdick, Spurgeon, and Macartney, and the Application of Psychological Procedures" (unpublished S.T.M. thesis, Concordia Theological Seminary, St. Louis, Missouri, 1957).

¹¹James W. Averitt, "A Study of Seven Contemporary Ministers, Their Sermon Content and Methods" (unpublished Master's thesis, Louisville Presbyterian Theological Seminary, Louisville, Kentucky, 1947).

The following Bachelor's theses have dealt with some aspect of Macartney's ministry:

Quentin O. Hayes, "The Sermons of Clarence E. Macartney" (unpublished Bachelor of Divinity thesis, Asbury Theological Seminary, Wilmore, Kentucky, 1957).

Arnold L. Nelson, "The Biographical Method in Preaching of Alexander Whyte and Clarence E. Macartney" (unpublished Bachelor of Sacred Theology thesis, Biblical Seminary, New York, 1955).

Carl A. Streufert, "An Analysis of the Introductions and Conclusions of Macartney's Sermons" (unpublished Bachelor of Divinity thesis, Concordia Theological Seminary, St. Louis, Missouri, 1950).

utilize a historical and biographical context against which to examine the preaching of Dr. Clarence Macartney.

The Plan of the Study

The study has been organized under three divisions.

Part One provides the contextual background for the analysis of Macartney's sermons. Chapter I, the title of which is taken from his autobiography, The Making of a Minister, presents selected biographical details which might be useful in analyzing his speaking career, considering such matters as his family background, the early years and home influences, his education, and his service to the Presbyterian church prior to his arrival in Pittsburgh. Recognizing that public address does not occur in a vacuum but in a historical context, Chapter II attempts to capture the mood and temper of the first half of the twentieth century in which Macartney's work was set, emphasizing particularly the climate of opinion in matters of faith and religion. Chapter III attempts to delineate Macartney's response to his world as it was motivated by certain basic assumptions, beliefs, and significant issues. Chapter IV, entitled "Macartney and 'First Church' of Pittsburgh," examines the immediate world in which he moved as administrator, pastor, and preacher for the First Presbyterian Church of Pittsburgh. Finally, to complete the contextual background, Chapter V, entitled "A Practitioner's View of His Art," provides important background for analysis of Macartney's sermons by presenting his views on homiletics--views acknowledged to reflect his personal practice.

Part II of the study attempts an analysis of the sermons of Dr. Clarence E. Macartney, generalizing from a large body of published sermons supplemented by a limited number of tape recordings. Because

search is made particularly for the elements of persuasion in his preaching, Chapter VI opens with a brief discussion of the relationship of preaching to the concepts of "persuasion," and proceeds to set against these criteria relevant aspects of his pulpit work. Chapter VII seeks to provide a detailed examination of essentially all aspects of Macartney's preaching in one given instance--the presentation of his well-known sermon, "Come Before Winter."

Part III of the study, in a chapter entitled "An Appraisal--With Conclusions," attempts to draw together the results of the investigation, inquiring first regarding the worth of Macartney's preaching as measured against established principles of good public speaking, and secondly, regarding the effectiveness of his preaching, following which a statement of conclusions is submitted.

PART I
CONTEXTUAL BACKGROUND

CHAPTER I

"THE MAKING OF A MINISTER"

In the study and appraisal of the persuasive efficacy of a speech, the critic regards the speaker, the "specific 'I' in the speaking situation," as a significant element. Hochmuth has compared the speech with a multi-celled organism, whose units consist of speaker, audience, place, purpose, time, and form.¹ The critic's task involves an examination of all these elements, verbal and non-verbal.

When one asks, "What are the predispositions, if any, toward the man who is giving the speech?" one is examining a cell in the organism; for it is inevitable that the audience, either because of previous acquaintance or of signs during the speech itself, comes to some conclusion about the speaker, and this figures importantly in the final judgment. Emerson's characterization of Disraeli is an illustration of this concept:

. . . he makes at last no impression, because the hearer asks, Who are you? What is dear to you? What do you stand for? And the speech and the speaker are silent, and the silence is confession. A man who has been a man has foreground and background. His speech, be it never so good, is subordinate and the least part of him, and as this man has no planet under him, but only his shoes, the hearer infers that the ground of the present argument may be no wider.²

¹Marie Kathryn Hochmuth, "The Criticism of Rhetoric," A History and Criticism of American Public Address, ed. Marie Kathryn Hochmuth (New York: Longmans, Green and Company, 1955), p. 9.

²Journals of Ralph Waldo Emerson, (eds.) Edward Waldo Emerson and Waldo Emerson Forbes (Boston: Houghton Mifflin Co., 1912), VII, 503. Quoted by Hochmuth, ibid., p. 9.

The critic, like the hearer, is unable to disassociate the speaker from his speech. Both ask, Who are you? What is dear to you? What do you stand for?

This chapter will undertake to present such information concerning the life and personality of Clarence E. Macartney as may be useful in providing a setting for the subsequent appraisal of his Pittsburgh preaching. To this end, selected biographical details will be set forth concerning his family background, the early years and home influences, his education, and his service to the Presbyterian church prior to his arrival in Pittsburgh.

The Early Years

Macartney's Family

Dr. Macartney's mother introduced a pamphlet which she had written for mothers by saying:

Begin your training early. Shall I say that even before that dainty cot with its white curtains and loops of blue has received its longed-for occupant, the work really begins! Keep a watch over your own life. . . . it will determine in a measure the fairness or foulness of the little stream beginning its course.³

The stream of life began its course for Clarence Edward Noble Macartney on September 18, 1879, at Northwood, Ohio. He was the last of seven children--four brothers and three sisters (two sisters had died before his birth).

His father, Dr. John Longfellow McCartney,⁴ whose forebears came originally from Ireland, was pastor of the First Miami Church of the

³Mrs. C. R. McCartney, A Word to Mothers, (pamphlet published by Miss Ruby I. Gilbert, Chicago, Ill., n.d.), p. 1.

⁴Clarence and his brother, J. Robertson, adopted a slightly altered spelling of the family name.

Covenanters in Northwood, and Professor of Natural Science at Geneva College, a Covenanter school located there. His father had received his theological training in the seminary of the Reformed Presbyterian Church at Allegheny City (now Pittsburgh), Pennsylvania, and his scientific training under the famous Professor Agassiz of Harvard.⁵

The elder McCartney supported the cause of the Abolitionists, and worked on the Underground Railroad. Interest in Civil War history was nurtured early in young Clarence, who recalls among the more vivid memories of childhood, the stirring stories related by his father of that experience.

Macartney's childhood memories, however, did not reach back to Northwood; for when he was but nine months of age, Geneva College was moved to Beaver Falls, Pennsylvania, that it might be nearer its Covenanter constituency; and his father, whose first love was the college, removed his family to this new scene of activity.

In Macartney's estimation, his father's chief contribution in life was the part he took in establishing and maintaining Geneva College. He noted further that in the pulpit his father excelled "as a pleader at the Throne of Grace, rather than as a preacher. . . . All who remembered him in the pulpit spoke of his prayers."⁶ In acknowledging the paternal influences upon his life, Macartney wrote: "When I think of him and his life and influence, I say to myself, in the words of the Psalmist, 'My father's God, and I will exalt Him.'"⁷

⁵Clarence E. Macartney, The Making of a Minister (Great Neck, New York: Channel Press, Inc., 1961) p. 34. Hereafter, books by Macartney will be footnoted without the author's name.

⁶Ibid., p. 167.

⁷Ibid.

Macartney's mother, of Scottish and French Huguenot heritage,⁸ was born Catherine Robertson, daughter of a wealthy mill owner in Scotland, and came to America as a bride in 1868. By unanimous testimony of the children, the mother was the dominant personality in the home. In his autobiography, Macartney devotes a chapter to his mother, characterizing her as "a remarkable woman."

How often in coming across persons who knew my mother have I heard that exclamation on their lips. A remarkable woman indeed: remarkable in strength of intellect, in deep interest in the lives of others; remarkable in her tender affection for her children; remarkable for her daily intercessions for her family at the Throne of Grace; and remarkable for her unflagging zeal and devotion to her Redeemer's Kingdom.⁹

At the time of her death in 1922, Dr. Macartney, at the request of his older brothers and sister, presented the funeral address.¹⁰ He made reference in the sermon to her intellectual endowments:

Mother's mind was of strong fibre, rich in imagination and orderly in its reasoning. She had that analytical and speculative, perhaps metaphysical, ability which is so commonly associated with the Celtic temperament. This natural endowment had been cultivated and stimulated by the advantages of a superior education. For this reason it was a rare privilege to discuss with her the deep things of the Kingdom of God, for she was one who served the Lord with her heart, her soul, her strength, and also her mind.¹¹

Home Influences

The McCartneys built the first faculty house on the new campus of Geneva College and named it Fern Cliffe. That home became a center for returned missionaries such as John G. Paton, for the representatives

⁸Macartney observed, "Covenanter and Huguenot,--that makes a strain hard to surpass." Ibid., p. 36.

⁹Ibid., p. 38.

¹⁰The sermon was published in Great Sermons by Great Preachers, (ed.) Jesse Lyman Hurlbut (Chicago: The John C. Winton Company, 1927).

¹¹Quoted in The Making of a Minister, p. 199.

of the Women's Christian Temperance Union (of which Macartney's mother was one of the founders and originators¹²), and for friends and relatives from Scotland; at the same time it became headquarters for many social gatherings of the students. Macartney described his home as "one of plain living and high thinking."¹³ A close friend and associate expressed the opinion that, "One cannot begin to understand Dr. Macartney as a person until he discovers the unfailing springs of inspiration which flowed from his home."¹⁴ Back of that home, particularly with respect to the religious overtones, lies the Covenanter heritage.¹⁵ One man's impression of that heritage is presented in the book, Personal Equation, by Dr. Albert Guerard, Macartney's brother-in-law, who had encountered formidable obstacles as an outsider proposing marriage to a Covenanter. He wrote:

. . . the Covenanters are the Dissent of Dissent, the Puritans purified, the Saving Remnant, the Salt of the Earth. A Covenanter farmer, pioneering in the West, wrote to his friends

¹²J. Robertson Macartney, "Greetings," First Church Life, Parish periodical, First Presbyterian Church of Pittsburgh, Dr. Macartney's Twenty-fifth Anniversary edition, April 27, 1952, p. 40.

¹³Clarence Edward Macartney, "Warm Hearts and Steady Faith," The Christian Century LVI (March 8, 1939), 315.

¹⁴Clyde J. Henry, "Introduction," The Making of a Minister. Henry was manuscript editor of this posthumously published autobiography of Macartney, and also Macartney's assistant at the Pittsburgh church for 12 years.

¹⁵The name, Covenanter, was received by a conservative wing of Presbyterianism in Scotland. They were so named because in a series of bands or covenants the Covenanters had bound themselves to maintain the Presbyterian doctrine and polity as the sole religion of their country. The Reformed Presbyterian Church of North America (Old School) is of direct Covenanter lineage. The church at Beaver Falls is one of 72 churches and 6,214 members reported by this denominational branch in 1954. See Frank S. Mead, Handbook of Denominations in the United States, (2nd ed. rev.; Nashville: Abingdon Press, 1961), p. 185.

in the East: "Send me an upstanding, Godfearing maiden to be my wife and helpmeet. If possible, a Reformed Presbyterian; if none is to be found, a United Presbyterian; but on no account go lower than that!"¹⁶

The Covenanters took their religion seriously. The McCartney home was a home of religious devotion where "family worship" was held twice daily:

Family worship was universal in the homes of our neighborhood, and we had "worship" every morning before breakfast and at night before going to bed. . . . After we had sung a Psalm we then read around the circle the verses of the chapter for the day, after which we knelt for the prayer, by Father when he was at home, or, if he was away, by Mother. My first lessons in religion and in reading I had on those mornings at family worship, sitting on my father's knee as he, with his long finger, pointed out the words to me.
: : .¹⁷

The Bible held a place of prominence in the McCartney household. The children left for school in the morning with a Biblical passage ringing in their ears, and all joined in singing the Traveler's Psalm when any member of the family was starting off to college or on a journey.¹⁸ Macartney treasured the childhood memory of Sunday afternoon family gatherings on a moss-covered rock under the sassafras trees on the hillside where his mother would tell the children "the deathless tales of the Bible," or sing from the red-bound hymnal. "I am sure," he wrote, "that the singing of those hymns on the summer afternoons on that moss-covered rock on the hillside in the long ago did much to

¹⁶Albert Guerard, Personal Equation, (New York: W. W. Norton and Company, Inc., 1948) pp. 17f. Dr. Guerard, a professor at Stanford University (1907-1913, 1925-1946) explained, "Now I might have been defined at the time as a Romanist or as an infidel; and it was a grievous problem for the Macartney clan to decide which was worse." Macartney himself refers to the Covenanter church as "the most rigidly orthodox of all churches." The Making of a Minister, p. 34.

¹⁷The Making of a Minister, p. 63.

¹⁸Ibid.

introduce us to the warmth and tenderness of personal religion."¹⁹

The family worshipped regularly in the Covenanter church in Beaver Falls, two miles distant from the McCartney home. The great occasion in the family's church life was the semi-annual celebration of the Lord's Supper, or Communion. Macartney confessed that though he had officiated at Communion in large and important gatherings and had witnessed impressive sacramental occasions in the world's great cathedrals, never had he seen any Communion services which moved him as those occasions in the Covenanter Church of his boyhood:

The Covenanters had bled, suffered, and died to get free of the rites and liturgy of the English church. Their communion celebration had no bell, no incense, no gown, and no organ; nothing of that nature; yet, in very truth, as I have just described it, it was poetic, symbolic and ritualistic in the highest degree. . . . Yes, those stern old Covenanters had in them, unconsciously, all the poetry and mysticism of true religion.²⁰

But if religion was an all-pervasive influence in the McCartney household, and discipline, sometimes inflicted with the ever ready "caws" (Scottish for whip), was strict, Macartney remembered nothing grim nor dour about the home atmosphere. He recalled pleasant memories of family expeditions along murmuring streams, over covered bridges, up pleasant glens, visiting neighboring farms at the nutting season, or special holiday festivals. Macartney's Parisian in-law admitted that the conventional stereotype of the stern Puritan is modified somewhat by social contact with the Covenanters:

I pictured them [the Covenanters] as stern, even morose: ever inclined to admonish, rebuke, and reprove, as enjoined by the Apostle; their daily talk punctuated with menacing scriptural quotations. . . I found my covenanter friends actually more

¹⁹Ibid., p. 69.

²⁰The Making of a Minister, p. 67.

cheerful than most of my Parisian acquaintances. . . . A gathering of Covenanters friends simply ripples with laughter.²¹

Incipient Preacher

It seemed to be taken for granted in the McCartney home that the boys would all become Presbyterian ministers. Clarence, who would later experience serious conflict and doubt regarding his life calling, nevertheless began to experiment early with vocational role-playing particularly as a public speaker and preacher. A feature column appeared in the Pittsburgh Post-Gazette in 1930 under Dr. Macartney's by-line entitled, "My First Speech." He began: "To tell about the first speech I ever made would carry me back to childhood days."²² The sermon--on the subject of the Judgment--was preached in the drawing room of Fern Cliffe, his boyhood home. The members of the congregation, "attentive, if not appreciative," were the members of his family. A second attempt featured the text, "Jesus Wept," which led him to note that "the austerities of conservative theology were mitigated by the gentler things of the Gospel."

His first outside effort, however, the article explained, was not in the sermonic field. He, with a brother and a friend, had formed themselves into a traveling lecture group under the name, "The Three Rising Stars." With magic lantern, slides, and bed-sheet for screen, the three loaded into a spring wagon and headed over the hills to a nearby town which had been well-placarded with handbills. Clarence gave the lecture, while the other two operated the equipment. After the second performance, the "Rising Stars" sank back into eclipse "for lack of funds and lack of public appreciation." Macartney was then thirteen years of age.

²¹Guerard, op. cit., pp. 176f.

²²The Pittsburgh Post-Gazette, December 22, 1930.

Early Schooling

Macartney's references to his early schooling and first teachers (with whom he was somewhat disenchanted) go little beyond the recital of a few incidents of human interest. Perhaps more significant and more prophetic of what was to be was his keen interest in the activities of the college literary society. He wrote, "As children we went eagerly to listen to the essays, orations, declamations, and debates which were the solid menu of the literary societies of that day."²³ He remembered names of youthful orators and repeated opening lines of orations which he must have heard fifty years earlier.

The openness of a small western Pennsylvania community combining with the stimulating atmosphere of a college campus might strike one as an auspicious environmental background, but a new chapter was opened when in 1894, in the month of young Macartney's fifteenth birthday, the family moved to California.

Pomona to Princeton

Of the move to California, which other members of the family referred to as "the great move,"²⁴ Macartney wrote, "An important chapter in life opened for me when our family left Beaver Falls for California."²⁵ That chapter was perhaps even more critical in its shaping influences than Macartney first realized. Concomitant with school experiences, one detects from this point an increasing

²³The Making of a Minister, p. 53.

²⁴Wilhelmina (Mrs. Albert) Guerard, "Clarence Macartney," unpublished, typewritten biographical notes, p. 16, hereafter referred to as "Guerard Notes."

²⁵The Making of a Minister, p. 78.

independence of thought and action, a careful scrutiny and re-evaluation of introjected parental values, and an openness to new ideas and new life patterns.²⁶

"Prep" School

The move to California had been made for the sake of the father's health, who had been advised by his physician: "Go to Redlands and live twenty years." He lived seventeen years, but only one of those years at Redlands. Here, the children enrolled in the Redlands High School, where "a new joyous intellectual life began" for the children,²⁷ Macartney describes his teachers here as "all exceptional teachers and superior personalities."²⁸ Two text books from that year's study were given a permanent place in his library--the rhetoric used in the English

²⁶J. Piaget, in his work, The Moral Judgment of the Child (New York: Harcourt, Brace and Company, 1932) has traced the evolution of the child's moral judgment between the seventh and fifteenth years. He demonstrated a trend from a literal belief in rules, almost as if they had an independent physical existence, toward an attitude of relativity, in which precepts were perceived in relation to the social purposes they were designed to serve. Robert W. White, in a study of somewhat older subjects, referred to this trend as "the Humanizing of Values." He emphasized that (1) the person increasingly discovers the human meaning of values and their relation to the achievement of social purposes, and (2) he increasingly brings to bear his own experiences and his own motives in affirming and promoting a value system. The overall trend, starting from childhood, might be described as a trend from absolute received values to a personally wrought value system. Robert W. White, Lives in Progress (New York: The Dryden Press, 1952), pp. 352f.

This does not mean, however, that the person creates his value system without the benefit of historical tradition or that he substantially changes the content of the received values. The growth trend implies, rather, that his values become increasingly his own.

Such an evolution in Macartney's development is distinctly traceable from this point, through the years of academic study, and then is dramatically demonstrated in the conflict and indecision that surrounded his eventual decision to take the ministerial course.

²⁷Guerard notes, p. 18.

²⁸The Making of a Minister, p. 81.

class,²⁹ and Gayley's Classic Myths, discovered in a class on Greek art, a book to which frequent reference is made in his sermons and which he suggested "every minister should have in his library."³⁰

Macartney continued to evince interest in public speaking at Redlands both as listener and speaker:

A speaker who greatly stirred me was the then-noted Joseph Cook, of the Monday Lectures at Boston. He had a grand peroration at the close of his lecture, in which he compared Christ with famous teachers, martyrs, patriots, and philosophers.³¹

He recalled his personal oratorical efforts: "I sometimes entertained the high school, or social gatherings, with Ben Hur's "Chariot Race," or "Spartacus to the Gladiators"--"Ye call me Chief, and ye do well to call him Chief!"³²

That liberalizing forces were at work in sunny California is perhaps suggested by Macartney's observation regarding the Easter services in which the family participated that Spring: "We had never heard of Easter in our Covenanter days at Beaver Falls; and the whole celebration, in the beautiful California springtime, seemed to us a wonderful thing."³³

Pomona College

That fall, in order that Macartney's sister, Wilhelmina, who had finished her junior year at Geneva College, might have opportunity to complete her college course, the family moved to the recently-established

²⁹No title given.

³⁰Preaching Without Notes, p. 46.

³¹The Making of a Minister, p. 83.

³²Ibid.

³³Ibid.

Pomona College at Claremont, California. Macartney continued his education here in the preparatory department of the college.

A new element in his training was introduced when he and his brother, Albert, began taking singing lessons. In his sister's opinion, "The training which they had at this time started them on the road to a voice culture which had, no doubt, much to do with their success as public speakers."³⁴

Public speaking and debating interests ran high at the college. The seniors delivered their orations at chapel, and there was an annual oratorical contest. Oratory was taught by Dr. Daniel H. Colcord, Professor of Latin, who appeared to have made a deep impression on the young Macartney.

I can see him with his mutton-chop whiskers and gold glasses as he gave his annual address to the students on oratory. In illustrating inept gestures, there was a place where he described a man saying in the course of his speech, "Up to heaven, or down to hell," but in both instances pointing in the wrong direction.³⁵

He recalled the professor's putting a student through the paces of an oration in which at one point the tyro clenched his fists, declaring as he did so how something was "changed from ductile clay to solid rock,"³⁶

Throughout the school year, concerts, lectures, and addresses by visiting speakers supplemented the academic fare. One lecturer greatly stirred Macartney with his lectures on historical characters. "I have done a great deal of biographical preaching and writing in my day, and that Pomona lecturer did much to kindle that flame of interest within

³⁴Guerard notes, p. 23.

³⁵The Making of a Minister, p. 90.

³⁶Ibid.

me,"³⁷

There was great enthusiasm for athletics at Pomona College, and Macartney discovered that he possessed some talent in this line. He made a try for the track team, running the hundred yard dash and the two-twenty. He concluded, "If I had been a little faster, and a little less bashful and reticent, I might have been a champion sprinter."³⁸ He was also captain of his baseball team; and his interest in this sport, awakened at that time, never waned.³⁹

An aspect of the Pomona experience not mentioned in the Macartney autobiography, but referred to in his sister's biographical notes, has to do with the young Presbyterian's attraction to the theory of evolution at that time. The children came under the influence of Dr. Albert J. Cook, biologist at Pomona and neighbor to the McCartneys who took the children on nature excursions and explained to them the theory of evolution. With respect to her brother, Mrs. Guerard wrote,

I think that at this time Clarence accepted the theory of Evolution as taught at Pomona. He always showed a slight tendency to be independent of family tradition and guidance. I think this was largely due to the fact that he felt that as the youngest he had to make a decided effort to assert his own personality.⁴⁰

³⁷Ibid., p. 91.

³⁸Ibid., p. 89.

³⁹Clyde Henry wrote, "Many a boy was amazed to hear the learned preacher cite records and averages of players and teams, and listened with new respect when he spoke of spiritual things." "A Messenger of Grace," Princeton Seminary Bulletin, I (May, 1957), 17.

⁴⁰Guerard notes, p. 22. The "self" theorists in psychology would identify this phase of development as a search for "ego identity"--the sense of being a distinct individual in one's own right within a social framework. Cf. E. H. Erickson, Childhood and Society (New York: W. W. Norton and Co., 1950). See Chapter IV for Macartney's later views on the theory of evolution.

When the father's health failed to improve after two years in California, he determined to try the air and altitude of Denver, Colorado. Clarence objected to being removed from Pomona, and was permitted to remain for another year and to graduate from the preparatory department. On commencement night, Macartney delivered the class oration on Louis Kossuth, the Hungarian orator and patriot.

The University of Denver

When school began the next fall, he was with his family in Denver. Predestinarian Macartney would probably have agreed with his sister's observation that this move also was decisive in its destiny-determining influence: "The spirit of Pomona College was radically opposed to an orthodox conception of life, and I doubt very much if a four-year course at Pomona would have led Clarence into the ministry of the Presbyterian Church."⁴¹

At Denver the "search for ego identity" continued. His sister and brother, Albert, noted his tendency toward independence and withdrawal from the family. When Albert joined a particular literary society, Clarence sought out another, as was true also in choice of fraternities. Mrs. Guerard reported, "Clarence showed an increasing tendency to form friendships apart from the family. Perhaps again this was indicative of a desire not to be a follower."⁴²

The 1941 "Pioneer Issue" of the University of Denver bulletin carried an article featuring the reminiscences of Dr. Macartney under the title, "In the Year of '97." Vivid sketches of his teachers and

⁴¹Guerard notes, p. 26.

⁴²Ibid., pp. 26f.

classroom incidents suggest a clear memory of those days. Reference is made to his activities in the debating club of the University, and to an address given by the intercollegiate orator that year: ". . . I can see him delivering his oration in the Tabor Opera House. One phrase of that oration still lingers in the chambers of my memory: 'Fortuitous chance.'"⁴³

From the treatment of the Denver experience in his autobiography, one receives the impression that his personal education received as much enhancement from his summer's work as a ranch hand as from the hours behind the ivyed walls.

In the bunk house where he slept with the other hired men he was confronted at once with a moral struggle. Did he have the courage to kneel down in the room in the presence of those "rough and profane men" to say his prayers? "It was hard at first; but I won the battle. Never did any of those men mock at me or interrupt me."⁴⁴

Each day bore its yield of instruction for life. A race with a rampaging bull, for example, spoke eloquently of hidden resources for life's emergencies: "As for getting over that high corral fence, it was one of those times when you had to climb, whether it was possible or not."⁴⁵

⁴³Clarence E. Macartney, "In the Year of '97," Bulletin of the University of Denver, XLII (January 10, 1941), 3, 4.

⁴⁴The Making of a Minister, p. 98. Here he learned, but did not use, the "Bunk House Prayer":

"Now I lay me down to sleep;
Ten thousand bedbugs o'er me creep.
If one should bite before I wake,
I pray the Lord, his neck to break."

⁴⁵Ibid., p. 100.

If Macartney was somewhat of an enigma to members of his family during this period, they might have been relieved to have known what of an entirely private nature was transpiring:

On the Sabbath afternoons on the ranch I used to go high up on the mountainside, where I exercised my voice and cultivated the spiritual life, and, half-consciously, prepared for the work in life ahead of me, by reading passages from Isaiah and St. Paul. I recall particularly reading, as my voice rang out over the mountainside, the sublime fifteenth chapter of First Corinthians, the great passage on the immortality of the soul.⁴⁶

His sister's estimate of the value of the year in Denver may be a reflection of her personal disappointment with her academic experience in that place. "I cannot see any contribution of the Denver experience to the future of either of my brothers."⁴⁷

The University of Wisconsin

Concerning the next chapter, the transfer to the University of Wisconsin, she wrote more enthusiastically:

The next move, to Madison, Wisconsin was, I believe, an important one. It was undertaken on the advice of Ernest [the oldest brother], who had a church at Cedar Rapids, Iowa, not far away. Here was a truly great University. . . . Here it was that Clarence developed style. The fields of poetry and the drama were explored under the inspiring leadership of gifted teachers. Here Clarence had his first triumphs in oratory.⁴⁸

Macartney's major field of study for his Bachelor of Arts degree was English and Literature; however, his first love was the speech department:

. . . the teacher who made the most lasting impressions on me and my brother was the professor of public speech, Dr. David Bower

⁴⁶Ibid.

⁴⁷Guerard notes, p. 27. Officials in the registrar's office of the Denver University were unable to uncover the records of Dr. Macartney's class work.

⁴⁸Ibid., pp. 27f.

Frankenburger. A genial, kindly soul, he encouraged us in good speaking and stirred our ambition. When I was at the University, the orator and the debater were as well known as the heroes of the gridiron.⁴⁹

He joined "the oldest and most renowned of the debating societies, Athena, with its sacred cock on the wall."⁵⁰ On the twentieth anniversary of Macartney's pastorate in Pittsburgh, a fellow member of the debating society sent this recollection to the church:

You might be interested in an incident which happened in the Ancient Athenian Debating Society, during a debate. The question was, Did the Teachings of Ingersoll Result in More Good than Harm? Dr. Macartney was on the negative, and I was one of the affirmative debaters. Our debate leader was Morgan, and in closing the debate, he made a violent, unfair and bitter attack on Christianity and especially on the teachings of Presbyterianism. Dr. Macartney was the last speaker, and as I looked at him, his face was aglow. When Morgan sat down, Dr. Macartney immediately took the glasses from his nose, jumped upon the table in the center of the room, and made the most brilliant and effective speech I have ever heard. It was a thrilling moment to see him on top of the secretary's table. He looked at the sixty-five members present, and opened by saying, "I resent the insult that the speaker has levied on the Presbyterian Church. Most of my ancestors, from the time of Bobby Burns until now, were Presbyterian clergymen, and they were unselfish, indefatigable, scholarly, and useful members of the Christian Church." His speech lasted about five minutes, and at the close, everybody cheered, and cheered, and cheered. Morgan had made a great mistake, and he realized it after hearing that speech.⁵¹

A letter dated November 4, 1900, and written to his parents reflects his entrancement with the speeches of Ingersoll:

I have just laid down one of Robert Ingersoll's speeches. I have a debate on his influence next Friday. His attitude towards religion probably was not right, but his own life was as pure as a

⁴⁹The Making of a Minister, p. 106. Apparently much of Macartney's speech training was received in extra-curricular activities, for his academic transcript credits him with only one class in "oratory." The transcript, supplied by the registrar's office of the University of Wisconsin, reveals the heaviest concentration of class work to have been in the fields of English and history.

⁵⁰Ibid., pp. 106f.

⁵¹Cited in The Making of a Minister, p. 107.

saint's, and as for his speeches, I would give the world if I could express such beautiful thoughts, such beautiful language.⁵²

He then cited several lines from Ingersoll's speech, "At His Brother's Grave," with the comment, "What could be more beautiful than that?"

At Madison, Macartney came under the influence of two famous American orators and political figures, William Jennings Bryan and Robert M. LaFollette. He first saw and heard Bryan when "the Great Commoner" spoke at the Monona Lake Chautauqua Grounds near the University campus in his 1900 campaign against McKinley. He was to see much of Bryan in after years, particularly at the time of the great theological controversy over modernism in the Presbyterian church.

A block beyond where Macartney roomed on Wilson street was the LaFollette home. Among college orators the senior Bob LaFollette was famous as the only Wisconsin man who had won the contest in the Northern Oratorical League. Macartney, who had won the privilege of representing his university in the 1900 intercollegiate contest, must have dreamed of following in the footsteps of LaFollette by bringing the victory to his school a second time.⁵³ He approached LaFollette with a request for coaching assistance in the delivery of his oration. Macartney recalls that,

he was busily engaged in his law practice and was also in the midst of a political campaign. Nevertheless, he gladly assented to help me, and in the later afternoons, when court had adjourned, he put

⁵²Macartney letter, dated November 4, 1900, Macartney Files.

⁵³Macartney's intramural victory which made him eligible for the intercollegiate contest was reported to his mother by his brother, Ernest, in a letter: "It was a great event this year and his success makes Clarence already a marked man. Should he win in the intercollegiate where he represents the University by virtue of his present victory, it would be one of the highest honors of university life." (Ernest McCartney, Letter dated March 29, 1900, Macartney Files.)

me through my paces in the court room of the Dane County Court House.⁵⁴

But first prize was won by an orator from Northwestern University. Macartney was given second place and would apparently have taken first place but for one judge who gave him sixth place on manuscript.⁵⁵ How keenly he felt that defeat is seen from his sister's description: "He was trudging home through a blizzard, his hat drawn over his face, 'Napolean retreating from Moscow,' was his laconic comment. He already had, and always preserved, a Napoleonic complex."⁵⁶ In a letter written to his parents following the contest he developed analogically the theme of his "Waterloo."

The battle is over; the wounded have been taken to the rear; the dead are buried. The Grand Guard has made its last stand. Waterloo has been fought and won! But the victory should have been mine. Already I had despatched a courier to Paris, telling of victory. But alas! Blucher appeared in the person of a judge from Indiana. Even then, I had hopes of victory. I ordered Ney's horse to charge, but my splendid squadrons went down to death on the sunken road of Ohain. So here I sit on my island rock, fighting the battle over again, and wondering why it rained, and why I overlooked the sunken road.⁵⁷

In spite of his disappointing defeat at this time, Macartney always recalled with pleasure his association with the great "Progressives" of his day. These contacts, however, did not deter him from voting against them on the occasion of his first exercise of the right of franchise. He wrote his parents:

Today, for the first time, I exercise my right as a citizen of the best, the noblest, the freest nation on earth. I feel for the

⁵⁴The Making of a Minister, p. 110.

⁵⁵LaFollette expressed his disapprobation of the verdict: "Macartney, the man who gave you sixth place was either a knave or a fool." Ibid., p. 111.

⁵⁶Guerard notes, p. 28.

⁵⁷The Making of a Minister, p. 111.

first time what it means to be a citizen of the great republic. . . . I expect to vote the Republican ticket. The choice of one's political party is a serious matter. I think that I have chosen the right one: the party which came into being that slavery might be abolished, and which, ever since, has stood for the best government, the truest liberty, and the highest statesmanship.⁵⁸

Although politically conservative, Macartney's attitude toward religion at this time is summarized by his sister:

The trend of thought at both Pomona and Wisconsin . . . was decidedly not rigorously orthodox. . . . In Madison Clarence showed again his desire for independence from the family. He was not much attracted by the Presbyterian church, and frequently attended the Congregationalist, where the minister held decidedly advanced views. These views, at the time, were in accord with his own trend of thought. . . . His graduating thesis on Byron's Cain had in it a note of pessimism, despair and unbelief. After reading this thesis, I remonstrated with him on his attitude toward revealed religion. His reply was striking, in the light of his later development: "It is all very well if you can believe those things: I cannot." At that time he had, I think, no thought of entering the Christian ministry.⁵⁹

Macartney himself, commenting retrospectively on his questioning mood of those days, confessed that, "Some of the doubts--looking back now I feel it more correct to say, conceits--which enter the minds of young men leaving the university affected me."⁶⁰

Upon graduating, still unsettled as to career, Macartney took tentative steps in the direction of the teaching profession. He armed himself with letters of recommendation from some of his professors and with a letter from LaFollette, now governor of Wisconsin. Excerpts from these letters appear below:⁶¹

⁵⁸Clarence Macartney letter, dated November 4, 1900, Macartney Files.

⁵⁹Guerard Notes, p. 32.

⁶⁰"Warm Hearts and Steady Faith," op. cit., p. 316.

⁶¹The letters, in the order in which they appear, are dated, January 14, 1902; January 14, 1902; January 9, 1902, and March 6, 1902. Macartney Files.

From the Governor:

The bearer of this letter, Mr. Clarence Edward Macartney, is a young man whose acquaintance I made during his residence in Madison as a student at the University of Wisconsin. I know the record which he has made as a student, and through personal contact became acquainted more particularly with the extent of his literary education and with his abilities as a writer and speaker. I know Mr. Macartney to be a young man of exceptional ability in literary work, a clear, logical thinker, and a good writer. He is a man of good habits, industrious, and of unquestioned integrity.

Jennie H. Butt, Instructor in Oratory and Elocution:

As a student at the University of Wisconsin his work was strong along many lines, but his special liking and aptitude for Oratory and Elocution together with powers of application made him the conspicuous leader in the department with which I am connected. . . . As a student he had considerable experience in coaching Wisconsin's orators and debaters. . . .

Alexander Kerr, Professor of Greek:

He showed a decided aptitude for the classics by the rank which he took in reading with me the Greek Orators and Dramatic Poets. In English composition and Oratory he had no superior among the undergraduates attending the University of Wisconsin during the period of his college course.

M. S. Slaughter, Professor of Latin:

While in the University he took high rank in his work, particularly in English and Oratory. He also did work of a high grade in History and Latin, and it is in these subjects that he proposes to teach.

A Year of Indecision

Despite these impressive credentials, however, the sought-after position did not materialize. He informed his sister in a letter written in February of 1902: "Your Teacher's agencies are good for nothing. I received notice of a vacancy from each of the Agencies, but in neither case was I successful in my application."⁶²

The problem of a life work for Clarence now became a matter of

⁶²Letter dated February 7, 1902; cited as a footnote in The Making of a Minister, p. 116, by the manuscript editor.

deep concern for the entire family: "The question of a career was . . . foremost in all our minds."⁶³ All were apparently hopeful that he would choose the ministry in spite of the fact that he had clearly communicated his disinclination toward that calling. His mother wrote to her son, Robertson: "I never knew anyone who was so clearly marked for the pulpit as Clarence, if only the Lord would put grace in his heart."⁶⁴

Robertson, in turn, wrote a long letter to his brother, Clarence, in which he described with enthusiasm the excitement of a single day's activity in the ministry, concluding on a note of encouragement: "May God bless you, my dear brother, and guide you in this trying time of uncertainty as to your life work. Do not worry and do not grow anxious. In years to come it will all seem wonderful in the way you have been led and guided."⁶⁵

Nor was the subject long absent from his own mind. Visiting with a member of the family on the steps of Fern Cliffe, Macartney arose suddenly and exclaimed half-facetiously, "What shall it be? journalism, the stage, grand opera, or Paris green?" When the ministry was suggested, he replied, "oh, Ab (Albert, his next oldest brother who was in theological training at the time) has spoiled that for me."⁶⁶ (The need for autonomy was apparently an overriding one at this point!)

The restlessness of spirit upon him during this period is seen from a chronological account of his peregrinations after his graduation

⁶³Guerard notes, p. 34.

⁶⁴The Making of a Minister, p. 119.

⁶⁵Letter dated February 9, 1902. Cited in The Making of a Minister, p. 117, in an editorial footnote by the manuscript editor.

⁶⁶Guerard notes, p. 34.

in June of 1901:⁶⁷

1) To Harvard armed with a letter of introduction from his English professor at the University of Wisconsin. He forsook Harvard, however, before attending the first class.

2) To Scotland to visit relatives, his mother's birthplace, and other places associated with his mother's family.

3) To Edinburgh with the intent of studying for a degree. He left after attending one lecture.

4) A tour of London and Westminster Abbey.

5) On to Paris, which seemed to him "rather dull and flat."⁶⁸

6) Back to America and Beaver Falls late that year, where, in the Spring of the following year he began work as a reporter on the county newspaper, The Beaver Times.⁶⁹

7) After his summer's work on the paper, to Yale Divinity School, where he matriculated.⁷⁰ He attended one class, then packed his bag and "retreated to Princeton," where he entered the junior class of the Theological Seminary.

⁶⁷See The Making of a Minister, chapter XI, and Guerard notes, pp. 36f.

⁶⁸Except for Napoleon's tomb, where he "looked down upon the red granite coffin of the great conqueror, with the sunlight pouring through the golden windows as if to reflect the effulgence of eternal fame." The Making of a Minister, p. 115.

⁶⁹Of this experience he said, "Newspaper reporting taught me to be clear and lucid in what I wrote, and also that the drama of human life is always interesting. If in any way my pulpit preaching and my writing have been clear or interesting, I owe much of that to my newspaper experience." Ibid., p. 118.

⁷⁰But why Yale? "Partly, perhaps, because my brother was already at Princeton and partly because of a degree of something akin to revolt against the orthodox position, a state of mind not uncommon in men just out of college." Ibid., p. 119.

Princeton Seminary

Of his eventual decision to enroll at Princeton Seminary,

Macartney wrote:

I have never doubted for a moment that it was the hand of the Lord that led me past the gates of Harvard, Yale, Edinburgh, the newspaper office, and the professor's chair to the halls of Princeton Seminary. "There is a divinity that shapes our ends."⁷¹

The period of indecision was over:

Princeton Theological Seminary, with its grand and ancient tradition of a stalwart defense of the truth, and of the glory of the Christian revelation, was the right thing for me. I had found my true place. Henceforth, there was no wavering; no halting between two opinions, but straight forward towards the goal.⁷²

Under the influence of the "stalwart," scholarly defenders of the orthodox Christian faith who staffed the Princeton Seminary faculty, Macartney became grounded in a life philosophy from which he never wavered. Of his instructors here he wrote, "There were some remarkable personalities on the seminary faculty in my day."⁷³ Among those he noted particularly were: Dr. John DeWitt, Professor of Church History and his successor, "the scholarly and brilliant Dr. [Frederick W.] Loetscher [who] did more than any other to open for me the thrill, romance and majesty of the long history of the Christian Church. This proved to be of the highest importance for me in my work as a minister."⁷⁴ He mentioned also Dr. Benjamin Warfield,⁷⁵ professor of

⁷¹Ibid., p. 120.

⁷²Ibid.

⁷³Ibid., p. 124.

⁷⁴Ibid.

⁷⁵According to one authority in Presbyterian Church history, Warfield "dominated the seminary from his coming to the faculty in 1887 until his death in 1921. He was perhaps the country's most scholarly--and most unyielding--opponent of the so-called liberal theology." Lefferts A. Loetscher, The Broadening Church. (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 1957), p. 136.

Systematic Theology; Dr. Robert Dick Wilson, Professor of Old Testament; and Dr. Francis L. Patton, president of the Seminary.⁷⁶ A visiting lecturer, Dr. David J. Burrell, at the peak of his career as minister of the Marble Collegiate Church, Fifth Avenue, New York, lectured every Monday on homiletics. "Two things he sank into us," Macartney said, "first, a clear outline; second, to preach without notes."⁷⁷

The seminary faculty, of course, was pledged to promote the purposes of the institution as declared by the General Assembly of the church and outlined in the seminary's catalog, from which the following paragraph is drawn:

It [the design of the seminary] is to form men for the gospel ministry who shall truly believe, and cordially love, and therefore endeavour to propagate and defend, in its genuineness, simplicity and fullness, that system of religious belief and practice which is set forth in the Confession of Faith, Catechisms, and Plan of Government and Discipline of the Presbyterian Church; and thus to perpetuate and extend the influence of true evangelical piety and gospel order.⁷⁸

The basic presupposition of the divine inspiration and inerrancy of the Bible is reflected in the course content, which was heavily weighted with courses designed to fit the student for the exposition and defense of the Bible and the orthodox Christian faith. The catalog of Macartney's period of enrollment gives the following survey of the course outlined:

The Junior Class averages each week of the session five exercises in Hebrew, one-half in Introduction to the Old Testament, one and a half in Old Testament History, one in Introduction to the New Testament, one in Exegesis of Paul's Epistles, two in Didactic

⁷⁶The Making of a Minister, pp. 124ff.

⁷⁷Ibid., p. 129.

⁷⁸"The Design of the Seminary," Catalogue of the Theological Seminary of the Presbyterian Church located at Princeton, N.J., 1904-1905, p. 33.

Theology, two in Theism, one in Apologetics, one in Homiletics and one in Elocution.

The Middle Class has one exercise and a half a week in Introduction to the Old Testament, one and a half in Exegesis of the Psalms, two in Biblical Theology of the Old Testament, two in the Life of Christ and Exegesis of the Gospels, three in Church History, two in Didactic Theology, one in Evidences of Christianity, two in Homiletics and Church Government, one in Elocution and on alternate years one in Missions.

The Senior Class has one exercise a week in Introduction of the Old Testament and one in Exegesis of the Prophets, two in Apostolic History and Exegesis of Acts and the Epistles, two in Biblical Theology of the New Testament, three in Church History, two in Didactic Theology, two in Christian Ethics and Christian Sociology, two in Homiletic and Pastoral Theology, one in Elocution, and on alternate years one in Missions.⁷⁹

Successful completion of the three year course, according to the catalog, entitled one to a certificate of graduation. With a fourth year of graduate study one could earn the Bachelor of Divinity degree.

Students with a satisfactory pre-seminary background were permitted to take elective courses at Princeton University which would lead to a Master's degree from the University.

Macartney earned the certificate of graduation from the seminary as well as a Master's degree in English literature from Princeton University during his three year academic career at Princeton.

Macartney threw himself wholeheartedly into the task of preparation for the Christian ministry. A classmate of Princeton days, Dr. Oswald T. Allis, submits the following reminiscence:

I recall one spring day near the end of our first year seeing two distinguished looking gentlemen sallying forth from Hodge Hall on their way to preaching appointments on the following Sabbath day. Their black tail coats, high hats and patent leather shoes were such a contrast to the rather careless apparel ordinarily worn about the campus that I remember being quite impressed.

The two gentlemen were Macartney and his brother, Albert. Allis

⁷⁹Ibid., p. 38. The Elocutionary emphasis in speech instruction of the latter half of the nineteenth century is reflected here as well.

commented, "For Clarence Macartney, the work of the pulpit and the thought of the pastorate was preeminent from the beginning."⁸⁰

Others would later recall their impressions of Dr. Macartney as a student preacher. The twenty-fifth anniversary of his pastorate in Pittsburgh was commemorated by special services at which time the only surviving teacher of his seminary career, Dr. F. W. Loetscher, preached the sermon. He observed:

I have known Dr. Macartney for almost fifty years. I remember his general excellence as a student at Princeton Seminary, and I recall the quite unusual commendation bestowed upon his class sermon by the then professor of homiletics, an augury and a pledge, events have proved, of his exceptional gifts as a preacher.⁸¹

Another classmate, Dr. Frederick W. Evans, who like Macartney, was later elected to the post of Moderator of the General Assembly, declared on the same occasion:

If during our senior year, when all these embryo preachers had tried, before a very critical audience, their sermonic wings, a ballot had been taken as to who was the best preacher and most likely to succeed, I believe that C.E.M. would have had every vote save one.⁸²

A Wisconsin Village

Upon completing his first school year at the Seminary, Macartney accepted an invitation to act as supply preacher for a small Presbyterian church at Prairie du Sac, Wisconsin, an experience of two successive summers which greatly augmented his seminary training.

Macartney said of his first sermon preached from this pulpit:

⁸⁰Dr. Oswald T. Allis, "Greetings," First Church Life, op. cit., p. 34.

⁸¹Frederick W. Loetscher, "A Notable Tribute," ibid., p. 9.

⁸²Dr. Frederick W. Evans, "Greetings," ibid., p. 37.

. . . I knew my sermon thoroughly; yet I took the manuscript with me into the pulpit, and although I never referred to it, the very fact that it was there seemed to chain me to the pulpit. I resolved to try it without a manuscript. . . . Since then, I have never taken a manuscript or notes of any kind into the pulpit.⁸³

It was in this village church that Macartney learned the appeal of biographical preaching, which was to become his specialty. Having few books with him, and with no library facilities available, the young preacher quickly exhausted his supply of sermon materials and illustrations. He later observed that had it not been for the Old Testament characters, he would have had to declare "pulpit bankruptcy"; but the Biblical characters--Joseph, Abraham, Jacob, David, Solomon, Samuel, Saul, Ruth, and others--saved the day. "That experience taught me the appeal of biographical preaching," he explained, "and thus opened for me a rich pulpit vein which I am still working."⁸⁴

Macartney viewed the experience of those two summers as "an invaluable preparation" for his future work. "There I came in close touch with the joys, the trials, the sorrows, and the beautiful affection of the common people. There I heard, and have never forgotten, the deep, glad, sad, sweet music of the human heart."⁸⁵

During his senior year at Princeton, the Prairie du Sac church, pleased with his work as supply preacher, extended a call to Macartney to serve them as regular pastor. But the First Presbyterian Church of the "big, turbulent, smoking, half-foreign," industrial center of Paterson, New Jersey, had also made its bid. At the advice of his friend and homiletics teacher, Dr. Burrell, the call to Paterson was

⁸³The Making of a Minister, p. 130.

⁸⁴Ibid., p. 131.

⁸⁵Ibid., p. 133.

accepted.⁸⁶

One might say at this point that as far as background, home training, and formal education were concerned, the making of a minister was finished; although, as he acknowledged, "In a certain sense, my preparation for the work of the ministry was just beginning."⁸⁷

Paterson to Pittsburgh

Formative Experiences

If home influences and the impact of the Princeton theologians ranked high as shaping forces, the years 1905 to 1914 with the Paterson church certainly laid the foundation for the methods and performance of Macartney's future ministry. The formative influence of the Paterson years is referred to by Dr. David Carlough, in whose home bachelor Macartney lived during a large portion of that time:

We still consider him one of the family. Even to this day in our home we set apart as "the Prophet's Chamber," that study where he made such diligent use of the opportunities afforded him for quiet study and acquired that careful, painstaking, methodical and scholarly habit of thinking and working that has served him so well in his long and useful ministry. Here in those formative years he devoured and assimilated the English classics (not neglecting Mr. Addison and the Spectator) and built up his reference file. Here he perfected that remarkable felicity in expression, becoming a master in the use of words. "None could weave them into more royal webs."⁸⁸

Macartney listed several characteristic features of his later ministry which were developed and perfected in Paterson:

It was there I learned to preach without notes. It was there I discovered the rich treasures of Old Testament preaching, and how,

⁸⁶Ibid., p. 135

⁸⁷Ibid.

⁸⁸Dr. David Carlough, "A Son of the Manse," Beta Theta Pi LXXIII, (July, 1946), 462.

as Beecher once put it, "The Old Testament will never be worn out until the heavens are worn out and men no more need to understand God." There, too, I discovered that biographical preaching, the great lives of the Bible, has a timeless appeal. There, too, I commenced to strike out along the line of what once was called "apologetic" preaching.⁸⁹

In Paterson, Macartney began his search for ways to broaden the appeal of the church's ministry. He experimented successfully with a Sunday evening service on the lawn directed to those passing along main street before the church--anticipating, perhaps, the great street meetings gathered about the street pulpit in front of "First Church" in Pittsburgh. Here also, he served his apprenticeship in preaching to men by conducting a weekly noon-day service at the car barns for the men of the street railway system.

In Paterson, Macartney developed further his interest in Civil War history, often spending his vacation periods traversing the battlefields of that war. "The minister," he suggested, "ought to give careful thought to his vacation period, lest the time be spent without profit."⁹⁰

The practice of diligent pastoral visitation which Macartney was to observe throughout his ministry was established in the Paterson church. He aimed at calling at every home in his parish at least once annually. It was here that he attended his first deathbed, that of a young woman. When entering the room, he stood somewhat apart and began his prayer; but the mother, sitting at the bedside, interrupted him saying, "Come a little closer, Mr. Macartney." Concerning the incident, Macartney wrote:

⁸⁹Macartney, "Warm Hearts and Steady Faith," p. 316.

⁹⁰The Making of a Minister, p. 162.

I have never forgotten that, and it taught me at the very beginning to try to come close to the sorrows and burdens of my people. . . . The public thinks of the minister chiefly in the pulpit; but often it will not be in the pulpit, but in the sick chamber and by the side of the dying that he will do his chief ministry. . . .⁹¹

In Paterson he had his first introduction to the wiles and ruses of the panhandler. He observed that if he had helped as many people to heaven as to New York, his ministry would not be without fruit. On the tenth anniversary of his ordination, he preached a sermon in the course of which he said a word regarding the kind of appeals a minister receives and the many imposters who come to him for help. He remarked, "When I get a word in my study that a strange man wants to see me, I lay aside my wallet and go down; but if it is a woman, I put on the whole armor of God and go down."⁹²

And Still a Bachelor

Macartney's continued celibacy as he entered the prime of his manhood and ministry became increasingly a matter of concern and speculation among interested friends. He himself apparently demonstrated a frustrating lack of concern. The women in his life were his mother, to whom he was deeply devoted, an only sister who "mothered" him, and a niece with whom he frequently traveled in later years.

This is not to say that he did not demonstrate a normal--if somewhat timid and reserved--interest in members of the opposite sex. The subject is a frequently-recurring one in the biographical notes of his sister. The impression given is one of frequent last-minute interventions of fate--a sudden death, or the meddling of an over-anxious mother at the inopportune moment. With each passing year, the scholarly

⁹¹Ibid., p. 145.

⁹²Ibid., p. 142.

young cleric seemed to become more content with his lot as a celibate.

Perhaps the point-of-no-return was reached soon after leaving Paterson. A promising development involved a daughter of the Patton family, then associated with the University of Pennsylvania. Mrs. Guerard reports the following turn of events:

His years as a bachelor had led him into habits of absorption and absent-mindedness. A day at the Yale-Princeton football game was arranged; the trip on the train was full of fun and frolic. However, as they were walking toward the stadium, Clarence became more and more absorbed in thought. Mildred Patton had great difficulty in keeping up with his stride. Great was her amazement when, on reaching the gate, Clarence, who of course had the tickets, walked in without her. "I am sure he forgot my very existence," she told me.⁹³

Their friendship survived, according to Mrs. Guerard; but she added significantly, "it could not grow into a permanent bond."

Macartney's brother, Robertson, put the matter briefly:

"Clarence never ventured out upon the sea of matrimony. Although in all fairness it must be said that he loved to stroll along the shores."⁹⁴

Arch Street Church, Philadelphia

Macartney's work in Paterson began to attract the attention of larger congregations. He had more than doubled the membership of a church whose property a few years before had been on the market. Invitations from three important congregations were rejected,⁹⁵ but in 1914 came the call which he could not ignore--a call to the Arch Street Presbyterian Church, a beautiful temple of Corinthian architecture in the heart of Philadelphia. Here he reached "the full stature of the

⁹³Guerard notes, pp. 42f.

⁹⁴Dr. J. Robertson Macartney, "A Great Man in Israel Has Fallen," First Church Life, Memorial edition, April, 1957, p. 42.

⁹⁵The Making of a Minister, p. 168.

mature preacher."⁹⁶

In Philadelphia his sermons again attracted wide interest, especially among the university and medical students. It was the response of two medical students which led him to repeat each autumn his sermon on opportunity, "Come Before Winter," first delivered in 1915.

At the height of the doctrinal controversy of the 'twenties,⁹⁷ Macartney began a series of sermons of an apologetic nature on the cardinal doctrines of the Christian faith. He wrote of that experience:

Through this long doctrinal series in Philadelphia, and when I frequently preached for an hour, the large Sunday night congregations filled the church. . . . My experience in this field of preaching convinced me anew that there is nothing so interesting to the great number of people as the great doctrines of the Christian faith, and nothing which comes closer to men's hearts and consciences.⁹⁸

Macartney's extraordinary success in calling out large audiences for evening services was noted editorially in The Presbyterian. The editor recalled surveying the records of the usher's book at the Arch Street Church during Dr. Macartney's pastorate:

We remember noting how the evening audiences steadily grew over a period of ten years at the rate of an average of one hundred each year. The last figure in the series was for a June Sabbath night of a certain year, and it was just over 1,000. Ten years before that date the number present was under one hundred.⁹⁹

Macartney's successful pastorate in Philadelphia and his leadership of the conservative forces in the fundamentalist-modernist

⁹⁶J. Clyde Henry, "A Messenger of Grace," Princeton Seminary Bulletin, L (May, 1957), 21.

⁹⁷See Chapter III for a discussion of Macartney's role in the fundamentalist-modernist controversy.

⁹⁸The Making of a Minister, p. 180.

⁹⁹"Revive, Revivify the Evening Service," The Presbyterian, LXIII, (November 18, 1943), 3.

controversy in the early 'twenties culminating in his election as Moderator of the General Assembly in 1924, brought his name to the attention of important Presbyterian congregations. The call to the New York Avenue Presbyterian Church in Washington, D. C. was at first accepted, then declined. A little later, however, came a call over which there was little indecision.

Call to Pittsburgh

When early in 1927 the historic First Presbyterian Church of Pittsburgh called Macartney to fill the pulpit from which the popular Dr. Maitland Alexander was retiring, no man could have asked for a better build-up from the press.

The Pittsburgh Press carried two successive feature stories "by way of introducing to Pittsburgh" Dr. Clarence Macartney. The reporter, who interviewed Macartney in Philadelphia for his articles, wrote:

He will "wear well" as a pastor, a teacher, a friend, and a man. There may be no whirlwind welcome, but after he has been active in the local church for a few months all Pittsburgh will realize that he has become a positive, forceful, definite, and progressive factor in . . . the city.¹⁰⁰

The article then proceeded to describe the man who was coming to them as "five feet nine inches tall, [weighing] 158 pounds, smooth shaven and his black hair thinning slightly at the top."

Another paper, The Pittsburgh Post, undertook to inform its readers as to what the "unseen Macartney" (as compared to the public battler for fundamentalism) was like.

What does the champion of fundamentalism do when away from his arena?

He takes plenty of physical, mental and spiritual exercise . . .

¹⁰⁰The Pittsburgh Press, February 11, 1927, p. 30.

his day usually is started with a brisk walk from home to the parish house adjoining the church near the center of the city. Near the church is the Central Y.M.C.A., where a workout in the gym or a plunge in the swimming pool helps to keep the physical man in trim. . . . Shelves filled with books reaching to the ceiling cover the walls of his study. Others are stacked about in convenient places.¹⁰¹

The reporter then suggests that a bachelor set in the midst of a room filled with books, who takes his exercise regularly might be a cold-blooded thinking machine without the human touch,--to which he replied, "If a pastor who regularly visits on a year each of his 700 members, in addition to his sick calls, who ventures out at midnight into the night life of a big city can be called cold-blooded then Dr. Macartney is a cold-blooded bachelor." The reference is to Macartney's experience of studying the night life of Philadelphia in the company of a police officer. From the information gathered, he had drawn a series of sermons entitled "Midnight Walks in Philadelphia."

Macartney, then, came well-recommended to his Pittsburgh congregation, at the height of his powers, bringing to the task an experienced, mature, and finely trained instrument of service. Here, until his retirement almost twenty-seven years later, he served with distinction.¹⁰²

.

From this survey of biographical matters pertinent to an understanding of Macartney's background and preparation for preaching prior to his Pittsburgh assignment, the study proceeds next to an examination of the times in which, and to which, he spoke.

¹⁰¹The Pittsburgh Pennsylvania Post, February 13, 1927, p. 8.

¹⁰²See Chapter IV for a discussion of Macartney's relationship to The First Presbyterian Church of Pittsburgh.

CHAPTER II

THE MOOD AND MIND OF MACARTNEY'S WORLD

Recognizing that oratory cannot be divorced from the social context in which it operates, speech critics have held that a reliable judgment of a public speech will have involved a serious attempt to determine the nature of the historical setting in which the speaker operated and the meaning of the events from which his speaking issued. "Rhetoric and history, age-old partners, cannot be divorced. The critic of speeches knows that their union is indissoluble."¹

Speaker and audience alike are conditioned by the times; and if, as Aristotle indicated, the hearers are the most important aspects of the speech situation, largely determining the speaker's objectives, then, certainly the composite influence of the happenings of the past which the audience brings to the speech situation must be understood if the critic is to evaluate the speaker's adaptation of ideas to his listeners.

The rhetorical critic accepts at the outset the impossibility of attaining a totality of historical data. Nevertheless, having made this concession to the limitations of his task, he proceeds under the assumption that he can recreate a workable and representative context reasonably faithful to the total pattern. "In order to appreciate the design of a fabric, it is not necessary to examine every thread."² More

¹Lester Thonssen and A. Craig Baird, Speech Criticism (New York: The Ronald Press Company, 1948) p. 315.

²Ibid., p. 318.

selective than the general historian, he discards some of the data as not contributing directly to his enterprise while searching out other data having "rhetorical" significance.

In this study, Dr. Clarence Macartney is viewed as a prime example of an exponent of traditional Christian orthodoxy³ in the first half of twentieth-century America. Preaching is assumed to be an important function in the conservation and extension of the Christian ethos. It has been postulated that many leading beliefs and values of Western culture come from Christianity and form part of the basic moral awareness even of those members of society who do not consider themselves churchmen or Christians.⁴ Granting this assumption, the reconstruction of a meaningful historical context for a religious speaker in America would necessarily bring into focus the changing climate of ideas and values of such a society. It would certainly include an assessment of the theological milieu.

However, as Bury reminds us, historical events "are parts of a whole. . . ."⁵ A leading student of American religious history comments on the interrelationship of theological and political unrest:

At no period in the history of American Christianity has there been more rapid change in the theological scene than has been

³The expression, "traditional orthodoxy" is elaborated in later paragraphs of this chapter.

⁴Arnold J. Toynbee declares that three hundred years after the challenge of Descartes, Christianity "was still being . . . inhaled by every Western man and woman with the air they breathed. . . . The Christian virus or elixir is in our Western blood." A Study of History, Abridged by D. C. Somervell (New York: Oxford University Press, 1954), Vol. 1, pp. 400f. James Sellers suggests that all members of Western society are in a sense "Christians by osmosis." The Outsider and the Word of God (New York: Abingdon Press, 1961), p. 15.

⁵J. D. Bury, The Ancient Greek Historians (New York: Macmillan Company, 1909), p. 250.

witnessed within the past generation. The principal reason for this fact is the radical revolutionary changes which have been taking place in the whole political, economic, social and religious climate of the world. For after all, theology is not final truth handed down from above, but grows out of man's condition; it comes out of a human background.⁶

In this chapter the creation of such an historical context for the preaching of Dr. Clarence Macartney is attempted, with particular emphasis on the changing intellectual and theological scene. Consideration is given to the social, political, economic, and cultural conditions as they provide that "human background" against which we must view the mind and mood of the times. The chapter is organized as follows: A section deals with the historical antecedents of the twentieth century. The first fifty years of the century are then examined under three general divisions, (1) the Age of Reform, (2) Years of Confusion and Disillusionment, and (3) the Age of Anxiety.

Historical Antecedents

The Christian Heritage

The cultural roots of America go back to Europe, the preponderance of early settlement being British, with German, French, Dutch, and Swedish minorities. This European heritage includes the great cultural and religious tradition of Western Christendom. Commager has noted that the Christian tradition, introduced by the first comers, reinforced by nearly all their European successors, and perpetuated by conscious effort, was the chief foundation stone of American intellectual development.

This religious faith was overwhelmingly Protestant and of the

⁶William Warren Sweet, The Story of Religion in America (New York: Harpers and Brothers Publishers, 1930), p. 584.

⁷Henry Steele Commager, The American Mind (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1950), p. 50.

Calvinistic-Reformed variety. Roman Catholicism came much later as an effective influence on the common life and national character. On this point Marty has observed:

Insofar as organized religion was represented in the great central events that shaped America and have become part of its mystic inner core, Protestantism dominated. Most of the permanent colonization of the original states was done by Protestants; many of the contributors (by necessity or by choice) to religious freedom were Protestants; the westward movement and the propagation of the gospel on the frontier were largely led by Protestants.⁸

At the dawning of the nineteenth century most American Christians still held to the traditional faith. Osborn describes this traditional orthodoxy as follows:

They believed in Almighty God, in salvation from sin and hell to righteousness and heaven, through the death of Jesus Christ, revealed as the incarnate Son of God in an inspired Bible.⁹

Throughout the nineteenth century there arose a series of protests against the doctrines of Calvinism. Methodists, Unitarians, Universalists, Transcendentalists, General Baptists, and others called into question one phase of Calvinism or another. Nevertheless, as the century drew to a close, however they may have interpreted the doctrine of predestination, most American Christians subscribed to the traditional orthodoxy--believing in an infallible Bible, practicing a pietistic type of devotion, observing such requirements of Puritan morality as Sunday-keeping and total abstinence, and rejoicing in the success of revivalists. A Christian faith centered in the Bible and a community life presided over by the church, constituted the supreme religious values of our civilization, a civilization which was dominated by the outlook and

⁸Martin E. Marty, The New Shape of American Religion (New York: Harper and Brothers Publishers, 1958), p. 4.

⁹Ronald E. Osborn, The Spirit of American Christianity (New York: Harper and Brothers Publishers, 1958), p. 146.

customs of rural America. In the words of one observer:

American life as long as it was preponderantly rural had been simple, laborious (it had to be), "Sabbath-keeping" (men, women and horses welcomed Sunday), religious (religion began, in part, as an affair with seasons, fields, and the hearth-stone) and puritanical.
 . . .¹⁰

All this, he adds, began to be changed by the end of the century.

The Modern Era

The decade of the 1890's has been described as "the watershed of American history."¹¹ On the one side lies an America predominantly agricultural, an America still largely in the making physically and socially, still operating on the political, economic, moral, and intellectual heritage of the seventeenth and eighteenth centuries--self-confident, self-contained, and conscious of a unique character and destiny. On the other side lies modern America, predominantly urban and industrial, no longer exclusively concerned with domestic problems, but involved in world economy and politics, experiencing profound changes in population, economy, and technology, and trying to accommodate its traditional institutions and modes of thought to the rapidly changing conditions.

Pointing out that "with the decade of the nineties--or roughly from the mid-eighties to the Spanish War--the new America came in as on flood tide,"¹² Commager includes among the phenomena of the changing scene, the passing of the old West, the disappearance of the frontier line, the decline of the cattle kingdoms, the completion of the trans-

¹⁰Gaius Glenn Atkins, Religion in Our Times (New York: Round Table Press, Inc., 1932), p. 44.

¹¹Commager, op. cit., p. 41.

¹²Ibid., p. 44.

continental railroads, and the final territorial organization of the trans-Mississippi area. He notes a dangerous acceleration of the exploitation of natural resources by the great corporations, the rising power of trusts and monopolies, the rise of big business, and the transfer of the center of economic and political gravity from country to city.

Urbanization.--The rapid urbanization of the nation during the past century changed the quality of American life. In 1870 little more than one-fifth of the country's population lived in urban areas; by 1890 the proportion had risen to more than one-third. By 1950 only one sixth of the people were left on the farms.¹³ Urbanization made for a higher degree of sophistication; as a concomitant of industrialization it also created new problems in society. Its effect on church attendance, preaching, worship, sacred music, and church architecture has been profound, as well as upon an increased Christian concern for social questions.¹⁴

Immigration.--As the nineteenth century drew to a close, there was a shift from the "old" to the "new" immigration. Problems of assimilation accentuated by differences in racial origins and cultural and religious traditions resulted. The most abundant sources of immigration now shifted to the predominantly Catholic areas of Southern and Eastern Europe. Two sizable new elements--Jews and Eastern Orthodox--joined the Catholic influx. The changing nature of immigration so alarmed those older-type Americans who preferred to have fellow citizens

¹³Clifton E. Olmstead, A History of Religion in the United States (Englewood Cliffs, N.J.: Prentice-Hall, Inc., 1960), p. 475.

¹⁴The rise of the "social gospel" will be discussed in the following section.

like themselves that restrictive laws were passed, such as the legislation of 1924, which set quotas based on proportions prevailing in the population in 1890.

As the proportionate strength of Roman Catholicism increased, the American spirit became less Puritan and more complex. The old religious mores, while persisting into the twentieth century among Christians of the Reformed tradition, ceased to dominate social behavior. A non-Puritan pluralism was rising as the dominating ethos.

Changes in the intellectual climate.--Not only were these transition years in the American social order or in the arenas of politics and economy, they were years of change in the intellectual climate as well. Not since the 1840's had there been such a ferment in the intellectual world and such a critical scrutiny of the established institutions and traditional philosophies. The neat and orderly universe bequeathed by the Enlightenment--a universe governed by discoverable and predictable laws--was disintegrating under the blows of Darwinian evolution and the new science.

Evolution was a concept that organized around itself some of the most characteristic ideas and moods of the late nineteenth century. Two examples are cited: the mood of internationalism and the philosophies of the time which emphasized man's natural ability and interpreted history in terms of progress.

The new internationalism.--With the changing conditions of national life at the close of the century, a groundswell of imperialistic ambition swept the country. Olmstead suggests that this crusading internationalism found philosophical support in the idealistic philosophies of the time which emphasized man's natural ability and interpreted history in terms of progress. "Darwinism," he observes,

seemed to support expansion through the survival of the fittest doctrine, which was readily translated by Americans into the thought that by natural selection the United States had become a superior nation destined to rule the weaker peoples of the world.¹⁵

He sees the gradually mounting enthusiasm of the churches for missions in the latter third of the nineteenth century as a product of the national expansionist sentiment.¹⁶

The idea of the inevitability of progress.--The doctrine of the inevitability of progress and its corollary, the perfectibility of man, became an accepted axiom of the times. Bury notes that "in the seventies and eighties of the last century the idea of progress was becoming a general article of faith," and that the dogma of "indefinite Progress" was a "generally assumed axiom."¹⁷

The nineteenth century, with its increasing developments in the field of discovery and invention, provided added impetus to the idea; but the capstone to the doctrine of progress and the perfectibility of man was placed by Darwin in 1859 when he published his epochal work, Origin of Species. His book came at the psychological moment to provide Herbert Spencer, the great philosopher of evolution, apparent scientific support for his philosophical views. Bury declares:

The receptive attitude of the public towards such a philosophy as Spencer's had been made possible by Darwin's discoveries, which were reinforced by the growing science of palaeontology and the accumulating material evidence of the great antiquity of man. By the simultaneous advances of geology and biology man's perspective in time was revolutionized, just as the Copernican astronomy had revolutionized his perspective in space. Many thoughtful and many thoughtless people were ready to discern--as Huxley suggested--in

¹⁵Olmstead, op. cit., p. 495.

¹⁶Ibid., p. 496.

¹⁷J. D. Bury, The Idea of Progress (London: Macmillan and company, 1921) pp. 346, 348. He wrote before the idea of progress was generally declared bankrupt by later events of the century. It should be noted that this idea seriously challenged the traditional doctrine of man. Instead of a creature born for destruction because of original sin, man was viewed as inherently good and capable of improvement if given opportunity.

man's "long progress through the past, a reasonable ground of faith in his attainment of a nobler future."¹⁸

The mood of optimism.--These philosophical views lent themselves easily to the general mood of optimism. Although a host of social problems of great urgency were spawned by the new industrial age, these difficulties and trends were all considered as but phases of "progress." Americans could hardly help believing in that alluring doctrine after the amazing achievements of a single century. For that matter, Victorian optimism was the mood of the times throughout the civilized world. Not until the twentieth century would the sense of awe and profundity come back into its own when men would see that technology offered menace as well as promise, and that science was raising more questions than it solved.

The church challenged.--It goes without saying that these forces and influences posed a threat to all the old absolutes, including religious certainties. The challenge of the new thought to the church, while less immediate and complex than the new urban, industrial, and corporate order, was certainly more dramatic.

The challenge actually came from several sources almost simultaneously. The works of geologists on the age of the earth provided ammunition for those who wished to challenge those preachers clinging to an infallible book laced up with Bishop Ussher's chronology. The application of scientific principles to the investigation of the Bible, labeled "Higher Criticism," was upsetting cherished notions of its composition and distinctiveness. Anthropological discoveries made it seem that the teachings of the Bible, rather than being uniquely God's Word, were a part of a rather generally diffused human wisdom. The

¹⁸Ibid., p. 342.

evolutionary hypothesis seemed to invalidate the Genesis story.

With the rise of Darwin, Huxley, Spencer, Marx, Nietzsche, and Freud, it seemed that all the old doctrines and certainties were on the defensive. Commager observes:

New developments in astronomy had already made man and his earth of infinitesimal significance. New developments in biology had put him in the animal kingdom. The new doctrine in the psychological field now seemed to make him a creature of blind impulses and automatic responses to stimuli and to rob him of the last remnants of free will and human dignity.¹⁹

The vogue of unlimited progress certainly ran counter to the traditional orthodox view of a fixed universe and an unchangeable human nature.

The nineteenth century, then, bequeathed to twentieth century Christianity a major challenge of adaptation. Atkins suggests a four-fold task:

. . . the adaptation of its inherited faith to the conclusions of science, the critical history and the new psychology; the examination and reinterpretation of its sacred books; the discovery of a changed appeal; the Christian recasting of society.²⁰

The controversies and struggles involved in these adjustments constitute an important aspect of the historical context in which Macartney's speaking must be viewed. "In 1890," comments Atkins,

the "liberal" was debating whether there were two Isaiahs; in 1930 the extreme "modernist" was debating whether there was a personal God. No other four decades, or forty decades either, in the history of Christian thought had seen so many and such momentous changes in fundamental religious attitudes.²¹

An examination in depth of these issues, however, would be beyond the purview of this study. A broadly descriptive treatment will be given rather than a highly analytical one.

.

¹⁹Commager, op. cit., p. 706.

²⁰Atkins, op. cit., p. 46.

²¹Ibid., p. 86.

An organization of the years since 1900 has been suggested by Horton,²² who has divided the history of theological trends into three periods as follows: (1) a period of growing liberalism, roughly from 1900 to 1920; (2) a period of sharp controversy and revolutionary realignment, between 1920 and 1935; (3) a period of constructive restatement, since 1935. Viewing these theological trends as a response to the larger historical setting, one can (without forcing the picture) utilize a similar three-fold division such as is employed below.

The Age of Reform--1900-1920

The opening of the century found the United States strong, prosperous, confident, and in a mood of optimism. The tremendous changes wrought in modern society by industrial growth and the growing absorption of Americans in materialistic values brought concern to the more thoughtful; the American people generally, however, were certain all would be well. Theodore Roosevelt's buoyant declaration that

we think the greatest victories are yet to be won, the greatest deeds yet to be done, and that there are yet in store for our people and the cause that we uphold, grander triumphs than have yet been scored,²³

seemed to exemplify the attitude of the people.

With the re-election of President McKinley in 1900, business and industry were forging ahead with new assurances of freedom for their expanding activities. Good times had returned to the farmer; and even labor could look to a brighter future as the bitter industrial warfare of the 1890's gave way to efforts for co-operation. Dulles refers to

²²Walter M. Horton, "Systematic Theology," Protestant Thought in the Twentieth Century, ed. Arnold S. Nash (New York: Macmillan Company, 1951), p. 105.

²³Quoted by Foster Rhea Dulles, The United States Since 1865 (Ann Arbor: The University of Michigan Press, 1959), p. 178.

W. G. Sumner's characterization of the period: "An air of contentment and enthusiastic cheerfulness characterized the thought and temper of the American people."²⁴

The "Progressive" Movement

The assassination of McKinley in the fall of 1901 set a shocked nation to wondering what might be expected from the young vice-president, Theodore Roosevelt, now assuming the presidency. His installation was to inaugurate a new period in American history that would witness far-reaching changes in the policies for which McKinley had stood.

The period was marked by a shift from the laissez faire philosophy which had prevailed through the nineteenth century, and was to witness Roosevelt's Square Deal and New Nationalism, and Wilson's New Freedom--all antecedents of the later New Deal. The new principles were in a large part those that had been put forward earlier by the populist movement and for which Bryan had campaigned unsuccessfully in 1896. They advocated the acceptance of responsibility on the part of state governments and the national government for more effective regulation of business and industry. The movement was an attack upon privilege and "invisible government"--a campaign to control the railroads, the trusts, and the money power in the national interest.

A beginning was made in municipal reform--in forms of city government, a more efficient handling of traffic and sanitation problems, slum clearance, and low-cost housing, and fire and police protection.

In the sphere of state activity, the Progressives launched a twofold drive to break the power of machine politics and secure the

²⁴Ibid., p. 179.

enactment of needed social legislation. In attacking the "invisible government," they campaigned with success, in state after state, for the secret ballot, direct primaries, the initiative and referendum, and the recall of elected officials.

Advances in social legislation steadily weakened the concept of laissez faire so far as state governments were concerned. Factory codes were stiffened, child labor greatly restricted, maximum working hours for women prescribed in almost every state, workmen's compensation laws enacted, and a beginning was made toward minimum wage legislation.

But municipal and state reforms were only preliminary to what the exponents of Progressivism proposed for the national stage. Under Roosevelt the trust-busting campaign, as it was soon called, awoke great public interest. Steps were taken to break the power of uncontrolled monopoly in American business. In his second term Roosevelt took on the railroads. The Hepburn Act, as his new railroad measure was called, greatly strengthened the position of the Interstate Commerce Commission. Rate reductions were generally sustained by the courts, and many of those abuses in railway management that had first aroused the Grangers thirty years earlier were corrected.

Following the fiasco of the Bull Moose bolt, Roosevelt had the bitter experience of standing aside while a Democratic president carried the progressive movement to fruition and then led the nation into war.

Wilson's New Freedom proposed a number of reforms aimed at freeing the people from the domination of the special interests. He called for the revision of tariff duties, the reform of the banking and currency system, the strengthening of antitrust laws, and passage of labor legislation to satisfy the new needs of the nation's workers. His program may not have differed greatly from the proposals of Roosevelt,

but he was to attain the position which would enable him to carry his ideas into effect.

The basic drive which characterized the Progressive era appeared to have largely spent itself by 1914. Events over which the American people had no control dramatically shifted the focus of public attention from domestic to world affairs. War broke out in Europe, and the United States became increasingly absorbed in what was to prove an unsuccessful attempt to maintain neutrality in the conflict.

A post-war reaction to Wilsonianism undermined some of the gains of the Progressive era. Tariff policies were reversed, the attempt to eliminate monopoly was largely nullified by the administrative policies of the 1920's; nevertheless, the basic principles of the movement never lost their validity. Though laissez faire appeared to receive a new lease on life after World War I, it could never again hold such undisputed sway as it did in the 1890's.

The excitement and optimism of the New Nationalism and the New Freedom gave to the era a unique quality. Characterizing it as "a period of high endeavor and hopeful achievement," Dulles quotes William Allen White:

What a lot of liberty we bought "with lance and torch and tumult" in those days from Roosevelt to Wilson! . . . If ever our land had a noble epoch, America enjoyed it in those days of the Great Rebellion.²⁵

The Social Gospel

There is a general contagion of ideas in any period, a give-and-take controlled by the time-spirit which directs the thinking of an epoch. The heyday of Progressivism in America saw also a swelling

²⁵Ibid., p. 219.

stream of social idealism promoted by the churches.

While Protestant conservatives conceived social progress in terms of organized charities, there was a group of clerical leaders, small at first, that was beginning to ask searching questions about the ethics of the social and economic structure of American life. They made themselves known through a tremendous volume of literature widely circulated; but only gradually did their fellow clergy follow their lead.

Among the forerunners in this new religious emphasis were Washington Gladden, a Congregationalist minister in Columbus, Ohio; Josiah Strong, minister of the Central Congregational Church in Cincinnati; Francis G. Peabody of Harvard; and Walter Rauschenbusch of Rochester Theological Seminary. Gladden exercised a determining influence upon the rising generation of young ministers. Strong popularized the conception of the Kingdom of God as a social ideal, while Rauschenbusch, the chief prophet of the movement, through important books--Christianizing the Social Order, 1912, and A Theology of the Social Gospel, 1917--probably did more than any other single man to carry the social gospel message over to the church as a whole.

The social gospel, associated with the "liberal" movement in theology, began with the central idea that redemption or salvation of mankind collectively, the regeneration of the social order, is the ultimate goal of religion. It proposed that the cause in which the Christian was to lose his life, and thus save it, was in the gradual Christianization of the social order. "The Kingdom of God is humanity organized according to the will of God. . . It implies a progressive reign of love in human affairs."²⁶

²⁶Walter Rauschenbusch, A Theology for the Social Gospel (New York: Macmillan Company, 1917), p. 142.

The concepts of sin and redemption took a radical departure from the traditional orthodox position in this context.²⁷ The major thinkers of the Social Gospel movement viewed sin in primarily "horizontal" terms, in keeping with the growing liberal theology--in terms of selfishness in defiance of neighbor-needs, rather than primarily as the rebellion of the will against the sovereignty of God. The long-established Calvinistic view of man as a fallen creature received amendment to a more favorable estimate of his condition.

A similar rewriting of the traditional Christian philosophy of history took place. Instead of the traditional eschatology looking away from the present "fallen" state of man to a final end brought about by Divine intervention, the eschaton was supplanted by an earthly Kingdom of justice and brotherhood approached progressively through time by gradual continuity on an upward plane. As Beach and Bennett point out, "A Christianized version of the progress philosophy of history, in the name of the Kingdom of God ideal, supplanted orthodox Christian eschatology."²⁸

This Social Gospel movement was rejected by groups with a strong revivalistic emphasis. They held that the principal function of the church was to save men from sin and damnation and prepare them for eternal life in a heavenly kingdom. The movement, however, gained momentum in the prominent evangelical churches such as the Methodist, Baptist, Congregational, Presbyterian, and Disciples, all of which adopted social creeds and established agencies to put them into practice.

²⁷See a discussion of the theology of the social gospel by Waldo Beach and John C. Bennett in Protestant Thought in the Twentieth Century, op. cit., pp. 125ff.

²⁸Ibid., p. 130.

The adoption in 1908 of a Social Creed by the newly founded interdenominational body, the Federal Council of Churches, climaxed this process. The creed, modified four years later, called for equal rights for all men, uniform divorce laws, child labor laws, laws against the liquor traffic, protection for workers in their places of employment, old age benefits, labor arbitration, one day of rest weekly, reduction of working hours, safeguards for the rights of workers, guaranteed living wages, and "the application of Christian principles to the acquisition and use of property."²⁹

Though official ecclesiastical approval had been given the movement, it seems unlikely, as Olmstead observes,³⁰ that a majority of the laity were won to the cause, or that they would agree with Atkins' estimate of its value to preaching--"a life-preserver for twentieth century preaching."³¹

With the advent of "normalcy" in the 1920's the movement declined, and more than ten years passed before it enjoyed another revival.

Growing Theological Liberalism

As suggested earlier, to understand the theological situation in America at the dawn of the twentieth century, one must remember that Calvinism, modified by the influence of revivalism, had been the leading tradition in American Protestantism. Horton asserts that:

Of the historic types of Protestantism, there can be no doubt which has done most to shape theological thought in America: Calvinism. . . . The American tradition is thus mainly conditioned

²⁹Atkins, op. cit., pp. 57f. See on these pages the Social Creed of the Churches as adopted in 1908.

³⁰Olmstead, op. cit., p. 494.

³¹Atkins, op. cit., p. 60.

by the two remaining forms of original Protestantism: the Calvinist and the Anabaptist or sectarian. No other country has been so deeply affected by radical sectarianism; but Calvinism is the traditional theology of many sectarian bodies. The Westminster Confession was formally accepted by Congregationalists as well as by Presbyterians, while the Calvinistic Baptists have generally outnumbered their theological rivals in that most numerous of all American denominations. Wherever American theology remains conservative, the outlines of the Calvinistic system can clearly be described.³²

But with the passing of the frontier and the rise of intellectual problems concerning the authority of the Bible and the implications of Darwinian evolution, the New England evangelical Calvinism was seriously threatened. If it survived the threat, as it did for some time at Macartney's theological Alma Mater, Princeton Theological Seminary, it was plainly on the defensive.

What came to be called the "liberal theology" or "new theology" in the early twentieth century began to replace Calvinism as the prominent American theological tradition. It is best defined as an attempt to mediate between historic orthodoxy and the radically altered scientific and cultural outlook.³³

Its philosophical roots may be traced back to German idealism--Kant, Schleiermacher, Hegel, Ritschl, Lotze, Troeltsch. Philosophical idealism was optimistic, teaching that the universe was inherently rational and that the irrational would eventually be overcome by reason. Similarly, goodness would triumph over evil. The thought of Albrecht Ritschl (1822-1899) introduced another creative force. For him, the purpose of religion was to cultivate the sense of values inherent in man.

³²Horton, op. cit., pp. 105f.

³³The new trends in theology are discussed in standard denominational histories and specialized works such as F. H. Foster, The Modern Movement in American Theology (New York: Fleming H. Revell Company, 1939).

God has shown what man might become in Jesus Christ; and it was therefore the task of religion to point men toward Jesus, whose divinity lay in the fact that he realized in his life the highest truth and goodness. Ritschl's views were mediated to Americans by Adolf von Harnack, who taught the Fatherhood of God and the brotherhood of men, but rejected the deity of Jesus Christ.

The key theological idea of the new outlook was perhaps the doctrine of God's immanence which found humanity in God and deity in man and was congenial to optimistic development. This emphasis on immanence inevitably placed an entirely different meaning on such historic Christian doctrines as revelation, sin, redemption, and the person of Christ.

The concept of evolution as running through the entire pattern of human existence suggested the principle of progressive revelation. For example, the picture of a God of vengeance which they detected in the Old Testament was now explained as simply an earlier stage of religious development. The scriptures were viewed as the record of man's search for God and of its fulfillment in Christ. There was a shift, then, from an infallible Bible as the basis of authority to the Christian consciousness as the standard. Revelation was conceived as a dynamic encounter with God who speaks through Christ to the individual soul.

As to the person of Christ: in the liberal view the emphasis was upon the "Jesus of history," in whom men could capture their truest insight into the meaning of God and could find a worthy example to emulate. In a certain sense the man from Nazareth was the Son of God; but the great Nicene formulations, the Pauline affirmations of the pre-existence of Christ, the Johannine doctrine of the Logos, and the

records of the Virgin Birth were de-emphasized during the liberal era.

On the doctrine of the Atonement, the new theology held that Christ had offered himself as a living sacrifice for the purpose of showing men the love of God and to lead them into the larger life of reconciliation with their heavenly Father. The doctrine of the Atonement as the propitiating of a just and wrathful God, in the orthodox sense, fell out of favor. Christ had not come to rescue men from the torments of hell, but to inspire them to long for the abundant life in God.

As for the concept of man, most liberals regarded him as potentially a son of God. The traditional views of a fall or of original sin were dismissed in favor of the idea of the innate perfectibility of man.

Such persuasions did not lend themselves readily to a belief in a divine cataclysmic event to usher in the kingdom of God. Instead, the kingdom of God was to be realized on earth by following the example set for men by Christ--the dedicated service of human beings in the area of social relationships. As shown earlier, the social gospel, with its hope of Christianizing the social order and building the Kingdom of God on earth, was the main positive message of American liberalism at its height before and during World War I.

There was a marked tendency through the liberal period to give more attention to the philosophy of religion than to systematic theology. Nevertheless, Horton warns against supposing that American liberalism was "simply German idealistic philosophy in an American dress."³⁴ He points to William N. Clarke and W. A. Browne as the leading systematic

³⁴Horton, op. cit., p. 108.

liberal theologians of the early twentieth century, and names their works as the most influential textbooks of liberal theology: Clarke's Outline (1898) and Browne's (1906) were "Biblical in substance and evangelical in spirit," Horton affirms, springing from "a conception of the 'common Gospel' which had deep historical roots and wide ecumenical sympathies."³⁵

The Conservative Rebuttal

There were many, however, who would not have evaluated the movement as charitably. The defenders of the traditional orthodoxy believed heretical doctrines were being propagated, and they would not permit the theses of the liberal theologians to go unchallenged. In the prosecution of their defense, as Cole summarizes it, they did their most telling work by "the Bible and prophetic conference movement, professional evangelism, Bible schools, tractarian propaganda, and polemic preaching. . . ."³⁶

Bible conferences antedated the Fundamentalist movement (the term had not yet been coined) and trained many of its leaders. No annual retreat did more to strengthen the religious conservatism of the people than did the Niagara Bible Conference, which was opened in 1876 and continued to meet annually until the end of the century. In 1895 the Niagara group put forth the famous Five-Points statement of "sound doctrine"--the inerrancy of the Scriptures, the deity of Christ, the virgin birth, substitutionary atonement, the physical resurrection, and bodily return of Christ.³⁷

³⁵Ibid.

³⁶Stewart G. Cole. The History of Fundamentalism (New York: Richard R. Smith, Inc., 1931), p. 31.

