

Achieving a Racial Democracy in Brazil through Race Based Social  
Inclusion Higher Education Policy

by

Monica Annette Evans

A DISSERTATION

Submitted to  
Michigan State University  
in partial fulfillment of the requirements  
for the degree of

DOCTOR OF PHILOSOPHY

Educational Policy

2011

## ABSTRACT

### ACHIEVING A RACIAL DEMOCRACY IN BRAZIL THROUGH RACE BASED SOCIAL INCLUSION HIGER EDUCATION POLICY

By

Monica Annette Evans

In this dissertation, I examine the social inclusion higher education policies and programs, targeted toward Afro-Brazilians, which are currently being implemented in Brazil. Through document analysis and stakeholder interviews, I analyze the broader Brazilian socio-historical context surrounding the policies, as well as the policy trajectory to date. Additionally, I use conceptual frameworks to analyze the policy landscape at the federal, university, and community levels. Utilizing a social inclusion ideology framework (Gidley, Hampson, Wheeler, & Bereded-Samuel, 2010), I establish the ideologies that are embedded in the policies and programs. I also explore the policy approaches and tools used to promote social inclusion through the use of the conceptual frameworks of Hopenhayn (2008) and McDonnell and Elmore (1987). This study

contributes to the social inclusion policy literature concerned with the ongoing development of racially inclusive societies in Latin America as well as the use of education policy as a democratization tool.

Copyright by  
MONICA ANNETTE EVANS  
2011

This dissertation is dedicated to my grandmother, Florida (Cee) Evans, my parents, Marilyn and Alfred Evans, my son, Foluke Zvinavashe, and my grandmother Essie Mae Henley and the other ancestors who have guided me along this journey. Adupe, Ase.

## Acknowledgements

I am indebted to a number of people who have helped me to navigate the graduate school and dissertation process. Dr. Reitumetse Mabokela, my advisor and chair, graciously served as a mentor and role model throughout this process. Dr. Chris Dunbar, Dr. Peter Youngs, and Dr. Doug Campbell, my committee members, and Dr. Michael Sedlak and Dr. Dorinda Carter Andrews, all provided much needed support along the way. Dr. David Wiley and Dr. David Plank connected me with resources and contacts which assisted me as I did my fieldwork in Brazil. I owe a special thanks to Dr. Ollie Johnson, who has served as a mentor and friend, helping to facilitate my entrance into the Afro-Brazilian studies community in the United States and Brazil. I also remember and give thanks to Dr. Jonas Zoninsein (1947-2010) and Dr. Susan Applegate Krouse (1955-2010), professors who assisted me in my endeavors and who are surely missed.

Preparation for this research project was supported by Michigan State University College of Education fellowships and a MSU Center for Advanced Studies in International Development Foreign Language and Area Studies fellowship. The research project itself was supported by a MSU Center for Latin American and Caribbean Studies Tinker fellowship and a U.S. Department of Education Fulbright Doctoral Dissertation Research Abroad

fellowship. The opinions expressed in this study are those of the author and do not necessarily reflect the views of the funding agencies.

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

LIST OF FIGURES	xiv
KEY TO ABBREVIATIONS	xv
CHAPTER 1: INTRODUCTION AND OVERVIEW	1
Brazil as a Racial Democracy	1
Research Questions	2
Research Methods	3
Key Theoretical Concepts	4
Rationale	6
Overview of Chapters	6
CHAPTER 2: LITERATURE REVIEW	8
Social Exclusion	8
Measuring Social Exclusion	13
Social Inclusion and Educational Policies	16
Perspectives on Quotas	21
Conceptual Framework: Social Inclusion Ideology, Approaches, and Tools	29
Neo-liberal / Neo-structural Ideology	30
Social Justice Ideology	31



Social Transformation Ideology	31
Policy Approaches	32
Policy Tools	33
Summary	34
CHAPTER 3: RESEARCH METHODS	36
Methods Overview	36
Three Sites of Investigation	37
Data and Data Collection	39
Study Design and Instrument Development	41
Policy Documents	42
Semi-structured Interviews	45
Observation	46
Data Analysis	48
CHAPTER 4: THE CHANGING DYNAMIC OF RACE IN BRAZIL: FROM SLAVERY, TO A NEW RACIAL DEMOCRACY, TO SOCIAL INCLUSION	51
Section 1: Historical Analysis	51
The Emergence of the Brazilian Educational System	62
Section Two: Public Law 12.288/2010 (Racial Equality Statute)	77
Analysis of Policy Document One Using the Conceptual Framework	84

Policy Ideologies	85
Policy Approaches	86
Cultural legitimization	86
Recognition	87
Redistribution: Educational improvement	87
Redistribution: Financial support	87
Redistribution: Quotas	88
Policy Tools	89
Mandates	89
Inducements	89
Capacity building	90
System changes	90
Section 3: Federal Level Higher Education Policies	
And Programs	91
Afroattitude	91
Knowledge Connections	95
ProUni	98
PIBIC-AA	99
Analysis of Federal Programs Using the	
Conceptual Framework	99
Policy Ideologies	100
Policy Approaches	101
Cultural Legitimization	102
Recognition	102
Redistribution: Educational improvement	102
Redistribution: Financial support	102
Redistribution: Quotas	103

Policy Tools	104
Mandates	104
Inducements	105
Capacity building	105
System changes	105
Summary	106

CHAPTER 5: RACE BASED SOCIAL INCLUSION HIGHER EDUCATION IN BRAZIL: THE CASE OF THE FEDERAL UNIVERSITY OF BAHIA	109
Early University Social Inclusion Policy Activity	109
The Community and the University Converge	111
The Color of Bahia	114
Color of Bahia Programs	116
The Center for Afro-Asiatic Studies (CEAO)	120
CEAFRO	120
Uniafro	123
Graduate Programs: Pos-Afro and Factory of Ideas	124
University-wide Initiatives	126
Permanecer and Conviver	128
Analysis of the Programs using the Conceptual Framework	130
Social Inclusion Ideology	130
Approaches	134
Cultural legitimization	134
Recognition	135
Redistribution: Educational improvement	135

Redistribution: Financial support	137
Redistribution: Quotas	137
Tools	139
Mandates	140
Inducements	140
Capacity building	140
System changes	141
Summary	141

CHAPTER 6: SOCIAL INCLUSION FROM THE OUTSIDE IN: HIGHER EDUCATION SOCIAL INCLUSION AND THE BLACK COMMUNITY: STEVE BIKO INSTITUTE	144
The Black Movement as Change Agent in Education	144
Steve Biko Institute	153
Description	153
SBI Programs	156
CCN	156
Pre-vestibular	160
Oguntec	161
Other Courses at SBI	165
Analysis of Steve Biko Institute Programs using The Conceptual Framework	169
Policy Ideologies	169
Policy Approaches	171
Cultural legitimization	172
Recognition	172