³⁷Ibid., p. 34.

The leaders of this movement³⁸--such men as A. J. Gordon, A. T. Pierson, C. I. Scofield, and James M. Gray--were preachers of great persuasive power. They believed and preached the "personal and pre-millennial" return of Christ.³⁹ Their system of belief was definite and final, buttressed by an array of proof texts validated, they believed, by revelation.

The conferences were attended largely by church people already established in the Christian faith who were likely, upon returning home, "to question the complete orthodoxy of their own ministers and compare their sermonic gifts unfavorably with the masters of assembly to whom they had been listening."⁴⁰ The ministers themselves attended, and certainly their own preaching reflected thereafter the conference teaching.

Each section of the country had its focal conference reflecting the sectional temper, but in all there was a common system of teaching which sought to maintain the "old gospel" against the critical temper and menacing secularism of the age.

Many of the conference speakers were evangelists; and one has

³⁸Macartney became identified later with the Fundamentalist movement as a result of the part he played in the Fosdick Case. See chapter IV.

³⁹The term, "pre-millennial," refers to the more radically supernatural conception that Christ would return to earth before the thousand year millenium and set up a kingdom under his personal, visible rule. "Post-millennialism" held that the kingdom was continuous with the present life of the church and prior to Christ's return. Proponents of the latter view taught that the Holy Spirit would show itself more fully in the holiness of individual lives, and even in the transformation of social institutions as a climax to the church's history in the present world.

⁴⁰Atkins, op. cit., p. 226.

only to mention such names as Needham, Pierson, Munhall, Torrey, Alexander, Chapman, Smith, and Sunday to be reminded of the strong corps of itinerant preachers active in that day. Their procedures had become somewhat stylized. Great city "campaigns" enlisted the support of the Protestant churches en masse, covered the city with publicity and promotional organization, and won hundreds, sometimes thousands, of converts. Their technique had been perfected since Jonathan Edwards, Whitefield, and John Wesley. The time-proven system of orthodox Protestant doctrine was the spearhead of their attack. As they challenged the enemies of the Book, their preaching often assumed a polemical character. In the midst of a confused social and religious era, the historic Bible-centered culture of America was re-established for many by the evangelists.

The theological seminaries and denominational colleges felt the strain of the religious tensions. The conservative met this situation in two ways: he founded schools of his own to train Christian workers, or he sought to retain or regain control of the schools where they seemed to be surrendering to the new learning. The Moody Bible Institute, founded in 1886, was followed by the Bible Institute of Los Angeles in 1907 and many similar institutions, imbuing thousands of laymen and some ministers with the concepts of a conservative system of religious beliefs.

Many older theological schools, especially those in the Calvinist tradition, produced scholars who were sharply critical of the new currents in religion and clung tenaciously to the doctrine of the plenary inspiration of the Bible. Among the leaders in this camp were the Presby-

terians A. A. Hodge, Francis L. Patton, and Benjamin B. Warfield.⁴¹

At Princeton Theological Seminary, what has been described as "a form of seventeenth-century scholasticism philosophically based on Scottish common-sense realism"⁴² found an elaborate American expression. Patterning their theological method after the method of the natural sciences, the Princeton theologians taught that the Bible is to the theologian what nature is to the natural scientist. From the Biblical data, employing the "inductive" method, the theologian was to quarry his systematic theology. Basically, salvation rested upon a saving faith in Christ as the unique Son of God. Having come to this saving faith, one discovers that Christ accepted the Old Testament Scriptures as the inspired Word of God, and promised the Holy Spirit to the writers of the New Testament. Therefore, on the authority of Christ, it was argued, the Christian should accept the entire Scriptures as the inspired Word of God, from which, inductively, he can draw a systematic theology.

Smith, Handy, and Loetscher believe that this "objective" theological method provided for men in the late nineteenth and twentieth centuries "a welcome antidote to the subjectivism and uncertainty which

⁴¹"Two groups must be distinguished in the literature and thought of the conservative element. The first was primarily scholarly, the second evangelistic and premillennial. In the first were James Orr, Augustus H. Strong, and the Princeton group of theologians, with the Princeton Theological Review and Bibliotheca Sacra as its chief organs. The second contained such men as R. A. Torrey, James M. Gray, and Griffith-Thomas, and allied with it was the Bible League of North America with its periodical, the Bible Champion." Winfred Ernest Garrison, The March of Faith (New York: Harper and Brothers Publishers, 1933), p. 273.

⁴²H. Shelton Smith, Robert T. Handy, and Lefferts A. Loetscher, American Christianity (New York: Charles Scribner's Sons, 1963), p. 311.

was implicit in much of the liberalism of the times. . . ."43 This method, they note, continued to enjoy wide acceptance "in fundamentalist and neo-fundamentalist circles even after 1930."

The conservatives published "a vigorously written, widely circulated and extensively read literature."⁴⁴ An early and significant attempt to deal with the problem of Higher Criticism was a series of eight articles authored jointly by Hodge and Warfield appearing in the Presbyterian Review in 1881. The essay entitled "Inspiration"⁴⁵ had been characterized as "one of the clearest and most balanced statements of the inerrancy of the Bible that the Biblical controversy in America produced, either at that time or later."⁴⁶ It is a classic statement of a doctrine which fundamentalists continued to hold in the middle of the twentieth century. At that time, among the more scholarly fundamentalists, Warfield's name was highly esteemed and his writings were reprinted and widely circulated.

In 1910 two wealthy Californians, Lyman and Milton Stewart, financed the publication of twelve small volumes entitled The Fundamentals. Nearly three million copies were circulated among ministers and laymen in the United States and abroad. The result was a renewed and militant antagonism toward liberalism which would reach its peak in the decade following World War I. But by that time the new theology would be on the decline and waiting to be replaced by theologies regarded as more relevant to contemporary issues.

⁴³Ibid., p. 312.

⁴⁴Atkins, op. cit., p. 230.

⁴⁵Archibald A. Hodge and Benjamin B. Warfield, "Inspiration," Presbyterian Review, II (1881), 225-8.

⁴⁶Smith, Handy, and Loetscher, ibid., p. 324.

Years of Confusion and Disillusionment--1920-1940

Between the Wars

"They call me a heretic. I am proud of it. I wouldn't live in a generation like this and be anything but a heretic. . . . It is a great time to be alive!"⁴⁷

These words of Harry Emerson Fosdick suggest something beyond the doctrinal controversies that rocked the American churches in the period between the wars. It was a great time, with the mood of the people ranging from bold, experimental optimism to that of shattering disillusionment.

During the brief period of high resolve which followed World War I, President Wilson was pouring out his energies for the cause of international justice and peace. It was one of the last naively optimistic acts of an age about to be replaced by an era of reckless uncertainties and swaggering doubts.

Wilson, his health broken, left the stage to Warren G. Harding and "normalcy." But normalcy was to involve change and tension. Concomitant with a return to insularity would be the "Big Red Scare"⁴⁸ with a simultaneous revival of the Ku Klux Klan surging to a peak in the 1928 election--and, of course, the fundamentalist-modernist controversy. From 1922, following Fosdick's controversial sermon, "Shall the Fundamentalists Win?" until 1925, when the Scopes trial took place, religion was front page news. A procession of fads and headlines reflecting the emotional instability of the age had come and gone: Lindbergh's flight,

⁴⁷ Harry Emerson Fosdick, "If This Be Heresy," Survey, LIV (April 1, 1925), 29.

⁴⁸ Frederick Lewis Allen, Only Yesterday, p. 31.

Tut-Ankh-Amen's tomb, "Yes, We Have No Bananas," mah jong, the cross-word puzzle, the Democratic Convention at Madison Square Garden, "The Sidewalks of New York," Gloria Swanson's marrying a French Marquis, and Floyd Collins dead in a Kentucky cave.⁴⁹ Now the spotlight focused on evolution and God.

Though religion was furiously discussed, it was obvious that it was losing its power in the lives of men. The intellectuals smiled with approval at the raging secularism of Clarence Darrow and H. L. Mencken. But if religion was not in the most robust health during the twenties, this fact was not revealed in the statistics of church membership.⁵⁰ There was a feeling, however, that convention was replacing commitment as motivation.

The shocking inconsistency between religious affirmatives and popular conduct and morals is not as surprising as it might seem. It was an age in transition, recoiling from the moralism of the Victorian era and reacting in adolescent fashion to its newfound freedom.

The criticism of contemporary society by Theodore Dreiser and Sinclair Lewis⁵¹ was not undeserved. In government, the weak and ineffectual Harding regime, plagued by such disgraceful episodes as the Teapot Dome scandal, became symbolic of corruption in high places. It was a time of sensational murders, flourishing bootleggers, and machine gun-toting gangsters. Men and women were still shivering from the Red Menace when they awoke to the no less alarming Problem of the Younger

⁴⁹Allen, ibid., pp. 190ff.

⁵⁰From 1920 to 1930 church affiliation of the total population rose from 43 to 47 per cent. See Olmstead, op. cit., pp. 544f.

⁵¹As in An American Tragedy and Elmer Gantry.

Generation. It was a first-class revolt. Supposedly "nice" girls were smoking cigarettes--openly and defiantly. The flappers in knee-length dresses and with bobbed hair, joined their partners on the dance floor to the wailing of the saxophone. The post-war disillusionment, the new status of women, the Freudian gospel, the automobile, prohibition, the sex and confession magazines, the movies, and the materialistic prosperity all combined in an irresistible conspiracy to change the folkways of America.

Through the decade of the twenties the prosperity band wagon rolled along with throttle wide open. "The business of America is business,"⁵² Coolidge had said as he mounted the driver's seat. In a position of honor rode the automobile manufacturer. The unveiling of the Model A Ford in 1927 was one of the great events of the year, rivaling the execution of Sacco and Vanzetti, the Hall-Mills murder trial, the Mississippi flood, and the Dempsey-Tunney fight at Chicago.

As if captured by a new religion, small and great were caught up in the speculation frenzy of the stock exchange. The market climbed to dizzying heights in 1929--and then fell with a resounding crash. In a moment, the Jazz Age, the age of normalcy, was over.

Though the Depression may be said to have begun with the fateful crash of October, 1929, it was not until 1932 that the public fully grasped the seriousness of the situation. A concerned electorate had turned away from another business man in the driver's seat and had swept Franklin D. Roosevelt into office. Not until they were confronted with the awesome spectacle of an official bank holiday followed by the Hundred Days of breath-taking congressional action in which the New Deal

⁵²Isabel Leighton, (ed.), The Aspirin Age, 1919-1941, p. 147.

was launched, did they realize how far they had sunk.

The Depression worked its wrath on all classes alike and drew them into a fellowship of despair. Faith in the inevitability of progress and a Utopian society just around the corner was sorely tried.

The New Deal, sounding a note of equalitarianism, spear-headed a social revolution as it proceeded to regulate industrial life, agriculture, labor relations, the security exchanges, and social security.

A chastened America struggled through the weary years of poverty, the drought and dust storms, and then another war at whose end there was no rainbow. In the closing stages of that war, President Harry Truman made his fateful decision. An American plane dropped an atomic bomb on Hiroshima on August 6, 1945, and three days later another fell on Nagasaki--the Atomic Age had dawned.

Americans found it difficult to maintain their optimism in a generation which had witnessed such a series of calamities.

Theological Controversy and Realignment

The violence of crisis and change which rocked the world in the years following 1914 had a profound effect on theological thinking. The spirit of idealism, of liberalism, and social optimism which had reached a peak during the war was rudely shaken. When the liberal aims of the war were found to be illusory, a reaction set in. The result was a series of controversies culminating in the retirement of liberal theology in its earlier forms.

Horton sets 1920 as the end of idealistic liberalism and the opening of a new period of theological controversy and realignment.⁵³

⁵³Horton, op. cit., p. 111.

The Fundamentalist Controversy (1920-1925)

The first of these was the fundamentalist-modernist controversy. It has been described as "the nation's most spectacular quarrel on religious doctrine."⁵⁴ News of the controversy was faithfully chronicled in the metropolitan dailies and received repeated commentary in popular periodicals of the day such as World's Work, The Literary Digest, Current Opinion, The American Mercury, The New Republic, North American Review, and The Forum. There was point behind the advice given in jest to prohibition officers: "When you see a bulge on a man's hip, do not jump to conclusions; it is as likely to be a Bible as a flask, for the Bible is fast becoming the most popular book in New York."⁵⁵

Throughout the decade of the 1920's, the conflict reverberated across the land, sharpening to the point that it came to be referred to as "the war in the churches."⁵⁶ Heresy trials rocked the churches and "monkey bills" tormented the legislatures. Tourists riding the "rubber-neck wagon" in New York stopped at "Heresy Corner" (Fifth Avenue and Tenth Street) as the guide called out, "Church of the Ascension! Here Dr. Percy Grant defies his bishop!"⁵⁷ Bills designed to forbid the teaching of evolution were introduced into the legislatures of nearly

⁵⁴Robert D. Clark, "Harry Emerson Fosdick," A History and Criticism of American Public Address, ed. Marie Kathryn Hochmuth, III (New York: Longmon's Green, 1955), p. 411.

⁵⁵Rollin Lynde Hartt, "Is the Church Dividing?" World's Work, XLVII (December, 1923), 161.

⁵⁶A series of articles by Rollin Lynde Hartt appeared in World's Work in 1923 and 1924 under this heading.

⁵⁷Hartt, loc. cit.

half the states of the union.⁵⁸ William Jennings Bryan predicted, "The movement will sweep the country, and we will drive Darwinism from our schools."⁵⁹

As the controversy continued, angry passions became overheated and the vocabulary of invective sometimes became unrestrained. Dr. Albert C. Dieffenbach, editor of the Christian Register, reacting to the menace he saw in fundamentalism, "ate raw meat, got red-eyed, and went at it."⁶⁰ He called fundamentalism "a religious Ku Klux" and a "creed of force." J. Frank Norris, a leading fundamentalist, headlined his Fort Worth church publication with bold red letters, WAR IS DECLARED--SECOND COMING OF CHRIST IS ISSUE.⁶¹ He, with many others in both camps, predicted an open split in the churches. "There is going to be a new denomination." Of the established churches he said, "We're going to rip them up soon. It's going to be a Bull Moose Bolt."⁶²

If the participants came suddenly to the point of open clash in the post-war period, the underlying tensions had been long in developing. As already noted, industrial changes in the nineteenth century had transformed post-Civil War America from a predominantly rural, pastoral (and Bible-centered) society to a rapidly growing urban, industrial society. These social changes were aggravated by new theories in science, especially the evolutionary hypothesis with its philosophical premise of inevitable progress. While the teaching of the evolutionists raised

⁵⁸Allen, op. cit., p. 142.

⁵⁹Hartt, "Down With Evolution," World's Work, XLVII (December, 1923), 606.

⁶⁰Hartt, "The War in the Churches," World's Work, XLVI (September, 1923), 473.

⁶¹Ibid., p. 474.

⁶²Ibid., p. 477.

questions about the factual reliability of the Bible, religious modernists, armed with Biblical criticism and a comparative study of religions, began to call in question teachings which had long been regarded as sacrosanct and unchanging. Thus, the conservatives in religion felt the attack from two directions. They chose to stand their ground and contend for their convictions.

Historically, the fundamentalist movement may be said to have had its inception with the publication of The Fundamentals,⁶³ the title of which apparently provided the name for the movement. Sweet has declared that, "The Fundamentalist movement may be said to have begun in 1910 with the publication of a series of little books entitled The Fundamentals: a Testimony to the Truth."⁶⁴

This series of twelve booklets set forth the historic doctrines regarded as essential. They were: (1) the verbal and inerrant inspiration of the Bible, (2) the virgin birth of Jesus Christ, (3) the substitutionary atonement of Jesus Christ, and (4) the physical or bodily resurrection of Jesus Christ, and (5) the imminent second coming of Jesus Christ. Other doctrines which supplemented these were: (1) the deity of Jesus Christ, (2) the depravity or sinful nature of man, (3) salvation and justification by faith through the grace of God, and (4) the promise of the physical or bodily resurrection of believing or regenerate Christians.⁶⁵

Cole has described the reaction produced in "sympathetic readers"

⁶³Supra, p. 61.

⁶⁴Sweet, The Story of Religion in America (2nd rev. ed., New York: Harper and Brothers, 1950), p. 568.

⁶⁵The Fundamentals: A Testimony to the Truth. Vols. 1-12 (Chicago: Testimony Publishing Co., n.d.), entire.

by the reading of the Fundamentals:

The language in which the themes were delivered stirred . . . first anxiety for the well-being of Christianity, then fear for the preservation of the historic faith, and then spirited defense of the old gospel.⁶⁶

Skirmishing, however, was sporadic and ineffectual until it found support in the general post-War I mood of conservatism verging on reaction. Wrage and Baskerville offer the point of view that this renewal of religious disputation was an expression of the post-war desire to return to "normalcy" in religion as in other fields, of a longing for the old securities, and resentment of innovation and disturbing new ideas.⁶⁷

As a definite movement of protest, the first significant conference of fundamentalism was the Philadelphia Prophetic Convention, which took place during May of 1918. Five thousand people thronged to its twelve sessions.⁶⁸ On the basis of this response, fundamentalist leaders decided that the time was right for the first meeting and formal organization of the World's Christian Fundamentalist Association. This meeting, held in 1919 at the Moody Bible Institute of Chicago, formed a definite plan of action to purge schools, seminaries, and pulpits of heretics.⁶⁹

Under the vigorous leadership of W. B. Riley, newly-elected president of the association, more than one hundred "conferences on

⁶⁶Cole, op. cit., p. 61

⁶⁷Ernest J. Wrage and Barnet Baskerville (eds.), Contemporary Forum (New York: Harper and Brothers, 1962), p. 87.

⁶⁸Norman F. Furniss, The Fundamentalist Controversy, 1918-1931 (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1954), p. 50.

⁶⁹Lewis Gasper, The Fundamentalist Movement (Paris, France: Mouton and Co., 1963), p. 14.

Christian Fundamentals" had been held in the United States and Canada by August of 1920.⁷⁰

Meanwhile, the controversy began to come to the fore in several of the major denominations. None was more shaken than the Presbyterian, U.S.A.⁷¹ Theological fixity, coupled with a general strain of conservatism persisting from Coventanter sires, lent a predisposition to certain fundamentalist emphases.

The publication of Baptist Fosdick's sermon, "Shall the Fundamentalists Win?", with the resultant reaction of the conservative forces under the leadership of Presbyterian Macartney,⁷² appears to have been the event that triggered the "war in the churches." Rian, who prefers to regard it as simply a "continuance of the struggle," concedes that the publication of this sermon was "the immediate cause of the conflict which eventually led to the formation of the Orthodox Presbyterian Church."⁷³ With the Fosdick case settled by his resignation from First Church in New York, the Presbyterian conflict continued, nevertheless, unabated. In 1924 a document signed by 1274 ministers and known as the

⁷⁰Furniss, op. cit., p. 51.

⁷¹For a detailed study of the conflict as it affected the Presbyterian Church see Lefferts A. Loetscher, The Broadening Church (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 1957). For the conservative view see Edwin H. Rian, The Presbyterian Conflict (Grand Rapids: Wm. B. Eerdmans Publishing Co., 1940). For accounts of the conflict as it affected particularly the Baptists, Methodists, Disciples of Christ, and Episcopalians as well as Presbyterians, see texts on American church history and specific denominational histories.

⁷²At its height, the controversy was receiving more newspaper space than any other religious question. According to the Literary Digest, "The Fosdick Case is one in which the entire country has been interested," The Olive Branch for Fosdick, The Literary Digest, LXXXI (June 21, 1924), 33.

⁷³Edwin H. Rian, The Presbyterian Conflict (Grand Rapids: Wm. B. Eerdmans Publishing Co., 1940), p. 29.

"Auburn Affirmation," was issued in protest to the five-point doctrinal requirement which had been imposed by the General Assembly on the ground that it was unconstitutional. Of its impact on the troubled scene

Furniss reported:

The importance of the Affirmation lay not so much in its contribution to the intensity of the argument over Fosdick, but rather in that it soon became itself a cause of fundamentalist indignation.⁷⁴

It definitely illustrated two sizeable and distinct centers of opinion in the Presbyterian church.

About that time another controversy was shaping up at Princeton Theological Seminary, where Professor J. Gresham Machen was calling for the defeat of liberalism. In his book, Christianity and Liberalism, he insisted that liberalism was a "totally diverse type of religious belief" than Christianity⁷⁵ and that its adherents should not be permitted to remain within the church. Growing tension among the faculty led to the decision of the General Assembly to investigate the situation at Princeton; the result was a reorganization of the seminary and the withdrawal in 1929 of Machen and some of his followers to Philadelphia, where they organized the independent Westminster Seminary.

Still another aspect of the conflict grew out of the issue of appointees for foreign missions. When Machen and his associates organized the Independent Board for Presbyterian Foreign Missions, the General Assembly directed all Presbyterians to withdraw from this enterprise. Machen refused to abide by this directive and was suspended from the Presbyterian ministry. In 1936, he and his supporters organized the

⁷⁴Furniss, op. cit., p. 134.

⁷⁵J. Gresham Machen, Christianity and Liberalism, (Grand Rapids: Wm. B. Eerdmans Publishing Co., 1923), p. 2.

Presbyterian Church of America, a body which suffered schism a year later when a faction withdrew to form the Bible Presbyterian Synod. The former body changed its name in 1938 to the Orthodox Presbyterian Church.

Following these developments, the Presbyterian Church, U.S.A., enjoyed comparative peace.⁷⁶

Though its doctrinal emphasis and heritage seemed to mark Presbyterianism for trouble in this period, the movement should not have become so prominent a battleground of fundamentalism had it not been for the fact that William Jennings Bryan was an elder in the kirk. In the opinion of the Christian Century:

Without Bryan the Presbyterians would undoubtedly have had their troubles with fundamentalism. But with Bryan, that cause quickly found the front page of newspapers everywhere, and under his leadership it was given a fighting edge and flair for the control of assemblies which soon put it in a dominant position.⁷⁷

As early as the 1923 General assembly, where reaction to Fosdick's sermon of 1922 provided the greatest excitement, Bryan was able to turn the attention of the delegates to evolution, his major concern. Sager notes that,

increasingly, thereafter, evolution was to rival the issue of modernism for central billing in fundamentalist gatherings, climaxing in

⁷⁶J. A. MacCallum, representing the more liberal element of the Presbyterian church diagnosed the situation in 1939: "Fortunately, with the exception of one or two minor skirmishes, all is now quiet on the theological front. Of course we can never tell when the battle will break out again in all its ancient virulence, but it looks as though we are in for an era of theological good-feeling. The conservatives are not so conservative, or at least not so militant, and the liberals are not so sure of themselves as they were a few years ago when Dr. Clarence Macartney was the self-appointed knight of reaction. His occasional Cassandra calls may be as strident as ever but they have lost their sometime magic and in consequence his followers have been reduced to a weedy segment of their former battalions." (The Presbyterian Tribune, March 16, 1939, p. 5, cited in Rian, op. cit., p. 272..

⁷⁷The Christian Century, LXV (June 14, 1928), 754.

the Scopes trial of 1925, when it was made to appear that evolution was the only issue at stake.⁷⁸

It may be said, in short, that the two pivotal events of the controversy, Fosdick versus Macartney and Bryan versus Darrow, typify the two-pronged threat of modernism and evolutionism against which the beleaguered forces of orthodoxy rose to give battle.

Bryan's death, only days after the trial, not only spared him from tasting the full bitterness of that humiliation, but also deprived fundamentalism of a dedicated and articulate advocate. Furniss gives Bryan's death as an important cause of the decline of the controversy. As other causes, he lists the following: (1) failure of the fundamentalists to consolidate their forces to produce an effective, permanent national organization; (2) the appearance of other issues, such as Prohibition and the economic "crash" of 1929, vying for the attention of the people; (3) the spread of knowledge; and finally, (4) the modification of the nature of their propaganda and method of attack on the part of the fundamentalists.⁷⁹ In addition--and perhaps more important--was the reaction against liberalism which had begun to appear by 1930. A realignment of theological forces under the impact of Karl Barth's school of Neo-orthodoxy was taking place. The Movement's obvious disillusionment with liberalism and its emphasis of the sinfulness of man dulled the cutting edge of the fundamentalist's argument. The situation was much as that described by the scientist in reply to the question, "Who killed off the dinosaurs?" His explanation: "Nobody, the climate changed and they died." The fundamentalists were not defeated;

⁷⁸Allan H. Sager, The Fundamentalist-Modernist Controversy, 1918-1930. (unpublished Ph.D. dissertation, Northwestern University, 1963), p. 63.

⁷⁹Furniss, op. cit., pp. 178ff.

the climate changed and they found themselves no longer as viable a force on the American theological scene.

The Humanist Controversy (1925-1930)

In the mid 1920's, while the fundamentalist pressures were still strong, the liberals were drawn into a dialogue with a small but vociferous party known as religious humanists. These insurgents openly challenged the liberals to forsake their theistic tradition with its inevitable supernaturalism in favor of a religious faith based entirely upon the authority of the modern scientific method. The most dramatic expression of their views, "A Humanist Manifesto,"⁸⁰ came in 1933 as a climax to trends long in the making. Charles Francis Potter, an enthusiastic supporter of the movement, wrote in 1933:

When eleven eminent professors of philosophy, theology, economics, medicine, and sociology, and twenty-three other leaders in editorial, literary, educational, and religious fields come out publicly over their own signatures and confess to belief in a new religion called Humanism, and state fifteen theses upon which they all agree, then something of more than ordinary importance in religious circles has occurred. The fact that these men come from various denominational and religious backgrounds, including Unitarianism, Universalism, Judaism, and Ethical Culture, increases the significance of the new movement.⁸¹

Spokesmen for the movement were convinced that the humanization of religion would require the substitution of discovery for revelation, the replacement of salvation by education, the replacing of the churches by free religious societies, and the supplanting of the supernatural by the natural. All this was being said with sublime confidence out of the

⁸⁰"A Humanist Manifesto," The New Humanist, VI (May-June, 1933), 1-4, cited by Smith, Handy, and Loetscher, op. cit., pp. 250ff.

⁸¹Charles Francis Potter, Humanizing Religion (New York: Harper and Brothers, 1933), p. 1, cited by Smith, Handy, and Loetscher, ibid., p. 250.

background of the unparalleled prosperity and social optimism prior to the Wall Street crash in 1929; but even as it was being said, our ephemeral prosperity was beginning to crack up beneath our feet and the mood of the 1930's would not prove responsive to these trends of an earlier period.

Americans might tend naturally to be optimistic; but it was difficult to maintain that condition in the face of such blows as the failure of the League of Nations, the Depression, and the mounting world unrest and drift toward another war. The sermons of the liberals and the efforts of the social reformers began to sound like voices of the past.

Realignment

The "recoil from humanism" led first to a realignment of theological forces rather than an immediate constructive effort in theology. Various systems began to vie for attention, the more important of which stood for some form of realism, as opposed to the absolute idealism which had nurtured liberalism. At the University of Chicago, Henry N. Wieman was undermining humanism by his "theistic naturalism or empirical theism."⁸² At Yale Divinity School, Douglas C. Macintosh⁸³ was promulgating theological realism via the empirical method, while at Boston University Edgar S. Brightman was taking the element of evil in the cosmic process with new seriousness. Realism, a broad term covering a multitude of differences, indicates nevertheless a general orientation.

⁸²Olmstead, op. cit., p. 573.

⁸³In Horton's opinion, the first persuasive alternatives to humanism in America in terms appealing to former liberals were given by Macintosh and Wieman. These men, he affirms, "first gave a positive realistic orientation to American Protestant theology." "Systematic Theology," Nash (ed.), op. cit., p. 116.

There was a common impulse toward objectivism and theocentrism. Realism reversed the direction of idealism and pointed out beyond the self and its subjectivity, beyond humanity and the changing processes of nature, to some deep objective Ground of faith unperturbed by those upheavals that shatter the dreams of idealists.⁸⁴

Significant in this theological realignment was the importation of existentialism from Europe. The Danish philosopher, Soren Kierkegaard, and his Spanish Catholic disciple, Miguel Unamuno, were introduced to America in the thirties "as radical critics of the Social Gospel and as romantic exponents of an anxious and agonized conscience."⁸⁵

This system, with its sense of the tragic--its picture of human life as estranged from God, rooted in sin, in frustration and despair--struck at the base of idealism. From its philosophical roots sprang theologies stressing the sinful nature of man's action, his utter need of divine grace, his personal encounter with the living God, and God's gift of salvation.

As moral optimism collapsed, the doctrine of the "humanity" of God lost its hold on philosophical theologians. God was now represented as "the absolutely other," the ultimately encountered "Ground of being." God, they explained, stands over against man's world; His realm is neither natural nor social.

The first important manifestation of theological existentialism in America came through the crisis theology of Karl Barth, Swiss Protestant theologian. Writing immediately after World War I, he startled

⁸⁴Cf. the various meanings of realism in W. M. Horton's Realistic Theology (New York: Harper and Brothers, 1934).

⁸⁵Herbert Wallace Schneider, Religion in 20th Century America (Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 1952), p. 139.

his disillusioned German readers by suggesting that God

confronts man in a demand for his will. This God who is the "wholly other," the transcendent, speaks to man through Jesus Christ alone; He speaks to him in a moment of crisis, an existential moment, in which man's sin stands uncovered and he responds to the divine will humbly in an act of total commitment. This dynamic encounter is possible not through natural theology or reason but only through faith which is a gift of God; it involves not the perception of an ultimate principle of truth but the reaction to a personal will.⁸⁶

However, not until 1928 when Barth's The Word of God and the Word of Man was published in English, did his theology begin to make an impression on American thinkers. During the critical days of the Depression, American revisionists, who had been nurtured in liberalism, began to write sympathetically of the new European theology which was coming to be known as "Neo-orthodoxy."⁸⁷

The primary revisionist and interpreter of existentialism in the United States was Reinhold Niebuhr of Union Theological Seminary. His work, Moral Man and Immoral Society, criticized the liberal attempt to achieve the Kingdom of God by human efforts and sounded a clear call for theological and social reconstruction. Niebuhr's views occupied a mediating position between Barth's pessimism, which saw the kingdom of God only as a future hope, and the unqualified optimism of American liberalism, which appeared to equate the Kingdom with human progress.

⁸⁶As summarized by Olmstead, op. cit., p. 572.

⁸⁷Twentieth Century Encyclopedia of Religious Knowledge (Grand Rapids: Baker Book House, 1955), p. 310, makes the following comment on Neo-orthodoxy: "The theologians of crisis are orthodox in the sense that they accept the central conceptions and the doctrinal formularies of the sixteenth century Reformation as reliable guides to the understanding of what the Bible says about God's action in Jesus Christ for man's salvation and the world's redemption. But they are also neo-orthodox because the theologians of crisis regard it as a primary responsibility of theology to give doctrinal conceptions and creeds of the past a contemporary formulation and significance."

For Niebuhr the Christian way was to work for every possible reform, recognizing the difficulty of moral progress but trusting that each task performed in faith would have significance in the unfolding of the divine purpose.⁸⁸

As names such as Barth, Emil Brunner, Paul Tillich, and Karl Jaspers began to make the rounds in American academic circles

a new vocabulary, a strange philosophy of history, a sophisticated use of the "Word of God," a trumpeting of transcendent judgment overwhelmed not only the spirit of American complacency, but also the voices of American idealism.⁸⁹

By the mid-1930's, then, it was obvious that the old order of liberalism had passed and a new theological era was in the making. Idealism was stringently modified by realism, in which man's goodness was now viewed against a backdrop of evil, sin, and guilt. The change was dramatized by a notable sermon, "The Church Must Go Beyond Modernism,"⁹⁰ delivered by Harry Emerson Fosdick at Riverside church. In this indictment of liberalism he declared that it had over-emphasized intellectualism, had been overly sentimental, had humanized the concept of God, and that it was guilty of taking its cue from the modern world rather than standing apart from "the prevailing culture" to challenge it.

He was supported in these views by such liberals as John C. Bennett and W. M. Horton. In 1933 Bennett announced, "The most important fact about contemporary American theology is the disintegration of liberalism."⁹¹ A year later, Horton declared that, in his opinion, the

⁸⁸Olmstead, op. cit., p. 575.

⁸⁹Schneider, op. cit., pp. 134f.

⁹⁰Harry Emerson Fosdick, "Beyond Modernism," Christian Century, LII (1935), 1549-1552.

⁹¹John C. Bennett, "After Liberalism--What?", Christian Century, L (1933), 1403.

entire system of liberalism had "collapsed and must be replaced."⁹²

Perhaps the most significant feature of the period under consideration for the purposes of this study is the assault made on 350 years of modern philosophy by events of what Carl F. H. Henry terms "the debacle of 1914-1945."

That 1914-1945 constitutes a turning point is evident from the shifting of major convictions in the arenas of thought determinative for the modern mind. Rising from his sickness unto death and alarmed to terror by the external manifestations of his inner ideological disease, the contemporary man is leaving behind premises which 350 years of modern philosophy had struggled long and hard to bring to ascendancy.⁹³

Among the presuppositions under fire he lists (1) the inevitability of human progress, (2) the inherent goodness of man, and (3) the absolute uniformity of nature.⁹⁴

The idea of progress, as already noted, established itself as the underlying presupposition of Occidental post-renaissance culture. The years 1914-1945, however, were fatal to this confidence in inevitable advance.

So strong was the idea, and so incorrigibly optimistic the American people that at first even World War I did not shake it. By an easy rationalization the conflict was conceived as the war to end war. This "will to believe" that the great war was only a purging fire from which a new world would arise was further strengthened by a series of peace pacts that were signed in the next decade. But the war had shaken the structure of the world more than men realized, and the old order was breaking up. As early as 1933 Paul Hutchinson wrote:

⁹²Horton, op. cit., p. ix.

⁹³Carl F. H. Henry, Remaking the Modern Mind (Grand Rapids, Michigan: Wm. B. Eerdmans Publishing Company, 1948), pp. 20f.

⁹⁴Ibid., p. 26.

Here, then, is my credo: I believe that we are living in a day which sees the final destruction of the illusion of inevitable progress which Herbert Spencer and the Victorian evolutionists fastened upon the pre-war liberalism of the West. . . . Man now finds himself confronting the possibility of chaos quite as much as of triumph, and discovering that catastrophe is much closer than either a dependable peace or a just, and therefore stable, world order.⁹⁵

In 1939 the Christian Century carried a significant series of articles entitled, "How My Mind Has Changed in This Decade."⁹⁶ Each article in a series of thirty-four was written by a different religious leader. Reinhold Niebuhr's contribution to the symposium entitled, "Ten Years That Shook My World," scores the liberals for their too optimistic estimate of the essential nature of man and their blind adherence to the doctrine of progress:

Liberal Christianity, in short, tended to follow modern culture in estimating both the stature and the virtue of man. It did not recognize that man is spirit who can find a home neither in nature nor in reason, but only in God. . . .

For this reason, the simple reinterpretation of the Kingdom of God into the law of progress, in the thought of liberal Christianity, is an equally serious betrayal of essential insights of the Christian faith to the prejudices of modern culture. . . . But there is not a single bit of evidence to prove that good triumphs over evil in this constant development of history.⁹⁷

Arnold S. Nash in The University and the Modern World observes that the doctrine of man's inherent goodness and the concomitant of inevitable progress is

the faith of the typical university teacher of our era in the liberal democratic countries. It is this faith which is now [1943] being shaken far more rudely by events than it ever could be by argument.

⁹⁵Paul Hutchinson, "The Future of Religion," Forum, LXXXIX (April, 1933), 226.

⁹⁶Dr. Clarence Macartney was invited to contribute to this series as a representative of the conservative view. His article will be noted in the following chapter.

⁹⁷Niebuhr, The Christian Century, LVI (April 26, 1939), 544.

The tragic happenings of the last few years have indicated not only the failure of man as man but in particular the failure of thinking man.⁹⁸

What might have remained of the doctrine of inevitable progress was certainly blasted into oblivion by the atomic bomb, which shook not only the earth but also the minds of men as they had never been shaken before.

The editor of The Christian Century, writing in 1946 under the title, "The Atomic Bomb and the Christian Faith," sums up the significance of the atomic age for the church:

. . . Science thus throws the whole question raised by the atomic bomb into the lap of the Christian faith. Something radical must be done about man.

When we talk about the nature of man, we are standing on ground that has been pre-empted by Christianity. On this ground, science and Christianity now meet face to face. With one voice they declare that the future is precarious and with one voice they declare that it is precarious because of man. Christianity puts its finger upon that in man's nature which science now gravely fears may cause his destruction and the destruction of the earth with him. Science and Christianity are now looking at the same thing in man. Science has no word for it, but Christianity has. That word is sin.⁹⁹

The foregoing testimony would indicate that the debacle of 1914-1945 had brought down the two pillars of world progress: the inherent perfectibility of man and the belief that there is a deep-moving, all-pervasive law of progress leading the whole creation onward and upward.

The Age of Anxiety

The dozen years which followed Hiroshima and Nagasaki, in which Dr. Macartney would bring to a close a ministry of almost fifty years, were troubled with international tensions and anxieties. Mid-century

⁹⁸Arnold S. Nash, The University and the Modern World (New York: Macmillan Company, 1943), pp. 30f.

⁹⁹Charles Clayton Morrison, "The Atomic Bomb and the Christian Faith," The Christian Century, LXIII (March 13, 1946), 330ff.

found the free world and the Communist powers confronting each other in a cold war that held out the all-too-dangerous prospect of developing once again into a global conflict. Americans were never quite free from a gnawing fear that the world might suddenly be engulfed in the flames of atomic fury. Groping for security in the "Age of Anxiety,"¹⁰⁰ they sought a panacea in the ordinances of religion. The post-war period would see a revival of religious interest coupled with an ecumenical awakening. In theology, students of the discipline would discern a trend toward constructive restatement; a resurgence of neo-fundamentalism would be observed as well.

The Post-War Revival of Religion

A phenomenon of the post-war period was a surge of interest in religion, one aspect of which was the return to popular favor of mass revivalism which had been neglected since the days of Billy Sunday. The movement appeared to have its beginnings in the Youth for Christ revivals at the outset of World War II. Rallies designed to reach teenagers and servicemen were conducted by such popular evangelists as Jack Wyrzten, Torrey Johnson, Billy Graham, and Charles Templeton. Other important exponents of evangelism during the early years of the revival were such radio preachers as M. R. De Haan, Charles E. Fuller, Walter Maier, H.M.S. Richards, and the Anglican mission-preacher, Bryan Green.

Most popular and successful was William (Billy) Franklin Graham, Baptist minister and founder in 1950 of the Billy Graham Evangelistic Association. In 1947 he launched a series of evangelistic campaigns which took him to the major cities of the nation, drawing crowds of from

¹⁰⁰W. H. Auden, The Age of Anxiety; A Baroque Eclogue (New York: Random House, 1946).

40,000 to 60,000 at a single meeting. Graham emphasized individual salvation through decision and profession of faith in Christ.

In government, President Dwight D. Eisenhower symbolized the spirit of the times with his simple, unaffected piety. His brief prayer offered at his inauguration deeply moved the people. "Prayer breakfasts" became the order of the day.

Everywhere there was talk of a religious revival sweeping the nation. The secular press commented favorably on the return to religion; religious movies and popular songs with a quasi-religious theme enjoyed unprecedented popularity..

With the publication of Rabbi Liebman's best seller, Peace of Mind, in 1946, a phenomenon simultaneous with the religious revival was launched--the national quest for peace of mind.¹⁰¹ Monsignor Fulton J. Sheen's Peace of Soul followed in 1949, and a Protestant version by Billy Graham in 1953, Peace With God. The "pontifex maximus" of the "cult of reassurance" was Norman Vincent Peale, the popular minister of the Marble Collegiate Church in New York City. His solution appealed to thousands of anxious Americans who were led to look to religion as a source of "practical" help. His books (such as The Art of Living, A Guide to Confident Living, The Power of Positive Thinking, and Stay Alive All Your Life) offered religio-psychological counsel advocating the banishment of negative thoughts and a turning for guidance to the Bible, Christ, and prayer. While he drew the criticism of theologians who

¹⁰¹The trend was anticipated somewhat by Harry Emerson Fosdick's works such as On Being a Real Person (1943). Ironically, when the "peace-of-mind" movement was at its height, America was gripped by a wave of hysteria brought on by fear of Communism. McCarthyism was abroad in the land.

complained of the superficiality of his theology, Peale continued to appeal to a non-theologically oriented public which saw religion primarily as an avenue to mental and physical health, happiness, and prosperity.

Thoughtful appraisals of the revival of religious interest began to appear; many seemed to see no genuine spiritual awakening such as might be indicated by an upward trend in the moral life of the cities. Martin E. Marty, in his significant study, described the revival as lacking depth, yet secured against criticism by its residence in the ethos, custom, and favor of the nation:

For this is that utterly new thing: a revival that goes not against the grain of the nation but with it; a revival that draws its strength from its safe residence in the mores of the nation. Hence it has proved largely invulnerable to the assaults of critics outside the churches. America is religionized. It has been on a religious "kick" and does not wish to be bothered.¹⁰²

Observers seemed to agree that there had been a broad revival of interest in religion but that it had been accompanied by an increase in secular patterns of thought and ways of living.

The Ecumenical Awakening

A salient feature of the American religious enterprise of the first half of the twentieth century was a growing trend toward greater cooperative endeavor. Although significant developments in cooperative Christianity may be traced back to the nineteenth century, it was not until after 1930 that the movement had achieved a maturity of development to the point that it carried an impact sufficient to produce an

¹⁰²Martin E. Marty, op. cit., p. 7.

ecumenical¹⁰³ awakening in the post-war years. A Roman Catholic observer declared that the ecumenical movement "is undoubtedly the most striking ecclesiological event since the sixteenth-century Reformation."¹⁰⁴

Commenting on the remarkable surge of interest in church union, Henry S. Leiper contrasts the situation in 1900 with that of 1950:

In 1900 . . . no churches were formally discussing unity--not to speak of union. In 1920 only 70 in the world were willing to discuss the subject informally at the call of the American Churches. Today, over 158 denominations (30 of them American with a membership of over 30,000,000 in the U.S.A.) are now officially a part of the World Council of Churches and have gone on record with the affirmation: "We intend to stay together."¹⁰⁵

Nevertheless, an undercurrent of criticism and pessimism as regards the movement has persisted. There were those who believed that stubborn issues--theological and non-theological--would prevent any fundamental transformation of the existing denominational pattern of American Christian life.¹⁰⁶

Constructive Restatement in Theology

Students of the American theological scene have seen trends toward a constructive system-building in theology since the realignment of the thirties. The era might be said to have been inaugurated with the publication of Reinhold Niebuhr's two-volume work on The Nature and

¹⁰³From the Greek word OIKOUMENE, meaning the inhabited world. The movement may be defined as that process whereby Christian communions in every part of the world strive to discover and express a common faith and life centered in commitment to Jesus Christ as Lord. The term has a long history, but only since 1937 when it was used at a conference held at Oxford has it become popular in Protestant circles.

¹⁰⁴Gustave Weigel, S.J., A Catholic Primer on the Ecumenical Movement (Westminster, Maryland: Newman Press, 1957), p. ix.

¹⁰⁵Henry S. Leiper, "Reunion and the Ecumenical Movement," Protestant Thought in the Twentieth Century, Nash (ed.) op. cit., p. 267.

¹⁰⁶See, e.g., Schneider, op. cit., pp. 49ff.

Destiny of Man in 1941 and 1943. By mid-century, however, no American Barth had yet appeared to produce a major Dogmatik to give comprehensive and systematic expression to the new emphases in Christian thought. Any effort, therefore, to characterize the scene at this writing must be in the form of general and approximate statements.

Smith, Handy, and Loetscher point to five major characteristics of the post-liberal mind as developed in the theological center of American Protestantism:

. . . (1) the revival of a theocentric emphasis; (2) a renewed interest in biblical revelation; (3) the recovery of a realistic view of human nature; (4) a return to the question of Christology; and (5) the search for a more vital doctrine of the church.¹⁰⁷

As the period under consideration drew to a close, there seemed to be evidences of a revival of certain aspects of liberalism on the part of those who believed that the Barthian attack had resulted in overcorrection. A symposium called Liberal Theology: An Appraisal¹⁰⁸ marked the first concerted expression of a neo-liberal trend. John Bennett, in his contribution, defends human nature and human reason against neo-orthodox pessimism, although acknowledging that the earlier liberal optimism needed to come under the influence of the insights of Augustine, Luther, and Calvin.

The Resurgence of Fundamentalism

At mid-century there were signs of a resurgence of strength among the Fundamentalists, who because of connotations that had become associated with the term, preferred now to be known as conservatives or evangelicals.

¹⁰⁷Smith, Handy, and Loetscher, op. cit., p. 437.

¹⁰⁸D. E. Roberts and H. P. Van Dusen, (eds.) Liberal Theology: An Appraisal (New York: Scribners, 1942).

While their position remained essentially the same, under such thinkers as Edward J. Carnell,¹⁰⁹ Carl F. H. Henry, and Cornelius Van Til, they presented what was regarded as a more rational and philosophic defense of faith than the "first-generation" Fundamentalists.¹¹⁰

A sophisticated periodical voice of the movement, the fortnightly, Christianity Today, edited by Carl F. H. Henry, is critical of neo-orthodoxy, theological liberalism, and the ecumenical movement as represented in the National and World Councils of Churches.

Henry rejects the neo-orthodox conception that revelation consists of the acts of God, and insists that Christian truth is "propositional," that the Word is made known in actual language, that "the living God . . . has spoken . . . has inscripturated His revelation."¹¹¹

The past fifty years of theology, Henry declares, have "treated the Scriptures with despise, and the new theology is not free of a related tendency."¹¹² He regards the new dialectical theology as deceptive in its attitude toward Scripture:

It recognizes that the appeal to any part of Scripture as divine revelation is exposed to higher criticism, with which it has no desire to wage a constant warfare. Consequently, the crisis theologians deny that the Bible at any point is God's revelation; rather, they hold, any part of the Bible may become revelation by

¹⁰⁹Cf. Edward J. Carnell, The Case for Orthodoxy (Philadelphia: Westminster Press, 1959).

¹¹⁰Daniel B. Stevick in Beyond Fundamentalism (Richmond, Va.: John Knox Press, 1964) pp. 21ff. contrasts what he calls First Generation Fundamentalists (1900-1930) with Second Generation Fundamentalists (1930--).

¹¹¹Carl F. H. Henry, The Drift of Western Thought (Grand Rapids, Michigan: Eerdmans, 1951), p. 158.

¹¹²Henry, Fifty Years of Protestant Theology (Boston: W. A. Wilde Company, 1950), p. 98.

the testimony of the Holy Spirit to me. The Bible is reduced to a "sign" or "witness to" revelation, which is said to occur only in the encounter with the Holy Spirit. . . . This position, presumably, attacks higher criticism from behind, for the door is now open to as much error in the Bible as criticism might insist upon, yet faith, resting not on history nor on an inerrant Bible, would not be flustered.¹¹³

Van Til denounces neo-orthodoxy as "the new modernism." He reminds evangelicals that, apart from epistemological considerations, the crisis theologians were as eager to distinguish themselves from fundamentalism as from liberalism. The line from Augustine to Barth runs, he says, through Kant and Hegel and Kierkegaard even more than through Calvin.¹¹⁴

A New Status for Protestantism

The altered position of Protestantism in American life--and a growing awareness of the fact--was certainly an important phenomenon of the post-war period. At mid-century the Eastern Orthodox bodies increased by 1,754.7 per cent to a membership of 2,396,906; Roman Catholics constituted almost 23 per cent of the population; Protestants 35.5 per cent; and Jews reported 5,500,000.¹¹⁵ It is not surprising, therefore, that some were speaking hyperbolically of a "post-Protestant" era, and that spokesmen of both Catholicism and Judaism declared that American culture was no longer Protestant, but pluralistic.

Employing the term, "religion-in-general," to characterize America's new religious constellation, Marty asserted that "the new shape of religion in America is the result of erosion and corrosion,"¹¹⁶

¹¹³Ibid., pp. 100f.

¹¹⁴Cornelius Van Til, The New Modernism (Philadelphia: The Presbyterian and Reformed Publishing Company, 1947), pp. 364ff.

¹¹⁵Smith, Handy, and Loetscher, op. cit., p. 424.

¹¹⁶Marty, op. cit., p. 1.

a price it has paid for accommodation to its environment. The process has involved

. . . the erosion of particularity, the smoothing of the edges of witness, the loss of religious content. Particularity is challenged by a blurry, generalizing religion; distinctive witness is confronted by amiable syncretism; theological content is often replaced by sentiments about religion.¹¹⁷

Marty holds that Protestantism stands to lose the most in this process "because Protestantism had the greatest investment in the religious situation that has lately been supplanted."¹¹⁸ Contrasting the Great Awakening of the mid-eighteenth century with the mid-twentieth century revival of interest in religion, he notes that:

In 1895 the historian of American Presbyterianism, Robert Ellis Thompson, saw the true significance of the Great Awakening of the mid-eighteenth century. That awakening of American evangelicalism, he said, "terminated the Puritan and inaugurated the Pietist or Methodist age of American Church History." It was the hinge from Calvinist to Arminian America. It set the stage for the first half-dozen revivals of religion. The recent First Great Awakening of interest in religion-in-general is terminating the Pietist age and inaugurating a post-Calvinist, post-Arminian, and post-Protestant age.¹¹⁹

He concludes:

When we begin to examine the substance of America's new religion-in-general it becomes clear that it is no nuance but strict historical accuracy to call these post-Protestant times.¹²⁰

Beyond and beneath both the daily work and the professed or inherent theology of Christian ministers lies the difficult question of the mentality of the church that produces them. This in turn is affected

¹¹⁷Ibid., p. 2.

¹¹⁸Ibid., p. 32.

¹¹⁹Ibid., p. 28.

¹²⁰Ibid., p. 32.

by what H. Richard Niebuhr termed "those strange tides in history called 'climates of opinion'",¹²¹ for climate, whether the revolutionary spirit of 1776 or the optimism of industrial expansion a century later, deeply affects a church and its ministry.

So far as this elusive question can be brought to light in a brief compass, this chapter has attempted to take account of the mood and temper of the times that formed the setting for Macartney's work. It was shown that all the basic certainties of the traditional orthodoxy had been brought under serious attack. The following chapter undertakes to examine Macartney's concept of some of these "basics" to which he adhered and his response to his changing world.

¹²¹H. R. Niebuhr, "The Protestant Movement and Democracy in the United States," The Shaping of American Religion, Volume I of Religion in American Life, edited by James Ward Smith and A. Leland Jamison (Princeton University Press, 1961), p. 21.

CHAPTER III

MACARTNEY'S RESPONSE TO HIS WORLD

This chapter seeks to set against the backdrop of the flux and change, characteristic of the past half century, the ideas and basic assumptions which motivated the public utterance of Dr. Clarence E. Macartney, a consistent defender of the traditional Christian orthodoxy.

It must be remembered that Macartney came to Pittsburgh as one who had distinguished himself as "a defender of the faith" at the time of the doctrinal controversy of the 'twenties. Although he covered a wide range of subjects in his preaching, his most vibrant and traceable response to his world was at the point of his basic beliefs--beliefs which were under special attack at that period. An investigation of Macartney's Pittsburgh preaching, the focus of this study, cannot, therefore, ignore his emotional investment in, and commitment to, these beliefs at that time.

It will be shown that six basic assumptions undergirded Macartney's preaching, all of which assumptions were under attack and elicited a spirited defense particularly at the time of the fundamentalist-modernist controversy. These matters are reported in the present chapter under two divisions: (1) Basic Assumptions, and (2) Issues that Mattered.

Basic Assumptions

Macartney's credo as a religious speaker will be recognized as one man's protest against that "erosion of particularity, the smoothing

of the edges of witness, the loss of religious content" cited earlier.¹

His contribution to the Christian Century series, "How My Mind Has Changed in This Decade," (the eighth article in the series) was introduced as follows:

I hope that during the last decade I have grown in grace and knowledge and humility; but I am not afraid, and not ashamed, to confess that as to the great underlying truths--what Chalmers was wont to call "the grand particularities" of the Christian revelation--I have experienced no emotional or intellectual change in the last ten years. Of course, I have had widening experiences, and perhaps here and there the emphasis has been altered; but as regards what Coleridge called the "constituent" doctrines of our faith, I am conscious of no change.²

These "particularities" are spelled out in detail for Presbyterian Macartney in the Westminster Confession of Faith,³ to which he subscribed as "containing the 'system' of doctrine taught in the Bible."⁴

His personal response to the time spirit within this doctrinal framework was palpable and explicit. Seven books, six of them sermon volumes, deal specifically with theology and doctrine;⁵ his writing and speaking in connection with the great doctrinal controversy of the 'twenties and as Moderator of the General Assembly provide valuable examples of advocacy in the heat and clash of theological battle; a

¹Supra, p. 89.

²Macartney, "Warm Hearts and Steady Faith," The Christian Century, LVI (March 8, 1939), 315.

³The Presbyterian Church is known as a creedal church because each minister and office-bearer must pledge loyalty to the creed known as the Westminster Confession of Faith. This Confession, prepared by an assembly of divines at Westminster Abbey, was completed in 1646 and became the dominant standard of Presbyterianism in the English-speaking world.

⁴Macartney, "The Creed of Presbyterians," The Presbyterian, LXLIII (July 12, 1923), 10.

⁵The following books deal specifically with doctrinal beliefs: Twelve Great Questions About Christ, 1923; Putting on Immortality, 1926; Christianity and Common Sense, 1927; Things Most Surely Believed, 1931;

personal "Declaration of Faith" appearing in his Pittsburgh church parish periodical provides an interesting exhibit; and, of course, there is also the interpretation of his beliefs appearing in many printed sermons.

A summary statement of Macartney's interpretation of the Gospel as he believed and preached it appeared in his first sermon preached at the First Presbyterian Church of Pittsburgh, and is quoted in its entirety:

The facts which constitute the Gospel are clearly and unmistakeably declared in the Word of God. These facts are God, His inflexible holiness and His fathomless love; man, in the image of God, yet alienated, rebellious, fallen, corrupt and guilty; the redeeming love of God manifested in the incarnation of Jesus Christ, the eternal Son of God, Who by His humanity perfectly represents man and by His full Deity perfectly declares God; His sinless life and perfect obedience to the law of God; His mighty works to which He made His appeal as proofs of His origin and His authority; His death on the cross, not an accident, not as an example, not as an appeal to our emotions, but as a sin-bearer, tasting death for every man, as the sinner's substitute answering to the law of God to remain just and yet the justifier of them that believe in Jesus; His resurrection from the dead, His ascension into the heavens; His bestowal of the Holy Spirit, His present mighty intercession; His coming again in glory to judge men and angels,--these are the sublime and stupendous facts which comprise the Gospel.⁶

Occasionally, Macartney summarized the "essentials" in very brief compass--in "four indispensable planks": The doctrine of man, of Jesus as the Son of God, of the Atonement, and of the Kingdom.⁷ Again, he spoke of "four great convictions": "There are four great convictions--

Christian Faith and the Spirit of the Age (not sermons), 1940; The Faith Once Delivered (on the Creed), 1952; What Jesus Really Taught, 1958.

⁶Macartney, "Your Fellowship in the Gospel," sermon text appearing in The Pittsburgh Pennsylvania Post, April 4, 1927, p. 4.

⁷Macartney, "The Platform of Christ and the Church," pamphlet. Sermon preached at Pittsburgh, Sunday, June 14, 1936.

that there is a God; that there is a soul; that there is a life to come; and that there is a judgment to come."⁸ A similar summary comes to light in his criticism of contemporary preaching: "The most serious weakness of the modern pulpit in my judgment is the fact that it is non-Scriptural, ignores Redemption and the Atonement, and does not preach Sin and Repentance."⁹

These various points of doctrinal emphasis can be gathered together for discussion under six topics--beliefs pertaining to (1) God, (2) Man, (3) the Bible, (4) Christ, (5) the Atonement, and (6) the Kingdom.

The Doctrine of God

At the heart of the Christian message is the account of how God saves man; therefore, the Christian doctrine of God and the doctrine of man constitute the great presuppositions. Macartney logically commences his system at this point; "A man's theology, after all, his view of the Bible and of the revelation in Jesus Christ, depends upon the kind of God with which he starts."¹⁰

Committed as he was to the Westminster Confession, he approved its stress upon the sovereignty and transcendence of God--attributes which "helped to render intelligible all else." While it is true that God is immanent in the world--not a sparrow falls to the ground without Him--He is immanent in the world not because He is identified with it, but because He is the free Creator and Upholder of it.

⁸Macartney, Bible Epitaphs, p. 27.

⁹Cited in Edgar DeWitt Jones, American Preachers of Today, p. 182.

¹⁰Press release copy of address made at Princeton Seminary, April 7, 1925, Macartney Files.

In his personal Declaration of Faith he phrased it as follows:

"I believe in Almighty God, Who created all things, and Who by His wise and just providence rules all men and nations, and is infinite in His being, wisdom, power, holiness, justice, goodness and truth."¹¹

Macartney's doctrine of God was a protest against humanism, which appeared ready to dispense with God altogether, and against the "immanence" doctrine of modernism which tended to diffuse away into His creation, the personality and objectivity of God. He deplored the tendency of liberal thought to break down the separateness of God and the world, and the sharp personal distinction between God and man with the resultant depreciation of the supernatural. In 1925 he predicted, "I believe that the tide ere long will turn, and men will see that if we are to believe in God, then we must also believe in the mighty and gracious activities of God." He maintained that God Himself is so supreme and awful a miracle that once the mind of man admits belief in God, nothing can be too difficult for faith. "There is a text that is almost forgotten in our churches today, and that is what the angel said to the Virgin: 'With God nothing shall be impossible.'"¹²

Associated with his doctrine of God is the tenet of Providence, or Predestination. In this doctrine lay Macartney's reply to the puzzling mysteries of life: "I suppose I have received more requests to preach on the subject of providence and predestination than on any other subject. Nor is this strange. Things happen to us and we want to know how and why they happen. . . ." The Christian view, he said, is that all things happen "within the circle of the plan and purpose of an all-wise,

¹¹"Declaration of Faith," First Church Life, October, 1950, p. 16.

¹²Press release copy of address, Princeton Seminary, op. cit.

all-powerful and all-beneficent God. 'The decrees of God are His eternal purpose, whereby for His own glory He hath foreordained whatsoever cometh to pass.'¹³

This means that one cannot shut out from God's rule and plan even the dark, sad, tragic things of life, for then God is banished from a large part of His universe and becomes but a "spectator" God.¹⁴

Macartney shied away, however, from a double-predestinarian fatalism and determinism: "The fact is that both truths, God's sovereign purpose and man's freedom and accountability are taught in the Bible. . . . The reconciliation [of the two ideas] is to be found in things not yet revealed."¹⁵ Though there is mystery here, it was plain to him that "we are not a ball, rolled down a groove, or a puppet worked up and down on the stage by a hand behind the curtain. When we do a thing, we do it because we want to do it and will to do it."¹⁶

A characteristic emphasis growing out of this concept is Macartney's oft-stated "true Christian philosophy of life," that life is a trial and a probation where moral qualities are to be developed and exercised with a view to their coronation in the life to come. This "probationary or trial element in human life," which, he explained, was early impressed upon him by his mother, means that "life here is not a cruise of selfish pleasure nor a desperate leap in the dark, but a wise and beneficent probation where all things work together for our good,

¹³"Providence and Predestination," pamphlet, n.d. Sermon preached at Pittsburgh.

¹⁴Ibid., p. 4.

¹⁵Ibid., p. 5.

¹⁶Ibid., p. 6.

and where with fear and trembling we are to work out the secrets of our predestination."¹⁷

The Doctrine of Man

Macartney's doctrine of God at the same time determined an important aspect of his doctrine of man--the creature limitations of mankind. This awareness of the great gulf that separates the creature from the Creator, was blurred by liberal theology at the peak of the liberal movement, as observed in Chapter II. The evolutionary theory was particularly culpable at this point, Macartney contended: "The evolutionary theory of man's history and nature is incompatible with the Christian view of man." Though he does not insist that we "press too narrowly into the majestic sentences of the first chapter of Genesis," one thing is made clear, and that is that "there is a gulf fixed between man and the whole creation under him." The appearance of man is pre-faced with the saying, "Let us make man in our image, after our likeness." That, he declared, fixes a gulf between man and the whole creation. "Evolution makes the difference between man and the rest of the creation a difference of degree, of time. The Bible makes the difference one of essence, of being."¹⁸

Elements of optimism and pessimism commingle in the orthodox Christian view of man. Optimism characterizes the concept of man's high origin as expressed in Macartney's personal declaration of faith:

¹⁷"A Son's Tribute to His Mother," pamphlet printed by Wilber Hanf, Philadelphia, Pa., n.d. p. 8.

¹⁸A Christian's Difficulty with Evolution," typed manuscript in the Macartney Files (n.d., p. 6) the following note was attached: "This article is the substance of an address delivered by Dr. Macartney in a debate at New York some years ago with the late Dr. Henry Fairfield Osborn, Director of the American Museum of History, New York City, on the subject, "Does the Teaching of Evolution Menace Religion?"

I believe that man, having been created by God in his own image, has, and is, an immortal soul, capable of hearing the voice of God and doing His will, and of so great worth that Christ could say of the soul, What shall it profit a man, if he gain the whole world and lose his own soul?"¹⁹

But to Macartney this view of the high origin of man is contravened by the theory of evolution: "If the evolutionary theory of man's origin and nature is true, then we must of necessity revise the sublime affirmation of the Eighth Psalm, 'Thou hast made him a little lower than the angels,' and make it read, 'Thou hast made him a little higher than the ape.'"²⁰

Optimism gives way to pessimism in the doctrine of the fall of man. For Macartney,

the doctrine of the fall of man, the first man, and every man after him, is fundamental to Christianity. If Christ died on the cross for our sins, it must have been because we are all sinners. . . . There is no genuine Christianity without this doctrine of sin. The popular Christianity which leaves it out is a grotesque counterfeit and caricature of the Christianity of the Bible and the historic Church.²¹

As noted in Chapter II, before the decades of the 'thirties and the 'forties when a series of calamities seriously disturbed man's confident optimism so that the concept of sin was brought into vogue again, a supreme confidence in human goodness characterized popular thought. While the reality of sin had not been denied in the liberal period, its existence was often attributed to the impulses of man's animal nature, and traditional conceptions of the depth and extent of human sin were modified. The doctrine of human depravity, despite its unpopularity during this time, remained Macartney's intransigent reply

¹⁹"Declaration of Faith," loc. cit.

²⁰"A Christian's Difficulty With Evolution," ibid., p. 7.

²¹Ibid., pp. 7f.

to humanism and modernism: "Although it is the fashion today to praise and gild human nature, it is just as well to remember that all this eulogy pronounced upon human nature does not change it in the least degree."²² World War II, in Macartney's opinion, had laid the doctrine of inevitable progress and the perfectibility of man to rest: "Once again the foolish myth of natural evolution and inevitable progress, regardless of what man is, or what man does, has been exposed and condemned."²³

The Bible

At the very center of the conservative reaction to liberalism was the question of the authority and inspiration of the Bible. For the Conservative, the Bible is in detail an absolutely reliable and authoritative source of knowledge of God and his activity, and to admit even the slightest amount of "higher criticism" is to cast doubt on everything in the Bible.²⁴

According to Dr. Macartney, the ultimate question of all religion was simply this: "Has God come out of the darkness and silence and spoken to man?" The answer of the Church, he contended, has been that God has so spoken and that "in the Scriptures of the Old and New Testament we have an infallible record of that revelation. In the Protestant Church we have emphasized the divine origin, and therefore the complete authority of the Scriptures, their sufficient clarity, and

²²Sermons From Life, 1933, p. 76.

²³"The Spires of Cologne," Sermon Pamphlet, p. 5, n.d.

²⁴Dillenger and Welch observed: "To say that we can have only a little bit of criticism, which will leave intact the essentials, would be to the fundamentalist mind like saying that a woman can be 'just a wee bit pregnant.'" John Dillenger and Claude Welch, Protestant Christianity (New York: Charles Scribner's Sons, 1954), p. 228.

their finality."²⁵

In a mass meeting held in Pittsburgh in 1924 at the height of the doctrinal controversy, Macartney reminded his hearers of the stand of the Church as expressed by the General Assembly regarding the inerrancy of the Bible:

It did not declare that every extant copy and version of the Scriptures is without error, but that the Holy Spirit did so inspire, guide and move the writers of the Holy Scriptures as to keep them from error. Not that all scribes and copyists were kept from every slightest error, but that the original autographs of the Scriptures were without error.²⁶

Macartney averred that "the stars will fall from heaven before the Presbyterian Church will declare that the Scriptures can be broken and that the Bible is fallible."²⁷ Cognizant that such a position flew in the face of the prevailing views of the modern scientific mind, he nevertheless stood his ground. The question was one of ultimate authority--the choice was between revelation and rationalism:

The only alternative for an infallible record of a divine revelation for our salvation is human reason, and human reason is as the eloquent American agnostic, Robert Ingersoll, declared it to be, "a flickering torch, borne on a starless night, and blown by the winds of prejudice and passion."²⁸

Nor would he have any truck with those who, while conceding that the Bible contains high moral and spiritual values, even revelation, at the same time described it as a mass of scientific blunders, historical

²⁵"Protestantism's Tomorrow," Christianity Today, I (May, 1938), 8.

²⁶"The Irrepressible Conflict," The Presbyterian, LXLIV (February 14, 1924), 7. (Address delivered at the mass meeting for the Presbyterian faith in the First Presbyterian Church, Pittsburgh, Pa., February 5, 1924.)

²⁷Ibid.

²⁸"The Authority of the Holy Scriptures," The Princeton Theological Review, XXIII (July, 1925), 389f.

inaccuracies, and low moral views:

. . . We must face the fact that a Bible which is childish, grotesque and absurd as to its astronomy, geology and biology can never exert . . . moral authority over the minds of men. . . . You can never open the door to the reception of the Bible as a spiritual authority and guide by first of all describing it as a collection of myth and folklore, silly notions of the earth and of man, with here and there very low ideas of God. Yet this is the impossible task that many of our so-called "liberal" Protestants are attempting. But it can never be done until the east meets the west.²⁹

Macartney was confident that a more perfect knowledge would unravel many of the so-called scientific difficulties in favor of the Biblical record:

Now and then you hear someone maintain that the cosmogony or astronomy or the biology of the Bible needs revision. I do not feel so, I believe that when the whole truth is known, the revelation of God in the Scripture will be found to be in agreement with the revelation of God in nature.³⁰

But the concept of a divine revelation and the hypothesis of evolution Macartney regarded as totally incompatible. "Evolution," he said, "leaves no place for revelation."

If man has been able without a revelation to rise from a single cell in the sea to his present stature then he can make the rest of the journey . . . by himself. On the evolutionary hypothesis, God has not revealed Himself. . . . Evolution shuts man up to human reason as his sole guide. . . .³¹

And unaided human reason, he would remind us, is not capable of solving the riddle of origins:

Men are beginning to realize that we know very little about the beginnings of life and of human history, and that while we talk learnedly about the Rhodesian man and the Pithecanthropus, we are merely decorating the impenetrable veil of silence and mystery with the trinkets of human fancy.³²

²⁹Ibid., pp. 390f.

³⁰Sermons from Life, p. 76.

³¹"A Christian's Difficulty with Evolution," ibid., pp. 4f.

³²"The Authority of the Holy Scriptures," op. cit., p. 390.

But while Macartney would argue for the supremacy of faith, it was not to be blind faith. He would have resented the label, "obscurantist":

The fruit of the Tree of Knowledge has always been dangerous to those who pluck it with proud and irreverent hands. Yet knowledge we must have. The problem is how to have religion and knowledge dwell together in unity. Religion without knowledge will degenerate into superstition, and knowledge without religion will light the way to chaos.³³

Nevertheless, he had sharp criticism for those within the Church who claimed to save the Bible for intelligent faith by accommodation to the "modern mind" at the expense of faith:

The most dangerous attack on the Bible is made by those within the Churches who claim that only by such reinterpretations can we mediate between the Bible and the "modern mind," that terrible monster which now threatens to destroy Christianity after it has survived the shocks and the storms of the ages.³⁴

He points then to what he regarded as the real culprit in Biblical reinterpretation: "Perhaps the best key to the whole liberal and modernistic method with the Bible is what is called 'Progressive Revelation.'"³⁵ Acknowledging as legitimate a concept of progressive revelation in which God has revealed his will successively and increasingly through patriarchs, prophets, and the gospel, culminating in Jesus Christ, he nevertheless rejected the modernist's brand:

If some parts of the Bible are false, and others true, if this is only tribal religion and stone-age morality, and this the highest and the purest, what is to be our guide in judging and distinguishing the one from the other? Ah, there is the fatal question, and the

³³"The State of the Church," The Princeton Theological Review, XXIII (April, 1925), 185.

³⁴"The Authority of the Holy Scriptures," press release copy of address given in Cardiff, Wales, June 29, 1925, Macartney Files.

³⁵Supra, p. 55.

fatal answer must be, 'Man's reason.' And this in turn means that ultimately we depend not upon revelation, but upon human reason. The final authority is not the Word of God, but human reason.³⁶

In words reminiscent of Ingersoll's speech discovered long before at the University of Wisconsin, Macartney concludes, "Thus the world is plunged back into the abyss of human ignorance and despair where we can hear only the taunting, mocking echoes of our own cries in the darkness."³⁷

Christ

Because of its focus on the humanity of Christ,³⁸ liberalism found it hard to say that Christ was anything more than a man--a man, to be sure, in whom God was supremely immanent, whose character and teaching were divine (at any rate God-like); but this was only humanity raised to its highest power. Macartney insisted that with such an interpretation of Jesus, the modernists had vitiated true Christianity--it was no longer the gospel of Christianity at all because it had given men "another Christ":

We have Christ in the four Gospels, and outside of that silence and darkness: But the Christ of this neo-Christianity is one who did not come into the world by the stupendous miracle of the Virgin Birth, who wrought no miracles, who did not rise again from the dead in the same body with which He suffered, and whose second and glorious Advent is nothing more than the "phrasing of hope." Whoever this Jesus is, whatever power He may possess, He certainly is not the Christ of the Gospels.³⁹

Macartney drew the line clearly between those who accept Christ as the Son of God and those who regarded him simply as "the fairest

³⁶"The Authority of the Holy Scriptures," loc. cit.

³⁷Ibid.

³⁸Supra, pp. 55f.

³⁹"Protestantism's Tomorrow," op. cit., p. 7.

flower of humanity":

On the one side, we have those who are anxious to confess that Jesus Christ is the eternal Son of God, very Light of Light and God of God. On the other side, those who speak of Christ and his nature as certainly "unique," the highest and the best that has ever come from God, the highest expression of the divinity, shared though to a less degree by all mankind.⁴⁰

For those intimating that it actually made little difference what rank was assigned to Christ, he had this word:

It certainly does make a difference, for it involves the authority of the Bible. If I cannot trust the Gospels as to the first thing they tell me about Christ, then how do I know in what other particular, in the next, or the last thing they tell me about Christ, I can trust them?⁴¹

The "first thing" the gospels had revealed about Christ, he said, was the supernatural virgin birth:

The two parties differ again as to the Incarnation, the first fact of the Christian revelation. The evangelical believes that when St. Luke and St. Matthew tell us that our Lord was conceived by the Holy Ghost and was born of the Virgin Mary, they tell us what is fact, irrefragible fact. But the modernist and the liberal either deny the fact, or if they do accept it, say that it is unimportant and non-essential.⁴²

For Macartney, the difference was critical:

The difference between a Christ who commences with this first great fact, and one who commences in some other way, is the difference between a world hero, reformer, and teacher, and a world Saviour, Judge, and Redeemer.⁴³

It goes without saying that Macartney rejected the efforts of higher criticism to distinguish between the "historical Jesus" and a "Christ of faith" allegedly evolved at a later period by the early church.

⁴⁰"The Irrepressible Conflict," The Presbyterian, LXLIV (February 14, 1924), 6.

⁴¹"Another Gospel Which is Not Another," pamphlet, n.d., p. 6
Sermon preached and printed at Pittsburgh, Pa.

⁴²"The Irrepressible Conflict," loc. cit.

⁴³"Another Gospel Which is Not Another," loc. cit.

Macartney accepted the supernatural aspects of the gospel record of Christ--the virgin birth, the sinless life, the miracles, and Christ's resurrection--not as excrescences, but as belonging to the very warp and woof of the historical fabric. Of the miracles recorded of Christ he remarked, "The miracles are as a strand woven into the fabric of the garment of Christ's personality, and you cannot tear them out without destroying the fabric itself."⁴⁴ He added that since Christ claimed to work miracles, the moral authority of Christ was involved: "If you reject His miracles, you reject Him, for He said that He would work miracles and that they proved His divine authority and Messiahship."⁴⁵

The resurrection of Christ from the dead is for the evangelical, the authenticating miracle. Macartney described it as "the great evidential fact of Christianity" establishing the deity of Christ. The modernists, however, he charged, "according to the progress of their disease, either reject the resurrection altogether, or explain it in such a way as breaks down the authority of the New Testament as a credible witness to Christ."⁴⁶

The Atonement

The crucifixion of Christ as an atonement for the sins of men, with the sinner's salvation hinging upon a faith-acceptance of that atonement, is a key concept of the orthodox Christian faith.

Simplifying the ponderous statements of the Westminster Confession, Macartney expressed his personal Declaration of Faith in this article as

⁴⁴Twelve Great Questions About Christ (Grand Rapids, Michigan, 1956 (original printing, 1923), p. 76.

⁴⁵"Another Gospel Which is Not Another," op. cit., p. 8.

⁴⁶"The Irrepressible Conflict," loc. cit.

follows:

I believe that to atone for our sins Christ, out of His great love, offered Himself on the Cross a sacrifice to satisfy the Divine Justice and reconcile us unto God; and, therefore, it is not by any works of his own that man is saved, but solely by faith in Jesus Christ and His redeeming work for sinners upon the Cross.⁴⁷

Concerning the centrality of this tenet in Christianity, Macartney observed, " . . . the doctrine of the atonement has always been the central truth of the Christian religion. All of its theology, its liturgies, its art and music center in the truth that Christ died as a Substitute for the sinner upon Calvary's tree."⁴⁸

As shown in the previous chapter, this teaching had fallen out of favor with many persons during the liberal period in religion. The idea that man was a lost sinner in need of such a radical intervention in his behalf did not fit well with the prevailing mood of optimism and faith in the natural goodness of man.

Macartney saw, too, that the underlying presuppositions of the evangelical and the modernist would lead inevitably to irreconcilable positions on this issue:

With such an abandonment and denial of the Christian view of sin, it is inevitable that the central doctrine of the Christian religion, the forgiveness of sin, the Atonement, should be the next to go. . . . The evolutionary preachers see the logic in this, so they proceed in an extraordinary way to evacuate the death of Christ of its atoning significance, and make it just the highwater mark in the law of vicarious suffering which runs through the universe. Christ is an example, not a sin offering.⁴⁹

The religion of the modernists, he said, is better described as

⁴⁷"Declaration of Faith," loc. cit.

⁴⁸"Dr. Macartney in the West," The Presbyterian, LXLIV (October 16, 1924), 6.

⁴⁹"A Christian's Difficulty with Evolution," op. cit., pp. 8f.

"a Christianity of ethics, of ideals, of development, of inspiration, of education; and not a Christianity which stands or falls with one grand redemptive act by Jesus Christ."⁵⁰

In his 1939 contribution to the Christian Century, Macartney reaffirmed his loyalty to this belief by declaring, "The atonement is still to me the grand central truth of our Christian faith."⁵¹ At the same time he expressed his pleasure with what seemed to him to be a trend away from the extreme forms of liberalism:

I am glad to note what seems to be a decided swing back from the extreme modernistic position toward what may be described as the conservative or evangelical position. Certainly the modernism of the pulpit today is not so loud, confident, aggressive and arrogant as it was ten or fifteen years ago.⁵²

Nevertheless, he expressed amazement and sadness that the pulpits in 1939 should still, in his opinion, be guilty of so "wide neglect of this great truth that 'Christ died for our sins, according to the Scriptures.'" He concluded:

I may be wrong, but many of my brethren impress me as trusting and "glorying" in something other than that in which St. Paul said he put his trust--"God forbid that I should glory, save in the cross of our Lord Jesus Christ."⁵³

The Kingdom

Macartney's conception of the Kingdom of God, the traditional orthodox view, was phrased in his personal Declaration of Faith as follows:

⁵⁰"The Great Defection," The Presbyterian, LXLIII (September 20, 1923), 8.

⁵¹"Warm Hearts and Steady Faith," op.cit., p. 318.

⁵²Ibid.

⁵³Ibid.

I believe that Jesus Christ, according to His last promise, will come again in great glory to overthrow the kingdom of Satan and all that is opposed to God, and establish His everlasting Kingdom of righteousness and peace.

I believe that the dead shall be raised out of their graves at the last day.⁵⁴

As shown in chapter II, such notions were regarded as outmoded by the proponents of religious liberalism. The idea of a literal, supernatural second advent of Christ, according to the liberals, was a part of the framework of ideas into which Jesus came; and although Christ did not dispute this idea of his literal return, it was not his own, the liberal theologians said. His concern was mainly with the kingdom within--the rule of God in the hearts of individuals. Conceptions of the immanence of God and of evolutionary progress in history buttressed the faith that the transformation of society was possible; consequently, a new social emphasis and the preaching of the "social gospel" came into being.

To all of this, Macartney made unequivocal response. In 1924, comparing orthodoxy and modernism, he declared,

Every time the evangelical receives the communion he pledges his faith in the coming of Christ with the solemn words of institution, "Ye do show the Lord's death till he come." But the modernist tells us that he is never coming, that this is mere apocalyptic symbolism. It is only a figure of speech. What it teaches us is that the principles of Christ's kingdom, of the Gospels, will eventually be triumphant. . . . With such irreconcilable opinions, the wonder is not that there is now a controversy and a conflict, but that it has not come long before this.

To those who claimed that the great goal of mankind would be reached "through invincible evolution and progress," he said,

But this theory of invincible progress borrowed from the seductive romance of evolution in the physical world, will not stand the test

⁵⁴"Declaration of Faith," op. cit., p. 17.

⁵⁵"The Irrepressible Conflict," loc. cit.

of examination or experience. Man carries with him not only weapons of construction, but weapons of destruction. There is not only a path of progress to be noted among men and nations, but also a path of deterioration and decline.⁵⁶

Nor did he agree with those who asserted, "We shall reach the end, the great goal, not by any law of development or progress, but by the expansion of the Christian Church." The Church, he said, would always be confronted by a hostile and unbelieving world and therefore:

There is no reason to expect that the Church of the future will differ in any great respect from the Church of the past. So far as that is concerned, all that we can expect is that Zion will be still struggling with Babylon. Certainly, Christ did not foresee or predict that the world was going to ripen into millennial peace and righteousness without another Act of divine intervention; for He says that His coming will find the world a sinning and unbelieving world, just as it was in the day of Noah.⁵⁷

He summarized his viewpoint as follows:

Not by natural development, and not by the expansion of the Church and the spread of the Gospel will the great day of peace and righteousness come, but by the Coming of Christ, who shall bring human history to a conclusion and redemption to its climax, when the kingdoms of this world shall become the kingdoms of our Lord and of His Christ.⁵⁸

The preaching of the "social gospel," it is evident, would possess a certain incongruity in such a context of belief. According to Macartney, to identify Christianity with any movement or with any social theory was to weaken its practical influence in society. He was convinced that,

the emphasis which many of our preachers have placed on what is called the "social gospel" has not borne the fruit which its proclaimers expected. The fact is, the church has exerted the greatest social influence when it spoke least about that influence but when its religious convictions and enthusiasms were at flood tide. . . .

⁵⁶"The Second Coming of Christ," pamphlet, n.d., p. 8. Sermon preached and printed in Pittsburgh, Pa.

⁵⁷Ibid., p. 9.

⁵⁸Ibid., p. 10.

If in preaching to the times we forget to preach also to the eternities, we shall have little influence upon the times.⁵⁹

Associated with Macartney's eschatological views was his belief in the resurrection of the dead, a tenet which he regarded as "the most neglected portion of Christ's teaching":

It seems so much easier to believe in the continued existence of the soul, and leave out the resurrection of the body. . . . Man is not soul only, but soul and body, and the totality of man's existence is to share in the glories of redemption. Over and over again Jesus declared, "I will raise him up at the last day," as if he meant to say that the crowning vindication of faith in him would be to share in the resurrection. . . . The doctrine of the resurrection of the body is the ground of our hope for reunion with the beloved dead.⁶⁰

As time passed, this teaching of immortality and the future life received increasing emphasis in his preaching, he said: "In the last ten years I have emphasized more and more the doctrine of immortality and the future life."⁶¹

If the modernists were quick to brand his eschatological emphasis as too severe and pessimistic, he would claim that with the arrival of the atomic era and the "Age of Anxiety," the tables were turned. In 1946 an interviewer recorded the following impressions:

In this age of the atom bomb, when many men feel civilization is poised on the brink of a precipice, Dr. Macartney, with his bedrock convictions, is unfrightened and unruffled. Man's danger from the atom bomb, he believes, is "greatly exaggerated" and far less than from the "curse of liquor and licentiousness." "Civilization," he says, "has never destroyed itself and never will. That would defeat the purpose of God. Man may destroy himself morally but only God can wipe him off the earth."⁶²

⁵⁹Ibid.

⁶⁰"Dr. Macartney in the West," loc. cit.

⁶¹"Warm Hearts and Steady Faith," op. cit., p. 319. He makes no attempt to reconcile this idea of reward and reunion at the resurrection with the belief in an immortal soul surviving the body at death and proceeding immediately to its reward. See his series, "Beyond the Grave," The Ladies Home Journal, XLIII (February, 1926), 8, 192, 195; XLIII (March, 1926), 12, 235; XLIII (April, 1926), 42, 56.

⁶²"Biography," The Bulletin Index, CXXVIII (February 16, 1946), 17.

Issues That Mattered

In the preceding section an attempt was made to outline and summarize Macartney's basic belief system. Against this background, an effort is made now to describe specific issues in historical context which elicited Macartney's response, and to discuss other definite views and emphases of his preaching content.

The Fosdick Case

The "Fosdick Case," a pivotal event in the fundamentalist-modernist controversy, is discussed in studies dealing with the particular conflict, and has been drawn out in considerable detail in two histories of the Presbyterian Church cited in the previous chapter, The Broadening Church, by Lefferts A. Loetscher, and The Presbyterian Conflict, by Edwin H. Rian.

It is proposed to examine the episode from Macartney's perspective for whatever insights may be derived concerning him, both as a person and as a public advocate.

In describing his reaction to Fosdick's sermon, "Shall the Fundamentalists Win?" Macartney said, "It struck me as a direct assault upon cardinal Christian truth."⁶³ The trouble was, of course, that in stating the liberal and fundamentalist positions, Fosdick spoke as a Baptist and associate minister in a Presbyterian church and proclaimed frankly what the modernist position on some points was: "the virgin birth no longer accepted as historic fact, the literal inerrancy of the Scriptures incredible, the second coming of Christ from the skies an outmoded phrasing of hope."⁶⁴

⁶³The Making of a Minister, p. 184.

⁶⁴Harry Emerson Fosdick, The Living of These Days (New York: Harper and Brothers, 1956), p. 146.

That such a sermon preached from a Presbyterian pulpit should provoke "righteous indignation among the Churches and Presbyteries of the Presbyterian denomination" was inevitable, Macartney said. Nor was the indignation lessened by the fact that "in no single paragraph of the sermon did the preacher say, 'I believe this and this,' or 'I do not believe thus and thus'":

He put his views into the mouth of a party who were described as holding views opposed to the "Fundamentalists." This made the sermon all the more reprehensible, as the preacher did not openly confess to views which, by implication, it was clear that he himself held.⁶⁵

Macartney was particularly distressed that this sermon (which had been put into pamphlet form and circulated throughout the country by a publicity agent of the Rockefeller Foundation, a Mr. Ivy Lee), should have been given such wide publicity and circulation. Macartney explained that no one was searching Fosdick's books or auditing his sermons for heresy, but:

This extra-ordinary sermon was preached and published and, with the knowledge of Dr. Fosdick, widely distributed throughout the country. Hundreds of ministers found it lying upon their desks when they came to their morning task. . . . the plain fact of the case is that it did greatly grieve and exasperate not a few ministers in the church. If Dr. Fosdick and the First Church of New York had kept these peculiar goods for their own home consumption, perhaps no protest would have been made. It was the thrusting of the outrageous sermon upon the church at large which has made this incident precipitate a conflict.⁶⁶

Considerations such as these, Macartney believed, made it incumbent upon the church that a protest be made. It would have been a sad page in the history of the Presbyterian Church, he declared, "if not a single minister and not a single elder had answered Dr. Fosdick's sermon,

⁶⁵"The State of the Church," op. cit., p. 179.

⁶⁶"For the Faith: The Philadelphia Overture," The Presbyterian, LXLI (February 15, 1923), 9.

and not a single presbytery had lifted up its voice in righteous indignation."⁶⁷

Macartney's reply came in the form of a sermon, also subsequently published, under the title, "Shall Unbelief Win?", in which he denounced Fosdick's view as "subversive to Christian faith."

Also, he proceeded to initiate administrative action. As pastor of the Arch Street Presbyterian Church at that time, he was the acknowledged leader of the conservative forces of the Presbytery of Philadelphia, historically a stronghold of conservative theology in the church. Under his leadership, the presbytery in its October, 1922, meeting voted to introduce an overture to the General Assembly requesting this body to see to it that the preaching in the First Church of New York be in conformity with the doctrines of the Presbyterian Church as set forth in the Confession of Faith.

At the time of the May, 1923, General Assembly, however, the majority report of the Committee on Bills and Overtures recommended that the Presbytery of New York be allowed to conduct its own investigation and report to the 1924 Assembly. Macartney, roundly scoring this apparent straddling of the issue, closed the debate for the minority report by saying:

I wish I could pay tribute to the majority report. But I cannot. It is a masterpiece of whitewash, and the man who wrote it ought to seek employment as an exterior decorator. . . .

We take our stand upon the New Testament and the Confession of Faith. . . What you have heard here this afternoon is but the "sound of a going in the tops of the mulberry trees." The storm is coming,

⁶⁷Ibid., p. 8.

⁶⁸"Shall Unbelief Win?" (Published in two parts), The Presbyterian, LXLII (July 13, 1922), 8, 10, 26; (July 20, 1922), 8-10.

and you cannot stop it with any pusillanimous compromise.⁶⁹

When the vote was taken, the minority report of the committee recommending the Macartney-initiated overture was passed by a vote of 439 to 359.⁷⁰ The ensuing intricate involvement of judicial commission rulings, drafting and re-drafting of statements, and presbytery and session inquiries which occupied the attention of church officials for the next two years, is traced in careful detail in the works cited early in this chapter.

The upshot of the matter was that Fosdick was asked to "regularize" his position by becoming a Presbyterian minister, "subject to the jurisdiction and authority of the Church," or "not to occupy a Presbyterian pulpit."⁷¹ Fosdick declined the invitational ultimatum, and his resignation followed.

The following two years were stormy years for the churches and busy ones for Macartney. He participated in large mass meetings called to defend the faith in centers such as New York, Philadelphia, and Pittsburgh. At the same time, he began preaching a series of apologetic sermons in the morning and evening services of the Arch Street Presbyterian Church. One observer wrote of the popularity of these sermons at that time:

. . . when I was hungry for good preaching I went to Arch Street Church, and I gradually became warmly attached to my classmate, its pastor; And when . . . he raised the issue of loyalty to the Standards of our Church, I rejoiced greatly in the stand he was taking. I well remember how Sunday evening after Sunday evening

⁶⁹"Excerpts From Dr. Macartney's Closing Argument," The Presbyterian, LXLIII (June 7, 1923), 8.

⁷⁰Minutes of the General Assembly, 1923, Part I, page 253. Cited in Rian, The Presbyterian Conflict, p. 33.

⁷¹Fosdick, op. cit., p. 174.

that beautiful sanctuary was filled almost to overflowing as he expounded the great doctrines of the faith.⁷²

It was inevitable that in the May, 1924, General Assembly his name should be put forward for the office of Moderator by the conservative forces of the church. William Jennings Bryan, in a characteristic speech, made the nomination:

I present him [Dr. Macartney] as a conspicuous defender of the faith. Any one of the ten thousand ministers of the Presbyterian church would gladly have undertaken and might have done as well the work that he did in the last General Assembly, but it was his vigilance that detected the insidious attack made on the historic doctrines of the Presbyterian church; it was his courage that raised the standard of protest about which the church rallied; it was his leadership, that won a decisive victory for evangelical Christianity and historic Presbyterianism. He was the "man of the hour". . . .⁷³

Dr. Macartney, elected by the close margin of 464 to 446 votes over his opponent, has been commended for his "dignity and fairness as a presiding officer" during his term of office.⁷⁴

In the late summer of that year the newly elected moderator made a tour from the Atlantic to the Pacific and back again, speaking at large meetings in his official capacity on various aspects of these issues before the church.⁷⁵

⁷²From a tribute by Dr. Oswald T. Allis in First Church Life, Twenty-fifth Anniversary edition, April 27, 1952, p. 35. See Macartney's Twelve Great Questions About Christ, a series of sermons preached during this period.

⁷³Xeroxed copy of the speech script supplied by the Presbyterian Historical Society, 520 Witherspoon Building, Philadelphia, Pennsylvania.

⁷⁴Loetscher, The Broadening Church, p. 121. Fosdick wrote of Macartney with respect to their interchange: "He was very decent and dignified in his attitude. While his theological position was in my judgment incredible, he was personally fair-minded and courteous; Indeed, when the storm was just breaking, he wrote me directly, in order to be sure that he was not misquoting me. After which we had some frank and not unfriendly correspondence in which he presented his own unbending orthodoxy. . . ." Fosdick, op. cit., pp. 146f.

⁷⁵See The Presbyterian, LXLIV (October 16, 1924), 6-8.

In February of the following year, 1925, Macartney addressed the Princeton Theological Seminary Alumni in New York; in March he spoke at the all-Presbyterian conference of New England in Boston; April found him addressing the students at Princeton, and in May he presented the Moderatorial address to the graduating class of the Presbyterian Theological Seminary at Louisville, Kentucky.⁷⁶ In each case, Macartney spoke as an apologist for the conservative faith. Writing retrospectively of that period, he commented,

For myself, I saw very clearly at the time the great division in the church as to the Bible and Christian revelation. One had to choose between redemptive and Biblical Christianity and that vague, inchoate mass of emotionalism and pseudo-intellectualism and barren secularism popularly called "modernism."⁷⁷

He looked back upon those turbulent days without regret:

Into that battle I threw myself with ardor and enthusiasm. I have heard and read much about the paralyzing blight of religious controversy. I never found it so. For me it was a period of intellectual expansion and stimulation and enthusiastic preaching and writing. The part I took in that conflict left no "black" in my blood and no bitterness in my spirit.⁷⁸

The Church

Macartney's encounter with ecclesiastical machinery and procedures was apparently disillusioning. Refusing in his 1939 statement to acknowledge any change whatever as to the "cardinal beliefs of Christianity," he, nevertheless, admitted a transformation of attitude with respect to the denominational church.

As a church leader in the 'twenties and early 'thirties he believed that a chief function of the denominational church is to bear a

⁷⁶Dated press release copies of these addresses repose in the Macartney Files.

⁷⁷"Warm Hearts and Steady Faith," op. cit., p. 317.

⁷⁸Ibid.

corporate witness to its faith in Christ. A creedal church, such as the Presbyterian, had an advantage in that while there are many theories and opinions on the great matters of Christianity, such a church "has its own carefully articulated and logically defined views,"--views that it declares must be held and taught by its ministers. "That is what a creed and a constitution mean," he said.⁷⁹

At the time of the Fosdick case, the issue at stake, in his opinion, was "whether or not the Presbyterian Church is to continue a creedal and constitutional church." ⁸⁰ If men could be received into the church and installed in its pulpits without accepting wholeheartedly these creedal statements, then the Creed had become a scrap of paper. Speaking of those who, in his view, were disloyal to the Creed, he declared,

Loyal men in the church will do all they can to persuade them of the inconsistency of their position, so that they shall quietly withdraw. But if they do not withdraw, and if they persist in their defiance of the church, then ⁸¹ if the Presbyterian Church is to endure, it must proceed against them.

He was impatient at that time with those who feared to follow these conclusions to their logical end. To combat the "great defection" he believed it would be necessary to employ "protest and appeal and ecclesiastical procedures":

But from this method many turn away. They will pray and testify, but they will not take any action within their respective churches

⁷⁹Press release copy of address to Princeton Theological Seminary Alumni, New York, February 9, 1925, Macartney Files.

⁸⁰"For the Faith: The Philadelphia Overture," The Presbyterian, LXLI (February 15, 1923), 9.

⁸¹"The Creed of Presbyterians," The Presbyterian, LXLI (July 12, 1923), p. 26.

which would seem to challenge the Christian belief of any in those churches. They shrink from what is called the application of "force." So far as they mean to deprecate the unhappy strifes which arise from time to time in churches, their course is commendable. But, carried to an extreme, it is without courage and without logic.⁸²

But as the forces of moderation and tolerance gradually took over the control of the Presbyterian church with the ultimate result that, in the view of some observers, "a distinctive Presbyterianism was largely given up in favor of a broad ecumenism,"⁸³ his confidence in ecclesiastical procedure was weakened.

The ouster from the church of his friend, Professor Machen, over the issue of the Independent Mission Board was a further blow to his faith in ecclesiastical structure. The church, in this act, he said, witnessed against its creed, rather than for it.⁸⁴

At this time, however, when the members of the Independent Board were suspended from the ministry, Macartney did not go along with these men in their formation of another church, the Orthodox Presbyterian Church. He urged the ministers and members to stay with the parent body,⁸⁵ taking the position that the church had a sound Confession of Faith; and although the courts, boards, and agencies of the church had been disloyal to the standards in many instances, he said, nevertheless, it was the duty of each minister and member to contend for the faith and to lead the church back to a place of faithfulness to the Bible.

Acting on this conviction, he and other conservative leaders of

⁸²"The Great Defection," op. cit., p. 9.

⁸³Stonehouse, op. cit., p. 351.

⁸⁴"Warm Hearts and Steady Faith," p. 317.

⁸⁵Rian, op. cit., pp. 258f.

the church formed the Presbyterian League of Faith with the object in view of "reform from within."⁸⁶

An issue arousing the interest and activity of this league concerned the election of E. G. Homrighausen to the seminary staff at Princeton, as well as the presence of Dr. Emil Brunner of Zurich, Switzerland, as guest professor. Both men, the League contended, were exponents of Barthianism, which the members of the League regarded as being contrary to the historic position of Calvinism and Christianity. Dr. Macartney and an associate appeared before the Standing Committee on Theological Seminaries of the 1938 General Assembly to register their protest, though without success.⁸⁷

Against the background of these disappointments, Macartney's statement in the Christian Century regarding denominationalism is understandable:

More and more, I despair of getting a united witness from churches which embrace in their point of view and preaching almost any and every religious opinion. Therefore, I value less the whole ecclesiastical structure, and feel that more and more for the true witness to the gospel and the Kingdom of God we must depend upon the particular local church, the individual minister and the individual Christian.⁸⁸

Between these "individual Christians," Macartney believed, hands of fellowship reached over the separating walls of denominational barriers, not excluding the Roman Catholic church: "Whenever men confess Christ as the Son of God, and accept the Scriptures as the Word of God, there you have a true unity. . . . I cannot separate myself from the

⁸⁶Ibid., pp. 258ff.

⁸⁷Ibid., pp. 265ff.

⁸⁸"Warm Hearts and Steady Faith," ibid.

Roman Catholic who believes in Christ as the Son of God."⁸⁹

But one is not to conclude from this that Macartney was an exponent of the Ecumenical movement. While he noted with satisfaction every evidence of the breaking down of the barriers of seclusion and separation, he had his reservations regarding church union: "For myself, however, I must frankly confess I see no great contribution to the work of the Kingdom of God in the external drawing together of Protestant denominations."⁹⁰ It was his conviction that the Protestant church had exerted its strongest witness to Christ when its various denominations were strongest. The possibility which concerned him most was "the danger of effecting union by ignoring certain fundamental convictions."⁹¹

Christian Customs

There were two Christian customs which Macartney regarded as a fountain of inspiration and strength--the Christian home and the religious observance of Sunday. He expressed concern that both of these institutions were fading from the American scene.

The home and marriage.--Referring first to a loss of the "public recognition of God in the home," he said:

We have devised many schemes and orders, and built up innumerable agencies and launched "movements" so many that the mind is dazed in keeping count of them. But we have yet to discover any substitute for a God-fearing father and mother who, in the home, and in the presence of their children, prayed for their eternal salvation.⁹²

⁸⁹Things Most Surely Believed (Nashville: Cokesbury Press, 1931), p. 156.

⁹⁰"Warm Hearts and Steady Faith," ibid.

⁹¹The Making of a Minister, p. 214.

⁹²"Dr. Macartney in the West," op. cit., pp. 6f.

Macartney reported in 1939 that during the previous decade he had found himself giving increasing attention to the subject of divorce and the collapse of the home. "If the present increase in divorce is maintained," he affirmed, "the day is not far distant when divorce will compete with death as a dissolver of marriages."⁹³ Speaking of his personal practice with respect to solemnizing marriage for the divorced, he declared, "In my present pastorate I have married just one divorced person, and that one exception was due to my own carelessness in not carefully reading the license which had been left with me the day before the ceremony."⁹⁴ He maintained that the ease with which almost any divorced person can be married by Protestant ministers was "a shame and a disgrace to the Protestant Church."

Sunday observance.--Another Christian custom to which, in the past, the Protestant church had borne a "noble" witness, he said, was "the observance of the Christian Sabbath":

Who can estimate the tide of morality and spirituality which the keeping of the Sabbath has poured into the life of the Church? But everywhere today this invigorating and uplifting custom is fading and declining, and even in the homes of the ministers themselves.⁹⁵

Macartney's personal stand on Sunday observance is exemplified by his resignation from the various committees of the sesqui-centennial celebration in Pittsburgh because of its open Sunday decision,⁹⁶ and also by the following statement, which reveals his convictions regarding traveling on Sunday at the time when he was serving the church as

⁹³"The State of the Church," op. cit., p. 186.

⁹⁴"Warm Hearts and Steady Faith," op. cit., p. 318.

⁹⁵"The State of the Church," loc. cit.

⁹⁶The Pittsburgh Gazette-Times, February 7, 1927.

Moderator:

I have been surprised at some of the invitations to speak which I have received, for the senders seem to take for granted that the moderator of the Presbyterian Church has no scruples about preaching at one place in the morning and then getting on a train and traveling a hundred, or two hundred miles, for a second service.⁹⁷

Ethics and Morality

A biographical sketch appearing in the Bulletin Index of 1946

made the following observation regarding Dr. Macartney:

His sermons against secularization of the Sabbath, his condemnations of current motion pictures, liquor advertising, and vice conditions in the city have time and again made newspaper stories. He never considers the popularity of his stands.⁹⁸

While he did "take these stands," this comment could be somewhat misleading; for while these are the subjects which naturally would be given newspaper publicity, even if but incidentally referred to, they by no means represent the major emphasis of his preaching. Macartney believed that "when a man really accepts the truth of the atonement, the cross of Christ, he will need little exhortation along the lines of Christian ethics and conduct."⁹⁹ He insisted that the church has but

⁹⁷"Dr. Macartney in the West," loc. cit. Macartney here reveals his Covenanter heritage. Philip Schaff, in commenting on the "Sabbath" article of the Westminster Confession, points out that the "Puritan Sabbath" had taken over the sanctions of the original seventh-day Sabbath of the decalogue. Schaff explained: "The chief impulse to this movement was given in 1595 by Dr. Nicolas Bownd (or Bound), a learned Puritan clergyman of Norton in Suffolk. He is not the originator, but the systematizer or first clear expounder of the Puritan theory of the Christian Sabbath, namely, that the Sabbath or weekly day of holy rest is a primitive institution of the benevolent Creator for the benefit of man, and that the fourth commandment as to its substance (that is, the keeping holy one day out of seven) is as perpetual in design and as binding upon the Christians as any other of the Ten Commandments. . . ." Philip Schaff, The Creeds of Christendom, I 6th ed. (New York: Harper and Brothers, Publishers, 1877), p. 777.

⁹⁸The Bulletin Index, op. cit., p. 15.

⁹⁹"Warm Hearts and Steady Faith," loc. cit.

one task, "that of bringing sinful souls to Jesus"; and it was his conviction that the church could not accomplish this by participating "in conferences and discussions of lawlessness and immorality [and] by preaching on social, national and international affairs."¹⁰⁰

In an address given at the first commencement of the newly-established Westminster Theological Seminary he was critical of preaching which employed "these curious substitutes, Unity, Eugenics, Birth Control, Internationalism, Communityism and all that vast hokum which now is widely received as an equivalent for the Gospel."¹⁰¹

A similar thrust is evident in his introduction to Whitesell's volume, The Art of Biblical Preaching. Pointing to the wide variety of Biblical topics available to the minister, he remarked, "How tame compared with this are such contemporary themes as Rent-Control, Housing, Race Equality, Communism and the Atom Bomb."¹⁰²

When in his early ministry Macartney was sounded out about becoming a field representative for the Anti-Saloon League (his preaching on the temperance issue had come to the attention of the League officials), his father advised him, "Stick to your last."¹⁰³ To the end of his career, Macartney adhered to that counsel. The preacher, he concluded, must resist the tempting side-roads and address himself exclusively to his task of preaching the gospel:

War is bad, bestial: the defiler of the temple of the Holy Spirit.
 . . . Child labor, unjust industrial and economic conditions,
 sweatshops, unfair bargaining--all this is bad. . . . The moving

¹⁰⁰The Bulletin Index, op. cit., p. 15.

¹⁰¹"Protestantism's Tomorrow," op. cit., p. 9.

¹⁰²Whitesell, The Art of Biblical Preaching (Grand Rapids, Michigan, Zondervan Publishing House, 1950), Introduction.

¹⁰³The Making of a Minister, p. 150.

pictures are bad, with their open or, still worse, attractively disguised nakedness and seduction. The open advocacy of the sex ethics of the stockyard and the barnyard is bad; the prurient stream of popular literature is bad. . . . But the gospel of Christ is not responsible for these things. The Church is not responsible for them. . . . Ours it is to hold up the lamp of truth, to pronounce God's judgments upon a wicked and adulterous generation, and ever to say to Zion, "Thy God cometh."¹⁰⁴

Summary

Macartney's loyalty to the tenets of Christian orthodoxy as represented by the Reformed tradition was unquestionable throughout his long career. The fundamentalist-modernist controversy, however, besides bringing him to the forefront in evangelical circles, also provided for Macartney a made-to-order situation for the articulation and persuasive public presentation of his beliefs.

He took his position without mental reservation upon the Bible as the Word of God, and "the only infallible rule of faith and practice." He insisted that without the historical foundation of revelation, the Christian gospel has no power as simply a symbolic record of experience.

As noted, these basic assumptions which motivated his preaching were based upon the presupposition of a supernaturalism uncongenial to the modern mind. His doctrine of God, as sovereign and transcendent; of Christ as the incarnate Son of God, based upon the historical fact of the virgin birth; of man as fallen and depraved, and the cross of Christ as central for his salvation were all beliefs which were regarded as being incompatible with the prevailing scientific mood.

Macartney was fully aware of this incompatibility but was not disturbed by it; indeed, what he feared most was just such accommodation to the mood and mind of his world as would evacuate Christian belief as

¹⁰⁴Peter and His Lord, pp. 133ff.

he conceived it:

No greater tragedy could befall the Christian Church than to have men think that Christians were ready to throw away any portion of the divine revelation, for the sake of gaining the support of the mind of the age.¹⁰⁵

.

From this consideration of Macartney's response to his times, we now turn to an examination of his relationship to the immediate world in which he moved as a preacher of the Christian Gospel, namely, the First Presbyterian Church of Pittsburgh.

¹⁰⁵Twelve Great Questions About Christ, p. 68.

CHAPTER IV

MACARTNEY AND "FIRST CHURCH" OF PITTSBURGH

The city of Pittsburgh has a long and colorful history, and closely inter-linked with that history is the story of the First Presbyterian Church.¹ The first appearance of the First Presbyterian Church in ecclesiastical records dates back to 1773, when a notation was made on April 14 of that year in the minutes of the Donegal Presbytery recording a petition from the church at "Pitts Burg" for supplies.²

The Scotch-Irish settled Pittsburgh; and although many other nationalities have come and gone, it is still predominantly a Scotch-Irish city in spirit. Not all of those early settlers were cultured, educated Christians. They were pioneers and some were adventurers, but all had a Presbyterian background and were good material for Presbyterianism.

Arthur Lee, of Virginia, who was evidently a Cavalier and an Anglican, visited Pittsburgh in 1783 and had this to say about what he saw:

It is inhabited almost entirely by Scots and Irish [Scotch-Irish] who live in paltry log houses, and are as dirty as in the north of Ireland, or even Scotland. There are in town four attorneys, two

¹See., e.g., William M. Darlington, "Sketches of Pittsburgh in the Last Century, with an account of the organization of the First Presbyterian Church in 1786-7", Centenary Memorial of the Planting and Growth of Presbyterianism in Western Pennsylvania and Parts Adjacent. . . . (Pittsburgh: Benjamin Singerly, 1876), pp. 251-83.

²Cited by C. E. Macartney in "Tell It to the Generation Following," pamphlet, n.d., p. 8. Sesqui-centennial historical sermon preached at First Presbyterian Church, Pittsburgh, Pa., December 2, 1934.

doctors, and not a priest of any persuasion, nor church nor chapel, so that they are likely to perish without the benefit of clergy.³

The picture is perhaps exaggerated and drawn by one unable to recognize diamonds in the rough.

Macartney's Inheritance

Log Church to Cathedral

About the time Lee was writing this, some of these Scotch-Irish of whom he spoke so contemptuously were forming themselves into the nucleus of what was to become the First Presbyterian Church. About this same time the Penn heirs deeded to this group two and a half lots of land, to which another contiguous lot was added by purchase. On the land thus secured, the First Church has stood from its beginnings to the present day--a log church at first, replaced twenty years later by a brick building. The present handsome stone, Cathedral-like structure of modified Gothic architectural design, was built in 1905, the year Macartney began his ministry. Embellished with richly-stained glass windows from Tiffany of London, the church with its furnishings is valued at \$4,680,000.⁴ Today, bearing the address of Sixth Avenue at Wood Street, it stands in the heart of down-town Pittsburgh, surrounded by tall business buildings with not a residence in sight.

Macartney's Predecessors

In its long history of almost 200 years the church has had only ten regular pastors, of whom Dr. Macartney was the ninth. It has been

³Quoted by Walter L. Lingle, "A Significant Anniversary," Christian Observer, CXXXV (July 9, 1947), 3.

⁴Interview with Robert J. Lamont, pastor, May, 1965.

said that "every institution is the lengthened shadow of some man," the man in this case being Dr. Francis Herron, who was pastor from 1811 to 1850. He is described as a man of deep piety and forceful character who placed an indelible mark upon the thinking and character of First Church. His memorial tablet, prominent in the vestibule of the church: bears this inscription:

IN MEMORIAM
FRANCIS HERRON, D.D.

Born June 28th, 1774--Died December 6th, 1860
A dignified, decided, able, courageous and courteous
man. An ardent Christian, faithful Pastor, impressive
preacher, and an honored Presbyterian, revered by the Church
he served and the city he adorned.

All of Macartney's predecessors were men of marked ability and stature in the church. To call the roll: Dr. William Paxton (1851-1866); Dr. Sylvester Scovel (1866-1883); Dr. George T. Purves (1886-1892); Dr. David R. Breed (1894-1898); and Dr. Maitland Alexander (1899-1927).

Paxton and Purves afterward became professors in Princeton Theological Seminary; Breed became a professor in the Western Theological Seminary; and Scovel served as president of the College of Wooster. Four pastors of First Church, Herron, Paxton, Alexander, and Macartney, were elected to the high office of Moderator of the General Assembly.

An Institutional Church

Macartney inherited from his predecessor, Dr. Alexander, whom he described as an "administrative genius,"⁵ a smooth-functioning church organization possessing all the characteristics of the "institutional

⁵The Making of a Minister, p. 205.

church," a phenomenon of the twentieth century.⁶

Alert to the changes which were coming over Pittsburgh, and the retreat of the church membership to the suburbs, Dr. Alexander, with a vision of a church serving the multitudes who come and go in the midst of a great city, organized the church for a seven-day week program of service and fellowship.

Under Alexander's pastorate there were developed such organizations as the Mother's Club, the Thursday Noon Club, the Thursday and Friday Night Girl's Clubs, the Tuesday Sewing, the Boys' Club, the Church Missionary and the Church Nurse organization, and the Korean Club.

It was to this reputation of the church as a superbly organized institution that Dr. Alexander's assistant appealed in a letter urging Dr. Macartney to accept the call to come to First Church:

The First Church, as you know is a well organized church, but it is also united and harmonious. . . .

You will have the backing of the biggest crowd of Christian people a minister ever dealt with. The Session and Trustees are a unit and are laying their plans to support you as they have supported Dr. Alexander. The women are willing workers, and the army of volunteer workers make our Institutional Work possible. The young people flock to the church and many of them are well trained to successfully take up the work when vacancies occur in the ranks.

As you know our Sunday School is a joy and delight, and gives an opportunity for real christian work the average pastor covets. You will be delighted with the Clubs. They have been started right and

⁶Atkins describes the activities of such a church in a chapter entitled, "The Rise of the Institutional Church": "They keep their doors open seven days a week. They 'preach the gospel' Sunday mornings (and occasionally other things of a more ephemeral character Sunday evenings). They carry on religious education along a wide front. They have ladies' aid, guilds, and missionary societies. . . . men's organizations and classes (variously named), Boy Scouts and Girl Scouts, other boys' and girls' clubs, chorus choirs, choirs of assorted ages and gender, orchestras, bands, lectures, libraries, concerts, mothers' meetings, luncheon clubs, dinners, suppers, teas, dramatics, athletics, sewing classes, domestic science, employment offices, visiting nurses, health classes, day nurseries, dispensaries and clinics, civics and economic classes-- Douglass names thirty-three typical organizations and activities." Gaius Glenn Atkins, Religion in Our Times (New York: Roundtable Press, Inc., 1932), p. 78.

all their work and play grow out of a real christian atmosphere.
We are praying that you will accept the call. . . .⁷

A Center of Conservatism

Another factor that must have held strong appeal for Macartney was the long tradition of conservatism of this congregation. A Presbyterian editor has noted that:

. . . the First Church, as the name implies, is the mother of Presbyterianism in Pittsburgh, and Pittsburgh is the greatest center of Presbyterianism in America, and perhaps in the world. I also venture to say that it is the most conservative center of Presbyterianism in America. The Presbyterian Church, U. S. A., and the United Presbyterian Church each has approximately one hundred churches in Pittsburgh and its suburbs.⁸

This stamp of conservatism had been deeply imposed by Macartney's predecessor, Dr. Alexander, who has been described as an "eloquent foe of 'isms'." His message at First Church is well summed up in the charge he gave to the congregation at the dedication of the Mary McMasters Jones preaching pulpit. Looking to the future, Dr. Alexander said:

I charge you, the members of this Church, to see to it that when my work has been finished in this Church, that no man shall ever stand here as its minister who does not believe in and preach an inspired and infallible Bible, a living Christ who is God, and the Cross and shed Blood, the only way of everlasting life. Let no graces of speech, executive ability or power, charm of diction or literary equipment, obscure the paramount qualification for a minister of this Church, namely that he shall be true to the Bible, to all the standards of the Presbyterian Church, to the Dicty of God's only Begotten Son, and Salvation through His Precious Blood alone.⁹

As a self-styled "conservative" Dr. Macartney subscribed to these qualifications for the ministry of First Church as set down by the man

⁷W. A. Jones, Letter dated February 2, 1927, Macartney Files.

⁸Lingle, op. cit., p. 2.

⁹The Making of a Minister, p. 205.

who would later personally recommend him to this pulpit.

Looking back to the time when he took over the pastorate of the Pittsburgh church, Dr. Macartney observed: "He [Dr. Alexander] handed me a great possession."¹⁰

Relationship To Church And Community

As An Administrator

Dr. Macartney built upon, and enlarged, the institutional aspects of the church initiated by his predecessor. In 1947, on the twentieth anniversary of his ministry at First Church, an edition of the parish periodical, First Church Life¹¹ described the work of sixteen service organizations as well as the work and organization of the church in general. At this time, the church membership, numbering approximately 2500, was served by an administrative staff comprised of the senior minister, two assistant pastors, the session of thirty-two members, and ten trustees. In addition, there was a staff of paid workers consisting of the following officers: assistant to the treasurer, Sunday School secretary, church clerk, church missionary, church secretary, church nurse, girls' club secretary, building custodian, and dietitian. Five telephones served the needs of the staff; a church cafeteria, open five days a week, provided an important convenience, as did also a nursery for small children which was open daily.

Following the tradition established by Dr. Alexander, Macartney served as superintendent of the Sunday School, which, with an enrollment of almost 1200 by 1947, was acknowledged as the largest in Pittsburgh.

¹⁰The Pittsburgh Sun-Telegraph, April 26, 1952, p. 7.

¹¹First Church Life, Twentieth Anniversary edition, April, 1947.

When Macartney, noting that the week-day and week-night meetings of the church were largely for women and children, suggested such a meeting for men, he was told it would not succeed. Nevertheless, he ventured a beginning on the first Tuesday of November, 1930, when twelve men appeared. From that small beginning the Tuesday Noon Club grew steadily, "until now it has a membership of two thousand, and a weekly average attendance of over eight hundred men."¹² Macartney believed it to be the largest stated men's meeting of the kind in the country.

Volunteered comments by members of First Church regarding Dr. Macartney's relationship to the administrative bodies of the church suggest there was a spirit of mutual respect, with apparently an amiable and cordial working relationship existing between the pastor and both the session and the board of trustees.¹³

While Dr. Macartney appears to have adapted himself very well to a highly-organized institutional church with its heavy administrative demands, he "left something to be desired" as a presbyter on the denominational level. Even though he once had taken a prominent part in several church battles, he had largely withdrawn from all church conflict and controversy after coming to Pittsburgh. Only on occasions when an issue deeply interested him was he to be heard from by the church at large. An assistant wrote after his death:

It must be admitted that as presbyter our friend left something to be desired. In a day when the mesh of churchmanship was not nearly so entangling as now, he appeared on the floor only as "something

¹²The Making of a Minister, p. 212.

¹³An example is a note from the widow of a man who had served as Ruling Elder under Macartney over a period of fourteen years who reports: "He had a very close relationship to the members of the session and a deep regard for their families," Respondent #50.

important" was being discussed. To even close friends and devotees, this was a source of despair.¹⁴

As a Pastor

Macartney came to Pittsburgh with the reputation of being a visiting pastor who planned to call on all his parishioners annually. With the larger church and increased administrative load, it was impossible to make a complete visitation as before, "but I did as much as I could, sometimes taking one of the elders with me, sometimes one of the assistant ministers, and often going alone, both by day and by night."¹⁵

Although it was impossible to call at every home personally, it was nonetheless, his goal that the entire membership be covered annually with the aid of his ministerial assistants, who reported the results of their work in regularly-held staff meetings. The high degree of "family-feeling" characteristic of First Church, according to observers, was attributed to this pastoral emphasis.¹⁶

Although parishioners under Macartney sometimes complained of an aloofness and reserve on the part of their minister which some found difficult to associate with the pastoral role,¹⁷ only eight out of fifty-eight actually reported that he did not fulfill their expectations as a

¹⁴C. Ralston Smith, Christianity in the World Today, I (March 18, 1957), 28. Another associate declared that Macartney, after looking in briefly on a meeting of the Presbytery, which was usually held at First Church, would walk away saying, "There, I have attended Presbytery." Interview with Paul B. Rhodes, June, 1965.

¹⁵The Making of a Minister, p. 208.

¹⁶Interview, Paul B. Rhodes, June, 1965, Hayward, California.

¹⁷See Appendix XI-E.

pastor.¹⁸

A parishioner, writing a note of appreciation to his pastor in 1947, reminds him that her children, grown now, have never known another pastor, and adds "How much--oh so very much you've done for them. . . . Remember how you questioned _____ about God's truths when she was quiet enough to sit a while on your knees then she'd tumble off and play a while, then back again to listen?"¹⁹

Typical of many comments volunteered by parishioners are the following:

" . . . always prompt in coming to call when I was sick or in sorrow."

"I shall never forget his loving sympathy when I lost my father in 1929. . . . I never went to him with any problem that he did not show understanding and found the answer."

"He was a man's man--did a great deal of counselling with men of all walks of life--he was greatly respected by everyone."

"When he visited our home you always felt blessed . . . always prayed for whole family. . . . Mother was not a member of his church, but he and Rev. Henry came to see her in the hospital in pouring rain and at the time Dr. Macartney was not well himself."

"My husband and I visited him at Fern Cliffe shortly before his death. He was still the same dear precious friend and pastor--thoughtfully asking regarding each of our grown children by name and sending his love and blessings to them."²⁰

Because of a large and regular following of Sunday evening worshippers, many of whom were not members of his church, Macartney came to regard himself as pastor of a second congregation:

In all three churches and all three cities, Paterson, Philadelphia, and Pittsburgh, I have felt that I have been pastor in a double

¹⁸See Appendix XI.

¹⁹Letter, dated March 11, 1947, Macartney Files.

²⁰Respondents #8, #46, #22, #47, #50.

sense, pastor of my own members, and pastor of the great number not members of my own church, but who came to the Sunday night service.²¹

Many of Macartney's sermon illustrations drawn from his pastoral experiences grew out of these contacts with people who heard his preaching but were not enrolled members.²²

A ministerial assistant testified of Macartney, "He . . . was a good pastor. He made many calls on the sick and shut-ins, the poor as well as the rich."²³

Blackwood's observation is in confirmation of this opinion:

His twenty-five hundred members, spread out all over Greater Pittsburgh, receive more intensive pastoral care than the members of many a village church whose pastor does not believe in ringing doorbells. All the while Dr. Macartney keeps the pulpit first.²⁴

As a Preacher

Macartney was described as "a natural born preacher who dearly loves to preach and who is never far removed from the mighty business of unfolding the Scriptures. . . ."²⁵ It was in the pulpit that he had built a name in his two previous churches, and his twenty-six years in Pittsburgh served further to enhance that reputation.

During those years the flow of printed sermons in pamphlet and book form increased, thus bringing him to the attention of a national

²¹The Making of a Minister, p. 221.

²²See, e. g., the first five sermons of More Sermons From Life (Nashville, Tenn.: Cokesbury Press, 1939).

²³Correspondence from C. Ralston Smith, October 19, 1965, Oklahoma City, Oklahoma.

²⁴Andrew Watterson Blackwood, Preaching in Time of Reconstruction (Great Neck, New York: The Pulpit Press, 1945), p. 40.

²⁵Edgar DeWitt Jones, American Preachers of Today (Indianapolis: The Bobbs-Merrill Company, 1933), p. 175.

and international audience. He wrote:

In my Pittsburgh ministry I began to emphasize more and more the printed word. Every month several sermons were printed in pamphlet form, distributed to the Sunday congregations, and sent out with the church magazine, "First Church Life," to persons all over the world.²⁶

During the war years, bundles of the printed sermon pamphlets were sent to chaplains all over the world and distributed to service men.

The word regarding his skill in the pulpit spread in the Pittsburgh area as well, and many who eventually became members of the church admit that it was his reputation as a preacher that led them to hear him. Replies to the question "What factors led you to hear him the first time?" ran:

"His fine reputation for strong sermons."

"Reports of others--his preaching."

"His reputation as a preacher--his preaching."

"His outstanding reputation."²⁷

Blackwood observed:

In almost every local community of Greater Pittsburgh one can find an attractive Presbyterian church. Why then do many persons, especially the young, travel miles downtown by bus or train or automobile? They wish to hear Dr. Macartney!²⁸

Having heard him once, many continued to return and eventually became members of his congregation. One parishioner, who described himself as a farmer with a grammar school education, wrote of his first visit to hear Dr. Macartney: "I set [sic] glued to the seat listening, as most preachers I heard before ran around in circles. . ." From that point on "we attended every Sunday morning. We drove 45 miles every

²⁶The Making of a Minister, p. 215.

²⁷Respondents #2, #34, #36, #54.

²⁸Blackwood, op. cit., p. 39.

Sunday one way to hear him. . . . We drove through snow and ice from the West Virginia State line."²⁹

It is understandable, therefore, that as his fame as a preacher grew, particularly in the circles of the orthodox, he would be besieged by requests for his services as a guest speaker. In addition, his interests in local and American history brought him into demand as a lecturer. While not all of these requests could be ignored, he was not easily lured away from his own pulpit.

It is a great thing for the preacher if he likes to preach in his own pulpit more than anywhere else. I have learned by experience to say No to nearly all the invitations which come to speak and preach in different places over the country, and, except in the summer vacation, I am rarely away from my own pulpit.³⁰

This decision to keep close to the home pulpit laid heavy demands upon him for study and sermon preparation, since he had placed himself under a regimen of a minimum of four speaking appointments per week:

The Wednesday night service.--Resumed by Dr. Macartney in 1927 when he came to Pittsburgh, this service assumed an important place in the ministry and worship of First Church. It provided opportunity for consecutive Bible study, and in these series ground was often broken for sermons to be preached later at the Sunday services. Some of these studies appeared later in book form, such as: Sons of Thunder (a series on great preachers), Parallel Lives of the Old and New Testament, Things Most Surely Believed, What Jesus Really Taught, Putting on Immortality, and Wrestlers with God.³¹

²⁹Respondent #32.

³⁰The Making of a Minister, p. 213.

³¹First Church Life, Twentieth Anniversary Edition, April, 1947, p. 17.

The Tuesday Noon Club.--At first, visiting ministers were brought in to address the men; but after a few months he took the meeting over himself, coming to regard this appointment as extremely important and rarely to be broken. An assistant who was associated with Macartney in those days observed, "When Dr. Macartney took it over and began to speak regularly the attendance skyrocketed."³²

Macartney's sermons on these occasions, dealing mainly with practical aspects of Christianity, were adapted to the interests of this unique audience. A series of eleven addresses, "Along Life's Highway," for example, drew lessons for living from highway signs.³³

Of this type of public address Macartney noted, "It is a kind of speaking and preaching that is quite different from the more formal pulpit sermons, and there is a certain ease and freedom of speech which makes it a delight to the speaker."³⁴

Two Sunday services.--Besides superintending the Sunday School, Macartney preached regularly both morning and evening, preparing for the evening service first because, he said, it was the most likely to be slighted. Attendance at the morning service, according to the testimony of assistants,³⁵ ran consistently from 1200 to 1600, filling the main sanctuary including the balcony and flowing over into the Sunday School room, or chapel as it was called. The evening service, though also conducted as a worship service, encouraged a slightly less formal atmos-

³²Letter from John K. Highburger, October 22, 1965, Ramsey, New Jersey.

³³Preaching Without Notes, p. 99.

³⁴The Making of a Minister, p. 211.

³⁵Attendance estimates are based on the testimony of assistant ministers whose terms covered a large portion of Macartney's career in Pittsburgh.

where, particularly in the choice of the hymns and music. Estimates of the evening attendance ran from 500 to a full house, with perhaps 500 being an average figure. Visitors at the morning services averaged ten per cent of the audience, with forty to fifty per cent of the congregation in the evening being comprised of nonmembers.

The sermons at both services carried a characteristic evangelical note; and while at times one can detect a slanting of a sermon to one or the other of these two audiences, by and large, the similarity of emphasis and style is so great that unless indicated, it is difficult to distinguish at which service a sermon was preached. These sermons presented at the Sunday morning and Sunday evening services of the First Presbyterian Church of Pittsburgh comprise the bulk of his published and voice-recorded addresses available for this study.

As a Citizen of His Community

Dr. Macartney participated only rarely in civic affairs, avoiding membership on committees and boards to which a minister is often invited.

A biographical sketch appearing in a Pittsburgh publication reported:

This stocky, wide-browed, stern-faced man, so high in Presbyterian councils of the nation, so famous as an evangelical preacher, is less intimately known and connected with community affairs than any other pastor of an important Pittsburgh church. He takes no part in inter-faith movements, fails to grow enthusiastic about most civic reform or patriotic organizations. The explanation is his conviction that the church has only one job--the task of bringing sinful souls to Jesus.³⁶

This is not to say that he was not an influence in city or community life. His hope was that he might bring a Christian influence to bear by speaking out on issues that caused him concern. His influence was aided by his success in maintaining a good press. As suggested

³⁶"Biography," The Bulletin Index, CXXVIII (February 16, 1946), 15.

earlier, his sermons against secularization of Sunday and his condemnation of current motion pictures, liquor advertising, and vice conditions in the city, frequently made newspaper stories.³⁷ As in Philadelphia, he kept close to the pulse of the city by taking midnight walks through the "tenderloin" section of the city and by visiting the men brought by the police in the middle of the night into the station houses.³⁸ His flair for local historical lore resulted in several small books about Pittsburgh: Not Far From Pittsburgh, Right Here in Pittsburgh, and Where the Rivers Meet. As a consequence, he was an occasional speaker at commemorative events of the city.³⁹

Macartney also received wide publicity when on D day and again on V-E Day, from the street pulpit of his church, known as the Geneva pulpit, he conducted a patriotic rally, leading a crowd thronging Sixth Avenue from corner to corner in an expression of prayer and dedication.⁴⁰

In spite of Macartney's reluctance to be drawn into specific community projects, the Pittsburgh Junior Chamber of Commerce recognized his position of influence in the city when it honored him as the Man of the Year in the Field of Religion for 1952. The letter written to him with this announcement reads in part:

Dear Dr. Macartney:

Each year at our Man of the Year Banquet, the Junior Chamber of Commerce presents special awards to those who have been outstanding

³⁷This Study, p. 122.

³⁸The Making of a Minister, p. 18.

³⁹For example, Macartney was the speaker at "Location Day" ceremonies marking the 200th anniversary of George Washington's visit to the Point (the heart of Pittsburgh), The Sun-Telegraph, November 23, 1953, p. 1

⁴⁰First Church Life, op. cit., p. 33.

in their own field of endeavor during the previous year.

It is my pleasure to advise you that you have been selected as the leading figure in the field of Religion for the year 1952. The presentation of a certificate will be made at the William Penn Hotel on January 22, 1953.⁴¹

The Image of the Man

It is no simple matter to recapture the image of this man, still vivid in the minds of many, yet rarely sharply defined even by those who thought they knew him well. A former associate warns that unless one knew Dr. Macartney personally " . . . it will be extremely difficult for you to portray him faithfully."⁴²

Another writes:

Dr. Macartney was an enigma, a strange person. He addressed all the staff as Mr., Mrs., or Miss.--and always called me John; but I never felt as close to him as some others did. I know that he spoke to me of very personal things.⁴³

A synthesis of impressions gained from personal questionnaire, private correspondence, and published materials leads one to the conclusion that he was a "loner" though in the midst of many people, in a calling that brought him into constant contact with people. At the same time, however, he was a man of sensitive human spirit, sympathetic, and understanding--qualities which he best conveyed in the (for him) less-threatening atmosphere of a preaching occasion, or to children and close friends. One observer said, "It is only with children, old people, church employees and his own family that Dr. Macartney loosens the severe lines of his face, loses the reserve that makes most people regard him as

⁴¹From Raymond S. Ehrman, Chairman, Awards Committee, December 15, 1952, Macartney Files.

⁴²Letter, C. Ralston Smith, October 19, 1965, Oklahoma City, Oklahoma.

⁴³Letter, John K. Highburger, Oct. 22, 1965, Ramsey, New Jersey.

a cold, world-detached, ivory tower preacher."⁴⁴

From the reading of his sermons alone, the impression is unavoidable that their author was a man possessing a knowledge of human nature and a "warm heart." It is significant that the large majority of parishioners recording their impressions of Dr. Macartney as a person report him as "kind" and "understanding," while at the same time reporting a noticeable reserve and aloofness.⁴⁵ A number explained that to those who did not know him he appeared to be "impersonal" and "abrupt in manner," but that this was not his true nature. Others acknowledged that he tried, but did not know how, to get close to people:

"He often indicated he would like to be closer to people."

"He did not have that warm feeling that you usually expect in a minister. However, this was a type of personality. I am sure that he would have loved to be more cordial, but found this very difficult. . . ."

"Dr. Macartney was 'aloof' in manner or at least he created that impression. . . . But at times he would say or do something that would make one feel that perhaps he did not feel aloof inside."⁴⁶

Apparently, in spite of his native reserve (and perhaps an actual shyness of people) Macartney succeeded in building a strong and devoted following in his church.

Respondents to the questionnaire, with rare exception, expressed a strong positive regard with only a sprinkling of complaints regarding his manner of distant reserve. Some reported their impressions in the language of hyperbole:

"The church membership worshipped him."

"He was loved and worshipped by all who knew him as I knew him."

⁴⁴Bulletin Index, loc. cit.

⁴⁵See survey of the questionnaire, Appendix XI.

⁴⁶Respondents #12, #53, #40.

"Dr. Macartney seemed almost divine."⁴⁷

It was Blackwood's contention that the secret of Macartney's drawing power as a speaker was his personality, but that, as a "son of the Covenanters . . . he may be more worthy of note for strength than charm."⁴⁸ Perhaps he had in mind those qualities of moral discipline and integrity commonly associated with the Puritan character. Macartney by precept and example exemplified these qualities. A cousin described his personal life as "impeccable." "I never knew one who conveyed an equal impression of integrity and dignity. He was ascetic, almost like a monk. I never knew him to take a drink. His only vice was red silk pajamas."⁴⁹

Perhaps equally as suggestive of a quality of rock-like strength was his consistent unwavering and unbending adherence to his basic religious convictions. Referring to this side of his character, a Pittsburgh newspaper, on the twenty-fifth anniversary of Macartney's pastorate, editorialized: "In an age of confusion and fear, the stalwart minister of First Church has stood like a veritable Gibraltar for the fundamental doctrines of the Christian faith."⁵⁰

.

The memorial service for Dr. Macartney, held in First Church on George Washington's birthday, had been planned in detail by Macartney

⁴⁷Respondents #10, #33, #25.

⁴⁸Blackwood, op. cit., p. 39.

⁴⁹Interview with Dr. Anne Cook, May, 1965, Pittsburgh, Pa.

⁵⁰The Pittsburgh Sun-Telegraph, "A Giant in the Pulpit," April 28, 1952, p. 12.

himself, who arranged that his former assistants be brought back to participate. This chapter closes with a paragraph from a tribute offered by one of the men:

There were many facets to his disciplined life. The primary quality that impressed me through the years was Committal. He was Christ's man. Personal ambitions, social relations, natural desires were subjugated to his responsibility to be Christ's ambassador. In reality, Dr. Macartney was married--to the Church!⁵¹

Summary

When in 1927 Dr. Clarence E. Macartney was called to succeed the popular Maitland Alexander to Pittsburgh's First Presbyterian Church, he was assuming the pastorate of the leading church in a presbytery described as "one of the chief heirs in America of Scotch-Irish Presbyterianism. . . ." ⁵² As a leader of the forces of conservatism in the church, he was stepping into a pulpit committed to a defense of the orthodox faith.

He adapted himself quickly to the new demands of a highly organized institutional church; but he won his following by a consistently high level of sermon production, drawing large crowds to both morning and evening services--this in a down-town church where the evening services especially would test a preacher's drawing power.

An outer shell of reserve, verging at times on abruptness of manner, was disappointing to some of his parishioners; but on the whole, he was perceived to be a person of warm heart and sympathetic spirit, and admired as a man of irreproachable personal integrity, strength, and dignity. His scholarly interests, reflected in his sermons and books,

⁵¹C. Ralston Smith, First Church Life, Memorial Edition, April, 1957, p. 36.

⁵²Lefferts A. Loetscher, The Broadening Church, (University of Pennsylvania Press, 1957), p. 110.

facilitated the public image of an intellectual's pastor, yet one who at the same time refused to see any inconsistency between his championing of orthodox Christianity and an intellectual respectability.

.

From this survey of Dr. Macartney's relationship to his immediate world of Pittsburgh and Pittsburgh's First Presbyterian Church, the study turns to an examination of his expressed views and theories pertaining to the homiletic art.

CHAPTER V

A PRACTITIONER'S VIEW OF HIS ART

Macartney indicated his preference for the role of a practitioner to that of a professor of homiletics when in 1925 he was elected to the chair of Christian Ethics and Apologetics at Princeton Seminary with the understanding that at the appropriate time he should be transferred to the Chair of Homiletics. Of his decision to decline that invitation he wrote:

I have never doubted that I made the right decision when I declined the chair to which I had been elected. When the time came for the final decision, I felt that I would rather preach myself than try to tell others how to preach.¹

It was inevitable, however, that he should be besieged by requests to share his methods and success secrets with fellow ministers and ministerial students. At first, he recalls, he was reluctant to accept the invitations to deliver lectures at religious assemblies, colleges, and seminaries, "but finally I reflected that I had had some unusual opportunities for study and meditation and travel, and at least an average amount of practical experience. Hence, I accepted some of the invitations which appealed to me. . . ."2

Among the lectureships which "appealed" to him are the following: Lectures on the Stone Foundation at Princeton Theological Seminary in 1928; the Ott Lectures at Davidson College in 1934; the Auxiliary Lectures on the James Sprunt Foundation at Union Seminary in Richmond

¹The Making of a Minister, p. 198.

²Ibid., p. 222.

in 1942; the Bussing Lectures at Western Theological Seminary at Holland, Michigan, in 1941; the Smythe Lectures at the Columbia Theological Seminary in 1939; The Princeton Institute of Theology in 1944; the Payton Lectures at Fuller Theological Seminary in Pasadena, California, in 1950; and others.

Three of these lecture series resulted in books pertaining to the preaching art: the Princeton Institute series as Preaching Without Notes,³ his most complete published statement on homiletics; the Stone Lectures as Sons of Thunder,⁴ and the Smythe series as Six Kings of the American Pulpit,⁵ the latter two being studies of famous preachers and their methods, with Macartney's personal views on homiletic theory emerging only incidentally.

These books, contributions made to professional journals, references to preaching appearing occasionally in his sermons, and Macartney's personal notes and manuscripts on preaching deposited in his files at Geneva College provide the sources for a study of his homiletic theory.

Correspondence from the institutions involved reveals that Macartney's lectureships dealing with the art of preaching took the form either of the emphases appearing in his Preaching Without Notes, or that of case studies of prominent preachers of the past. It was not his intent to set forth a formal and complete body of homiletic theory but to share proven methods and techniques out of his own experience. In the

³Preaching Without Notes (New York: Abingdon-Cokesbury Press, 1946).

⁴Sons of Thunder (New York: Fleming H. Revell Company, 1929).

⁵Six Kings of the American Pulpit (Philadelphia: The Westminster Press, 1943).

forward to Preaching Without Notes Macartney declares, "I have drawn upon the experience of forty-one years in the pulpit. . . . This book is not designed to be a textbook in homiletics. It is the account of my own experience in study and preparation for the pulpit and preaching."⁶

Macartney's statements on this subject, therefore, have a quality of freshness and originality characteristic of a personal testimony. They provide valuable clues for an analysis and evaluation of his rhetorical practice.

It is the purpose of this chapter to outline and describe, within the framework of the language and categories he employs, Dr. Macartney's view of his art. The discussion is organized under seven sub-topics: (1) The Minister and His Calling, (2) His Audience, (3) His Message, (4) Formal and Functional Elements, (5) Preparing to Preach, (6) Preaching Without Notes, and (7) Dramatic Power in Preaching.

The Minister and His Calling

Concept of Preaching

Macartney's conception of the objective and purpose of preaching is succinctly put: "The great objective of preaching is to declare the gospel and to persuade men to repent and believe."⁷ Associated with this view of the minister's task is a similarly elevated concept of the vocation of the Christian ministry as is indicated by his remarks to the graduating class of the Presbyterian Theological Seminary at Louisville, Kentucky:

Nothing can ever take the place of preaching. As long as man is what he is, as long as the heart has passions and life has woes, as long as the mind of man continues to say to itself "Whence came

⁶Preaching Without Notes, p. 5.

⁷"Choosing the Arrow," unpublished lecture notes, p. 2. Macartney Files.

I? Whither am I going? What must I do? What dare I hope? the office of the preacher will be [the] highest and most necessary office under heaven. Teachers, healers, leaders, rulers, inventors, artists, poets, let them all speak their word and wield their blessed influence. Not one of them invades the sacred territory of the preacher.⁸

In Macartney's view, also, preaching is to be regarded as an indispensability because of man's basic nature and needs. Further, it is to be regarded as a sacred trust committed to the Christian minister. He mentions the sacred trust of a child in its parents, of a mother in her son, a wife in her husband, or a nation in its soldiers. But none of these, he says, "can compare with that most sacred and beautiful trust which Christ reposes in those who stand before the world as his ministers."⁹

Because of this unique function of the minister as a spokesman for God, Macartney is led to ask:

What could be equal to that, to stand, even the lowest and humblest, in that long succession of men who have proclaimed the Word of the Lord, whether he does it from a metropolitan pulpit in the midst of the great city, or from the pulpit of a little frame church in the country at the crossroads, under the shadow of the swaying branches of the oak and the hickory trees?¹⁰

The Minister As a Man

With this exalted concept of the Christian minister's calling is linked an equally demanding sense of ethical responsibility. "The better the man," Macartney opined, "The better the preacher."

When he kneels by the bed of the dying or when he mounts the pulpit stairs, then every self-denial he has made, every Christian forbearance he has shown, every resistance to sin and temptation, will come back to strengthen his arm and give conviction to his voice.¹¹

⁸Press release copy of address given at Presbyterian Theological Seminary, Louisville, Kentucky, May 5, 1925. Macartney Files.

⁹Preaching Without Notes, p. 28.

¹⁰Ibid., p. 83.

¹¹Ibid., p. 178.

Macartney lists the following seven temptations against which the clergyman must be on guard: laziness, conceit, love of money, worldly ambition, animosity or anger, the love of popularity, and the temptations of the flesh.¹²

He emphasizes that just as his personal virtues and victories greet the minister "at the head of the pulpit stairs" to help him on his way, so his moral failures meet him there to vitiate his powers of persuasion and influence:

Every evasion of duty, every indulgence of self, every compromise with evil, every unworthy thought, word, or deed, will be there at the head of the pulpit stairs to meet the minister on Sunday morning, to take the light from his eye, the power from his blow, the ring from his voice, and the joy from his breast.¹³

His Audience

Quintilian's definition of the orator as "a good man speaking well" is given a new turn when applied to Macartney's preacher. He notes the common desire of preachers to preach well, but adds, "As the years go by in his ministry, the true preacher thinks less and less of what is called 'a good sermon,' and more and more about a sermon which will 'do good.'"¹⁴ This concern for his audience--the effect produced and response elicited--is a significant and distinctive element in Macartney's homiletic theory. A good sermon, he insisted, must above all do good to the soul of man.

The audience to which the gospel is addressed, according to Macartney's theological presuppositions, is composed of men and women

¹²"The Bowman," unpublished lecture notes, Macartney Files.

¹³Preaching Without Notes, p. 178.

¹⁴Ibid., p. 145.

estranged from God and morally disabled by sin; but at the same time, they are equipped with an innate capacity, and even, a propensity, to respond to the word of God. The preacher is to preach

with conviction that it makes the greatest difference in the world whether he does his work well. Let him speak to the souls of men, realizing that they are created by God and fitted to hear the word of God, and let him expect that the soul will respond to the voice of God.¹⁵

"Nothing," Macartney believes, "could be duller than to preach without [such an] expectation."¹⁶ It is evident that Macartney's preacher would be more than an automatic cafeteria counter rolling by and making its offerings in a take-it-or-leave-it fashion. Rather, he would be a salesman, adapting his presentations to his customers, conscious that it made "the greatest difference in the world" how he proceeded with his task.

Macartney's emphasis on the audience as the focal point of all preaching finds expression in specific applications. In the inventive process of selecting a theme, for example, Macartney's concern is for audience needs. He warns that the minister may become so interested in some bypath or by-product of truth "that he will not realize that it fails to grip the people, or that it is not what they need."¹⁷ To avoid this, he suggests that a wide variety of themes and subjects be chosen, not neglecting the great doctrines of the gospel, and the great characters and incidents of the Scriptures, for whether familiar with them

¹⁵Ibid., p. 171. He would have sided with Brunner in the debate with Barth over whether there is a "point-of-contact" in man for the gospel.

¹⁶"The Bowman," unpublished lecture notes, p. 1, Macartney Files.

¹⁷Preaching Without Notes, pp. 114f.

or not people "like to hear the stories of the Bible told and interpreted."¹⁸

Macartney refers frequently to what "people like," or to what a congregation "likes" in preaching: Of the place of reason and logic in apologetic preaching he asserts, " . . . I discovered very quickly that true believers like to hear their faith defended at the bar of reason."¹⁹ Citing with approval his Princeton Seminary homiletics teacher, who stressed logic in preaching, Macartney observes, "Apologetic preaching of the right sort undoubtedly makes its appeal to most people. They like to see the foundations upon which their faith rests."²⁰ In referring to his experience in preaching to men, Macartney takes note of the universality of emotional needs: "The human heart is just the same as it was a decade or three decades ago, and men like to listen to those who can warm their hearts."²¹ Of Matthew Simpson's success with crowds he writes, "The secret of the sway of Simpson . . . lay in the fact that people like to have their hearts warmed, and that when they came to hear him preach he warmed their hearts."²²

Even the canon of Arrangement receives an audience-centered application. He recognizes with Phillips Brooks that the desire for unity and direction is a law of the listener's mind. Brooks, in the Yale Lectures on Preaching, had advised his students to have careful divisions in their sermons and to show clearly at the outset what

¹⁸Ibid., p. 37.

¹⁹"Warm Hearts, Steady Faith," The Christian Century, LVI (March 8, 1939), 316.

²⁰Preaching Without Notes, pp. 101f.

²¹"Warm Hearts, Steady Faith," loc. cit., p. 317.

²²Six Kings of the American Pulpit, p. 81.

course the sermon will follow and to recapitulate at the end. "This habit," Macartney says, "has somewhat faded out of modern preaching, and probably to its hurt, for the average person in a congregation likes to know what a man's objective is and where he is going."²³

In this fashion, one might demonstrate Macartney's audience-centered preaching theory with each of the canons of rhetoric--even that of memory, for

in season and out of season, year after year, and to the average congregation, there can be no question that the sermon that does the most good is the sermon which is preached without notes.²⁴

His Message

Macartney insists on two requisites for the preacher's message: it must be Biblical in its origin and it must sound the Kerygmatic or redemptive note.

A sermon "which does good," is one that "is written and spoken by the preacher as 'one having authority,' not the preacher's authority, but the authority of the Scriptures."²⁵ The Church of Rome, he asserts, speaks with the authority of the Church; Protestantism has a far higher authority, the authority of the Bible. Lamenting the abandonment of this authority by great numbers of the Protestant clergy, he declares: "They have no 'thus saith the Lord' in their message, but speak only out of their brief experience, their little wisdom, and their dim vision."²⁶

Indicative of Macartney's strong feeling on this point is the

²³Ibid., p. 145.

²⁴Preaching Without Notes, p. 145.

²⁵"What Makes a Good Sermon?" Unpublished sermon notes, Macartney Files.

²⁶Ibid.

following comment appearing in his introduction prepared for Whitesell's book, The Art of Biblical Preaching:

One of the saddest tragedies which has befallen modern Protestantism is the widespread abandonment of Biblical preaching. Many Protestant preachers today do not take a text at all when they preach. Others take a text, but use it only as a peg upon which to hang their own, or other men's thoughts and fancies. But this is not preaching in the highest sense, for true preaching is based upon a "Thus saith the Lord." God said to Jonah, "Preach the preaching that I bid thee." What God hath bidden man to preach is found in the Bible, and nowhere else.²⁷

This note of authority flows not only from its Biblical ground, but adheres also in the redemptive note sounded for lost men. Without the latter, the messenger has no message and speaks without authority. "He cannot track the sinner down and say, 'Thou art the man!'" He has no message of atonement for sin, no ringing word of hope for the world or for the individual."²⁸ The true preacher comes, therefore, not as "an explorer, a discoverer, an inventor, but a herald. He comes in the name of God. . . . he has a great message to proclaim. . . ."²⁹ Lacking this kerygmatic note and emphasis, the minister's speaking can no longer properly be called, "preaching": "Without the great tidings of divine love, of atonement, of regeneration, of salvation and the heavenly life

²⁷Faris Daniel Whitesell. The Art of Biblical Preaching, (Grand Rapids, Mich.: Zondervan Publishing House, 1950) Introduction.

²⁸Preaching Without Notes, pp. 181f.

²⁹Sermons on Old Testament Heroes (New York: Abingdon-Cokesbury Press, 1935), p. 175. This concept of preaching as proclamation was given impetus in America by the publication of C. H. Dodd's work, The Apostolic Preaching (Chicago: Willet, 1937). The distinction was made between Kerygma, or the gospel as the news of God's redemptive action in Jesus, and Didache, or moral instruction and exhortation. It was shown that Apostolic communication of the Kerygma took the form of proclamation as by a herald of good news, the good news in this case being God's offer and promise to men. Macartney himself does not employ these terms.

to come, preaching is just a discussion, or a lecture, or an entertainment."³⁰

But while insisting that "the great aim and purpose of the sermon is to convert the sinner to the will of God in Christ,"³¹ he nevertheless acknowledges a place for "sermons for comfort and instruction, for condemnation, for special occasions."³² That is to say, the ministry of the Word has other purposes in addition to that of converting non-Christian persons into Christians. After becoming Christians, they still need to grow in knowledge, faith, and practice--Christians, in other words, are equipped and sustained by Christian Didache.

Macartney acknowledges that ethical sermons, such as may deal with intemperance, Sunday observance, gambling, etc., may be "timely and powerful" if properly related to the gospel.³³ He points to his personal practice of preaching "Sermons from Life," a series dealing with the personal problems of people, and growing out of actual experiences in his pastoral ministry.³⁴

Speaking to over 300 ministers assembled at Princeton Seminary in 1952, Macartney counselled:

Preach all the four winds. . . . Preach the North wind of God's righteous judgments--that the way of the transgressor is hard, and the wages of sin is death. Preach the East wind of God's affliction, that whom he loveth he chasteneth and scourgeth. . . . Preach the South wind of temptation and danger. . . . But most of all, preach the West wind. . . you're never really preaching until you're

³⁰The Wisest Fool and Other Men of the Bible (New York: Abingdon-Cokesbury Press, 1949), p. 27.

³¹Preaching Without Notes, p. 9.

³²Ibid.

³³Ibid.

³⁴Ibid., pp. 91f.

preaching the West wind of God's mercy and pity and forgiveness.³⁵

This, in essence, is the message of the preacher, according to Dr. Macartney.

Formal and Functional Elements

Macartney does not deal at length with the more technical aspects of the sermon craft. There is a paucity of suggestions, for example, regarding sermon organization. Without elaboration, Macartney calls for the somewhat standard elements of sermon arrangement--text, proposition, and a clear outline with introduction, body, conclusion, and appeal:

It is true that the old-fashioned plan of outlining a sermon--introduction, proposition with heads 1, 2, and 3, and conclusion with appeal--cannot, of itself, make a worth-while or effective sermon. But it is also true that no good and effective sermon was ever hindered in its effectiveness by such a method of division and outline, but rather helped thereby.³⁶

Aside from the suggestion that the narrative illustration is effectively used in the introduction as well as occasionally in the conclusion,³⁷ Macartney does not go into detail with respect to sermon arrangement.

In somewhat more detail, however, he discusses the three conventional sermon types: (1) the textual, (2) the expository, and (3) the topical sermon:

1) The textual sermon. In a sense, all sermons are textual if one asks whether they should be based on a text--and in Macartney's opinion, all sermons should be introduced with a text. The popular habit of omitting the text, he says, handicaps the preacher in that he

³⁵"Preach the West Wind," Time, LX (July 21, 1952), 47.

³⁶Preaching Without Notes, p. 110.

³⁷Ibid., pp. 62ff.

commences with no "Thus saith the Lord."³⁸

Technically speaking, however, he understands the textual sermon to be that form of sermon construction where the subject is drawn from the text and stated, and then discussed under such divisions as the text itself yielded.

2) The expository sermon. Macartney understands this to involve the explanation of a series of verses or passages. This, he says, is always useful, but "is not necessarily preaching." Expository preaching seems to conjure up for him a dry, stifling, wearisome "explanation of the contextual association of the passage he has chosen for his text."³⁹ Contrary to those contemporary theorists who regard the expository method as the only valid form of Biblical preaching,⁴⁰ Macartney ranks it below other forms:

Some have the mistaken idea that the only kind of Biblical preaching is what is called "expository" preaching, that is, the exposition of a series of Bible verses or passages. But that is not the only kind of Biblical preaching, nor, in my opinion, is it the highest kind.⁴¹

3) The topical sermon. The topical sermon, in Macartney's view, contributes to "the highest type of preaching."⁴² Here, the topic controls the contents and development of the sermon. Often, nothing but the central idea is derived from the text, which may then be developed independently without drawing further on the text. It is in this way,

³⁸Unpublished notes on preaching, Macartney Files.

³⁹Sons of Thunder, p. 104.

⁴⁰E.g., Dietrich Ritschl, A Theology of Proclamation (Richmond, Va.: John Knox Press, 1963).

⁴¹Macartney, Introduction to Whitesell, op. cit.

⁴²Untitled, unpublished notes on preaching, Macartney Files.

he believes, that the great topics, the great truths and doctrines of sin, repentance, redemption, retribution, conscience, hope, faith, etc., are most effectively developed.

If asked why the treatment should be topical, he would have pointed not only to its flexible adaptation to a wide variety of topics, but to precedent as well: "In the history of preaching thus far almost every powerful sermon has been topical in form,"⁴³ citing the example of such preachers as Whitefield, Simpson, Spurgeon, Talmadge, Brooks, and Beecher.

Under the topical sermon format Macartney includes the historical sermon (the presentation and description of the great events and scenes narrated in the Bible); doctrinal or apologetic sermons; prophetic sermons; ethical sermons; therapeutic sermons (dealing with life-problems); and biographical sermons.⁴⁴

The biographical, or Bible character sermon, was Macartney's specialty. In this approach, the Bible character, or some aspect of his life, becomes the topic; and all of the passages relating to the topic are studied for sermonic material. This type of sermon actually partakes of the nature of the expository sermon, as Lucas has pointed out,⁴⁵ and could very well bear the label, narrative exposition.

Macartney suggests two methods of treatment of the biographical sermon: (1) to relate the story of a Biblical character and make the points of the sermon as one proceeds through the narrative; or (2) to

⁴³As quoted by Andrew Watterson Blackwood, Preaching in Time of Reconstruction (Great Neck, New York: Pulpit Press, 1945), p. 40.

⁴⁴Preaching Without Notes, pp. 90ff.

⁴⁵Richard D. Lucas, "The Preaching of Clarence E. Macartney," (unpublished Th.D. dissertation, Southern Baptist Theological Seminary, 1959), p. 64.

tell the story, and then make the points of the sermon.⁴⁶

Preparing To Preach

In his discussion of the minister's preparation, both general and specific, he again speaks out of his personal experience and practice. In fact, this section actually provides a look at how he prepared himself for his task.

General Preparation

Macartney realizes that all of a minister's past study, reading, meditation, pastoral ministration, and all open-eyed contact with the world of men and things, contribute something to the sermon. "The preacher's whole life, his whole experience is, in a way, a preparation for the sermon, even though it may be an unconscious one."⁴⁷

A moral and spiritual preparation is simply assumed:

We take for granted, of course, the minister's moral and spiritual preparation. The life that the minister leads during the week follows him up the stairs into the pulpit, and if that life has been worthy it will strengthen him and give him power and joy and liberty in utterance.⁴⁸

From this, he passes to three aspects of a minister's general preparation: (1) reading, (2) traveling, and (3) pastoral ministration.

1) Reading. As a proponent of Biblical preaching, Macartney almost inevitably begins his recommendations for the minister's reading with a plea for regular devotional reading of the Scriptures.

The minister's morning and evening portion are, as in the case of every other reader of the Bible, for his own personal spiritual nourishment and growth in grace, and we dare not neglect that in our preparation for the pulpit. But in that regular and devotional

⁴⁶Preaching Without Notes, pp. 130ff.

⁴⁷Ibid., p. 108.

⁴⁸Ibid., p. 113.

reading, the minister will equip himself in a special way for the preparation and preaching of his sermons.⁴⁹

As to general reading,⁵⁰ Macartney recommends, among other things, the daily reading of a good newspaper. "Newspapers are always in touch with human life. In their columns the minister sees the tragedy, the glory, the wretchedness, the suffering, and the pathos of mankind."⁵¹

But the most helpful reading for the minister, in his opinion, is history and biography. "There you have life, not in theory, but in reality. You can hear the beating of the human heart when you read biography. To a less degree, this is true of history."⁵²

Fiction, if carefully chosen "to avoid the trivial and the filthy, of which there is so much in our day," can stimulate the minister's mind. Dickens, Hawthorne, and Victor Hugo are recommended as of value in illustrating the truths of the gospel.⁵³

Familiarity with good poetry is suggested "for it stimulates the imagination, a faculty sadly neglected by the majority of preachers." The objective is not to quote poetry in sermons, but "to find worthwhile sermon ideas, situations, and illustrations from the great poets."⁵⁴

2) Travel. By precept and example, Dr. Macartney encourages the minister to make wise use of his vacation periods by purposeful travel. He suggests that the minister have a special field of interest in which

⁴⁹Ibid., p. 77.

⁵⁰See Preaching Without Notes, pp. 61ff. for Macartney's recommended reading list.

⁵¹Ibid., p. 79.

⁵²Ibid.

⁵³Ibid., p. 80.

⁵⁴Ibid.

he reads widely and to make that interest the focal point of vacation travel. Macartney had two such special interests, the American Civil War and the life of the Apostle Paul; and his vacation periods were frequently spent traversing the battlefields of the Civil War or traveling abroad in the footsteps of St. Paul.⁵⁵

3) Careful work in the study needs the balancing influence of social contact, Macartney believed: "It is possible--and frequently happens--that the preacher will go stale into the pulpit because he has overworked in his study." The sermon, in such a case, "is dull and many a preacher is lifeless in the pulpit because he has been too shut off from social intercourse and has not refreshed his spirit with the sunlight of life." The remedy: ". . . faithful pastoral work is in itself one of the most important parts of sermon preparation. From pastoral experiences the preacher speaks not as an academician, but as one who is touched with a feeling for the infirmities, sorrows, trials, and hopes of mankind."⁵⁶

Specific Preparation

Coming to the specific preparation of the sermon, the first step, of course, is the selection of a theme for the discourse. Here again, Macartney simply describes his personal method and approach: "My texts and themes are suggested as a rule by the regular reading of the scriptures. When a theme or a passage strikes me, I file it away in a pocket,

⁵⁵One of Macartney's unrealized ambitions was to make one last trip (he had made 15) to the Holy Land and the Near East to visit those places connected with the Apostle Paul's life not yet visited, namely, Caesarea, Troas, and Perga. See The Pittsburgh Sun-Telegraph, February 20, 1957, p. 1.

⁵⁶Preaching Without Notes, pp. 113f.

and from time to time make notations and comments."⁵⁷ He advocates planning one's pulpit work well in advance, choosing the text and theme long before its actual presentation. As a rule, he followed a series of announced sermons, comprised of six to fifteen presentations on a related theme. This practice, he explains, saves one from thrashing around in search of a theme during the week, taking up one theme only to abandon it for another.

Once the theme is chosen, the proposition or key idea must be determined: "The first thing the preacher must do is make up his mind just what the chief idea is that he wants to express."⁵⁸ The next step, in Macartney's plan of attack, is to determine the plan of development, the outline.

As already noted,⁵⁹ he does not elaborate on the structural organization of the sermon, but suggests at this point that "the old-time classic division--three parts like 'all Gaul'--is still the best. Those who hear or read like to know where the preacher is going, and see if he gets there."⁶⁰

After the theme and text have been chosen, the proposition and a brief outline have been written out, then "let the preacher read everything worthwhile that he can on his subject."⁶¹ He may turn to the theology books used at the seminary, his poetry file, his general reference file, his book file, and his sermon index. Let him read him-

⁵⁷Cited in Edgar DeWitt Jones, American Preachers of Today (Indianapolis: The Bobbs-Merrill Company, 1933), pp. 180f.

⁵⁸Preaching Without Notes, p. 109.

⁵⁹Supra, p. 156.

⁶⁰Clarence E. Macartney, "Writing Books of Sermons and Devotional Books," Writing for the Religious Market, Roland E. Wolseley, ed. (New York: Association Press, 1956), p. 203.

⁶¹Preaching Without Notes, p. 110.

self full, for "in the reading his mind will begin to glow, and he will find himself reaching out and laying hold upon worthwhile ideas."⁶²

This step, says Macartney, should be followed by the making of a more lengthy and complete outline which fills in additional thoughts. Macartney prepared three and four such outlines on successive days, by which time the sermon was ready to be put into final form for the pulpit. One method, he says, is to take the last and fullest outline and use this as a guide and suggestion in the pulpit; another, to dictate the sermon in full; and still another, to type or write it out. His personal practice⁶³ was to dictate the sermon to his secretary; then, after studying the manuscript several times, perhaps making another outline in long hand, he was ready to preach without taking a manuscript or notes into the pulpit.

⁶²Ibid.

⁶³See Donald Macleod (ed.), Here is My Method (Westwood, N.J.: Fleming H. Revell Company, 1952), p. 112.

A letter prepared by Dr. Macartney in response to a ministerial student's request for information on how he prepared for the pulpit is reproduced below:

Nov. 10, 1941

Dear-

I am interested to learn of your studies for the ministry, and that you have been reading some of my books. I do not know that my methods of preparation for work differ greatly from those of other ministers.

Here are some of the things which I have emphasized:

(1) Bible Study. Particularly in connection with the Wednesday Night Service. All through my ministry I have concentrated on St. Paul and gone through his life and followed in his footsteps. This year, at the Wednesday Night meeting, I am going through the Letters of St. Paul. This study is not only food for your own soul, but it gives suggestion for sermons and breaks up for you the rich soil of the Scriptures.

Preaching Without Notes

The chapter from which the title of his book, Preaching Without Notes, is taken, touches on some aspects of speech delivery which will be subsumed under this section.

Advantages of Free Preaching

Macartney's use of the expression, "free preaching," reveals his preference for a extemporaneous preaching without notes. In his opinion,

(2) Forenoon devoted to study.

(3) A certain part of each day devoted to general reading. This is most important, especially for the young minister. I make notations on all my books and keep a reference file, so that when I preach on Retribution, Faith, Hope, Heaven, etc., I have references to my own reading. I keep a special file for the reading of poetry.

(4) I try to vary the style of sermons. Sometimes a doctrinal series; sometimes biographical; sometimes what I call Sermons from Life; that is, sermons based on incidents of pastoral experience.

In my two former churches, Paterson and Philadelphia, I made it a point to call on the entire congregation every year. Here, with such a large constituency this is hardly possible; but I make calls almost every day,--the sick, the afflicted, the new members after they are admitted to the church, and I always take the baptismal certificates to the homes of baptized infants. In addition to that, of course, there are many calls on the members of the congregation.

In a large church like this, with a large staff, considerable time must be given to administration. The secret of accomplishment is concentration. The alibi, "I haven't time," is not one that will stand in the Judgment.

In addition to my regular and special work as a minister, I have had an avocation of historical study and writing, and have written considerably in the field of the Civil War--Lincoln and His Generals, Lincoln and His Cabinet, The Life of General McClellan, Highways and Byways of the Civil War.

In the sermons, no matter what the occasion or what the theme, I always find opportunity to sound the call of the Gospel; and that is the work of the preacher, to call men towards God and faith in the Lord Jesus Christ.

With the prayer that God will bless you in your studies for the

"Reading a sermon, however profitable and well done it may be, is not in reality preaching at all. . . . The highest preaching and the highest oratory is the impact of one soul upon another in free and open address."⁶⁴

Macartney sees several advantages of preaching without notes:⁶⁵

(1) it facilitates a directness of appeal; (2) it gives earnestness to the preacher, "and it is earnestness that counts. That is true eloquence"; (3) it facilitates eye-contact and gives full play to the preacher's personality: "The eye on a written page can never be as effective as the eye fixed on a human countenance"; (4) it makes possible the spontaneous "welling up and outbreak of imagination," or "the quick and effective use of some happening or particular environment:" (5) it gives joy to the preacher; and (6) it tends to promote the conversational style of vocal delivery.

Suggested Aids in Note-Free Preaching

As aids in effective preaching without notes, Macartney offers several suggestions. He advocates a clear outline and logical development

ministry and in your labors, I am

Faithfully yours,

C. E. Macartney

P.S. As for the actual preparation and writing of the sermons, my method is, as follows:

Generally the texts are chosen long in advance; and, as a rule, I follow a series of announced sermons. This prevents a minister from thrashing around during the week, taking up one theme and quitting it for another. I make in long hand a brief synopsis of the sermon which has been worked out in my mind; then a long hand manuscript of perhaps ten pages, sometimes two or three drafts. Then the sermon is dictated directly to the typewriter. When I have done that, I have little difficulty in reproducing the sermon. I never use any notes in the pulpit, and I advise all young ministers to start that way in the beginning. (Macartney Files).

⁶⁴Preaching Without Notes, pp. 146f.

⁶⁵Ibid., 147ff.

to aid the memory in the recalling of points and heads of a sermon: "I myself like the old plan of a simple outline with few divisions, including a statement at the beginning pointing where the preacher intends to go and how he intends to get there."⁶⁶

After a logical outline, the minister's physical fitness is mentioned as important for free preaching: "When body and mind are tired, it is hard to preach in any fashion, and doubly hard to preach without notes."⁶⁷

A third suggestion is a rather novel solution for that much-feared "mental black-out"--he suggests that the minister have passages from the Psalms and other portions of the Scriptures on the tip of his tongue to fall back upon in such an emergency until the train of thought has been recaptured. "No matter what the subject of the sermon, great passages from the Scriptures will strengthen and adorn it."⁶⁸

Macartney does not advocate the memorizing of the sermon verbatim:

I am always asked whether I memorize my sermons. The answer is No, for were I to memorize the sermon verbatim, and then preach it, that would be merely another way of reading a sermon. . . . I would be reading it from the back of my head.⁶⁹

The purpose of speech, he says, is to convey thought, not to recite words.

Vocal Delivery

With respect to vocal expression, Macartney wrote,

⁶⁶Preaching Without Notes, p. 154.

⁶⁷Ibid., p. 155. He predicts that if the preacher did not sleep over his sermon Saturday night, the congregation would sleep over it Sunday morning.

⁶⁸Ibid., p. 158.

⁶⁹Quoted by Macleod, op. cit., p. 112.

One of the most serious handicaps to the preacher is monotony of speech and utterance. . . . But the chances for monotony are much less if a man is preaching without notes. In conversation the voice is rarely monotonous, and if a preacher feels what he is saying and speaks without notes, he is much less likely to fall into the singsong monotony which mars the effect of many a good sermon.⁷⁰

Macartney reminds the preacher that just as nature holds our attention by her infinite variety, so also should the speaker by a variety in pitch and rate of utterance.⁷¹

Bodily Action

One would suspect that the subject of bodily action in speech might come up under his discussion of "free preaching"; but this aspect of public speaking is not discussed by Dr. Macartney, aside from such incidental references to the matter as emerge in his description of the practice of the master preachers, or by intimation, as when he suggests that free preaching facilitates full play of the preacher's personality: "A preacher may have little or much personality, but certainly when he gets into the pulpit he needs to use all that he has."⁷²

Dramatic Power in Preaching

The title of this section is taken from an unpublished manuscript on preaching in the Macartney Files which, according to a notation on the first page, was the basis for a lecture presented at the Princeton Theological Seminary.

By "dramatic power in preaching" Dr. Macartney means that by employing narrative and description the preacher reproduces sensory events the content of which impresses an audience with the reality of a

⁷⁰"Bending the Bow," unpublished notes on preaching, Macartney Files.

⁷¹Ibid.

⁷²Preaching Without Notes, pp. 148f.

general principle or concept.⁷³ The ground for dramatic preaching in the Bible is found in the characters, emotions, and scenes therein described.⁷⁴

According to his observations, the preachers who have gripped and stirred congregations "had something in their treatment which can best be described as dramatic power." He does not mean by this that the minister becomes a stage actor, but "it is well for the preacher to remember that the actor holds his audience by acting out the emotions and the transactions and the characters which are presented."⁷⁵ The inference is that the Christian preacher by means of public speech, promotes the creation or recreation of experience in the "here and now" of the listener.

His treatment of this particular emphasis, it can be shown, rests on two basic assumptions: (1) that this communication of reality is enhanced, rather than hindered, by a liberal use of Biblical material, and (2) that the evangelical emphasis in preaching provides a foundation for dramatic preaching superior to that created by social, ethical, or politically-oriented sermonic themes.⁷⁶

Four aspects of dramatic power in preaching are covered: (1) description, (2) imagination, (3) figures of speech, and (4) narrative

⁷³"Dramatic Power in Preaching," unpublished lecture notes, p. 1, Macartney Files.

⁷⁴Ibid.

⁷⁵Ibid.

⁷⁶Macartney declares, "The preacher who preaches constantly on social, national, or international subjects, will never have dramatic power in preaching, for it is only in personal preaching, in dealing with personal problems, sins, temptations, sorrows, trials, victories, that the preacher gets into a field for dramatic power." "Feathers for the Arrow," unpublished notes, p. 5, Macartney Files.

illustration.

Description

"People like a picture," Macartney observes. Just as people like to see a scene acted out, so they like to hear it described.⁷⁷ The Bible, he believes, is an unequalled source of scenes lending themselves to such descriptive treatment. Biblical characters and scenes, he contends, "afford the preacher a rich field for dramatic preaching." Indeed, "Limitless are the possibilities of the Bible, its scenes and its characters; there is no need for going elsewhere, no need of the best seller."⁷⁸

Macartney proceeds then to give examples of Biblical scenes lending themselves to the word-painter's brush: New Testament scenes such as the parable scenes of Jesus, the miracle scenes, historical scenes such as the Crucifixion and the thief on the cross; Old Testament scenes such as Abraham and Isaac on Mt. Moriah, Jacob and Rachel at the well, events from the life of Joseph, Gideon and the Angel, Saul and the Witch of Endor, Elijah and Naboth's Vineyard, Ahab and the lost prisoner, Elisha and Gehazi, and many others.⁷⁹

Especially in the narratives of the great characters of the Bible is there "opportunity for descriptive and pictorial preaching," he says, "The preacher's task is to expand it and make it live so that it becomes a vivid reality to the congregation. . . . The mere description of a Bible scene is itself a powerful sermon."⁸⁰ It is his conviction that

⁷⁷"Dramatic Power in Preaching," p. 1.

⁷⁸"Feathers for the Arrow," pp. 4f. Macartney cites Whitefield as a master of description: "He could describe the sufferings of Christ in a way that answered the end of real scenery. . . ." Six Kings of the American Pulpit, p. 33.

⁷⁹"Dramatic Power in Preaching," pp. 1ff.

⁸⁰Preaching Without Notes, pp. 37f.

the secret of the popularity of sermons on the Biblical characters is this potential for dramatic power--the elements of conflict, emotion, and concreteness inherent in the narratives. "When you talk on these characters and scenes," he asserts, "everyone knows what you are talking about. You enter into emotions which are timeless."⁸¹

Because of its emotional impact, such description serves a further purpose--it prepares the mind to receive the truths of the gospel:

Thus by describing and entering into the scenes of the Bible, even a most familiar scene, like that of David and Goliath, the preacher gets hold of the thought and imagination and the emotions of his hearer. One might liken it to the plow, or the harrow, preparing the soil for the sowing of the seed. The seed will not take root and germinate in dry, hard, barren soil. Neither will the seed of the gospel take root in a dry, hard mind.⁸²

Imagination

The average preacher, Macartney charges, does not make enough use of his imagination; a "sanctified imagination" is a requirement for the preacher who would have dramatic and emotional power in preaching. He will employ his imagination "in describing a Bible scene or in a flight of pure fancy. He can repeat an imaginary conversation between two Bible characters, or visualize a scene or episode in heaven."⁸³

Furthermore, it is a legitimate function of the imagination to "embellish and make vivid a scriptural narrative."⁸⁴ As an example of such imaginative filling in of details, he suggests the following treatment of the narrative of Elisha's servant, Gehazi, who for his sin of procuring a reward from Naaman under false pretenses was afflicted with

⁸¹"Dramatic Power in Preaching," p. 2.

⁸²"Feathers for the Arrow," p. 4.

⁸³Preaching Without Notes, p. 68.

⁸⁴Ibid.

the leprosy:

When he returns with the spoils from Naaman, picture him (a) in the tower where he stores his goods, putting on one of the garments, the golden coins drifting through his fingers. (b) The sentence of Elisha, "a leper white as snow." What Gehazi said to himself when he went out. "I am a leper, and yet I have what many of the lords and nobles would like to have, the bag of gold and goodly garments. They won't avoid me when they know I have the money." (c) Gehazi returns to the tower, locks the door, puts on the purple garment, empties the sack of gold on the floor, lets the gold coins fall through his hands, the sound of gold falling on gold, the shaft of light into the tower; and suddenly Gehazi sees the white scar of the leprosy, takes the robe off, tears it to pieces and stamps upon it, falls down on the heap of gold, crying aloud, "A leper! A leper forever! A leper white as snow!"⁸⁵

A similar use of the imagination may come into play in description--in the recreation of a Biblical scene. He explains how he would enlarge upon the simple statement regarding the morning of Christ's Resurrection, "As it began to dawn":

. . . the darkness turning to gray, the gray to pink, the pink to gold; the light reflected on the peaks of Moab, Pisgah and Nebo. The Dead Sea becomes a Sea of Glass. The advancing sun lifts the towers and domes of Jericho out of the mist. Bethany and Jerusalem. The Gate Beautiful and the temple flaming in the sun. The smoke from the chimneys; the women on their way to the well. The sound of feet, of animals and men on their way to the market. The husband-men going into the fields. In the house of Caiaphas, the crowing of the cock. The day has dawned. "As it began to dawn."⁸⁶

Another form of imaginative illustration recommended by Macartney, but not for a "weakling," is the apostrophe. Noting that out of fear of "being called rhetorical" modern preachers no longer assay "grand passages or flights of imagination," he says:

Take the apostrophe, for example. . . . In the mouth of the weakling, it is ridiculous, but in the mouth of a gifted man, what can be more effective? Yet today it is the last form of speech which one will find in pulpit discourses.⁸⁷

⁸⁵"Dramatic Power in Preaching," pp. 6f.

⁸⁶Ibid., pp. 1f.

⁸⁷Sons of Thunder, p. 143.

Macartney concludes:

The mind of man delights in a stirring scene or spectacle, whether it is a battlefield of temptation or an imaginary scene of triumph and glory in the heavenly places. Let the preacher remember this, and throw open as wide as he can the golden gates of imagination. Napoleon said, "Men of imagination rule the world." The preacher of imagination is the prince of the pulpit.⁸⁸

Figures of Speech

Macartney pointed out that while some of the great preachers made no use of anecdotes or formal illustrations, "their very language was pictorial and descriptive. They understood, or had an unconscious instinct for the witchery of words."⁸⁹ He describes Beecher as "a metaphorical preacher." Also, as an example of an effective use of the metaphor or simile, he quotes Charles Kingsley's sermon, "Temptation": "There is a state of mind which is a bird call for all the devils, and when they see a man in this state of mind, they flock around him like crows around carrion."⁹⁰

Narrative Illustration

In the light of Macartney's stress upon pictorial preaching, it is not surprising that the role of the sermon illustration should be given prominence in his discussion of the homiletic art. His opinions are expressed in a chapter in Preaching Without Notes--"The Preacher and His Illustrations," and in a lecture entitled, "Feathers for the Arrow."

Explaining that "the purpose of the illustration is not merely to make truth clear, but to heighten its nobility and glory,"⁹¹ Macartney offers practical suggestions from his own experience, particularly with

⁸⁸Preaching Without Notes, p. 75.

⁸⁹Ibid., p. 59.

⁹⁰Ibid., p. 60.

⁹¹Ibid., p. 32.

respect to the source of effective and appropriate illustrations.⁹² He lists the following sources:

1) The Bible. "The Bible," he says, "makes music on all the chords that God has hung in the human heart." For this reason, "The greatest of all illustrations are the parables and stories of the Bible, particularly those of the Old Testament."⁹³ The Old Testament parables, not so well known as those of the New Testament, offer not only an especially good source of illustrations, but a helpful lesson in the use of illustrations.