Redistribution: Educational improvement	173
Redistribution: Financial support	173
Redistribution: Quotas	174
Policy Tools	174
Mandates	175
Inducements	175
Capacity building	175
System changes	176
Summary	176
 CHAPTER 7: CONCLUSIONS	 179
Summary of Findings and Implications for Research And Practice	 181
Limitations	187
Areas for Future Research	188
 APPENDICES	 192
Appendix A: Consent Form in English	193
Appendix B: Consent Form in Portuguese	197
Appendix C: Research Protocols	201
 REFERENCES	 204

## LIST OF FIGURES

Figure 1 -Research Areas and Conceptual Framework	34
Figure 2 - Interviewee Information	40
Figure 3 - Policy and Program Documents	43
Figure 4 - Codelist	44
Figure 5 - Research Methods	47
Figure 6 - Federal Social Inclusion Programs	104
Figure 7 - UFBA Social Inclusion Policies and Programs	139
Figure 8 - SBI Social Inclusion Programs	168

# KEY TO ABBREVIATIONS

Portuguese Term	English Translation	Abbreviation/ Common Name
A Pró-Reitoria de Ações Afirmativas e Assistência Estudantil	Office of Affirmative Action and Student Assistance	PROAE
Afroatitude	n/a	n/a
CEAFRO	n/a	CEAFRO
Centro do Estudos Afro-Orientais	Center for Afro-Asiatic Studies	CEAO
Cidadania e Consciência Negra	Citizenship and Black Consciousness	CCN
Conexões de Saberes	Knowledge Connections	n/a
Conferência Nacional de Promoção da Igualdade Racial	National Conference for the Promotion of Racial Equality	CONAPIR
Conselho Nacional de Promoção da Igualdade Racial	National Council for the Promotion of Racial Equality	CNPIR
Cor de Bahia	Color of Bahia	n/a
Fabrica de Ideas	Factory of Ideas	n/a
Fórum Intergovernamental de Promoção da Igualdade Racial	Intergovernmental Forum for the Promotion of Racial Equality	FIPIR
Frente Negra Brasileira	Brazilian Black Front	FNB
Instituto Steve Biko	Steve Biko Institute	SBI
Ministério da Educação	Ministry of Education	MEC
Movimento Negro Unificado	Unified Black Movement	MNU
Plano Nacional de Promoção da Igualdade Racial	National Plan for the Promotion of Racial Equality	PLANAPIR
Política Nacional de Promoção da Igualdade Racial	National Policy for the Promotion of Racial Equality	PNPIR
Portas Abertas, Mentes Abertas	Open Doors, Open Minds	Pompa
Programa Institucional de Iniciação Científica	Institutional Program Scientific Initiation Affirmative Action	PIBIC-AA

Programa Multidisciplinar de Pós-Graduação em Estudos Étnicos e Africanos	Multidisciplinary Graduate Program in African and Ethnic Studies	PosAfro
Programa Políticas da Cor	Policies of Color Program	PPCor
Programa Universidade para Todos	University for Everyone Program	ProUni
Projeto Tutoria	Tutoring Project	n/a
Secretaria da Políticas de Promoção da Igualdade Racial	Secretariat of Policies for the Promotion of Racial Equality	SEPPIR
Secretaria de Educação Continuada, Alfabetização e Diversidade	Secretariat for Continuing Education, Literacy, and Diversity	Secad
Teatro Experimental do Negro	Negro Experimental Theater	TEN
Universidade do NorteFluminense	University of North Fluminense	UENF
Uniafro	n/a	Uniafro
Universidade Estado da Bahia	State University of Bahia	UNEB
Universidade Estado do Rio de Janeiro	State University of Rio de Janeiro	UERJ
Universidade Federal da Bahia	Federal University of Bahia	UFBA



## Chapter 1: Introduction and Overview

### *Brazil as a Racial Democracy*

Brazil is attempting to turn its mythical vision of a racial democracy into a reality. The former slave colony, which took great pride in liberating slaves by decree and not through warfare, had for many decades been purported to be a racial democracy (Freyre, 1946). The viewpoint from within as well as abroad was that Brazil was a country that celebrated the mixture of the Indian, the European, and the African (Bailey, 2004). Discussion of racism was muted in society and the academy (Skidmore, 1993). The massive inequalities between Black and White Brazilians were rationalized to be issues of class inequality. Black activists and some university researchers had long declared otherwise, but it is only recently that this perspective has changed. Most recently, there has been considerable focus on the social exclusion of afro-descendants and policies of social inclusion with an emphasis on educational policies and programs in particular. The most controversial policies have been redistributive higher education policies, particularly quotas (Fry, 2007; Htun, 2004; Johnson, 2007).

While the socio-economic indicators of afro-descendants in Brazil still show vast racial and class inequalities, Afro-Brazilians, a historically socially excluded population, have

made inroads into all sectors of Brazilian society. This dissertation investigates how Brazil is using educational policies to become a more inclusive democracy. In what ways are policymakers, administrators, educators, and activists able to use the current policy climate to implement higher education social inclusion policies that target Afro-Brazilians? I explore this country's attempts to promote social inclusion in the educational system through higher education policy and programs that benefit Afro-Brazilians.

### *Research Questions*

This qualitative investigation focuses on policies and program initiatives that have been developed by the federal government, by a university, the Federal University of Bahia, and by the Steve Biko Institute, an Afro-Brazilian community organization. Prior research shows that substantial policy activity has occurred in all three spheres (federal, university, and community organizational), activity that is often interrelated. Each sphere, however, has a unique policy history and trajectory, as well as ideologies and methods of promoting and implementing social inclusion in higher education. This study looks at the federal government policy activity over time, as well as the activities of a federal university and a

community organization, both which are located in Salvador da Bahia, Brazil, the black cultural capital of Brazil.

Quota policies that mandate the reservation of spaces in the 1<sup>st</sup> year class of universities for Afro-Brazilians tend to be the most widely discussed and debated type of initiative. However, quota policies are but one type of social inclusion higher education policy that is utilized in Brazil. I investigate the policy landscape in its entirety. Specifically, this investigation describes and explains:

- The socio-historical context surrounding higher education social inclusion policies that target Afro-Brazilians
- The policy ideologies, approaches, and tools that predominate at the federal, university, and community level

### *Research Methods*

The three policy spheres, the federal government, the Federal University of Bahia (UFBA), and the Steve Biko Institute (SBI), are examined as individual cases. Three types of research methods were used to collect data about each sphere. Document analysis was used for understanding the social, historical, and political contexts surrounding the policies. Document analysis also was used to examine the policies in-depth. Semi-structured

interviews were used to provide context. These interviews also provided detailed information about specific policies and programs, particularly at the university and community levels. Direct observation of the activities of the community organization provided additional data about the ways in which that sphere envisioned and implemented social inclusion initiatives.