2) Biography and autobiography. Whatever he reads, advises Macartney, the clergyman should include a great deal of biography, and especially autobiography. "Such books are always out of the heart and true to life."⁹⁴ In such works as Rousseau's Confessions, Augustine's Confessions, and the Autobiography of Mark Rutherford, the minister will find helpful sermon illustrations. "I have never read any biography," he testifies, "in which I did not come upon at least one incident or illustration which I could use in a sermon."⁹⁵

3) Painters and paintings. Because of a tendency to "overdo them," he cautions a guarded use of such sources. However, a study of some of the masterpieces, particularly of religious art, will serve to stir the

⁹²The value of Macartney's discussion of the illustration lies chiefly in the actual examples given to demonstrate how the various sources may be exploited to the maximum. His book, Macartney's Illustrations, is a collection of 1500 classified stories, anecdotes, and quotes taken from his sermons. A reviewer said of the volume: "Thanks to Macartney's Illustrations, many a minister who never reads can sound well read." The Christian Century LVI (February 25, 1959), 233.

⁹³Preaching Without Notes, p. 35.

⁹⁴Ibid., p. 41.

⁹⁵Ibid., p. 42.

imagination and thus assist one in the depiction of life and reality. His examples at this point are useful.⁹⁶

4) Mythology. While ancient mythology is not normally named by homileticians as a useful source for sermon illustrations, Macartney's study of, and interest in, the Greek classics opened this area to him as a potential source.⁹⁷

5) Fiction. In his opinion, the modern "best seller" holds little of value for the illustration of Christian truth. On the other hand, "the old masters will give the preacher much grist for his mill."⁹⁸ The tales of Hawthorne, Dickens, or Victor Hugo abound in powerful illustrations for the preacher, he said.

6) Poetry. Macartney opposes the quoting of poetry at length because the preacher runs the risk of "sinking to the level of an entertainer or declaimer." His concern for the needs of the audience led him to conclude that "the most effective use is to take some of the great scenes or incidents and present the truth they illustrate" quoting only a few lines short of taxing the memory or tiring the audience.⁹⁹

7) Philosophy. Although he cautions the minister against posing as a philosopher--"One man telling what he doesn't know to another man who doesn't understand what he is talking about"--¹⁰⁰ he nevertheless encourages the reading of the philosophers for "unusual, dignified, and

⁹⁶Ibid., pp. 44ff.

⁹⁷Ibid., p. 46.

⁹⁸Ibid., p. 47.

⁹⁹Ibid., pp. 51f.

¹⁰⁰"Choosing the Arrow," unpublished notes, Macartney Files, p. 2, a definition current at Princeton in his seminary days.

searching illustrations."¹⁰¹ His examples from Plato and Kierkegaard support this contention.

8) Personal experience. Where the preacher's purpose is to throw light upon truth, but not upon himself, personal experiences are to be regarded as a legitimate source of sermon illustrations. In particular, if a man has had a godly home and godly parents, "references to that home and to his parents will always be acceptable and timely."¹⁰² Macartney warns, however, that there is the risk of an overexposure of the preacher's personality in the too-frequent personal reference: "If the personality of the preacher is presented too often to his congregation it is apt to lose stature."¹⁰³

Summary

Macartney's discussion of preaching assumes the form of a testimonial to methods and techniques which he had found to be practical and successful. Supporting evidence for his methods is drawn largely from the master preachers, although he also recommends such theorists as Hoppin and Vinet.¹⁰⁴

Macartney's is definitely an audience-centered philosophy of preaching, with persuasion as the recognized goal. Sensitive to the psychological needs and nature of men, he insists that sermons must "do good" to the souls of men, that they must satisfy the universal need of men "to have their hearts warmed."

¹⁰¹Preaching Without Notes, p. 53.

¹⁰²Ibid., p. 60.

¹⁰³Ibid.

¹⁰⁴Ibid., p. 81.

His fort   is the treatment of those aspects of Invention and Style by means of which reality and experience are represented and communicated through speech. In this respect, his discussion of dramatic power in preaching and of the sermon illustration makes a valuable contribution, particularly in the examples which are set forth in detail.

Aspects of Delivery and Arrangement are only incidentally covered in connection with his advocacy of preaching without notes.

The use of clear logic or reasoning, he holds, is important particularly in apologetic preaching, for people like to have their faith defended at the bar of reason; nevertheless, the stress with Macartney is on the "heart," rather than the "head."

.

With this examination of Macartney's view of the homiletic art, the contextual background for the study of Dr. Macartney's preaching is completed. The study proceeds next to the analysis of his sermons.

PART II
SERMON ANALYSIS

CHAPTER VI

AN ANALYSIS OF THE ELEMENTS OF PERSUASION IN THE PREACHING OF CLARENCE E. MACARTNEY

Introduction

The belief that preaching maintains a close relationship to persuasion, as held by Dr. Clarence E. Macartney,¹ has long been advocated. Broadus, whose work on preaching has over the years been regarded as a standard text in homiletics, declared as early as 1887 that preaching must persuade through a proper appeal to men's motives:

It is not enough to convince men of truth, nor enough to make them see how it applies to themselves, and how it might be practicable for them to act it out--but we must "persuade men." . . .

Persuasion is not generally best accomplished by a mere appeal to feelings, but by urging, in the first place, some motive or motives for acting, or determining to act, as we propose.²

A contemporary writer on the subject expresses the opinion that preaching is not preaching unless linked to persuasion:

Without persuasion toward moral and spiritual ends there is no preaching. There are occasions when the sermon should be used for educating and informing the hearer; indeed, when such purpose is entirely absent, the message may consist only of "sound and fury, signifying nothing." Yet the desire to dispense information must always be linked to persuasion.³

Practitioners, as well as theorists, have spoken in support of

¹See Chapter V, this study.

²John A. Broadus, The Preparation and Delivery of Sermons (New York: A. C. Armstrong and Son, 1887), p. 232. His use of the words, "persuade men," is based on St. Paul, Galatians 1:10.

³Webb B. Garrison, The Preacher and His Audience (Westwood, N.J.: Fleming H. Revell Company, 1954), p. 41.

this view. For example, Dr. Joseph R. Sizoo maintains that preaching must be more than an imparting of truth to the hearer:

When preaching is vital and vibrant, it becomes a living witness and something always comes of it. It is not simply an appeal to the aesthetic tastes of an age, to its intellectual acumen, nor to its imagination and memory, but to its conscience and to its will. It is truth lit up by the fire of the soul.⁴

Concurring testimony on this point might be multiplied, confirming the validity of applying the principles and criteria of rhetorical persuasion in public address to preaching.⁵

Turning from preaching, for the moment, we find that although rhetoricians as ancient as Aristotle have included the "persuasive" factors of speechmaking in the total range of their theories, persuasion as a specific field has emerged only in recent years. Adapting the insights of psychology to the classical theories of rhetoric, students of speech, such as A. E. Phillips, James Winans, and W. N. Brigance have joined in the search for the sources and bases of persuasion.⁶

Phillips⁷ was among the earliest speech writers of the modern

⁴Joseph R. Sizoo, Preaching Unashamed (Nashville: Cokesbury, 1949), pp. 13f.

⁵Contemporary dissenters to the view include Hendrik Kraemer, who insists that the Holy Spirit commends truth to men in such a way as to make the preaching of the gospel, communication sui generis. Conversion, he maintains, not persuasion, is the aim of the gospel. Hendrik Kraemer, The Communication of the Christian Faith (Philadelphia: Westminster, 1956), p. 29.

⁶"Persuasion" as a term, has been used by different writers with varied connotations. Some use the term in its generic sense and apply it to verbal methods of influencing human conduct. Others limit it to the special method of influencing human conduct by emotional or non-logical appeals. This is usually termed its specific meaning. The term is used in both senses in this discussion. It may be defined as the art of activating, motivating, or moving another individual or group of individuals toward decision or action as recommended by the speaker.

⁷A. E. Phillips, Effective Speaking (Chicago: The Newton Company, 1908).

period to incorporate the findings of modern psychology. He stressed that to arouse men to action, we must consider mankind's desires or "impelling motives," which he defined as man's spiritual, intellectual, moral, and material wants. Wants were classified as self-preservation, property, power, reputation, affections, sentiments, and tastes.

Winans⁸ pioneered in the attempt actually to define the technique of persuasion, and to place the processes of persuasion upon a clearly defined psychological foundation. Resting his theory essentially on the psychology of William James--the belief that "what holds attention determines action"--Winans defined persuasion as the "process of inducing others to give fair, favorable, or undivided attention to propositions." He held the view that those ideas which "arouse emotions" hold attention, and that the most obvious way to fix attention is to awaken desire for the end sought; an effective desire we call a motive. Winans did not believe, however, that persuasion should depend solely on the use of appeals to motives or emotions, but pointed out that logical argument may be necessary to induce belief. While agreeing with Phillips on the basic ingredients of persuasion, Winans changed the process of persuasion by emphasizing the psychology of attention.

Brigance, while respecting the pioneering work of Winans, was of the opinion, however, that more recent psychological research provided a better insight into the exact nature of persuasion. He supported this contention by indicating that whereas James and Winans viewed persuasion as a mental process, "the generally accepted view today . . . is that persuasion takes place, not on an intellectual, but rather on a

⁸James A. Winans, Public Speaking. (New York: The Century Company, 1917).

motor level."⁹ He added that even though the psychologists are often divided on technical points, they appear to be in agreement on the fact that the dominant basis for human belief and action is desire.

Brigance's study led him to redefine Winans' theory of persuasion and to state his own definitions of persuasion as follows:

1. When the aim is to rouse from indifference, to inspire, or to stimulate lagging enthusiasm and faiths, persuasion is a process vitalizing old desires, purposes, or ideals.
2. When the aim is to secure the acceptance of new beliefs or courses of action, persuasion is a process of substituting new desires, purposes, or ideals for old ones.

These pioneers, along with such men as G. H. Woolbert, Lew Saret, and Robert T. Oliver have formulated the modern theories of persuasion and have given this subject a field-of-study status within the general area of speech.

Oliver's works, The Psychology of Persuasive Speech (1942) and Persuasive Speaking: Principles and Methods (1950) were early texts employed by college classes in Persuasion. A second edition of the first-mentioned work appeared in 1957¹⁰ and attempted to incorporate the best features of the two books. Other entries in the field are: Persuasion, A Means of Social Control (1952)¹¹ by Brembeck and Howell and The Art of Persuasion (1957)¹² by Minnick. A relevant work summarizing contemporary findings in the field of the psychology of communication is

⁹W. N. Brigance, "Can We Re-Define the James-Winans Theory of Persuasion?", Quarterly Journal of Speech, XXI (February, 1935) 19-26.

¹⁰Robert T. Oliver, The Psychology of Persuasive Speech, (2nd ed. New York: Longmans, Green and Company, 1957).

¹¹W. L. Brembeck and W. S. Howell, Persuasion, A Means of Social Control (Englewood Cliffs, N.J.: Prentice-Hall, Inc., 1952).

¹²Wayne C. Minnick, The Art of Persuasion (Boston: Houghton Mifflin Company, 1957).

that by Eisenson, Auer, and Irwin.¹³

Somewhat apart from the fields of rhetoric and public address, yet augmenting our knowledge of the bases and techniques of persuasion, were the psychological studies of opinion change pioneered by Carl Iver Hovland and his associates. Carefully controlled experimental research was conducted to improve our understanding of the effects which communication stimuli have upon attitudes and behavior. The earliest studies were carried out under military auspices and studied the effective utilization of training and indoctrination films by the armed services during the war. The results of these studies were reported in 1949 under the title, Experiments on Mass Communication.¹⁴ A series of grants from the Rockefeller Foundation gave opportunity for broader investigation, and a progress report, Communication and Persuasion,¹⁵ appeared in 1953 which covered such subjects as, "Credibility of the Communicator," "Fear Arousing Appeals," "The Organization of Persuasive Arguments," and "Group Influence." Monographs have appeared since then under such titles as, Order and Persuasion,¹⁶ Personality and Persuasibility,¹⁷ and Social Judgment: Assimilation and Contrast Effects in Communication

¹³Jon Eisenson, J. Jeffery Auer, and John V. Irwin, The Psychology of Communication (New York: Appleton-Century-Crofts, 1963).

¹⁴Hovland, Carl I., Arthur A. Lumsdaine, Fred D. Sheffield, Experiments on Mass Communication (Princeton, N.J.: Princeton University Press, 1949).

¹⁵Hovland, C. I., I. L. Janis, and H. H. Kelley, Communication and Persuasion (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1953).

¹⁶Hovland, C. I., I. L. Janis, and H. H. Kelley, The Order of Presentation in Persuasion (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1957).

¹⁷Hovland, C. I., I. L. Janis, and H. H. Kelley, Personality and Persuasibility (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1959).

and Attitude Change.¹⁸

Still another work providing helpful insights pertaining to the formation and change of attitudes is that authored by J. A. C. Brown, The Techniques of Persuasion¹⁹ (from propaganda to brainwashing). Brown writes out of a background of training in psychiatry.

The above-mentioned works, along with the view-points of representative texts in speech and homiletics provide the background against which this present chapter is written.

Emerging from studies such as have been cited are insights which, as applied to speech, have contributed to a clearer understanding of three important aspects of the process of persuasion through public address as they pertain to the audience: (1) factors of attention and interest, (2) motivation, and (3) adaptation.

Attention has always been a central concept in psychology, and it is also a key functional factor in communication, for unless the speaker's message is attended to it will be lost regardless of how strongly he feels about it. The persuasive speaker will find that in the effort to influence the conduct of his auditors, "control of their attention is the most vital step."²⁰

Minnick defines attention as "the process of selecting a particular stimulus of the many available in one's perceptual field and focusing upon it until it becomes sharp and clear while other stimuli recede to

¹⁸Hovland, Carl Iver, and Sherif, Muzafer, Social Judgment: Assimilation and Contrast Effects in Communication and Attitude Change (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1961).

¹⁹Brown, J. A. C., The Techniques of Persuasion (London: Cox and Wyman Ltd., 1963). Reprint by Penguin Books, 1964.

²⁰Oliver, op. cit., p. 117.

indistinctness."²¹

Interest is inseparably related to attention. The distinction between them, a thin one, is that "attention is concerned with the initial organization of our sensory receptors toward a given stimulus and that interest is what maintains subsequent orientation."²² As Oliver puts it, "Whatever we attend to is interesting, and to whatever is interesting we freely give our attention."²³ Elements of interest are those factors so essentially interesting that they may be counted on to hold the attention of an audience. They include the concrete, conflict, suspense, animation, the combination of the familiar and the unusual, humor, the varied, and the vital.²⁴

While attention has come to be viewed as the channel for the flow of persuasive communication, its headspring is desire. Desires and wants give an emotional impulse toward behavior as the individual adjusts to the circumstances confronting him. His behavior, in other words, is motivated. Applied to communication, motivation becomes the basis for persuasion: "Thus persuasion in public address is defined as the process of securing acceptance of an idea, or an action, by connecting it favorably with the listener's attitudes, beliefs, and desires."²⁵

Another key concept of rhetoric, the focus of which is sharpened by psychological research, is that of audience analysis and its concomi-

²¹Minnick, op. cit., p. 38.

²²Eisenson, et al., op. cit., p. 241.

²³Oliver, op. cit., p. 119.

²⁴See Oliver, op. cit., pp. 125-130; Eisenson, et al., op. cit., pp. 292-293.

²⁵Eisenson, et al., op. cit., p. 293.

tant, audience adaptation. The public speaker, to be effective, must think in terms of his audience; he studies the audience both as he prepares and as he speaks; he tries to understand its point of view, biases, prejudices and predispositions, its tendencies, basic needs, sense of values, habitual modes of thinking, crowd characteristics, range of information, social background, and environment. The speaker's attitude is objective, audience-centered; he adapts his message to his audience in the choice of his materials, their arrangement, in what he says and how he says it.

.

This chapter examines the Pittsburgh preaching of Dr. Clarence E. Macartney with particular focus on the discernible elements of persuasion such as have been defined and described in the above-mentioned works. Involved in this enterprise is a report of observations, generalizations, and conclusions arising out of an examination of approximately 400 published sermons and the study of seven tape-recorded sermons. Selected samples will be introduced to illustrate specific points, while an analysis in depth of a complete sermon, Macartney's best-known "Come Before Winter," will be reserved for the following chapter.

The present chapter is organized under the following divisions:

- I. Purpose, Audience, and Setting
- II. Persuasion through Character
- III. Persuasion through the Development of Ideas
- IV. Persuasion through Order
- V. Persuasion through Language
- VI. Persuasion Through Delivery

I. Sermon Analysis--Purpose, Audience, and Setting

Purpose

A prime requisite for all successful speaking is that the speaker have in mind a clearly defined purpose around which his efforts will converge. As already noted, Macartney perceived the object and goal of preaching to be "to declare the gospel and to persuade men to repent and believe."²⁶ Not satisfied simply to "declare the gospel," he viewed his task as one of persuasion as well; not content merely to preach "a good sermon," he aimed to preach a sermon which would "do good."²⁷ This concern that the sermon achieve a predetermined worthy response from the listener is indicated by the title of a projected book, "Sermons that Hit the Mark." Unsolicited letters describing some noteworthy response or reaction to a particular sermon were filed under this heading, and a few introductory notes to sermons to be included in this volume had been prepared.²⁸

As indicated in chapter V, Macartney's goal in preaching was actually two-fold, to make disciples for the Christian faith and to deepen the commitment of those who were already Christians. (The joining of a church, though not specifically referred to as a desired response, has undoubtedly been included in that of becoming a Christian.)

Macartney's speech ends as stated above may be translated without difficulty into the language of the speech theorists,

²⁶"Choosing the Arrow," unpublished lecture notes, p. 2, Macartney Files.

²⁷See page 150 of this study.

²⁸"Sermons that Hit the Mark," unpublished notes and letters, Macartney Files.

Brembeck and Howell propose three purposes for the speech of persuasion: to stimulate, to convince, and to activate.²⁹ In the speech to stimulate the speaker wants "to arouse us, to deepen our concern, to sharpen our feelings. . . . to make our sluggish appreciations, weak emotions, and beliefs a more vital part of our living." This speech has to do with "ideals, appreciations, duties, sentiments, aspirations, desires, affections, moods, courage, endurance, faith, loyalty, and other values. . . ."³⁰

Oliver suggests that the speech to stimulate asks its auditors not to believe or to do but to become. The goal . . . is broad and inclusive. It seeks not to change minds or actions, but lives. It recreates the emotional power of its listeners to the end that they will have the will to self-generation of such thoughts and deeds as the speaker favors.³¹

The speech to convince "aims to change an audience's beliefs";³² it deals primarily "with intellectual rather than emotional commitments."³³ It frequently does not call for any immediate or specific overt action, though future behavior is usually modified as a result of the change in beliefs.

Where "a more immediate, definite, overt response on the part of the listeners" is sought, the speech to actuate is called for. "Emotions may and certainly will be aroused, beliefs or convictions may well be created, strengthened, or displaced, but explicit action must result."³⁴

Applying these concepts to the task at hand, one can see that all

²⁹Brembeck and Howell, op. cit., pp. 296ff.

³⁰Ibid., p. 297.

³¹Oliver, op. cit., p. 420.

³²Ibid., p. 387.

³³Brembeck and Howell, op. cit., p. 298.

³⁴Ibid., p. 299.

three approaches to persuasion were demanded by Macartney's proposed goals of preaching: the appeal for converts to Christianity and the church would partake of the elements of speeches to convince and actuate; the week by week task of deepening commitment to the Christian ethic, of the speech to stimulate.

It will be seen that the largest portion of Macartney's published sermons were in the nature of the speech to stimulate in spite of the fact that his expressed views on the homiletic art would seem to indicate that all true preaching sought as its goal the conversion of "the sinner to the will of God in Christ"³⁵--the winning of adherents to the Christian faith. It must be acknowledged that frequently in the concluding portion of the sermon, he confronted his hearers directly or indirectly with a specific appeal to "accept Christ"; but this was more frequently than not, attached to a sermon of a purely ethical or inspirational nature.³⁶

It will be shown that Macartney, adapting himself to his specific audience, directed his efforts in his Pittsburgh preaching largely to making "sluggish appreciations, weak emotions, and beliefs a more vital part" of the lives of his listeners (the speech to stimulate). Considerable challenge is involved in such an enterprise, man's nature being what it is. Man is motivated by his desires; but whether he chooses the high, idealistic desire, or the material one, depends upon how vividly and impellingly these alternatives are revealed to him. The transference of man's wants and desires to the higher, idealistic scale must not be dismissed as a simple task--nor an unimportant one. "Preaching has no

³⁵Preaching Without Notes, p. 9.

³⁶See this study, pp. 293f.

higher purpose than that of persuading listeners to change their lives for the better."³⁷

How Macartney met this challenge is the question prompting this study.

Audience

Students of public speech have long recognized the audience as an important variable in the speech event, and have therefore included audience analysis in the critical process. It is hoped that something approaching a faithful estimate of the general audience regularly addressed in Pittsburgh has been achieved in this study, although deficiencies in this area are freely acknowledged, some of which were imposed by the barriers of time and space.

At the outset, it must be said that a church congregation comprises a unique audience in several respects. Ordinarily, such an audience assembles with a predisposing set of expectations to hear the pastor appointed to address it. The congregation of First Church, for example, possessed a homogeneity arising from subscription to a common creed--in this instance, a creed with a long historical tradition and one re-inforced by a line of illustrious, conservative Presbyterian pastors. Such an audience would presumably come equipped with a background of instruction, vocabulary, and mind-set favorable to the purposes of our speaker.

Macartney regularly attracted a number of non-members to his congregation; perhaps ten per cent of his Sunday morning congregation and forty to fifty per cent of the Sunday evening audiences were com-

³⁷Garrison, op. cit., p. 41.

prised of visitors.³⁸ Some of this group would be of the Presbyterian persuasion, some were members of other denominations, and some, of course, had no church affiliation. However, it would seem that a somewhat imposing cathedral of a prestige congregation, where well-dressed worshippers were greeted at the door by "correct and cultured" gentlemen ushers, would have a screening effect on the audience assembled there. One might safely conclude that those who assayed to cross that threshold came with a predisposing set of expectations.

It should be pointed out that First Church, once the richest in the city, and invested with the prestige of a long history and size of congregation, was nevertheless, at least according to one Pittsburgh background source reporting in the mid-forties, "no longer a fashionable church, maintained by just a few, but a middle-class one, supported by the smaller gifts of the many."³⁹

A somewhat similar judgment was expressed by several of Macartney's former assistants, whose testimony concurred with the present pastor's estimate that the church drew a cross section of society--"from the highest echelons of management and labor to the common laborer":⁴⁰

"A cross section of society." Millionaires to scrub-women." "People of all educational, professional, and social backgrounds heard him and seemed interested in his messages."⁴¹

There is evidence, however, that the "cross-section-of-society characterization should be modified somewhat. Replies of the question-

³⁸See this study, p. 139.

³⁹"Biography," The Bulletin Index, CXXVIII (February 16, 1946) 15.

⁴⁰Robert J. Lamont, Interview, May, 1965, Pittsburgh, Pa.

⁴¹From a questionnaire prepared for Macartney's assistants, October 6, 1965. See Appendix X.

naire would indicate that while it is true that representatives of a broad spectrum of society held membership at First Church, a higher percentage of professional people,⁴² and a higher level of education was represented by the membership than would be typical of a cross section of American society. While it is not suggested that a sampling of fifty-eight of Macartney's parishioners would offer an accurate basis for generalization, the fact that almost as many report having a college education as those who had not gone beyond high school, with only three reporting less than a high school education, would seem to point to such a generalization.⁴³

Age groups in the audience appear to have been fairly evenly distributed, with a larger representation of young people and young adults present at the evening services.⁴⁴ One further observation, according to assistants, was that Macartney's services attracted a larger percentage of men than is ordinarily found in a religious service:

"A higher proportion of men than ordinary."

"He had a way of reaching men as well as interesting the women."⁴⁵

However, generalizations regarding an audience are hazardous, as Garrison reminds us, since congregations are still made up of individual listeners, each of whom "is guided by an elaborate complex of purposes."⁴⁶ He has listed a variety of motives which might be said to prompt people

⁴²See Appendix XI-A for a list of occupations represented by respondents to the membership questionnaire.

⁴³See tabulation from questionnaire responses, Appendix XI

⁴⁴From questionnaire prepared for Macartney's assistants.

⁴⁵Ibid.

⁴⁶Garrison, op. cit., p. 27.

to attend church: (1) loyalty to an institution, (2) habit, (3) fellowship, (4) worship, (5) desire for information, (6) respect for traditional authority, (7) curiosity, (8) exhibition, (9) emotional outlet, and (10) personal problems.⁴⁷

Undoubtedly some, if not all, of these purposes were a factor in the audiences gathered to hear Macartney from time to time. But, over and above the forces at work in each individual's private world were the larger influences of an age of tension. A depression, a world war followed by the uncertainties and fears of the Atomic Age, the ever-increasing concentration of economic control, the undermining of the old certainties of religion in the minds of many, all had collaborated to intensify the need for security--a need which may well have reached the status of a "deficiency motivation."⁴⁸

If one were to hazard a generalized summary of Macartney's audience assembled in a downtown church and drawn from a cross-section of two million inhabitants of industrialized Pittsburgh, it might be to describe it as an American, Protestant, middle and upper-middle class, Caucasian audience, possessing generally a high level of education, and coming with some favorable predisposition to the speaker's purpose (although not in its entirety Presbyterian in belief or Christian by profession).

⁴⁷Ibid., pp. 27ff. Garrison offers this interesting point of view: "A man who is a problem to himself is a ready-made opportunity for the preacher. Conversion may be described as problem-solving on the basis of religious motivation. It is a high-level synthesis, enabling a person in some sort of trouble to move out of it by moving God-ward." (Ibid., p. 34.)

⁴⁸Lew Sarett, William Trufant Foster, Alma Johnson Sarett, Basic Principles of Speech (3rd ed. rev.; Boston: Houghton Mifflin Company, 1958), p. 440.

Setting

Specialists in the psychology of communication have extracted the significant concepts of "polarization" and "social facilitation" from their observations of the behavior of audiences.

Polarization introduces structure into an unorganized group, it is what makes a group into an audience. The term has been used to denote an "all to one" relation, expressed as a situation where a speaker occupies the audience's focus of attention. "When an audience is polarized it is established as one entity, separate from the entity of the speaker, but attending to him, and linked with him by communication in such a way that interaction is possible."⁴⁹ These phenomena are affected by such variants as the physical setting, audience geography, and institutional ritual.

.

In a crowded Sunday service, such as might occur on the occasion of the annual preaching of Macartney's famous sermon, "Come Before Winter," 1700 or more people would have assembled. A thousand would be seated on cushioned pews on the main floor of the auditorium and in the galleries running full length of the auditorium on both sides. Up to 700 would be seated in the chapel or overflow hall facing the audience in the main auditorium. The two halls are separated by an archway with the view between the two halls somewhat broken by the altar centered on a raised platform in the archway.

The organ and choir (a double quartet) are located in the rear balcony of the main auditorium where they would not distract attention

⁴⁹Eisenson et al., op. cit., p. 274.

from the speaker.

A richly-carved elevated stone pulpit projects from the right wall at the dividing archway providing the speaker, figuratively, a position of social command. Blending architecturally into the pulpit is a stone-sculptured, curved stair case up which the speaker ascends during the singing of a hymn, achieving somewhat the effect of a "grand entrance."

The speaker, facing straight ahead, looked almost diagonally across the sanctuary. From this position eye contact was possible with the largest portion of the audience--a simple matter with respect to those seated downstairs in the main auditorium and the left balcony, but requiring a half turn or more for those on the right (the speaker's left). An even sharper turn was required to make eye contact with those sitting in the chapel. A manuscript speaker, or one confined to notes, would have been at a considerable disadvantage with this arrangement.

In spite of the bid for attention provided by the speaker's elevated and isolated position, some aspects of the physical setting and audience geography of First Church militated against a narrowed focus of attention on the speaker. Segments of the audience faced each other--both the main floor audience and the gallery audience. Those in the right gallery, because of their relative position to the speaker, focused prolonged visual attention upon him with considerable difficulty and discomfort. The main floor audience had not only the chapel group but the light of a massive stained glass window competing for visual attention. The chapel group in turn had similar competition from those in the choir loft. Both groups had the large altar and the two seated assistants in their natural line of vision.

On the positive side, the mood and atmosphere suggested by this cathedral-like structure created a most favorable setting for the typical Macartney sermon, described under the category of "the speech to stimulate." It is recognized that "the manipulation of various atmosphere-creating factors may alter significantly the nature and degree of an audience's expectations and anticipatory responses."⁵⁰

Many devices of what Young called "preliminary tuning"⁵¹ whether by design or tradition, favored the speaker's purpose here. Announcements for the meeting, printed cards, newspaper advertising, and the bulletin provided for worshippers, were formal and dignified. The church itself, outside and in, created a quiet, reverential setting, with stained glass windows, organ music, soft lights, and worship symbols, the most prominent of which was the stone-carved altar displaying an open Bible. These ritualistic devices would tend to create an audience mood appropriate to his manner and message--a message which had to do with ideals, appreciations, duties, sentiments, aspirations, and values.

On the other hand, an overt response such as might be sought by an evangelist calling for a decision to "accept Christ," or to join a church, would be less favored by this atmosphere.

Garrison has noted that:

A Gothic Cathedral is designed to produce an atmosphere of hushed reverence; every aspect of the building magnifies the individual's sense of dependence. To the degree that this effect is actually created, motor-vocal responses of the listener are inhibited, social facilitation is thereby reduced, and each listener tends to remain completely individual rather than becoming a part of a group. . . . Under extreme conditions, it becomes almost impossible to secure

⁵⁰Ibid., p. 278.

⁵¹Kimball Young, Social Psychology (3rd ed.; New York: Appleton-Century-Crofts, 1958), pp. 304f.

such overt response as laughter, nodding of the head or acceptance of an evangelistic invitation.⁵²

Included among institutional rituals which might be said to contribute to preliminary tuning in a religious service are the elements of group action prior to the sermon. The order of service in First Church, both morning and evening (the order of the two services was almost identical), was actually quite simple. Frequent standing, bowing, repeating of a creed or prayers in unison, characteristic of a "high church" service were not a part of the First Church order of worship.

The chief elements of group action preceding the sermon, as noted from bulletins examined, were the singing of a doxology, a hymn of worship, and a hymn of experience. These hymns would presumably serve to create an emotional unity prior to the sermon. Macartney observed, "A stirring feature of the worship of the First Church, remarked by all visitors, is the general and enthusiastic congregational singing."⁵³

With respect, then, to those elements of persuasion inherent in the setting for the preaching of Dr. Macartney, one might summarize by noting that the audience placement requiring that segments of the audience face each other, the positioning of the pulpit to accommodate the overflow audience beyond the altar, would militate against a narrowed focus of attention, or polarization. These negative aspects would be offset by the following: The large audiences usually assembled to hear Dr. Macartney would be favorable to social facilitation and the "shoulder

⁵²Garrison, *op. cit.*, pp. 74f. In an evening service honoring his twentieth-fifth anniversary in Pittsburgh, Macartney responded to the humor displayed in a preceding speech by saying, "That's more laughing than has been heard in this church in twenty-five years. Well, perhaps it won't do any harm." First Church Life, Twenty-fifth Anniversary Edition, April 27, 1952, p. 43.

⁵³The Making of a Minister, p. 205.

to shoulder configuration of a group" mentioned by Young;⁵⁴ the mood and atmosphere suggested by the church architecture and furnishing, as well as other institutional devices and rituals, would tend to favor certain aspects of our particular speaker's speech purposes. How he coped with the disadvantages of the setting, or utilized the advantages, will be noted in the following pages.

⁵⁴Young, op. cit., p. 303.

II. Sermon Analysis--Persuasion Through Character

Classical and modern writers agree that the power of the personality to persuade--referred to in traditional rhetoric as ethos, or ethical appeal--is one of the most powerful elements of persuasive speaking. Some contemporary writers, such as Gilman, Aly, and Reid, hold (as did Aristotle) that the ethos of the speaker is the most important factor contributing to his success:

Of the three means of persuading--reasoning, disposing, and accrediting--probably the most powerful is the one associated with the personality of the speaker himself. Day after day more changes are affected by request or direction based on faith in the speaker than by any argument advanced for a proposition.¹

Brembeck and Howell, who translate ethos broadly as "character," explain that in the context of the persuasive speech it includes two elements:

- (1) The reputation or prestige enjoyed by the speaker with respect to his particular audience and subject at the moment he begins to speak, and
- (2) the increasing or diminishing of that prestige as a result of what he says and does during the speech.²

Status of the speaker, then, is both ascribed--what the speaker is thought to be; and earned--what the speaker proves himself to be.

In specifying the components of ethos, writers usually refer to competence, high character, and good will as the sources of speaker credibility.

The intent of this section is to describe Dr. Macartney's ministry with respect to (1) the ethical persuasion of the status ascribed to him and, (2) those factors within his sermon composition tending to enhance

¹Wilbur E. Gilman, Bower Aly, and Loren D. Reid, The Fundamentals of Speaking (New York: The Macmillan Company, 1951), pp. 334f.

²Brembeck and Howell, op. cit., p. 244.

his ethos.³

Reputation

As already noted, Macartney had won a position of prominence in Presbyterian circles before coming to Pittsburgh.⁴ His eminently successful pastorates at Paterson and Philadelphia, the authorship of a half-dozen books, his part in the Fosdick case--catapulting him to the Moderatorship of the General Assembly--all contributed favorably to his reputation. Press stories preceding him to Pittsburgh probably reinforced this image of a successful, competent, scholarly (as well as human) defender of the Christian faith.⁵

For this Pittsburgh pulpit he was the personal choice of his popular predecessor, Dr. Alexander, who presented him to the congregation. Macartney's reputation as a man of clear-cut convictions was further enhanced at the time of his installation by the reading of a testimonial letter from the noted theologian, Dr. Francis L. Patton, who had written: "The new minister of your church will come with a message and not a query, and will be fully conscious that zeal in the pulpit will never grow out of doubt in the study."⁶

Macartney came to Pittsburgh, then, highly recommended as a man of competence and sound character whose message would coincide with the rigid ideals and values of his audience.⁷ In the ensuing years, this

³Delivery, also significant as a source of speaker credibility, will be reserved for a later section. See pp. 329ff.

⁴This study, pp. 34ff.

⁵This study, pp. 35f.

⁶Clyde Henry, "Introduction," The Making of a Minister, p. 20.

⁷See this study pp. 130ff; pp. 191ff. for a discussion of the expectations of Macartney's audience.

reputation seems not to have diminished, but rather to have been more firmly established. Aside from his preaching performance over the years, such extra-pulpit factors as the following would certainly have had confirming and validating effect:

1) Macartney continued to publish a book or more each year, with appropriate announcement of this event appearing in the public press, the parish paper, and book displays in a Presbyterian book store near the church. Macartney most certainly enjoyed the prestige associated with the authorship of books as well as recognition as an able, scholarly, and hard-working minister.

2) Observations made during summer vacation travels⁸ were reported to the home church in regular travel letters inserted in the church bulletin or published in the parish paper (also frequently in the journal, The Presbyterian). These letters, interspersed with moral and spiritual lessons befitting his office, portrayed the pastor as a man gaining first-hand knowledge, educated in history and literature, and possessing perceptivity and skill in applying this knowledge to his travel observations.

3) Anniversary occasions which were memorialized by special editions of First Church Life and reported by the Pittsburgh press⁹ would also have enhanced the speaker's ethos. Testimonials by leading citizens of the community, of the denomination, and the church, revealed the high esteem and respect reputable persons accorded to Macartney.

⁸Macartney's official call to Pittsburgh included the guarantee of two months vacation during July and August, which he devoted to wide travel both in America and abroad. See pp. 160f. of this study.

⁹See the Twentieth and Twenty-fifth Anniversary editions of First Church Life. The Pittsburgh Sun-Telegraph referred to Macartney in an editorial as "Giant in the Pulpit," April 28, 1952.

4) Perhaps most significant of all would be his personal contacts with people in his pastoral role.¹⁰ The uniqueness of the minister's office and its potential for persuasion are seen at this point, for he combines this altruistic personal contact (with people in their most receptive moments as in sickness, or in the presence of death) with his role as public speaker. This demonstration of those important attitudes of good will and identification with his people had, with Macartney, the additional advantage of the long-term impact.¹¹

Ethos Factors in Sermon Composition

Everything the speaker says and does in the actual speaking situation focuses attention on his character and competence--his choice of subject, his ideas, their development and arrangement, his style, and manner of delivery. Rhetoricians have held, moreover, that by personal reference, modestly and tactfully made, a speaker may enhance his ethos and strengthen his case.

Modest in his use of the first-person pronoun, Macartney expressed concern that such self-reference would lead to an over-exposure of the preacher's personality.¹² He, nevertheless, made successful use of travel and pastoral experiences and reference to his devout parents and early home training. Explicit statements which would draw attention to his competence or character are, however, almost non-existent.

¹⁰See this study, p. 161, relative to Macartney's pastoral visitation.

¹¹He noted on the twenty-fifth anniversary of his pastorate that he had baptised children whose parents he had also baptised as infants, First Church Life, Twenty-fifth Anniversary Edition, p. 26.

¹²See this study, p. 175.

It is the intent of this section (avoiding that uncertain realm of speculation as to why a speaker says this or that) through quoted examples to illustrate those statements most typical of the means by which Macartney (1) revealed the probity of his character, (2) indicated his competence, and (3) adapted himself favorably to his audience.

Character

The accumulated effect of Macartney's self-references regarding his experience, attitudes, and feelings would serve to create an image of: (1) sincerity, (2) sympathy and understanding, (3) integrity, and (4) modesty.

Sincerity.--The first-mentioned speaker trait, sincerity, is ranked high among the essentials for source credibility. It has been described as "a sense of mission. No real leadership is possible without it. We recognize it in the Minister's 'call,' in the reformer's zeal."¹³ Two aspects of this form of sincerity are especially vital--"the personal commitment of the speaker to what he is doing (a 'cause'), and his intellectual conviction."¹⁴

Macartney's frequently-expressed opinions regarding a true minister's mission and message would presumably have a transference effect to his advantage with a Biblically-oriented audience: "That is the kind of minister and prophet every church should desire to have; not one who will speak what pleases them, but who will speak the whole counsel of God and hide nothing that God hath revealed."¹⁵ "It is the

¹³Oliver, op. cit., p. 73.

¹⁴Brembeck and Howell, op. cit., pp. 254f.

¹⁵"The Noblest Man in the Old Testament," Sermons on Old Testament Heroes (New York: Abingdon-Cokesbury Press, 1933), p. 80.

lack of conviction that threatens to kill preaching in the Protestant pulpit. What we need is not more knowledge, organization, paraphernalia, but more bed-rock conviction as to a few great facts."¹⁶

Occasionally, in expressions of appeal, he used to advantage the generally-accepted view of his congregation that a minister of the gospel serves in a unique function as a special messenger for God:

. . . as Christ's ambassador, I beseech you, be ye reconciled to God!¹⁷

.

I speak now as God's minister to that conscience, to that soul within you. You can hear and you do hear, the voice of God. God offers you his grace, his pardon, his amazing love. What will you do with it?¹⁸

.

The Spirit speaks many languages, and Christ has many secret paths to the door of a man's heart. . . . he may come in the accents of a sermon such as this. God grant that he may!¹⁹

Macartney reinforced this image of "one set apart as a minister of the gospel" by numerous appealing references to early Christian influences in his life. He said on one occasion that because of the example and influence of a "godly home," it was "natural that I should become a Christian and also a minister."²⁰

His portrayals of the family gathered for family prayers were

¹⁶"John the Baptist," Of Them He Chose Twelve (Philadelphia: Dorrance and Company, 1927), p. 174.

¹⁷"Christ Reconciling the World," The Greatest Texts of the Bible (New York: Abingdon-Cokesbury Press, 1947), p. 159.

¹⁸"While He is Near," ibid., p. 42.

¹⁹"The Tenth Hour Struck for Me this Evening," Sermons from Life (Nashville, Tennessee: Cokesbury Press, 1933), p. 165.

²⁰"The Parable of the Vineyard," The Parables of the Old Testament (New York: Fleming H. Revell Company, 1916), p. 75.

effectively used:

Some things stand out above others in one's recollections of the past. One of these unerasable memories is the reading of the eleventh chapter of 2 Samuel at family worship. I can see the fire burning on the hearth, and the family assembled for morning worship; and I remember very distinctly the solemn words with which the reading of this chapter was prefaced.²¹

This is a phrase I can remember hearing frequently on the lips of my father in his prayers at the family altar, praying that his children might be bound up in the bundle of life.²²

As were also references to his mother's prayers:

I can show you the spot in our old home where our mother offered her daily prayers for her children.²³

. . . I can see the room which was her trysting place with God, and where at a certain hour of the forenoon, she was wont to kneel in intercession for the salvation of her children.²⁴

His reference to memories of lessons impressed upon him in his youth portrayed a high-principled family:

One thing that I remember about my own father is that I never heard from his lips a word of evil report or detraction concerning any man, either in public or private life, save once; and that one exception was when the truth had to be spoken in order to warn and to safeguard his children.²⁵

Well do I remember my mother's comment on an unworthy person who was being discussed: "Yes, but one of those souls for whom Christ died."²⁶

²¹"David and Bathsheba," The Way of a Man with a Maid (Nashville Tennessee: Cokesbury Press, 1931), p. 75.

²²"Abigail and Nabal," ibid., p. 81.

²³"The Woman Who was Better than Her Job," Great Women of the Bible (New York: Abingdon-Cokesbury Press, 1942), p. 58f.

²⁴"The Prayer of Abraham," Wrestlers with God (1930), p. 20.

²⁵"Getting the Best of the Tongue," Facing Life and Getting the Best of It (New York: Abingdon-Cokesbury Press, 1940), p. 68.

²⁶"The Ideal Woman," Great Women of the Bible (1942), p. 205.

One of the clearest memories that I have of Christmas at home is the recollection of how our mother sent me and my brother across the river one Christmas morning to a humble home in a poor settlement where we left a basket of supplies for the family.²⁷

Sympathy and Understanding:--Sympathy and understanding are also suggested as character traits essential for the persuasive speaker. "Great leaders and speakers . . . are not cold and aloof but warm with human understanding. They have the capacity to share the feelings of their fellows and visibly to display their sympathy."²⁸ While Macartney, who spoke frequently of the "warm heart" when addressing ministers²⁹ found it difficult to convey this warmth on the personal level,³⁰ these qualities must certainly have come through in his preaching, for the sermons are replete with expressions revealing him to be a man of deep human sympathy and understanding. The following is one such example:

Through the whole creation rolls the deep dirge of human sorrow. In that dirge I hear the cry of the little child, of the strong man in the midst of his years, and of the aged also. When you see someone in tears--a little child that is lost, or a man weeping like Peter over his sins and transgressions--who has not wished that he had the power to wipe away all tears from his eyes?³¹

In something approaching "an oratorical flight," Macartney surveys the sweep of human emotion represented in the large city, settling on the "note of loneliness":

If I were a composer, I should like to compose an anthem on the voice of the cry of a great city. In such an anthem there would be the note and chord of ambition and mounting desire; the major chord

²⁷Ibid., p. 204.

²⁸Minnick, op. cit., p. 119.

²⁹See C. E. Macartney, "Warm Hearts and Steady Faith," The Christian Century LVI (March 8, 1939).

³⁰This study, pp. 141f.

³¹"Night No More," Great Nights of the Bible (New York: Abingdon-Cokesbury Press, 1943), p. 220.

of hope and worship and sorrow; the penetrating note of pain; the low-sounding chord of despair; the strident piercing note of greed; the howl of hate. But no anthem of the city would be complete which did not have sounding through it the deep, diapason note of loneliness.³²

Macartney evinced feelings of compassion for all classes of men:

I never see a pale, worn washer-woman without thinking that her chief prayer must be for rest. . . . There are multitudes for whom life is one long, never-ceasing grind of manual labor, and a labor which is often beyond their strength.³³

That drunkard lying in the doorway of the closed shop at evening, as the people hurry to their homes; at first you think him as a fool, but who knows what sorrow will be in his heart when he comes again to himself? . . . Who knows that he had not set out to purchase Christmas gifts for his wife and children?³⁴

In his sermons and illustrations drawn from pastoral experiences, he is revealed not only as sympathetic and understanding, but as a man who can be trusted with confidences and self-disclosure:³⁵

He had come to me for counsel and for help. But what could I do or say? . . . when he was through with his tale, I sat dumb with silence, solemnized at the recoil of the broken law. At length, the young man himself broke the silence which on both sides had followed the recital of the story of his transgression.³⁶

As to the circumstances and details of this case and the causes contributory, I cannot speak. Over that we draw the impenetrable veil of obscurity and anonymity and charity.³⁷

³²"Getting the Best of Loneliness," Facing Life and Getting the Best of It (1940), pp. 99f.

³³"A Prayer Every Man Makes," Wrestlers With God (1930), pp. 197f.

³⁴"Peter's Tears," Peter and His Lord (New York: Abingdon-Cokesbury Press, 1937), p. 96.

³⁵The sermons comprising his two volumes of "Sermons From Life" are based on such instances; often a sermon is built on the words of a counselee spoken to him either in person or written in a letter.

³⁶"I Believe I am Going to Hell," Sermons from Life (1933), pp. 36f.

³⁷Ibid., p. 223.

Integrity.--A third component of good character, integrity, is frequently demonstrated by the speaker's use of other men's ideas. Macartney scrupulously avoided any suggestion of plagiarism. A typical example of his care in acknowledging the use of other men's ideas is the following taken from his sermon on "The Unpardonable Sin":

Henry Ward Beecher commences a sermon on this subject of the Unpardonable Sin by saying: "There is much anxiety and very little knowledge on this important subject." And Thomas Chalmers begins his great sermon on the same theme by saying: "Let us never suspend the practical influence of what we do know by idly rambling in a vain and impertinent pursuit after what we do not know."³⁸

Modesty.--The trait of modesty is revealed by occasional statements in which, for example, he disclaims any superiority over the common run of men or in which he acknowledges deficiencies in skill or knowledge:

. . . But that every man is temptable, that every man has inclinations which, if yielded to, would lead him into the darkness, that I believe from what I see of human nature about me and from what I know of my own heart.³⁹

I have often read this story of midnight prayer: I have studied it, written about it, but always with a sense of complete failure.⁴⁰

Competence

Competence is that quality in the speaker growing out of a com-

³⁸"The Unpardonable Sin," Sermons From Life (1933), p. 185. In his advice to preachers who hoped to publish their sermons he suggests an added reason to avoid plagiarism--the possibility of getting caught: "It goes without saying that for his own honor and safety, the writer of printed sermons must be meticulous in the use he makes of other men's thoughts and forms of speech. If a preacher is a plagiarist, or a semi-plagiarist, it would be well for him not to publish his sermons, for his sin 'is sure to find him out.'" Clarence E. Macartney, "Writing Books of Sermons and Devotional Books," Writing for the Religious Market, Roland E. Wolseley, ed. (New York: Association Press, 1956), p. 212.

³⁹"The Unpardonable Sin," Sermons From Life (1933), p. 82.

⁴⁰"The Prayer of Jacob," Wrestlers With God (1930), p. 37.

bination of ability, intelligence, know-how, understanding, judgment--
 "Listeners believe that a speaker is competent when they can say, 'He
 knows what he is talking about.'⁴¹

Macartney's competence as a preacher (or lack of it as the case
 may be) would have been demonstrated to his congregation in many ways--
 his handling of Biblical material, his choice of other supporting
 materials, his manner of delivery. These are matters for discussion in
 later sections, however. At this point it is suggested that the most
 obvious and characteristic forms of self-reference implying competence
 would be those made with respect to his travel experiences (with which
 the sermons abound), an occasional reference to his association with men
 of high standing, and an occasional statement implying successes or
 results traceable to his preaching.

References to travel experiences in the Holy Land or in the foot-
 steps of St. Paul should be especially effective in augmenting the image
 of competence for a Christian preacher.

. . . on an August day--traveling, not as Jesus was, from Judea to
 Galilee, but from Galilee to Judea--I paused in the heat of noonday
 at that same well and asked for a drink of water.⁴²

. . . How often have I myself, faint and weary in following the foot-
 steps of St. Paul, sat down beneath one of those plane [Sycamore]
 trees and solaced my soul with its grateful shade.⁴³

This is a sermon I found at Antioch, when leaning over the parapet
 of the bridge and watching the snow-colored Orontes flowing rapidly
 through the city toward the sea.⁴⁴

⁴¹Hance, Kenneth G., Ralph, David C., Wiksell, Milton J., Principles
 of Speaking (Belmont, California: Wadsworth Publishing Company, Inc.
 1962), p. 38.

⁴²"With a Much-Married Woman," Great Interviews of Jesus (New York:
 Abingdon-Cokesbury Press, 1944), p. 26f.

⁴³"With a Tree-Climbing Politician," ibid., p. 56.

⁴⁴"Barnabas--the Good Man Behind a Great Man," The Wisest Fool
 (New York: Abingdon-Cokesbury Press, 1949), p. 44.

Macartney made effective reference to his visits to famous art galleries. Such statements as the following would imply his competence as a connoisseur of the fine things of life.

. . . I saw wonderful paintings that summer and other summers in the great cathedrals of Europe--Rembrandts, Murillos, Velasquez, Titians, El Grecos, Rubens, Raphaels--but this was by all odds the finest picture I saw, the beautiful child and the old man kneeling side by side before the mystery of Christ and him crucified.⁴⁵

Statements regarding his association with men of high standing likewise inferred a competence for public work:

. . . Crossing the Atlantic once with the English poet laureate John Masefield, I told him that sometimes when preaching on repentance I quoted from his Everlasting Mercy, one of the greatest things on repentance ever written. . . .⁴⁶

Some years before his death I was driving across Chicago with Williams Jennings Bryan.⁴⁷

In the city where I began my ministry there was a man who lived in a beautiful marble mansion in one of the residential sections. He was the owner of the chief department store in the city. I had no contact with him whatever, but one day, greatly to my surprise, he called at my study and told me that he understood that I frequently went abroad on my summer vacations. He said he would like to go with me. . . .⁴⁸

The suggestion of competence for his task would have been conveyed by his occasional mention of some desirable response to a sermon such as:

Here are three verses which I once repeated on a Sunday night, and heard by a man and his wife were used for their conversion.⁴⁹

⁴⁵"With Two Dead Men," Great Interviews of Jesus (1944), p. 68.

⁴⁶"Philip--The Man Who Made a City Glad," The Wisest Fool and Other Men of the Bible (1949), pp. 111f.

⁴⁷Macartney's Illustrations (New York: Abingdon-Cokesbury Press, 1945), p. 256.

⁴⁸"Loneliness," You Can Conquer (New York: Abingdon Press, 1954), p. 44.

⁴⁹"Getting the Best of Yesterday," Facing Life and Getting the Best of It (New York: Abingdon-Cokesbury Press, 1940), p. 95.

The frequency of the requests for this sermon, the different kinds of persons from whom the requests come, the quick consumption of printed issues of it, bear witness to the fact that its subject lies very close to life.⁵⁰

Perhaps as close as Macartney ever comes to a direct assertion of his competence would be the following comment:

I know the guesses, the surmises, the perhapses of the philosophers, what the Platos and the Ciceros and the Socrates⁵¹ have said on the subject, and I know how cold they leave the heart.

Good Will

It is generally accepted that the persuasive speaker adapts himself favorably to his audience by conveying an attitude which is interpreted to mean that he is identified with his listeners through common interests, mutual understanding, and sympathetic regard. The auditor is made to feel that "the speaker is 'with him,' on his side, 'in the same boat,' or concerned about his welfare."⁵² Such an identification, one might almost assume at the outset, would be inherent in the speaking situation under consideration--a Christian minister who regularly addresses a friendly audience for whom he is the appointed spokesman.

One does not detect anything unique in Macartney's sermons in this respect; however, those standard methods which have come to be associated naturally with preaching such as "first-person" expressions of concern and regard for the welfare of the listeners, appear to be used appropriately and always in good taste.

⁵⁰"It Takes Tribulation to Make a Man," *Sermons From Life* (1933), p. 168.

⁵¹"I am Not Ashamed," The Greatest Texts of the Bible (1947), p. 19.

⁵²James H. McBurney and Ernest J. Wraga, The Art of Good Speech (New York: Prentice-Hall, Inc.), p. 489.

At times Macartney used expressions that would identify him with his hearers in the successes and failures of the Christian life:

Probably all of us have had, or shall have, some one experience in life when God seemed nearer to us . . . than he was at any other time.⁵³

But why throw stones at Saul? Have we not all done that? Felt the folly of our ways, confessed that we had done wrong, and then gone back to it again?⁵⁴

The doctrinal belief that all men are sinners, for which plight the cross of Christ is the remedy, gave occasion for effective common-ground expressions such as:

Oh, if that had to be our remedy [the death of Christ] , then what must be the disease! If that had to be the deliverance, then what must have been our doom!⁵⁵

At times, a direct appeal to his listeners represented what was probably an effectively communicated altruistic concern:

Is there anyone here this morning who is marching with drawn sword against God? If so, the Holy Spirit comes to meet you. . . . Obey him! Obey that voice!⁵⁶

Again, the appeal expressed concern for specific classes--the tempted soul, the children, and youth:

I wonder if now, all unconsciously, I am beholding in some life . . . the struggle between good and evil for the mastery of an immortal soul? . . . If, indeed, as I surely am, I am speaking to some sorely tempted man or woman . . .⁵⁷

⁵³"The Worst and the Best Man," Sermons on Old Testament Heroes (1935), p. 106.

⁵⁴"The Greatest Shipwreck in the Old Testament," ibid., p. 123.

⁵⁵"The Conqueror from Calvary," pamphlet, sermon preached April 15, 1927.

⁵⁶"Bound in the Bundle of Life," pamphlet, sermon preached June 18, 1950.

⁵⁷"The Tenth Hour Struck for Me this Evening," Sermons From Life (1933), p. 164.

Sometimes, watching the bright young faces of our boys at the Boys' Club, and thinking of their future and their possibilities, I say to myself, "Would that one could guard them and protect them from pain and sorrow; but, especially from temptation--the temptation which may take the bright light out of their eyes and the joy out of their hearts!"⁵⁸

Would that I might write that with a pen of iron upon the heart of every young man and young woman in this congregation tonight.⁵⁹

I would that I could meet every train coming into the city bringing its precious cargo of young lives starting out on the great adventure of the world; that I could encounter every young man as he comes to the doors of college and school . . . and say to them all, "Who is your friend?"⁶⁰

Summary--Persuasion through Character

The available means of persuasion within the speaker include his reputation and prestige at the moment he begins to speak, and the increasing or diminishing of that prestige as a result of what he says during his speech.

Macartney enjoyed high prestige and an excellent reputation for his task when he was originally presented to his congregation. This reputation was maintained in ensuing years not only by the manner in which he fulfilled his assignment, but by his continued success as an author of books, by a favorable press, and was sustained even during his absences from his pulpit by weekly travel letters to his congregation.

While a speaker's ethos is enhanced or diminished by the over-all impression created in the actual presentation of the speech, it is also recognized that specific, appropriate statements of self-reference may

⁵⁸"Temptation," You Can Conquer (1954), p. 30.

⁵⁹"I Beg to Remain in Sorrow, His Mother," Sermons From Life (1933), p. 141.

⁶⁰"Amnon," Bible Epitaphs (New York: Abingdon-Cokesbury Press, 1936), p. 38.

contribute favorably to speaker-credibility. Although explicit assertions of character and competence were rare with Macartney, he employed with evident effect certain modes of audience adaptation common to Protestant preaching. He communicated a sense of earnestness and sincerity by statements of his views regarding preaching and preachers, by reference to childhood memories of a devout home, and by expressions portraying him to be a man of human sympathy and understanding, integrity, and modesty.

Competence for his task was implied by references to his association with important people, by the use of travel experiences, and by comments regarding desirable responses made to his sermons.

Good motives by means of which he would adapt himself favorably to his audience were expressed by such typical sermon usages as first-person common ground expressions, expressions of altruistic concern, and directness of appeal.

III. Sermon Analysis--Persuasion through the Development of Ideas

The central problem of preaching, according to one writer on the subject, is "What shall a man preach and why? Before this question, all matters related to methods of delivery, and handling of the audience fade into insignificance."¹ Preaching four times weekly and more, as was Macartney's practice, he would have prepared 150 to 200 sermons annually.² Such an output requires a tremendous supply of both sermon ideas and illustrative materials.

This section considers the sermons of Dr. Macartney from the standpoint of their content--the dominant ideas and their development. The following matters are considered: (1) themes and emphases, (2) the source of ideas, (3) the development of ideas, (4) the idea dramatized, and (5) motive appeals.

Themes and Emphases

A useful context within which to examine the content of Macartney's sermons is provided by H. Grady Davis' discussion of the three "functional forms" of preaching.³ Taking his cue from New Testament evidence regarding the forms of religious address employed in the early Christian church, he divides preaching into "proclamation," "teaching," and "therapy." By proclamation (which, incidentally, he declares to be the only form of speech in the New Testament called

¹Garrison, op. cit., p. 41.

²Figuring an average of 3,000 words per sermon, his literary productivity would have totaled at least one-half million words a year. Few professional writers, devoting full time to their craft, maintain a greater output than that.

³H. Grady Davis, Design for Preaching, (Philadelphia: Fortress Press, 1958), chapters 7 and 8.

preaching) is meant that form of religious speech addressed to unbelievers announcing God's redemptive action in Jesus, or the Gospel. A second form of communication is Christian teaching based on the content of the former but addressed to believers with the purpose of training the convert for the new life; it moves into the implications of the gospel for believers through instruction in Christian ethics and theology. A third form of discourse recognizable in the New Testament, is what he has termed "therapeutic speech," which seeks by means of exhortation and encouragement to improve the hearer mentally, emotionally, or religiously:

The immediate concern of preaching is to broadcast the announcement. The immediate concern of teaching is to impart the truth of Christ. But the immediate concern of therapeutic speech is to remedy or improve the existing condition of the hearer.⁴

The usefulness of such an analysis not only for a classification of themes, but a sharpened evaluation of the speaker's adaptation of his themes to his audience is obvious.

While one notes in Macartney a frequent overlapping of these three forms, with many sermons bearing characteristics of each, well over half of the sermons published between 1927 and 1958 would have to be classified as therapeutic speech--persuasive exhortation, sometimes comforting and consoling, often curative and corrective. Under this category would come the largest portion of his sermons on Biblical characters,⁵ his "Sermons from Life," those sermons on the order of

⁴Ibid., p. 127.

⁵In 1949 he noted he had preached 167 sermons to that date on Biblical characters (Foreword, The Wisest Fool and Other Men of the Bible). In 1951 he announced that, having dealt with "practically every major character in the Bible," he was now finding even greater homiletic value in the lesser personalities (Foreword, Chariots of Fire and Other Sermons on Bible Characters).

pastoral counseling or pastoral psychiatry such as the series: "Facing Life and Getting the Best of It," and "You Can Conquer." Frequently recurring themes within this classification are: (1) social relationships--home, family, children, marriage, divorce, friendship, Christian influence and witness; (2) personal problems--loneliness, grief, suffering, sorrow, discouragement, disappointment, loss, fear; (3) moral exhortation--conscience, temptation, moral retribution, guilt, remorse, opportunity; (4) warnings--doubt, backsliding, apostasy; and (5) ethical questions--money, avarice, slander, gossip, irreverence, lethargy, etc.

As suggested, there is an overlapping of the three functional forms so that elements of teaching and proclamation appear throughout the sermons subsumed under the above-mentioned categories.

Perhaps in one third of Macartney's published sermons one could say that the didactic rather than the hortatory note prevails (although Macartney is always persuading and appealing even when the sermon content is more heavily weighted with instruction in Christian truth and doctrine). Included in this "teaching" classification are his series on the creed such as "Things Most Surely Believed," his doctrinal series such as, "The Faith Once Delivered," and "What Jesus Really Taught." These sermons, bringing instruction in Christian theology and ethics, cover such areas common to the Christian message as doctrines concerning God, Christ, eschatology, the Bible, the nature of man, sin, salvation, Holy Spirit, angels, and the church. Instruction in Christian living included many of the themes mentioned in the previous classification (but examined in more detail), such themes as Sunday observance, the Christian's prayer life, and Christian virtues such as, humility, temperance, altruism and others.

A much smaller number of sermons would meet Davis' criteria for "proclamation," in which the predominating tone and emphasis consist of the announcement of God's means devised for the redemption and salvation of lost sinners--sermons directed to non-Christians. These sermons are found scattered in such volumes as The Greatest Texts of the Bible, Salute Thy Soul, and in the individual sermon pamphlets. In many cases, these were found to have been preached during Holy Week.⁶ It must be explained, however, that Macartney felt bound to sound this note of proclamation, even if briefly, in a large number of his sermons where it was usually accomplished by means of a skillful transition in the closing moments of the sermon (regardless of what other emphases may have prevailed earlier).⁷

True to his stated views regarding the proper subject-matter for preaching,⁸ Macartney rarely spoke on civic, national, or international problems and issues, but confined himself largely to the themes outlined above. Occasionally, however, he took note of current events to sound a patriotic note as in "Lincoln and Washington Speak to the Soul of America,"⁹ preached on Washington's birthday, or "Sixty Bombers Did Not Return,"¹⁰ preached in 1943 defending the allied cause during the war. A sermon preached prior to the 1952 presidential election was entitled,

⁶It is regrettable that more of Macartney's sermons preached during Holy Week, particularly the Good Friday sermons, have not been published in book form. Filed correspondence from his listeners, as well as questionnaire response, would indicate these were of a high order.

⁷See this study, pp. 293f.

⁸See this study, pp. 153ff.

⁹Pamphlet, sermon preached February 22, 1948.

¹⁰Pamphlet, sermon preached November 7, 1943.

"The Kind of Leader America Needs Today."¹¹

The Source of Ideas

The Bible

As expected, Macartney relied chiefly upon Biblical material for the source and development of his sermon content. Chapter V has already delineated his views concerning reliance upon Biblical material for preaching. Illustrative of his convictions in this regard is counsel reportedly given two days before his death to his brother who was leaving his bedside to preach in a nearby church: "Put all the Bible you can into it."¹²

Lucas has observed,

A study of one of his books selected at random revealed that between seventy-five and eighty per cent of the sermon space was devoted to mentioning or discussing a Biblical event, character, or narrative. His concept of the vital significance of the Bible caused him to draw upon his knowledge of the Scriptures at every point and incorporate it into his sermons.¹³

While a random selection would not necessarily be typical, since the use of Scriptural material varied from sermon to sermon--as for example, in a sermon on a Biblical character as compared to one taken from his series, "Sermons from Life"--nevertheless, the generalization can safely be made that whatever the topic, the supporting materials would have been drawn largely from the Scriptures.

¹¹Sermon pamphlet (n.d.) imprinted with the following notation: "This sermon, by unanimous consent of the House of Representatives, was printed in the Congressional Record for July 7, 1952."

¹²Oswald T. Allis, Foreword, Salute Thy Soul (New York: Abingdon Press, 1957).

¹³Richard D. Lucas, "The Preaching of Clarence E. Macartney" (unpublished Th.D. dissertation: Southern Baptist Theological Seminary, Louisville, Kentucky, 1959), p. 51.

A profitable exercise would be to take an example cited earlier-- Macartney's pre-election sermon, which had been introduced into The Congressional Record, "The Kind of Leader America Needs Today."¹⁴

Macartney's ideal leader is typified by a Biblical example, Nehemiah, of whom he says early in the sermon: "One might call him the greatest layman of the Bible. As a civil governor he shows the immense influence that strong and godly men can exert upon their nation and their times."

Introduced, typically, with a brief text drawn from the Biblical narrative of Nehemiah, the sermon in pamphlet form covers 330 lines, the first 182 lines of which are a re-telling of the Biblical account of Nehemiah's return to Jerusalem to lead out in a restoration of the ruined city. Then follow four divisions, in which the application is made to the contemporary scene:

- I. America needs a man who cares.
- II. America needs a man of courage.
- III. America needs honest and incorruptible men in office.
- IV. America needs a man of faith and prayer.

Each division is introduced by a specific reference to the Nehemiah narrative, from which the generalizations are drawn for specific application. Under division I, from Nehemiah's example, the general assertion was made: "We need men today who care about the state of our nation," which in turn is supported by specific instances of conditions which

¹⁴Sermon pamphlet (n.d.), See Supra, footnote 11. An enthusiastic listener wrote Macartney that he had mailed a copy of this sermon to General Eisenhower: "Never for a moment did I think the General would answer me, but today I received a reply thanking me for sending the sermon. . . . Since I gave my copy to General Eisenhower, would it be possible to secure another copy?" (Letter dated August 25, 1952, Macartney Files.)

should awaken concern in America: evidences of moral decline as revealed by syndicated crime, alcoholism, pornography, and bribery and corruption in public and private life. In a similar manner, the remaining points take their authority first from the Biblical narrative and then are supported by specific instances drawn from American history. Biblical materials occupy perhaps 60 per cent of the content of this sermon, as analogically Macartney develops his concept of the man needed to lead America.¹⁵

Other Sources

Aside from the Bible, those areas from which his sermon materials are most frequently derived are the following: literature, history, biography, hymnology, philosophy, sermons of other preachers, and personal experiences.¹⁶ A sampling of authors and sources frequently alluded to will give some indication of the intellectual cast of his Biblically-oriented sermons: Shakespeare's works, Milton (particularly, Paradise Lost), Bunyan (Pilgrim's Progress), Defoe (Robinson Crusoe), Lord Byron, Shelley, Keats, Eliot, Gray, Burns, Carlyle, Addison, Dickens, Sir Walter Scott, Tennyson, Longfellow, Stevenson, Hawthorne, Matthew Arnold, the Russians, Gorky and Turgenev, Greek mythology, Roman and Greek history, church history, British and American history; such preachers as Chrysostom, Frederick Robertson, Chalmers, Guthrie, Beecher, Brooks, and Spurgeon; hymns from Cowper and Faber; and the works of

¹⁵While this sermon is a good example of how he employs Biblical concepts in almost any topic he wishes to develop, the other supporting materials are not typical since the topic actually was not of a nature normally dealt with in his preaching.

¹⁶The fields of psychology and science are rarely drawn upon; nor are there many references to newspaper and periodical articles.

Augustine and Plato.

A sermon selected at random which was found to deal with the subject of disciplining one's thoughts, made use of the following non-Biblical materials:¹⁷

1. Comments from a sermon by John Wesley
2. Incident from the biography of a civil war general, O. O. Howard
3. Observations regarding Rudin's sculpture, "The Thinker"
4. Lines from Milton's Paradise Lost
5. Personal pastoral experience
6. Lines from Shakespeare's "Lady Macbeth"
7. James Russell Lowell quotation
8. Two 8-line poems by unknown authors
9. Quotation from Marcus Aurelius
10. Quotation from A' Kempis', The Imitation of Christ
11. Allusion to the historian, Livy.
12. Travel experience
13. Legend from Flaubert
14. A letter written by his mother
15. Incident from Bunyan's Pilgrim's Progress
16. Quotation from Jeremy Taylor's, Holy Dying

Such an array of supporting materials, many of which were of a high order from the literary standpoint, must have made a persuasive appeal to Macartney's well-educated audience.

The Development of Ideas

The four forms of discourse by means of which ideas and assertions

¹⁷"The Mind," You Can Conquer (1954), pp. 89f.

are amplified and supported, namely (1) Exposition, (2) Description, (3) Narration, and (4) Argumentation, have been described as follows:

Exposition is explanation: what something is, what it means, how it works, how it is made, what can be done with it, how or why something happened, etc. Description tells how a person, a view, an object, or an event appears to the senses: how it looks, sounds, tastes, smells, feels to the touch or through the organs or muscles. Narration tells a story. Argumentation is not necessarily debate or controversy but is the form of discourse used in stating evidence and reasons for a conclusion or judgment.¹⁸

It is important to remember that, on the whole, Macartney's sermons took the form of a message to be illuminated rather than an argument to be proven. Because he was speaking to people generally in agreement with his propositions, his task of persuasion was to stir passive loyalties and to promote values and ideals and a stronger devotion to them--"to strengthen the bonds of relatedness through shared experience."¹⁹

That form of address adapted to heighten latent beliefs has been termed The Impressive Pattern.²⁰ For this, it is suggested "the best media are narration and description rather than argument or exposition."²¹ These implications have suggested a separate treatment of the "media" of Narration and Description in Macartney's sermons under the heading, "Dramatizing the Idea." At this point, however, the discussion will consider those forms of development which might be more obvious in his "teaching" sermons,²² namely, Exposition and Argument.

¹⁸Sarett, Foster, and Sarett, op. cit., p. 258.

¹⁹Ibid., p. 498.

²⁰Ibid., p. 565.

²¹Ibid.

²²See this Study, pp. 214ff.

Exposition

The use of exposition as a means of persuasive development of the idea in the preaching of C. E. Macartney is illustrated by its application to the explanation of Scripture and by the use of the sermon illustration.

Explanation of Scripture.--In preaching, exposition involves particularly the explanation of the Scriptures, which in the view of Broadus is "among the primary functions of the preacher."²³

As reported earlier,²⁴ Macartney was not enamored with expository preaching as such--that form of religious discourse occupied largely with the exposition of a passage of Scripture. His preaching was largely topical, but employed Biblical materials. Although he nearly always opened his address by reading a text--usually very brief--frequently the text was actually not the basis or source of the ideas advanced, but acted rather as a point of departure, or as a unifying theme or motto for his topic.

Three examples of such a use of the text follow:

1. Text: "There was standing by the cross, his mother," (John 19:25).

This is a statement describing the scene at Calvary where Christ's mother stood near the cross. Macartney's only use of the text appears late in the sermon when he makes the following application:

There stood by the Cross his mother. When you and your cross come together, who stands closer to the cross than your mother? Who is more interested in your success and happiness? Who will

²³John A. Broadus, On the Preparation and Delivery of Sermons (rev. ed.; New York: Harper and Brothers, 1944), p. 157.

²⁴Supra, p. 157.

sympathize more with you in your grief or disappointment?²⁵

2. Text: "And we sailed thence, and came the next day over against Chios: and the next day we arrived at Samos, . . . and the next day we came to Miletus." (Acts 20:15).²⁶

Macartney's use of this passage is to give it a spiritualized application to life--life, a journey which must be taken day by day.

3. Text: "They cast four anchors out of the stern." (Acts 27:29).²⁷

The sermon is not an exposition of that passage, of course. The four anchors become for Macartney: Church going, Home ties and Affections, the Bible, and Prayer.

It is this use of Biblical material that has brought Macartney under adverse criticism of certain contemporary writers on preaching.

Davis expressed disapproval of this practice:

Many a sermon uses a text but is not derived from the text. The text of such a sermon is not its source; it is only a resource, a tool used in preaching the sermon--used for psychological or literary effect.²⁸

Macartney's defense would have been that these sermons were topical in form, not textual or expository, and that while the text simply suggested the topic (however vaguely), the topic was developed

²⁵"I Beg to Remain in Sorrow, His Mother," Sermons from Life 1933), pp. 142f.

²⁶"The Next Day, Chios," pamphlet, sermon preached September, 1937. Macartney's resourcefulness is illustrated in this use of a ship's log for a sermon.

²⁷"Four Anchors," pamphlet, sermon preached January 11, 1942.

²⁸Davis, op. cit., p. 47.

with a straightforward use of Biblical authority.

This was not, however, Macartney's only mode of using a Biblical text. Frequently the sermon demonstrated faithful use and development of a passage of Scripture in its true context. His sermons on Biblical characters were a form of narrative exposition, and his special series on "The Great Texts" of the Bible often involved considerable exposition. As an example, an Easter sermon was developed from the four assertions of the following passage:

"I am the first and the last: I am he that liveth, and was dead: and behold, I am alive for evermore, . . . and have the keys of hell and of death."²⁹

Each assertion is developed with materials of exposition. For example, the expression, "And, have the keys of hell and of death" was explained as follows:

The keys were a symbol of authority. When a city was conquered, or opened its gate to a conqueror, the leaders of the city delivered over the keys to the conqueror. So Christ holds the keys of the gates of death.³⁰

Macartney was concerned that difficult passages be clarified; and where necessary, he utilized his knowledge of the original languages to explain a passage. Thus, he was able to clarify the meaning of a scriptural metaphor employed by St. Paul:

He says, "If our earthly house of this tabernacle, (or tent,) were dissolved, we have a building from God." Literally, he says, if the earthly tent were taken down, unloosed, as one takes down a tent by loosening its ropes. . . . So at death the cords of the earthly tents are unloosened; the tabernacle, the body, comes down.³¹

²⁹Revelation 1:17, 18.

³⁰"Have the Gates of Death Been Opened to Thee?" The Greatest Questions of the Bible and Life (New York: Abingdon-Cokesbury Press, 1948), p. 111.

³¹"A House not Made With Hands," The Greatest Texts of the Bible (1947), p. 111.

Another passage is illuminated as follows:

"Great," declares Paul, "is the mystery of godliness." By that he did not mean what mystery means to you and me today, something which is inexplicable and inscrutable. "Mystery" is Paul's favorite word for Christianity, and by mystery he means the great secret of man's redemption and salvation, hid from time eternal, but now revealed in Christ and proclaimed by his Church.³²

In his sermons on Biblical characters, which were often largely narrative in form, frequent expository comments growing out of his travels and wide reading illuminate the story--³³ as for example:

Samson was to be a Nazarite from his mother's womb. . . . A Nazarite was from his birth a man devoted in a peculiar sense to God. As no tool or instrument of iron could be lifted over an altar, so no knife, or iron tool, could be lifted over the body of a Nazarite, for he was to be an altar dedicated to God. This was the meaning of the provision that he could not shave or cut his hair.³⁴

Exposition by illustration.--Macartney made wide and effective use of the sermon illustration, drawing from such areas as the following: the Bible, history, art, biography, fiction, nature, poetry, mythology, philosophy, hymns, drama, science, personal experiences, and imagination. His illustrative material most frequently served the purpose of rendering his ideas more vivid and impressive, rather than simply to clarify a point. While this use will be discussed in a following section, at this point, however, examples are cited of the use of the illustration for purposes of clarification:

³²"The Mystery of Godliness," The Greatest Texts of the Bible (1947), p. 173. His explanation grows out of the actual connotation of the Greek Musterion.

³³Lucas cites Church Management magazine, "His sermons are as readable as fiction, but as helpful as a Bible Commentary," op. cit., p. 86.

³⁴"Samson and Delilah," The Way of a Man with a Maid, pp. 101f.

1) He illustrated the proposition that "the eye of faith sees more than the eye of sight" with the account of the discovery of the planet Neptune. Astronomers, assuming that deviations and perturbations of the planet Uranus were caused by another planet, confirmed their suppositions mathematically:

Finally, after midnight on the morning of September 14, 1946, an astronomer turned his instrument on the place designated and the great planet swam into view. . . . The eyes of the mind, the eye of faith, discovered it long before it was seen through the lens of the telescope.³⁵

2) "The meaning of conscience and how it asserts itself" was clarified by a narrative from literature:

Another fact in man which witnesses to the existence of God is conscience. Perhaps I can best explain what I mean by conscience by the following story from the "Confessions of Rousseau": then follows a narrative of some 150 words.³⁶

3) The philosophical idea of "the efficacy of the death of Christ" is clarified analogically by an incident from the annals of ancient history:

There is an old story of how the celebrated Greek poet, Aeschylus, was about to be sentenced and banished by the citizens of Athens. But his brother, who had lost an arm at the battle of Salamis, appeared at the Tribunal and displayed his wounds as a reason why the citizens should show mercy to Aeschylus. Upon that ground, and with that appeal, the poet was set free. This is but a poor illustration of how the wounds of Christ, his death upon the cross, are with God the ground of our forgiveness and his mercy.³⁷

By means of the above-mentioned modes of exposition, Macartney has actually endorsed his own audience-centered theory of homiletics, demonstrating in this case a concern for clarity through exposition.

³⁵"Thomas--the Man who was not There," The Wisest Fool and Other Men of the Bible (1949), pp. 148f.

³⁶"God," Things Most Surely Believed (Nashville, Tennessee: Cokesbury Press, 1930), p. 12.

³⁷"He Ascended into Heaven," Things Most Surely Believed (1930), pp. 95f.

Argument

The persuasive power of appeals to the intellect has been emphasized:

Where do reasoning and argument enter the picture? Do they play an important part in human behavior? They do indeed. Obviously most people desire to know the truth, to detect chicanery, to avoid gullibility, and to live in the main a rational life.³⁸

Because of this natural attraction in man for the "rational life," some authorities view reason in discourse as a motive appeal serving a supplementary role with desire.³⁹

Homileticians have also emphasized the importance of rational proof for preaching: " . . . Preachers really have a great use for argument. . . . The right to speak with authority will be acknowledged, among Protestants, only where the preacher shows himself able to prove whenever it is appropriate all that he maintains."⁴⁰

The elements of logical proof generally accepted by rhetoricians are evidence and reasoning: (1) Evidence is concerned with matters of fact and opinion used as a basis for establishing proof; (2) Reasoning is the process of using evidence and propositions to infer conclusions.

Evidence.--Evidence comes chiefly from two sources, (1) observations of facts and (2) opinions about facts. Because facts have to do with the existence of things, the classification of data, the character of phenomena, fact evidence is also normally regarded as verifiable evidence. Opinion evidence ranges from inexperienced and non-experimental opinions to the most expert and carefully supported judgments.

³⁸William N. Brigance, Speech Composition (New York: Appleton-Century-Crofts, Inc., 1937), p. 140.

³⁹Brembeck and Howell, op. cit., pp. 126ff.

⁴⁰Broadus, (rev. ed.), op. cit., pp. 167ff.

1) Factual evidence. A discussion of Dr. Macartney's use of factual evidence for purposes of logical proof involves an examination of the use he made of Biblical materials. An earlier chapter detailed the basic premises upon which Macartney, as a proponent of the traditional Christian orthodoxy, built his theological structure and to which his preaching gave expression. It was shown that the Bible, interpreted in a strictly conservative or orthodox manner, constituted the primary source of evidence for his beliefs.

At this point one might raise the question concerning the nature of this evidence. If the primary source of such evidence is the Bible, one might ask whether such Biblical evidence is to be regarded as evidence of fact or evidence of opinion.⁴¹ Macartney's theological presuppositions led him to view such evidence as factual evidence, as did apparently the largest portion of the members of his congregation.⁴² In other words, what the Scriptures state as fact, whether verifiable or not, must be taken as settled fact on the basis of the divinely inspired source of the statement. A statement by St. Paul then, for example, is not to be regarded as one man's opinion, even expert opinion, but a statement of indisputable fact. It is not the purpose of this study to assay the validity of these premises, but rather to show how the speaker proceeded from these basic premises in the construction of logical argument for persuasive address.

Granting the validity of these premises, such an appraisal in-

⁴¹The debate between liberalism and fundamentalism on this point was discussed earlier. See this study, chapter II.

⁴²Respondents to the questionnaire directed to parishioners under Macartney, without exception express agreement with his theological views. See Appendix XI.

volves also the matter of the speaker's competence in the interpretation of Scripture within this framework. As already indicated, Macartney occasionally took liberties with a passage of Scripture--a fact which has brought him under adverse criticism by some contemporary proponents of Biblical preaching.⁴³ The complaint was to the effect that frequently a text was lifted out of its context and used mainly as a motto or point of departure for a sermon. (It was shown earlier that in these instances the sermon, nevertheless, made authentic use of Biblical evidence apart from the text).⁴⁴

That Macartney was regarded generally as a competent interpreter of Scripture among conservatives in religion, however, may be adduced from the fact that in several instances books on preaching by representative spokesmen for the orthodox faith set him forth as an example worthy of emulation as a Biblical preacher, and therefore, presumably a competent interpreter of the Bible.⁴⁵ In addition, respondents to the questionnaire involving fifty-eight persons who heard Macartney, many for long periods of time, without exception indicated their confidence in the speaker as a competent Biblical interpreter.

It should be noted then, that Macartney, as a conservative interpreter of the Bible, relied largely upon Biblical evidence for logical

⁴³Supra, pp. 223f.

⁴⁴Ibid.

⁴⁵See works by Whitesell, Dewitt Jones, Macleod, and Blackwood cited earlier in this study. Blackwood does take issue with Macartney in one instance on the use he makes of Samson's early life as recorded in the Bible. See Expository Preaching for Today (New York: Abingdon-Cokesbury Press, 1953), pp. 91f.

Lucas finds fault with Macartney's interpretation of Scriptures in a few instances, but he does not generalize from these instances that Macartney was incompetent as a Biblical interpreter. Richard D. Lucas, op. cit., 162ff.

proof (although, as shown below, testimony evidence served a supplementary role). An earlier section, dealing with the sources of Macartney's sermon materials, gave an example of his heavy reliance upon Biblical materials even in a sermon on "The Kind of Leader America Needs Today."⁴⁶ In only a few of the sermons examined in the course of this study (such as those dealing with the problem of alcoholism or similar questions of a moral or ethical nature) will one find extra-Biblical factual evidence the primary basis of logical proof. From the Biblical "facts," Macartney drew his inferences--frequently by analogy or from example (as would be expected from his emphasis on Biblical biography) or inductively, from the Biblical evidence to a generalization based upon this evidence. Examples of the above-mentioned uses of Biblical material will be given later in this section.

2) Opinion evidence. Macartney, who often reminded ministers that the best preachers "quoted hardly at all" and that a suitable epitaph for many a sermon might well be "Died of quotation,"⁴⁷ nevertheless frequently employed opinion evidence to bolster his arguments. While his sermons are not burdened with lengthy quotations, frequent brief comments of opinion or personal testimony by well-known personages in literature or history and experts in particular fields both past and present are set forth:

Augustine's opinion of man's inscrutability is cited, as is Pascal's comment on man's greatness, and Milton's view on the divine image in man, as the speaker builds his argument on the worth of the

⁴⁶This Study, pp. 219f.

⁴⁷"Bending the Bow," unpublished lecture notes on preaching, p. 4, Macartney Files.

human soul suggested by Christ's question, "What if . . . he . . . gain the whole world, and lose his own soul?"⁴⁸

The opinions of Dean Farrar, Martin Luther, John Keble, and John Knox are quoted with respect to the power of or conquest of discouragement, as an incident from the life of Elijah the Prophet becomes the basis of a sermon dealing with victory over discouragement and disappointment.⁴⁹

George Bernard Shaw's opinion is quoted as an example of man's natural opposition to the doctrine of the Atonement,⁵⁰ while the historian, Harnack, is quoted at length as offering opinion evidence regarding the influence of the belief in Christ's resurrection.⁵¹

Grover Cleveland's testimony, coming out of an experience of serious illness, is cited as proof of the value of trials,⁵² and the testimony of the Russian novelist, Dostoevski, reveals the havoc and misery which addiction to gambling may bring to a life.⁵³

Occasionally, as in his series, "Sermons from Life," the comments and letters addressed to him by people seeking pastoral counsel became the basis of a form of impressive opinion or testimony evidence as he

⁴⁸The Greatest Questions of the Bible and Life (1948), pp. 32ff.

⁴⁹"Elijah," Wrestlers with God (1930), pp. 119ff.

⁵⁰"The Night of Doom," Great Nights of the Bible (1943), p. 18.

⁵¹"Jesus, the Epitaph that Ends all Epitaphs," Bible Epitaphs (1936), pp. 197ff.

⁵²"The Trial of Paul," Trials of Great Men of the Bible (New York: Abingdon-Cokesbury Press, 1946), p. 172f.

⁵³"Is the Young Man Safe?" The Greatest Questions of the Bible and Life (1948), p. 96.

sought to drive home the ideals and values which he advocated.⁵⁴

Macartney's use of fact and opinion evidence can best be demonstrated by a more detailed look at actual examples. Two such examples will be presented at this point: (1) an example of Macartney's use of fact and opinion evidence of a non-Biblical character and, (2) an example of his use of Biblical evidence.⁵⁵

The Use of Non-Biblical Evidence--An Example

A survey of Macartney's sermons in which evidence of a non-Biblical nature was the chief tool of persuasion would indicate that he took more than ordinary care in gathering his data. The fact that many of his sermons were destined for later publication undoubtedly encouraged this caution.⁵⁶

An example of the use Macartney made of such material in a sermon where Biblical evidence would be less prominent is one of a series of

⁵⁴See, e.g., Sermons From Life (1935), pp. 61, 77, 89, and 108.

⁵⁵Other examples illustrating more specifically his use of the kinds of argument appear in a later section on reasoning.

⁵⁶Macartney's former secretary wrote of fact-finding tours, personal interviews, and personal correspondence undertaken by the speaker in pursuing his factual and opinion evidence. (Letter from Mrs. Ruth Tabler, dated January 27, 1966).

An interesting exhibit is the following note addressed to William Jennings Bryan taken from the Macartney Files:

I am asking a few of our public men who are also Christians and church-goers to tell me why they do go to church. On every hand we are being told why men do not go to church. I think there is room for something on the other side. I want to read these answers at a Sunday evening service in the near future. I should greatly appreciate a word from you.

Very respectfully,
C. E. Macartney

(Written from Paterson, New Jersey, and returned to Macartney inscribed with a note from Mrs. Bryan stating that her husband was on an extended tour. The date was illegible).

three preached in 1936 entitled "Three Foes at America's Gate."⁵⁷ The sermon deals with the drink problem in America. In outline form, Macartney's evidence of fact and opinion is detailed below:

1. Evidence of fact--this is largely in the form of statistical evidence which would probably have high credibility value both from the standpoint of source and contemporaneity:
 - a. Statistics on liquor production, consumption, and cost.
 Source: American Business Men's Research Foundation,
 Chicago ("Using the official government figures.")
 Date: "Covering a period from April 1, 1933 to August 1, 1936."
 - b. Statistics on traffic fatalities in Pittsburgh.
 Source: Bureau of Traffic Planning of the Department
 of Public Safety of Pittsburgh.
 Date: Covering 1935 through September, 1936.
 - c. Experimental evidence regarding the influence of alcohol consumption on muscular reaction.
 Source: The Atlantic.
 Date: April, 1936.
2. Opinion testimony--high credibility value through proximity and prestige.
 - a. Regarding the flaws in the liquor licensing system:
 "One of the chief law enforcement officers of the county told me that one of the chief evils of the present system is the ease with which licenses can be secured and the

⁵⁷"Three Foes at America's Gate--Drink," pamphlet, sermon preached Sunday evening, November 15, 1936.

indifference to the character of the applicant." etc.⁵⁸

- b. Regarding problems in industry related to liquor consumption:

"I had an interview with the superintendent of one of the largest of our industrial plants in Pittsburgh, or in the country, . . . he told me that in his opinion . . . liquor in industry had become more of a menace than ever before. . . ."

- c. Regarding alcohol and youth problems.

"The principal of one of the largest high schools in Pittsburgh told me that drinking has now made its appearance at high school football games, where formerly it was unknown."

It would seem that in sermons where persuasibility required matters of fact and opinion, Macartney took special pains to invest these factors with the highest possible credibility value.

The use of Biblical evidence--an example.

At this point an example is given of how Dr. Macartney used Biblical evidence and the argument from Scriptural authority in a sermon which would be classified under the category of "proclamation"⁵⁹--sermons in which such facts of the gospel are presented as are understood by conservative Christians to be required to win belief in Christ as the true "savior" of "lost sinners." It will be noted that no attempt is made to defend or justify Biblical authority--the validity of such authority is

⁵⁸The source is unnamed; Macartney was relying here upon his personal proof as well.

⁵⁹See this Study, pp. 214ff., for a discussion of the three categories under which the sermons of Dr. Macartney have been subsumed.

simply assumed.

The sermon, entitled "The Fact of Facts,"⁶⁰ is an amplification of Macartney's assertion: "The first, the last, the simplest, and the most mysterious, the most awful, and the most tender--the fact of the Christian faith is that Christ died for sinners."⁶¹ In support of this assertion, the speaker appeals immediately to the authority of Scripture: "This is stated in many ways and in many places in the Scriptures. . . ." He cites his text as one of the best statements of proof: "But nowhere is there a better statement of it than in this passage, 'the Lord hath laid on Him the iniquity of us all.'"⁶² His chosen proof text, it must be noted, taken from the prophecy of Isaiah, has traditionally been accepted as Messianic in intent by conservative Christianity. Liberals, however, have seen nothing more in this than a poetic description of Isaiah as the "suffering servant."⁶³ Macartney might have strengthened his case with those present not yet convinced of the orthodox position by taking note of this fact,⁶⁴ before turning to his

⁶⁰From a sermon pamphlet. No date is given, but the cover states that the sermon was preached at First Presbyterian Church, Pittsburgh, Pennsylvania. It is reasonably certain that the largest portion of the audience comprised Christian believers. The purpose of the sermon, therefore, was not only to win the allegiance of the unbeliever and doubter to Christ, but strengthen the faith of the Christian: "These are days of unsettlement, uncertainty, and anxiety, and we are told that men must have hope and encouragement, and that the church must speak those words and give men something to which they can cling." p. 4.

⁶¹Strong, positive statements of this nature regarding the significance of Christ's crucifixion are common in the circles of Christian orthodoxy.

⁶²Isaiah 53:6.

⁶³See, e.g., The Interpreter's Bible, vol. V, (New York: Abingdon Press, 1956), pp. 621ff.

⁶⁴Hovland, Janis, and Kelley have generalized that a two-sided presentation is more effective where there is disagreement with the commentator's position. Communication and Persuasion (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1953).

two points of evidence that the passage actually refers to Christ, namely: Christ himself identified this as a reference to his death, and Philip, the evangelist, used the passage to convert the Ethiopian to Christ.

Macartney proceeds then to develop this "fact of facts" as having three-fold significance: (1) it deals with a universal need, "The iniquity of us all," (2) it satisfies this need, "Forgiveness by reconciliation," and (3) it has significance because of "The effect on our lives."

I. "The Iniquity of us all"

The speaker's observation that "sin is the universal shadow, universal as man, and eternal as human history" states a cardinal tenet of the orthodox faith, the fall and universal depravity of man. This assertion is supported by argument from Scriptural authority--his text, and an allusion to the familiar Pauline passage, "If one died for all then were all dead."⁶⁵

Macartney next reminds his hearers in an explanatory passage that the tragedy of man's fall involves more than simply the burden and misfortune of sin as an affliction, but that man is thus placed under guilt and condemnation before God. "When we say that God is holiness, we do not mean merely that God is without the transgressions, imperfections that we see in ourselves or others, but that God everywhere must be actively opposed to sin." This key concept which lays the basis for his next point, and which was presumably generally accepted and understood by members of his church, is not supported further than by the general comment, "The Bible . . . presents . . . God in action against evil."

⁶⁵1 Corinthians 5:14.

II. "Forgiveness by Reconciliation"

Macartney moves to his second major point with a structural assertion: "God's way of forgiveness was by reconciliation in Christ." To his credit, Macartney demonstrates an awareness of a problem of definition and proceeds to offer explanatory comments on this theological concept. "What does this mean? It means that the death of Christ had a reference to our own sins, and that when Christ died, in some way he was dealing with our sins before God and taking our place before God." Again he turns to Scriptural authority in support of these assertions. "The witness of Scripture to this is immense, and everywhere we come upon those passages which say to us that Christ died for the ungodly. . . ." (Biblical passages are paraphrased at this point.)

The speaker seeks next to strengthen his argument for the significance of Christ's death as a divine act of reconciliation by presenting a series of what he regards as inadequate explanations of its meaning: it was only a martyr's death, it was only an example to teach us how to live and die, it was to show the love of God, it was to move men to gratitude and repentance. Each is dismissed with a refutory comment following which he makes a summary statement, "But all these explanations fall short of the truth. They are explanations which mutilate the great fact in an effort to make it fit man's finite understanding and capacity." Scripture authority, his text, is then appealed to in a final statement of confutation: "The answer to the question, Why did Christ die? is that the Lord laid upon Him the iniquity of us all. Christ was dying in our place."

The objections of men like George Bernard Shaw to the vicarious death of Christ are dismissed with the following:

Yet over against these objections and exceptions, we must place the testimony of the Scriptures, the testimony of men like Peter and John and Paul, who were much nearer to Christ than the men today who explain away the meaning of his death.

The section closes with an explanatory passage to the effect that the efficacy of Christ's death as a substitutionary sacrifice for sins lies in the fact that "when the Lord laid on Him the iniquity of us all, . . . it was not upon another man, but upon God's Representative, and our Representative, the Eternal Son of God become Man." No proof is presented to support this concept which is generally approved of by orthodox Christians.

III. "The Effect on our Lives"

Among the results of "God's laying upon Christ our iniquities" he points to the following: it assures peace and pardon; it is a source of virtues, joys and hopes, a defense from temptation and sin, a pledge of God's final victory. Scriptural testimony or example and a hymn which paraphrases Scripture are woven into the pattern of structural assertions regarding these "effects" produced by Christ's substitutionary death.

Macartney closes his sermon with a direct appeal for action, climaxing in the language of Scripture which, in effect, not only applies but restates his original argument for the efficacy of Christ's substitutionary death:

Be ye reconciled unto God. Come to God in penitence and gratitude, believing that He has laid on Christ your sins, and say to that great Sin-bearer, "O Lamb of God, that takest away the sin of the world, take away my sin."

Macartney's audience, already largely predisposed to an acceptance of Biblical evidence as factual evidence, would presumably have been satisfied with the speaker's use of that evidence to establish what he

termed in this sermon "The fact of facts."

Reasoning.--Closely-reasoned discourse such as would employ the traditional forms of argument--argument from example, argument from analogy, cause to effect, effect to cause, and argument from sign--was not characteristic of the larger part of Macartney's Pittsburgh preaching.⁶⁶ In the main, his sermon expanded from a central idea or theme, but did not pose it as an issue; and even though speaking as an advocate of a changed attitude toward, or deepened commitment to his proposition, he was not primarily concerned with "proving" a point, as a rule, but in deepening the impact of ideas assumed to be already accepted.

This is not to say that Macartney did not at times, where the subject and occasion demanded, employ effectively the various processes of reasoning with which, as a former student and coach of debating at the University of Wisconsin,⁶⁷ he was familiar. Technically speaking, one could say that argument from analogy and from example played a prominent part in a large portion of his sermons due to his liberal use of Biblical characters and incidents to reinforce his propositions. In one type of sermon, however, Macartney did make considerable use of all the traditional kinds of argument, namely, the apologetic sermon. Here, he defended the affirmations of the Christian faith, as he said, "at the bar of reason." While these form only a small part of his published sermons, evidently he presented periodically series on the great doc-

⁶⁶While this generalization applies to Macartney's Pittsburgh preaching, the scope of this study, it would certainly not hold for the period of the early twenties when as a public defender of the orthodox faith he preached many sermons in which reasoning of this nature was an important tool of persuasion. See, e.g. Twelve Great Questions About Christ (New York: Fleming H. Revell Company, 1923).

⁶⁷This study, p. 22.

trines of the creed.⁶⁸ It should be noted that the audiences to which these sermons were addressed were also largely comprised of believers, the task of persuasion being again not so much one of changing basic beliefs but reawakening and vitalizing passive beliefs.

Illustrative examples of the reasoning processes employed by Dr. Macartney in his preaching will now be presented. It will be observed that no extensive array of examples is set forth, the intent being simply to illustrate by citing a sufficient number of examples which might be considered to be typical.

1) Argument from example. Perhaps the most common form of argument from example in the preaching of Dr. Macartney is seen in his use of the examples of Biblical characters, good and bad, to argue his case for consistent Christian living. Instances such as the following could be multiplied at length: Noah becomes "one of the greatest examples of faith recorded in the Bible,"⁶⁹ Daniel's example supports his brief for temperance,⁷⁰ and Joseph's example supports his generalizations regarding the spirit of forgiveness.⁷¹ Moses, Abraham, David, and Peter are cited in support of his generalization regarding the unexpected nature of temptation.⁷²

A sermon on the providence of God in history⁷³ makes prominent use of examples to support his thesis: the preservation of the Jewish

⁶⁸This study pp. 31, 152.

⁶⁹"The Man Who Saved the Human Race," Sermons on Old Testament Heroes (1935), p. 12.

⁷⁰"The Most Influential Man of the Old Testament," ibid, pp. 36ff.

⁷¹"The Most Christlike Man in the Old Testament," ibid., pp. 72f.

⁷²"Temptation," You Can Conquer (1954), p. 34.

⁷³"God In History," pamphlet, sermon preached March 26, 1933.

race, the history of King Cyrus of Persia, the chance circumstances involved in Columbus' discovery of America, Napoleon's defeat at Waterloo, events of the Civil War, and others.

In a sermon preached during World War II Macartney supported his assertion regarding the fall of man by examples of man's inhumanity to man: the desolated cities, the slaughter of the Jews, death camps, and the plight of the refugees.⁷⁴

2) Argument from analogy. Examples of Dr. Macartney's use of reasoning would include both literal and figurative analogy.

Arguing for the authenticity of the miracles of Jesus recorded in Scripture he contended:

To write the life of Jesus and leave out those miracles would be like writing the life of Julius Caesar or Napoleon and leaving out the account of their battles. Just as the seamless robe of Christ could not be rent at the cross by the Roman soldiers without destroying it, so the miracles, cannot be subtracted or separated from the life of Jesus as recorded in the four gospels.⁷⁵

In refuting the argument that the virgin birth of Christ is questionable because it is omitted by the Gospel writers, Mark and John, Macartney argued that to hold that these writers had never heard of, and did not believe in, the virgin birth as did Matthew and Luke

would be like saying that Dr. Randall, one of the foremost of the Lincoln biographers, whose life of Lincoln commences with Lincoln at Springfield, knew nothing of Lincoln's birth in Kentucky. . . . It would be like saying that John B. McMaster, whose well-known history of the United States commences with the year 1784, had never heard of the French and Indian War or the Revolutionary War.⁷⁶

More frequently, Macartney used figurative analogy to make his

⁷⁴"The Spires of Cologne," pamphlet, sermon preached March 25, 1945.

⁷⁵"The Miracles of Jesus," *The Faith Once Delivered* (New York: Abingdon-Cokesbury Press, 1952), p. 75.

⁷⁶"The Virgin Birth," *The Faith Once Delivered* (1953), p. 61.

points,⁷⁷ as would be expected from his liberal use of the sermon illustration. A vivid description of a painting of an abandoned ship at sea is used to impress his point of man's condition when abandoned by the Divine Spirit: "So on the sea of life is that soul from whom God has withdrawn his Holy Spirit."⁷⁸ In support of his view that the Christian church has exerted a beneficent influence Macartney employs a Scriptural analogy drawn from Ezekiel's vision of a river flowing from under the temple leaving a trail of green vegetation as it wound its way across the hot desert: "So across the desert of human history we can tell where the Church has gone by the green trees of its benediction and influences."⁷⁹

3) Causal argument. A frequently used form of argument in Macartney's apologetic sermons defending the orthodox Christian faith was the causal argument.

For example, the existence of the Christian church today is seen as an effect of an early belief in the bodily resurrection of Christ.

. . . we do say that the resurrection of Christ created the Church. The belief in it transformed a small group of grieving women and discouraged, despondent men into the moral and spiritual heroes who went forth to preach Jesus and the Resurrection and turn the world upside down.⁸⁰

The doctrine of the fall of man is supported, in Macartney's view, by "the strange persistence and perdurance of evil. It keeps

⁷⁷It must be remembered that figurative analogies are useful for illustrative value and have no probative force. See discussion comparing the significance of figurative and literal analogy for argument by McBurney, O'Neill, and Mills. James H. McBurney, James M. O'Neill, and Glen E. Mills, Argumentation and Debate (New York: The Macmillan Company, 1951), p. 107.

⁷⁸"The Holy Spirit," Things Most Surely Believed (1930), p. 146.

⁷⁹"The Holy Catholic Church," ibid., p. 159.

⁸⁰"Jesus--The Epitaph that Ends all Epitaphs," Bible Epitaphs (1936), p. 196.

coming into the world with every new generation."⁸¹ The validity of Christ's claims to Diety are seen to be supported by his influence in the world--in literature, art, music, architecture.⁸²

4) Argument from sign. On occasion Macartney employed argument from sign to support certain basic teachings of Christianity by inferring their validity from the basic nature of man: "That there is a God, a hereafter, and that God will judge, are three convictions which rise out of the moral constitution of man's nature."⁸³ He held that these beliefs had taken on the nature of universal intuition among men and that such an intuition must be regarded as proof of the validity of these Scripturally-supported doctrines.

.

Where his purposes required, Macartney then made use of all the traditional forms of argument. The use of a variety of structural forms of reasoning might also be demonstrated: the enthymeme, hypothetical syllogism, disjunctive syllogism, and a fortiori argument. At this point, however, an example is presented in detail illustrating Dr. Macartney's use of reasoned argument as it would appear in an apologetic sermon, following which attention is drawn to a process of reasoning particularly characteristic of his sermons and a significant element of persuasion in his preaching--generalization by induction.

⁸¹"The Fall of Man," The Faith Once Delivered (1953), p. 43.

⁸²"Jesus Christ, His Only Son," Things Most Surely Believed (1930), pp. 24f.

⁸³"The Last Judgment," ibid., pp. 117f.

Reasoning--An Example

In 1930 a series of sermons on the Apostle's Creed appeared in book form under the title, Things Most Surely Believed. The first sermon entitled, "God,"⁸⁴ will be used as an example of Macartney's reasoning processes in an apologetic sermon, the data being presented in outline form:

Proposition: "The conviction which a Christian believer has concerning God arises from three sources: Man, Nature, Revelation."

I.. Man

1. Argument from sign--Quoting a French thinker, "I think, therefore I am," Macartney argued analogically,

"In the same way we are justified in our faith concerning God. The idea of God is certainly in the minds of men. . . ." [therefore God exists, implying by non-reciprocal relationship that one phenomenon serves as a sign of a second].

2. Argument from sign--

"Another fact in man which witnesses to the existence of God is conscience. . . How can we account for the tragedy of remorse and conscience? The simplest and most rational explanation is that conscience is the reflection of the moral law in man's life. . . . The common-sense explanation of such a standard is that there is an author of the moral law, one to whom we are accountable--God himself."

3. Hypothetical syllogism--"If there is a God who has to do with man, then the history of man ought to show the evidence of His presence and power," (This point is then particularized.)

II. God In Nature

1. Effect to cause--"Who made the world? The world is a great effect, and common sense tells us that it must have had a sufficiently great cause."

⁸⁴"God," Things Most Surely Believed (1930), pp. 9ff.

2. Argument from example--The old story of Paley's watch is recounted: ". . . he concludes that the watch must have had a maker and a designer."
3. Refutation by argument from effect to cause--The nebular hypothesis is alluded to, "But still we must ask the question, 'Who supplied the original nebula? And who started the motion?'"
4. Argument from authority--
When so great a scientist like Pupin declares that his life-long studies and explorations in the field of science have only served to confirm his faith in . . . God . . . the Christian believer is not to be frightened out of the house of his faith. . . .

III. Revelation

1. Appeal to grouped authority--"That God has come out of the silence and darkness and spoken unto man, and that in the Scriptures we have a credible account of what was spoken, has ever been the confidence of the Christian Church."
2. Argument from Biblical authority--After quoting a Scriptural passage, "What Paul meant is that the full revelation of the mind and purpose of God came through Jesus Christ."
3. Argument from sign--
The Christian believer who has faith in Christ knows God [intuitively]. . . . In our experience we often turn that great utterance about and say, "I believe in Christ, therefore I believe in God."

Macartney's argument presumably would have been adequate for his audience, largely believers, and, also, would have accomplished his stated objective--the energizing of beliefs already subscribed to. Auditors of a skeptical turn of mind would have demanded something of a more sophisticated nature and contemporary flavor; nor would they have

been moved by arguments appealing to the authority of the Scriptures or the argument from sign of an alleged intuitive knowledge of God possessed uniquely by Christians.

Inductive Generalization.--Macartney's heavy reliance upon Biblical materials, particularly the narrative portions, leads naturally to the question, What use does he make of this material? A characteristic use is for purposes of conveying to the listener the meaning of a specific idea--a meaning which he might not have had before.

Macartney possessed a unique gift of insight for the discovery of fresh, new, unexpected relationships of ideas in Biblical materials by means of which old and familiar passages were made to sparkle with new meaning.⁸⁵ The significance of such generalizations for persuasive preaching has been explained:

We may say that in a sermon the purpose of a generalization is to cause our hearer to understand some phase of reality. On the other hand, the function of particulars is to present concrete details of that phase of reality in such a way as to cause our hearer to experience that reality for himself. . . . Generalization interprets reality, comprehends it in large masses, while particularity evokes reality by means of concrete details.⁸⁶

Macartney's use of "particulars" to convey reality through the recreation of experience in the listener is described in the next section. At this point, typical examples illustrating his faculty for conveying understanding by means of the generalization will be cited:

1) From a rather puzzling incident, the Lord's reversal of an original command refusing Balaam permission to go with the men sent to him by Balak, the following generalization, almost in the form of an

⁸⁵Davis, who referred to the power to make generalizations as "one of the most astounding faculties of the mind," cited Samuel Johnson "that the effect of a good generalization is first astonishment and then admiration;" H. Grady Davis, op. cit., pp. 243f.

⁸⁶Ibid., p. 246.

aphorism, is drawn:

In things moral and spiritual, the first intimations of the heart are right and true altogether, [followed by this elaboration:] If you are going to buy a house or a horse or a parcel of ground, it is well to spend a second night or day in thinking it over; [Balaam got the answer he wanted after asking for a night to think it over] but in matters of duty, do what the voice of the conscience always flashes upon your course. Wait for the second night, wait for the second flash, and you are lost.⁸⁷

2) From an easily-overlooked detail in the account of the death of Aaron, the high priest, he generalizes and amplifies his point:

The death of Aaron, and the bestowal of his office upon his son, shows how no man, even the greatest, is indispensable. Aaron dies, but the priesthood goes on. There is an uninterrupted tide and river of position and honor and office from age to age. At the end of every generation God empties all posts and offices, secular and sacred, of those who occupy them. He calls a new generation into being. No man is indispensable to God. No man is indispensable to the cause of truth.⁸⁸

3) From the account of the Noachian flood his generalization takes a novel turn--an expression of thanks for the "universal judgment of death":

He sweeps the earth clear of each generation of men and starts with another and a new generation. Were that not done, were men who have become corrupt and have developed in iniquity permitted to live on from age to age without death's stop and interruption, life on this planet would be intolerable. In that respect we can thank God for the universal judgment of death.⁸⁹

4) A poetic expression hidden away in the account of Samuel anointing Saul as king is picked up and given a universal application:

The sacred chronicler tells us that when Samuel met Saul and anointed him king, he met him at "the spring of the day." That beautiful phrase fits the morning of Saul's life, and the life of all others, too, who are at life's morning. Every soul has its mystic and beautiful "spring of the day," when great things are possible for the soul, when the gates of a noble destiny can be

⁸⁷Wrestlers with God (1930), p. 58.

⁸⁸Mountains and Mountain Men of the Bible (New York: Abingdon-Cokesbury Press, 1950), pp. 48f.

⁸⁹Ibid., p. 11.

glimpsed, and when decisions are made which shall influence the soul for good throughout the ages to come. Alas that so many fail to keep the innocence, enthusiasm, and hope of the "spring of the day".⁹⁰

5) Similarly, a statement of universal truth is drawn from Herod's expressions of admiration for John the Baptist:

It is an instance of how there is a goodness which lies sleeping beneath the breast of the worst of men, and how even the worst of men respect and honor moral character. Herod, a weak voluptuary, impelled by passion and incited by his paramour, is nevertheless awed by a sense of right, and trembles at the whisper of conscience.⁹¹

Examples of this nature may be drawn from almost every sermon. A "generalization" regarding Macartney's preaching at this point might well be that the fabric of his thought was a woof of particulars on a warp of clear generalizations.⁹² The attention and interest value of this old-wine-in-new-bags characteristic of his invention would be significant for persuasion.⁹³

The Dramatization of Ideas

The proverb, "Seeing is believing," has been revised to read "Sensing is believing," for "to most of us the evidence of our senses is taken as incontrovertible proof of the reality of things outside our skins."⁹⁴ Psychologists have determined that real events experienced in vivid sensory impressions act to create attitudes and influence conduct

⁹⁰Ibid., p. 107.

⁹¹Way of a Man with a Maid (1931), p. 155.

⁹²Apologies to Davis, op. cit., p. 257.

⁹³Lucas notes that Macartney's tendency to employ sweeping superlatives led him into occasional false generalizations. The examples brought forward would not suggest this to be a serious weakness in this writer's opinion. Op. cit., pp. 166f.

⁹⁴Minnick, op. cit., p. 173.

through the laws of learning known as the law of exercise and the law of effect. Likewise, by verbally reconstructing experience, a speaker may affect the beliefs and acts of his audience--almost as if the narrated experience were real. Such a dramatization of ideas is particularly crucial for the preacher who deals largely with the intangible, the spiritual, the unseen, and the abstract. Applied to preaching, according to Sleeth, "The basic principle of dramatization is to place truth in such imaginative form that people respond through several of their senses. . . . the sermon becomes a shared experience in which all are vital participants in the drama unfolding before their eyes."⁹⁵

The two rhetorical processes essential to such vicarious recreation of experience are narration and description. Important for the successful utilization of these processes is the gift of creative imagination. Broadus defines imagination as "the imaging function of the mind. It is thinking by seeing, as contrasted with reasoning."⁹⁶

In this section, Macartney's employment of narration and description is examined, noting particularly those specific elements of persuasion discernible in his treatment of these materials.

Narration

The term is used here, as by Sarett, Foster and Sarett,⁹⁷ to range from the simplest form, through the incident and anecdote to the more complex short story. (In homiletics, "illustration" has become the

⁹⁵Ronald E. Sleeth, Persuasive Preaching (New York: Harper and Row, publishers, 1956), pp. 66f.

⁹⁶John A. Broadus, On the Preparation and Delivery of Sermons (rev. ed., New York: Harper and Brothers, 1944), p. 279.

⁹⁷Sarett, Foster, and Sarett, op. cit., p. 259.

omnibus term.)

In this study of the narrative form, or sermon illustration in Macartney's preaching, it is not the plan to present a sampling of the wide variety of sermon illustrations employed by him for the intensifying and clarifying of experience. (The reader is referred to Macartney's Illustrations, in which over 1500 classified stories, anecdotes, and quotes appear, selected from his sermons and drawn originally from his wide reading, his extensive travels, his pastoral experience, and from his own imagination.) Rather, examples are given to illustrate methods, or techniques unique with, or particularly characteristic of, Macartney's use of the narrative form:

The attention-arresting allusion.--Macartney frequently introduced a point with a brief allusion of a nature to arrest the attention as well as to dramatize and clarify the idea:

The new-born Hercules found serpents in his cradle for him to strangle. That is a picture of life. Temptation is common to man. It is as characteristic of man as thought, or ambition, or love. The untempted man would be a curiosity.⁹⁸

One has written of Beethoven that he had the capacity for realizing the fundamental character of life in its two aspects of suffering and achievement. Suffering and achievement--those two aspects stand out in the life of Christ. . . .⁹⁹

Explosions beneath the surface of a lake or river bring to the surface dead bodies and hidden objects. So in the breast of man great convulsions of grief, pain, fear, and remorse hurl hidden things to the surface, and the beholder stands aghast at what he has seen or heard. Then the question of sincerity sinks out of sight, and the truth, whether it be glorious or terrible, reveals itself.¹⁰⁰

⁹⁸Sermons from Life (1933), p. 26.

⁹⁹Ibid., p. 62.

¹⁰⁰Ibid., p. 222.

The Kaleidoscopic series.--A characteristic rhetorical device by means of which he focused attention on a generalization was a swift-moving panorama of Biblical people, events, or scenes leading to his point or proceeding from it to amplify the idea. A sermon on Gideon included the following string of Biblical cameos:

God's chosen men come upon the stage of history in different ways and in different places: Moses at the burning bush in the desert; Samuel as a little child in his bed in the holy house at Shiloh; David on a battlefield, when he slew the giant; Elijah in the court of Ahab, with the thunder of judgment on his lips; Isaiah confessing his sins in the temple; Peter in a fishing boat on the Sea of Galilee; Paul in a vision that blinded him at the Gate of Damascus. But Gideon comes on the stage of divine history with a question on his lips.¹⁰¹

In an imaginary setting, Macartney fancies himself in heaven listening to a sermon by Peter; and he asks the question, What was the theme of his discourse? A series of rhetorical questions leading to the answer covers all the leading incidents of Peter's recorded career:

. . . Was it the story of that scene in the desert place at Caesarea Philippi, when Peter confessed that Jesus was the Christ the Son of God, and Christ said that upon that truth he would build his church, and the gates of hell could not prevail against it? Was it the story of that stormy night on Galilee when Peter tried to walk on the sea? Was it the story of the night on the mountain when Jesus was transfigured before them and they saw Moses and Elijah talking with him? Was it the story of that wonderful morning by the Sea of Galilee when they saw Jesus on the shore, and Peter leaped into the sea and swam to where he was, and heard his threefold question, "Lovest thou me?" Was it the story of the Day of the Ascension on Olivet's Mount when the cloud received him out of their sight? [the series continues through several more scenes.] No! It was not of these great hours and great scenes that I heard Peter now discoursing to that multitude by the city's western wall. It was the story of that night when he denied his Lord.¹⁰²

A variant of this technique further demonstrating Macartney's methods of creating interest or building the listener's attention is to

¹⁰¹Mountains and Mountain Men of the Bible (1950), p. 92.

¹⁰²"Peter the Man who was Saved by a Look," The Greatest Men of the Bible (New York: Abingdon-Cokesbury Press, 1941), pp. 72f.

lead to the point through a series of incidents in chain-reaction fashion:

1. "The first church building in all western Pennsylvania was the church the Moravians built in 1771 on the Beaver River [of local historical interest]. . . ."

This leads to:

2. "The Moravians were founded by Count Zinzendorf who was converted in an art gallery in Dusseldorf by contemplating a painting of Christ on the cross. . . ."

Which leads to:

3. "This painting was painted by an artist three hundred years before. [an account follows of how the artist came to paint it three times, changing it twice because of a little girl's mis-identification of the figure portrayed]."

Then comes the climax of a chain-reaction triggered by his noting a church on the Beaver River:

4. "When it was finished he called the girl in a third time and asked her who it was. Looking at the portrait, the girl knelt down and exclaimed, 'It is the Lord!' That alone makes the coming of Christ of meaning to the world: not that a good man came, not that a wise teacher came, not that a great sufferer came, but that God came, Immanuel, God with us."¹⁰³

Special uses of the personal experience.--The effectiveness of the personal experience in preaching is at least partly due to the fact that the sermon, the preacher, and the congregation are all tied together in a joint enterprise.

A unique use of the pastoral experience was Macartney's occasional series, "Sermons from Life." Pastoral incidents, after a sufficient lapse of time, formed the basis for the central idea in these sermons. A sermon in which the theme of "moral retribution for sin" predominates,¹⁰⁴ is introduced as follows:

¹⁰³"Christ Came, God Over All," sermon preached December 21, 1941, First Church Life, December, 1942, pp. 1-5.

¹⁰⁴Sermons from Life (1933), pp. 35ff.

He sat before me, a young man in the early twenties. But I needed to look at him only for a moment, to see that he was scarred with the marking of sin. A few inquiries sufficed to open up the way for him to tell me his story.

A period of silence following the young man's recital is broken finally by his exclamation, "If I had only known then what I know now." These words, like a refrain, recur thematically throughout the sermon. The transition from the introduction to the first division displays the theme like a banner over the heads of a procession of the despairing:

. . . as I sat there in the silence I saw a long procession recruited from all ages and all ranks and walks of life, yes, even from the grave. Youth marched side by side with the octogenarian; the child of wealth and fortune, side by side with the man brought up on the streets; the college man and the coal heaver, the clerk and the banker, the professional man and the laborer, the chorus girl and the housemaid; the society woman and the char-woman. They marched in perfect step and rhythm; yet the music they chanted was the sad harmony of hopelessness and the dirge of despair, and over their heads floated a banner with this device--"If I had only known then what I know now."

This vivid scene is followed by a division labeled "The Way of the Transgressor is Hard," which in turn reaches a climax by returning to the cry of the young man:

The cry of this young man, "If I had only known then what I know now," meant simply this: "If I had only known then what I know now"--the recoil of the broken law; if I had only known then how the dark spirits of shame and guilt and remorse and despair track the man who has sinned; had I only known then what it would mean to have a heavy heart at the dawning of the morning when all the world was rejoicing, a sad heart at noon, and a restless heart when night came with its ministers of peace and quiet and holy calm and blessed sleep, and bade all the world but me be still; if I had only known then what it would mean to look back over the past years, and behold one after another the golden opportunities that I had scorned fade on the horizon of my life; had I only known then what it would mean to see the angels of hope and joy that I had sinned against departing from me, their backs turned against me, and I, uselessly imploring them to return; if I had only known then what it would mean, not only to regret the past, but to face the future without a hope--If I had known! Now he knew it, knew it in all its bitter reality.¹⁰⁵

¹⁰⁵Sermons from Life (1933), pp. 35ff.

Thus, the speaker has dramatized an idea with the intent that it should march into the lives of his hearers not as an abstract theory but in real life, as incidents and emotions are relived and vicariously experienced.

The use of the familiar and the proximate.--We like the familiar--it is our world; it holds our interests. Macartney used this technique of the persuader very effectively.

The common experience of rooting up a shrub or small tree is capitalized on as follows:

If you have ever tried to dig up a bush or a small tree, you have discovered that there is one particular tap root which anchors the tree in the earth. You may cut all the other roots, but until you cut that one root, you cannot get the tree out. But if you cut that one root, it is easy to cut the others and remove the tree. So does the besetting sin hold a man to this world.¹⁰⁶

The very common experience of stepping through a rotten fallen tree is also utilized: "On an autumn day, walking through the woods, you have set your foot upon the trunk of a fallen tree, and the moment your weight came upon the bark it gave way, and your foot crashed through to the rotten heart of the tree." Thus he seeks to make clear one of his main ideas: "How men fall slowly, and how moral deterioration may proceed without being observed by the man who is its victim, or by those who know him best."¹⁰⁷

An attention-arresting technique employed on occasion was reference to the immediate speech situation--in this case to a portion of the church architecture:

¹⁰⁶The Greatest Texts of the Bible (1944), p. 165.

¹⁰⁷"Your Unknown Self," cited in Blackwood, Preaching in Time of Reconstruction, p. 41.

Tribulation made these Corinthian columns. The mighty monarch of the forest in Wisconsin or Georgia felt the fierce blows of the ax, until at length it fell with a vast sigh to the earth, leaving a lonely place against the sky. Tribulation cast it into the river and floated it to the sawmills; tribulation sawed it and cut it and shaped it and hammered it. But there it now stands, recalling the Olympian Zeus and holding the dome over our heads as we worship the invisible God.¹⁰⁸

Oh, if the history of this, or any church like it, where the gospel has been preached, could be written! What if the stones should cry out of the wall and the beam out of the timber should answer them, what a story they would tell of those whose conscience was stirred.
 . . .¹⁰⁹

Imaginary speech.--Macartney's live imaginative powers lent themselves to several effective ways of achieving dramatic impact:

1) The hypothetical illustration. As an example, he follows in imagination the career of a young man who leaves the quiet country home to take work in the city. The gradual compromise of his principles to escape the torments of his loneliness is depicted in vivid scenes until, "One night he again goes out with his questionable friends, and that night he is slain--not his body, but his soul."¹¹⁰

2) The apostrophe. The parents of the above-mentioned hypothetical lad are addressed:

But, mother and father, as you go about your daily task and wait for the letters which have become less and less frequent, I would not shatter your dream. You look forward to the day when your son . . . will come back . . . But, Mother, your son will never come back again. . . .¹¹¹

In his rather frequent use of the apostrophe, Macartney addressed beings both terrestrial and celestial: angels in heaven, the corpses of

¹⁰⁸"It takes Tribulation to Make a Man," Sermons from Life (1933), p. 169.

¹⁰⁹"Felix," Bible Epitaphs, p. 151.

¹¹⁰"Loneliness," You Can Conquer (1954), pp. 48ff.

¹¹¹Ibid., pp. 50f.

the unidentified bodies he had seen in a morgue,¹¹² Biblical characters such as Joseph, who is invited to preach: ". . . I yield the pulpit now to Joseph. Come, Joseph; come up the pulpit stairs, in that coat of many colors, and preach to us on the beauty of forgiveness!"¹¹³

3) The imaginary visitor. At times Macartney imagined a sudden visitor breaking in upon his preaching:

But who is this shining one who has appeared suddenly before me?
"Art thou one of the patriarchs? or one of the prophets? or one of the apostles?"

"I am the Angel of Destiny."

"What are those books in thy hands?"

The dialogue continues at length, leading into the conclusion: "Now I can finish the question which I was asking when the Angel of Destiny appeared and interrupted me. . . ." ¹¹⁴

4) The imaginary dialogue with members of the audience.

Perhaps a man rises now and says, "Wait; I see yonder a man who cheated another in a business deal. I see yonder another who sings the hymns heartily, but who neglects his wife and his family. I see yonder another who takes up an evil tale against his neighbor . . . And over there I see a profane swearer; and over yonder one who has betrayed innocence. When you say, 'All we like sheep have gone astray,' when you speak of the 'iniquity of us all,' I suppose it is persons like that you mean." No; that is not what I mean, I mean all of us. "All we like sheep have gone astray."¹¹⁵

5) Futuristic imagination. Macartney's flights of fancy sometimes transported him into the great hereafter: "Once on the wings of

¹¹²Sermons from Life, pp. 57f.

¹¹³"The Trial of Joseph," Trials of Great Men of the Bible (New York: Abingdon-Cokesbury Press, 1946), p. 53.

¹¹⁴"The Last Judgment." The Faith Once Delivered, pp. 149ff. On one occasion, so realistic was his reference to an imaginary company of people healed by Jesus, whom he invited forward to be questioned, that several people came forward to take seats near the front. Preaching Without Notes, p. 152.

¹¹⁵"Isaiah--Who saw Christ's Glory," The Greatest Men of the Bible, p. 122.

imagination I entered the Holy City, the New Jerusalem, come down from God out of Heaven. . . ." He imagines the sights and songs of the Holy City. Then his attention is drawn to one special singer:

"Tell me," I said, to one of the glorious Beings who stood about me, "Who is that singer? Why are all the other harpers silent? Why are all the angels and archangels, cherubim and seraphim, and all the company of the blood-washed Redeemed now voiceless?" "Mortal," he said, "they are silent and voiceless because they are listening to David. . . the greatest sinner and the greatest saint."¹¹⁶

Biblical drama.--Macartney's flair for the dramatic made him ever alert to possibilities for dramaturgy in the Biblical incident or narrative. His earlier reluctance to preach on the women of the Bible was explained: "It did not seem at first that the narrative of the women of the Bible had enough of the personal and dramatic element in them to make them the subjects of successful and popular sermons."¹¹⁷ His penchant for the dramatic is illustrated by his listing of the "ten most dramatic scenes in the Bible," in the introduction of a sermon which was to deal with one of these scenes.¹¹⁸

Macartney was adept at seizing upon the dramatic impact of the suspense, conflict, and contrast (also important attention and interest factors) inherent in such Biblical narratives as: Abraham's offering up of Isaac on Mount Moriah, Elijah's contest with the prophets of Baal on Mount Carmel, the death of blind Samson in the temple of the Philistines, Abigail and Nabal illustrating the "beauty and the beast," and many others.

¹¹⁶"The Greatest Sinner and the Greatest Saint," Sermons on Old Testament Heroes (1935), pp. 245f.

¹¹⁷Great Women of the Bible (1942), p. 5.

¹¹⁸"Mount Carmel and Elijah," Mountains and Mountain Men of the Bible (1950), p. 117.

(Macartney's techniques for the heightening of dramatic effect in Scriptural narrative--as by the imaginative filling in of details--are illustrated in his lecture notes on the subject by examples taken from his actual practice and cited in chapter V;¹¹⁹ therefore it is not deemed necessary to multiply illustrations at this point.)

The narrative sermon.--This sermon form, of which the address based on a Biblical character is most common, comprises well over half of Macartney's published sermons. These sermons represent a form of persuasion by suggestion in which principles, values, and ideals are advocated and vitalized through the indirect appeal of the characters of the narrative. Macartney was aware of the principle involved:

It is not possible to preach on the great men of the Bible without speaking practical and timely truths to the people, and in a way that everyone will understand. The great advantage of such preaching is that you summon these men themselves into the pulpit and permit them to preach for you. Abraham preaches on Faith; Elijah on Righteousness; Samuel on Judgment to come; David on Temptation; and Peter on Repentance. Every chord in the great harp of the Gospel is struck by the preacher who preaches on the great men of the Bible.¹²⁰

At times, Macartney's plan was simply to relate the Biblical narrative, with sufficient imaginative detail to make it come alive, followed by an application stemming from three or four major points of the story.¹²¹

More frequently, the practice was to make the applications as he proceeded through the narrative. (The implication of this approach for

¹¹⁹This study, pp. 167ff.

¹²⁰The Greatest Men of the Bible (1941), p. 6. Macartney said, "There is no earthly and mortal experience or reality which cannot be illustrated in the men and women of the Bible. The Greatest Words in the Bible and in Human Speech (1938), p. 130.

¹²¹E.g., the sermon "The Kind of Leader America Needs Today," discussed in this Study, pp. 219ff.

unity and coherence is discussed in a following section on Macartney's sermon arrangement.)

A study of Macartney's biographical method has been made by Nelson,¹²² who has noted the following general characteristics:

1) A live re-creation of the historical setting is achieved by careful attention to details, imaginatively presented. Some speculative material is introduced, but the mood is not violated.

2) A psychological analysis of Biblical characters, often probing deeply into possible hidden motives, takes note of the dominant moods and emotions experienced by the actors.

3) The application of lessons drawn from the narrative is normally of an indirect nature: "The story is so simply and lucidly told that there would be very little difficulty on the part of anyone to apply the lessons and illustrations to himself."¹²³ Applications of a more direct nature are usually made near the conclusion.

4) The lessons drawn are not in broad, general terms, but are made specific by the lives of the characters depicted. The motivation is in the direction of ideals, values, and principles, however, rather than specific action required of the listener.

Description

Macartney said on one occasion, "When I get through preaching the Bible I would like to paint it."¹²⁴ His pictorial powers had been

¹²²Arnold L. Nelson, "The Biographical Method in the Preaching of Alexander Whyte and Clarence E. Macartney " (unpublished Bachelor's thesis, The Biblical Seminary, New York, April, 1955).

¹²³Ibid., p. 74.

¹²⁴Great Nights of the Bible (1943), p. 45.

enlarged by travel and a careful study of history, geography, archaeology, oriental customs, and local color. Bringing his imagination to bear on the Biblical passage, he entered into minute detail, at times, to fill out the picture--highways, the sky, groves of trees, sand dunes, houses, tents, rivers, buildings, mountains, facial expressions, tones of voice, posture, color of hair and eyes, aromas, and sounds were verbally recreated.

Obviously, narration and description blend in Macartney's sermons. Representative examples of description employed for purposes of the visual recreation of (1) the physical setting and (2) the emotional mood and climate of the setting are now presented:

The physical setting.--The setting on the night of the slaying of the first-born in Egypt is re-created with vivid imagery word-concepts:¹²⁵

Over all Egypt it is night. The April moon sheds its golden light over all the land. Against the clear sky rises the mighty Pyramid of Cheops, and in front of that pyramid the Sphinx stares out over the white moonlit desert with stony, mysterious, inscrutable gaze. By the banks of the winding Nile and the numerous canals, tall palm trees wave their branches in the soft evening air. Along the river a thousand villages are asleep. In his marble palace, flanked by prophyry columns wound with sculptured serpents and crowned with fierce eagles whose eyes flash with precious stones, Egypt's Pharaoh slumbers. In the temples of Isis and Osiris the fire has sunk on the altars and the priests and their attendants are asleep. In the huts and cottages of the peasants the sons of toil are deep in sleep, sore Labor's bath. In the dungeon the captive has forgotten the galling of his chains as sleep, balm of hurt minds, knits up his raveled sleeve of care. All Egypt is asleep.¹²⁶

The setting in an oriental king's palace introduces sensory material of a visual, auditory, and olfactory nature:

¹²⁵By "word-concept" is meant here the identification by symbols of an actuality held in the consciousness of an individual.

¹²⁶"The Night of Doom," Great Nights of the Bible (1945), pp. 9f.

Midday, in the palace of the king of Persia at Shushan, where the yellow Ulaï winds about the walls of the palace. Within the palace Artaxerxes, the long-handed despot of the world, with his queen at his side, is seated at the banqueting table, attended by obsequious slaves and hundreds of his nobles and satraps. The hall is worthy of the empire. White, blue, and green curtains drape the walls, caught with purple cords to silver rings fixed in pillars of marble. The pavement is of red, blue, white, and black marble, and the couches of gold. Clouds of incense go up, and the strains of music float through the halls.¹²⁷

Note the careful detail with vivid sensory material in the following brief description of the boat carrying Jesus and the disciples moments before a great storm breaks upon them:

It is a perfect night; the stars are shining, and the soft wind is filling out the sail. Jesus is calmly sleeping, his respiration in rhythm with the pulsation of the sea. There is no sound save the low voices of the apostles and the gentle slap of the water against the bow of the ship as it plows through the sea. Someone has thrown a mantle over Christ, and not far from him, I am sure, sits John, his beloved disciple.¹²⁸

In the following attention-arresting action description, he employs imagery word-concepts appealing to the visual, auditory, motor, and tactile "doors to the mind":

The words of doom were heard in awe and silence by Belshazzar and his lords. Then, suddenly, there was the loud blast of a trumpet, the sharp words of military command, and the rush of the feet of armed men as the soldiers of Darius, the general of Cyrus, charged up the grand stairway and burst into the banqueting hall. Swords flashed under the candelabras; groans, shouts, curses, pleas for mercy rang through the hall; and soon a thousand nobles and their women lay dead in the slush of mingled wine and blood, and among them lay Belshazzar.¹²⁹

Note the kinesthetic-sense appeal of the first few lines below:

¹²⁷"Nehemiah, the Bravest Man in the Old Testament," Sermons on Old Testament Heroes (1935), p. 221.

¹²⁸"The Night of the Tempest," Great Nights of the Bible (1943), p. 124.

¹²⁹"The Night of Dissipation," Great Nights of the Bible (1943), p. 31.

Having uttered his prayer, Samson bows himself with all his might. The veins on his massive brow are distended; the muscles in his arms and legs, and across his back stand out like cables. Desperately Samson heaves at the pillars. There is a slight movement in the floor of the galleries, and the shouting, drinking, laughing mob of the Philistines look at one another in consternation. What is happening? Is it an earthquake? or are we drunk? What happened they were never to learn, for, the next moment, the pillars which upheld it lifted from under it by the mighty arms of Samson, the whole temple came crashing down in ruin, and under the cloud of yellow dust which rose toward heaven the three thousand Philistines lay buried, and among them Samson.¹³⁰

Descriptive recreation of the emotional setting.-- The material here, as with the foregoing, is so abundant that it is difficult to be selective.

Macartney imagines the emotions that may have stirred Jacob in the years following his son, Joseph's disappearance:

Neither had Jacob forgotten Joseph. Often, we are sure, he thought much about him. I wonder if he ever asked himself, "Did my sons deceive me? Can it be possible that Joseph still lives?" On a day when his sons and their families are afar off with the flocks, Jacob opens an old black chest, and taking from it a faded garment, lays it across his knees. It is the coat of many colors, with the rents and the stain of the blood still there. Tears are in the eyes of the old man, and if any had been at hand, they might have heard him exclaim, "Joseph! Rachel!"¹³¹

He imagines a possible conflict of thoughts and emotions within the woman who was subsequently healed by touching the hem of Christ's garment:

Now watch this woman against the wall, as she lifts her head and looks eagerly in the direction of Jesus. She is talking to herself, and this is what she is saying: "If I do but touch his garment, I shall be made whole. And yet, do I dare to try it? How can I get through this great crowd, when I am so weak and frail, and hardly able to stand? If the rulers see me, will they let me approach him? After all, I am only an outcast; but so were the

¹³⁰"Samson and Delilah," The Way of a Man with a Maid (1931), p. 111.

¹³¹"The Most Christlike Man in the Old Testament," Sermons on Old Testament Heroes (1935), p. 71.

lepers; they were unclean too, and yet I hear that he healed them. He is on his way also, to the house of a rich man: Perhaps he will not care to heal a poor woman like me, for I have spent all I had on the physicians, and have nothing with which to pay him. And yet I have heard that he takes pity on the poor." Thus alternate waves of hope and despair rolled over the soul of this woman.¹³²

Thus, Macartney made concrete the abstract ideas and theories of religion through the use of word imagery which presumably would find vicarious response in the auditor's experience.

Motive Appeals

In spite of himself, man is a creature of wants, needs, drives, motives, and emotions; and since these physiologically and psychologically based forces are elemental in determining his behavior, they must be recognized and allowed for in the persuasive attempts of the effective speaker. Brigrance reminds us, "Persuasion is more effective, other things being equal, when related to people's wants,"¹³³ to which Brembeck and Howell would add, "The dominant basis of human belief and action is desire as expressed through an elaborate and often subconscious system of motives."¹³⁴

The expression, "motive appeals," frequently used in the speech texts, is clarified by Monroe as follows:

We shall call the basic forces that motivate human conduct and belief primary motives, and, because these primary motives are so often combined in complex patterns and concealed from external observation, we shall call by the term motive appeals the appeal to all the specific sentiments, emotions, and desires by which the speaker may set the primary motives into action.¹³⁵

¹³²"The Woman Who Touched Him," Great Women of the Bible (1942), pp. 190f.

¹³³Brigrance, Speech, p. 95.

¹³⁴Brembeck and Howell, op. cit., p. 23.

¹³⁵Alan H. Monroe, Principles and Types of Speech (4th ed.; Chicago: Scott, Foresman and Company, 1955), p. 194.

Motive appeals, then, include all those materials and means which are calculated to put the hearer into a frame of mind favorable to the speaker's purpose.

As stated earlier, Macartney's over-all speech purposes were to persuade people to embrace the conservative Christian faith, and to deepen the commitment of believers to the Christian way of life and belief. (The invitation to join First Church was always only by implication.) In a study of motive appeals employed by our speaker for the accomplishment of these purposes several things must be kept in mind. In the first place, the orthodox preacher is very likely to advocate the sublimation of the listener's immediate goals, ambitions, drives, and desires, to what the speaker regards as transcending values and aims; or again, he may advocate a postponement of their realization to the Christian's "hereafter."

These observations are borne out in Macartney's "motivational" approach, which, as can be seen from the following, had about it a quality of hardness, austerity, and challenge:

No one ought to embrace the Christian life--indeed, he never sincerely does so--for the sake of profit and comfort in this world. That would be a base, utilitarian motive. Christianity has spread and conquered because of its very disdain for suffering and for hardship on this life. It has fixed its eye on another world, upon the city which hath foundations, whose builder and whose maker is God.¹³⁶

The speaker's task, as can be seen from this and the following comment, was to direct the impulse of primitive aims to those he regarded as ethically superior, such as the development of Christian character or the achievement of the heavenly goal:

We are not here to make money, to find an easy berth, to be decorated with honors and to drift down placid streams between flowering banks.

¹³⁶"Does It Pay to Be Good?" More Sermons from Life (Nashville, Tennessee: Cokesbury Press, 1939), p. 181.

We are here for just one purpose--to make souls out of ourselves, to win our souls, to grow in likeness to our God.¹³⁷

The promotion of an idealism of this nature is a difficult one with people being as they are. It is made somewhat easier for Macartney, however, by the fact that this appeal would be congruent with the central attitudes of the majority of his hearers. (Brembeck and Howell, who have noted the drive power of attitudes, remind us that people of like attitudes tend to congregate together, with many organizations existing solely for the perpetuation and promotion of certain prescribed attitudes.¹³⁸) It is as if his church congregation, which existed as an organization to promote the high idealism of Christianity, were challenging him to inspire them to renounce the strong competing bid of lesser goals for the higher and often future goals of the Christian faith.

This is not to say, however, that Macartney did not make an intelligent and apparently planned appeal to those motives and desires which prompt men as they are in the "here and now."

A survey of Macartney's motive appeals may be made by considering first those appeals which he based upon the superiority of the Christian faith and life, followed then by other miscellaneous forms of appeal.

As Based on the Superiority of the Christian Way

The foundation upon which a good share of Macartney's appeals was based was his belief in the superiority of the Christian religion:

There is nothing to compare with the grandeur and beauty of the Christian faith. . . . it speaks of a divine origin, it unfolds the path of duty from day to day; it comforts amid the sorrows of life and shows a divine purpose in our trials and adversities. It

¹³⁷"It Takes Tribulation to Make a Man," Sermons from Life (1933), p. 179.

¹³⁸Brembeck and Howell, op. cit., pp. 98ff.

strengthens us in our temptations, and in the hour of death it whispers to our soul the words of immortal hope and eternal life.¹³⁹

He does not hesitate to suggest that the acceptance of this way of life may also yield temporal values. A sermon entitled, "Does It Pay to be Good?" proposes temporal gains suggestive of Philip's traditional "impelling motives" of power, property, and reputation:

. . . As a general rule it has always been true . . . that the godly man fares better than the ungodly, even in this world. [He lists Christian virtues which he regards as assets for character recommendation]. The banks, the offices, professors, the pulpits, the administrative offices are not looking for drunkards, rakes, or thieves.¹⁴⁰

Macartney cites Babson to the effect that "All there is in the world today that is worthwhile" comes from men actuated by Christian principles.¹⁴¹

He appealed to the desire for happiness in recommending the Christian life as the superior life: "Wherever a man is, and whatever he is doing, his life has more satisfaction and more joy in it if he is a true and sincere Christian man."¹⁴²

The motive of self-esteem is appealed to in his concept of the worth of man inherent in the Christian faith. "God who created you has high things in store for you," Macartney told his congregation.¹⁴³ Man's place in God's plan is then particularized:

¹³⁹"Abner," Bible Epitaphs, p. 16.

¹⁴⁰"Does it Pay to be Good?" More Sermons from Life (1939), p. 182.

¹⁴¹Roger Babson, "Fundamentals of Prosperity," cited in More Sermons from Life (1939), p. 182.

¹⁴²"Does it Pay to be Good?" ibid., p. 184.

¹⁴³"The Woman Whose Beauty Saved a Race," Great Women of the Bible (1942), pp. 41ff.

God not only has a place for you in the working out of his great plan, but he has a particular plan in your life and particular work for you to do. . . . Rise then to the greatness of life!¹⁴⁴

Macartney recommended the Christian life, not only for its temporal benefits but especially because of its assurance of immortality. He declared, "But godliness has the promise and assurance of the life which is to come, a life of glory, of beauty, and of peace."¹⁴⁵

Such elemental drives as self-preservation, security, and safety, are suggested by his appeals to accept the "eternal salvation" offered by the gospel:

Is the scarlet thread of the Cross, of Christ's blood, over your soul? . . . Is the cord there today? Are you trusting in the Cross? One day the trumpets of judgment will sound, as they sounded of old over ancient and doomed Jericho. But where the scarlet cord waves, there is (sic) safety and refuge.¹⁴⁶

The possibilities for self-realization in the eternal world are suggested in the following:

And what it means to be saved, what it means for a man made in the image of God to be restored to the divine likeness, what it means to unfold and expand all the powers of your soul, it will take the measureless love of God, the priceless blood of Christ, the endless years of eternity, and all the music of all the angels of heaven to describe and tell.¹⁴⁷ [emphasis supplied]

Miscellaneous Grounds of Appeal

Aside from those appeals based on Macartney's concept of the superior aspects of the Christian faith, other types of motive appeal are discernable such as: (1) love and loyalty to Christ, (2) emulation,

¹⁴⁴Ibid., p. 41.

¹⁴⁵"Does it Pay to be Good?" More Sermons from Life (1939), p. 187.

¹⁴⁶"The Woman Who was Better than Her Job," Great Women of the Bible, pp. 58f.

¹⁴⁷"I am not Ashamed," The Greatest Texts of the Bible, p. 21.

(3) conservatism, (4) social approval, (5) fear, and (6) sentiments.

Love and loyalty to Christ.--A frequent emotional appeal appearing especially in the latter portions of a sermon consists of an appeal to the Christian's sense of loyalty and devotion to Christ, often on the basis of his suffering for man and His love revealed to mankind:

Jacob endured the heat of the day and the cool of the night through all those seven years for the love which he had to Rachel. But your Eternal Lover endured the pain and despised the shame on the cursed Tree for you.¹⁴⁸

Sometimes the appeal is grounded on God's love for man rather than man's obligation to God:

I leave with you the message of Christ: God's timeless, fadeless, patient, yearning love for you and interest in you. . . . I pray that the Father's heart may be made glad because one of his children whom he loves so faithfully and tenderly has turned from the fickle, illusory, deceptive, cruel love of this world to the love of God.¹⁴⁹

Emulation.--A frequent motive appeal used especially in the sermons on Bible characters is emulation--the principles illustrated in good lives are held up as ideals to aspire to. Abraham's perseverance is brought forward:

You will find many all around you who have turned back, and a great many others who might be described as "halfwayers." But these are not the ones whom you ought to take for your guides. Be led and inspired, rather, by those who started and who have arrived at their goal; those who said, "This one thing I do". . . .¹⁵⁰

Conservatism.--Macartney utilized effectively the tendency in people toward conservatism, the maintenance of the status quo, and preference for the old and the established:

¹⁴⁸"The Woman Who Married the Right Man," Great Women of the Bible, p. 150. See the next section dealing with sermon arrangement for other examples.

¹⁴⁹"I Beg to Remain in Sorrow, His Mother," Sermons from Life, pp. 144f.

¹⁵⁰"Abraham--A Pioneer's Epitaph," Bible Epitaphs, p. 164.

We talk constantly of new things today--New Deals, New Theology, and new standards. But what we need most of all is some of those old things which have been tried and tested through the ages--the old virtue of thrift, of honesty, of honor in office, of faith in God.¹⁵¹

Desire for social approval.--"Men may pretend to laugh and sneer at one who has standards, convictions, and holds to them. But in their heart of hearts they respect such a man."¹⁵²

Fear.--A form of "godly fear" based on the brevity of life, man's probationary time, or the withdrawal of heaven-sent appeals was frequently employed:

There is time enough for all that is great and good, but you never know that there will be a next time.¹⁵³

God makes that plain, unspeakably solemn truth though it is, that his Spirit which calls us to him and which gives us all our day and opportunity, will not always strive with man.¹⁵⁴

Eighty years from tonight, at the utmost, every one in this congregation will be in eternity. Within fifty years most of you will be there. Within twenty-five years many of you. Within ten years not a few. Within one year certainly some of you. Therefore, I hold up before you Jesus Christ and Him crucified.¹⁵⁵

Sentiments.--Macartney frequently turned to the motive appeals involved in sentimental attachments--a mother's prayers, the love of a child, memories of childhood, etc.:

Think of your mother's prayers on your behalf. May these recollections strengthen and comfort and establish many a soul this day

¹⁵¹"The Kind of Leader America Needs Today," op. cit., p. 11.

¹⁵²"The Night with Wild Beasts," Great Nights of the Bible, p. 42.

¹⁵³"There was no Next Time," More Sermons from Life, p. 28.

¹⁵⁴"The Greatest Shipwreck in the Old Testament," Sermons on Old Testament Heroes, p. 127.

¹⁵⁵"Isaiah--Who saw Christ's Glory," The Greatest Men of the Bible, p. 125.

and draw all of us nearer to God.¹⁵⁶

If you knew how near God comes to you in his providences . . .
in that mother who loved you and cared for you, in that little child
through whose eyes streamed the light of heaven, in that woman who
loved you and cared for you. . . .¹⁵⁷

Sometimes the appeal was to the memory of the dead--loved ones
and saints of the Bible who were represented as looking on from heaven:
"They watch; they know; they care; they still love. Think of them!
Imitate their faith! Be true to Christ as they were! Seek to stand
where they stand!"¹⁵⁸

Summary--Persuasive Development of Ideas

Macartney's sermon content has been examined from the standpoint
of the themes and emphases, the sources of his materials, the develop-
ment of the idea, the dramatizing of the idea, and motive appeals.

With respect to the three categories, "proclamation," "teaching,"
and "therapy," the majority of Macartney's published sermons were found
to fall in the third category, with a fair representation of "teaching"
sermons as defined in this study, and fewer as pure "proclamation,"
although there is an overlapping of these three functional forms in many
of the published discourses.

The chief source of Macartney's inventional material in preaching
was the Bible, with a heavy reliance on Biblical material noticeable not
only for sermon themes but for illustrative purposes. Other important
sources called upon were: English and American literature, history,

¹⁵⁶"If it had not Been for My Mother's Bible," More Sermons from Life, p. 153.

¹⁵⁷"With a Much-Married Woman," Great Interviews of Jesus, p. 30.

¹⁵⁸"Our Friends on the Other Side," More Sermons from Life, p. 200.

biography, art, hymnology, philosophy, sermons of other preachers, and personal experiences. References to newspapers, periodicals, or the latest "best-seller" are almost non-existent in the published sermons.

Macartney's published sermons were largely on the order of "the speech to stimulate," a circumstance which would account for the fact that narration and description were more prominent than exposition and argument. He did, however, preach sermons involving considerable exposition, at which times he successfully clarified texts and themes drawing upon his wide reading and travel experiences, and employing illustrations to build a bridge from the known to the unknown.

Argumentative development of his ideas through evidence and reasoning was evident particularly in the apologetic sermons. The Bible, as interpreted by conservative theology, constituted the primary form of "factual" evidence being supplemented by evidence of opinion and testimony. His use of evidence and reasoning for logical proof appears adequate for this particular audience. Macartney's forte', however, was his ability to reason inductively from the particulars of the Scriptural narrative to generalizations of timeless, universal application.

Macartney was seen to make a particularly effective use of narrative and description to dramatize his ideas--that is, to place truths in an imaginative form so that through the avenue of the senses of the listeners, the sermon becomes a shared experience. Among the characteristic uses of the narrative form of this purpose were attention-arresting allusions, kaleidoscopic series of incidents, a unique use of the personal experience, the use of the familiar and proximate, imaginary speech such as the hypothetical illustration or apostrophe, and the narrative sermon. Description was effectively employed in recreating

the physical setting or emotional mood and climate.

In Macartney's use of motive appeals it was seen that the impulses of primitive aims were directed to those regarded as ethically superior, such as the development of Christian character or the achievement of the heavenly goal. The superiority of the Christian religion and way of life was the foundation for such motive appeals as happiness, security, and altruism. Appeals were also made to the motives of love and loyalty to Christ, emulation, conservatism, social approval, fear, and sentiments.

IV. Sermon Analysis--Persuasion through Order

For well over 2,000 years writers in the field of speech have discussed the divisions of the speech, which in both ancient and modern texts are normally listed as essentially four: the introduction, the thesis sentence, the body, and the conclusion. (In some instances, "the thesis sentence" is included in "the introduction.")

Critical issues are not raised with respect to this broad general structure of the speech. Problems arise, however, when one thinks of the ordering of the discrete proofs, arguments, or means of support by which a speaker seeks to gain approval of his thesis. Eisenson, et al., cite experimental evidence to the effect that at least with shorter speeches, speech organization is not as critical a matter as always believed.¹ Minnick, however, gives similar evidence to support his contention that, "the order in which discrete arguments and proofs are presented has an influence on the overall success of the speech."² Broadus, applying the canon of Arrangement to homiletics, believes that "the effective arrangement of the materials in a discourse is scarcely less important than their intrinsic interest and force."³ Good arrangement makes the discourse more intelligible to the listener, more pleasing, and more persuasive, Broadus says,⁴ concluding with respect to the latter that "both in presenting motives and in appealing to feeling, order is of great importance."⁵

¹Eisenson et al., op. cit., p. 299.

²Minnick, op. cit., p. 262.

³Broadus, op. cit., p. 93.

⁴Ibid., pp. 95f.

⁵Ibid.

Eisenson et al., suggest a useful set of criteria by means of which "distinctions can be made between well and poorly organized speeches":

Does the introduction orient the listener toward the subject, both in terms of its general nature and its relationship to listener needs and desires? Does the body of the speech consist of identifiable separate but coherent arguments for the speaker's proposition, with clear topic sentences for each one, and transitions that show relationships among them? Does the conclusion summarize the arguments supporting the proposition and motivate listeners to want to accept it as a means of satisfying their needs and desires?⁶

Macartney's sermon organization will be examined from the standpoint of three elements of persuasion involving the adaptation of sermon organization to the audience: (1) interest and attention, (2) motivation, and (3) comprehension and learning.

Sermon Order--Attention and Interest Factors

The persuasive speaker, in trying to secure a favorable response to his speech purposes, will find that control of attention is a most vital step.⁷ Sermon organization touches this element particularly with respect to introductory materials.

For a pastor, speaking on regular appointment to a fairly constant audience, the achievement of initial interest is especially crucial. The "captive-audience" factor is involved in this situation, where often a variety of motives is operating in assembling the auditors.⁸ Because of the general familiarity of a congregation with the subject-matter normally presented in preaching, anticipatory interest cannot always be counted on, nor does the pastor have that normal curiosity working for

⁶Eisenson et al., op. cit., pp. 299f.

⁷See this Study, pp. 183f.

⁸See this Study, pp. 191f.

him that attaches itself to a stranger about to speak.

How Macartney adapted himself to these aspects of his speaking situation are dealt with under (1) use of the text as introduction, and (2) introductory sermon materials.

Use of Text as Introduction

Macartney's ascension up the pulpit stairs to the elevated pulpit took place moments before he spoke, and the almost inevitable involuntary attention captured by this movement⁹ was to his advantage. His first words, almost invariably, were those of a short passage of Scripture quoted from memory. What might easily have become an interest-deadening routine bow to custom was actually utilized by Macartney to advantage, not only because of this initial appeal to an authority source held in high esteem by the many of his listeners, but to capture the immediate attention of the listener.

His texts were always brief¹⁰--perhaps a sentence or sentence fragment, and often obviously selected for its attention value. Typical of the length of his texts are the following from his sermon series, "Bible Epitaphs":

"Died Abner as a fool dieth?" (II Sam. 3:33)
 "Amnon had a friend." (II Sam. 13:3)
 "Alas, my brother!" (I Kings 13:20)
 "A leper as white as snow." (II Kings 5:27)
 "Demas hath forsaken me, having loved this present world." (II Tim. 4:10)

⁹The capacity of certain external factors to draw attention whether the organism wishes to attend or not is recognized; attention so focused has been called involuntary attention. Among these factors are movement and change--"Movement draws the eye." See Minnick, op. cit., p. 49.

¹⁰As brief as one word, "Selah." (Salute Thy Soul, p. 100). Because scholars are not certain of the meaning of this Hebrew word, Macartney used it as a symbol of "the things God hides."

"He was eaten of worms, . . . But the word of God grew." (Acts 12:23)
 "Felix trembled." (Acts 24:25)

A series of sermons in which the texts were patently selected for their interest value was entitled. "Strange Texts but Great Truths."

Representative of this series is the following group of texts:

"A woman slew him." (Judges 9:54)
 "Alas, master! for it was borrowed." (II Kings 6:5)
 "Stings in their tails . . ." (Rev. 9:10)
 "For the bed is shorter than that a man can stretch himself on it." (Isa. 28:20)
 "And Gashmu saith it." (Neh. 6:6)
 "Send us into the swine." (Mark 5:12)
 "The mule that was under him went away." (II Sam. 18:9)

One can well imagine the effect (an aroused curiosity to say the least) of one of these texts thrown out dramatically from the elevated pulpit as his first spoken words.

Sometimes the effect was heightened by a pithy comment on the words of the text before turning to the formal introduction of his sermon. The text asking the question, "Can the Ethiopian change his skin?" is followed by his comment, "Here is the story of one who did."¹¹ Achan's confession "Behold they are hid in the earth in the midst of my tent, and the silver under it," used as text for a sermon, is followed by the attention-arresting comment, "The only trouble was that he had not dug the hole deep enough. That is always the trouble with sin--you cannot dig a hole deep enough to hide it."¹² Macartney then turns abruptly to the formal introduction.

Introductory Sermon Materials

Macartney's announcement of a brief text is followed by the

¹¹"Can the Ethiopian Change His Skin?" The Greatest Questions of the Bible and of Life, p. 128.

¹²"Achan--How Sin Lost a Battle," The Wisest Fool and Other Man of the Bible, p. 32.

formal sermon introduction, a survey of which reveals his awareness of its purpose--to arrest the attention and to orient the listener to the subject.

He employed a wide variety of "sermon gates"¹³ from week to week, the variety itself constituting an interest factor. This is indicated by Streufert, who made a study of twenty sermons selected at random from books published in the years 1947, 1948, and 1949, and reported ten different modes used by Macartney in the twenty discourses.¹⁴ Perhaps most representative of Macartney's method are the following:

The dramatic description,--A frequently used introduction, because of his wide use of the Biblical narrative, was a dramatic description of the scene or setting.

In the sermon, "Can the Ethiopian Change His Skin?," he draws back the curtain, as it were, to reveal the following scene:

High noon on the desert near Gaza, the gateway to Egypt. To the east and to the south, the undulating sand of the desert; to the west, sand dunes heaped up by the wind; and beyond these hills of sand, the Mediterranean, as blue as the sapphire stone which gleamed upon the breastplate of the high priest. Where the road from Samaria joins the great highway from Mesopotamia to Egypt, there stands a solitary traveler. Looking to the north he descries a cloud of dust. The cloud of dust rolls nearer and nearer, until out of it appear horses and a chariot. The short necks and the narrow heads of the horses declare their Arabian breed, and the decorations on the chariot show it to be a chariot of state. In this chariot sits a black man reading a book.¹⁵

¹³Blackwood lists twelve "sermon gates," as effective modes of introduction. Andrew Watterson Blackwood, The Preparation of Sermons (New York: Abingdon-Cokesbury Press, 1948), pp. 113ff.

¹⁴Carl A. Streufert, "An Analysis of the Introductions and Conclusions of C. E. Macartney's Sermons" (unpublished Bachelor of Divinity dissertation, Concordia Seminary, 1952), p. 26.

¹⁵The Greatest Questions of the Bible and Life, (1948), p. 128.

The attention value of the vivid, concrete detail and the interest-arousing suspense of the approaching "cloud of dust" combine here to form an effective introduction.

A similar scene introduces another sermon, already alluded to, "Achan--How Sin Lost a Battle:"

Midnight over the ruins of Jericho. No death-dealing, block-buster had fallen on the city. No artillery had blasted its walls Yet there it lay, a heap of desolation and ruin. The moon looks down upon the fragments of gigantic walls, prostrate pillars of the temples of Baal, the dust and rubble of baths, theaters, shops, mansions of the rich, and cottages of the poor. [There follows a brief swift-moving account of the fall of the walls of Jericho]. . . . In the ruins of Jericho not a soul is alive. In the camp of Israel no one is stirring. All are asleep, all but one. Look! Out of yonder tent comes a solitary man. He stands for a little at the fly of his tent and looks this way and that way to see if anyone is looking. Then, cautiously and carefully, stopping every now and then to look back and make sure that he is unobserved, he makes his way out of the camp of Israel and enters the ruins of Jericho.

There he crouches for a time behind the fragment of a fallen wall, as if fearful of the shadow which his body casts in the moonlight.

. . .¹⁶

Here again, there is a vivid heaping up of detail with a skillful creation of a mood of mystery and suspense.

A quality of authenticity and reality is imposed upon these scenes by Macartney's first-hand knowledge of Bible lands and customs growing out of his travels. Many of his descriptive introductions take his travels as a starting point. Sometimes the first words of the introduction placed the auditor abruptly into strange, new settings:

At first you can hardly tell whether it is cloud or land, the heavens or the earth, at which you are looking. But as the ship comes closer in, what seems to be cloud takes the form of the hills. Soon the shipping of the harbor appears; and back of the harbor rises the town, with its white and brown houses and their flat roofs.

¹⁶The Wisest Fool and Other Men of the Bible, (1949), p. 32. The first phrases of these illustrations are typical of this form of introduction; e.g., "Sunset over the Ephesian Plains." The Greatest Texts of the Bible, p. 171; "Springtime on the Plains of Dothan." The Greatest Men of the Bible, p. 98.

One has a thrill that comes never again--the first view of the Holy Land.¹⁷

The effect would no doubt have been weakened had he begun with a general assertion about the thrill one experiences with the first view of the Holy Land.

One further example is cited of how travel experiences were utilized to lend interest and authenticity to his introductions which employed description:

It was a pleasant day when I stood on the banks of the Jordan as it flowed between the thickets and bushes, the branches of the plane trees reflected in its peaceful water. There was nothing about the stream that day to suggest a great and famous river, except its memories. But when I looked up from the river to the trees that border it, there, high up, in the topmost branches of the trees, I saw the sticks and the stones, the rubbish, the flotsam and jetsam which had been deposited by the river when it overflowed its banks. There was the incredible high-water mark of the Jordan; and looking at that high-water mark in the tops of the trees, I thought of this old question in the book of Jeremiah, one of the grand old texts which dropped out of preaching long ago, but is ever timely for our souls: "How wilt thou do in the swelling of Jordan,"¹⁸

The illustration--Concrete Example, Anecdote, or Incident.--

Macartney's use of the illustration, with examples, was discussed earlier in sections dealing with Narrative and Exposition.¹⁹ From a wide variety of sources he selected narrative material for sermon introduction.

His most characteristic form, particularly where the subject dealt with a Bible character or incident, was the Bible narrative, which he had described as "an easy, natural, and successful introduction to such a sermon."²⁰ Since examples of Macartney's technique in handling the

¹⁷Peter and His Lord (1937), p. 172.

¹⁸The Greatest Questions of the Bible and Life (1948), pp. 177f.

¹⁹See this study, pp. 226ff.; 250.

²⁰Preaching Without Notes, p. 62.

Biblical narrative have been given, perhaps one example of this form of introduction will suffice--from the sermon, "Naaman--the Man Who Washed and Was Clean." Here, typically, he lifts a dramatic moment out of the story and surrounds it with imaginative detail to arouse immediate interest:

Naaman, the captain of the Syrian host, was dressing one morning to present himself at court. Stretching out his muscular, well-braceleted arm, his eye fell on something there which he had never seen before. He looked at it carefully, and as he did so the bronzed face of the veteran of many campaigns began to pale. But Naaman was a soldier, and, throwing his robes about him, he went to the court and performed his duties with the King Benhadad.

Some weeks later when he looked again, the spot had grown larger. Another week or two passed by, and there was a spot on the other arm, and then one on his thigh. There was no doubt about it. Naaman was a leper! He had fallen a victim of mankind's oldest, most dreaded, most exclusively human, and most loathsome disease.²¹

An effective narrative introduction was that taken from his pastoral experiences. An example illustrating how a common experience skillfully introduced was used for the purpose of winning audience rapport is as follows:

"It was a mistake," she said as I greeted her, a friend of former years, as she came out of the pew. She had been married since I saw her last, and naturally I made some allusion to her marriage. But that was her only comment, as a look of sadness came into her face--"It was a mistake." Like many another woman, she had married the wrong man. And she was not the first, nor the last, to do that.²²

Other examples could be given of illustrations from art, literature, history, and travel. Perhaps one further example of Macartney's use of the narrative introduction will suffice. A sermon on the incident of Christ's healing a demoniac is introduced with the recital of a boyhood memory:

²¹The Wisest Fool and Other Men of the Bible (1949), p. 169.

²²"The Woman Who Married the Wrong Man," Great Women of the Bible (1942), p. 105.

Memory paints vivid pictures on the tablets of the mind. Here is one of them: Four boys out on a camping expedition. Up one river and then up another. Supper by the campfire in a lonely ravine. At midnight a terrific thunderstorm. The boys take refuge from the storm in the haymow of a farmer's barn. Lying on the hay, safe now from pouring rain, they hear--when the thunder is not speaking--loud, wild cries of a human voice. All through the night they hear that terrible shouting.²³

The shouting of a maniac confined in an outbuilding of a farm became the bridge to the sermon topic. The interest and attention value of these narrative introductions is obvious.

The Attention-arresting statement or assertion--Macartney was aware of the importance of the first moments of his addresses, as can be seen by simply checking the first sentence of his introductions. Sometimes he appeared to be consciously aiming at a shock-effect. His "Sermons from Life" were introduced with a striking statement, sometimes the words of a troubled counselee:

"I believe I am going to hell," the sentence shocks you. It has a dread echo to it.²⁴

"I can't let her go!" It was his answer to my suggestion and advice, which he had sought. The words were spoken, not defiantly or impetuously, but slowly, quietly, and sadly, "I can't let her go."²⁵

Sometimes the statement was a homely saying or proverb turned to a new use:

A penny for your thoughts! But your thoughts are worth far more than a penny. The true wealth and power and influence of your life is in your thoughts. The danger, too, of life is in your thoughts.²⁶

At times, an arresting sentence was amplified providing introduction to his theme:

²³"With a Man Who Wore Chains," Great Interviews of Jesus (1944), p. 40.

²⁴Sermons from Life (1933), p. 222.

²⁵Ibid., p. 22.

²⁶You Can Conquer (1954), p. 89.

I have no dread of a cemetery. Sometimes it is better to be there, and have fellowship with the dead who are buried, than to walk down the streets of our cities and meet the unburied dead; that is, those in whom faith and hope and love and purity have long been dead, leaving only the animal alive.²⁷

A series of questions.--The most interesting exhibit of this type of introduction is provided by a series of sermons on "The Greatest Words of the Bible and Human Speech." Macartney explained his approach in this series in the Foreword:

It will be noted that in announcing the sermons the particular Word was never given, and even in the preaching of the sermon that Word was not spoken till well along in the introduction. This gives the preacher the advantage of a legitimate and natural curiosity and suspense.²⁸

Here, even the customary introductory text was dispensed with until after the word was disclosed. He introduced the sermon, "The Saddest Word," with the following series of questions:

What is the saddest word in the Bible and in human speech? Some thought it was Death; others, Hell; others, Depart; and many voted for Lost. But what is the saddest word? What is the word that is the fountain of woe, the mother of sorrows, as universal as human nature, as eternal as human history? What is the word that is the cause of all war and violence and hatred and sorrow and pain? What is the word that is man's worst enemy? What is the word that nailed the Son of God to the Cross? That word is, Sin. "Sin croucheth at the door."--Genesis 4:7.²⁹

Macartney used other forms of introduction such as a striking quotation, the statement of a problem, the contextual background of a text, or an imaginary dream; but the above-mentioned methods were the most common, and illustrate his awareness of the purpose of the introduction to capture the listener's attention.

More than simply arresting attention, however, the introduction

²⁷Bible Epitaphs (1936), p. 94.

²⁸The Greatest Words of the Bible and Human Speech (1938), Foreword.

²⁹Ibid., p. 11.

must serve also to arouse interest in, and act as a bridge to, the theme of the discourse.

It can be shown that Macartney's introductions were designed to achieve this over-riding purpose. The earlier-mentioned introductory incident of a maniac's terrifying cries at night might well have derailed the listeners' train of attention, but Macartney deftly channels it into his sermon purpose, bridging naturally to a Biblical narrative of similar texture which in turn becomes the basis of the sermon:

Still the cries of the man echo in the memory of one of those boys. There were two storms that night: the storm of nature, the thunder-storm; and the storm of human nature, the storm of insanity in that poor man's mind and body.

Likewise there are two storms in the great story of Jesus' interview with a man who wore chains. First came the storm at sea when Jesus and the disciples were crossing over and they awakened him, thinking they were going to perish. And Jesus rebuked the wind and said to the sea, "Peace, be still." Then, after that storm and the quelling of the tempest came the storm in a man's soul and the stilling of that tempest by the love and power of the Son of God.³⁰

The Biblical narrative is introduced, then, with the description of another man's wild cries and his subsequent healing.

A similar appropriate transition to the sermon theme could be demonstrated in the other examples cited above. Two further illustrations of his method are given. In the sermon "Lord, is it I?" the introduction is of a contextual nature, with pertinent background information leading up to the scene in the Upper Room, where the question "Lord, is it I?" prepares the minds of the hearers for the theme of the sermon, self-examination:

This question, and this incident, one of the most memorable and moving of all that transpired at the Lord's supper, tells us of the possibility of evil within our hearts, of our deep ignorance of

³⁰Great Interviews of Jesus (1944), pp. 40f.

ourselves, and hence the necessity and wisdom of self-examination.³¹

The introduction of the sermon, "Is the Young Man Safe?" combines narration and description to engage the emotions of parents as David is pictured pacing the floor awaiting news of the fate of his son. His urgent question addressed to successive messengers prepares the minds of his auditors for the sermon on the perils confronting youth of our day. The transition is made as follows:

"Is the young man safe?" This is a question which is asked by many fathers and mothers, and by sons too. Conscience, faithful conscience, will often whisper to the heart of the young man, striving to win him back from an evil way. "Is the young man safe?"³²

Sermon Order--Motivation

Sermon organization as a factor in listener motivation becomes pertinent particularly at two points (1) the positioning of arguments and propositions within the sermon, and (2) the conclusion.

Positioning of Arguments and Propositions

Experimental evidence is not conclusive as to whether arguments are most effectively presented in climax or anti-climax orders.³³ Minnick tends to favor the climax order (strongest points last) when the speech material involves strong emotional content, advising that if the speaker is in doubt, "he probably would do well to use the climax order."³⁴ Sarett, Foster, and Sarett suggest that "in the speech to inspire, the climactic adaptive order is usually best."³⁵ Traditionally,

³¹The Greatest Questions of the Bible and Life (1948), p. 144.

³²Ibid., p. 94.

³³See Eisenson et al., op. cit., pp. 300f.

³⁴Minnick, op. cit., pp. 270f.

³⁵Sarett, Foster, and Sarett, op. cit., p. 500.

homileticians, looking upon preaching as persuasive address designed to motivate the hearers to decision and action, have favored the climax order.³⁶

Macartney's sermons display a wide variety of arrangement types; and examples could be brought forward under such categories as the historical or chronological plan, the distributive plan, partition of text plan, an occasional problem-solution plan, and a type growing out of his handling of the Biblical narratives which might be labeled the dramatic continuity.

Most common are the historical, where the material is arranged in chronological order, a plan he followed with many of the sermons based on Biblical narratives; and the distributive plan of arrangement, where matters having a common thought center and an obvious connection among themselves are grouped in sections, a plan utilized in his topical sermons.

It can be shown, however, that whatever the plan, the materials are arranged in a psychologically ascending order with those points lending themselves most naturally to an emotional climax positioned last. Many of his sermons contain the traditional three divisions within the body of the sermon although four divisions appear almost as frequently. Ordinarily, the last point (particularly where the thought movement is in a deductive pattern) becomes the base for the conclusion. The examples given below demonstrate the climax order, typical with Macartney, and at the same time illustrate his most common patterns of sermon arrangement.

In a sermon entitled, "Saul--the Greatest Shipwreck in the Old

³⁶See Broadus, op. cit., pp. 116, 117, 211.

Testament"³⁷ the outline is in the historical pattern, with the life of Saul being divided into three chronological periods which form the sermon divisions:

- I. Saul's Morning
- II. Saul's Breakdown and Failure
- III. Sunset and Night

The material gathered into the last two divisions increases in dramatic impact, with the conflict of the second division giving way to climactic events of Saul's visit to the Witch of Endor followed by his suicide on the battle field the day following. The conclusion follows naturally on the theme of the forfeiture of high privilege and opportunity.

A topical sermon based on the narrative of the conversion of Zacchaeus, "With a Tree-climbing Politician,"³⁸ takes the form of an inductive--deductive continuity. The introductory narrative portion closes with a transitional sentence, from which point the application of the narrative proceeds from three generalizations, the outline falling into a distributive pattern:

The sycamore tree into which Zacchaeus climbed that spring day at Jericho so that he might see Jesus has become one of the greatest pulpits in the history of the church.

- I. "It preaches first of all a sermon on KINDNESS."
- II. "The sycamore tree preaches, in the second place, the JOY of receiving Christ."
- III. "The third thing to remember is that when his chance came, Zacchaeus acted quickly--OPPORTUNITY."

Macartney moves here psychologically to a point of climax which lends itself naturally to a personal application--namely, the urgent need to

³⁷Sermons on Old Testament Heroes (1933), pp. 115ff.

³⁸Great Interviews of Jesus (1944), pp. 52ff.

act on an important, but fleeting opportunity, "the . . . opportunity to repent and come to God."

On occasion, Macartney's sermons would fall into a continuity of three steps so related as to produce a dramatic action as might be illustrated by the modern three-act play. In the first phase, Exposition, persons are revealed in such a way as to reveal a problem situation and start the action moving in a given direction; In the second phase, Complication, the action runs into difficulties; opposing forces impede its movement with resulting conflict; In the third phase, Resolution, the action reaches a climax and passes into an outcome which resolves the conflict. Macartney's sense of form led him to see this dramatic quality in many of the sermon ideas taken from Biblical characters. An example is his treatment of a sermon on the life of Joseph³⁹ which climaxes with promotion to the office of prime minister of Egypt.

The outline is simple:

Text: "Behold, this dreamer cometh." (Genesis 37:19)

I. Dreams

II. Dungeons

III. Diadems

The last point lends itself to a climactic conclusion which will be noted later.

One further example of Macartney's climax ordering of materials for motivation is considered--particularly because of the rather atypical early and precise announcement of his plan of development. The sermon, entitled "What if he Gain the Whole World and Lose his

³⁹"Joseph--Dreams, Dungeons, Diadems," The Greatest Men of the Bible (1941), pp. 98ff.

Soul,"⁴⁰ is briefly introduced, following which he proposes:

There are three things that I shall say on this subject. First, that man has or is a living and immortal soul; second, that the soul has suffered injury and damage; and third, that Christ discovers, redeems, and restores the soul of man.⁴¹

Here, the order is both logical and psychological, with the conclusion and appeal growing naturally out of the last and climaxing division.

The Conclusion

In the main, Macartney's sermons move steadily toward a climax and carefully-planned ending, thus fulfilling the traditional purposes of the sermon conclusion such as application, exhortation, and appeal⁴² (summary conclusions are rare). The conclusions are appropriate to that category of sermons labeled "therapy"⁴³ in this study and into which category the majority of his sermons fall. Exhortation, entreaty, encouragement, consolation, warning, or promise are all legitimately addressed to those who consider themselves believers.

An occasional conclusion takes the form of invitation, call, or earnest plea addressed to persons who presumably have not yet "believed." Because, however, Macartney did not make an altar call, overt response to these specific appeals would have to be made following the service.⁴⁴

⁴⁰The Greatest Questions of the Bible and Life (1948), pp. 32ff.

⁴¹Ibid., p. 32.

⁴²Broadus, op. cit., pp. 127ff.

⁴³See this Study, pp. 214ff.

⁴⁴Such as seeking out a minister for interview. In a tape-recorded evening service following such an appeal, Macartney suggests a room in which he will be available to those who wish to respond. (Tape recording of sermon preached September 28, 1952). In the opinion of a former assistant, "The personal application and personal invitation were weaknesses. . . He practically never gave an invitation." (Correspondence from Dr. Harold Ockenga, October, 1965). While another suggested that his audiences would

Macartney's conclusions usually flow naturally from the sermon thrust and theme, often growing out of the last point or sermon division, although in one form of devotional climax, as will be shown, there is an exception to this rule. Examples of typical conclusions follow:

Hortatory.--A sermon on Samson exhorts the listener to repent:

Turn back to God only this once; repent of your sins and seek his pardoning grace and the God who strengthened the penitent Samson and gave him back his lost gift, will strengthen you, and make you strong in the power of his might.⁴⁵

A sermon on "heaven" concludes with the exhortation, "Do not forget that home! Do not miss that home! May we all at length get home!"⁴⁶

Warning.--The exhortation took a warning aspect, building stylistically to an emotional climax in a sermon on "The Unpardonable Sin":

We have quenched the Holy Spirit when we have resisted him so persistently and obstinately that he withdraws himself from us. Then our condition is hopeless. Our friends may pray earnestly to God for our salvation; the sorrows and the joys of this world may visit us in impartial succession; the church bells may sound in our ears; the hymns of grace and redemption echo all about us; the preacher may reason with us of righteousness and temperance and judgment to come; death itself may knock and bid us prepare to depart; but in vain are these ministries because the Holy Spirit no longer speaks in them and through them. Without him we cannot repent, we cannot believe, we cannot be saved. If, then, ye hear his voice, obey! Do not grieve him! Do not resist him! Do not quench him.⁴⁷

Direct appeal.--A series of questions followed by Scriptural admonition seeks to motivate the hearer in a direct appeal based on lessons drawn from a biographical sermon:

have been offended by the "altar call" and that Macartney had properly adapted himself to his audience in this respect. (Interview with Paul Rhodes, January, 1966.)

⁴⁵"Samson and Delilah," The Way of a Man with a Maid (1931), p. 115.

⁴⁶"If a Man Die shall He Live Again?" The Grestest Questions of the Bible and Life (1948), p. 223.