### *Key Theoretical Concepts*<sup>1</sup>

As Brazil increasingly gains prominence as the leading Latin American country, more emphasis has been made on improving the social condition of its citizenry, particularly those historically excluded from the larger democratic project. This includes indigenous people, poor people, and Afro-Brazilians. *Social exclusion* and *social inclusion* are phrases commonly used by the federal government, the academic community, and community organizations. Social exclusion can be defined as "the denial of equal access to opportunities imposed by certain groups of society upon others" (Behrman, Gaviria, & Szekely, 2003). Social inclusion policies and programs are being used to remedy social inclusion of specific groups. These policies and programs, "...call for public investments to correct imbalances in access to quality services and to productive and political resources.

---

<sup>1</sup> The theoretical concepts will be discussed in greater detail in Chapter 2.

They strive to 'level the playing field' and create an enabling environment for the excluded to exercise their agency" (Buvinic, 2004). This study is positioned in the ongoing discussion about social inclusion initiatives that are taking place throughout parts of Latin America.

The ideology and rationale behind why social inclusion is necessary varies, as do the approaches or ways in which policymakers and implementers attempt to promote social inclusion. The specific policy tools and the mechanisms through which the policy goals are translated to concrete action are also varied. This study utilizes three conceptual frameworks to examine the policy landscape in Brazil: one, a social inclusion ideology framework to determine to what extent the policies are framed as neo-structural, social justice, or transformation focused; two, a social inclusion policy framework, to examine the approaches (cultural legitimization, recognition, redistributive) used to promote social inclusion; and three, a policy tool framework to describe and explain the processes by which these social inclusion goals are administered.

In addition to the social exclusion and social inclusion policy bodies of literature and the conceptual framework literature, the debate surrounding social inclusion in Brazil is addressed. These policies and programs, particularly redistributive quota policies, have been highly contested.

Discussion of the viewpoints of proponents and opponents of social inclusion higher education policies that target Afro-Brazilians is included in the literature review. Understanding the contentious nature of these policies helps to underscore the profoundness of the societal shift that is currently underway in Brazil.

### *Rationale*

Afro-Brazilians today live in a country that is focused on addressing issues of discrimination and exclusion, a country determined to include all citizens in the larger democratic project. This research illuminates the ways in which socially excluded groups can be successfully included in democratic societies through the promotion and implementation of social inclusion policies and the combined efforts of the state, activists, community members, and scholars. The political, social, and historical contexts surrounding these policies are specific to Brazil. This study, however, will elucidate ways in which various interest groups in other diverse societies can work to promote social inclusion for all citizens through educational inclusion.

### *Overview of Chapters*

Chapter 1 has provided an overview of the purpose of the study, the research questions, the literature and conceptual

frameworks that the study is housed in, and the research methods. Chapter 2 provides a deeper look at the social exclusion and inclusion literature and the conceptual frameworks for the policy ideologies, approaches, and tools. Chapter 3 describes the research methods in detail. Chapter 4 focuses on the federal policy sphere. Chapter 5 focuses on UFBA and Chapter 6 on the SBI. The study is discussed and summarized in Chapter 7.

## Chapter 2: Literature Review

The proposed research is based on a number of literature fields. Research on social exclusion and inclusion in Latin America in general and Brazil in particular is used to explain the social, historical, and political contexts surrounding the educational policies. Discussion of the debates surrounding the policies is also critical. Included in this chapter is a description of the three conceptual frameworks used to analyze the policies and programs.

### *Social Exclusion*

This study is positioned as part of the emerging discussion around social exclusion and policies of social inclusion in democratic countries in Latin America. During the 1980s and the 1990s the region focused on developing economically reformed neo-liberal democracies (Oxhorn & Ducatenzeiler, 1998). Recently, many Latin American countries have shifted their political and economic perspectives, opening up new opportunities for social reform (Almeida, 2007; Cavanaugh & Mander, 2004). Scholars are engaged in a profusion of research that investigates ways in which afro-descendants have endured social exclusion as well as the governmental and civil societal efforts to ensure social inclusion. Quotas and other types of social inclusion policy are increasingly being used throughout



Latin America. This research, which focuses on the policy climate in Bahia, will provide a concrete example of the impact of these policies in a particular locale.

Social exclusion is a complex phenomenon that has its roots in the cultural, economic, legal, and political systems of a given society (Bello & Rangel, 2002). The distribution of income and assets is one aspect of social exclusion, but so is the lack of access to voice and power in a society (Buvinic, 2003). The fact that, in 2002, afro-descendants represented around 45% of the Brazilian population but only 4.4% of the Brazilian Congress is one indicator that Afro-Brazilians are still largely excluded from the social and political spheres of the country (Buvinic, 2003). Social exclusion, a result of intergenerational societal and cultural processes, can be seen through a number of indicators, in addition to measures of political participation, including: measures of poverty and inequality, access to social services and education, and access to and participation in labor markets (Buvinic, 2003).

Socially excluded groups share a number of characteristics. These groups often form sizable portions of the population, but are rendered invisible by official demographic measures<sup>2</sup>.

---

<sup>2</sup> For further discussion of this phenomenon in Brazil, see the book, *Shades of Citizenship: Race and the Census in Modern Politics* (Nobles, 2000).

Cultural denial also contributes to rendering certain groups invisible (Hopehayn, 2005). Socially excluded groups are often disproportionately poor and are often stigmatized and discriminated against. Members of more than one socially excluded group may suffer from cumulative discrimination (Collins, 1998; Delgado & Stefancic, 2001). Buvinic (2003) gives the example of how gender, race, and health issues intersect, leading to the particular societal exclusion of afro-descendant women in Honduras who are infected with HIV/AIDS. Hopehayn (2005) articulates a similar occurrence among indigenous women in Latin America who suffer from 'triple' exclusion because of their gender, race, and class.

Policy has an important role to play in diminishing the effects of social exclusion. Hopenhayn (2005) discusses a recognition-redistribution approach, where demographic data is collected to accurately reflect the socio-economic conditions in all sections of society. Redistribution of resources, such as education, which is "not just a social and cultural right (but) an asset that promotes the realization of other rights" (Hopenhayn, 2005, p. 18), promotes social citizenship for marginalized groups. The legislative actions of countries, like Brazil and Columbia, illustrate that societies recognize and are willing to remedy the negative effects that intergenerational

social exclusion have had on afro-descendants and indigenous people in particular (Bello & Rangel, 2002). Quotas are discussed as effective policy strategies, but the authors assert that such initiatives benefit more successful members of socially excluded groups, and cannot address the needs of all socially excluded people (Buvinic, 2003).