⁴⁷Sermons from Life (1933), p. 196.

Are you in a situation comparable to that of any one of these men of whom I have spoken in this sermon? Is your conscience dimmed by the mist of indulgence? Is your ambition asleep? Are you looking only at the things which are unseen and eternal? Are you asleep to the welfare of your soul, to the great issues of time and eternity? Then, "Awake thou that sleepest, and arise from the dead, and Christ shall give thee light."⁴⁸

A direct appeal to accept Christ was prompted by an incident often related concerning Dwight L. Moody:

Remembering that incident in Moody's life and preaching, certainly I will not ask you to wait until next Sabbath, or wait until tomorrow, or to wait until the next hour to decide what you will do with Christ. I ask you to answer the question, and to answer it now.⁴⁹

Consolation and Encouragement.--Here, and in the remaining examples, the appeal and application are less direct, an aspect more typical of Macartney's conclusions than those already cited:

Sursum corda! Lift up your heart. Every shadow that falls across your path tells of a reality and substance beyond the grave. Every heartbreak and disappointment gives you that much clearer title to a room in the Father's house.⁵⁰

A passage of Scripture and sixteen lines of poetry follow in this same mood of optimism.

The heightened vision.--Generally speaking, Macartney aims for a verdict or decision in his sermons, but he does not always close with a verbal plea or exhortation. At times he appears to have taken as his goal the inspiring and moving of the listener with a heightened vision of a truth or concept. In these instances, his conclusions may achieve a point of eloquence, when under the influence of his emotions his language becomes rhythmic and exalted. These conclusions often blend

⁴⁸"A Common Epitaph," Strange Texts but Grand Truths, (New York: Abingdon-Cokesbury Press, 1946), p. 20.

⁴⁹"What Shall I do with Jesus?" The Greatest Questions of the Bible and Life (1948), p. 56.

⁵⁰"It was a Great Disappointment," Sermons from Life (1933), pp. 132ff.

into a final Biblical quotation or passage of poetry. The following example, given in full, is from a sermon which dealt with the narrative of Simon's feast and the woman intruder who found assurance of forgiveness:

As she goes out from the banqueting hall, the silence which has hung over the feast after the words of Jesus is broken by strains of haunting melody. It is not the orchestra of Simon with their flutes and cymbals, nor is it the strolling musicians of the street, nor does it come out of the window of some house of marriage or of revelry. What music can it be? Whence comes it? Is it the music which bids farewell to some messenger of heaven as he goes forth upon his great enterprise? Is it the song of triumph over the tidings which have come of a rebellion put down in some part of God's empire? Is it the song which hails a new creation, or the advent of a new world in God's vast empire? Are the morning stars singing together? Are the suns of God shouting for joy? No. It is not that music, but something richer, deeper, more majestic. It is a music in which all the minor chords of human guilt and shame and sorrow and suffering and pain, transmuted by the sighs and agony and tears and blood of the Son of God, have been lifted into the major chord of thanksgiving and praise and rejoicing. It is heaven's noblest music, the song of the angels rejoicing over one sinner that repenteth. It is the music of ten thousand times ten thousand rejoicing over the repentance of one poor harlot, once a sinner, but now washed white in the blood of the Lamb slain from the foundation of the world.⁵¹

The effect of the heightened vision was sometimes sought by concluding with an apostrophe when an indirect appeal was made to the hearers through the one addressed in imagination. The sermon on Joseph, "Dreams, Dungeons, Diadems," concludes:

"Behold, this dreamer cometh!" Yes, Joseph, come again into our midst! Put that ring of constancy upon thy finger, and that robe woven by thine own fidelity and obedience. Hang again about thy neck that gold chain forged out of the furnace of thy fiery trials. Walk down our streets. Enter our places of amusement. Pass through our business offices. Enter the cloisters of our colleges and universities. Pass down the aisles of our churches and tell us once more, as thou alone art able to tell, that duty is the pathway to glory; that our dreams light the way sometimes to suffering, but in the end to victory; that it is Christlike ever to forgive; that forever it pays to be true to our dreams; and that by our fidelity to God and our loyalty to principle we join the company of those

⁵¹"Jesus and the Woman," The Way of a Man with a Maid (1931), p. 176.

prophets, apostles, and martyrs, who from age to age have pushed forward the boundaries of the Kingdom of God.⁵²

An emotional climax of a similar nature was sometimes achieved by transporting the hearer to a scene of triumph in the hereafter. A sermon concludes on the words of Jesus to the forgiven woman, "Go and sin no more:"

"Go, and sin no more!" I wonder if when the redeemed souls enter heaven, they will be greeted by the angels who shall speak some word of encouragement and congratulation to those who enter the realms of the blessed? Yes; I think that may be true. There will be one angel who shall say to them as they pass, "Enter, and labor no more." Another shall say to them, "Enter, and suffer no more." Another shall say to them, "Enter, and groan no more." Another shall say to them, "Enter, and weep no more." Another shall say to them, "Enter, and fear no more." But beyond all other salutations in the power of its joy and its peace will be the salutation of that angel who shall say to the redeemed souls as they pass in through the gates into the city, "Go, and sin no more!"⁵³

Devotional conclusion.--Macartney's stated conviction that every sermon should lead to, and exalt, Christ as Savior is demonstrated in a unique form of conclusion which is frequently employed, and in which (sometimes in rather surprising ways) he manages in the closing moments to bridge to an appeal centering in Christ.

In some instances, this may take place in sermons where, it would appear, the general mood and tone have been such that the mind has not been prepared sufficiently for the change. In the examples cited below, one might wonder whether the transitions have not been too abrupt to make a useful motivating close:

A sermon drawing lessons from the covetousness of Gehazi, who was punished with leprosy does not close on the theme of victory over covetousness but bridges very briefly to a focus upon Christ as Savior:

⁵²"Dreams, Dungeons, Diadems," The Greatest Men of the Bible (1941), pp. 111f.

⁵³"With a Harlot," Great Interviews of Jesus (1944), p. 86.

Standing by the grave of Gehazi, and reading that epitaph, "A leper as white as snow," one thinks of another "white as snow" in the Bible--"Though your sins be as scarlet, they shall be as white as snow." And that makes one think of Him who cleansed the lepers, and who can save us all from a leper's epitaph and the sinner's doom.⁵⁴

Another example is the conclusion to a sermon on David and Bathsheba. In this sermon, Nathan's parable of the lamb had led David to repentance. Macartney bridges, in the final moments, to Christ as the Lamb of God:

It was the story of the death of a lamb, only a little innocent lamb, that broke David's heart and showed him how great a sinner he was and brought him to repentance. So it is nothing more, and nothing less, than the story of a death of a Lamb, God's Lamb, the Lamb of God, slain from the foundation of the world, that brings men to repentance, shows us how great our sin is, and how much greater is God's forgiveness. O Lamb of God, that takest away the sins of the world!⁵⁵

Although it appears that at times this concluding focus on Christ was rather abrupt, it must be conceded that the speaker's ingenuity in finding a variety of paths to Christ in his preaching would have won favorable response from many of his auditors who regarded the exaltation of Christ in every sermon as one sign of a good preacher.

Sermon Order--Learning and Comprehension

After reviewing a number of studies on opinion change, Hovland, Janis, and Kelley concluded that "attention, comprehension, and acceptance probably determine, to a very large extent, the degree of persistence of the opinion changes induced by a communication."⁵⁶

⁵⁴"Gehazi--A Leper White as Snow," Bible Epitaphs (1936), p. 83.

⁵⁵"David and Bathsheba," The Way of a Man with a Maid (1931), p. 129.

⁵⁶C. I. Hovland, I. L. Janis, and H. H. Kelley, Communication and Persuasion (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1953), p. 92.

It is evident then, that beyond focusing attention, maintaining interest, and providing motivation, the effective speaker must prepare, arrange, and deliver his speeches so that the listener will comprehend and retain what he hears. In other words, what he wishes the listener to understand and respond to must be presented in such a way as to make the learning process as congenial as possible. Herbert Spencer described the problem in terms of "mental economy" for the listener: "To so present ideas that they may be apprehended with the least possible mental effort, is the desideratum. . . ."57

Acknowledging these facts regarding learning and comprehension, it becomes obvious that sermon order as it involves the factors of unity, coherence, and clarity, is a significant matter.

Unity, Coherence, and Clarity

The desire for unity, in Davis' opinion, is a law of the listener's mind. "It is his own sense of form at work, trying to bring order out of the chaos of impressions."⁵⁸ For this reason Davis adds: "That the best sermon is the embodiment of a single idea is not a rule but an accurate reporting of fact."⁵⁹ Oliver describes a unified speech as one that is "so inevitably one compact whole that the relations of the parts to one another are organic."⁶⁰

⁵⁷H. Spencer, "The Philosophy of Style," in Cooper, L. (ed.), Theories of Style (New York: Macmillan, 1907), pp. 270ff., cited in Eisenson, et al., op. cit., p. 296.

⁵⁸Davis, op. cit., p. 36.

⁵⁹Ibid. He acknowledges that all homiletic texts pay at least lip service to this principle.

⁶⁰Oliver, op. cit., p. 344.

On the whole, Macartney's sermons might well serve as models of clarity and unity--the theme emerging clearly with plain topic sentences and transitions to bind the whole. (Exceptions to these generalizations will be noted later in this section.) The study proceeds now with examples taken to be representative of Macartney's practice with respect to the above-mentioned principles.

Where Macartney has been careful to formulate a clear thesis or proposition he inevitably follows through with a unified sermon structure, as in examples given below:

1. Sermon title: "Temptation Conquered"⁶¹

Text: "There came a viper." (Acts 28:3)

Proposition: "This viper, coming suddenly out of the gathered sticks and fastening itself to Paul's arm, may well serve as an illustration of the universality, the secrecy, the subtlety, and peril of temptation."

Divisions: I The source and diversities of temptation

II The wounds of temptation

III How to resist temptation

IV The joy of overcoming

To strengthen the unity of the whole, each point is tied in with Paul's experience with the viper. Transition indicators are clear, with an internal summary preceding the final point to tie the theme together:

We have reflected upon the diversity of temptation, the terrible wounds which it inflicts, and ways of resisting it and overcoming it. Now, in conclusion it is our privilege to think of the joy of overcoming temptation and of the blessing of temptations endured.

⁶¹Strange Texts but Grand Truths (1953), pp. 95ff.

2. Sermon title: Andrew--The Man Who Brought His Brother⁶²

Text: "He first findeth his own brother, Simon, . . . and he brought him to Jesus. (John 1:41-42)

Proposition:

That is the greatest present need of the Church--more Andrews, more men who will tell the news of Christ and bring others to him. Since the great work of the ministry and indeed of every Christian, is to witness for Christ, and to bring others to him, one of the most profitable things we can do is to study for a little the history of this man Andrew.

Divisions: I Andrew brought himself to Christ

II Andrew brought his brother to Jesus

III Andrew brought a boy to Christ

IV Andrew brought the strangers to Christ

Transition sentences indicate the progression from point to point and are of a nature to bind the divisions into an organic unity. For example, he moves from the first division to his second point with the sentence: "Andrew had made a great discovery. Let us see what he did with it." He bridges to the last division with a transition and internal summary: "He brought Peter and he brought the boy. Now he brings strangers to Christ."

3. Sermon title: "Peter's Never-answered Question"⁶³

Text: "Lord, to whom shall we go? Thou hast the words of eternal life." (John 6:68)

Proposition: "With this incident from the ministry of our Lord for a starting point, I would like to show the pre-eminence, exclusiveness, and indispensableness of Christ."

⁶²The Wisest Fool and Other Men of the Bible (1949), pp. 153ff.

⁶³"Peter's Never-answered Question," Peter and His Lord (1937), pp. 41ff.

- Divisions:
- I If we forsake Christ as an Example and a Guide, to whom shall we go?
 - II If you leave Christ, your Friend, Companion, and Helper, to whom will you go?
 - III If we leave Christ as the sinner's Saviour, to whom shall we go?
 - IV If we leave Christ as the Resurrection and Life, to whom shall we go?

Here the question of Peter, "To whom shall we go?" is repeated as a theme or refrain marking the transition to each new division and acting as a unifying factor as well;

Another example which illustrates Macartney's usual faithfulness to the principles of unity and clarity under discussion in this section represents, however, a departure from the usual practice of an early statement of theme or proposition:

4. Sermon title: "The Rich Young Ruler"

Text: "He went away sorrowful"

- Divisions:
- I The attractiveness of the young man
 - II The searching test
 - III The sadness of his failure

Proposition: A statement in the form of a generalization growing out of the narrative as divided above appears near the conclusion and represents the full emergence of the sermon theme: "No one ever dropped out of the Christian life, turned away from Christ and the Bible, and got any joy out of it. Equally true is it that no one ever felt moved to follow Christ, to be his disciple, or was almost his disciple, and yet turned away from him without knowing the sorrow that this young man did when he made the Great Refusal. . . ."

While a majority of Macartney's sermons appear to be above serious adverse criticism with respect to the principles of unity and clarity, exceptions do appear and will now be noted. Occasionally a Biblical narrative tempted Macartney into too many directions so that one has difficulty in pin-pointing a central theme. Out of sixteen sermons on Biblical characters appearing in one volume, one sermon appears to lack a unifying theme:

5. Sermon title: "Naaman--The Man Who Washed and was Clean"⁶⁴

Text: "Then went he down, and dipped himself seven times in Jordan." (II Kings 5:14)

Proposition: (None stated.) The sermon proceeds chronologically through the Naaman story drawing lessons from four aspects of the narrative.

Divisions: I Unsuspected sorrows and burdens
 II How great service can be rendered by humble agents
 III The folly and danger of untimely anger
 IV God helps those who humble themselves

These four disparate themes would be difficult to bind into an organic unity; and what we have is four sermonettes with some measure of continuity only because drawn from the one narrative.⁶⁵

⁶⁴The Wisest Fool and Other Men of the Bible (1949), pp. 169ff.

⁶⁵The temptation to a proliferation of the theme would be greatest in the Biblical biography or narrative where various incidents would suggest different lessons. See, e.g. "Jonah--the Greatest Preacher in the Old Testament" Sermons on Old Testament Heroes, pp. 143ff., where the narrative of Jonah prompts the following nine themes: (1) How God sends his Word to men, (2) how sin leads men from God, (3) the ubiquity of God, (4) the value of an active conscience, (5) the life versus the occupation, (6) no one sins alone, (7) sin creates a storm, (8) the second chance, and (9) modern preaching.

In a series of twelve sermons on the creed, one sermon attempts to describe too many facets of one subject, the doctrine of the Holy Spirit:

4. Sermon title: "The Holy Spirit."⁶⁶

No text given.

Proposition: The sermon is to proceed in an inductive pattern from the following question "Just what do we mean when we say that we believe in the Holy Ghost, or when we baptize our children into his name, or when we bless the living in the name of God the Holy Spirit?"

- Divisions:
- I The Holy Spirit is God
 - II The Holy Spirit is a Person
 - III The work of the Holy Spirit
 - IV The Holy Spirit and Preaching
 - V The sin against the Holy Spirit

The last two divisions move away from the direction suggested by the theme sentence. In addition, it appears that Macartney is attempting too much in this sermon; for while it is true that the last point, "the sin against the Holy Spirit," aids in turning a teaching discourse into an evangelistic appeal, it is actually a sermon in its own right.

Summary--Order and Persuasion

Macartney's sermon organization has been studied from the standpoint of three elements of persuasion--the adaptation to the audience with respect to (1) attention and interest factors, (2) motivation, and

⁶⁶Things Most Surely Believed (1931), pp. 132ff.

learning and comprehension.

His brief and frequently unusual sermon texts, as well as introductory sermon materials, were apparently carefully selected for attention and interest value.

The channeling of listener motivations in support of the speaker's propositions was sought through the psychological ordering of materials in an ascending climax to the conclusion. Sermon conclusions were usually of an emotional nature, often approaching an "oratorical" climax. A direct plea for a verdict was made on occasion, although the more frequent practice was an indirect application, with the conclusion seeking the effect of a heightened vision of the truth or concept advocated.

Macartney's adaptation of his sermon organization to the listener's needs with respect to unity, coherence, and clarity was found generally to be acceptable, with some exceptions noted.

V Sermon Analysis--Persuasion Through Language

Speech style, or the way in which a speaker clothes his ideas with language, has been regarded as an indivisible element of the process of persuasion since the days of the Greek masters. Quintilian observed that "those words are the most to be commended which express our thoughts best, and produce the impression which we desire on the minds of the judges."¹ His dictum focuses attention upon what language does, not simply upon what it is.

Authorities in the field of public address have suggested that the style of the speech to stimulate is most effective when it carries to the audience the feelings of the speaker phrased in terms of the emotional needs of his listeners. Oliver, for example, makes use of De Quincey's distinction between a "literature of knowledge," and a "literature of power." The speech to stimulate, he says, makes effective use of the "language of power"--the language which, beyond conveying information, suggests reactions. "The speaker's style is the elusive quality of language by which he enters into and then to an extent transforms the audience mood."²

The pattern of effective modern speech advocated by contemporary writers is that which at its base preserves the best elements of good conversation: directness, intimacy, apparent spontaneity and ease, lack of affectation, pompousness and exhibitionism. These factors must be modified in order to enable the speaker to adapt himself to his

¹J. S. Watson (Translator and editor), Quintilian's Institutes of Oratory, 2 volumes (London: George Bell and Sons, 1895), II, p. 78. (Book VIII, Introduction).

²Oliver, op. cit., pp. 433ff. In Oliver's opinion "The persuasive effect of sheer stylistic excellence is tremendous." (p. 156).

particular speech situation which might call for more dignity and energy. In preaching, the ideas are not of a nature as would be tossed about casually in small talk. It would appear to be inevitable, therefore, that the preacher's speech would have more warmth, power, and distinction than ordinary conversation.

It is suggested that "frequently the conversational basis of speech must be supplemented by intensity and fervor because the ideas are freighted with significance and emotion; it must be stepped up to the level of eloquence . . . because he [the speaker] must be eloquent, but even then he remains unqualifiedly communicative."³

Before we turn to a detailed analysis of the speech style in the preaching of Dr. Clarence Macartney, several general observations should be noted:

From the excerpts of Dr. Macartney's sermons which have already appeared in connection with different aspects of this study it can be seen that many of the published sermons have a quality reminiscent of the "grand style" in the preaching of former years.⁴ Time magazine, commenting on a sermon preached to an assembly of ministers at the Princeton Seminary Institute of Theology in 1952, observed:

To an audience of professionals, his rolling periods, the long Biblical analogies, the references to the writings of the Founding Fathers were in themselves an epitome of a great but vanishing style of church preaching.⁵

It should not be concluded from this, however, that his sermons were ponderous in style, for with the exception of an occasional less

³Sarett, Foster, and Sarett, op. cit., p. 362.

⁴One detects the influence of such past masters as those whose practice he reviewed in his books Sons of Thunder, and Six Kings of the American Pulpit.

⁵Time, LX (July 21, 1952), 47.

familiar word, Macartney retained an ease of style by the use of simple strong, dignified, informal English.⁶ His speech was made vivid by a wide use of connotative language and word imagery. But as suggested, a grandeur of style is approached on occasion, accomplished in part at least by the vocabulary choice, use of the inverted sentence, the apostrophe, and what Phillips calls "Cumulation" with various forms of climax.⁷ His style is also made ornate by rich use of figurative elements, such as the metaphor and simile and the use of poetry. Ornamentation, however, would appear to be subordinate to speech content and thus serves a supplementary role in the over-all task of persuasion.

These generalizations will now be amplified by a detailed analysis of specimens of his preaching. For this study of the stylistic features of Macartney's sermons, the case study method has been chosen. Three representative sermons were selected from those which were analyzed in detail as a part of the research for this chapter.

The first sermon, "The Tenth Hour Struck for Me,"⁸ was preached in the early part of his Pittsburgh tenure. It is a "Sermon from Life," taken from a popular series preached from time to time in his career in which pastoral incidents, life situations, became the basis for the discourse.

⁶Macartney's breadth of vocabulary is revealed by a sprinkling of less familiar words throughout the published addresses, although in no one sermon would intelligibility appear to be significantly hampered by an over-use of words as complex as the following which were taken from as many individual sermons: "cicatrized," "putrescence," "perdurance," "cloaca," "asseveration," "porphyry," "sybarite," "epiphony" "inexpiable," "turpitude," "anthropomorphism," "phantasmagoria."

⁷A. E. Phillips, op. cit., pp. 79ff.

⁸Sermons from Life (1933), pp. 157ff.

The second sermon, "The Woman Who Touched Him,"⁹ published in 1942, illustrates Macartney's style in the narrative or biographical sermon.

A third, "The Doom of Evil,"¹⁰ preached near the close of his career, is valuable for this study because it is one of two sermons available for analysis in both the printed and voice-recorded form,¹¹ and is, therefore, helpful in comparing Macartney's actual oral style with the printed sermon.

An extended content or procedural analysis is not attempted here; rather, the purpose of this section is to describe the ways in which Macartney clothes his thoughts and feelings in language designed to communicate his message effectively to his Pittsburgh audience. The criteria of communicative language--clarity, ease, vividness, and force¹²--will be employed as the following fundamental constituents of style are applied to Macartney's preaching: (1) choice of words, (2) composition, and (3) embellishment.¹³

Analysis of the Sermon, "The Tenth Hour Struck for Me."

This "sermon from life" was prompted by a letter written to Dr. Macartney in response to a presentation of seven years earlier on the text, "It was about the tenth hour."¹⁴ The expression represents the

⁹The Great Women of the Bible (1942), pp. 186ff.

¹⁰Strange Texts but Grand Truths (1953), pp. 136ff.

¹¹The other sermon, "Come Before Winter," is studied in Chapter VII.

¹²Sarett, Foster, and Sarett, op. cit., pp. 345ff.

¹³Thonssen and Baird, op. cit., pp. 416f.

¹⁴John 1:39.

gospel writer John's perceptive notation of the time of day when he first met Jesus.

Macartney develops the theme "that there are critical hours, turning points, in a man's life when the response or decision may ever after influence one's destiny." The three main heads offer a clue to the mood of the message:

- I Hours of shock and depression of soul
- II The hour of temptation
- III The hour of Christ's approach to the soul

Choice of Words¹⁵

The key word, of course, is "crisis." Macartney's aim is to help those in crisis and, also, to create a crisis for those complacent about the claims of the Gospel. The "muscle" words chosen to carry the weight of his thought and create the mood are nouns, sometimes coupled with vivid descriptive adjectives. The following modifier-noun combinations are heavy with connotative content:

dark struggle	broken trust	firm resolves
great fear	cherished hopes	momentary pang
bitter cup	heroic endurance	vain remorse
incomparable pain	critical hour	solemn earnestness

Action phrases such as "fling the blood money," "cast to the dogs," or the vivid, "flashing of his judgments," are interspersed in the

¹⁵Semanticists have shown that not merely large communication units, but also individual words may have both factual and emotional connotations: Ogden and Richards speak of strictly symbolic and evocative language: "In strict symbolic language the emotional effects of the words, whether direct or indirect, are irrelevant to their employment. In evocative language on the other hand, all the means by which attitudes, moods, desires, feeling, emotions can be verbally incited in an audience are concerned." C. K. Ogden and I. A. Richards, The Meaning of Meaning (New York: Harcourt, Brace and Co., 1946), p. 235.

illustrative incidents:

Macartney's language is not burdened here with vague and abstract theological jargon. His Presbyterian listeners presumably would have had no problem with his reference to "the sovereign plan of God," or "overruling providence." Biblical phraseology woven into the texture of the address would have served to enliven it with emotional overtones for his Biblically-minded listeners. Two examples in which an emotional appeal blends into a Scriptural climax follow:

What will you do then? . . . Will you accept this last defeat and failure as final, or will you rise again to your feet, to cry anew, "Rejoice not against me, O mine enemy, for though I fall, I shall rise again?"

Will the soul surrender, or will it call upon God and say, "Though he slay me, yet will I trust him?"

A directness of address in keeping with communicative oral style is facilitated by a liberal use of first and second person pronouns in the introduction, conclusion, and at the points of appeal and application appearing in each of the divisions: "Is he speaking to you now. . .? Then this is your hour . . . by your quick and wise choice make this hour as memorable in the calendar of your life as that tenth hour was for John. . . ."

Macartney has chosen words of acceptable usage in America and well within the vocabulary range of his audience, no words being more difficult than those already noted. Expressions such as "incalculably, indefinably precious," or "the incomparable pain of heartlessness and faithlessness," are not exactly the language of ordinary conversation, but Macartney's cathedral audience probably expected such a balancing of occasional colloquial elements with expressions of a more formal nature. The archaism, "Alas!" which appears once in this sermon is found rather frequently in his published sermons.

Composition

By composition is meant the orderly arrangement of the words chosen. As the medium through which beauty and sense are imparted to language, it has to do with the way in which words are assembled and related so as to convey thought effectively and with appropriate grace and rhythm.

This would include attention to the elements of grammar and syntax. No fault can be found with Macartney's sermon in this respect which, of course, would have been edited for book publication.

With respect to sentence structure, it will be noted that on the whole, Macartney's sentences in this sermon are simple and direct in form. Variety and emphasis, however, are occasionally achieved by various forms of inversion. The following rhythmic periodic sentence follows five sentences of loose construction, contributing variety as well as an element of suspense:

When the brightness has suddenly been extinguished, when life's interests by whose flames you have warmed and cheered your soul have gone out, leaving only the dull, cold, gray ashes on the hearth, then a critical hour has struck for your soul.

Macartney demonstrates a skillful use of variety in sentence length to create a mood or feeling tone--action and urgency, for example, are clothed in short, staccato exclamations:

Jesus of Nazareth passeth by! What a moment for the soul! Never again did Jesus pass by Jericho. Perhaps he will not pass your way again. Arise! He is calling for thee. Rise up to meet him! This may be your hour!

From this peak he reverts briefly to John's "tenth hour" when Christ was introduced as the "Lamb of God," following which he builds a suspended climax with an expanding, survey sentence:

That was, still is, ever will be, the great thing about Christ, the thing that interested the Baptist and made John and Andrew follow

Christ; the thing that takes more space in the New Testament than anything else; the thing that the apostles declared, that Paul loved to preach; that generations of believers have made their only hope and confidence; the thing that will be the theme of heaven's song and celebration, that Christ is the Lamb of God that taketh away the sins of the world.

The effect of subsiding climax is then achieved by three sentences of successively decreasing length:

All else you may hear of Christ is of relative unimportance compared with this. He can take away your sins! No other can.

A significant form of emphasis is the use of the rhetorical question in three appeal sections of the sermon illustrated by the following: "What will you do then? Will you let the ship of your soul drift before the wind which has struck it, or will you contend against the storm?"

Another aspect of composition as related to style in public address is paragraphing which in Macartney's published sermons is standard in form--a group of related sentences that expand a statement by explaining it, or illustrating it, or proving it. His paragraph units in this sermon are lengthy, only thirteen paragraphs comprising this address of approximately 3,000 words. However, clarity is facilitated within these thought groupings by a liberal use of connectives. One typical paragraph of approximately 250 words is tied together with the following connecting phrases:

Although these hours . . .
 They remind us, too, . . . and that . . .
 But there is . . . there is . . .
 But there is also . . .
 Let us think then, . . .

Embellishment

The primary purpose of embellishment is to adorn or elevate through the judicious use of figurative elements in speech. It is

suggested that such an appropriate use of these elements of ornamentation is especially compatible with the aims of the speech to stimulate¹⁶--the speech type under which much of Macartney's preaching would fall.

The most frequently used form of embellishment in this sermon is the metaphor, with more than twenty expressions such as the following counted:

massive gates of circumstance
pit of destruction
citadel of the soul
ship of your soul
sin-ruined temple of man

A striking use of figurative analogy appears in a sentence quoted earlier where life's interests are called a fire "by whose flame you warmed and cheered your soul" which has gone out "leaving only the dull, cold, gray ashes on the hearth."

Of a similar nature is the picturing of one's prayers and firm resolves as seeming "ghastly in their impotence as they lie strewn about our feet."

A moderate use of alliteration is noted:

makes or mars
wreck and ruin
soul surrender
shock of soul
ship of your soul

Another figure, the polysyndeton--a figure occasioned by the liberal use of connectives--is employed for emphasis: "What we do, or say, or will, or accept, or refuse, influences our life ever after."

The following passage (with underscoring supplied) illustrates how in an emotional, ascending climax dealing with Christ's call to the

¹⁶Oliver, op. cit., p. 433. The comment of Socrates is recalled, "Oratory is the art of enchanting the soul."

soul, Macartney makes use of the language of embellishment--a simile to introduce the passage with also an effective use of alliteration and metaphor in succeeding lines. Attention is also called to the rhythmic cadence of this passage:

He called for them, stood and called, as the lover in the Song of Songs, but stood and called in vain. There is no greater moment in a man's life than when he feels a gentle impulsion toward God. The Spirit speaks many languages, and Christ has many secret paths to the door of a man's heart. He may come by the path of sickness, when the powers of life are spent, and dimly flickers the sinking flame of life; or he may approach through some one's death, or through the viewless winds of memory, or in the quiet hush of meditation or worship, when all the stars of our spiritual nature begin to glow and our whole nature has Godward tendencies; or he may come through storm and tempest and shipwreck, and in the quick flashing of his judgments; or he may come in the accents of a sermon such as this. God grant that he may!

Another method of achieving ornateness of style is the use of an ancient maxim, "the feet of the gods are shod with wool," or a literary allusion from a sonnet by Milton:

Yet I argue not
Against Heaven's hand or will, nor bate a jot
Of heart or hope; but still bear up and steer right onward.

Analysis of the Sermon, "The Woman Who Married the Wrong Man."

This sermon is taken as representative of the large number he has preached from a Biblical narrative. A brief outline of the story will be useful for this analysis. Three characters come upon the scene: David, pursued by the jealous King Saul, in hiding with a band of several hundred men in the south country; Nabal, a stupid but wealthy sheep owner; and Abigail, Nabal's astute and charming wife. The narrative as developed in this sermon is cast in a continuity of three steps so related as to produce dramatic action:¹⁷ (1) the idyllic scene of sheep-

¹⁷ See this study, p. 288 for comments on the dramatic continuity in Macartney's sermons.

shearing time in Palestine, (2) the element of conflict introduced by Nabal's insulting reply to David's requests for supplies, and (3) the resolution of the conflict by the swift action of Nabal's wife, whose gifts and eloquent plea turn David aside from his intended revenge.

Choice of Words

Macartney's mastery of words is revealed in this type of sermon in which description, action, and conflict are prominent. Visual, auditory, tactual, and kinesthetic imagery is employed repeatedly in the narrative and descriptive passages. The setting for sheepshearing time in Carmel is created with phrases as the following:

- a still, green and pleasant country
- black tents of the people
- red, yellow and blue headdresses
- bleating of the sheep
- sheep . . . thrown down on the platforms
- sound of the clippers
- fleecy wool
- thick and infinitely soft
- tables groaned with plenty
- singing . . . dancing . . . festive joy

Words "loaded" with emotional connotations create the contrast between Abigail (the heroine) and Nabal (the "wrong man" and villain):

charming, gracious lady	boorish, churlish, cruel wicked man
lovely voice, lovely face	drunken fool and beast
sweet disposition	coarse
wits, energies, charms	besotted fool and churl
gentle plea	Nabal sits drinking
beautiful, immortal plea	angry insult

The conflict element is intensified with a liberal sprinkling of "angry" words to depict the determined, onrushing David bent on revenge:

- countenance blanched
- wave of anger
- angry command
- great indignation
- anger and rage
- fierce revenge
- blood and death
- David's vengeance
- tramp, tramp, tramp of his soldiers

The feeling tone or mood of the sermon changes completely after Abigail's successful plea. Macartney personalizes his application of the lessons with a free use of first and second person pronouns: "I appeal to you . . . it will be no regret to you . . ." and calls into play those words rich with positive associations for his particular audience: God's House, God's Word, beholding Jesus, wounded for your transgressions, give your heart to him, eternal life, Savior, Guide, and Friend.

A word-by-word survey of this sermon confirms the previous impression of the relative simplicity of the vocabulary used by Macartney in his preaching. Entirely obscure words without contextual clues to their meaning do not occur. Out of a total of approximately 3500 words, the most complicated are: allusion, boorish, encountered, Bedouins, poaching, skulking, blanched, magnanimous, reconciliation, mien, evoked, and intercession. Where he deems it necessary to clarify a word, he does so: "Nabal had a seizure--a stroke."

For Macartney's particular audience, possessing as it did an above-average level of education, it is questionable whether any of these words as used in this sermon would have created a problem in the communication process.

Composition

This sermon offers a good example of Macartney's sentence construction in the narrative form. It seems obvious that he was composing here for the ear, rather than the eye, as is revealed by an orderly, unconfused development of sentences--simple and compound sentence-structure predominates. Where complex sentences are used, the dependent clause is simple, usually an adverbial clause as would be common in

narrative development:

- when Nabal hears their request . . .
- as he marched along, and heard behind him the tread of his armed men . . .

One notes a variety of short and long sentences. The longest sentence of eighty-eight words would have created no problem for the listening ear (which hears large units of thought, not sentences as such) because of the connecting words tying the separate elements into the larger unit:

From all parts of the nearby country the people had gathered to assist in the ritual of the sheep-shearing; and just as in the early days on the American farms the barnraising or the threshing season was a time of social intercourse, of joy as well as labor, when the tables groaned with plenty, and there was singing, and sometimes dancing, so in ancient Palestine--and still today--the sheepshearing season was a time of festive joy and reunion, of feasting and drinking and the giving of gifts.

It is interesting to note that in the retelling of the Biblical narrative, Macartney moves the action along with short, simple sentences, as can be seen from the brief topical sentences which introduce the paragraphs. His lead sentences almost create the skeletal outline of the narrative, as can be seen from a few examples taken in consecutive order:

- Here in this masterpiece of Old Testament biography we have the story of the Beauty and the Beast.
- It was a sad marriage for Abigail, as such marriages often are.
- It was sheepshearing time in Carmel, a still, green, and pleasant country south of Hebron.
- The news spread through the land that Nabal was shearing his three thousand sheep.
- Some of David's followers brought word to him that Nabal was shearing his sheep.
- The sheepshearing and the accompanying festivities were well under way when David's messengers arrived.

The clear-cut, simple structure of these topical sentences makes for clarity in the narrative, an important ingredient of successful oral communication.

Another facet of composition comes to view in the noticeable lack of contractions such as "I'll", "can't", "shouldn't", which are common to oral style. Anticipating somewhat the discussion of "oral versus written style" which has been reserved for the analysis of the two tape-recorded sermons available for such a comparison, it may be noted at this point that from a study of the tape-recordings available, it is almost certain that the following bit of informal soliloquy would have used the contractions:

Never heard of David, never heard of the son of Jesse, did he?
 Thinks we are runaway slaves, vagabonds, eh? Well, we will teach him a lesson.

The introduction of a few such contractions would have contributed to ease and spontaneity of style.¹⁸

Embellishment

The first half of this sermon, occupied with a retelling of the swift-moving narrative of David, Nabal, and Abigail evinces little in the way of ornamentation. An instance of personification ("relentless and sleepless jealousy"), of alliteration, not necessarily planned, ("sheep shorn"), and a metaphor ("revenge flaming in his heart") is the extent of the figurative elements employed. In the latter half of the sermon, in which Macartney draws his lessons and applies them, there is an increase in "the language of power" in keeping with his purpose. The rhetorical question, the metaphor ("scroll of yesterday," "keen edge of

¹⁸See discussion on the characteristics of oral style in Sarett, Foster, and Sarett, op. cit., pp. 345ff.

adversity," "cup of joy") and two instances of the apostrophe are called upon to add beauty and emotional force to this part of the address.

An emotional climax is achieved near the close by use of the epanaphora (in which the same words are "gracefully and emphatically repeated"¹⁹):

I appeal to you now on the ground of those things, that course of conduct, those choices and decisions, which you will never regret. It will be no regret to you that you did not forget God, but "remembered thy Creator in the days of thy youth," and in middle life, and in old age. It will be no regret to you that you did not neglect God's Word, God's Holy Day, God's House of Worship. It will be no regret to you that you did not forget the poor and the oppressed and the afflicted. [The series is extended by another three such sentences.]

The passage then culminates in an apostrophe:

Answer me, enthroned and blessed saints in heaven, and tell me if any of these things caused you a moment's regret! I know what ye will say. I know that ye will answer that those deeds, those choices or decisions, those good things that you did, those evil things you did not, have rather brought you peace of spirit and added to your cup of joy in the heavenly places!

Macartney's "geyserlike jets" of impassioned utterance are most frequently found, as one might expect, at those points where he seeks to make a personal application of the message. Observe in a similar passage the balance and cadence achieved:

Perhaps you are discouraged, or even rebellious. God's way with you seems hard. Your Life seems to you useless and all your efforts futile. Be of good cheer! God who created you has high things in store for you. Be faithful! Hold back your hand from evil and your heart from unbelief! Wait, I say, on the Lord, and be of good courage, and he will bring it to pass!

Although Macartney sweeps over a broad range of moods in this presentation, he maintains a language style appropriate to his audience, his subject, and the occasion--a style likewise consistent with the speaker's age, position, and personality:

¹⁹Thonssen and Baird, op. cit., p. 422.

III Analysis of the sermon, "The Doom of Evil."

The present sermon was available for study in the form of a voice recording made at the time of its presentation at the First Church of Pittsburgh, October 21, 1951. In its published form it appeared in the book Strange Texts But Grand Truths, which was published in 1953.²⁰ This makes possible, therefore, a comparison of Macartney's oral style in the preaching of the sermon with the published version.

Employing an unusual passage of Scripture as his point of departure--"The mule that was under him went away."²¹ Macartney poses the proposition that evil betrays the evil-doer--that "ultimately everything that the evil man, the ungodly man, depends upon goes from under him, and in the end he is left forsaken and alone. . . ." The proposition is largely supported by lessons drawn from the narrative of Absalom's rebellion against his father, David, and the eventual denouement of Absalom's career as suggested by the text. Several allusions to Biblical examples of a similar character, as well as two examples from history, play a supporting role in the development of his thesis.

This case study of the speaker's use of language proceeds with an examination of the constituents of style: word choice, composition, and embellishment, applying such criteria of communicative language as clarity, ease, vividness, and force. An additional section deals with the speaker's emphasis of oral style as it might come to view in a

²⁰See Appendix V.

²¹II Samuel 18:9. Of his use of the "striking and unusual texts" used in this series Macartney observed: "The very fact that an unusual text arouses the curiosity of the hearer and causes him to wonder what can be made of such a text, what lesson for time and eternity can be drawn from it, will certainly be no handicap to the preacher." Foreword, Strange Texts but Grand Truths, 1953.

comparison of the voice recorded sermon with the published version.

Choice of Words

Macartney's published sermons exhibit the careful attention he gave to a correct use of words. The present voice-recorded sermon is no exception. The words are in good taste and provincialisms or archaisms (with the possible exception of the twice-occurring "yonder") do not appear.

Clarity and intelligibility are also facilitated by the use of a relatively simple vocabulary--the least common words appearing in the following three expressions: "stones of detestation and execration," "blackguard son," and "ethereal mantle."

A generally unpretentious vocabulary coupled with an almost exclusive use of active rather than passive verbs contribute a quality of forcefulness appropriate to the theme and the narrative materials employed in its development.

The persuasive value of Macartney's preaching is enhanced on the present occasion by the use of vivid word imagery--words associated with sensory experience. Among the verbs with sensory connotations are the following: "clambering," "trampled," "fled," "cast into the pit," "rush for fame," "sprang the rebellion," and "rooted out." Image-provoking adjectives include: "thwarted," "deserted," "lordly," "ethereal," "moving," "pathetic," and "grim and crumbling." Nouns such as the following are also image-provoking: "lamentation," "ruins," "horde," "heaps," "wreck," and "splendor."

An earlier case study took note of an extensive use of "loaded" words by means of which a negative or positive feeling tone is created with respect to an object, person, attitude, or point of view. A notable

use of this technique of persuasive address is observed in this sermon. An illustration is provided by the expressions associated with the person and life history of Absalom, the speaker's chief exhibit in support of his proposition that evil betrays the evil-doer.

dissipated and backguard son
 utterly selfish man
 stones of detestation and execration
 sad misnomer
 father of woe and shame
 false and hypocritical
 rebel army

It would appear that the speaker's choice of words in this sermon is above adverse criticism with respect to their persuasive value as well as to their propriety. Such word choice as is noted in the foregoing sections is entirely appropriate to the speaker's subject, to the speaker himself in terms of his status, his age, and his role in the present speaking situation, as well as to the audience addressed.

Composition

Several instances of ambiguity resulting from faulty reference of pronouns or placement of modifiers appear in this voice recorded sermon. Perhaps his audience, for the most part Biblically-literate, would have had no problem understanding the intent of the opening sentence: "The mule that was under him went away, and there he was left hanging between the heaven and the earth," but the published version is certainly a clearer, improved statement of introduction permitting no question as to who "was left hanging:" "The mule that was under him went away. He always does! And there Absalom hangs. . . ." In a later restatement of this portion of the narrative, a dangling participial phrase appears: "But going through the wood, the branches of this great oak caught his head." Another instance of an ambiguous reference of modifier and

antecedent which could easily have caused confusion to the listener has to do with the Aaron Burr example: "And his mother, the gifted daughter of Jonathan Edwards, whom Aaron Burr rightly described as the one clear mind that America produced . . ." The antecedent of the "clear mind" characterization is clear in the published version.

However, careful listening to the other voice-recorded sermons which were made available for this study would indicate that the problem of modifiers and antecedents apparent on this occasion was not a serious one with Macartney.

In other aspects of composition, it is noted that Macartney's style embodies the direct, active mood in this sermon. The speaker's choice between loose and periodic sentences favors the loose construction by a three to one ratio. Transitional markers, obvious throughout the sermon, contribute to clarity and a sense of onward movement, as may be seen by the following key phrases taken from his primary example:

Now, here is Absalom. . . .
First of all . . . he had a magnificent body. . . .
 He had great abilities also. . . .
 He had also high ambitions. . . .
And yet . . . he goes down in ruin. . . .
Now how can we account for that?
First of all. . . .
Again. . . .
 Absalom too. . . .
 It goes without saying, too. . . .
So, the ungodly man loses out. . . .

Sentence length in this sermon, which averages twenty-eight words per sentence, generally exceeds that suggested as characteristic of effective oral style.²²

²²Gordon Thomas has shown that a direct positive correlation exists between oral style and the intelligibility of speech. In his study, in a speech evaluated as possessing a maximum of those qualities characteristic of oral style, sentence length averaged 19.8 words per sentence. Speech Monographs, XXIII (March, 1956), pp. 46ff.

The punctuation of a sermon transcribed from a recording is

Of the eighty-three sentences in this relatively short sermon, twenty-eight sentences contained thirty or more words, eighteen sentences were over forty words in length, and eight exceeded fifty words. It is to be noted, however, that with the exception of two sentences with parenthetical elements, the longer sentences (employed largely in the narrative portion of the address) are of simple construction with plainly-distinguished thought units held together by simple connectives, as in the following (emphasis supplied):

Fleeing from the battle in which the rebel army had been defeated, Absalom, going through the wood was caught by his head in the boughs of a great oak and his mule went from under him, and there he was left hanging--just waiting for the three fatal darts from the hand of Joab and then to be cast into that pit in the wood and to be covered with the stones of detestation and execration as the soldiers of the victorious armies march by.

Another lengthy sentence, (cited to illustrate how the speaker resumed his train of thought following an explanatory interjection) was not difficult to follow as actually spoken, although one might suggest some editing for reading ease:

Another man in the Bible who had no reverence for himself was Esau, and the great sentence in the New Testament says of him, "that profane person"--not profane in the sense that he was taking the name of God in vain, although he may have done that, but profane in the literal sense that he was unfenced, that there was nothing sacred to him; everything was common ground and territory.--that profane man who for one morsel of pottage sold his birthright.

Variety is achieved by an intermingling of shorter sentences--thirty-six were under twenty words in length. Short sentences in this

subject to considerable individuality of treatment. There would appear to be validity in Tompkins belief that researchers need to discover the oral unit of expression because a perfect sentence on paper is not necessarily a perfect unit for oral transmission. "After all, as we have seen, there is nothing in natural spoken English that correlates with what we know as a sentence on paper." Philip K. Tompkins, "Rhetorical Criticism: Wrong Medium?" Central States Speech Journal, XIII, no. 2. Winter, 1962, p. 94.

sermon were often used to introduce a new point (as in his analysis of the steps in Absalom's downfall), and may be said in this way to act somewhat like the accent in music or the high light of a picture.

Embellishment

As noted, a study of what has been termed "embellishment" in public address is particularly concerned with the use of figurative speech as it is employed to adorn or elevate the address.

The sermon, "The Doom of Evil," while not lacking in elements of ornamentation, is seen to be of a plainer style than the two previously examined. However, one notes a moderate use of various forms of figurative speech. Metaphor and simile, implied and explicit comparison, comprise the majority of instances where figurative speech occurs:

trampled underfoot every natural affection
his life is an echo of that conclusion
father of woe and shame
stones of detestation and execration
grinding like a beast.

An unobtrusive use of alliteration (the grouping together of words with the same initial sound or the same sound in stressed syllables) appears in such forms as the following:

pleasing, persuasive personality
brilliant, blackguard son
remembered only as a wreck and ruin
shame and sorrow
sighed and said
tomb without a tenant
timely and timeless

Several instances of personification were observed: "The sun's rays salute it," "the moon casts her ethereal mantle over it," and "that mule preaches a timely and timeless sermon." One also notes several uses of synecdoche in expressions such as "seize the crown" or "rise to the throne." Literary allusions or poetry, frequently introduced by

Macartney for embellishment, were not employed on this occasion.

It would appear that the speaker sought to create an air of serious purpose and earnest warning in this message, and for that reason may have elected a plainer, less ornate style.

Oral Style

In comparing Dr. Macartney's speaking style as represented by the voice-recordings with his published sermons, one must be aware of certain factors pertaining to Macartney's preparation and sermon delivery as well as to the process of sermon publication.

As noted in chapter V, Macartney's practice was to write out on successive days, increasingly expanded outlines of his sermon; then the sermon was put into final form by dictating it to his secretary, who typed the script as Dr. Macartney, pacing the floor of his study, composed and articulated his message."²³ It was this script, with the preacher's editorial touches, which became the basis for the published version of the sermon.

It was Macartney's contention that his published sermons fairly closely represented what was actually preached. This may be seen from comments appearing in his contribution to a work entitled Writing For the Religious Market, edited by Roland E. Wolseley. The latter, corresponding with Macartney regarding a chapter dealing with books of sermons, asked Macartney specifically to comment on the style of a sermon prepared for publication: "Is there no difference in the text of

²³Interview with Macartney's former secretary, (Mrs.) Ruth Tabler, May, 1965. One observer described Macartney's practice as follows: "He dictates his entire literary output to his secretaries . . . who sit at a typewriter in his big church study while he strides up and down a fiery red carpet delivering his thoughts in slow, deep, oracular tones. However, when he mounts the church's pulpit he takes neither sermon copies nor notes." "Biography," The Bulletin Index, XV (February 16, 1946), 128.

a spoken and a printed sermon? What do you recommend a preacher do with a sermon after he preaches it, if he wishes to publish it in a book? Does he change 'isn't' to 'is not?' and so on."²⁴

Two paragraphs from Macartney's chapter in this book appear to deal with Wolseley's query. Macartney explained that, "In the sermon as preached and spoken there will be some things which ought to be deleted when the sermon is printed, particularly allusions to local events and current happenings." He did not advocate, however, that all local color be removed from the sermon and added, "The more the printed sermon retains of the form and spirit of the spoken sermon, the more acceptable it will be to the reader."²⁵ Macartney proceeded then to comment specifically on the style of spoken and printed sermons:

The style and the method of preachers vary, and for that reason there will be some sermons which require drastic changes before being printed, while others can be printed almost as they were spoken. My own printed and published sermons . . . through the years have appeared with almost no changes from the sermon as written, dictated, and preached.²⁶

A comparison of Macartney's sermon typescripts with their published version generally confirms his comments regarding the correspon-

²⁴Letter dated July 29, 1955, Macartney Files.

²⁵C. E. Macartney, "Books of Sermons and Devotional Books," Writing For the Religious Market, ed. Roland E. Wolseley, (New York: Association Press, 1956), p. 211.

²⁶Ibid., p. 212. The question concerning contractions raised by Wolseley was not answered. Contractions, a characteristic of oral style, rarely appear in either the published sermons or typescripts although they are evident in the recordings. Whether the secretary unconsciously "corrected" these as she proceeded is not known; perhaps Dr. Macartney kept in mind that he was dictating for possible publication as well as for oral presentation and therefore did not include some of the more informal, conversational elements of language style which are apparent in the voice-recorded versions.

dence of the two, although in some, the modifications are more pronounced than the above-quoted comment would indicate.

Since Macartney did not memorize his sermons, although they were delivered entirely without notes,²⁷ one might expect modifications as well as the interpolation of additional concepts or amplification of the same. It may be shown that the majority of these modifications are in the direction of those aspects of style already alluded to which have generally been thought to reflect the oral rather than the written emphasis--those which are more personal and direct; factors involving repetition or instant intelligibility; and trends toward greater informality through contractions, colloquialisms, fragmentations and minor deviations from formal grammar.

The contrast can be observed in the following parallel presentation of certain excerpts from this sermon, "The Doom of Evil."²⁸

Printed:

Absalom was totally lacking, too, in the third reverence--reverence for God. His dramatic story covers many pages in the Old Testament; and yet in nothing that Absalom says is there the slightest reference to God.

Recording:

The voice-recorded version, more expansive in style, amplifies the point somewhat and also takes on a tone of ease and informality through the introduction of the personal pronoun and contractions:

It goes without saying, too, that he had no reverence for God. If you'll look in this second book of Samuel, you'll see that the story of Absalom covers many pages, but there is one striking fact about that record and that is that, save in one instance, there is no reference on the part of Absalom to God, and that one instance

²⁷See this study pp. 164ff.

²⁸See a similar comparison on pp. 360ff.

was false and hypocritical.

Printed:

There is always a fascination about ruins. We like to clamber over old moated castles and ruined forts.

Recorded:

The recorded version, again more expansive in style, reflects also a personal and informal tone (deviating at one point from formal grammar in the agreement of tenses [underlining]):

I suppose that nearly all of us here, if we have had the opportunity, will find that old ruins have a fascination for us. We like to clamber over old moated castles and fortifications and think of the life that was lived within those grim and now crumbling walls, of the battles and sieges which took place there.

Printed:

The advice is good, except for that one clause, "in defiance of the Decalogue." Absalom defied the Decalogue.

Recorded:

Again the modification is in the direction of the colloquial and informal style of spoken rather than written language:

Well, that was good advice to stir their ambition except for that one clause, "in defiance of the Decalogue." It's a dangerous thing to defy the Decalogue and Absalom found that out.

The question may arise: Was Macartney capable of maintaining the level of stylistic excellence one observes in the published sermons? The reader is reminded that the manuscripts submitted for publication were originally dictated extemporaneously in his study before public delivery and required but minor editing.²⁹ Furthermore, as this sermon demonstrates, modifications and interpolations appearing in the sermon as publicly delivered would indicate that Macartney's abilities of composition carried over into the pulpit.

²⁹Supra, p. 323ff. See also appendix VII.

Summary--Persuasion Through Language

Macartney's use of language in persuasion (or style) was studied from the standpoint of word choice, composition, and embellishment against the criteria of clarity, ease, vividness, and force. The summary is based on a detailed analysis of three selected sermons and also upon a larger survey of some four hundred published sermons.

Clarity and forcefulness of style were achieved by the speaker's choice of simple, strong, dignified English, but with a vocabulary sufficiently broad and varied to have commended him to his educated auditors.

The choice of concrete words, vivid in imagery or sensory detail, contributed to an intensification and clarification of listener-experience. Emotional responses were facilitated by suggestion through the use of loaded words where appropriate to the subject matter.

Composition, as represented by sentence structure, generally adhered to the normal requirements for intelligibility with simple and compound sentences predominating. Although sentences tended to be longer than what has been recommended for oral style, transitional markers designated the compact thought groupings in an easy to follow sequence. Structural adaptations--inverted sentence order, the rhetorical question, parallelism, repetition, and antithetical structure--contributed variety, vividness, and force to the presentation of the speaker's subject matter. Paragraphs, as reflected in the published sermons, were lengthy (particularly in the narrative sections), and were generally developed from a clearly-phrased topical sentence.

Macartney's style may be described as ornate, although ornamentation appears to be subordinate to content, playing a supplementary

role. The special care given to matters of style is evident from the fresh and vivid figurative elements consistently employed--metaphor, simile, alliteration, personification, synecdoche, epanaphora, asyndeton, and polysyndeton in particular.

Frequently, passages in Macartney's sermons are seen to approach a poetic cadence and beauty--his use of poetry, his literary allusions, a unique reliance upon the apostrophe, and various forms of structural climax, were reminiscent of the grand style of past pulpit masters.

From this description, it may be seen that Macartney made successful use of the "language of power" adapted to the speech to stimulate.

VI Sermon Analysis--Persuasion Through Delivery

That effective persuasive speaking is dependent on both content and delivery has long been recognized. Aristotle observed that, "It is not enough to know what to say--one must know also how to say it. The right way of doing this contributes much to the right impression of a speech . . . Success in delivery is of the utmost importance to the effect of a speech."¹

Delivery, which may be regarded as everything the speaker does physically to communicate his message, is not only a major factor in conveying speech content to the audience but also is a factor in determining the ethos of the speaker. Competence in delivery enhances the speaker's prestige, while weakness in delivery definitely handicaps him.

Because persuasion demands sustained attention to the logically and psychologically developing message, the best delivery is inconspicuous. In persuasion, any delivery detail which would break into that attention would be damaging.

In a study of delivery, or any other specific aspect of a speaker's practice, it is well to remember that "persuasion is always situational--drawing much of its effectiveness from the precise situation in which it occurs."² For this reason the inadequacies of an evaluation of delivery factors in isolation from the actual speech situation must be acknowledged. Nevertheless, in an assessment of the elements of persuasion in the speaking of Dr. Clarence Macartney, an attempt must be made.

¹Lane Cooper, trans., The Rhetoric of Aristotle (New York: Appleton-Century-Crofts, Inc. 1932), pp. 182f.

²Oliver, The Psychology of Persuasive Speech, p. 367

A study of the delivery factors in the preaching of Dr. Clarence E. Macartney would include an examination of the mode of delivery as well as an analysis of the oral code of communication (vocal elements), and the visible code (general appearance and bodily movement).

Mode of Delivery

Macartney was convinced that extemporaneous preaching without notes was the most effective, a practice which he followed from his seminary days onward.³ According to his testimony, although the sermon was not memorized, the careful writing and rewriting of the manuscript before its final dictation to the secretary usually guaranteed a rather close correspondence between the preached sermon and the typescript.⁴ As already noted, this mode of delivery appears definitely to have enhanced the personal appeal of the speaker and to have encouraged those elements associated with oral style as opposed to written style.

Assistants, describing this aspect of Macartney's preaching, suggest the following.⁵

"Since he preached without notes, he had a direct appeal unto his people."

"His delivery was slow and deliberate, without notes, and therefore very direct and forceful."

"Marvelous eye contact with his audience. He did not use notes."

"He made people feel as though he were talking directly to them. He used the full sweep of his pivotal position [the elevated pulpit] to include all."

³See this study, p. 29.

⁴See this study, pp. 323ff.

⁵Comments taken from replies to a questionnaire mailed to Macartney's assistants. See Appendix X.

"Dr. Macartney preached without notes and constantly maintained an eye contact with his audience. He didn't seem to look at any particular part of the congregation exclusively and felt free to move in the pulpit from one direction to the other."

It is evident from these reports that our speaker was successful in surmounting some of the possible handicaps to effective communication inherent in the physical setting of First Church as described earlier in this chapter. Preaching without notes, Macartney was able to command the attention of, and maintain a direct and personal contact with, all sections of his somewhat segmented audience.

An additional factor significant for persuasion in Macartney's mode of delivery was the "ethical proof" engendered by his consistent handling of all public speaking appointments without resorting to the use of notes. Parishioners wrote admiringly of his ability to speak without notes, of his "phenomenal memory," as well as of the poise, dignity, and self-assurance communicated by his manner in the pulpit.⁶

The Visible Code

Apart from a few scattered descriptions, clues to Macartney's visible code of communication while in his Pittsburgh pulpit were not readily available.⁷ Therefore, in the questionnaire directed to 100 parishioners of the First Presbyterian Church of Pittsburgh who heard Dr. Macartney regularly, a section was devoted to questions pertaining to aspects of his delivery. The results, tabulated in appendices, provide

⁶See Appendix XI-C.

⁷Whitesell gave this description of Macartney preaching to an assembly of ministers at Princeton Seminary in 1946: "He preached entirely without manuscript or notes. Standing midway between the pulpit and the reading desk, out of reach of either, with his whole figure from the top of his head to the soles of his shoes in view, he poured out his soul." Faris D. Whitesell, The Art of Biblical Preaching, p. 145.

a basis for certain generalizations useful to our purposes.

General Appearance

Under this head, comment is made on matters of dress, physical build, facial expression, and the "presence" of the speaker.

Dr. Macartney is described as always appropriately and neatly attired, well-groomed, and "conservative." In the pulpit he wore a black Geneva gown over his business suit, white shirt, and black tie. On special occasions, as on Communion and Easter Sundays, he wore the clerical collar and bands.

Of medium height and stocky build, he is described as "stalwart" and "manly." The most noticeable features of his expressive face were the deep-set, piercing eyes, craggy eye brows, and large, "thoughtful forehead."⁸ Standing erect in the pulpit, calm, poised, and with "kingly dignity,"⁹ he "breathed authority."¹⁰ His general appearance, from comments of his parishioners, was apparently congruent with their expectations of one occupying the ministerial office: "He looked like a preacher."¹¹

Bodily Movement

There is almost universal agreement on the part of those who observed Macartney in the pulpit that his gestures, while graceful and effective when employed, were limited to a few hand and arm movements. Several, commenting on his restrained, conservative use of bodily move-

⁸Description by Paul Rhodes, Interview, June, 1965, Hayward, California.

⁹Respondent #1.

¹⁰Paul Rhodes interview, June, 1965, Hayward, California.

¹¹Respondent #34.

ment, suggested that the content of his sermons so interested them that they were unaware of his bodily action in the pulpit.¹² That his gestures did not detract attention from his message is evident also from the fact that a few reported observing no use of gestures whatever. Likewise, there were no reports of any noticeable pulpit mannerisms.

The Audible Code

In the appraisal of Dr. Macartney's vocal production, attention must be given to such factors as volume and projection, articulation, tone quality, rate, and pitch level.

For this aspect of Macartney's delivery we are not entirely dependent upon the reports and memories of observers; but through the miracle of the tape-recording, we are able to hear again the voice of our speaker. Unfortunately, however, no recordings earlier than 1951 (when Dr. Macartney was in his seventy-second year) were obtainable for this study.¹³ The limitations to accuracy of voice reproduction in the recordings are recognized--differences in the machines used in recording

¹²See Appendix XI-C.

¹³A former assistant, Navy Chaplain Stewart P. Robinson, has in his possession a large quantity of Sound-Scriber recordings (1946-1952) which it was hoped would be available for study; however, his duties abroad prevented his return to this country in time to procure them from storage.

Six tape recordings were made available by another assistant, the Rev. James H. Blackstone, Jr. They are listed below:

1. "Moses, the Kind of Man the Nation and the Church Need Today," preached October 21, 1951, morning.
2. "The Doom of Evil," preached October 21, 1951, evening.
3. "O God, Give Me What it Takes," Tuesday noon, October 23, 1951.
4. "Turning Souls to Righteousness," June 22, 1952.
5. "Men and Women Christ Changed--A Blind Man," September 28, 1952.
6. "A Leper White as Snow," November 16, 1952.

A seventh recording was obtained from Reigner Recording Library, Union Theological Seminary, Richmond, Virginia.

7. "Come Before Winter," October 12, 1952.

and in playing back the recordings will of course affect such factors as pitch, rate, and quality, while the volume is largely in the control of the one making or playing the recordings. In spite of these limitations, the recordings do make possible fairly accurate general observations, an intensive, scientific analysis of vocal factors in Macartney's delivery being outside the purview of this study.

Volume and Projection

To judge from the recordings whether or not Macartney's volume of vocal production was adequate for the edifice in which he spoke would be to go beyond the available evidence because of the limitations of the recording for such a purpose. It may be said, however, that the clear impression gained from listening to the recorded sermons is that he employed sufficient vocal force to be clearly understood in all sections where listeners might be seated in First Church.

This observation appears to be confirmed by the reports of those who actually heard him preach. A former assistant described Macartney's voice as a "vibrant, well-controlled voice that can fill any auditorium and express any kind of emotion."¹⁴ Parishioners likewise, in responding to the questionnaire, without exception describe his voice as adequate in volume and with a carrying quality that communicated his message clearly at all levels: "His voice carried in both high and low tones."¹⁵

At no place in the recordings does he appear to be reaching his maximum potential volume. He does not shout. One described him, "an easy speaker, he didn't yell."¹⁶

¹⁴Clyde Henry, Introduction, The Making of a Minister, p. 21.

¹⁵Respondent #32.

¹⁶Respondent #22.

Articulation

Macartney's speech in the recordings appears to be entirely free of articulatory defects. Substandard pronunciations were also largely absent from his speech (although his pronunciation of Israel with the soft "s" is seldom thus heard from the pulpit today). There appears to be sufficient movement of the tongue, lips, teeth, and jaws for precise articulation. Several respondents volunteered that the speaker's "diction" was "good," "excellent," "perfect," or "distinct,"¹⁷

Tone Quality

Quality has been defined as "that characteristic of the voice which results from the total effect of the resonators upon it."¹⁸ It is that characteristic of the voice which gives it timbre of tone and causes people to react to it as pleasant or unpleasant. It is a highly subjective factor and is interpreted in part by the listener's reaction to the speaker's personality. In the judgment of this observer, the recordings reveal a voice with a pleasing balance between mouth and nasal resonance. Parishioners of First Church described it variously as a "wonderful voice, who can describe it?" "inspiring," "interesting," "attractive," "pleasing to me," "monotonous" and "unemotional."¹⁹

The two last-mentioned characterizations crop up again in the discussion of pitch level and of rate. At this point, it may be said, however, that a conversational tone quality, such as would demonstrate a sensitive response to varying emotional states is largely absent from

¹⁷ Respondents #41, #44, #50, #18.

¹⁸ Robert T. Oliver, Rupert L. Cortright, and Cyril F. Hager, The New Training for Effective Speech (New York: The Dryden Press, 1946), p. 227.

¹⁹ Respondents #22, #33, #46, #4, #51, #40, #5.

the recordings studied. The tonal quality is suggestive, rather, of what has been sometimes called the "ministerial tone," with the full, orotund tone prevailing.

Rate

Rate is the term that is used to designate the speaker's speed of utterance. A rate of 125 words per minute is designated as "normal,"²⁰ although the more important consideration here is whether a speaker's rate of utterance is varied to suit the subject matter, mood, purpose, and audience situation, or whether it remains constant. It is suggested that variety in rate is useful in serving the following functions: "(1) to help make clear the speaker's meaning; (2) to punctuate his sentences; (3) to mark transitions from one idea to another; (4) to emphasize important ideas; (5) and to assist in holding the audiences' attention."²¹

Macartney's vocal delivery as reflected in the recordings must be described as slow and deliberate, proceeding at a steady, constant pace with a minimum of variety.

A report of the words-per-minute rates of three sermons gives a clearer indication. The sermon "The Doom of Evil"²² which totaled 2,265 words, averaged 98.4 words per minute and reached a rate of 128 words per minute at one point, reducing to eighty-eight words per minute. The over-all rate of a sermon of 3,400 words preached at a morning

²⁰Oliver, Cortright, and Hager, op. cit., p. 227.

²¹Ibid., p. 226.

²²See Appendix V for text of this sermon preached in an evening service at First Church on October 21, 1951.

service²³ was 114.6 words per minute, accelerating to 140 words per minute and reducing at one point to seventy-seven words per minute. A ten-minute sermon preached to the Tuesday Noon Men's Club²⁴ averaged 125 words per minute. Of the seven recordings studied, this brief message reflected the most rapid delivery and greatest variety in rate of utterance. While no significant correlation between content and rate was noticeable in the other recordings studied, on this occasion Macartney indicated somewhat a mood of excitement and animation as he related the account of the return of the Prodigal Son, accelerating his rate of utterance to 140 words per minute.

Reports from former assistants whose periods of association with Dr. Macartney cover various points in his career, would tend to confirm an impression of a slower than average rate of vocal delivery on the part of our subject of study:

"rate of utterance was rather slow."²⁵

"deliberate and rather slow."²⁶

"deliberate and slower than average."²⁷

While Macartney appears usually to have spoken somewhat more slowly than the normal rate for public speech, he did not hesitate or falter but moved along at a steady pace with only slight pauses for phrasing and the marking of thought terminals. The pause, as a controlled communicative function, was not detected in the recordings studied.

In the opinion of this observer, Macartney's slow, deliberate,

²³"Turning Souls to Righteousness," sermon preached June 22, 1952.

²⁴"O God, Give Me What It Takes," sermon preached October 23, 1951.

²⁵Harold Ockenga, correspondence, October 18, 1965.

²⁶James H. Blackstone, Jr., correspondence, October 22, 1965.

²⁷C. Ralston Smith, correspondence, October 21, 1965.

and somewhat constant pace of vocal delivery would have militated against attention and interest factors, as well as such emotional responses as are known to be facilitated by variety in rate of utterance.

Pitch Level

The expectations of pitch level are that it shall be appropriate to the speaker's sex and age and that it shall demonstrate an appropriate variety of level or inflection.²⁸

Macartney's voice may be described as a deep baritone. His pitch level as observed in the recordings, was characteristic of those conventional forms of pulpit address where, to signal reverence, solemnity, and perhaps dogmatic assurance, a somewhat monotonous inflectional pattern rather than a communicative, conversational quality has resulted.

Pertinent to this aspect of Macartney's audible code are certain studies by descriptive linguists who have noted that the English language uses four significant levels of relative pitch as a part of the sound-structure of the language:

Pitch as used in language is heard around a limited number of points rather than as a continuum.

Extensive testing of spoken English material has convinced us of the correctness of the independent conclusions of Pike and Wells that there are four pitch phonemes in English.²⁹

These four levels are designated simply as pitch level "one" for the lowest and "two," "three," and "four" for successively higher levels. Level "one" is that level at which, for example, the speaker normally indicates a thought terminus as at the end of a declarative sentence. Pitch level "two" represents the speaker's median pitch in speaking, the

²⁸Oliver, Cortright, and Hagen, op. cit., p. 226f.

²⁹George L. Trager and Henry Lee Smith, Jr., An Outline of English Structure (Norman: Battenburg Press, 1951), pp. 41ff.

level at which most sentences are begun, while pitch level "three" would indicate that rise in pitch which accompanies stress or emphasis. Extreme stress or emphasis is indicated by pitch level "four." In normal public speaking a variety of pitch levels one, two, and three predominates. Variations within each level are recognized, but these are not of a nature to gainsay the concept of the four distinct levels as opposed to that of a continuum.

Macartney habitually moved within a single octave, almost one octave below "middle C." According to the recordings studied, he began the sermon at his median level, with pitch level two prevailing. But as he warmed to his subject, he moved into a constant melodic pattern: he entered the sentence at his pitch level three, a level which was sustained with only slight variation to the end of the sentence or thought grouping, when he dropped decisively to level one. Only infrequently is this level broken by the additional stress of pitch level four, or the more relaxed pitch level two. The heavy downward inflection at the thought terminals coupled with the stress note of the sustained pitch level three created a sense of authoritarian urgency and finality.

The persuasive effectiveness of Macartney's wide use of narrative and description would seem to have been impeded by this rather unimaginative, stereotyped, inflectional pattern.³⁰

³⁰As noted earlier, Macartney believed that preaching without notes would facilitate a conversational delivery and prevent the preacher from falling "into the singsong monotony which mars the effect of many a good sermon." He drew attention to the need of variety in pitch and rate of utterance (this study, p. 167). In this instance it appears that his practice (though he was probably not aware of it) did not measure up to his theory.

An assistant wrote: "His style tended to be declamatory and oratorical rather than conversational. His voice tended to become somewhat monotonous." Correspondence from Paul Rhodes, October 14, 1965.

A parishioner described his voice as "monotonous," but observed that

Summary--Persuasion Through Delivery

Analysis of delivery factors in the preaching of Dr. Clarence Macartney included a study of his mode of delivery and aspects of his visible and audible code of communication.

Preaching extemporaneously, without any notes whatever, Macartney maintained "eye contact" with all parts of his audience. His appearance and demeanor in the pulpit conveyed a sense of self-assurance, dignity, and authority, in keeping with the expectations of his audience.

Macartney's bodily movement while preaching was conservative and restrained, his gestures, appropriate, effective, and unobtrusive. His vocal delivery was adequate with respect to quality, volume, and articulation; however, his delivery suffered in communicative directness and flexibility due to inadequacy of vocal variety in pitch level and rate. A somewhat monotonous and stereotyped inflectional pattern militated against the fullest vocal emphasis of the intellectual and emotional content of his sermons.

"after a long time one did not notice this and could listen with undivided attention. However, until that time I was inclined to have a wandering mind." Respondent #40.

CHAPTER VII

AN ANALYSIS OF THE SERMON, "COME BEFORE WINTER"

The selection of Macartney's best-known sermon, "Come Before Winter," for detailed analysis was almost inevitable, not only because of its value as a case study in persuasion but because of its unique history. Published in a special brochure by Abingdon-Cokesbury Press as "The Sermon With a History," this address was given annually, usually during the month of October, from the time of its first presentation in 1915 at Arch Street Presbyterian Church in Philadelphia until 1955, when it was preached for the last time at the First Prebyterian Church in Pittsburgh on the fortieth anniversary of its first presentation.¹

It will be seen at once that in certain aspects, particularly those surrounding its public presentation, the sermon cannot be regarded as typical. The annual fall presentation, with the attendant publicity and audience conditioning, was, of course, unique with this sermon.²

However, a study of "Come Before Winter" would seem to be justified not only as being one illustration of Macartney's practice, even if

¹Letter From Mrs. Ruth Tabler, Macartney's former secretary, dated July 27, 1965.

²Lest it be thought that the purpose of this case study be simply an additional basis for generalizing with respect to Macartney's practice, it should be observed that Chapter VI is offered as a basis for such generalization, being based upon a survey of a large number of sermons. Again, it should be emphasized that the purpose of this chapter is to provide a detailed examination of essentially all aspects of Macartney's practice in one given instance. In a sense, therefore, these two chapters are complementary--one providing a basis for generalization, the other a basis for intensive, detailed observation of his practice in a given instance.

somewhat atypical, but actually as an example which in many respects was typical of Macartney's overall approach. His flair for the dramatic has already been noted. The idea of an annual fall sermon tying in the brevity and frailty of life with the seasonal motif is typical of this speaker, who appeared to be alert to any means which he might legitimately employ to dramatize his message. Because of its repeated presentation, one might conclude that we have in "Come Before Winter" a highly refined and polished, and therefore atypical, Macartney production. In reality, it appears that the sermon varied but very little in composition across the years. This may be seen from a comparison of the earlier printed version with the recorded version of 1952 or from a study of typescripts on file in the Macartney Memorial Library.³

In the opinion of this investigator, then, the sermon per se is actually one such as Macartney might readily have been able to produce for any one normal preaching assignment, although, as will be shown, a combination of factors appears to have caused this sermon to "catch on" in a special way.

The Sermon With a History

In the second year of his pastorate in Philadelphia, Macartney, impressed by the number of students from nearby Temple, Medico-Chirurgical, and Jefferson Medical Colleges present in his congregation, conceived the idea of an annual service for the students.

³A typescript of what appears to be the original sermon which had been dedicated to college students reveals certain adaptations to this special audience which are absent from later versions (see below, pp. 348f.) However, later versions display only minor changes for purposes of adaptation to the specific occasion. Macartney himself acknowledged that the sermon was essentially the same across the years. See C. E. Macartney, Foreword, Come Before Winter (New York: Abingdon-Cokesbury Press, 1945).

A personal letter was addressed to each of the classes of the medical schools inviting them to attend this special service. One of these students who was present at this meeting when "Come Before Winter" made its debut, wrote twenty-five years later:

Piqued perhaps by curiosity at first, a churchful of students settled themselves against red cushioned pews and spiritual blandishment at that first September Sunday evening service ever held especially for them in Philadelphia. But Clarence Edward Macartney won first their attention, their interest, their respect, later their loyalty. And those who came to scoff remained, if not to pray, at least to come again and again to his church, packed each Sunday evening from pews to galleries to confound the congregational eyebrow lifters and head wagers and kindred of little faith in the enterprise.⁴

The author of the foregoing stopped on his way to college the next morning to mail a postal card upon which he had written his praise of the sermon.⁵ Another student was so impressed that he went to his room and penned a letter to his mother. Soon after, a telegram summoned him home to his dying mother, under whose pillow he found the sermon-inspired letter. It was this reaction to the address which led to its annual presentation: "The messages which I received gave me hope that a sermon on this theme preached every autumn would not be in vain."⁶

When Abingdon-Cokesbury Press published the sermon in special brochure form in 1945, a professional journal on preaching commented:

⁴Hilton A. Wick, M.D., Letter to the editor, The Bulletin Index, CXXII (October 24, 1940), 14, 18.

⁵The card read, "Dear Sir: Your Sunday evening sermon was without doubt the finest sermon preached in Philadelphia on that date. Sincerely, (signed) Hilton A. Wick." (Postal card postmarked October 4, 1915, Macartney Files). See also Hilton A. Wick, M.D., "Come Before Winter: The Story of a Sermon," The Presbyterian, CX (October 24, 1940), 11.

⁶C. E. Macartney, Foreword, Come Before Winter (New York: Abingdon-Cokesbury Press, 1945), p. 3. Brochure containing the sermon with foreword by Dr. Macartney.

When a sermon can be repeated in the same pulpit once every year for thirty consecutive years, and when that one sermon is considered worthy of printing by itself, by one of the outstandingly strong publishers of religious books, that is a sermon. . . . It [Come Before Winter] has been thought of as the "Acres of Diamonds" of our time. It has been preached from one end of the land to the other and frequently before college and university students.⁷

Reaction to the preaching of "Come Before Winter" was often expressed by letter to Dr. Macartney, who kept a file of these responses. Several sheets of excerpts from these letters were filed with the sermon typescript for possible use in the sermon. A few examples of these selected notes revealing listener-response to the address are given below:⁸

I thought I was a Christian until I heard your sermon, "Come Before Winter."

Your "Come Before Winter" made a great impression upon me. I am doing something very worth while before the snow sees Pittsburgh.

Words cannot express my appreciation for the touching sermon preached this evening, the subject, "Come Before Winter." Please allow me to confide in you this fact, just to acquaint you with one whose heart was deeply affected. There is an estrangement between a sister and myself, having existed over ten years. After hearing your "blessed sermon," I, with great difficulty, promised God to write this night, which I shall do after concluding this letter.

I still hear echoes of your sermon here. One lad in particular who had grave difficulties, and had not found himself in his christian faith, received a new start which shows real evidence of being nothing more or less than the great change itself. "John A. Mackay" (President Princeton Theological Seminary)

Your sermon tonight fell like a bomb shell. I, too, am a student of Hippocrates. When you spoke of your original sermon, it was as if you spoke directly to me. Never has anything so soul-rending struck me. . . . I must act quickly before the steel is cold. Winter has already closed in on some opportunities over the past years, but you have given me my greatest opportunity tonight. Five years from today, if I have proved myself to have changed the course of my existence from this night on, I will send you my signature. This is written tonight in deep appreciation of a powerful message, the sort that may shape the course of a young man's life.

⁷"Come Before Winter," The Expositor, XLIX (January, 1947), 26.

⁸Examples taken from the Macartney Files.

While no listener-response has been pin-pointed for the 1952 presentation studied in this chapter, the above-quoted letters and notes, typical of many others, point to the impact of this particular sermon. The student of persuasive speaking is intrigued by the apparent extreme effectiveness of this message presented annually and heard frequently by many of the same listeners.

Sermon Analysis

This sermon, which has been called "an intellectual's revival call,"⁹ is based on the words of Paul's letter written from the Roman prison to his young friend, Timothy, requesting his presence in Rome and urging him to "come before winter."¹⁰

When Macartney discovered that in those ancient days the season for navigation in the Mediterranean closed in the autumn and did not open again till spring, he saw in this fact the possibility of a sermon on the passing of opportunity--"the things we can do, and ought to do, now, but which later on we shall not be able to do."¹¹ The proposition of the sermon was that "just as Timothy must go to Paul at Rome before winter, or wait until the spring because of ancient navigation con-

⁹"Biography," The Bulletin Index, CXXVIII (February 16, 1946), 15. The sermon, as taken from the Reigner tape recording at First Presbyterian Church of Pittsburgh on the occasion of its thirty-seventh anniversary, as well as the text of the published version, appears in Appendices VIII and IX, pp. 414ff., of this study for examination in connection with the analysis. Correspondence from the Reigner Recording Library, Union Theological Seminary, Richmond, Virginia, explained that the recording was made at First Church, October 12, 1952. "We are not certain as to the quality of equipment used." Letter dated January 18, 1966.

¹⁰II Timothy 4:21.

¹¹Come Before Winter, op. cit., p. 5.

ditions, so there are things that must be done now or never. If Timothy had waited until spring, he would have waited too long, for Paul was executed before that time."

The sermon seeks a response on three matters: (1) the amendment and reformation of character, (2) action regarding love's duties to friends and loved ones, and (3) acceptance of Christ for salvation.

With a slight modification of the order followed in the previous chapter, the analysis will proceed with an examination of those elements of persuasion related to (1) sermon arrangement, (2) sermon content (evidence and lines of reasoning, speaker's credibility, and psychological factors), and (3) sermon style.¹²

Sermon Arrangement

One has little difficulty in discerning the traditional divisions of Introduction, Body, and Conclusion of this sermon. The theme of the sermon emerges clearly in the introduction, and clear transitional sentences bridge to each of the three divisions of the body and into the conclusion and appeal.

Introduction.--The introduction must be regarded as beginning with the announcement of his Bible text--"Come before winter." For one hearing the sermon the first time, the words of the text would, no doubt, have arrested attention largely because of the element of novelty. A listener familiar with the Bible and with preaching in general would probably never have heard the text read from the pulpit as the basis for a sermon, and his curiosity as to what the minister planned to do with the phrase would certainly have been aroused.

¹²Generalizations regarding delivery factors have already been made in Chapter VI.

The introduction, in Macartney's treatment of his topic, required some contextual or background explanation before the text would properly serve as a springboard for the theme. He avoids the pitfall of dullness in such a background explanation by introducing Napoleon, a prisoner like Paul, to create interest by contrast: "Napoleon Bonaparte and the Apostle Paul are the most renowned prisoners of history."

These first words provide the setting for a vivid contrast of the two prisoners, which in turn gives way to background material on the text leading naturally to his proposition: "Well, there's the sermon, plain and unmistakable, 'Come before winter.' There are some things which you can do now, but if you leave them undone until winter comes they will never be done."

The introduction may well have served a two-fold purpose of winning attention and preparing the hearer for the subject matter of the message.

Body.--The transition from introduction to the body of his sermon is unmistakable: "So let us listen to that voice of Paul as he flings this message across the seas to Timothy there in Ephesus, "Come before winter." Three divisions follow:

- I The voice which calls for the amendment and the reformation of character
- II The voice of friendship and affection
- III The voice of Christ

The sermon, in the homiletic terminology of sermon types, is plainly topical, with a distributive pattern of arrangement--matters having a common thought center and an obvious connection among themselves are grouped in the three divisions.

The first and third divisions begin with a structural assertion

and then proceed deductively to particulars in support of the assertion. The second division begins with a hypothetical description of Timothy's possible response to Paul's request and thus moves inductively to a generalization which, in turn, is further amplified by incidents and examples.

There is, however, one puzzling aspect of the arrangement of this sermon--the ordering of the three divisions. As noted earlier, Macartney almost inevitably arranges his material in ascending climax order. Although his last division dealing with Christ's call to the soul, his strongest point, is properly placed. One might wonder why Macartney should not have transposed the order of the first and second divisions. Macartney's first division, taking up the call to amendment and reformation of character, deals unquestionably with an issue of weightier significance than the second division, which deals with duties to friends and loved ones. Furthermore, his second division is the only point which is derived from the Biblical incident, making its point on the friendship of Paul and Timothy. The transition from the introduction, which had covered this incident, to a division on "the call of friendship and affection" would have been natural and almost expected. Was he departing here from his usual psychological order of ascending climax? Or did he believe that such an order was served best by prefacing his last point with material of more emotional content such as that surrounding a discussion of sentimental friend and family affections?

A better explanation, in the opinion of this investigator, lies in a study of what very likely was the typescript of the sermon as first given to the students in Philadelphia.¹³ The three headings in this

¹³The typescript was for a sermon obviously prepared for students. A comment that the man of 1935 or 1940 will be to a large degree the

early sermon were:

- I A challenge to youth
- II A challenge to friendship
- III A challenge from Christ

Noting that the letter to Timothy was a message from an old man to a youth, Macartney declared "Youth is the springtime of life, and what we are and what we do then, determines the autumn and the winter." Here, Macartney, undoubtedly, sought early for a point of contact or rapport with his student audience; and a careful reading of this sermon leaves the impression that the order here is proper and natural, even though the content of the first division deals with "the amendment and reformation of character" as in the present outline.

It would seem, however, that in the transition from a specific youth-slanted sermon to the present form, with the first division no longer serving the important function of a point of contact with youth, this division would now follow in a more natural and strengthened motivating sequence if it were to precede the final division, as follows:

- I The voice of friendship and affection
- II The voice which calls for the amendment and reformation of character
- III The voice of Christ

The Conclusion.--The conclusion, as might be expected from the subject matter, is in the form of an hortatory appeal, and, as was characteristic of Macartney, grows out of the last division. The appeal is "to come to God while there is opportunity." A specific appeal is made in this instance for an overt response, the lifted hand--though but

product of the man of 1915-1919 would indicate this to be one of the early typescripts, several of which are extant and stored in the Macartney Files.

a brief moment is allowed for this response before the closing prayer.

The conclusion achieves an oratorical climax (to be considered further under the section on style), and is a fitting climax to the note of urgency evident throughout the sermon.

Sermon Content

Evidence and Reasoning.--Macartney's argument "that life's opportunities may be irretrievably lost," based analogically on the passing of the opportunity to sail for Italy once winter comes, is not posed as an issue but assumed to be accepted by his listeners and needing only to be vitalized in their thinking by pertinent example. This gives a different feeling to the undertaking. The focus of attention is on functional questions such as "What does it mean?" "What difference does it make?" and "What are its consequences?"

For example, the assertion "Your character can be amended and improved, but not just at any time," is not supported by Scriptural proof which might have been cited, or by opinion or testimony, (aside from Senator John Ingall's poem on the passing of opportunity), but the fact is simply assumed as accepted and needing only to be re-emphasized by the use of example and illustration. Strong, positive, but unsupported assertions such as "Now chains of evil habit can be broken, which, if not broken, will bind us forever," would suggest he was relying heavily upon "personal proof" as a minister of the gospel.

His second argument to the effect "that the opportunity of fulfilling love's duties to friends and loved ones is evanescent," needs no proof because of the universality of death--the point is simply dramatized with narrative and example.

His third point, "that the opportunity to respond to the call of

Christ is also a passing opportunity," is supported by argument from authority--the appeal to Scripture: "Now is the accepted time,"¹⁴ "While it is called, today, harden not your hearts."¹⁵ The argument is dramatized by his declaration: "If you can find any place in the Bible where the Holy Spirit says, 'Repent when you feel like it,' 'Come to Christ tomorrow,' then I shall come out of this pulpit because I would have no message to preach."

While Macartney's logical proof in this particular type of sermon would be adequate for the majority of his hearers, accepting as they did the authority of Scripture upon which his argument rests, it would seem that with the large number of visitors normally present because of the build-up which the sermon always received, he might have made stronger use of evidence and logical proof, particularly in the first section of his address, where unsupported assertions place the weight of credibility on the speaker alone.

Sermon Content--the Speaker's Credibility.--Macartney's "source credibility" rating was undoubtedly high at the time of this thirty-seventh annual preaching of a sermon that had come to be regarded as "something special." Macartney's sense of the dramatic would presumably have seen to it that the occasion had received wide advance publicity. Visitors who had driven some distance would have been acknowledged, and everything would have been done to invest the occasion with the aura of a high occasion.

Many would have heard the sermon a number of times before, while others were hearing it the first time. If some were present out of a

¹⁴II Corinthians 6:2.

¹⁵Hebrews 3:15.

sense of need which the sermon promised to satisfy, certainly many were present simply to hear Dr. Macartney preach this annual sermon.

Six months before, the church had held impressive week-end services to commemorate the twenty-fifth anniversary of Macartney's pastorate at First Church. By July of the following year, his retirement, concerning which hints had already been dropped, would become effective. He had just passed his seventy-third birthday; and to many of the faithful he was not only the dean of preachers, "one of the greats,"¹⁶ but a spiritual father; and in their minds First Church and Dr. Macartney had become so closely identified as to make his permanent retirement seem almost unthinkable.

As already noted, Macartney had always conveyed a sense of physical, moral, and spiritual strength.¹⁷ According to the voice-recording, Macartney's years had not noticeably diminished this quality, the impression of which was communicated clearly by his delivery--presumably without notes as was his practice¹⁸ (including the fourteen lines of poetry), in clear, strong, vibrant tones, unfaltering, though deliberate.

If the preacher, on this occasion, were to have indulged in a bit of reverie and reminiscence, it would certainly have been forgiven him; but Macartney (characteristically) avoids personal references aside from noting that this was the thirty-seventh annual presentation of the sermon. Confident of his standing with his hearers, he finds no need for explicit self-reference to build personal proof.

¹⁶This, and similar laudatory phrases were used by parishioners engaged in conversations by the writer following a worship service at First Church, May 23, 1965.

¹⁷This study, pp. 143f.

¹⁸This study, pp. 32, 164ff., 330f.

It must be noted, however, that Macartney has introduced into the content of the sermon, materials which would commend him to a wide variety of listeners. His choice of vocabulary, the literary allusions, the Carlyle incident and quotation, his choice and use of poetry, would have pleased those of literary tastes and preserved not only a fitting balance with the more sentimental aspects of this revival call, but Macartney's image as an intellectual preacher as well. The easy reference to place-names on the map of the ancient world revealed his first-hand knowledge of far-away places even before the fact was disclosed by specific reference to his visit to Paul's ancient place of confinement--Mamertine dungeon: "It was cold and damp on a blistering hot August day the last time I went down into it."