Vann Cott (2005) discusses the ways in which Latin American countries are working to build democracies that are inclusive of indigenous and Afro-descendants populations. Public opinion and the influence of international agencies have helped to encourage countries to adopt policies that affirm minority rights and anti-racism. Democratic states have accepted the theoretical articulation of a 'liberal culturalism', which is defined as:

The view that liberal states should not only uphold the familiar set of individual civil and political rights which are protected in all democracies, but should also adopt various group-specific rights and policies which are intended to recognize and accommodate the distinctive identities and needs of ethnic cultural groups (Kymlicka, in Van Cott, 2005, p. 822).

But the ways in which these issues have been addressed vary across locales and among populations. Indigenous people in Latin America, who comprise around 10% of the population, have made strides in organizing and demanding, and ultimately acquiring, bilingual education and collective land rights (Van Cott, 2005). The Latin American afro-descendant population is around 30% of

the region's population. According to Vann Cott, this population has not been able to successfully organize and influence political, social, and economic policy, a point which is debated by many scholars who study Afro-Latino politics (Covin, 2007; Johnson, 2008). Nevertheless, afro-descendants are primarily urban dwellers and often share common cultural and ethnic identities with the White populations.

Unlike indigenous people, urban afro-descendants focus less on collective land rights and more on anti-racist policies. Vann Cott (2005) states that rural afro-descendant organizations have been able to achieve some policy goals by aligning with indigenous organizations. These indigenous organizations, in turn, have joined forces with international funding agencies and political elites interested in promoting democratic rule. A number of Latin American constitutions include language that, in varying degrees, affirms the rights of indigenous people (Van Cott, 2005).

Vann Cott, like Lovell, discusses how long denied racial disparities and racial and ethnic difference have made fighting racial injustice difficult in a region where many adhere to the *class over race* argument (Van Cott, 2005). Asserting afro-descendant and indigenous identity has been a crucial part of the struggle for collective rights, particularly multicultural

rights (Vann Cott, 2005, p. 833). The political mobilization of indigenous peoples and afro-descendants, strengthened by minority groups' alliances with international agencies, has fostered a higher quality democracy in Latin America. Vann Cott asserts that redistributive policies and other measures need to be enacted in order to continue this current trend in the democratizing countries of Latin America. She warns that economic elites must realize that it is in the countries' best interest to work with indigenous people and afro-descendants to further inclusive democracies (Van Cott, 2005).

### *Measuring Social Exclusion*

The myth of the Brazilian racial democracy limited the intellectual and governmental discussion of race based social exclusion. Researchers, including former Brazilian president Cardoso, were able to challenge the myth through documenting racial inequality in Brazilian society. Measuring social exclusion continues to be important as opponents of quotas and other race-based social inclusion policies continue to assert that race is an inadequate method of determining inequality. The following works examine and measure Latin American social exclusion in numerous ways, including intergenerational mobility, occupational and workplace discrimination, and educational access and attainment.

Behrman, Gaviria, et al. (2001) examine how family background affects socio-economic status in Latin America. Due to the lack of longitudinal data sets on intergenerational mobility, they use household surveys that include retrospective questions about parental socio-economic status in order to ascertain past intergenerational mobility. These data were gathered in Brazil, Columbia, Mexico and Peru, which represents 65% of the population of Latin America. The authors examine more recent intergenerational transmissions of schooling and occupational status in 19 Latin American and Caribbean countries and the United States.

The authors find that intergenerational mobility is higher in the United States and is varied across the other countries. These differences are associated with mean schooling attainment over time and across countries, but changes in schooling attainment do not appear to be correlated with changes in mobility. Returns to schooling are very high in Latin America, particularly at the high school and tertiary levels. The authors do not discuss issues of school quality and racial and ethnic discrimination, issues that they acknowledge could impact intergenerational mobility. They state that immobility may be a reflection of the inequality of schooling in each country. In addition, they make the point that market reforms in Latin

America have not reduced inequality; some reforms have actually increased it by widening wage gaps.

Lovell (1994) looks at social exclusion by examining the intersectionality of race and gender discrimination in the Brazilian workforce using data from 1960-1980. She studies White and Afro-Brazilian men and women in the urban workforce during this period of economic growth and modernization in Brazil. She finds that all four groups achieved "absolute gains in education and wages as well as more favorable occupational and demographic distributions" (Lovell, 1994, p. 30). But there are persistent inequalities with regards to race and gender. In addition, Whites and Afro-Brazilians with similar levels of educational attainment and occupational experience do not have equal access to higher-paying, white collar occupations. Afro-Brazilians who are employed in white collar positions are paid less, and Afro-Brazilian women are at the bottom of the pay scale. Lovell shows that racism and sexism are evident in the Brazilian job market, and that the intersectionality of racism and sexism is particularly detrimental to the Afro-Brazilian female laborer.

Blom, Holm-Nielson, et al. (2001) continue Lovell's analysis using Brazilian labor data from 1982-1998. They find that Brazilian workers, on average, received more schooling in 1998 than 1982 (due to both the retiring of lower educated

workers and the increase of younger, higher educated workers). Universal basic education was a policy focus during this time, resulting in lower returns to primary and secondary education. The demand for highly skilled workers has increased the returns to tertiary education, but Brazil is not currently able to supply the demand because of limited access to higher education. The authors suggest reforming the tertiary education system through inducements that would prompt higher education institutions to adopt policies and practices to increase "access, enrollment, and completion" (Blom, Holm-Nielson, et al., 2001, p. 198). Currently, tertiary education is subsidized primarily for the rich; "... over  $\frac{3}{4}$  of the resources budgeted to public tertiary education pays for education to the wealthiest 20% of the population" (Blom, Holm-Nielson, et al., 2001, p. 199). The authors look at the urban Brazilian population as a whole and do not distinguish between subsets of the population, other than by acknowledging that policy changes need to benefit poorer members of society.

#### *Social Inclusion Educational Policies*

Research on social inclusion and education in Brazil and other parts of Latin America has included some mention of quotas and other educational policies (Blom, Holm-Nielsen, & Verner, 2001; McCowan, 2007; Panizzi, 2003; Zoninsein, 2004a, 2004b)



(Zoninsein, 2001). There have been a few studies that focus on the development and implementation of specific educational policies (Queiroz & Santos, 2006) (Benedito, 2005), but most have looked at the policies broadly. My work will contribute to the social inclusion research field by examining specific social inclusion educational policies and programs undertaken at the community, university, and federal levels in Brazil.

McCowan (2007) examines efforts to increase access to higher education institutions in Brazil, finding that even with the recent expansion of the system through the increasing number of private institutions, inequities persist. Student loans and government subsidies to private institutions expand access to systems of higher education. Low income students, who often have substandard primary and secondary education, are not able to access the higher quality and higher prestige public institutions. They are tracked into what is perceived to be a lower quality education, which translates into a lower value education on the job market.

Another new initiative is the development of low cost *pre-vestibulares* (entrance exam preparatory courses). These courses allow more lower-middle class students access to the private institutions that provide the preparation, but still do not help children of poorer families, who often cannot afford the fees.

McCowan's statistical data shows that 50% of students attending private universities come from the richest 10% of the Brazilian population (2007). Five percent of students come from poor families. These are greater proportions of rich and lower proportions of poor than the public higher educational institutions. McCowan, a university administrator, suggests the elimination of the vestibular for individual schools and the use of a national exam for all secondary school leavers. This would eliminate the need for expensive pre-vestibular courses altogether (2007).

McCowan (2007) also discusses targeted policies, particularly quotas<sup>3</sup>, and the controversies that surround them, stating that such practices, which do discriminate on the basis of background (race and prior schooling), are needed considering the "deep and long lasting exclusion of certain segments of society" (McCowan, 2007, p. 591). Incremental societal changes, like the strengthening of the primary and secondary public educational systems, might be more palatable to those concerned with the procedural justice issues that quotas bring. Indigenous and Afro-Brazilians are underrepresented in both public and private higher education institutions, and quotas can

---

<sup>3</sup> Quota policies are the most widely discussed and controversial of the social inclusion policies discussed in this study. A more detailed discussion of the quota debate follows.

provide a provisional measure of equity while societal changes are in progress. More sweeping social change is needed to fully ensure social inclusion for indigenous and afro-descendant Brazilians (McCowan, 2005).

Social inclusion is not only beneficial for excluded groups, but it also a necessary for the development of society as a whole (Van Cott, 2005). Zoninsein, a Brazilian political economist, focuses on the economic costs that befall countries as a result of social exclusion and the need for affirmative action social inclusion policies (Zoninsein, 2001, 2004a, 2004b). His analyses cover Latin America and the Caribbean, while his discussion on affirmative action is centered in Brazil. Countries that have systematically excluded indigenous and afro-descendant populations have subsequently suffered unnecessary development losses. "Gaps in investment in human capital, low wages and concentrated poverty among afro-descendants and indigenous peoples lead to losses in national production, income, and wealth creation" (Zoninsein, 2004b, p. 41).

Zoninsein uses an economic model that measures the projected gains to the Brazilian, Bolivian, Guatemalan, and Peruvian economies if 1) afro-descendants and indigenous people were able to fully benefit from their current education and

skills, and 2) afro-descendants and indigenous people were able to expand their skills and education to the levels of the White members of the citizenry (Zoninsen, 2001). This model was first developed by economists interested in studying the impact that the social exclusion of Blacks has on the American economic system (Brimmer, 1996). He finds that the Brazilian economy in particular could potentially expand by 12.8 % and asserts that these findings illustrate the societal benefit to ending social exclusion policies and practices (Zoninsein, 2001).

Zoninsein also discusses affirmative action as a social inclusion policy in Brazil (2004b). He argues that while the current initiatives are important first steps to achieving social inclusion for Afro-Brazilians, the current institutionally specific financing and implementation of these initiatives are problematic. The variability of student preparation and resources in different parts of the country make the success of quota policies too dependent on localized administration. Instead, he proposes a somewhat more tightly coupled system with federal oversight. Institutions would voluntarily participate in the federally funded program and be required to administer well organized, results-driven programs.

Governments throughout Latin America are making concrete attempts to promote the social inclusion of afro-descendants

into society. The Brazilian policy landscape has shifted from one that did little to formally acknowledge racial inequality to one that overtly promotes Afro-Brazilian social inclusion. In order to understand how revolutionary the changes that are occurring in Brazilian society are, it is necessary to examine the historical moments that preceded this new era. The next section will address the historical contexts surrounding race, government, and education. Brazil, like most of the countries of North and South America, is the home of descendants of African slaves. To date, Brazil has more African descendants than any country outside of Africa; only Nigeria has more people of African descent (Martins, Medeiros, & Nascimento, 2004).

### *Perspectives on Quotas*

My pre-dissertation research indicated that of all the policies to promote the social inclusion of Afro-Brazilians, quotas policies are the most highly contested. There has been both strong resistance to and support for quota policies by many in the Brazilian academic and media communities (Fry, 2007; Kamel, 2006). This section discusses the perspectives of both sides and provides an analysis of the dominant arguments for and against the use of quota policies as social inclusion policies.

In 2006, two contingencies of academics, entertainers, and activists published open letters to the Brazilian Senate

(Johnson, 2007) . The authors of the first letter were primarily prominent White university professors, but did include some entertainers, including the internationally known singer Caetano Veloso (A. Filho, Mariano, Aggio, & Mello e Souza, 2006). The authors of the second letter were primarily Black academics, researchers, and activists (Nascimento, Gomes, Alves, & Sampaio, 2006). The publication of and the debate surrounding the two letters marked an important turning point in the public discourse surrounding race and equality (Johnson, 2007). Brazilians are increasingly articulating various viewpoints surrounding race.

The first letter, *Todos Tem Diretos Iguais na Republica Democratica*<sup>4</sup> (A. Filho, et al., 2006), denounced PL 73/1999<sup>5</sup> and PL 3.198/2000<sup>67</sup>. The authors asserted that basing rights on the color of one's skin or by one's race was a problematic method for combating social exclusion. The Brazilian government, in

---

<sup>4</sup> Everyone has Equal Rights in the Democratic Republic (of Brazil).

<sup>5</sup> This bill was passed by the House of Representatives and was then debated in public forums across the country in preparation for a Senate vote.

<sup>6</sup> This bill was withdrawn for further debate in 2006 (Johnson, 2008), but the measures outlined in the bill have been implemented to a certain degree through the creation of SEPPIR by the Lula administration.

<sup>7</sup> Both bills were later incorporated into the Racial Equality Statute that is discussed in Chapter 4.

essence, would be “inventing official races” and granting rights and privileges to people in certain racial categories. The bills fail to promote social justice, according to the letter’s authors. Instead, the bills, if passed into law, could potentially increase the level of racial intolerance in Brazilian society. A better policy would be to improve social services for all Brazilians, particularly in the areas of education, health, and labor. Non-race specific policies would improve the lives of all Brazilian citizens without encroaching upon the country’s democratic principles of legal equality (A. Filho, et al., 2006).