Macartney's competence for his task must certainly have been conveyed also by his reference to responses awakened by this sermon on previous occasions. After citing one instance, he reminds his audience that this was not the first nor last time someone was grateful that he heard the sermon; then he expresses the hope that "perhaps someone here tonight will be glad" he heard it.

A point of interest is Macartney's strong, and apparently deliberate, appeal made to men in a sermon which could easily have been handled in a way as to have repelled men by sentimentality. Men are kept at the center of the large number of illustrative examples and word pictures created for his hearers: Napoleon; Paul; Timothy; Luke, the physician; blast furnace workers, the man in the hotel room; Senator Ingalls; the soldier; Carlyle; medical students: "he said to me. . . . speak to my brother now," etc.

Those of a devout turn-of-mind would, almost certainly, have been

drawn to him as a sensitive, spiritually-minded man, making reverent use of Biblical material and ideas, pleading with evident sincerity and earnestness for those values he prized and decisions he regarded as important.

Perhaps the most noticeable and persuasive form of personal proof employed in this sermon is the impression of deep earnestness and concern communicated in the content and delivery. In its published form approximately thirty exclamations are indicated, and this intensity comes through in the recording. Deep concern was registered in expressions such as the following:

Every recurring autumn has filled me with a desire to say something-- not only something that shall move men toward God to do what they ought to do--but move them to do it now! tonight! before winter!

Oh, if the history of this church could be told, if these columns should cry out of the wall and the beam out of the timber should answer, what a story they could tell of those who were not far from the kingdom of God but tonight are far from it because when God said, "today," they said, "tomorrow."

This element of persuasion, prominent in many of Macartney's sermons, is particularly noticeable in this address.

Sermon Content--Psychological Factors.--In the search for clues as to the effectiveness of this annually-repeated sermon, one cannot escape the fact that it must have made strong psychological appeal to the listener. The build-up for each presentation, the tying in of its theme--"the passing of opportunity"--with the somewhat melancholy mood of the autumn season ("a parable of all that fades"), must have charged the atmosphere of each such occasion with a sense of expectancy as well as urgency.

The psychological factors of the sermon itself, however, are perhaps one explanation of its long popularity. Macartney's unquestion-

ably high sermon purpose in this message would have been in keeping with his audience's expectations, and his evident earnest hope to actuate an immediate listener response would have won the sympathetic approval of his church members.

Attention and interest factors, vital in the persuasive process, are prominent throughout the sermon. The attention is arrested in the introduction, as already noted, by the elements of curiosity (the text) and by contrast. Sympathetic identification with the Apostle Paul is won at once in this contrast of the two philosophies represented by Napoleon and Paul--the love of power, and the power of love. Interest is maintained by the narrative background material leading to his proposition; the listener's empathic identification with the cold and lonely Paul in Mamertine dungeon, encouraged by the narrative, is an effective preparation for later appeals grounded on sentiment and affection.

While structural assertions and generalizations are adequate for the development and progression of his theme, Macartney does not linger long at any time on the level of generalities. There is a constant procession of people and scenes and emotions to engage the interest and produce experience in the listener.

To illustrate: the general assertion of the first division, "Your character can be changed but not at any time," is supported by at least five concrete particulars: (1) boyhood memories of watching the men at the wire mill (His Pittsburgh audience, familiar with steel mills blast furnaces, would have seized on this picture with immediate interest), (2) the scene at the Pool of Bethesda, (3) the dramatic incident of the tempted man in his hotel room, (4) reference to Senator Ingalls, and

(5) a bonfire. While no more than six minutes would have elapsed during this procession of verbal images, each particular instance has been applied to the original assertion, and all have been tied together to create an over-all unity of impression.

Attention and interest factors are similarly prominent by way of concrete example, narrative, and illustration in the succeeding divisions. The second division is rich with sensory material of an emotional nature. Macartney wishes to impress the listener with the wrong done to loved ones and friends by procrastination and neglect. He dramatizes his point by means of an hypothetical re-creation of such procrastination and neglect on the part of Timothy with respect to Paul, and his subsequent remorse when it is too late. The auditors would certainly have relived and vicariously experienced these emotions--feelings which were even further intensified by the account of Carlyle's lost opportunity and the vivid picturing of the irrevocable finality of the sudden death of a friend. These examples, along with the story of the medical student who wrote the timely letter to his mother, represent a most powerful form of persuasion by suggestion in that the listener is led to experience vicariously both punishment for failure to act, and reward and satisfaction for appropriate response.

Macartney has based his strongest motive appeals on sentiment and what the homileticians have called "godly fear"; and while other appeals are based on such motives as the desire for self-esteem and self-realization, and the need for love, the weight of his appeal rests on fear and sentiment.

A recurring note of appeal is sounded on the possibility that valuable opportunities and privileges now available may suddenly pass

beyond reach:

The winter will come and pass, and spring will come and deck the earth with its flowers and also the graves of some of your opportunities. (It may be the grave of a dearest friend.) There are golden gates of opportunity that are standing wide open tonight. A year from tonight those gates will be closed. . . . There are voices--earnest, wistful, affectionate--speaking to you tonight. A year from tonight those voices will be forever silent.

There are times when life's metal is, as it were, molten and you can hammer it and fashion it into any design you please; but if that moment is permitted to pass, it tends to a state of fixation in which it is not possible either to plan or to do a good thing.

You can kindle a bonfire any time . . . but this finer fire of the spirit you cannot kindle when you will.

In a similar vein are the reminders of the fickleness of the human heart:

Someone might hear a sermon like this tonight and be ready to act . . . He might come next October and hear the same message, but it would make no impression upon him.

Or the reminders of the possibility of sudden death:

Why, the spider's most attenuated web is like a cable of steel compared with your hold on life.

In the final moments of the sermon he reverts again to the motive appeal of godly fear: "Come before the heart is cold and life is o'er and you stand before God to give your account. . . ."

Macartney's appeal for the amendment and reformation of character, however, is not grounded on the fear of passing opportunity alone. He appeals to man's desire for self-esteem and self-realization as well:

Sometimes he [the Angel of Opportunity] comes in a mysterious urge for a better and higher life.

"O, for a man to rise in me
That the man I am might cease to be."

. . . then golden goals can be glimpsed . . . then, decisions made which shall bless the soul long after the stars have ceased to burn.

Sentiments and affections are engaged as motive appeals particularly in the second division of the sermon where he seeks a response of

the listener with regard to love's obligations to friends and family. The relationship of husbands and wives, parents and children, and friend with friend are invested with emotional content by the examples cited.

The intermingling of the element of fear with these appeals to sentiment would undoubtedly have deepened the impact. Appropriating Christ's words, "The poor ye have always with you, but me ye have not always," Macartney said:

I can't see it now, but here tonight and in your homes, and in your family circles . . . there are those across whose brow are written those words, "the poor ye have always with you, but me ye have not always."

The motive appeal of love and affection is again called into play in the sermon conclusion:

So once more in the rich providence of God and for the thirty-seventh time, I am permitted to throw out this great text, "Come Before Winter." And as I do so I am sure that the angels of heaven, those who love you, that the redeemed in heaven, that the Holy Spirit, that the Lord Jesus Christ himself are with me and speaking with me and for me, "Come before winter."

Without question, to the psychological factors involved in the annual fall presentation of this sermon, the featuring of the seasonal motif, and the sermon content in itself--interest-gripping and emotional--must be attributed in a large measure, the popularity and apparent effectiveness of this sermon.

Sermon Style

The analysis at this point employs the three constituents of style:¹⁹ (1) choice of words, (2) word composition, and (3) embellishment. In addition, oral style (as opposed to written style) will be noted.

¹⁹Lester Thonssen and A. Craig Baird, Speech Criticism (New York: The Ronald Press Company), pp. 416ff.

Choice of Words.--Clarity and intelligibility are somewhat, though not seriously, impaired by a larger use of obscure words than Macartney usually introduced into one address. One could usually count on one or two less familiar words to preserve the image of intellectualism, but rarely a run of words such as: encomium (pronounced enconium in the tape recording), indissoluble (pronounced correctly in the recording with the accent on the second syllable), amalgamation, offal, revirescence, litany, viaticum, transiency, livery, dissonances, attenuated. It must be said that the above-mentioned words do not appear at points critical to the thought movement, and contextual clues would have aided somewhat-- "offal" was coupled with "debris," "revirescence" with "life," "viaticum" with "heartease," and "transiency" with "uncertainty."

It is possible that this choice of vocabulary was a deliberate effort to infuse an element of formality into an address, the content and setting of which could tend to sentimentality and emotionality.

Composition.--The deeply personal, earnest, sincere tenor of this message is reflected in its sentence structure. The great majority of Macartney's sentences here are relatively short, simple, and direct in form. There are no complicated lines of thought demanding broad sweeping sentences where, in order to give breadth and perspective to a field of thought, one would combine parts so as to raise some and lower others, to accent some and subdue others. Instead, a few structural assertions are made in clear, straightforward sentences which in turn are supported by narrative and example--a form of development for which a simple sentence structure is appropriate. The longer sentences appear in the narrative portions as when a panorama of events is swiftly covered with a series of independent clauses, as in the sentence surveying

Timothy's response to Paul's letter up to the moment he witnesses Paul's martyrdom:

We like to think that Timothy needed no further urging, no second letter, but that he gathered together the books and the parchments and then went over to Troas and picked up that old cloak at the house of Carpus, took a vessel across the Aegean to Neapolis and Macedonia and then across Macedonia to the Adriatic and across the Adriatic Sea to Brundisium on the heel of Italy and then by the Appian Way up to Rome, where he sought Paul out in the dungeon, put the old cloak about him, read to him from the books he had brought with him--the Scriptures--wrote for him his last messages, walked by his side to the place of execution by the Pyramid of Cestius, outside the walls of Rome, one of the monuments of that day still standing, saw the headman's sword flash in the sunlight and Paul put on immortality.

Variety not only is achieved by an intermingling of long and short sentences but is also produced by parallelism and inversion. A series of parallelisms in the introduction, for example, is followed by the following periodic sentence:

Not strange then, that at the end of his life standing on his lonely, wave-washed rock in the South Atlantic, Napoleon wondered if there was anyone in the world who really loved him.

At one point, emphasis is achieved by a series of antithetical statements in parallel construction:

There are golden gates of opportunity that are standing wide open tonight. A year from tonight those gates will be closed. There are tides of fortune and destiny which tonight are flowing at the flood. Next October they will be flowing at the ebb. There are voices--earnest, wistful, affectionate--speaking to you tonight. A year from tonight these voices will be forever silent.

The rhetorical question is also employed to emphasize a point:

David, in great distress, said to Jonathan one day, 'As thy soul liveth there is but a step between me and death.' Is that true of David alone? Or is it true of you and me also?

Oral Style.--Despite Macartney's undoubted familiarity with the basic format of this sermon because of its repeated presentations, and while many lines and entire paragraphs follow the printed form very closely, occasional modifications of the printed form move definitely in

the direction of oral style.

Fragmentations, repetitions, or deviations from standard grammar are not particularly noticeable; but such characteristics of oral style as contractions, colloquialisms, free use of first and second person personal pronouns,²⁰ and occasional redundancy are noticeable. Comparisons between the printed form and the tape-recorded sermon reveal these differences.

Printed:

When a man enters the straights of life, he is fortunate if he has a few friends upon whom he can count to the uttermost.

Recording:

A sense of ease and spontaneity is achieved through a simpler more colloquial style.

When you get into real trouble in life, it's a great thing if you have a few friends upon whom you can count to the uttermost.

.

Printed:

Paul's last letter is to this dearest of his friends, Timothy, whom he has left in charge of the church at far-off Ephesus. He tells Timothy that he wants him to come and be with him at Rome. He is to stop at Troas in the way and pick up his books. . . .

Recording:

In the recording the comment moves in the direction of simplicity with some redundancy:

Paul had left Timothy in charge of the church at Ephesus, but now in the prison at Rome he wants Timothy by his side, so he sends him this letter--Paul's last letter. And in the letter he tells Timothy to come, and he wants him to bring three things with him; first of all, the books and the parchments.

.

²⁰Some eighty-five uses of pronouns in the first and second person in the printed version were counted as against 115 in the recorded sermon, or an increase of thirty such usages in the spoken sermon.

Printed:

There is a time when life's metal is, as it were, molten, and can be worked into any design that is desired. But if it is permitted to cool, it tends toward a state of fixation, in which it is possible neither to do nor even to plan a good work. When the angel came down to trouble the pool at Jerusalem . . .

Recording:

The personal pronoun is introduced and a more personal and intimate feeling tone is created:

There are times when life's metal is, as it were, molten and you can hammer it and fashion it into any design that you please. But if that moment is permitted to pass then it tends to a state of fixation in which it is not possible either to plan or to do a good thing. You remember that story of the angel and the pool at Bethesda . . .

.

The following colloquial phrases and contractions, which do not appear in the printed text, illustrate variations one might expect in Macartney's oral style when compared to the printed sermon:

Why before winter? Well, because in that ancient day, when winter came on, ships were laid up.

Well, there's the sermon, plain and unmistakable, 'Come before winter.'

'Why, don't you know? Paul was put to death in the Ides of January, beheaded. And are you Timothy? then you're the one about whom he was always asking.'

Embellishment.--Ornateness of style is achieved in this sermon by a wide use of figures and imagery. Metaphors such as the following are liberally sprinkled throughout the discourse:

hammer of adversity
 graves of your opportunities
 tides of fortune and destiny
 gates of opportunity
 life's metal
 pool of life
 chains of besetting sin
 what shadows we are!

Several forms of the simile appear:

--stars like silver-headed nails driven into the vault of heaven
by the hammer of an archangel

--writhing and twisting like tortured spirits

--the spider's most attenuated web is like a cable of steel compared
with your hold on life.

A few figures were in the nature of hyperbole:

--rivers of blood upon which to float his ambitions

--ghastly trails of the dead

--I might as well sow seed on the marble pavement beneath this
pulpit

Several uses of alliteration contributed further to stylistic
embellishment of the sermon:

--golden gates of opportunity

--golden goals can be glimpsed

--the soul, like the soil

--from the Pyrenees to Moscow and from the Pyramid to Mount Tabor

Personification was employed at least twice:

--the vacant place, the empty chair, the unlifted book will speak
to your soul with a rebuke which you can hardly endure. . . .

--if these columns should cry out of the wall and the beam out of
the timber should answer. . . .

Macartney makes sensitive use of poetry to dignify this message--
fourteen lines, at one point, with two to four lines interspersed at
three other points, and again six lines to close.

At several points the use of epanaphora, or the repetition of a
word, adds forcefulness to his appeal as in the following line:

Sleep on now! Sleep! Sleep forever!

or, as in the conclusion:

Come before winter. Come before the haze of Indian summer has
vanished. Come before the winds send the leaves whirling over the
lawns. Come before the winter wheat is covered with snow. Come

before the heart is cold and life is o'er and you stand before God to give your account. . . . Come before winter!

These examples would indicate that Macartney's use of language as a tool of persuasion in this sermon deserves a place only a little less than coordinate with invention in bringing to fruition his speech purposes. Aside from a scattering of rather obscure words, the language on the whole is vivid, forceful, appropriate, correct, and dignified; and it represents well Macartney's use of the "language of power" in persuasive address.

.

An analysis of Dr. Macartney's best-known and annually-presented sermon, "Come Before Winter," would lead one to believe that a combination of factors contributed to its apparent popularity and effectiveness. With a Biblically-oriented audience, this unusual and imaginative use of an easily-overlooked incident and almost off-hand comment by St. Paul would very likely have sparked immediate interest and attention. The steady procession of concrete images and stirring emotions throughout the sermon would have served to provide constant sensory experience for the listener. Macartney's strongest appeals, based on sentiments, affection, and fear, were certainly important ingredients of persuasion as employed.

Psychological factors were undoubtedly the key to the sermon's appeal--an expectant audience assembled under the influence of the psychological build-up of the annual presentation, the tie-in of the sermon's theme (the evanescence of life and opportunity) with the somewhat melancholy mood of the autumn season, the strong emotional appeal of sentiment and fear buttressed by vivid incidents and illustrations presented in equally vivid language, apparently combined to produce a memorable speech event.

PART III

APPRAISAL AND CONCLUSIONS

CHAPTER VIII

AN APPRAISAL--WITH CONCLUSIONS

Preceding chapters have reported an examination of the Pittsburgh preaching of Dr. Clarence E. Macartney with special reference to the discernible elements of persuasion. This chapter presents an evaluation with conclusions based on certain inferences drawn from this study.

Standards of Evaluation

Discussions pertaining to an evaluation of public address make use of the concepts of "good" speaking and "effective" speaking. In the former context it is suggested that any given speech is good to the degree that it incorporates the principles which constitute the art of public speaking.¹ However, where the doctrine of speech "as a venture in communication of ideas"² is adhered to, it is recognized that the techniques of an art are but the means of achieving ends. Therefore, their use must be assessed with regard to the ultimate values they help to realize. A speech is effective, then, "if it achieves an end or response consistent with the speaker's purpose--provided that the purpose is, in turn, consistent with the dictates of responsible judgment and solicitous regard for the positive good of an enlightened society."³

¹James H. McBurney and Ernest J. Wraga, The Art of Good Speech (New York: Prentice Hall, Inc., 1953), pp. 28ff.

²Lester Thonssen and A. Craig Baird, Speech Criticism (New York: The Ronald Press Company, 1948), p. 460.

³Ibid., p. 461.

The following appraisal of the preaching of Dr. Macartney proceeds with these principles in mind, inquiring both as to its conformity to the principles of "good" speaking and as to the "effectiveness" of his speaking.

Rhetorical Appraisal

A rhetorical evaluation is made against the following five criteria stated canonically:

- (1) The speaker's subject should be significant.
- (2) The speaker's purpose should be evident.
- (3) The speaker should evince an analysis of the speaking context (occasion), and this analysis should be valid.
- (4) The speaker should employ the best available resources.
- (5) The speaker should demonstrate competence in the methods of persuasion.

1. The speaker's subject should be significant.

Good speaking, it is suggested, deals with significant subjects-- subjects which "tap the best resources of the speaker and make some demands on the best resources of the listener."⁴ As a proponent of Christian orthodoxy, Macartney chose the subject matter of his pulpit address in terms of his basic theological convictions, such as the existence of God, the deity of Christ, the inspiration of the Bible, the natural depravity of man, and the Christian doctrine of salvation. Out of these basic convictions arose topics designed not only to persuade others as to the value and validity of these convictions, but related topics touching man's personal needs, problems, relationships, and ethical responsibilities.

⁴Ibid., p. 38.

Whether such subjects are to be counted as significant or not would depend upon one's religious biases. Approaching this question from the standpoint of the theological "liberal," or the humanist, one would have reservations regarding the significance and relevance of many of Macartney's topics. On the other hand, if one were of the opinion, with Macartney, that the solution to man's problems is to be found in the supernaturalistic interpretation of Christian faith, one could contend that his choice of subjects was indeed significant and deserving of the application of the best of his spiritual and intellectual resources in preparation, and of his listeners in response.

Attention should be drawn again to the persistence into mid-century of fundamentalism in America, and the popularity in American theological circles since the 'thirties and 'forties of that brand of neo-supernaturalism advocated by Barth.⁵ These facts would suggest that such topics as occupied Dr. Macartney's attention in preaching would have been regarded as extremely significant by many Americans--and certainly so, by his Pittsburgh audience.

2. The speaker's purpose should be evident.

Concerned with significant subjects, good speaking is also purposeful--"it is consciously directed to achieve a relatively specific response from an audience."⁶ This rule is particularly important in

⁵See this study pp. 76ff. Osborn, referring to "the faith of 100 million Christians" in America, suggests that "it would be a mistake to conclude that the people of the United States have embraced modernism lock, stock, and barrel, that their present faith is merely a form of humanism hallowed by a few traditional phrases. . . . Of our active church members and of our pastors. . . . probably not 5 percent would give assent to a theology of naturalism." Ronald E. Osborn, The Spirit of American Christianity (New York: Harper and Brothers Publishers, 1958), pp. 168, 170.

⁶McBurney and Wrage, op. cit., p. 38.

persuasive speech, the purpose of which is to rouse the audience to some very definite and clearly understood response. The audience, then, must know what is required of it.

As a lecturer on homiletics, Macartney clearly stated regarding the purpose of the sermon⁷ that while he acknowledged a place for sermons for "comfort and instruction, for condemnation, for special occasions," he regarded the conversion of the sinner "to the will of God in Christ"⁸ as the dominant purpose of all preaching.

Evidence was presented that in practice, however, Macartney adapted himself to his audience and the pastoral and evangelistic role--directing his sermons toward deepening the commitment of Christians to the Christian way as well as appealing to those not yet committed to Christ. It is obvious from a study of the individual sermons, as represented by chapter VI, that sermon purposes to inspire, instruct, convince, or actuate were evident and that the audience was apprised of the specific purpose by clearly stated propositions, or by suggestion--direct or indirect--at various points in the sermon and particularly in the conclusions of his messages.

3. The speaker should evince an analysis of the speaking context (occasion), and this analysis should be valid.

Good speaking is analytical, i.e., it takes into account the context in which the speech occurs as provided by the subject, the audience, the occasion, and the speaker himself; an appraisal of these factors singly and collectively is involved.⁹

⁷See pp. 148ff. and 186ff. for discussions of Macartney's views of the purpose of the sermon.

⁸Preaching Without Notes, p. 9.

⁹McBurney and Wrage, op. cit., pp. 38f.

It can be shown that Macartney took sensitive account of these factors--of the larger perspective of the mood and temper of his times, but particularly of his local speech context.

That Macartney was sensitive to the threat which the theological liberalism of his times presented to those beliefs which he (and many of his congregation) regarded as sacrosanct is reflected by his emphatic defense of "the faith once delivered." A study of the periodically presented apologetic sermons reveals his awareness of the issues and arguments involved.

His audience, made up largely of educated Pittsburgh Presbyterians was, of course, exposed to the appeal of the new ideas. On the other hand, one would suspect that the conditioning of home and church, the challenge to group loyalty inherent in the church organization, the need for security in an age of change and tension, all collaborated to produce for Macartney, an audience with a strong favorable predisposition to his pulpit defense of the conservative faith. It is worth noting too, that by the strong tone of intellectualism introduced into much of his preaching, Macartney invested these ideas with an intellectual respectability so important for an audience which would not have taken readily to the label, "obscurantist," (or even "fundamentalist," with its connotations¹⁰).

Macartney also indicates an analysis of the local speaking context in choice of subjects--by his careful adherence to the Christian year, by his adaptation of sermon subjects to various holidays (including Washington's and Lincoln's birthday), or by his choice of topics designed

¹⁰Macartney insisted that while he believed in the "fundamentals," he was not a fundamentalist. He preferred the terms conservative, or evangelical. See "For the Faith," The Presbyterian LXLIII (February 15, 1923), 8.

to meet the needs of his audience. From time to time (as may be seen from introductions appearing in his sermon volumes) Macartney preached series of sermons in response to polls and questionnaires prepared to ascertain the interests and needs of his congregation. The personal problems of people, such as might be aggravated by the depression years, the war years, or the post-war "age of anxiety" were acknowledged in sermon series such as his "Sermons From Life," "Facing Life and Getting the Best of It," or "You Can Conquer."

Further evidence of the speaker's analysis of the speech context is found in his purposeful efforts to identify himself with his people. (Kenneth Burke maintained that "You persuade only insofar as you can talk his language by speech, gesture, tonality, order, image, attitude, ideas, identifying your way with his."¹¹) Macartney regarded pastoral visitation as indispensable to his preaching because it gave him insight into the real day-to-day situation of the people whom he addressed. In addition, it was his practice to make himself an expert in the local history of his community and church. The results of his research were woven into his sermons or were featured in sermons for special occasions. Macartney's analysis of the local context, however, is perhaps best seen in the adaptation made of subject and method of presentation to different segments of his audience--as to the two divergent audiences represented by the Tuesday Noon Mens' Club, or the junior girls of the Friday Night Girls' Club.¹²

¹¹Kenneth Burke, A Rhetoric of Motives (New York: Prentice-Hall, 1950), p. 55.

¹²Note the adaptation to men as represented by the humor in the sermon "The Old Dinner Bell," Appendix VI, or the adaptation to the girls in his sermon "The Girl Who Outwitted a Wicked King," Appendix VII.

4. The speaker should employ the best available resources.

Good speaking involves good content; therefore, an appraisal of the speaker's practice of the principles of his art must consider the resources called upon by the speaker in assembling his materials. Such an appraisal simply inquires how much the speaker knows about his subject.¹³

The answer to this question has already been provided in previous discussions dealing with Macartney's early intellectual and religious environment, his academic training, his methods of sermon preparation,¹⁴ the literary and historical resources called upon, as well as vacation study tours, including frequent journeys to the lands of the Bible. Macartney's sermons reflect a detailed knowledge of the Bible, his chief source of sermon material, which in turn was augmented by materials drawn from a high order of non-Biblical sources--literature, history, biography, hymnology, art, etc. His pre-occupation with sources of this nature may have led to a neglect of the more contemporary sources as represented by current publications--a fact which could easily have prompted accusations of irrelevance.

On the whole, it must be said, however, that Macartney's pulpit work combined effectively his academic knowledge of Christian doctrine with a knowledge of people, their problems and needs as brought to his

¹³McBurney and Wrage, op. cit., pp. 39f.

¹⁴Macartney's personal account of his methods of preparation was presented in Chapter V. One observer reported: "He was a prodigious worker. His celibate life made more practical his intense study schedule. The time of day was of little significance when he was laboring on an important theme. Those who heard him as often as four times a week, year after year, testify that never once was there an iota of lack of preparation or shoddiness about his public utterances." C. Ralston Smith, Christianity In the World Today, I, (March 18, 1957), 28f.

attention in the pursuit of his pastoral role.

5. The speaker should demonstrate competence in the methods of persuasion.

Good speaking should also employ sound method. As has been suggested: "If speech is to be used effectively in the service of inquiry, reporting, advocacy, and evocation, it must be conceived and employed in ways best designed to achieve these ends."¹⁵

As already noted, Macartney's rhetorical purpose was largely that of advocacy and evocation, or persuasion. An evaluation of his methods of persuasion must take into account (1) his ethos (ethical persuasion), (2) his logical proof, (3) his emotional proof, (4) the arrangement of his discourses, (5) factors of attention and interest in his speaking, (6) the style of his discourses and (7) his delivery.

Ethical Proof.--"Good" personal qualities, we are reminded, contribute to good speech.¹⁶ Ethical proof--the evidence of competence, character, and good will--as revealed by Dr. Clarence Macartney, may well have been one of the most significant elements of persuasion in his preaching. Evidence of his intelligence and competence for his work has already been cited. A study of listener-response as represented by letters in the Macartney files, or the response to the questionnaire including many volunteered notes and letters enlarging on specific items, creates an inescapable impression of the appeal this man had as a man to those who heard him regularly.

The integrity of his character in public and private life seems to be unquestioned. Even those who complained of his aloofness or reserve

¹⁵McBurney and Wrage, op. cit., p. 41.

¹⁶Ibid., pp. 43f.

were inclined to make charitable allowances; thus it appears that the image of a busy, earnest, and serious-minded (even if somewhat reserved) pastor was actually in keeping with the audience expectation, and congruent with his message. Pastoral visits, as noted, also served to strengthen the identification of speaker and audience.

His unmistakable sense of mission and conviction, the impression which he conveyed of a rock-like strength and authority undoubtedly carried a persuasive appeal to his audience.

Logical Proof.--When Dr. Macartney was called to the First Presbyterian Church of Pittsburgh, he was called to a congregation which placed a high premium on loyalty to the Bible and the traditional orthodox Christian faith.¹⁷ Macartney's emphasis on Biblical preaching in which Biblical evidence was honored as pre-eminent factual evidence for the support of the ideas and values he advocated, invested his public address with high credibility value for many who heard him. His reputation as a Biblical preacher drew large numbers (aside from members of his own congregation) who through previous conditioning or for other reasons wished to hear a speaker who spoke authoritatively from a theological stance which conceded a high value to Biblical evidence.

The speaker's more than ordinary insight into the significance of Biblical materials as demonstrated by his ability to generalize to fresh, new, and unusual conclusions from specific Biblical materials appears to have had considerable persuasive influence with his particular audience.

While the largest portion of Macartney's Pittsburgh preaching did not occupy itself with subjects requiring closely-reasoned arguments,

¹⁷See chapter IV of this Study.

when required (as in his periodically presented apologetic sermons defending the orthodox faith) he evinced generally a handling of the traditional kinds of argument for persuasive logical proof in a manner adequate for his specific audience.

Emotional Proof.--Macartney, by precept and example, appears successfully to have demonstrated that there need not necessarily be a conflict between intellectual honesty and emotional fervor--between the "warm heart" and the "steady faith." A sense of mission and message stemming from his own religious experience, combined with the content of his sermons, and the language (or style) employed in their presentation, appears to have produced appropriate and successful emotional appeal to his audience.

Imagery, loaded words, figurative elements--all these were used imaginatively to vivify his style and contribute to the persuasiveness of his preaching.

His skillful use of narrative and description, aimed at what he termed "dramatic power in preaching," was his forte', as is evident not only from a study of these factors in his sermons, but from frequent commendatory comments on this point by those who heard him.¹⁸ Employing Biblical biography, often utilizing sheer dramatic contrast of hero and villain, the speaker sought to stir his listeners to follow the hero, presenting thus the emotional challenge of a two-value approach.

Appeals were made to such values as justice, integrity, honesty, and obedience, or to such basic human needs as affection, status,

¹⁸Parishioners made reference to his "tremendous powers of description," or described his sermons as "vivid portrayals illustrating his subjects so that you were transported to the locale," or commented that "you could picture every sermon he preached." Respondents #1, #30, #47. See also Appendix XI-D.

security, self-preservation, and happiness. In addition, appeals to the motives of fear, emulation, and sentiments, and to the tendencies of his hearers to altruism or conservatism were made with telling effect.

Arrangement.--On the whole, Macartney's arrangement of sermon materials was found to adhere to the criteria established for "good" speaking. A variety of introductions (employing description, narration, the arresting statement, questions, and striking Biblical text) was designed to arrest the listener's interest and attention, and to indicate the direction of the sermon.

Similarly, sermon conclusions give evidence of careful and intelligent planning to meet the traditional purposes of the sermon ending such as application, exhortation, and appeal. Cutting off cleanly, with material of high quality, the speaker's conclusions usually achieved an emotional climax in keeping with his purposes of persuasion.

Arrangement in the body of the sermon was found generally to meet the criteria of clarity, coherence, and unity with a variety of sermon plans being employed. Transitional devices provided a sense of movement to the materials, which were almost inevitably arranged in climax order. Where, on occasion, (as in some narrative sermons) Macartney attempted to draw lessons of a widely diverse nature from themes suggested by his Biblical materials, or introduced tangential materials thus suggested, his rhetorical practice is seen to fall short of established criteria for good speaking.

Attention and Interest Factors.--Macartney's sermons demonstrate the speaker's awareness of the indispensability of attention and interest to persuasion. He shrank from such dullness as might result from long quotations or generalized abstractions. Turning frequently to narration

and description, he skillfully introduced elements of movement and change, conflict and suspense, of the familiar, the proximate, the novel and concrete--all vital interest factors.

Ideas were made impressive by restatement and repetition ("cumulation"), or spiced by the introduction of an arresting phrase, or aphorism, or (less frequently) of a bit of subtle humor. Macartney appears to have hit upon a highly successful form of indirect suggestion in his preaching of Biblical biography, a means by which a sharp focusing of attention on the character held up for emulation or disapproval was achieved.

Style.--Like the other parts of rhetoric, style (or how a person "clothes his thoughts with language") is closely interrelated with its correlative members, and interacts with all aspects of public address. In this chapter, aspects of Macartney's style have already come into consideration in an evaluation of "emotional appeal" or of the factors of "attention and interest."

Macartney's skillful use of evocative language--loaded words, word imagery, and figurative elements in combination with narration and description, obviously contributed to a vividness of style.

A study of the recordings would indicate the presence of considerably more "personal" elements in his public speaking than would be indicated in the published sermons--preserving, thus, the communicative directness of conversational speech.

In some passages, one notes a quality of ornateness and grandeur reminiscent of the "grand" style of past pulpit masters. While this is no longer characteristic of most pulpit address, it appears to have been entirely appropriate for this particular speech context--the man, his

message, his audience and the cathedral-like edifice in which the speech-event occurred--a speech context best described as "conservative."

Delivery.--The rhetorical critic would raise a question with respect to certain aspects of Dr. Macartney's vocal delivery. Although he possessed an excellent voice, pleasant in quality, adequate in volume, and spoke with clear, intelligible articulation, his vocal delivery suffered from a lack of variety in pitch level and rate.

Apparently, however, these deficiencies in vocal variety and flexibility were not as serious handicaps to effectiveness with his audience as one might judge from impressions gained from the recordings.¹⁹ This is suggested by the fact that, of the nearly sixty respondents to a questionnaire directed to those who heard him regularly, only seven made reference to monotony in his vocal delivery, while the large majority wrote approvingly of all aspects of his delivery.²⁰

It is possible that the positive factors of his delivery such as have been noted, as well as his commanding physical appearance, appropriate bodily action, and demeanor in the pulpit, combined with sermon content of high interest value, had a meliorating influence on these deficiencies.

There is also a consideration involving Macartney's audience. If those who maintain that people possessing the "orthodox" or "conservative" attitude also tend to respect power and authority are correct,²¹ then it

¹⁹It must be remembered that the voice-recordings available for study were made in the latter years of Macartney's career and therefore cannot be said to represent accurately his speaking over the entire Pittsburgh period.

²⁰See Appendix XI-C.

²¹See J. A. C. Brown, The Techniques of Persuasion, pp. 58ff.

is entirely possible that the tone of authoritarian finality or dogmatism suggested by his vocal pattern actually appealed to those who sought an authoritarian figure with which to identify.

However that may be, to the extent that Macartney's delivery, particularly with respect to a lack of vocal variety in pitch level and rate, may have violated those principles governing the important factors of attention and interest, and communicativeness, it must be evaluated as rhetorically remiss.

Appraisal as to Effectiveness

The foregoing section reviewed Dr. Macartney's rhetorical practice from the standpoint of the "Artistic" theory, which holds that any speech in any situation is good in the degree to which it measures up to, or incorporates, the principles which constitute the art of speaking. While Macartney's speaking would generally rank high when evaluated from this standpoint, it is nevertheless possible that such "good" speaking was not necessarily "effective" speaking--achieving the desired response or "results." Causes that operate to produce results are extremely complex, and factors over which the speaker has no control may militate against the speaker or frustrate the desired audience response.

It remains, therefore, to determine whether Macartney's preaching was effective in achieving his purpose. Such an inquiry will involve an examination of the response the speaker sought to achieve.

An Evaluation of the Speaker's Purpose

From a study of Dr. Macartney's statements on preaching as well as of his actual practice, it was concluded that his dominant speech purpose was: (1) the winning of converts to the orthodox Christian faith

(the invitation to unite with First Church was implied here), and (2) the deepening of commitment to this faith on the part of "believing" Christians.

In evaluating this two-fold speech purpose, it must be remembered, as stated earlier in this chapter, that the achievement of the speaker's purpose is regarded as affective speaking only as that purpose can be shown to be "consistent with the dictates of responsible judgment and solicitous regard for the positive good of an enlightened society."

This study has uncovered nothing that might be said to raise the slightest question regarding the sincerity of the speaker's motives in preaching the Christian gospel as he perceived it. In various ways, over the years, Macartney repeatedly expressed his convictions regarding the power of the gospel he preached to meet the needs and solve the problems of mankind, all of which, he said, were the result of sin. His complete dedication to the proclamation of Jesus Christ as the deliverer from sin and its consequences, as represented by the prodigious output of effort involved in the steady flow of meticulously prepared sermons, would indicate a "solicitous regard for the positive good" of his hearers. The question remains as to whether or not that regard was the product of responsible judgment.

It would seem that "responsible judgment" should involve a man's awareness of the available evidence, his ability to evaluate that evidence, and his willingness to base his conclusions on the implications thus suggested.

As shown earlier, Macartney held tenaciously to the traditional orthodox Christian faith, although the mainstream of western theological and philosophical thought had rejected this option. It is evident from

a study of his sermons, and particularly his pronouncements at the height of the modernist-fundamentalist debate, that he had an intelligent grasp of the issues involved and that, having examined the evidence proffered by both his liberal counterparts and the non-Christian critics of Christian thought, he was prepared to reject it.

One might ask how, given the same evidence, Dr. Macartney was unable to accept the conclusions that were generally being adopted in this period. The answer would appear to lie in his evaluation of this evidence. It must be remembered that an objective appraisal of evidence of the nature under consideration in this study is well-nigh impossible since people bring to such a task the product of their environmental background--their education, personal experiences, and personal values.

In Dr. Macartney's case, it is clear that a number of conditioning factors were involved which understandably affected his interpretation of the evidence. Not only was he reared in a deeply religious home, but his early environment was steeped in the strictly conservative Presbyterian tradition. His frequent, almost nostalgic, references to the influences of that home (and particularly to his "remarkable" mother) and to the Covenanter community of Beaver Falls, point to these early influences as being highly significant in the formation of the "nuclear personality,"--the formation of attitudes, and the introjection of the values of family and primary reference groups.

The university years were a time of apparent liberalization of views, of experimentation with new ideas and attitudes; but if the character traits and attitudes of the early years of life are as resistant to change as Brown suggests,²² the turmoil of mind with respect to his

²²Brown, op. cit., chapter 2.

life's vocation following graduation was predictably resolved upon his return to the Beaver Falls environment by enrollment in Princeton Seminary. Here, under the influence of some of the leading thinkers in conservative theology, the original emotional attachment to the orthodox faith was re-inforced in a challenging and highly intellectual environment.

In addition to these environmental and psychological factors (all of which placed a high moral value on the acceptance of the orthodox faith) were the later influences growing out of his pastoral role in which a fulfillment of the expectations of his conservative congregations would tend further to re-inforce his commitment to this theological position. The desire for status within one's cultural community would provide strong motivation for conformity to the values of that culture. While it is highly unlikely that these influences even in their total effect would lead a person of Macartney's intellectual stature to ignore evidence contrary to his position, the likelihood that the significance of such evidence would be depreciated is obvious. If Macartney's judgment in theological matters was deeply influenced by environmental conditioning, it need not therefore be regarded as irresponsible simply because it failed to conform to the popular trends of the day, particularly in the light of post-War II developments in theological thinking. Macartney's theological positions to which his preaching gave utterance was an entirely responsible expression of his environment.

The Achievement of the Speaker's Purpose

It has been shown that Dr. Macartney's speech purpose was two-fold; the winning of adherents to the Christian faith (and by implication, the winning of members to the First Presbyterian Church of Pittsburgh), and

deepening of commitment to the Christian way on the part of "unbelievers."

It has been suggested that such a speech purpose was indeed "consistent with the dictates of responsible judgment and solicitous regard for the positive good of an enlightened society."

Inquiry is now made regarding the extent to which the speaker's purpose was realized. At this point the purpose of speech criticism meets its fulfillment which (as stated in the Introduction) by applying "standards of judgment deriving from the social interaction of a speech situation" to public addresses, seeks "to determine the immediate or delayed effect of the speeches upon specific audiences, and, ultimately, upon society."²³

The difficulty of measuring with any precision the effectiveness of Dr. Macartney's preaching on the basis of results achieved will be recognized at once. With respect to his purpose to win adherents to the Christian faith one asks, How many accepted Christianity during his twenty-six year career in Pittsburgh? The answer is not easily arrived at. Although reports indicate that large numbers of "visitors" attended both morning and evening preaching services at First Church during the period of Dr. Macartney's ministry, there is no accurate way of determining how many were influenced then or later to embrace Christianity by his preaching. For that matter, there is no way of knowing how many of the non-members who came to hear Dr. Macartney were not already Christians or at least pre-disposed to Christianity. It seems unlikely that as many non-Christians or neutral observers would assay to cross the threshold of a rather imposing cathedral with its special atmosphere and institutional ritual as might attend a preaching service in a more neutral

²³Thonssen and Baird, op. cit., p. 16.

place.

While Macartney, who regarded the conversion of lost sinners to Christ as the highest aim of preaching, almost always included an appeal to the "unconverted" who might be present, public invitations to which overt response could be made were not given, thus, no clue as to his effectiveness in winning converts is provided here. Even if one takes the total figure of the accessions to First Church during the years of his ministry from 1927 to 1953--an imposing 3,676²⁴--one cannot be sure how many of that number would have pointed to Dr. Macartney's preaching as the significant factor in their decision to unite with this specific church or, for that matter, how many were influenced to become Christians under his preaching but eventually became members of other churches. (It will be remembered that the invitation to unite with First Church was always only by implication and was never explicitly coupled with the acceptance of the Christian faith in Dr. Macartney's preaching.)

It should be noted that out of fifty-eight who responded to the questionnaire mailed to 100 parishioners under Dr. Macartney's ministry, thirty-six indicated that they had joined First Church during his tenure, and twenty-two of these suggested that his preaching was a significant influence. Although this would seem to indicate that his preaching was an important factor with many in their decision to join First Church, it is again difficult to draw any firm conclusions as to conversions, since it is impossible to say how many of these may have been at some stage of commitment to Christianity before they heard Dr. Macartney and asked for membership in his church.

²⁴Correspondence from the church office, First Presbyterian Church of Pittsburgh, April, 1966.

Although statistics of member accessions do not offer a precise measure of effectiveness with respect to the achievement of the specific speech purpose of winning converts to Christianity, membership accessions would certainly provide a "straw in the wind" in our search for means of evaluating the effectiveness of Dr. Macartney's preaching. Church records reveal that over half of the total number of accessions were added upon confession or reaffirmation of faith, a total of 1,951, or an average of seventy-five per year (the remainder being added by letter or certificate). As a matter of interest, figures are presented below by means of which comparisons may be made between First Church in Pittsburgh and the Madison Avenue New York Presbyterian church under the popular George A. Buttrick who was serving this church during the period under study--1927-1953. Checks are made at five-year intervals of the total membership and the accessions to the church through confession or reaffirmation of faith; a third column shows the percentage of the total membership which was represented by these accessions;²⁵

First Presbyterian Church, Pittsburgh
(Membership in 1927--2468)

<u>Year</u>	<u>Membership</u>	<u>Accessions by Confession or Reaffirmation of Faith</u>	<u>Percentage of Total Membership Represented by Accessions</u>
1932	2535	80	3.2%
1937	2582	86	3.4%
1942	2659	104	3.9%
1947	2582	58	2.3%
1952	2526	64	2.5%

²⁵Minutes of the General Assembly of the United Presbyterian Church in the U.S.A. (Office of the General Assembly, 510 Witherspoon Building, Philadelphia, Pennsylvania), for the years 1927, 1932, 1937, 1942.

Madison Avenue, New York, Presbyterian Church
(Membership in 1927--2498)

<u>Year</u>	<u>Membership</u>	<u>Accessions by Confession or Reaffirmation of Faith</u>	<u>Percentage of Total Membership Represented by Accessions</u>
1932	2706	132	4.8%
1937	2692	114	4.2%
1942	2828	109	3.8%
1947	3041	107	3.5%
1952	3162	126	3.9%

Although Macartney's church, disadvantaged geographically and environmentally in its downtown location, had held its own remarkably well in the face of the "retreat to the suburbs," the New York church would appear from these figures to have had the edge in membership growth and accessions during this period.²⁶

While the comparatively large number of accessions over the twenty-six year period would appear to indicate a successful achievement of his speech purpose--the winning of adherents to the Christian faith--we are nevertheless without a precise measure of effectiveness in this respect. We can say with more certainty, however, that Macartney's preaching was popularly received over the years of his Pittsburgh ministry.

A correlate speech purpose, and one perhaps more significant for Macartney's role as a pastor, was that of a deepening of commitment to

²⁶See Appendix XII for additional comparisons. In searching Presbyterian records for down-town Presbyterian churches in 1927 comparable in size to "First Church" of Pittsburgh and with a continuous history in the same location to the present, one learns that the Pittsburgh church is almost in a class by itself.

the Christian way on the part of those who were already "believers" or members of his congregation.

Again we are dealing in an area where precise measurement is impossible. However, if the personal testimony of members of the audience such as might become available through questionnaire response or letters received by the minister is accepted as valid evidence in measuring the speaker's effectiveness in realizing his speech ends, we have in the pastor-parishioner relationship a better than usual opportunity to study listener-response. In the case of Dr. Macartney, bulging files of personal correspondence received over his long pastorate were made available for study and supplemented the testimony evidence of the questionnaire as a rich source of data for the evaluation of listener-response and attitude change.

A large quantity of personal testimonies similar to the examples appearing below points to a successful realization of speech purpose with respect to those who were already professed Christians.

A birthday greeting carried the following comment:

You can never know how many times I left First Church and returned to my home and thanked God that He had spoken to me through you; how many times when troubles and doubts beset me, your sermons seemed to have been preached especially for me. You have brought me comfort and hope and renewed my faith so often.²⁷

Another wrote a note of appreciation at the time of Dr. Macartney's retirement:

I just cannot let you go without telling you that your life, your preaching and your example have meant much to me; more than I can express. . . . over the last few years, as you know, I have had considerable sorrow, worry and uneasiness . . . I was commended for my courage in seeing it through, but what [people] didn't know was-- it was your courage showing through me. Many times I have asked

²⁷Letter dated September 15, 1954, Macartney Files.

myself, "What would Dr. Macartney think was right?"--and believe me, it gave me the will to go on.²⁸

A parishioner who had been under Macartney's entire Pittsburgh ministry wrote soon after his retirement:

After listening to your sermons I realized how little I knew of God's plan for me and I began reading my Bible more often and more prayerfully, thus bringing me closer to Christ and bringing me the joy of a real Christian dissatisfied with the nominal life I had known. The twenty-six years under your leadership will always be a precious period in my life because I grew in Christian grace.²⁹

Testimonies of this nature could be multiplied at length and would indicate that the sermons of Macartney successfully achieved their purpose of deepening the commitment of "believers" to the Christian faith and life.

Similar evidence is provided by volunteered comments prompted by the questionnaire mailed to parishioners who had heard Macartney.

An engineer wrote:

. . . His preaching and teaching profoundly molded my young life and has left its imprint on my adult character.³⁰

The vice-president of a corporation volunteered that,

. . . during the period in which I knew Dr. Macartney my life was changed and my feeling toward the church went from lack of interest to be deeply interested. Various factors caused this and I am sure that the preaching of Dr. Macartney was at least one of these factors.³¹

Another lists several areas in which his Christian commitment had been affected:

There is no doubt under his preaching and because of his life and ministry my early life was guided and strengthened. My knowledge

²⁸Letter dated September 20, 1953, Macartney Files.

²⁹Letter dated December 14, 1953, Macartney Files.

³⁰Respondent #57.

³¹Respondent #42.

of the Bible was greatly increased and much of any Christian witness I have today had its roots in his service at First Church.³²

Testimonies such as the following were freely offered:

"The Gospel he preached helped me to become a stronger Christian."³³

"Our Christian life was deepened and we grew in knowledge under his ministry."³⁴

"Through his preaching, I became a member, and am still a member, and attend Sunday services regularly."³⁵

"Dr. Macartney made Christ a living reality in my life."³⁶

In brief, then, while it is impossible to say with certainty to what extent the speaker's purpose of winning converts to Christianity was realized, the large number of accessions (against the considerable odds of the "downtown" location) during his ministry would suggest a successful realization of this purpose. However, perhaps a more significant indication of the persuasive effectiveness of Macartney's preaching lies in listener-response which points to his positive influence upon the beliefs and attitudes of his 2500-member congregation.

Conclusions

The results of the foregoing investigation would seem to point to certain conclusions pertinent not only to the more limited area of preaching but to public address in general:

Macartney's insistence that preaching is an art, the end of which is persuasion, and in the pursuit of which "it makes all the difference

³²Respondent #41.

³³Respondent #3.

³⁴Respondent #22.

³⁵Respondent #23.

³⁶Respondent #46.

in the world" how one proceeds, runs counter to much contemporary (1966) homiletic theory which tends to depreciate "form" in favor of "content."³⁷

He would have rejected any concept of the gospel as a kind of magic, an objective "given" that comes to us untouched by human hands. By his practice, he demonstrated the thesis that preaching, like all other arts, is a man's witness to what he has seen, heard, felt, and tasted of the mystery of his existence, including the mysteries of faith which he has not known by himself alone; the preacher's task being, then, to give it form, substance, color, texture, recognizable by his fellows.

Macartney's techniques for the representation of reality and experience, particularly his application of the function of the imagination to the preaching art, would seem to warrant study by preachers regardless of their particular theological biases:

1. The narrative form. Macartney saw that the Christian gospel is for the most part a simple narrative of persons, places, happenings, and conversations, rather than a verbal exposition of general ideas--that the Bible gives a dramatic rendering of truth rather than an exposition of it. The popular response to, and apparent effectiveness of, his imaginative dramatization of the Christian gospel by means of the narrative form (particularly Biblical narrative) would suggest that preachers might well recognize and use the narrative element in the gospel, the persons and events, more than they do--that possibly the power of assertion in preaching has been over-estimated, and the power of narrative to communicate meaning and to influence the lives of people is underestimated.

³⁷See, e.g., Karl Barth, The Preaching of the Gospel (Philadelphia: Westminster, 1963) and the work of a Barthian disciple, Dietrich Ritschl, A Theology of Proclamation (Richmond, Va.: John Knox Press, 1963).

2. Description. Macartney, whose concept of "dramatic power" in preaching included the imaginative recreation of setting and situation through description, has demonstrated again the importance of conceiving and feeling a background in the communication of ideas. He saw correctly that one of the most important functions of the imagination is its power to supply the natural surroundings of an object, action, or conception--that a fact in itself is dead; it must be assimilated, it must be seen, and become food for the imagination before it becomes vital truth.

Macartney's methods of creating emotional and physical setting in which to place his ideas (frequently drawn from a Biblical narrative) would seem to merit careful study.

3. The imagination and feeling. Macartney, who spoke often of the importance of the "warm heart" for preaching, demonstrated in his pulpit address the interrelationship of imagination and feeling and their reaction upon each other: deep emotion kindling the imagination and expressing itself in imaginative form, while imaginative insight kindles and deepens emotion.

Apart from the power of imagination to arouse feeling by vividly conceiving and communicating ideas as present realities, there is its power to create in the speaker an identification and sympathy with people, that true altruism by which one soul can appreciate the point of view of another.

Macartney's preaching reflects this sensitive understanding of, and rapport with, the inmost feelings, struggles, desires, and motives of men. The persuasive power of such a sensitive identification with people "where they live," coupled with the application to men's needs of fresh, new insights drawn from specific (often biographical) Biblical

material is worthy of careful consideration by those seeking for the bases of persuasive preaching.

4. The imagination and style. Macartney's theoretical and practical emphasis of figurative elements in style might well be closely examined even by those who would reject the concept of an infallible Word containing unequivocal statements about God, man, and the world. For language, when applied to God, is always at best but a pointer toward Reality. No human speech can be regarded as capable of a one-to-one correlation with the nature and acts of God. Style, then, becomes a functional concern which makes any religious speech possible. The marshalling of metaphor and simile becomes imperative, not simply as embellishment or an attempt to influence the emotions, but as an attempt to say what cannot be said (even as Christ's constant use of the parable, the simile, and metaphor, pointed to the poetic analogy).

A study of Macartney's application of imagination to preaching, as in comparison (giving rise to such figures as simile, metaphor, contrast, and antithesis), or the mental processes of making things live (personification, vision, apostrophe, allegory, and the like), should prove valuable to all who recognize that preaching cannot divorce form and content, and therefore must concern itself with style if the sermon is to speak truly.

.

It is suggested, therefore, that contemporary homiletic theories which would tend to minimize the problem of communion in preaching, need the corrective influence of a careful look at a preacher like Dr. Clarence E. Macartney. Relying on nothing but "straight Bible preaching" against the considerable odds of the prevailing climate of

opinion, and of the geographical or environmental location of his church, he was apparently successful over the long period of his Pittsburgh ministry in holding and building his congregation while at the same time attracting "throngs of people of every sort."³⁸

.

Several conclusions, perhaps of a more tentative nature and suggestive of further research for purposes of confirming or modifying rhetorical theory, may be said to arise out of the rather unique speaker-audience relationship inherent in the setting of the church with its minister and parishioners.

Macartney's strong ethical proof established over the years of pastoral contact was undoubtedly a most powerful element of persuasion in his ministry. A study of ethos factors in the pastor-parishioner setting would appear to promise helpful returns regarding the relative persuasive power of ethos among close associates and fellow church members. In this connection, one might also speculate regarding the interrelationship of ethos and delivery. While a good delivery is known to affect positively one's ethical proof, in Macartney's case his ethos seems to have affected particularly the conception of delivery factors in the mind of the listeners. His vocal delivery, while adequate for intelligibility, appears to have suffered from a lack of variety in pitch level and rate; a factor which, theoretically, would have seriously hampered interest and attention. Parishioners, however, seem hardly to have been aware of this; and they generally speak in commendatory terms of all aspects of his delivery. One wonders what might have been

³⁸Blackwood, Andrew W., Preaching From the Bible (New York: Abingdon-Cokesbury Press, 1941), pp. 31f.

revealed by a comparative study of Macartney's ethos and delivery factors as conceived by his parishioners and by an audience hearing him for the first time (as in a week's out-of-town preaching mission).

A final observation has to do with a possible "rhetoric of orthodoxy." Macartney's preaching would seem to confirm the assumption that a Biblical literalist for whom the Bible constituted the prime source of speaking materials would tend to be more concrete, more realistic, since the Bible is realistic in this way (and, if the speaker has imagination, he will be pictorial and biographical as well, for imagination rises out of actual persons and concrete things rather than from abstractions).

One would certainly hesitate to conclude from a single study, however, that preaching which employs the presuppositions of Christian orthodoxy tends inevitably toward concreteness as compared to a tendency toward a higher level of abstractions where Biblical literalism is rejected. For one thing, one can never be sure how much one's psychological make-up may influence what is actually seen in the Scriptural passages.

In the case of Dr. Macartney, it is suggested that his espousal and earnest defense of the orthodox faith were important ingredients of his persuasive appeal. It must be remembered that he spoke to an age politically, economically, and spiritually in search of security and certainty. For many Americans, Protestantism had lost its voice; and for them the tentative, uncertain gropings of theological experimentalists were too unsure an anchor. For such, Macartney's message, presented with conviction and authority, had a strong appeal. It was a case where an articulate spokesman, a cogent expression, and a motivated audience united in the arena of public address.

APPENDICES

APPENDIX I--Letter from Publisher

Since 1789

ABINGDON PRESS

New York - Nashville

201 Eight Avenue, South - Nashville - Tennessee 37203

Thomas E. Carpenter
Manager

May 12, 1966

Mr. Arnold Kurtz
5035 Butler Drive
Riverside, California 92505

Dear Mr. Kurtz:

This is in response to your letter of May 1, 1966, regarding the books of Dr. Clarence E. Macartney. Abingdon Press was the publisher of 29 of Dr. Macartney's books, 15 of which are still in print. I enclose a complete list of the titles which we have published.

According to our records a total of 410,177 copies have been sold through November 30, 1965, which is our last record posting date. This gives an average sale of 14,144 copies per title. His most popular book was not of a sermonic nature, MACARTNEY'S ILLUSTRATIONS, which has sold a total of 55,197 copies. The most popular book of sermons has been GREAT WOMEN OF THE BIBLE, which has sold a total of 34,957 copies.

Sincerely,

(Signed)

Thomas E. Carpenter
Manager

TEC:jg

APPENDIX II--
Letter from Book Seller

1019 Wealthy St., S.E./
Grand Rapids, Michigan / 49506

BAKER BOOK HOUSE

May 5, 1966

Mr. Arnold Kurtz
5035 Butler Drive
Riverside, California 92505

Dear Mr. Kurtz:

Its a pleasure to reply to your letter of May 1 in regard to the demand for Dr. Macartney's sermons.

I have just checked with the manager of our Used Book Department, where we specialize in theological books. The demand for used volumes of Macartney remains strong and we predict that Macartney's sermons will sell for a long time to come. Sermons by Clovis G. Chappel and Clarence E. Macartney were always our best sellers. Today, Macartney outsells Chappel. In popularity, I would say that Dr. Macartney ranks with George H. Morrison, James Stewart, Fosdick, Spurgeon, Talmage, Weatherhead, and Maclaren.

If you need more information, please let us know. With greetings and best wishes, I remain,

Sincerely yours,

BAKER BOOK HOUSE

(Signed)

Herman Baker

HB:es

APPENDIX III--Letter from Book Seller

K R E G E L ' S

BOOK STORE

525 Eastern Avenue, S. E.
Grand Rapids, Michigan 49503

From the office of
Robert L. Kregel

May 4, 1966

Mr. Arnold Kurtz
5035 Butler Drive
Riverside, California 92505

Dear Mr. Kurtz:

During the lifetime of the late Dr. Clarence E. Macartney, we sold hundreds of his books. Seemingly he appealed to the Liberal as well as the Conservative pastor.

In our second-hand book department which numbers some 75,000 used religious and theological books, we never have an abundant supply of Dr. Clarence Edward Macartney's books. It seems they are picked up almost as fast as they are secured by us.

During recent months some of Macartney's books have come out in paper-back form. Since Dr. Macartney's death, the demand for his books new has dropped considerably. Even the paper-back edition has not gone too well with us.

I trust the above information will be helpful in your presentation.

Cordially yours,

(Signed)

Robert L. Kregel

RLK:hk

APPENDIX IV

INVENTORY OF BOOKS IN DR. MACARTNEY'S LIBRARY

(Inventory of books in the study and second office
made by Mrs. Ruth Tabler at the close of Dr. Macartney's
ministry in "First Church," 1953.)

<u>Category</u>	<u>Number of Volumes</u>
Volumes	396
Homiletics	92
Church History	38
History	86
Poetry	156
Commentaries	245
Biography and Autobiography	244
Encyclopaedia	24
Anti-Nicene Fathers	23
Theology, Atonement, Immortality	320
Evolution and Science	17
Young Men, Marriage, etc.	43
Macartney	65
Life of Christ	24
Teachings of Christ	81
Devotional	91
Hymns	50
Paul	35
Bibles	26
Constitution and Law	29
Old and New Testament	66
Bible	61
Holy Land	47
Classics	269
Illustrations	27
Bible	29
Bible Characters	35
Novels, Travel and Books on	
English Language	169
Miscellaneous	<u>266</u>
Total	3,074

APPENDIX V

SERMON--"THE DOOM OF EVIL"*

"The mule that was under him went away." II Sam. 18:9.

The mule that was under him went away, and there he was left hanging between the heaven and the earth. Fleeing from the battle in which the rebel army had been defeated, Absalom, going through the wood was caught by his head in the boughs of a great oak and his mule went from under him, and there he was left hanging--just waiting for the three fatal darts from the hand of Joab and then to be cast into that pit in the wood and to be covered with the stones of detestation and execration as the soldiers of the victorious armies marched by.

But that was not where Absalom expected to be buried, for yonder in the king's dale he had built for himself a lordly mausoleum, "Absalom's place," as he called it; and in that costly tomb he expected to be buried with the kingdom's lamentation.

When David's army marched out to do battle with the rebel army that morning in the wood of Ephraim, as each division, one under Joab, one under Ittai, and one under Abishai passed by, it was halted and addressed briefly by David who said to them in moving, pathetic words, "Deal gently with the young man Absalom, even for my sake." David feared lest that dissipated and brilliant, blackguard son of his would perish in the battle and that is exactly what happened.

After the defeat of his army, Absalom, mounted on the royal mule, was trying to escape. He rode suddenly into a detachment of the army of David and then turned his thwarted mule about and fled in another direction. But going through the wood, the branches of this great oak caught his head and his beast ran from under him and there he was left alone deserted by those who had followed him into the battle, deserted even by his mule. Now, that mule preaches a timely and timeless sermon, declaring the truth that ultimately everything that the evil man, the ungodly man, depends upon goes from under him, and in the end he is left forsaken and alone as Absalom was. In the powerful words of the book of Job, the words of the eloquent Elihu: "His confidence shall be rooted out and he shall be brought to the king of terrors." And that is precisely what happened to Absalom. His confidence was rooted out, and he was brought to judgment to the king of terrors.

I suppose that nearly all of us here, if we have had the opportunity, will find that old ruins have a fascination for us. We like to clamber over old moated castles and fortifications and think of the

* As taken from a tape recording of a sermon preached October 21, 1951. The published version appears in Strange Texts But Grand Truths (New York: Abingdon-Cokesbury Press, 1953) pp. 136ff.

life that was lived within those grim and now crumbling walls, of the battles and sieges which took place there. There is a certain fascination also about the ruins of the notable men of the Bible: men like Gideon who commenced under the hand of God by delivering Israel out of the hand of the Midianite horde and then at the end of his life set up an image, the sacred chronicler said, even at Ophrah, where the angel of God had called him; or Balaam, lying there covered with blood amid the heaps of the dead on that battlefield where God smote the Midianites--Balaam who almost more than anyone in the Bible hailed the glorious future of God's people; or Samson, of whom it is written that he began to save Israel, who made a glorious beginning and then in the end sold his honor to a harlot, and we see him with his eyes put out grinding like a beast in the mill at Gaza; and Saul, who was head and shoulders over all Israel physically and also in some other respects, who had many grand traits but whom we see last of all going at the midnight hour into the cave and den of the Witch of Endor to learn of his doom on the morrow on the hills of Gilboa in the battle with the Philistines; and Solomon, the wisest of kings and one of the most splendid and most glorious, but who in his old age was led astray by his heathen wives and bowed his aged knees to false gods and idols.

Now here is Absalom. Absalom was not a great man as these others were great men and who fell into ruin, but he was great in his talents, great in his gifts, great in his possibilities.

First of all, he had a magnificent body--a beautiful specimen of manhood, we are told. From the sole of his foot to the crown of his head there was not a blemish on him, and men remarked of the splendor of that hair of which he was so proud and which in the end was the agent of his destruction. He had great ability also. It took ability and cleverness to set in motion the great rebellion which he raised against his father. He had a pleasing and persuasive personality and the gift of speech. Whenever a man came with a complaint to the king, David, and asked David to judge his cause, Absalom was waiting there by the gate and he took the man by the hand and kissed him and said to him, "Tell me your story, perhaps I can help you." And when the man had told his story Absalom sighed and said, "Oh that I were the judge in Israel, then I would avenge you." And so Absalom stole the hearts of the people.

He had also high ambitions. He wanted to occupy a high place in the world and to be remembered after he was dead. That was why he built that splendid tomb, that pillar of Absalom in the wood. In short, he seems to have been endued with every grace but the grace of God; and yet, with all these gifts, or rather, perhaps in spite of them, he goes down in ruin and is remembered only as a wreck and a ruin.

Now how can we account for that? Well, first of all, selfishness. He was an utterly selfish man. He was ambitious but his ambitions ended with himself. One of the philosophers used to say, "Always treat a human being as an end in himself and to himself and never as a means to your end." Absalom treated other men only as a means to his end. He admired nobody. He had no pity, no magnanimity; and he did not scruple, if he could have done it, to rise to the throne upon the corpse of his father. Well, men who have ambition like that, the record of the past

tells us, often discover that their ambition ends them; and the world will not long stay with one when it becomes evident that his only desire is his own exaltation and advancement. Jesus said, you know, "He that exalteth himself shall be abased," and in the Bible there is no more striking illustration of the truth of that than the life and wreck of Absalom.

Again, Absalom was lacking in another cardinal virtue, reverence. Self-knowledge, self-reverence, self-control--these alone lead life to sovereign power. Absalom had no reverence for himself. His ambitions, as we have seen, ended with himself. That brilliant mind and intellect of Virginia, John Randolph, speaking to young men used to say, "Make to yourself an image, and in defiance of the Decalogue, worship it, whether it be excellence in medicine, in law, or in politics." Well, that was good advice to stir their ambition except for that one clause, "in defiance of the Decalogue." It's a dangerous thing to defy the Decalogue, and Absalom found that out. Another man in the Bible who had no reverence for himself was Esau, and the great sentence in the New Testament says of him, "that profane person"--not profane in the sense that he was taking the name of God in vain, although he may have done that, but profane in the literal sense that he was unfenced, that there was nothing sacred in him; everything was common ground and territory--that profane man who for one morsel of pottage sold his birthright. Absalom, too, had a great birthright--the son of the great king and the son of a noble woman, too. When he was born his father called him Absalom, "the father of peace,"--a sad misnomer because to the father and to his friends and to himself he was the father of woe and shame and sorrow immeasurable.

He had no reverence for others either. He slew his own brother and profaned the house of his father, and if he could have done so, would have seized the crown at the cost of his father's life. In his rush for fame and worldly honor he trampled under foot every natural affection.

It goes without saying, too, that he had no reverence for God. If you'll look in this second book of Samuel, you'll see that the story of Absalom covers many pages, but there is one striking fact about that record and that is that, save in one instance, there is no reference on the part of Absalom to God, and that one instance was false and hypocritical. When he sprang the rebellion against his father he came to David and said that he had made a vow to God and he wanted to go down to Hebron to fulfill that vow, but that, of course, was hypocritical and false. He is perhaps the best illustration in the Bible of that kind of a man described by the Psalmist when he said, "God is not in all his thoughts." That great statesman in America in the last quarter of the nineteenth century, James G. Blaine, writing to his son once said to him, "There is no true success in life without purity and virtue and the religious consecration of all that we have to God." Absalom had no reverence for God and his mule went from under him. The wise man of Proverbs said, "My son, the beginning of knowledge is the fear of God," and the Christian apostle said, "Godliness is profitable to all things, having the promise of the life which now is and of the life which is to come." So, the ungodly man loses out not only in this world but in the

world to come.

There are two historical figures about whom I think when I read the story of Absalom, and this last week I was reading about both of those men. One of them, the brilliant Greek leader of the armies and statesman, Alcibiades. Like Absalom, he had a beautiful person, he was gifted intellectually, he had a pleasing, gracious manner, he was wealthy and a spendthrift but he had no moral character. Today he serves the Athenians, his own nation; tomorrow he is in a conspiracy to betray them to the Syracusans, and tomorrow to betray them to the Persians. In his celebrated Lives, Plutarch, writing of Alcibiades said of him sagely that there was a tradition among the Greeks that the chameleon--that little creature you know which assumes protective coloring wherever it fastens itself--that the chameleon could assume every color but one, white, but that Alcibiades was able to assume every color in whatever company he happened to find himself. If he was among good men, he was a good man, if he was among bad men, he was a bad man, and he perished miserably in the end as Absalom did.

The other is a character in our own American history, Aaron Burr. Certainly he makes you think of Absalom. He had a great birthright, the son of a Presbyterian minister, the pastor of the First Presbyterian Church of Newark, and then the second president of Princeton College. And his mother--the gifted daughter of Jonathan Edwards whom Aaron Burr rightly described as the one clear mind that America had produced. So, you see, he was the son of the second president of Princeton and the grandson of the third president of Princeton. He had a brilliant career at college, and in the army (for a time) of the Revolution, and then as a lawyer, and as a Senator, and as the presiding officer--as vice-president in the Senate. But he had no moral character. When his friends came to Washington to get him to appoint Aaron Burr as minister to France he said, "No, I will never appoint any man to an important post like that in whose integrity I have no confidence." And the great political figure of that day whom he slew in the duel, Alexander Hamilton, said the same thing of him--and yet a brilliant man, gifted as a writer and a speaker, most gracious and appealing in his manner; but the fear of God was not in his heart. And if it is true, that old tradition, that during the Whitefield revivals he said aloud, "Goodby, God," then his life is an echo of that conclusion and that goodbye.

At West Point, in one of the halls there, they have places along the walls dedicated to the great military figures (sort of niches) and you will see the names of Washington, and Gates, and Morgan, and leaders of the Mexican War, Scott and the rest of them, and more modern ones; but there is one niche that has no name under it, and when you look upon that you think of an officer of our army. You see him fighting by the side of Montgomery, you see him leading that great charge at Saratoga, the decisive battle of the Revolution; then the scene changes. You see him at the midnight hour on the banks of the Hudson bartering his soul to Satan and betraying his country--Benedict Arnold--hero, patriot, traitor.

So these then are the truths that are struck and which resound when you pronounce the name of Absalom--that at length everything goes

from under the evil man. Take a final look at those two monuments; first, that monument there in the king's dale, that beautiful pillar and tomb built of costly marble. At noonday the sun's rays salute it; at night the moon casts her ethereal mantle over it, but it is a tomb without a tenant. Yonder in the wood under that heap of stones the body of Absalom was buried. The fear of God is the beginning of wisdom.

APPENDIX VI

SERMON--"THE OLD DINNER BELL"*

There are two bells whose music, above that of all others, echoes in my memory. One was the bell in the tower of Geneva College, the melodious tones of which I used to hear as a child when it summoned the students to their morning classes or to the Sabbath convocations. Its tones rang sweetly out over the hillside and across the Beaver River. The other was the family bell which was rung in our home. It stood, just as you see it now, on a table in the front hall. Looking into it, I can see reflected there the faces of my parents and my brothers and sister. Voices now silent for many years speak in the echoes of this bell. We had a family horse, a family cow, a family dog, a family cat, a ten-gauge family shot gun, a family boat on the river, a family bath tub, a family rooster, and, last but not least, this family bell. It had to be, as you see it is, a large bell, the tones of which could be heard even in the spacious attic and in the vast cellar of our house, and far off in the woods, too; or down by the river. This is the bell that awakened us in the morning, called us to breakfast, dinner, and supper, and to family worship.

I.

It was the Rising Bell

In that respect it was a symbol of life and its duties. The new day was before us. It reminded us of the opportunities and the obligations of each new day and bade us greet the new day with courage and expectation. Every new day is, as it were, a new life. Whatever the mistakes or failures of yesterday, the new day speaks to you with its clear and beautiful voice and calls you to fidelity and industry and the proper use of time. "The night cometh when no man can work." Those words, spoken by Jesus when He healed the man born blind, towards the close of the day, "The night cometh," were written in Greek letters on the face of the watch carried by Samuel Johnson. For all of us there is an appointed day; and after that the night, when no man can work.

II.

The Bell which called us to our Meals

This is the bell which called us to breakfast, to dinner, and to supper. For breakfast, we had porridge. Samuel Johnston in his Dictionary defines oatmeal as a grain fed to horses in England and to men in Scotland. When an Englishman told that to a Scotchman, the Scotchman retorted: "And where do you find such horses as in England and such men as in Scotland?"

* Address delivered by Dr. Macartney at the Thanksgiving Meeting of the Tuesday Noon Men's Club, November 25, 1952. This sermon with its elements of humor illustrates Macartney's adaptation to his audience.

For dinner we could go down to Steinfeldt's butcher shop and for twenty-five cents get a steak which did for the whole family of seven. On Thanksgiving Day, there was, of course, a turkey; and on Christmas, a duck or two. Now and then we had a squirrel, a pheasant, or a rabbit. I wish I could have over again the thrill we used to get when we hurried down the hillside in the morning and opened up the figure 4 trap and found a rabbit in it. Once I shot a rabbit, a big one, and laid him on the back porch. One of my older brothers told me I had better clean the rabbit at once, because something might happen to it. I answered that there would be plenty of time for that. But when I went back to get the rabbit, I found nothing but his tail feathers. Our big dog "Duke," had helped himself to the rabbit. That morning at family worship, as, according to our custom, we were reading the verses around the family circle--and it was a chapter from Proverbs--the verse which fell to me was this, "The slothful man roasteth not that which he took in the hunt."

The three meals were always there; and without our care or labor or forethought. So it is that this bell spoke of parental care and love. We toiled not, neither did we spin; but in the morning, at noon, and at evening the table was spread with things necessary for our bodily life. So it is, then, that this bell echoes that petition of the prayer which our Lord taught His disciples to pray, "Give us this day our daily bread." When we read of want and hunger in other parts of the world, of men and women in Europe searching for food amid discarded garbage of American soldiers stationed there, we have reason to be thankful that the lines have fallen unto us in bountiful America, and that no famine in bread has ever threatened the life of our people.

III.

This was the Bell of Discipline

This was the bell of discipline. When it rang, as you have heard it ring just now, it rang with the note of authority. It was not a voice to be trifled with. When we heard it, we had to get up in the morning. If skating or swimming on the river, or roaming through the woods, when we heard that voice we knew it was a voice which had to be obeyed. It was a curfew, too, which rang at night and called us to our beds.

We had something else, too, in the way of discipline in our home. I wonder if there is any Scotsman here, or man of Scottish descent, who knows what the taws was? (Several hands went up) For the uninitiated, let me say that the taws was a leather strap about a cubit and a half long, slit at one end, with a hole in the other end so that it could be hung to a nail. I recall distinctly where it hung in our house, just inside the door as you went down to the cellar; and I can hear, too, the occasional command, "Clarence, bring the taws!" Good old taws! If it had not been for the taws, I might not be addressing this great crowd of men today.

IV.

The Bell of Worship

This was the bell which rang for family worship. I can still see the dumbwaiter closet on the shelf of which were kept the black-bound Bibles which the family used at family worship. There we received our first lessons in reading and in public speech. Seated on my father's knee as child, I followed his forefinger as he traced out the words for me to pronounce, as from the oldest to the youngest he read the sacred page around the family circle. It was there I first heard of Abraham, and Jacob, and Moses, and Samuel, and David, and Isaiah; of Peter, and James, and Paul, and John; and the old, old story of the Saviour's birth, temptation, miracles, crucifixion, and resurrection from the dead.

It was there, too, at the family altar, that we learned of the needs of others besides ourselves, as they were remembered in the petitions of our father or our mother. At a convocation of the University of Pennsylvania I heard the Dean of the college relate a conversation he had with a physician missionary who had returned to America after a long term of service in India. The Dean asked this doctor what his impressions were upon returning to his native land, and what he thought of the disregard for human life and the wave of crime inundating the land. His answer was: "My father gathered his family together each morning and commended us to God's keeping before we separated for the duties of the day. On my return from India I found that he had given up the practise of family prayer entirely, and that my younger brothers and sisters were individualists who cared nothing for the moral and religious influence of the home. What is true of my father's household is true of many homes throughout the length and breadth of the land. This, in my judgment, is the explanation of the lack of moral earnestness and disregard for the rights of others."

V.

The Bell of Heaven

This is the bell that rings of heaven and the reunion in heaven. The family which it used to summon to the family table and to the family altar is now divided. Part of them have "crossed the flood"; all the others will follow. I wonder if there will be the music of bells in heaven? Bells on earth echoed the voice of God, and spoke of the heavenly life. Perhaps, then, in addition to the music of trumpets and harps, the trumpets of victory and overcoming, there will be also the music of bells. If by divine grace I one day hear the bells of heaven, I am sure that in their music I shall hear the echo of this old family bell, the bell which echoed through the house, in the attic, in the cellar, in the stable, in the woods, and over the river; and as I look now upon this bell I can see reflected in it the faces of father and mother, the brothers and the sister.

Not all, I know, had such a home, or such a bell which echoes in their memory. But God has hung a bell within every man's soul. That bell calls you to the highest. It calls you Godward and heavenward.

Listen now to its music! It speaks to you of early ideals, of high purpose and Christian character and Christian hope. If anyone here today has been falling away from those things, from the music that once guided his life, then let the sound of this old bell, as you listen to it, call you back to God.

"There's a land beyond the river,
That we call the sweet forever;
And we only reach that shore by faith's decree.
One by one we'll gain the portals,
There to dwell with the immortals
When they ring the golden bells for you and me."

APPENDIX VII

SERMON--"THE GIRL WHO OUTWITTED A WICKED KING"*

This sermon, appearing on the following pages, was Xeroxed from Macartney's original manuscript and reveals his adaptation to this age group as well as the meticulous care taken in his work even in addresses to children. The sermon was the first of a series of eight biographical sketches from the Bible presented to the Friday Night Girls Club. No date appeared on the manuscripts.

* Macartney files.

I.
MIRIAM
THE GIRL WHO OUTWITTED A ^{wicked} CRUEL KING
Exodus 2:1-10

There is just one thing out of which you can make a good woman, and what do you think that is? A good girl. I am going to tell you the story of a good girl who became a good woman.

This was centuries ago, but a girl ^{was} just the same then as she is today; just as bright, just as pretty, just as loveable, and, sometimes, just as naughty. It was in a time when Rameses II was the king of Egypt. Long before that, in the days of Joseph, Jacob's son, who had been sold by his brothers into Egypt, the Israelites had settled in that land. When they grew in numbers and in prosperity, and were on their way to become a great nation, the Egyptians began to persecute them. But the more they were persecuted, the more they increased in numbers and in prosperity.

Then the cruel king, or Pharaoh, of Egypt gave an order that the nurses were to kill all the boy babies when they were born. Why did they not kill the girl babies? I suppose because the boy babies could become soldiers, and the girls could not. That was why he commanded that the boy babies were to be killed.

But these nurses feared God more than they feared the king, and did not do as the king had commanded them; but saved the boy babies alive.

Then the wicked king ordered that every male child should be cast into the River Nile as soon as he was born. You can imagine how the mothers and fathers of the Jews felt when that order was made known to them, that they had to cast their baby boys into the Nile, where they would be drowned, or eaten by the hungry crocodiles.

Now in one of the homes of the tribe of the Levites, ~~where~~ ^{when} a fine baby boy had been born, his mother and father determined that Pharaoh would not get him. They would not throw their boy into the Nile. So they hid him in the house. Every

time when one of Pharaoh's secret police went down the street, ready to rush

any house where they heard the cry of a baby, this baby's mother and father, and his sister Miriam, would quiet and hush the baby so that he wouldn't cry.

But as the weeks went by, the baby was getting too big and his voice too loud for them to hide him in that way. So they made an ark, or a little boat like a basket out of the bulrushes, and daubed it with pitch so that it wouldn't leak. ^{Then they} ~~and~~ carrying it down to the river, ^{where} they placed it among the tall weeds near the bank of the Nile, ~~and~~ then put the baby in it, and left its sister, Miriam, to watch and see that no harm came to the child. Whenever she saw the snout of a crocodile sticking up out of the water near the little ark, she would throw stones at him until he disappeared.

A few years ago, when I was in Egypt, I climbed early one morning up to the top of the Great Pyramid to see the sun rise over the desert and over the Nile. It was a great sight! In one direction the waves of rolling sand; in the other direction I could see afar off the domes and ^{spires} ~~minarets~~ of ~~the~~ Cairo; and in ^{the distance} ~~between~~ the River Nile, with the camels and asses and peasants walking along the banks, and the tall masts of the boats with their colored sails rising high above the palm trees. Not far from Cairo, I could see the very place where ~~the cradle of Moses had laid~~ ^{lay} ~~his ark~~ in the river.

One morning, as Miriam was watching by the river bank, she heard the sound of voices. First of all came a number of tall black eunuchs, or slaves, and after them a number of maidens, and then, carried in a chair with a canopy over it, came the beautiful princess, the daughter of Pharaoh. She had come down to the river to take a bath.

As her attendants were preparing her to step down into the river, one of them saw the cradle, or ark, of Moses in the water, and drew the little boat into the shore.

They were afraid at the strange faces and the strange voices, and, just like any other baby would have done, began to cry.

When Pharaoh's daughter saw the baby and heard him cry, she said, "This is

one of the Hebrews' children," ~~and~~ She felt so sorry for him that she made up
in spite of her father's wicked decree.
her mind she would save the baby's life. Just then little Miriam, the sister
of the baby, stepped out from her hiding place and said to the princess, "Do you
want me to go and call a nurse of the Hebrew women, that she may nurse the child
for you?" The princess said, "Yes, go and call a nurse." And whom do you think
Miriam called? She ran away to her home and brought her ^{own} mother, ~~and~~ the baby's own
mother, back with her! The princess, told the mother ^{who} ~~although she~~ didn't know
that ^{she} ~~it~~ was the mother of the baby to take the baby and bring him up for her.

When the child was several years old, ~~then~~ he was brought to the palace
of the princess, and carefully brought up as if he had been her own son. Thus
the quick witted Miriam, through her affection and her fidelity in watching, was
able to save her brother's life, and that brother became a great man, one of the
greatest in the world, and one day brought his people up out of the land of
Egypt and out of the house of bondage.

The next we hear of Miriam, and she is now quite a young woman, was after
the Hebrews had passed through the Red Sea, which opened up a way for them, but
~~which~~ drowned all Pharaoh's armies and his chariots when they tried to follow the
people of Israel. ~~and destroy them.~~ They had a big thanksgiving service on the
other side of the sea. With a ^{harp} ~~timbre~~ in her hand, Miriam led the choir of the
Hebrew women, as they praised God and gave thanks. And this was the song they
sang; "Sing ye to the Lord, for He hath triumphed gloriously. The horse and his
rider hath He cast into the sea."

The next time we hear of Miriam we hear something about her that is very
sad. ^{that is,} Moses had married a Cushite, ~~an~~ a black woman, and Miriam didn't like that,
and was very angry with her brother. She had another brother, Aaron, who was the
spokesman for Moses, and this brother and Miriam complained about Moses, and said,
"Hath the Lord indeed spoken only by Moses, Hath He not also spoken by us?" ^{At} But
the Lord, who hears everything that we say or think, heard what Aaron and Miriam
had said about their brother Moses. God was very angry with them, and punished
Miriam, who must have been a beautiful young woman, by turning her into a leper.

She became a leper white as snow. She would have remained a leper had not Aaron asked Moses to pray for her. Moses still loved Miriam, for he had not forgotten what he had been told, how Miriam had saved his life. When Moses prayed ~~in~~ for Miriam to God, God heard his prayer and Miriam was healed of her leprosy.

That is the story of Miriam, the little woman who outwitted a great king. These are the things we learn from the story of Miriam:

First, She was only a little girl, but because she was affectionate and true and obedient and faithful and courageous, God used her to save the life of Moses, who became the great leader of the people of Israel. Suppose that when Pharaoh's daughter came down to bathe that morning in the Nile, Miriam had been playing Hop Skip and Jump, or Drop the Handkerchief with her companions, instead of watching? or suppose she had fallen asleep at her post? Then Moses might have been lost, or brought up by some Egyptian woman and never known that he was a Hebrew. This teaches us that if we are faithful and true wherever we are, God will make good use of us. ~~who knows~~ perhaps If you are faithful and true, God will do some great thing through you.

Second, The next thing we learn from Miriam is that it is not well enough to start well. Miriam started well; but she did not continue. She became jealous of Moses, and spoke against him, and God punished her by turning her into a leper. You must not only start well, but end well. Remember what Jesus said, "He that persevereth to the end, the same shall be saved."

APPENDIX VIII

SERMON--"COME BEFORE WINTER"

(As taken from the 1952 Tape Recording)

Do thy diligence to come shortly unto me. . . .Do thy diligence to come before winter.--II Tim. 4:9, 21.

The two most renowned prisoners of history were Napoleon Bonaparte and St. Paul. One was in prison because the peace of the world demanded it; the other because he tried to give the world that peace which the world cannot give and which the world cannot take away. One had shed rivers of blood upon which to float his ambitions. The only blood the other had shed was the blood which flowed from his own wounds for the sake of Christ. One could trace his path to empire by the ghastly trails of the dead which stretched all the way from the Pyrenees to Moscow and from the Pyramid to Mt. Tabor. The other could trace his path to prison, death, and immortal glory by the hearts he had loved and the souls that he had gathered into the kingdom of God.

Napoleon once said, "I love no one living, not even my own brothers, perhaps Joseph a little." Not strange, then, that at the end of his life standing on his lonely, wave-washed rock in the South Atlantic Napoleon wondered if there was anyone in the world who really loved him. But this other prisoner from his lonely dungeon beneath the Capitoline Hill at Rome sends out messages that glow with love and throb with hope immortal.

When you get into real trouble in life it's a great thing if you have a few friends upon whom you can count to the uttermost. Paul had at least three such friends. The first--need I mention his name? If you are not his friend you can be his friend forever, before you leave the church this night. The second friend was that one whose face we see almost the first when we come into this life and almost the last when we leave it--the face of the doctor. Paul hands his doctor down to immortality with that imperishable encomium, "Luke, the beloved physician," and again, "Only Luke is with me." The third friend was this young Lycaonian youth, half Greek and half Hebrew, whom Paul had converted at Lystra in Asia Minor. Perhaps after Paul had been stoned that time by the mob and dragged out of the gate of the city and left for dead, it was Timothy who, when the mob had dispersed, made his way out through the gate of the city and searched among the heaps of debris and offal until he found Paul and put his arm around him and poured the cordial down his lips and then carried him off to the home of his mother, Eunice, and his grandmother, Lois. If you make a friendship in the time of danger, fire or shipwreck, you never forget that friend. Here was a friendship that was formed for adversity and the hammer of adversity welds human hearts, as it did in this case, into an indissoluble amalgamation.

Paul had left Timothy in charge of the church at Ephesus, but now in the prison at Rome he wants Timothy by his side, so he sends him this letter--Paul's last letter. And in the letter he tells Timothy to come, and he wants him to bring three things with him; first of all, the books and the parchments, and then the old cloak that he had forgotten and left behind him in the house of Carpus at Troas. What a cloak the church would make for Paul now if we could do it. But then that was the only cloak he had. It had been wet with the brine of the Aegean, and yellow with the dust of the Egnatian Way, and white with the snow of Galatia, and crimson with his own heart's blood. It was cold and getting damp in that Mamertine Dungeon. It was cold and damp on a blistering hot August day the last time I went down into it. Bring the old cloak. But most of all he wants Timothy to bring himself. He says to him, "Use thy diligence to come unto me." And then at the very end, as if perhaps Timothy might not understand the urgency of the matter he says, "Do thy diligence to come and come before winter." Why before winter? Well, because in that ancient day, when winter came on, ships were laid up. Navigation ceased in the open sea. How dangerous it was to sail then, the last shipwreck voyage of Paul himself was the illustration. If Timothy waited until winter, he would have to wait until spring and Paul had a premonition that when spring comes he will be gone. We like to think that Timothy needed no further urging, no second letter, but that he gathered together the books and the parchments and then went over to Troas and picked up that old cloak at the house of Carpus, took a vessel across the Aegean to Neapolis and Macedonia and then across Macedonia to the Adriatic and across the Adriatic Sea to Brundisium on the heel of Italy and then by the Appian Way up to Rome, where he sought Paul out in the dungeon, put the old cloak about him, read to him from the books he had brought with him--the Scriptures--wrote for him his last messages, walked by his side to the place of execution by the Pyramid of Cestius outside the walls of Rome, one of the few monuments of that day still standing, saw the headsman's sword flash in the sunlight, and Paul put on immortality.