The second letter was published in June of 2006. *Manifesto em Favor da Lei de Cotas e do Estatuto da Igualdade Racial*<sup>8</sup> (Nascimento, et al., 2006) discussed the history of inequality and the struggle for equality that has long been a part of Brazilian society. This letter places the two bills within a larger global context, referencing the steps that other nations have made to promote the social inclusion of oppressed groups. Like the policies and practices of the United States, Malaysia, South Africa, and Australia, the two bills, if passed, would make social justice a national initiative. This is necessary, particularly in the higher education sector, according to the

---

<sup>8</sup> Manifesto in Favor of the Quota Law and the Racial Equality Statute.

authors. With 1% of the public universities' students being Afro-Brazilian in a country with a 45% Afro-Brazilian population, university level initiatives alone are inadequate to substantially increasing the numbers of college educated Blacks. A national, race based policy is needed to promote inclusion. The authors of this second letter also critique the first letter, stating that those authors offered no feasible alternative to PL 73/1999 and PL 3.198/2000. Universal equality is an empty principle without any specific policies to promote racial inclusion. According to the second letter's authors, to not promote the two bills is to reify the unequal status quo (Nascimento, et al., 2006).

This public debate illustrates the competing claims of those who support and oppose race-based social inclusion policies, particularly those related to higher education institutions. There are two common discourses surrounding race-based social inclusion programs with regards to the Brazil. The first is the discussion of social inclusion as racialist policies imported to Brazil from the US. These policies are framed as a form of cultural imperialism, where the US tries to fit the Black-White binary onto a multi-hued Brazil (Bonnett, 2006; Bourdieu & Wacquant, 1999). According to this view, US anti-racist scholars, as well as Brazilian scholars funded by US



agencies like the Ford Foundation, hold the African American civil rights struggle up as an African diasporic model for race relations and resistance.

Whether or not the influence of American and African American viewpoints on Brazilian race relations amounts to imperialism, the US being utilized as an counter-authority model for social movements (Bonnett, 2006), or an overt hegemonic ploy by Americans (Bourdieu & Wacquant, 1999) is debatable. North-South comparisons of racial inequality have long been undertaken (Freyre, 1946; Sansone, 2009), but so have South-South comparisons as scholars and activists from Brazil and other Latin American and Caribbean countries, as well as their counterparts in various African nations increasingly work for social justice and social inclusion (Dzidzienyo & Oboler, 2008; Sansone, Soumonni, & Barry, 2009).

Supporters of social inclusion see the policies as fitting the reality of Brazil. Racial democracy is a myth, in the sense that it is an ideology purported by Brazilian elites and accepted by the masses, a myth that until the 1970s subverted any Black consciousness efforts or intellectual discussions about racial inequality (Hanchard, 1999). Similarly, Brazil is viewed by some scholars as having more of a Black-White binary than previously articulated. Research that looks at the

employment, police brutality, wages, health care, and educational outcomes of Brazilians by race have found that Afro-Brazilians are much more disadvantaged than Whites (Lovell, 1994; Martins, et al., 2004; McCallum, 2007; Reichmann, 1999; Silva & Hasenbalg, 1999). Others acknowledge the complexity of the racial landscape, acquiescing that lighter skinned Afro-Brazilians do receive some privilege relative to dark-skinned Brazilians (Burdick, 1998; Telles, 2004; Winant, 2004), but assert that there is still a need to deal with the inequality between lighter and darker Afro-Brazilians and Whites.

The second discourse surrounding race based social inclusion policies is whether or not these types of policies are needed to promote social inclusion, or if broader policies that cover the poor of the citizenry, regardless of race, would be more effective. Lovell (1994) discusses the two perspectives. The first is the *class over race* argument, which postulates that not only are most Brazilians, including Afro-Brazilians, poor, the richer Afro-Brazilians become, the less they appear to suffer from social prejudice. According to Lovell, some people who ascribe to this view assert "...if Afro-Brazilians are looked down upon by the middle and upper classes, it is because they are poor and uneducated rather than because they are not White" (Lovell, 1994, p. 10).

If the class over racism hypothesis is correct, then as Afro-Brazilians acquire more human capital (education and income), they will have more opportunities for social inclusion in the higher strata of society (Fry, 2008; Goldemberg & Durham, 2007; Kamel, 2006; Schwartzman, 2003). Proponents of the class over race argument assert that if governmental intervention is needed, then it should be targeted towards the poor, regardless of race. Since Afro-Brazilians are a large majority of the poor, they would be eligible to benefit from income based governmental programs (Durham, 2005; A. Filho, et al., 2006; Rochetti, 2004). Social inclusion programs based on class would more appropriately benefit the students who are most in need, the poor, who often are also afro-descendant. Class based measures would quell any racial tensions that might arise if race based measures were to be implemented.

The second perspective is the *class and race* argument. Adherents to this argument assert that contemporary Brazil continues to be a discriminatory and exclusionary society (Nascimento, et al., 2006). The legacy of slavery is a factor, but with modernization came new forms of discrimination. Hasenbalg summarizes the connections between industrialization and race relations by stating that "race prejudice and discrimination are functionally related to the material and

symbolic benefits obtained by Whites through the disqualification of non-Whites as competitors" (Hasenbalg, in Lovell, 1994, p. 11). Racism is seen to be as much a contributing factor to social exclusion as class.

If class and race intersect to doubly disadvantage Afro-Brazilians<sup>9</sup>, then social inclusion policies are needed to help remedy the social situation (N. A. Filho, Marinho, Carvalho, & Santos, 2005; S. A. D. Santos, 2005; Zoninsein, 2009) . Adherents to the class and race position see the work of the Black movement as important to pushing social inclusion policies into the mainstream (Guimaraes, 2002), but stress the need for continued connections to be made between the fates of Afro-Brazilians and the poor (Educação e Cidadania de Afrodescendentes e Carentes, 2009). Social inclusion policies are increasingly being framed not just as necessary for certain groups of people, but as a basic human right (Zoninsein, 2009).

My research goal is to provide an analysis of Brazilian social inclusion higher education policy at the federal, university, and community levels. I present the socio-historical context surrounding the policies and programs. Additionally, I

---

<sup>9</sup> Gender often intersects with class and race to form a "triple exclusion" for Afro-Brazilian women. Hopenhayen (2005) describes this occurrence among indigenous women in Latin America, and McCallum (2007) discusses the particular concerns of Afro-Brazilian women in Salvador da Bahia, Brazil.

use conceptual frameworks to examine the Brazilian policy landscape. Utilizing a social inclusion ideology framework (Gidley, et al., 2010), I establish the ideologies that are embedded in Brazilian policy. I also explore the policy approaches and tools used to promote social inclusion through the use of the conceptual frameworks of Hopenhayn (2008) and McDonnell and Elmore (1987).