Well, there is the sermon plain and unmistakable "Come Before Winter." There are some things which you can do now, but if you leave them undone until winter comes they will never be done. The winter will come and pass and spring will come and deck the earth with its flowers and also the graves of some of your opportunities. (It may be the grave of a dearest friend.) There are golden gates of opportunity that are standing wide open tonight. A year from tonight those gates will be closed. There are tides of fortune and destiny which tonight are flowing at the flood. Next October they will be flowing at the ebb. There are voices--earnest, wistful, affectionate--speaking to you tonight. A year from tonight those voices will be forever silent.

I like all seasons of the year. I like winter with the crunching snow beneath my feet and the clear cold nights with the stars like silver-headed nails driven into the vault of heaven by the hammer of an archangel. I like the spring with its mysterious revirescence of life and I like the summer with the litany of the winds in the tops of the trees. But best of all I like the autumn--I like its cool crisp mornings, I like its golden sunlight, I like its fields strewn with the blue

aster and the goldenrod. I like the radiant livery of its forests--"yellow, pale and hectic red." But how soon that glory passes. The rains fall, the wind blows and lo the trees are stripped, the leaves are gone. Autumn is a parable of everything that fades; and so it is that every recurring autumn has filled me with a desire to say something--not only something that shall move men toward God to do what they ought to do--but move them to do it now. Tonight, before winter. So let us listen to that voice of Paul as he flings this message across the seas to Timothy there in Ephesus, "Come before winter."

And first in it I hear the voice that calls for the amendment and reformation of character. There isn't anyone in this church tonight whose character is all that it ought to be, or what the Lord Jesus Christ wants it to be. Your character can be changed but not at any time.

One of the good memories of my boyhood is that of passing on the winter nights the wire mill in our town. We could see the streams of molten metal coming out of the furnaces, writhing and twisting like tortured spirits, and before the furnaces (because that is the way they did it then) stood men in leathern aprons with great tongs in their hands waiting to receive the metal and convey it to the molds. But if that metal was permitted to cool beneath a certain temperature it refused the mold. There are times when life's metal is, as it were, molten and you can hammer it and fashion it into any design that you please. But if that moment is permitted to pass, then it tends to a state of fixation in which it is not possible either to plan or to do a good thing. You remember that story of the angel and the pool at Bethesda around which the sick lay waiting to be healed. When the angel came down and agitated the water and troubled the pool, then the sick could go down and be healed. But only then. There are times when the pool of life is troubled, stirred, by the visit of the angel. Then is the time to act.

Some years ago a man was sitting in his room in a hotel in Atlantic City. For an hour or more he had been battling desperately with a shameful appetite. He was about to yield to the temptation and had just put forth his hand to ring the bell for the waiter when he said it seemed to him that an angel stood before him and he heard a voice which said, "This is your hour, if you conquer this temptation now and refuse it, you are its master forever; if you yield to it now, you are its slave forever." He said he obeyed the angel. Now, the visit of that angel is not unique. The angel comes and knocks on the door of your heart and waits to see what your answer will be. Sometimes he comes in the awakening of conscience, in the conviction of sin, "Thou art the man," sometimes he comes in a mysterious urge for a better and higher life. "Oh, for a man to rise in me that the man I am might cease to be." Sometimes he comes in a wave of sorrow which washes the eyes of the soul and through the thick rinds of the visible you can discern the fair outlines of the invisible. But however he comes and whenever, that is a precious moment for the soul. Then, golden goals can be glimpsed; then, chains of besetting sin can be broken; then, decisions made which shall bless the soul long after the stars have ceased to burn.

One of the most brilliant senators who ever sat in the Senate was John Ingalls of Kansas. He presided over the Senate as president after

the death of Vice-president Hobert. A greatly gifted man--and yet, he seems to have cast his own life in a sense in rubbish to the void. The last I heard of him he was reporting a prize fight. He wrote the finest lines on opportunity ever written:

Master of human destinies am I!
 Fame, love, and fortune on my footsteps wait.
 Cities and fields I walk; I penetrate
 Deserts and fields remote, and, passing by
 Hovel and mart and palace, soon or late,
 I knock unbidden once at every gate!
 If sleeping, wake; if feasting, rise before
 I turn away. It is the hour of fate,
 And they who follow me reach every state
 Mortals desire, and conquer every foe
 Save death; but those who doubt or hesitate,
 Condemned to failure, penury or woe,
 Seek me in vain and uselessly implore--
 I answer not, and I return no more.

You know that's true in the affairs of life. How true then it must be in regard to these heavenly opportunities which God grants us. You can kindle a bonfire any time--a few sticks and a match or two--but this finer fire of the Spirit you cannot kindle when you will.

We cannot kindle when we will
 The fire that in the heart resides
 The Spirit bloweth and is still;
 In mystery the soul abides.

When the Spirit blows, arise and act.

Again in that message of Paul to Timothy, "Come before winter," we hear the voice of affection and friendship. Suppose for a moment that when Timothy received that message from Paul he said, "Yes, Paul, I'll come but you must not be in too great a hurry. I have some matters to attend to here in Ephesus, some deacons to install over in Philadelphia, and some elders to ordain down at Miletus." So, when he has attended to those matters he picks up the books and the parchments, goes up to Troas, gets the old cloak in the home of Carpus, and then goes down to the waterfront and says to the seamen, "I want a ship sailing for Italy." They tell him, "No ship for Italy until spring." Then I suppose he would go way down the coast a hundred miles to Miletus and there ask the same question--"a ship sailing for Italy?" and get the same answer. "No ship for Italy until spring." All that winter, if that was the history, Timothy must have wondered as he went about his pastoral duties how it fared with Paul. "Does he think that I have forgotten and forsaken him?" And when the winter breaks up he is down at Troas, takes the first ship for Italy, lands at Brundisium, goes up the Appian Way, goes to the Praetorium, the palace of Caesar, and asks one of the soldiers, "Where can I find Paul, the prisoner." The soldier looks at him, "Paul, the prisoner? What do I know about these criminals and brigands who have been brought here to be tried before Caesar? Get out! Be gone, or I'll let you feel the butt end of this lance!"

Then he looks up some of those Roman Christians with their beautiful names--Mary, Pudens, Rufus, Ampliatus, Narcissus--and asks them, "Where is Paul?" And one of them looks at him and says, "Paul? Why, don't you know? Paul was put to death in the Ides of January, beheaded. And are you Timothy? Then, you're the one about whom he was always asking. And when the jailor put the key in the door of his cell he would be saying, 'I'm sure that will be Timothy now.' But you never came and his last message was for you, 'Tell Timothy, my beloved son, to meet me at God's right hand.'" If that was the history, then how Timothy must have wished that he had gone before winter.

Before winter or never! When Judas and some of the other disciples, too, found fault with Mary because of that beautiful offering, the costly ointment, with which she anointed the head and the feet of Jesus shortly before his death and said the money ought to have been spent on the poor, Jesus said, "Let her alone; she hath done what she could. The poor ye have always with you but me ye have not always." I can't see it now, but here tonight, and in your homes, and in your family circles, as surely as I am standing in this pulpit there are those across whose brow are written those words, "The poor ye have always with you, but me ye have not always." No.

A competent critic has said that the most moving, the saddest sentence in English literature, is that sentence from the diary of Thomas Carlyle concerning his oft-neglected wife, Jane Welsh, "Oh, that I had you yet for five minutes by my side that I might tell you all." And if there are any here tonight who are living with those close to you as if they were fixed always by your side, then hear those other words of this sage of Chelsea, "Cherish what is dear to you while it is near and wait not till it is far away. Blind and deaf that we are, O think, if thou yet love anybody living, wait not till death sweep down the paltry little dust clouds and dissonances of the moment, and all be made at last so mournfully clear and beautiful, when it is too late."

The first sermon on this text was preached on the evening of October 3, 1915, 37 years ago. There were many medical students from the medical colleges of Philadelphia present that night. One of them, the next morning on his way to Jefferson Medical College, stopped in Wanamaker's store and bought a postcard and sent me a few words about the sermon. There was another there either that night or the next year. He went down the aisle with the rest of the students, up Arch Street to his boarding house, and to his room to read a magazine; but the refrain of this text kept sounding in his mind and in his ear, "Come before winter." He flung aside the magazine and said to himself, "I think I'd better write a letter to mother." He sat down at the desk and wrote a letter to his mother, the sort of letter that every mother likes to get from her son. He went out on the street, dropped it in the box--and then to bed. The next day at the medical school he was handed the yellow envelope of the Western Union and tearing it open he read, "Come at once, mother is dying." He caught the night train for Pittsburgh, another train out to New Galilee, Pennsylvania where his brother met him and drove him rapidly to their farm home. Through the door, up the stairs, into his mother's chamber, and he was in time to see that smile upon his mother's face which if a man has once seen he can never forget,

till

. . . with the morn those angel faces smile;
Which I have loved long since, and lost awhile!

And there under her pillow, her heartease, her viaticum as she went down into the dark waters of death, was the letter he had written her. Not strange was it that when he met me on the street a few days after in Philadelphia he said, "I'm glad you preached that sermon, 'Come before Winter.'" He was not the first and he was not the last. Perhaps someone here tonight will be glad that he heard this sermon.

When Jesus came and found the three disciples sleeping, James and Peter and John, he awakened them and said, "What, could ye not watch with me one hour?" When he came the second time and found them asleep again he said the same words. But when he came the third time and found them asleep, he looked down upon them and said, "Sleep on now and take your rest. Behold, the Son of Man is betrayed into the hands of sinners." One of those three, Peter, undoubtedly was crucified for his Lord. John, we know, was in prison on Patmos for the sake of Christ. James was the first of the apostles to gain a martyr's crown; but never again did any one of them have the chance that he lost that night--to watch with Christ in his agony.

You say, when you hear that a friend has gone, "Why, it cannot be possible!" "Oh," you say, "I saw him last Wednesday on the corner of Wood and 5th Avenue." Yes, you did, but you'll never see him again. You were going to do this or that, but now the vacant place, the empty chair, the unlifted book, will speak to your soul with a rebuke which you can hardly endure. Sleep on now! Sleep! sleep forever!

Last of all, in this voice of Paul to Timothy we hear the voice that calls for repentance and faith. The voice of Jesus. The most yearning, the most wistful of all. You know, I wish I had been there one of those times when he called those disciples, Peter and John and Andrew and the rest of them, because they rose up immediately and left all and followed him. There must have been the note of immediacy and urgency.

The most important theme upon which any man or angel or the Holy Spirit himself can speak to you is the welfare of your immortal soul, and when the Holy Spirit speaks on that theme he always says, "Today," never, "Tomorrow." If you can find any place in the Bible where the Holy Spirit says, "Repent when you feel like it. Come to Christ tomorrow," then I shall come down out of this pulpit, because I would have no message to preach. But now he always says, "Today," never "Tomorrow." "Now is the accepted time." "While it is called Today, harden not your hearts." "Today."

The reason for that urgency is twofold. First of all, the obvious uncertainty and transiency of life. Why, the spider's most attenuated web is like a cable of steel compared with your hold upon life. David, in great distress, said to Jonathan one day, "As thy soul liveth, there is but a step between me and death." Is that true of

David alone? Or is it true of you and me also? What shadows we are and what shadows we pursue! There was an old preacher who used to conclude his sermons by saying, "Repent the day before you die." And his people would come up to him and say, "But we do not know the day of our death." "Then," he said, "Repent today."

The other reason for this urgency and immediacy is the fact that the disposition and the mood of the heart changes. The soul, like the soil, has its favorable seasons. I can still hear the accent of his voice as he said to me sitting in my study speaking of a brother who was out of Christ and whose little girl had died, "Speak to him now, his heart is tender now." Someone might hear a sermon like this tonight and be ready to act, almost persuaded; but he says, "No, not tonight." He might come here next October and hear the same message, but it would make no impression upon him--I might as well sow the seed on that marble pavement beneath this pulpit. His hour had passed. Oh, if the history of this church could be told, if these columns should cry out of the wall and the beam out of the timber should answer, what a story they could tell of those who were not far from the kingdom of God but tonight are far from it because when God said, "Today," they said, "Tomorrow." And tomorrow never came.

Tomorrow, and tomorrow, and tomorrow,

And all our yesterdays have lighted fools
The way to dusty death.

So once more in the rich providence of God and for the 37th time, I am permitted to throw out this great text, "Come before winter," and as I do so I am sure that the angels of heaven, that those who love you, that the redeemed in heaven, that the Holy Spirit, that the Lord Jesus Christ himself are with me and speaking with me and for me, "Come before winter," Come before the haze of Indian summer has vanished. Come before the winds send the leaves whirling over the lawns. Come before the winter wheat is covered with the snow. Come before the heart is cold and life is o'er and you stand before God to give your account of the use you have made of the precious opportunities which he presented unto you. Come before winter!

Come to thy God in time,
Youth, manhood, old age past;
Come to thy God at last.

Come to thy God in time
Storm, billow, whirlwind past;
Come to thy God at last.

APPENDIX IX

SERMON--"COME BEFORE WINTER"

(As taken from the Published Version, 1945*)

Do thy diligence to come shortly unto me. . . .Do thy diligence to come before winter.--II Timothy 4:9, 21.

Napoleon Bonaparte and the apostle Paul are the most renowned prisoners of history. One was in prison because the peace of the world demanded it; the other because he sought to give to men that peace which the world cannot give and which the world cannot take away. One had the recollection of cities and homes which he had wasted and devastated; the other had the recollection of homes and cities and nations which had been blessed by his presence and cheered by his message. One had shed rivers of blood upon which to float his ambitions. The only blood the other had shed was that which had flowed from his own wounds for Christ's sake. One could trace his path to glory by ghastly trails of the dead which stretched from the Pyrenees to Moscow and from the Pyramids to Mount Tabor. The other could trace his path to prison, death, and immortal glory by the hearts that he had loved and the souls that he had gathered into the Kingdom of God.

Napoleon once said, "I love nobody, not even my own brothers." It is not strange, therefore, that at the end of his life, on his rock prison in the South Atlantic, he said, "I wonder if there is anyone in the world who really loves me." But Paul loved all men. His heart was the heart of the world, and from his lonely prison at Rome he sent out messages which glow with love unquenchable and throb with fadeless hope.

When a man enters the straits of life, he is fortunate if he has a few friends upon whom he can count to the uttermost. Paul had three such friends. The first of these three, whose name needs no mention was that One who would be the Friend of every man, the Friend who laid down His life for us all. The second was that man whose face is almost the first, and almost the last, we see in life--the physician. This friend Paul handed down to immortality with that imperishable encomium, "Luke, the beloved physician," and again, "Only Luke is with me." The third of these friends was the Lycaonian youth Timothy, half Hebrew and half Greek, whom Paul affectionately called "My son in the faith." When Paul had been stoned by the mob at Lystra in the highlands of Asia Minor and was dragged out of the city gates and left for dead, perhaps it was Timothy who, when the night had come down, and the passions of the mob had subsided, went out of the city gates to search amid stones and rubbish until he found the wounded, bleeding body of Paul and, putting his arm about the apostle's neck, wiped the blood stains from his face, poured

* Come Before Winter (New York: Abingdon- Cokesbury Press, 1945).

the cordial down his lips, and then took him home to the house of his godly grandmother Lois and his pious mother Eunice. If you form a friendship in a shipwreck, you never forget the friend. The hammer of adversity welds human hearts into an indissoluble amalgamation. Paul and Timothy each had in the other a friend who was born for adversity.

Paul's last letter is to this dearest of his friends, Timothy, whom he has left in charge of the church at far-off Ephesus. He tells Timothy that he wants him to come and be with him at Rome. He is to stop at Troas on the way and pick up his books, for Paul is a scholar even to the end. Make friends with good books. They will never leave you nor forsake you. He is to bring the cloak, too, which Paul had left at the house of Carpus, in Troas. What a robe the Church would weave for Paul today if it had that opportunity! But this is the only robe that Paul possesses. It has been wet with the brine of the Mediterranean, white with the snows of Galatia, yellow with the dust of the Egnatian Way, and crimson with the blood of his wounds for the sake of Christ. It is getting cold at Rome, for the summer is waning, and Paul wants his robe to keep him warm. But most of all Paul wants Timothy to bring himself. "Do thy diligence to come shortly unto me," he writes; and then, just before the close of the letter, he says, "Do thy diligence to come before winter."

Why "before winter"? Because when winter set in the season for navigation closed in the Mediterranean and it was dangerous for ships to venture out to sea. How dangerous it was, the story of Paul's last shipwreck tells us. If Timothy waits until winter, he will have to wait until spring; and Paul has a premonition that he will not last out the winter, for he says, "The time of my departure is at hand." We like to think that Timothy did not wait a single day after that letter from Paul reached him at Ephesus, but started at once to Troas, where he picked up the books and the old cloak in the house of Carpus, then sailed past Samothrace to Neapolis, and thence traveled by the Egnatian Way across the plains of Philippi and through Macedonia to the Adriatic, where he took ship to Brundisium, and then went up the Appian Way to Rome, where he found Paul in his prison, read to him from the Old Testament, wrote his last letters, walked with him to the place of execution near the Pyramid of Cestius, and saw him receive the crown of glory.

Before winter or never! There are some things which will never be done unless they are done "before winter." The winter will come and the winter will pass, and the flowers of the springtime will deck the breast of the earth, and the graves of some of our opportunities, perhaps the grave of our dearest friend. There are golden gates wide open on this autumn day, but next October they will be forever shut. There are tides of opportunity running now at the flood. Next October they will be at the ebb. There are voices speaking today which a year from today will be silent. Before winter or never!

I like all seasons. I like winter with its clear, cold nights and the stars like silver-headed nails driven into the vault of heaven. I like spring with its green growth, its flowing streams, its revirescent hope. I like summer with the litany of gentle winds in the tops of the

trees, its long evenings, and the songs of its birds. But best of all I like autumn. I like its mist and hazel, its cool morning air, its field strewn with the blue aster and the goldenrod; the radiant livery of the forests--"yellow, and black, and pale, and hectic red." But how quickly the autumn passes! It is the perfect parable of all that fades. Yesterday I saw the forests in all their splendor, and Solomon in all his glory was not arrayed like one of these. But tomorrow the rain will fall, the winds will blow, and the trees will be stripped and barren. Therefore, every returning autumn brings home to me the sense of the preciousness of life's opportunities--their beauty, but also their brevity. It fills me with the desire to say not merely something about the way that leads to life eternal but, with the help of God, something which shall move men to take the way of life now, Today. Taking our suggestion, then, from this message of Paul in the prison at Rome to Timothy in far-off Ephesus--"Come before winter"--let us listen to some of those voices which now are speaking so earnestly to us, and which a year from today may be forever silent.

The Voice Which Calls for the Amendment and the Reformation of Character

Your character can be amended and improved, but not at just any time. There are favorable seasons. In the town of my boyhood I delighted to watch on a winter's night the streams of molten metal writhing and twisting like lost spirits as they poured from the furnaces of the wire mill. Before the furnace doors stood men in leathern aprons, with iron tongs in their hands, ready to seize the fiery coils and direct them to the molds. But if the iron was permitted to cool below a certain temperature, it refused the mold. There are times when life's metal is, as it were, molten, and can be worked into any design that is desired. But if it is permitted to cool, it tends toward a state of fixation, in which it is possible neither to do nor even to plan a good work. When the angel came down to trouble the pool at Jerusalem, then was the time for the sick to step in and be healed. There are moments when the pool of life is troubled by the angel of opportunity. Then a man, if he will, can go down and be made whole; but if he waits until the waters are still, it is too late.

A man who had been under the bondage of an evil habit relates how one night, sitting in his room in a hotel, he was assailed by his old enemy, his besetting sin, and was about to yield to it. He was reaching out his hand to ring the bell for a waiter, when suddenly, as if an angel stood before him, a voice seemed to say, "This is your hour. If you yield to this temptation now, it will destroy you. If you conquer it now, you are its master forever." He obeyed the angel's voice, refused the tempter, and came off victorious over his enemy.

That man was not unique in his experience, for to many a man there comes the hour when destiny knocks at his door and the angel waits to see whether he will obey him or reject him. These are precious and critical moments in the history of the soul. In your life there may be that which you know to be wrong and sinful. In His mercy God has awakened conscience, or has flooded your heart with a sudden wave of contrition and sorrow. This is the hour of opportunity, for now chains of evil habit can be broken, which, if not broken, will bind us forever.

Now golden goals can be chosen and decisions made which shall affect our destiny forever.

We like to quote those fine lines of the late Senator John J. Ingalls:

Master of human destinies am I!
 Fame, love, and fortune on my footsteps wait.
 Cities and fields I walk; I penetrate
 Deserts and fields remote, and, passing by
 Hovel and mart and palace, soon or late,
 I knock unbidden once at every gate!
 If sleeping, wake; if feasting, rise before
 I turn away. It is the hour of fate,
 And they who follow me reach every state
 Mortals desire, and conquer every foe
 Save death; but those who doubt or hesitate,
 Condemned to failure, penury or woe,
 Seek me in vain and uselessly implore--
 I answer not, and I return no more.

We all recognize the truth of this in the things of this world, but in a far more solemn way it is true of the opportunities of our spiritual life. You can build a bonfire any time you please; but the fine fire of the Spirit, that is a different thing. God has his Moment!

We cannot kindle when we will
 The fire that in the heart resides
 The Spirit bloweth and is still;
 In mystery the soul abides.

The Voice of Friendship and Affection

Suppose that Timothy, when he received that letter from Paul asking him to come before winter, had said to himself: "Yes, I shall start for Rome; but first of all I must clear up some matters here at Ephesus, and then go down to Miletus to ordain elders there, and thence over to Colossae to celebrate the Communion there." When he has attended to these matters, he starts for Troas, and there inquires when he can get a ship which will carry him across to Macedonia, and thence to Italy, or one that is sailing around Greece into the Mediterranean. He is told that the season for navigation is over and that no vessels will sail till springtime. "No ships for Italy till April!"

All through that anxious winter we can imagine Timothy reproaching himself that he did not go at once when he received Paul's letter, and wondering how it fares with the apostle. When the first vessel sails in the springtime, Timothy is a passenger on it. I can see him landing at Neapolis, or Brundisium, and hurrying up to Rome. There he seeks out Paul's prison, only to be cursed and repulsed by the guard. Then he goes to the house of Claudia, or Pudens, or Narcissus, or Mary, or Ampliatus, and asks where he can find Paul. I can hear them say: "And are you Timothy? Don't you know that Paul was beheaded last December? Every time the jailer put the key in the door of his cell, Paul thought

you were coming. His last message was for you, 'Give my love to Timothy, my beloved son in the faith, when he comes.'" How Timothy then must have wished that he had come before winter!

Before winter or never! "The poor always ye have with you; but me ye have not always," said Jesus when the disciples complained that Mary's costly and beautiful gift of ointment might have been expended in behalf of the poor. "Me ye have not always." That is true of all the friends we love. We cannot name them now, but next winter we shall know their names. With them, as far as our ministry is concerned, it is before winter or never.

In the Old Abbey Kirk at Haddington one can read over the grave of Jane Welsh the first of many pathetic and regretful tributes paid by Thomas Carlyle to his neglected wife: "For forty years she was a true and loving helpmate of her husband, and by act and word worthily forwarded him as none else could in all worthy he did or attempted. She died at London the 21st of April, 1866, suddenly snatched from him, and the light of his life as if gone out." It has been said that the saddest sentence in English literature is that sentence written by Carlyle in his diary, "Oh, that I had you yet for five minutes by my side, that I might tell you all." Hear, then, careless soul, who art dealing with loved ones as if thou wouldst have them always with thee, these solemn words of warning from Carlyle: "Cherish what is dearest while you have it near you, and wait not till it is far away. Blind and deaf that we are, O think, if thou yet love anybody living, wait not till death sweep down the paltry little dust clouds and dissonances of the moment, and all be made at last so mournfully clear and beautiful, when it is too late."

On one of the early occasions when I preached on this text in Philadelphia, there was present at the service a student in the Jefferson Medical College.* When the service was over he went back to his room on Arch Street, where the text kept repeating itself in his mind, "Come before winter." "Perhaps," he thought to himself, "I had better write a letter to my mother." He sat down and wrote a letter such as a mother delights to receive from her son. He took the letter down the street, dropped it in a mailbox, and returned to his room. The next day in the midst of his studies a telegram was placed in his hand. Tearing it open, he read these words: "Come home at once. Your mother is dying." He took the train that night for Pittsburgh, and then another train to the town near the farm where his home was. Arriving at the town, he was driven to the farm and, hurrying up the stairs, found his mother still living, with a smile of recognition and satisfaction on her face--the smile which, if a man has once seen, he can never forget, till

. . . with the morn those angel faces smile;
Which I have loved long since, and lost awhile!

Under her pillow was the letter he had written her after the Sunday night service, her viaticum and heartease as she went down into the River.

* Dr. Arnot Walker, New Galilee, Pennsylvania.

The next time he met me in Philadelphia he said, "I am glad you preached that sermon, 'Come Before Winter.'" Not a few have been glad because this sermon was preached. Let us pray that it shall move others to do that which shall make their hearts glad in the years to come.

Twice coming to the sleeping disciples whom He had asked to watch with Him in the Garden of Gethsemane, Christ awakened them and said with sad surprise, "What, could ye not watch with me one hour?" When He came the third time and found them sleeping, he looked sadly down upon them and said, "Sleep on now, and take your rest." One of those three, James, was the first of the twelve apostles to die for Christ and seal his faith with his heart's blood. Another, John, was to suffer imprisonment for the sake of Christ on the isle that is called Patmos. And Peter was to be crucified for His sake. But never again could those three sleeping disciples ever watch with Jesus in His hour of agony. That opportunity was gone forever! You say, when you hear that a friend has gone, "Why it cannot be possible! I saw him only yesterday on the corner of Smithfield and Sixth Avenue!" Yes, you saw him there yesterday, but you will never see him there again. You say you intended to do this thing, to speak this word of appreciation or amendment, or show this act of kindness; but now the vacant chair, the unlifted book, the empty place will speak to you with a reproach which your heart can hardly endure, "Sleep on now, and take your rest! Sleep! Sleep! Sleep forever!"

The Voice of Christ

More eager, more wistful, more tender than any other voice is the voice of Christ which now I hear calling men to come to Him, and to come before winter. I wish I had been there when Christ called His disciples, Andrew and Peter, and James and John, by the Sea of Galilee, or Matthew as he was sitting at the receipt of custom. There must have been a note not only of love and authority but of immediacy and urgency in His voice, for we read that they "left all and followed him."

The greatest subject which can engage the mind and attention of man is eternal life. Hence the Holy Spirit, when he invites men to come to Christ, never says "Tomorrow" but always "Today." If you can find me one place in the Bible where the Holy Spirit says, "Believe in Christ tomorrow," or, "Repent and be saved tomorrow," I will come down out of the pulpit and stay out of it--for I would have no gospel to preach. But the Spirit always says, "Today," never "Tomorrow." Now is the accepted time." "Now is the day of salvation." "Today if ye will hear his voice, harden not your hearts." "While it is called Today."

The reason for this urgency is twofold. First, the uncertainty of human life. A long time ago, David, in his last interview with Jonathan, said, "As thy soul liveth, there is but a step between me and death." That is true of every one of us. But a step! What shadows we are, and what shadows we pursue! An old rabbi used to say to his people, "Repent the day before you die."

"But," they said to him, "Rabbi, we know not the day of our death."

"Then," he answered, "repent today." Come before winter!

The second reason why Christ, when He calls a man, always says Today, and never Tomorrow, is that tomorrow the disposition of a man's heart may have changed. There is a time to plant, and a time to reap. The heart, like the soul, has its favorable seasons. "Speak to my brother now! His heart is tender now!" a man once said to me concerning his brother, who was not a believer. Today a man may hear this sermon and be interested, impressed, almost persuaded, ready to take his stand for Christ and enter into eternal life. But he postpones his decision and says, "Not tonight, but tomorrow." A week hence, a month hence, a year hence, he may come back and hear the same call to repentance and to faith. But it has absolutely no effect upon him, for his heart is as cold as marble and the preacher might as well preach to a stone or scatter seed on the marble pavement below this pulpit. Oh, if the story of this one church could be told, if the stone should cry out of the wall and the beam out of the timber should answer, what a story they could tell of those who once were almost persuaded but who now are far from the Kingdom of God. Christ said, Today! they answered, Tomorrow!

Tomorrow, and tomorrow, and tomorrow,

.
And all our yesterdays have lighted fools
The way to dusty death.

Once again, then, I repeat these words of the apostle, "Come before winter"; and as I pronounce them, common sense, experience, conscience, Scripture, the Holy Spirit, the souls of just men made perfect, and the Lord Jesus Christ all repeat with me. "Come before winter!" Come before the haze of Indian summer has faded from the fields! Come before the November wind strips the leaves from the trees and sends them whirling over the fields! Come before the snow lies on the uplands and the meadow brook is turned to ice! Come before the heart is cold! Come before desire has failed! Come before life is over and your probation ended, and you stand before God to give an account of the use you have made of the opportunities which in His grace He has granted to you! Come before winter!

Come to thy God in time,
Youth, manhood, old age past;
Come to thy God at last.

APPENDIX X

COMMENTS OF MINISTERS WHO AT ONE TIME SERVED
AS DR. MACARTNEY'S ASSISTANTS. NINE POINTS
HAD SPECIFICALLY BEEN REFERRED TO THEM FOR COMMENT.

1. Dr. Macartney's relationship to his community--participation in civic and community affairs, general reputation in Pittsburgh.

"Enjoyed a good 'press.' Highly respected. Sought to bring a Christian influence to bear in civic life."

"Although Dr. Macartney did not sit on committees, etc. in community affairs he had a very strong reputation as a spiritual leader, and was heard with respect by all people."

"Dr. Macartney's reputation in the city of Pittsburgh was very high. However, he took practically no part in civic and community affairs."

"To my knowledge (1937-1940) he participated only rarely in civic affairs, not serving on many committees, etc. He was greatly respected as a minister, and in matters of history he was also greatly respected as an historian."

"I felt that Dr. Macartney took no part in civic or community affairs; yet he would at times speak out on matters which seemed to him to involve faith and morals.

He was well known in Pittsburgh. He had his following, but there were many who considered him shallow and irrelevant.

On a number of occasion I heard Dr. Macartney speak of clearing out the end of the 'Golden Triangle' and creating a great park, etc. To me it was visionary. He was the first person I ever heard speak of it.

After World War II when Pittsburgh was rejuvenated by the combined efforts of Capital and Labor the great dream came to pass. I'm not around Pittsburgh but I have never heard Dr. Macartney given any credit for the initial idea."

.

2. Your evaluation of his drawing power as a speaker. How many normally heard him in the morning and evening services? What percentage, would you estimate, were non-members? (a.m. and p.m.)

"His preaching and services drew a consistently high attendance. I would judge about 1300-1500 in the morning and about 800-1200 at night. I would judge 40-50% non-members in the evening."

"His drawing power as a speaker was very strong as as was evidenced by evening worship services as well as the morning congregation. In the evening services of course there were more non-members,

perhaps 40 to 50%, but the Sanctuary was filled practically every time he preached."

"Dr. Macartney was a magnetic speaker with subdued drama in constant use. Normally, approximately 1400 heard him in the morning and the evening congregations went anywhere from 1200 to 1800."

"About 1200 in the morning; 500 in the evening, but toward the last of his ministry the latter diminished. Perhaps 10 percent would be visitors."

"He could draw people to worship services and to public meetings. While I was at 1st Church we organized the Tuesday Noon Club for business men--a short worship service and a cheap lunch in the church cafeteria. When Dr. Macartney took it over and began to speak regularly the attendance skyrocketed.

I would judge attendance averaged around 1000 at each morning and evening service. It seems to me that I carefully counted the seating capacity of the church proper and found it smaller than popular estimates gave.

Morning service I would estimate was made up of 90% members; evening perhaps 50%."

.

3. An evaluation of his morning and evening audiences as to education, professional, and social status; and the proportion of men to women, and predominant age groups.

"His morning audiences appealed to a higher educational and social bracket. Evening audiences more cosmopolitan and represented a good social and economic cross section of the city. Higher proportion of men than ordinary. Age groups fairly evenly distributed."

"People of all educational, professional and social background heard him and seemed interested in his messages. He had a way of reaching men as well as interesting the women, and adapted his messages to all groups of people."

"A very high percentage of professional people attended the church and there was always a strong contingent of young people. Traditionally, the First Church had many wealthy people as members."

"It was a real cross section of society week after week. In the evening there would be many young people, and young adults."

"Educational level high, more at morning than evening. Social status covered millionaires to scrub women. My recollection is that the proportion of men and women was about even. Age group was broad but probably 40-50 the largest."

.

4. Please comment on Dr. Macartney's adaptation of his sermons to the needs of the complete spectrum of his audiences.

"His appeal was mainly personal and individual. Strong intellectualism coupled with vivid illustration. Sought to deal with human problems. Strong evangelistic appeal and note evident."

"Dr. Macartney had a way of speaking to the heart, and no matter what the persons background he could feel the impact of the message in a personal way."

"Dr. Macartney preached Biblical Christianity with an emphasis upon doctrine and biography. He was not an expository preacher but he did use the needs and experiences of people to preach what he called 'Sermons from Life.'"

"He always started with some scriptural exposition or narrative and applied it to the present circumstances. In every sermon there would be some need met from the Bible."

"I'd say he didn't, but he said he couldn't preach unless he had a close pastoral relationship with his people. He had to visit his congregation."

.

5. Would you regard Dr. Macartney as having been a "persuasive" speaker? If so, in your opinion, what basic elements of persuasion were particularly at work--as to the preacher, his message, and delivery?

"'Persuasive' in the sense that his sermons were close to life. His voice and delivery were in my opinion not particularly persuasive. His conviction and sincerity, however, were impressive."

"To me he was a very persuasive speaker, primarily because of the way in which he organized and presented his message. His delivery was slow and deliberate without notes, and therefore very direct and forceful. He had many climactic moments in his sermons, primarily through his ability to bring the material to a climax rather than a dramatic, oratorical presentation. He constantly thought for a decision and a personal appeal."

"Dr. Macartney was a very persuasive speaker who always stimulated one intellectually and spiritually. Since he preached without notes, he had a direct appeal unto his people."

"His persuasion arose out of the manner of life which was his rather than his method of preaching or delivery. Of course the strength of his message was significant, for while others were preaching on current events and reviewing books he was declaring the counsel of God."

"He was persuasive. His sincerity came through. His delivery was poor in many respects but his voice was strong. He spoke in

a monotone, but he used adjectives and adverbs well "

.

6. A general statement as to his strengths and weaknesses as a speaker.

"Marvelous 'eye contact' with his audience. He did not use notes. Well thought-out messages gave flow and direction and purpose to all that he said. Voice strong; diction excellent; enunciation clear.

His style tended to be declamatory and oratorical rather than conversational. His voice tended to become somewhat monotonous. Not too much variety in rate of utterance or pitch."

"I do not know of any special weaknesses that I could name regarding his speaking."

"The personal application and the personal invitation were weaknesses in Dr. Macartney's preaching. He practically never gave an invitation."

"He had a marvelous memory, and a very orderly mind. He used simple and exact language. His illustrations were from a wide source: ancient, contemporary, from literature and history.

His voice was monotonous if you were not intrigued by what he was saying."

"Always well prepared. Strong voice, well chosen illustrations.

As mentioned above, spoke in a monotone but few people were aware of it."

.

7. Would you agree, or disagree: "His sermons 'read' better than they actually came across in delivery."

"I would agree. Had a clear, lucid, vivid style of writing."

"I would disagree, for I feel his sermons were very effective in delivery. They certainly have had an appeal when written."

"Dr. Macartney's sermons were better in the personal delivery than they were in printing, although they read well."

"I cannot judge because when I read his sermons even now I can hear him proclaiming them from the pulpit."

"I disagree. His sermons came across in delivery, not only 'live' but also by radio. He had a large radio audience."

.

8. With the pulpit located as it is in "First" church, how successful do you think he was in maintaining "eye contact" with all his audience?

"I have preached in this pulpit myself. My reaction is that it is exceedingly well placed to maintain 'eye contact' with the audience."

"Dr. Macartney preached without notes and constantly maintained an eye contact with the audience. He didn't seem to look at any particular part of the congregation exclusively and felt free to move in the pulpit from one direction to another."

"Because of his preaching without notes, Dr. Macartney maintained constant eye contact with his audience."

"He was eminently successful. He made people feel as though he were talking directly to them. He used the full sweep of his pivotal position to include all."

"He had eye contact with those in the sanctuary, the overflow in the Sunday School room were largely behind him but by turning his head and body he maintained contact with them."

.

9. His influence upon your work and ministry as to methods, techniques, emphases, etc.

"To sit under Dr. Macartney's preaching for three years was like a post-graduate course in homiletics--an ecclesiastical internship, if you will, under the direction of a master. His influence upon me has been both deep and lasting. I shall be eternally grateful for the privilege of being associated with him."

"Many of the methods and techniques which I have used through the years, were learned, or at least emphasized through his ministry. The visitation of the congregation, preaching almost without notes, the effort to make the sermon forceful and to bring about a decision, and also to make the appeal very personal."

"Unconsciously, one absorbs certain influences from one with whom he works. Dr. Macartney's emphasis upon the calling ministry, a preaching ministry and a teaching ministry have carried over into my own experience."

"My three years with him were as valuable to me as a doctoral course in practical theology. It set the course for this ministry of twenty five years."

"After some years I dared to try preaching without notes and found it effective."

Negatively, I have given my associates more freedom in which to work than I felt that I had with Dr. Macartney."

.

APPENDIX XI

QUESTIONNAIRE SUMMARY

(From fifty-eight respondents who had heard
Dr. Macartney of "First Church")

1. Between what dates (approximately) did you hear the preaching of Doctor Macartney?

Length of Time	Number of Respondents
Over 20 Years	40
10 - 20 Years	16
Under 5 Years	2

_____ 19____ and _____, 19____.

2. Would you care to check or fill in the following information regarding yourself?

Male [24] Female [34] Present age [Over 60 24]
[40 - 60 23]
[Under 40 2]

3. Would you care to fill in the following items regarding yourself during Doctor Macartney's ministry?

Educational status [College or More 24] [Grammar School 3]
[High School 25]
 Occupation [See Appendix XI-A]

4. Were you a member of "First" Church when you first heard Doctor Macartney? Yes [22] No [36]

5. If not, what factors led you to hear him the first time?

And What part did his preaching play in your joining "First" Church, if Any?

[22 indicated that the preaching was an important factor]

6. Would you describe your attendance at "First Church" services under Doctor Macartney?

Sun. A.M.: Regular [54] Frequent [2] Occasional
 Sun. Eve.: Regular [30] Frequent [9] Occasional [9]

7. Would you describe your impressions of Doctor Macartney as a person by checking all those personality traits listed below which in your opinion applied to him?

[27] Friendly
 [28] Warmhearted
 [25] Approachable
 [49] Courteous
 [34] Humble
 [40] Kind
 [30] Gentle
 [39] Understanding

[46] Reserved
 [47] Dignified
 [8] Pre-occupied
 Unfriendly
 [9] Impersonal
 [7] Unapproachable
 [9] Abrupt
 Conceited

8. Would you have felt free to approach him personally to receive spiritual counsel? Yes [37] No [10]
9. Did he fulfill your expectations always, as your pastor?
 If not, would you care to indicate the nature of such exceptions?
 Yes [49] No [8]

[See Appendix XI-B for further comments]

10. Would you care to check four (4) of the following descriptions of a preacher which you think best applied to Doctor Macartney? If any do not apply at all, please strike them out.

[53] Scholarly
 [2] A showman
 [53] Spiritual
 [47] Sincere
 [4] Sensational
 [36] Inspirational
 [41] Deeply theological
 [17] Logical
 [4] Emotional
 [1] Disturbing
 [2] Provoking
 [12] Authoritarian

[Most frequently stricken out:

Showman
 Sensational
 Provoking
 Emotional
 Disturbing]

11. Did you find yourself generally in agreement [58] or disagreement [0] with the basic emphases and teachings of Doctor Macartney's sermons? Any serious disagreement? [0]

12. Please describe the speaking of Doctor Macartney with regard to

(a) bodily movement [See Appendix XI-C for Summary of
 (b) personal appearance Question 12]
 (c) voice (quality, inflection, volume, etc.)
 (d) rate of utterance
 (e) pulpit mannerisms [None indicated]

13. Please comment on the following:

(a) Doctor Macartney's use of illustrations, poetry, quotations, etc. [No negative comments made]

(b) Doctor Macartney's use of the Bible (effective, convincing, too much, too little, etc.) [No negative comments made]

See Appendix XI-D for additional comments]

14. Would you say that Doctor Macartney's preaching was on the order of one talking with you (conversational style)? [24] or more on the order of one "preaching" at you (oratorical style)? [27]

15. What sermon, or series of sermons, do you best remember? _____

[Most frequently mentioned: "Come Before Winter," Holy Week Series, "I Went Into Arabia."]

16. Did you hear, "Come Before Winter?" Yes [57] No [1]
If so, how often? _____ Your reaction to the sermon, please _____

17. What did you appreciate most about Doctor Macartney as a person?

[See Comments, Appendix XI-E]

As a preacher?

What did you appreciate least? (If anything) As a person _____

As a preacher?

(You may use the back of this sheet for any additional comments you may have. Thank you for your help!)

[Thirty-three responded with additional comments on the back of this sheet--excerpts appear at various points in the text of this study.]

Appendix XI--Continued

XI--A

OCCUPATIONS LISTED BY RESPONDENTS

Housewife (5)	Bank employee (3)
Foundation Administrator	Farmer
Telephone worker	Brick layer
Price clerk, Wholesale Drugs	Clerical (2)
Rare Book Dealer	Jeweler
Clerk (2)	Department Store Executive
Secretary (12)	Vice-president, Corporation
Attorney (2)	Bank clerk
Accountant (3)	Stenographer, U.S. Steel Corporation
Supervisor, Mellon National Bank	School principal
Minister	High School teacher
Engineer (2)	Physician
Sales work (2)	Librarian
Maintenance man	Church worker

Appendix XI--Continued

XI--B

Negative comments made on question 9, "Did he fulfill your expectations always, as your pastor?"

5 "I had the highest regard for him, his ability, and integrity, but didn't really feel 'comfortable' with him--felt he was aloof."

#36 "He was a preacher and teacher, more than a pastor."

#52 "He did not have that warm feeling that you usually expect in a minister. However, this was a type of personality. I am sure he would have loved to be more cordial, but found this very difficult, and often went at it the wrong way."

#55 "I never felt I could go to him with personal problems other than strictly spiritual."

Appendix XI--Continued

XI--C

Comments on question 12, "Please describe the speaking of Doctor Macartney with regard to. . ."

Bodily Movement

- # 1 "Dignified--gestures sparing--wanted to focus attention on the word of God, not himself"
- # 2 "None"
- # 3 "Few, but necessary"
- # 4 "Very reserved in the pulpit"
- # 5 "Stood quietly"
- # 6
- # 7 "Very few gestures"
- # 8 "None"
- # 9
- #10 "None"
- #11 "Minimum"
- #12 "Very little. Not a pulpit thumper or exhibitionist"
- #13 "Very quiet and dignified"
- #14 "Little"
- #15
- #16 "I liked his manner of preaching. He was a dignified gentleman, always with very little body movement"
- #17 "A turn to the rear occasionally to reach that part of the congregation in the chapel"
- #18 "Simple--nothing unusual"
- #19 "Natural movements--conservative"

Appendix XI- C, Continued

- #20 "Good"
- #21 "Dignified"
- #22 "Very little--did use his arms some"
- #23 "No showman"
- #24
- #25 "Stationary--did not move"
- #26
- #27
- #28
- #29 "No exceptional ones--quiet"
- #30 "Quiet, very little"
- #31 "No show-off"
- #32 "Very smooth, gentle"
- #33 "Very little"
- #34 "As I recall, his hands and arms were the very large part of his bodily movement"
- #35 "Limited to a few gestures with the hands or the sweep of an arm, no violent or drastic movements"
- #36 "Nothing unusual"
- #37 "None--he stood rigid as stone"
- #38 "Stood up straight, and talked out boldly"
- #39
- #40 "Controlled"
- #41
- #42 "Not much"
- #43 "Good gestures"

Appendix XI-C, Continued.

- #44 "Almost no gestures. You watched his face and eyes, not his hands"
- #45 "He didn't make many movements"
- #46 "Very few gestures"
- #47 "Raised both hands at times and held tight to pulpit at other times"
- #48 "Not usually"
- #49 "None"
- #50 "Quiet and restrained--no dramatics"
- #51 "Natural--his thoughts were on what he was saying"
- #52 "None whatsoever"
- #53 "He stood very still--occasionally moving a hand slightly"
- #54 "Natural"
- #55 "Brisk, until severe surgery and age took their toll"
- #56 "Just enough to be effective and for emphasis"
- #57 "Cannot recall any other than a gentle gesture of the arms now and then"
- #58 "Minimal"

Personal Appearance

- # 1 "Clean-cut, good posture, a kingly dignity"
- # 2 "Very well-groomed"
- # 3 "Attractive"
- # 4 "Impeccable, good taste"
- # 5
- # 6 "Always good"
- # 7 "Neat"
- # 8 "One to be revered"
- # 9

Appendix XI-C, Continued

- #10 "Conservative"
- #11 "Good average"
- #12 "Always immaculately-attired in well-fitting dark suit"
- #13 "Very good--always well-groomed"
- #14 "Exceptional"
- #15
- #16 "Well-groomed"
- #17 "Every inch a spiritual leader"
- #18 "Good"
- #19 "Always in keeping with his profession"
- #20 "Good"
- #21 "Correct"
- #22 "Plain, even austere"
- #23 "Neatly attired"
- #24
- #25 "Very personable"
- #26 "Good"
- #27 "Always immaculate"
- #28
- #29 "Good"
- #30 "Stalwart"
- #31 "Always neat"
- #32 "Always neat"
- #33 "Manly"
- #34 "He looked like a preacher"
- #35 "Very conservative at all times"

Appendix XI-C, Continued

- #36 "Dignified"
- #37 "Excellent"
- #38 "Refined, scholarly, dignified"
- #39
- #40 "Good"
- #41
- #42 "Well-groomed"
- #43 "Proper"
- #44 "Impeccable in the pulpit"
- #45 "Fine"
- #46 "Always in good taste"
- #47 "Plain"
- #48 "Dignified"
- #49 "Dignity"
- #50 "Neat and conservative in dress"
- #51 "Well-groomed"
- #52 "Good"
- #53 "Always neat, immaculate"
- #54 "Excellent"
- #55 "Very nice, except his hat which became somewhat of a kindly joke,
as to its age, among those of us who respected him"
- #56 "Excellent"
- #57 "Poised, dignified, calm"
- #58 "Meticulous and conservative"

Voice (quality, inflection, volume, etc.)

- # 1 "Carrying--volume to fill our cathedral-like church"

Appendix XI-C, Continued

- # 2 "Monotone"
- # 3
- # 4 "Attractive for listening, good use of inflection"
- # 5 "Well-modulated, even tones, plain and easily followed--unemotional"
- # 6 "Just right"
- # 7 "Very good delivery"
- # 8 "Quality, volume good; no inflection"
- # 9
- #10 "Strong, vibrant"
- #11 "Excellent"
- #12 "One had to listen and to pay attention"
- #13 "All very good"
- #14 "Very good delivery"
- #15
- #16 "A fine voice with good volume. He never was a monotonous speaker"
- #17 "Even speaker, volume such that could be heard everywhere, no
dramatics"
- #18 "Good, distinct, and understandable"
- #19 "Good quality and volume"
- #20 "Good in quality and volume"
- #21 "Very fine range"
- #22 "His wonderful voice--who can describe it? It was deep--you could
hear every word without a speaker. An easy speaker--he didn't yell"
- #23 "Good voice and fine quality"
- #24
- #25 "Low, steady tone"
- #26 "Clear voice"

Appendix XI-C, Continued

- #27 "Quality"
- #28
- #29
- #30 "Dr. Macartney disdained (although he used) a microphone in his church"
- #31 "Soft"
- #32 "Could be heard at all times. His voice tone carried all over this church either in high or low tones"
- #33 "Inspiring"
- #34 "Quality and sufficient volume to be heard clearly without microphone aid"
- #35 "Calm, resonant, strong, variable, soothing"
- #36 "Superior, actually an orator"
- #37 "Steady monotone. No need for amplification"
- #38 "Well-modulated, easily heard"
- #39
- #40 "Monotonous. After a time one did not notice this and could listen with undivided attention. However, until that time I was inclined to have a wandering mind"
- #41 "Perfect diction, great ability in expressing himself"
- #42 "Clear, good enunciation, moderate volume"
- #43 "All the qualities of a good orator"
- #44 "Clear, easily heard--good diction"
- #45 "Very good"
- #46 "Interesting"
- #47 "Deep, Clear, Strong"
- #48 "Excellent"
- #49 "Had volume, clear diction, and nearly a monotone"

Appendix XI-C, Continued

- #50 "Well-modulated--never noisy--excellent diction--perfect delivery"
- #51 "His voice was pleasing to me"
- #52 "Monotone, no inflection"
- #53 "He spoke somewhat in a monotone, but had good volume"
- #54
- #55 "At times a bit monotonous"
- #56 "Monotonous at times, volume good, not quite enough variation in inflection or pitch"
- #57 "Quiet, rich, with slight ring to it. The volume was moderate. He spoke in a rather majestic manner without the trace of pomposity"
- #58 "Even intonation with variance consistent with topic discussed"

Rate of utterance

- # 1 "Deliberate"
- # 2 "Slow"
- # 3 "Moderate"
- # 4 "Moderate speed"
- # 5
- # 6
- # 7 "Moderate"
- # 8 "Deliberate"
- # 9
- #10 "Slow, deliberate"
- #11 "Normal"
- #12 "Good--not rushed, but not a 'staller'"
- #13 "Moderate"
- #14 "Medium"

Appendix XI-C, Continued

#15

#16 "Medium. Not too fast nor too slow"

#17 "Just right to understand and nothing ever missed through speed or racing"

#18 "Pleasing"

#19

#20 "Steady, not rapid"

#21 "Tuned to audience"

#22 "Medium (could follow him well)"

#23 "Well timed"

#24

#25 "Steady flow"

#26

#27 "Good"

#28

#29

#30 "Studied"

#31 "Not too fast"

#32

#33 "Moderate"

#34 "Not too slow, and not too fast"

#35 "Slow, deliberate"

#36 "Normal to slow"

#37 "Slow, deliberate"

#38 "Just right, not too fast, not too slow"

#39

Appendix XI-C, Continued

#40 "Very good"

#41

#42 "Moderate rate"

#43 "Variable, depending on oratorical circumstances"

#44 "Never too fast"

#45 "Good"

#46 "Slow"

#47 "Medium"

#48 "Good"

#49 "Did not hesitate"

#50 "Moderate speed--pleasant"

#51 "Good"

#52 "He was a terrific speaker. Slow and deliberate"

#53 "Average, to slow"

#54

#55 "Very nice pace"

#56 "Easy to follow, continuity good"

#57 "Moderate--slower than normal conversation"

#58

Appendix XI--Continued

XI--D

Comments regarding Dr. Macartney's use of illustration, poetry, quotations, etc. (Question 13-a, Sample comments only.)

- # 1 "Always effective and memorable"
- # 2 "His illustrations were always to the point"
- # 5 "Graphic"
- # 6 "Always at the right time to emphasize a point"
- # 7 "Always appropriate--a wonderful background from which to draw"
- # 8 "Always well-selected"
- # 9 "Charming, seemingly limitless"
- #10 "A master with illustrations"
- #31 "Always seemed to have the right one at the right time"
- #34 "He could draw pictures with words"
- #35 "He was a master at word pictures"
- #37 "A master in all of these--had great power of description"
- #43 "Illustrations were his strong point--master of description"
- #44 "Beyond any I have ever heard a minister use, always appropriate"
- #46 "Excellent--he used historical illustrations and poetry"
- #47 "Biblical illustrations were wonderful"
- #48 "They were always carefully chosen from his wide, wide knowledge of literature and world travel. You would remember them weeks later"
- #53 "Slightly overdone at times"
- #57 "Frequently and most successfully--always subordinate to his message"

Appendix XI-D, Continued

Comments regarding Dr. Macartney's use of the Bible (question 13-b, sample comments only--many simply underlined the words "effective" and "convincing" appearing in the question. No negative comments.)

- # 1 "He knew his Bible from cover to cover... he knew Paul so well that he seemed to be Paul; tremendous powers of description"
- #21 "Effective because it seemed effortless"
- #35 "To him preaching meant the Bible, Christ and Him crucified. There was no room for anything else--nor any need"
- #37 "Effective and very convincing, yet simple so that all could understand"
- #43 "Most effective. Knowledge of Scripture as if he had written it"
- #44 "It was the foundation of all his preaching. He never swerved from its teachings. Believed it in its entirety"
- #46 "He made it [the Bible] a living book"
- #51 "You knew he believed in God's Word as you listened"
- #53 "Many of the sermons I heard seemed to be a complete retelling of the Bible story. At times it was most effective"
- #55 "He knew his Bible and wanted you to know and understand and believe it too"
- #57 "The Bible was the foundation of his preaching ministry. It was the source of his authority, accepted in faith; and his mightiest weapon in defense of the historic Christian message"

Appendix XI--Continued

XI--E

Comments on Question 17, "What did you appreciate most about Doctor Macartney as a person?" (Sample comments)

- # 1 "His integrity; his friendship to my family, his leadership"
- # 2 "He never compromised"
- # 5 "His scholarship and integrity"
- # 6 "His guidance in crisis as in time of war"
- # 8 "His faithfulness"
- #10 "His earnestness, faithfulness, and sincerity"
- #14 "I admired his dignity"
- #15 "His interest in the young people and children and his keen interest in the Sunday School"
- #17 "A gentleman, a man, and a scholar"
- #18 "Humility"
- #20 "Dignity, strength, sincerity of Christian purpose"
- #22 "His integrity, honesty, genuiness"
- #23 "He looked and acted like a man of God"
- #25 "Sincerity, humility, one you could look up to"
- #31 "He lived the life he preached. He was just like the 'Rock of Gibraltar' to me"
- #33 "His sense of humor"
- #34 "His courteous mannerisms, and soft-spoken, kind voice"
- #36 "His firm stand for his convictions"
- #41 "He lived what he preached"
- #42 "His love of children--a very obvious trait"
- #43 "Sincerity and ability"
- #44 "His absolute integrity"

Appendix XI-E, Continued

- #46 "I shall never forget his loving sympathy when I lost my father in 1929. And not many outsiders ever knew his sense of humor was so good"
- #50 "His utter sincerity--his complete and unfailing awareness of the needs of others. He was a very special person"
- #51 "His brilliant mind and his humility"
- #52 "Some young people were afraid of him, but I enjoyed telling him things about our class and our youth group and asking him about any ideas I had"
- #57 "His strong, quiet, steadfast personality. His breadth of interests and his unlimited capacity to move effortlessly from one to the other. His pleasure was his work, and his work was his pleasure"

Comments on what was appreciated most as a preacher:

- # 1 "His unfolding of Biblical truths and personalities"
- # 2 "His sermons were easy to follow and there was always a vital message"
- # 3 "God-fearing preacher"
- # 8 "Earnestness and excellent teaching"
- #16 "His knowledge of the Bible, and his general knowledge due to his travels and his background of literature"
- #17 "A man of God"
- #18 "His Christian belief and training"
- #21 "I think I have a weakness for first-class performance"
- #22 "He knew the Bible from Genesis to Revelation, and was able to present the Bible characters as living people"
- #29 "I liked his dignity in the pulpit and his sureness of himself"
- #35 "Eloquence, sincerity, and spiritual dedication. He was a giant among ministers"
- #38 "His scholarly, spiritual, and well-prepared sermons"
- #39 "His descriptive theology--you could see the characters"

Appendix XI-E, Continued

- #42 "His ability to paint word pictures with simple language never ceased to amaze me"
- #44 "His being able to fit the Bible's teachings to your every day needs and problems"
- #46 "The narration of Bible events and then application of same"
- #50 "He was the Christian you hoped to be but could never attain..."
- #52 "He was easy to follow and take notes. His sermons were very much in outline form"
- #54 "Fundamentalism!"
- #56 "Adherence to gospel preaching, sincerity. Descriptive ability"
- #57 "His simple eloquence--his preaching was comforting and sustaining. He was a giant among pygmies"
- #58 "His deep knowledge and extensive travel--a splendid amalgam"

Comments under question 17: What did you appreciate least (if anything) about Doctor Macartney as a person?

(All comments listed)

- # 2 "Very cold"
- # 8 "Diffidence"
- #16 "He had lived alone too long without any family and lack of understanding of problems"
- #17 "His coldness and unapproachability"
- #25 "He was a little too reserved, if anything"
- #36 "Rather cold manner. His lack of consideration for his staff, appointments at all hours"
- #40 "He liked money"
- #41 "He was very reserved"
- #43 "Reserved manner"
- #51 "His coldness"
- #56 "Too reserved at times"

Appendix XI-E, Continued

Comments under question 17: What did you appreciate least about Doctor Macartney as a preacher (if anything)?

(All comments listed)

- # 2 "He was the best, but I didn't care for his dry historical sermons. Fortunately, he had just 1 or 2 of these a year"
- # 8 "Sensationalism"
- #17 "He talked over the head of the congregation, particularly in his last year or two"
- #51 "His lack of sympathy and understanding"
- #56 "Not enough relevancy in preaching to current affairs and problems one faces in life. Slightly more humor"

APPENDIX XII

Membership totals and accessions by confession or reaffirmation of faith in two churches comparable in size to the First Presbyterian Church of Pittsburgh in 1927 appear below. These additional examples, employing checks at five-year intervals, are presented for purposes of comparison with "First Church" totals which appear on page 385 of the text of this study.

Rochester Brick Presbyterian Church
(Membership in 1927--2474)

<u>Year</u>	<u>Membership</u>	<u>Accessions by Confession and Reaffirmation</u>	<u>Percentage of Total Membership Represented by Accessions</u>
1932	2424	32	1.4%
1937	2228	19	.9%
1942	1973	49	2.5%
1947	2044	35	1.7%
1952	1946	68	3.4%

Detroit First Presbyterian Church
(Membership in 1927--2195)

1932	2083	67	3.2%
1937	1830	64	3.5%
1942	1651	61	3.7%
1947	1958	76	3.9%
1952	1351	20	1.5%

BIBLIOGRAPHY

BOOKS BY DR. CLARENCE E. MACARTNEY

- Macartney, Clarence E. Ancient Wives and Modern Husbands. Nashville, Tennessee: Cokesbury Press, 1934.
- _____. Bible Epitaphs. New York: Abingdon-Cokesbury Press, 1936.
- _____. Chariots of Fire and Other Sermons on Bible Characters. New York: Abingdon-Cokesbury Press, 1951.
- _____. Christianity and Common Sense. Philadelphia: John C. Winston Company, 1927.
- _____. Facing Life and Getting the Best of It. New York: Abingdon-Cokesbury Press, 1940.
- _____. The Faith Once Delivered. New York: Abingdon-Cokesbury Press, 1952.
- _____. Grant and His Generals. New York: The McBride Company, 1953.
- _____. Great Interviews of Jesus. New York: Abingdon-Cokesbury Press, 1944.
- _____. Great Nights of the Bible. New York: Abingdon-Cokesbury Press, 1943.
- _____. (ed.). Great Sermons of the World. Boston: The Stratford Company, 1926.
- _____. Great Women of the Bible. New York: Abingdon-Cokesbury Press, 1942.
- _____. The Greatest Men of the Bible. New York: Abingdon-Cokesbury Press, 1941.
- _____. The Greatest Questions of the Bible and of Life. New York: Abingdon-Cokesbury Press, 1948.
- _____. The Greatest Texts of the Bible. New York: Abingdon-Cokesbury Press, 1947.
- _____. The Greatest Words in the Bible and in Human Speech. New York: Abingdon-Cokesbury Press, 1938.
- _____. Highways and Byways of the Civil War. Revised editions. Pittsburgh: Gibson Press, 1938.
- _____. Lincoln and His Cabinet. New York: Charles Scribner's Sons, 1931.
- _____. Lincoln and His Generals. Philadelphia: Dorrance and Company, 1925.
- _____. Lincoln and the Bible. New York: Abingdon-Cokesbury Press, 1949.

- _____. The Lord's Prayer. New York: Fleming H. Revell Company, 1942.
- _____. Macartney's Illustrations. New York: Abingdon-Cokesbury Press, 1945.
- _____. The Making of a Minister. (J. Clyde Henry, Manuscript editor) Great Neck, New York: Channel Press, Inc., 1961.
- _____. The Man Who Forgot. New York: Abingdon Press, 1956.
- _____. Men Who Missed It. Philadelphia: Dorrance and Company, 1940.
- _____. More Sermons from Life. Nashville, Tennessee: Cokesbury Press, 1939.
- _____. Mountains and Mountain Men of the Bible. New York: Abingdon-Cokesbury Press, 1950.
- _____. Mr. Lincoln's Admirals. New York: Funk and Wagnall's, 1956.
- _____. Of Them He Chose Twelve. Philadelphia: Dorrance and Company, 1927.
- _____. The Parables of the Old Testament. New York: Fleming H. Revell Company, 1916.
- _____. Paul the Man. New York: Fleming H. Revell Company, 1928.
- _____. Peter and His Lord. New York: Abingdon-Cokesbury Press, 1937.
- _____. Prayer at the Golden Altar. Grand Rapids, Michigan: Zondervan Publishing House, 1944.
- _____. Preaching Without Notes. New York: Abingdon-Cokesbury Press, 1946.
- _____. Putting on Immortality. New York: Fleming H. Revell Company, 1926.
- _____. Right Here in Pittsburgh. Pittsburgh: Gibson Press, 1937.
- _____. Salute Thy Soul. New York: Abingdon Press, 1957.
- _____. Sermons from Life. Nashville, Tennessee: Cokesbury Press, 1933.
- _____. Sermons on Old Testament Heroes. New York: Abingdon-Cokesbury Press, 1933.
- _____. Six Kings of the American Pulpit. Philadelphia: The Westminster Press, 1943.
- _____. Sons of Thunder. New York: Fleming H. Revell Company, 1929.

- _____. Strange Texts but Grand Truths. New York: Abingdon-Cokesbury Press, 1953.
- _____. Things Most Surely Believed. Nashville, Tennessee: Cokesbury Press, 1931.
- _____. Trials of Great Men of the Bible. New York: Abingdon-Cokesbury Press, 1946.
- _____. Twelve Great Questions About Christ. New York: Fleming H. Revell Company, 1923.
- _____. The Way of a Man With a Maid. Nashville, Tennessee: Cokesbury Press, 1931.
- _____. What Jesus Really Taught. New York: Abingdon Press, 1958.
- _____. The Wisest Fool and Other Men of the Bible. New York: Abingdon-Cokesbury Press, 1949.
- _____. The Woman of Tekoah and Other Sermons on Bible Characters. New York: Abingdon Press, 1955.
- _____. Wrestlers With God. New York: Harper and Row, Inc., 1930. (Reprinted by Baker Book House, Grand Rapids, Michigan, 1963.)
- _____. You Can Conquer. New York: Abingdon Press, 1954.

BOOKS

- Allen, Frederick Lewis. Only Yesterday. New York: Harper and Brothers, 1931.
- Anderson, Bernhard W. (ed.). The Old Testament and the Christian Faith. New York: Harper and Row, Publishers, 1963.
- Atkins, Gaius Glenn. Religion in Our Times. New York: Round Table Press, Inc., 1932.
- Auden, W. H. The Age of Anxiety; a Baroque Eclogue. New York: Random House, 1946.
- Auer, John Jeffery. An Introduction to Research in Speech. New York: Harper Brothers, 1959.
- Auerbach, Erich. Mimesis. Garden City, New York: Doubleday and Company, Anchor Book Paperback, 1957.
- Barth, Karl. The Preaching of the Gospel. Philadelphia: Westminster, 1963.
- Blackwood, Andrew Watterson. Expository Preaching for Today. New York: Abingdon-Cokesbury Press, 1953.

- Blackwood, Andrew Watterson. Preaching From the Bible. New York: Abingdon-Cokesbury Press, 1941.
- _____. Preaching in Time of Reconstruction. Great Neck, New York: The Pulpit Press, 1945.
- _____. The Preparation of Sermons. New York: Abingdon-Cokesbury Press, 1948.
- Brembeck, W. L., and Howell, W. S. Persuasion, A Means of Social Control. Englewood Cliffs, New Jersey: Prentice-Hall, Inc., 1952.
- Brigance, William Norwood. Speech. New York: Appleton-Century-Crofts, Inc. 2nd ed. 1961.
- Brigance, William Norwood. Speech Composition. New York: Appleton-Century-Crofts, Inc., 1937.
- Broadus, John A. On the Preparation and Delivery of Sermons. New and revised edition. New York: Harper and Brothers, 1944.
- _____. The Preparation and Delivery of Sermons. New York: A. C. Armstrong and Son, 1887.
- Brown, J. A. C. Techniques of Persuasion. London: Cox and Wyman Ltd., 1963. Reprinted by Penguin Books, Baltimore, Maryland, 1964.
- Browne, R. E. C. The Ministry of the Word. London: SCM Press LTD, 1958.
- Burke, Kenneth. A Rhetoric of Motives. New York: Prentice-Hall, 1950.
- Bury, J. B. The Ancient Greek Historians. New York: Macmillan Company, 1909.
- _____. The Idea of Progress. London: Macmillan and Company, Limited, 1921.
- Cairns, David. A Gospel Without Myth? London: SCM Press LTD, 1960.
- Carnell, Edward J. The Case for Orthodoxy. Philadelphia: Westminster Press, 1959.
- Cole, Stewart G. The History of Fundamentalism. New York: Richard R. Smith, Inc., 1931.
- Commager, Henry Steele. The American Mind. New Haven: Yale University Press, 1950.
- Cooper, Lane. Trans. The Rhetoric of Aristotle. New York: Appleton-Century-Crofts, Inc., 1932.
- Curry, S. S. Imagination and Dramatic Instinct. Boston: The Expression Company, 1896.

- Curti, Merle. The Growth of American Thought. 2nd ed. New York: Harper and Row, Publishers, 1951.
- Darlington, William M. Centenary Memorial of the Planting and Growth of Presbyterianism in Western Pennsylvania and Parts Adjacent... Pittsburgh: Benjamin Singerly, 1876.
- Davis, H. Grady. Design for Preaching. Philadelphia: Fortress Press, 1958.
- Dillenberger, John, and Welch, Claude. Protestant Christianity. New York: Charles Scribner's Sons, 1954.
- Dodd, C. H. The Apostolic Preaching. Chicago: Willet, 1937.
- Dulles, Foster Rhea. The United States Since 1865. Ann Arbor: The University of Michigan Press, 1959.
- Eisenson, Jon; Auer, J. Jeffery, and Irwin, John V. The Psychology of Communication. New York: Appleton-Century-Crofts, 1963.
- Erikson, E. H. Childhood and Society. New York: W. W. Norton and Co., 1950.
- Fosdick, Harry Emerson. The Living of These Days. New York: Harper and Brothers, 1956.
- Foster, F. H. The Modern Movement in American Theology. New York: Fleming H. Revell, Company, 1939.
- The Fundamentals: A Testimony to the Truth. Vols. 1-12. Chicago: Testimony Publishing Company, n. d.
- Furniss, Norman F. The Fundamentalist Controversy, 1918-1931. New Haven: Yale University Press, 1954.
- Garrison, Webb B. The Preacher and His Audience. Westwood, New Jersey: Fleming H. Revell Company, 1954.
- Garrison, Winfred Ernest. The March of Faith. New York: Harper and Brothers Publishers, 1933.
- Gasper, Lewis. The Fundamentalist Movement. Paris, France: Mouton and Company, 1963.
- Gilman, Wilbur E.; Aly, Bower; and Reid, Loren D. The Fundamentals of Speaking. New York: The Macmillan Company, 1951.
- Guerard, Albert. Personal Equation. New York: W. W. Norton and Company, 1948.
- Hance, Kenneth G.; Ralph, David C.; and Wiksell, Milton J. Principles of Speaking. Belmont, California: Wadsworth Publishing Company, Inc., 1962.

Henry, Carl F. H. The Drift of Western Thought. Grand Rapids, Michigan: Wm. B. Eerdmans Publishing Company, 1951.

_____. Fifty Years of Protestant Theology. Boston: W. A. Wilde Company, 1950.

_____. Remaking the Modern Mind. Grand Rapids, Michigan: Wm. B. Eerdmans Publishing Company, 1948.

Hochmuth, Marie Kathryn (ed.) A History and Criticism of American Public Address. New York: Longman's, Green, 1955.

The Holy Bible. New York: Oxford University Press.

Horton, W. M. Realistic Theology. New York: Harper and Brothers, 1934.

Hovland, Carl, Janis, Irving, and Kelley, Harold. Communication and Persuasion. New Haven: Yale University Press, 1953.

_____. The Order of Presentation in Persuasion. New Haven: Yale University Press, 1957.

Hovland, Carl Iver, Janis, Irving L., and Kelley, Harold H. The Order of Presentation in Persuasion. New Haven: Yale University Press, 1957.

_____. Personality and Persuasability. New Haven: Yale University Press, 1959.

Hovland, Carl I.; Lumsdaine, Arthur A.; and Sheffield, Fred D. Experiments on Mass Communication. Princeton, New Jersey: Princeton University Press, 1949.

Hovland, Carl I., and Sherif, Muzafer. Social Judgment: Assimilation and Contrast Effects in Communication and Attitude Change. New Haven: Yale University Press, 1961.

Hurlbut, Dr. Jesse Lyman (ed.). Great Sermons by Great Preachers. Chicago: The John C. Winton Company, 1927.

The Interpreter's Bible. 12 volumes. New York: Abingdon-Cokesbury Press, 1952.

Jones, Edgar DeWitt. American Preacher's of Today. Indianapolis: The Bobbs-Merrill Company, 1933.

Jones, E. Winston. Preaching and the Dramatic Arts. New York: The Macmillan Company, 1948.

Kraemer, Hendrik. The Communication of the Christian Faith. Philadelphia: Westminster, 1956.

Leighton, Isabel (ed.). The Aspirin Age, 1919-1941. New York: Simon and Schuster, 1949.

- Leith, John H. (ed.). Creeds of the Churches. Chicago: Aldine Publishing Company, 1963.
- Loetscher, Lefferts A. The Broadening Church. Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 1957.
- McBurney, James H.; O'Neill, James M.; Mills, Glen E. Argumentation and Debate. New York: The Macmillan Company, 1951.
- McBurney, James H., and Wrage, Ernest J. The Art of Good Speech. New York: Prentice Hall, Inc., 1953.
- Machen, J. Gresham. Christianity and Liberalism. Grand Rapids, Michigan: Wm. B. Eerdmans Publishing Company, 1923.
- Macleod, Donald (ed.). Here is My Method. Westwood, New Hampshire: Fleming H. Revell Company, 1952.
- Marty, Martin E. The New Shape of American Religion. New York: Harper and Brothers Publishers, 1958.
- Mead, Frank S. Handbook of Denominations. Second Revised Edition. New York, Nashville: Abingdon Press, 1961.
- Miller, Donald G. The Way to Biblical Preaching. New York: Abingdon-Cokesbury Press, 1957.
- Minnick, Wayne C. The Art of Persuasion. Boston: Houghton Mifflin Company, 1957.
- Monroe, Alan H. Principles and Types of Speech. Chicago: Scott Foresman and Company, 1955.
- Nash, Arnold S. (ed.). Protestant Thought in the Twentieth Century. New York: The Macmillan Company, 1951.
- _____. The University and the Modern World. New York: Macmillan Company, 1943.
- Niebuhr, H. R. "The Protestant Movement and Democracy in the United States." The Shaping of American Religion. (Volume I of Religion in American Life. Edited by James Ward Smith and A. Leland Jamison). Princeton, New Jersey: Princeton University Press, 1961.
- Ogden, C. K., and Richards, I. A. The Meaning of Meaning. New York: Harcourt, Brace and Company, 1946.
- Oliver, Robert T. The Psychology of Persuasive Speech. 2nd ed. New York: Longmans, Green and Company, 1957.
- Oliver, Robert T.; Cortright, Rupert L.; and Hager, Cyril F. The New Training for Effective Speech. New York: The Dryden Press, 1946.

- Olmstead, Clifton E. History of Religion in the United States. Englewood Cliffs, New Jersey: Prentice-Hall, Inc., 1960.
- Osborn, Ronald E. The Spirit of American Christianity. New York: Harper and Brothers Publishers, 1958.
- Phillips, A. E. Effective Speaking. Chicago: The Newton Company, 1908.
- Piaget, J. The Moral Judgment of the Child. New York: Harcourt, Brace and Company, 1932.
- Randall, John Herman, Jr. The Making of the Modern Mind. Boston: Houghton Mifflin Company, 1926.
- Rauschenbusch, Walter. A Theology for the Social Gospel. New York: Macmillan Company, 1917.
- Rian, Edwin H. The Presbyterian Conflict. Grand Rapids, Michigan: Wm. B. Eerdmans Publishing Company, 1940.
- Ritschl, Dietrich. A Theology of Proclamation. Richmond, Virginia: John Knox Press, 1963.
- Roberts, D. E., and Van Dusen, H. P. (eds.). Liberal Theology: An Appraisal. New York: Scribners, 1942.
- Robins, James M., and Cobb, John B., Jr. (ed.). New Frontiers in Theology. Vol. II: The New Hermeneutic. New York: Harper and Row, Publishers, 1964.
- Sarett, Lew; Foster, William Trufont; Sarett, Alma Johnson. Basic Principles of Speech. 3rd ed. rev. Boston: Houghton Mifflin Company, 1958.
- Schaff, Philip. The Creeds of Christendom. I, 6th ed. New York: Harper and Brothers, Publishers, 1877.
- Schneider, Herbert Wallace. Religion in 20th Century America. Cambridge, Massachusetts: Harvard University Press, 1952.
- Sellers, James. The Outsider and the Word of God. New York: Abingdon Press, 1961.
- Sizoo, Joseph R. Preaching Unashamed. Nashville: Cokesbury, 1949.
- Sleeth, Ronald E. Persuasive Preaching. New York: Harper and Brothers, 1956.
- Smith, H. Shelton; Handy, Robert T.; and Loetscher, Lefferts A. American Christianity. New York: Charles Scribner's Sons, 1963.

- Smith, James Ward, and Jamison, Leland A. (eds.). The Shaping of American Religion. Volume I of Religion in American Life. Princeton, New Jersey: Princeton University Press, 1961.
- Stevick, Daniel B. Beyond Fundamentalism. Richmond, Virginia: John Knox Press, 1964.
- Stonehouse, Ned B. J. Gresham Machen. Grand Rapids, Michigan: Wm. B. Eerdmans Publishing Company, 1954.
- Sweet, William Warren. The Story of Religion In America. New York: Harper and Brothers Publishers, 1930. Also 1950 Second Revised edition.
- Toynbee, Arnold J. A Study of History. Abridged by D. C. Somervell. New York: Oxford University Press, 1954. Vol. 1.
- Trager, George L., and Smith, Henry Lee, Jr. An Outline of English Structure. Norman: Battenburg Press, 1951.
- Twentieth Century Encyclopedia of Religious Knowledge. Grand Rapids: Baker Book House, 1955.
- Van Til, Cornelius. The New Modernism. Philadelphia: The Presbyterian and Reformed Publishing Company, 1947.
- Watson, J. S. (translator and editor). Quintilian's Institutes of Oratory. 2 Volumes. London: George Bell and Sons, 1895.
- Weigel, Gustave, S. J. A Catholic Primer on the Ecumenical Movement. Westminster, Maryland: Newman Press, 1957.
- White, Robert W. Lives in Progress. New York: The Dryden Press, 1952.
- Whitesell, Faris Daniel. The Art of Biblical Preaching. (Introduction by Clarence Edward Macartney). Grand Rapids, Michigan: Zondervan Publishing House, 1950.
- Whitesell, Faris D., and Perry, Lloyd M. Variety in Your Preaching. Westwood, New Jersey: Fleming H. Revell Company, 1954.
- Wilder, Amos N. The Language of the Gospel. New York: Harper and Row, Publishers, 1964.
- Winans, James A. Public Speaking. New York: The Century Company, 1917.
- Wolseley, Roland E. (ed.). Writing for the Religious Market. New York: Association Press, 1956.
- Wrage, Ernest J. and Baskerville, Barnet (eds.). Contemporary Forum. New York: Harper and Brothers, 1962.

ARTICLES AND PERIODICALS

Bennett, John C. "After Liberalism--What?" Christian Century, L (November 8, 1933), 1403-1406.

"Biography," The Bulletin Index, (Pittsburgh, Pennsylvania), CXXVIII (February 16, 1946), 15-17.

Brigance, W. N. "Can We Re-Define the James Winans Theory of Persuasion?" Quarterly Journal of Speech, XXI (February, 1935), 19-26.

Carlough, David. "A Son of the Manse," Beta Theta Pi, LXXIII (July, 1946), 463-464.

"Come Before Winter," The Expositor, XLIX (January, 1947), 26.

"The Design of the Seminary," Catalogue of the Theological Seminary of the Presbyterian Church located at Princeton, New Jersey, pp. 39-40.

"Dr. Macartney in the West," The Presbyterian, LXLIV (October 16, 1924), 6-8.

"Excerpts from Dr. Macartney's Closing Argument," The Presbyterian, LXLIII (June 7, 1923), 8-9.

First Church Life. (Parish Periodical of the First Presbyterian Church of Pittsburgh) Twentieth Anniversary edition, April, 1947; twenty-fifth Anniversary edition, April, 1952; Macartney Memorial edition, April, 1957. Other Miscellaneous copies, 1927-1953.

Fosdick, Harry Emerson. "Beyond Modernism," Christian Century, LII (December 4, 1935), 1549-1552.

_____. "If This Be Heresy," Survey, LIV (April 1, 1925), 29.

Hartt, Rollin Lynde. "Down With Evolution," World's Work, XLVII (December, 1923), 605-614.

_____. "Is the Church Dividing?" World's Work, XLVII (December, 1923), 161-170.

_____. "The War in the Churches," World's Work, XLVI (September, 1923), 469-477.

Henry, J. Clyde. "A Messenger of Grace," Princeton Seminary Bulletin, L (May, 1957), 17-24.

Hodge, Archibald A., and Warfield, Benjamin B. "Inspiration," Presbyterian Review, Vol. II, 1881, 225-8.

Hutchinson, Paul. "The Future of Religion," Forum, LXXXIX (April, 1933), 226-231.

Lingle, Walter L. "A Significant Anniversary," Christian Observer, CXXXV (July 9, 1947), 2-3.

Macartney, Clarence E. "The Authority of the Holy Scriptures," The Princeton Theological Review, XXIII (July, 1925), 389-396.

_____. "Beyond the Grave," Ladies Home Journal, XLIII (February, 1926), 8, 192, 195; XLIII (March, 1926), 12, 235; XLIII (April, 1926), 42, 56.

_____. "The Creed of Presbyterians," The Presbyterian, LXLIII (July 12, 1923), 8-10, 26.

_____. "Declaration of Faith," First Church Life, (October, 1950), 16.

_____. "For the Faith: the Philadelphia Overture," The Presbyterian, LXLIII (February 15, 1923), 8, 9, 26.

_____. "The Great Defection," The Presbyterian, LXLIII (September 20, 1923), 8-10.

_____. "The Irrepressible Conflict," The Presbyterian, LXLIV (February 14, 1924), 6-9.

_____. "Protestantism's Tomorrow," Christianity Today, I (May, 1930), 8-10.

_____. "Shall Unbelief Win?" The Presbyterian, LXLII (July 13, 1922), 8, 10, 26; (July 20, 1922), 8-10.

_____. "The State of the Church," The Princeton Theological Review, XXIII (April, 1925), 177-192.

_____. "Warm Hearts and Steady Faith," The Christian Century, LVI (March 8, 1939), 315-319.

Morrison, Charles Clayton. "The Atomic Bomb and the Christian Faith," The Christian Century, LXIII (March 13, 1946), 330-333.

Niebuhr, Reinhold H. "Ten Years That Shook My World," The Christian Century, LVI (April 26, 1939), 542-546.

"The Olive Branch for Fosdick," The Literary Digest, LXXXI (June 21, 1924), 33.

The Pittsburgh Press. February 11, 1927.

The Pittsburgh Gazette-Times. February 7, 1927.

The Pittsburgh Pennsylvania Post. February 13, 1927; April 4, 1927.

The Pittsburgh Sun-Telegraph. November 23, 1953; April 26, 1952;
April 28, 1952; February 20, 1957.

"Preach the West Wind," Time, LX (July 21, 1952), 47.

"The Presbyterians," The Christian Century, XLV (June 14, 1928), 754.

"Revive, Revivify the Evening Service," The Presbyterian, LXIII
(November 18, 1943), 3.

Smith, C. Ralston. "He Being Dead Yet Speaketh," Christianity in the
World Today, I (March 18, 1957), 28-29.

Thomas, Gordon L. "Effect of Oral Style on Intelligibility of Speech,"
Speech Monographs, XXIII (March, 1956), 46-54.

Tompkins, Philip K. "Rhetorical Criticism: Wrong Medium?" Central
States Speech Journal, XIII, No. 2. (Winter, 1962), 90-95.

Wick, Hilton A. Letter to the editor, The Bulletin Index, CXXII
(October 24, 1940), 14, 18.

_____. "Come Before Winter: The Story of a Sermon," The Presbyterian,
CX (October 24, 1940), 11.

PAMPHLETS

Macartney, Clarence E. "Another Gospel Which Is Not Another," n.d.

_____. "Come Before Winter." New York: Abingdon-Cokesbury Press,
1945.

_____. "The Fact of Facts," n.d.

_____. "Four Anchors," n.d. (Preached January 11, 1942.)

_____. "The Kind of Leader America Needs Today," n.d.

_____. "Lincoln and Washington Speak to the Soul of America," n.d.
(Preached February 22, 1948).

_____. "The Next Day, Chios," n.d. (Preached September 19, 1937).

_____. "The Platform of Christ and the Church." June 14, 1936.

_____. "Providence and Predestination," n.d.

_____. "The Second Coming of Christ," n.d.

_____. "A Son's Tribute to His Mother," n.d.

_____. "Sixty Bombers Did Not Return," n.d. (Preached November 7,
1944).

_____. "The Spires of Cologne," n.d.

Macartney, Clarence E. "Tell It to the Generation Following," n.d.
(Preached December 2, 1934).

_____. "Three Foes at America's Gate," No. 1, n.d. (Preached
November 15, 1936).

UNPUBLISHED MATERIALS

Averitt, James W. "A Study of Seven Contemporary Ministers, Their
Sermon Content and Methods." Unpublished Master's Thesis,
Louisville Presbyterian Theological Seminary, Louisville,
Kentucky, 1947.

Boecler, P. A. O. "The Preaching of the Law in the Sermons of Geise-
mann, Fosdick, Spurgeon, and Macartney, and the Application of
Psychological Procedures." Unpublished Master's Thesis,
Concordia Theological Seminary, Louisville, Kentucky, 1947.

Bryan, William Jennings. Typescript of Speech Nominating Dr. Macartney
as Moderator of the General Assembly. Xeroxed copy supplied by
the Presbyterian Historical Society, 520 Witherspoon Building,
Philadelphia, Pennsylvania.

Guerard, Wilhelmina. "Clarence Macartney." Biographical Notes, (type-
written).

Hayes, Quentin O. "The Sermons of Clarence E. Macartney." Unpublished
Bachelor's thesis, Asbury Theological Seminary, Wilmore, Kentucky,
1957.

Jones, Elbert Winston. "A Study of Interest Factors and Motive Appeals
in Rhetorical Theory with Special Reference to Invention, Style,
and Arrangement." Unpublished Ph.D. dissertation, Northwestern
University, Evanston, Illinois, 1950.

Lucas, Richard D. "The Preaching of Clarence E. Macartney." Unpub-
lished Th.D. dissertation, Southern Baptist Theological Seminary,
Louisville, Kentucky, 1959.

Macartney, Clarence E. "A Christian's Difficulty with Evolution."
(Typewritten), Macartney Files, n.d.

_____. Lecture Notes on Preaching. (Typewritten). Macartney Files.

Nelson, Arnold L. "The Biographical Method in the Preaching of Alexander
Whyte and Clarence E. Macartney." Unpublished Bachelor's Thesis,
The Biblical Seminary, New York, April, 1955.

Sager, Allen. "The Fundamentalist--Modernist Controversy, 1918-1930, in
the History of American Public Address." Unpublished Ph.D.
dissertation, Northwestern University, Evanston, Illinois, 1963.

Streufert, Carl A. "An Analysis of the Introductions and Conclusions of C. E. Macartney's Sermons." Unpublished Bachelor of Divinity Thesis, Concordia Seminary, 1952.

OTHER SOURCES

Beaver Falls, Pennsylvania. Personal interviews with Mrs. Mable Moss and Mrs. J. Vale Downie, May, 1965.

Hayward, California. Personal interviews with Pastor Paul B. Rhodes, May, June, 1965.

Letters, papers. Miscellaneous letters and papers, Macartney Files, McCartney Library, Geneva College, Beaver Falls, Pennsylvania; correspondence received from C. Ralston Smith; John K. Highburger; Paul B. Rhodes; James H. Blackstone, Jr.; Harold J. Ockenga; Mrs. Ruth Tabler; Reigner Recording Library; The office secretary, First Presbyterian Church of Pittsburgh, Pennsylvania; The Office of the Registrar, The University of Wisconsin and The University of Denver, Colorado.

Minutes of the General Assembly of the United Presbyterian Church in the U.S.A. (Office of the General Assembly, 510 Witherspoon Building, Philadelphia, Pennsylvania), 1927-1953.

Palo Alto, California. Personal interview with Dr. Albert J. Guerard, Stanford University, November, 1964.

Pittsburgh, Pennsylvania. Personal interviews with Dr. Robert J. Lamont, Dr. Anne Cook, Mrs. Ruth Tabler, May, 1965.

Recordings. Six sermons recorded on tape and loaned by Pastor James H. Blackstone, Jr. Tape recording of "Come Before Winter," Reigner Recording Library, Richmond, Virginia.

Walnut Creek, California. Personal interview with Pastor William S. Stoddard, February, 1965.

MICHIGAN STATE UNIVERSITY LIBRARIES



3 1293 03145 1382