*Conceptual Framework: Social Inclusion Ideology, Approaches, and Tools*

Social inclusion policies are being articulated throughout many parts of Latin America. These policies are often framed as responses to the social exclusion of specific racial groups, women, or the poor (Almeida, 2007; McCowan, 2007; Moehleck, 2009). The ideology that shapes the policies is varied. Gidley et.al describes a layered view of these ideologies. Neo-liberal policies (discussed here as neo-structural policies) are the first layer, and exhibit one set of articulations. Social justice policies are the next layer. The articulations of this layer include the neo-structural views, but with an added emphasis. Social transformation policies encompass the first two layers, taking social inclusion to an even higher level. The three layers are discussed below.

### *Neo-liberal /Neo-structural Ideology*

Social inclusion policies can "...call for public investments to correct imbalances in access to quality services and to productive and political resources. They strive to 'level the playing field' and create an enabling environment for the excluded to exercise their agency" (Buvinic, 2004; 10). These types of social inclusion policies are described by Gidley, et al. as neo-liberal policies which provide access to institutions in order to improve human capital, thereby increasing economic productivity (Gidley, et al., 2010) .

I proffer that these policies are actually neo-structural in nature. The ultimate goal is to strengthen Brazil's position in the global economy. Neo-structural<sup>10</sup> ideology, unlike traditional neo-liberalism, recognizes the need to develop policies and programs that ensure that socially excluded citizens are able to adapt to the global economic structure (Leiva, 2008). Examples of social inclusion policies developed from a neo-structural ideology consist of language that references economic growth, social capital, and improved access (Gidley, et al., 2010). Such policies would include scholarships, educational expansion programs, and technology inputs and training.

---

<sup>10</sup> A more detailed explanation of the appropriateness of the neo-structural term is provided in Chapter 3.

### *Social Justice Ideology*

For groups that have been excluded from the political, economic, cultural, or legal systems of a society, social inclusion policies can also be seen as targeted ways to incorporate citizens into the larger democratic projects of a country. This inclusive ideology is social justice oriented, with increased participation and engagement as desired policy effects (Gidley, et al., 2010) . Language that indicates a social justice ideology includes discussion of engagement and participation on the part of the socially excluded (Gidley, et al., 2010). In addition to the policy activities found at the neo-structural level, social justice policies include mentoring, learning networks, and community engagement.

### *Social Transformation Ideology*

The third ideological perspective frames social inclusion policies as human potential or socially transformative policies that promote social transformation (Gidley, et al., 2010). The inclusion of previously excluded groups in higher education allows for opportunities to re-imagine higher education as a democratic public sphere, a place where "...both scholars and citizen activists...connect their research, teaching, and service with broader democratic concerns over equality, justice, and an alternative vision of what the university might be and what society might become" (Girox, 2003, p. 483).

These policies include rhetoric about empowerment, diversity, potential, and transformation. In the Brazilian case, such policies also explicitly focus on the eradication of racism as a policy or programmatic goal. Policy action that is meant to be socially transformative creates sustainable pathways to success, celebrates diversity, focuses on cultural transformation, and puts an emphasis on dialogue and empowerment (Gidley, et al., 2010). I examine the ways Brazilian social inclusion higher education policies are framed, discerning to what extent the policies are neo-structural, social justice, or social transformation oriented.

#### *Policy Approaches*

Utilizing Hopenhayn's social inclusion policy framework, I examine the use of cultural legitimization, recognition, and redistribution policy approaches. Cultural legitimization policy approaches affirm and/or support the development and strengthening of cultural practices, spaces, and knowledge. Recognition approaches help to define the policy targets, often by counting and gathering information about excluded groups in relation to more privileged groups or society as a whole. Redistribution policy approaches restructure space, finances, materials, personnel, and other resources, to benefit those who have been socially excluded (Hopenhayn, 2008).



This study looks at three types of redistribution policies. Educational improvement policies are redistribution policies that work to strengthen the education of the socially excluded. These policies are directed either at the students in the universities, before they come to the universities, or at the teachers who work with these students<sup>11</sup>. Financial support policies are policies that provide funding for students to prepare for college entrance examinations or that provide financial support for students enrolled in the university. Quota policies are policies that reserve spaces in particular social institutions or job markets for people based on their membership in a pre-determined group. In the case of this study, I am looking at quota policies that reserve spaces in the freshman class of higher educational institutions for those people who have been designated as afro-descendant.

### *Policy Tools*

In addition to policy approaches, I look at the use of social inclusion policy tools, the ways in which policy goals are translated into concrete actions through the use of mandates, inducements, capacity building, and system changes. Mandates are the rules or procedures by which policy

---

<sup>11</sup> This study does not include analysis of policies that target teachers exclusively.

beneficiaries and targets are expected to comply. Inducements are monetary transfers that are administered to institutions or individuals in order to generally further the goal of social inclusion. Capacity building instrumentations are used to invest in material, intellectual or human resources for specific social inclusion outcomes. System changes alter the resource delivery system by changing or creating new authoritative pathways (McDonnell & Elmore, 1987).

Figure 1: Research Areas and Conceptual Framework

Research Areas	Brazilian Federal Government	Federal University of Bahia	Steve Biko Institute	
Policy Ideologies	Neo-structural	Social Justice	Social Transformation	
Policy Approaches	Cultural Legitimization	Recognition	Redistributive <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Educational improvement</li> <li>• Financial support</li> <li>• Quotas</li> </ul>	
Policy Tools	Mandates	Inducements	Capacity Building	System Change

### *Summary*

Social exclusion has long been an issue throughout Latin America, particularly with regards to indigenous people and afro-descendants. Social inclusion policies and programs that target these excluded groups are becoming more widely accepted as a legitimate means for creating more inclusive democracies. These policies and programs are sometimes seen as controversial,

as the debate surrounding quotas in Brazil demonstrates. There does seem to be, at this juncture, an increased willingness in former slaveholding and colonized societies like Brazil to promote social inclusion. But what does this look like in Brazil? What ideologies are driving the policies and programs? What tools and approaches are being used? In Chapter 3, I provide details of the research methods that are used to answer these questions.

## Chapter 3: Research Methods

The central question of this qualitative investigation is: *in what ways are policymakers, administrators, educators and activists able to implement higher education social inclusion policies that target Afro-Brazilians?* Of particular interest is how the policy climate has changed over time, the circumstances that led to the development the of social inclusion policy, and the policy ideologies, approaches, and tools that predominate at the federal, university, and community levels. In this chapter, I begin with an overview of the data sources and a review of the conceptual framework. Next, I specifically describe the three areas of investigation, the federal government, the Federal University of Bahia (UFBA), and the Steve Biko Institute (SBI). I then provide details about the data collection process, the study design, and the three types of data analyzed (policy documents, interview transcripts, and observation notes). Chapter 3 concludes with a description of the data analysis process.

### *Methods Overview*

Three data sources were utilized in exploration of this question: policy documents, semi-structured interviews, and observations. The data were analyzed using a conceptual framework that was developed using the social inclusion ideology

framework of Gidley, in conjunction with the social inclusion policy framework of Hopenhayn and the policy tools framework of McDonnell and Elmore. I analyzed the policy ideologies, discerning whether the ideologies were neo-structural, social justice, or transformation oriented. I examined the policies in order to determine what social inclusion approaches (cultural legitimization, recognition, redistribution) were used. I also determined what policy tools (mandates, inducements, capacity building, system changes) were used. The data were analyzed using the open coding and axial coding techniques in the ATLAS.ti qualitative analysis software.

### *Three Sites of Investigation*

I approached this investigation as a qualitative investigation of higher education social inclusion policies and programs that target Afro-Brazilians. I examined the development of such policies at three levels, the federal government, the university level, and the community level. Each level was examined as a separate case. The policies and programs that have developed in Brazil have happened at all three levels, but while the levels are interconnected in some ways, each is unique. Each level has a different policy trajectory.

The federal government has long been developing policies that impact Afro-Brazilians. In the 19<sup>th</sup> century and for most of

the 20<sup>th</sup> century, Afro-Brazilians were negatively impacted by formal and informal policies that limited their ability to participate fully in society. Starting in the late 20th century, the federal government began to engage in the development of policies that explicitly targeted Afro-Brazilians for integration into society. The higher education policies that have their genesis at the federal level are therefore analyzed separately from the policy activity of the community and the universities.

UFBA was an early adopter of social inclusion policies that specifically targeted Afro-Brazilians. Located in Salvador, the Black cultural capital of Brazil, the university has long been connected with Black political thought and social activism. The Center for African and Asiatic Studies was the first of its kind in South America. To date, its graduate program in African Studies is one of two such programs in Latin America and the Caribbean. The varied policies and programs at UFBA provide a descriptive look at a progressive race focused higher education social inclusion university program.

The Steve Biko Institute (SBI) was one of the first community organizations to develop educational programs targeted at preparing Afro-Brazilians for entrance into the university. The organization has also been instrumental in pushing for

social inclusion policies at the university and the federal levels. Many SBI students, former students, teachers, and administrators have been active in the community and the universities, both nationally and internationally.

#### *Data and Data Collection*

I conducted the research for this dissertation over the course of three years. In 2007, I initially traveled to Salvador on a Foreign Language and Area Studies (FLAS) summer fellowship. During a six-week period, I took courses in Portuguese and Afro-Brazilian history and culture. I also was introduced to key stakeholders in the Black movement as well as university officials. I returned to Salvador in 2008, spending five weeks interviewing university administrators, professors, and activists<sup>12</sup> about the social inclusion policy landscape in Brazil in general and in Salvador in particular.

In 2009, I returned again, first for a three month summer stay and then later, in December, for the beginning of an eight month stay, funded by the Fulbright-Hays Doctoral Dissertation Research Abroad fellowship. During these stays I interviewed

---

<sup>12</sup> See Figure 2: Interviewee Information (p. 40).

Figure 2: Interviewee Information<sup>13</sup>

101: Activist, teacher, and former university student.

102: American living and working in Brazil. University professor and director (at the time of the interview) of a research center funded by the State of Bahia.

103: Cuban activist living and working in Brazil.

104: Italian living and working in Brazil. University professor affiliated with a university research center.

105: University professor and head (at the time of the interview) of a university research center.

106: University professor affiliated with a university research center.

107: Activist and head of a university outreach program.

108: Activist and administrator of a community educational center.

109: Activist, university professor, and administrator of a community educational center.

201: University student and teacher at a community educational center.

202: Activist and administrator of a community educational center.

203: Activist and administrator of a community educational center.

204: Administrator of a university student assistance center.

205: Former student at a community educational center.

206: University professor and head (at the time of the interview) of a university research center.

---

<sup>13</sup> All interviewees are Brazilian unless otherwise indicated.



more participants, including a number of students<sup>14</sup>. I also attended conferences on affirmative action at UFBA and in Salvador, and I went to a number of social inclusion-related lectures. I spoke informally with researchers who have studied higher education social inclusion policy. I observed classes and events in the local community that promoted such policies. I also volunteered at the SBI as a conversational English instructor, helping students who wanted to go abroad to the United States to attend college. In addition, I collected documents on federal policy, policy at UFBA, and, to a lesser degree, policy at SBI<sup>15</sup>.

#### Study Design and Instrument Development

Initially, the study focused mostly on the socio-political context surrounding race-based social inclusion education policy. Lei 10.639, the federal law that mandates the teaching of African and Afro-Brazilian history and culture, was initially included in the analysis. As I began to investigate further, I realized that while this law is an extremely important part of the overall social inclusion project in Brazil, discussion of it was tangential to discussion of the higher education policies. Additionally, through study of the policy landscape, I began to

---

<sup>14</sup> See Figure 2: Interviewee Information (p. 40).

<sup>15</sup> See Figure 3: Policy and Program Documents (p. 43).

see the three areas, federal, university, and community, as having related contexts but separate trajectories. The policy history, ideologies, tools, and approaches needed to be examined in their specific contexts in order to understand the entire policy landscape. Through an extensive and ongoing literature review, coupled with frequent dialogue with other researchers who study the area, I was able, over time, to develop a study and research agenda that would help to describe and explain the development of higher education social inclusion policies and programs that target Afro-Brazilians.

### *Policy Documents*

I analyzed policy documents in order to garner an understanding of the social, historical, and political contexts surrounding the policies, as well as to examine the policies in-depth. The document analysis also aided in identifying analytical categories outside of the ones in the conceptual framework<sup>16</sup>. Purposive sampling was used to determine which documents to procure and analyze (Love, 2003). Additionally, documents were used to provide an understanding of the Brazilian, Bahian, and Afro-Brazilian historical experiences as they relate to the policies. Documents that were accessed included university reports, congressional briefs and statements

---

<sup>16</sup> See Figure 4: Codelist (p. 44).

on social inclusion policies and programs, federal reports, various laws and statutes, and SBI newsletters and paraphernalia.

Figure 3: Policy and Program Documents

Federal Documents	
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• The first and second national conference proceedings on racial equality</li> <li>• The national racial equality plan</li> <li>• Government agency reports that provide statistical information on social exclusion and inequality</li> <li>• Official reports on specific federal higher education social inclusion programs</li> <li>• Bills, laws, and decrees that are associated with the federal policies</li> </ul>
University Documents	
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Website summary information</li> <li>• Working group papers on affirmative action</li> <li>• University reports on social inclusion programs</li> <li>• Research papers</li> </ul>
Community Organization Documents	
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Website summary information</li> <li>• Instructional materials</li> <li>• Founder magazine interview</li> <li>• Interviews of former students published in the SBI newsletter</li> <li>• Miscellaneous organizational handouts</li> </ul>

Figure 4: Codelist

Policy Ideologies	
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Social justice</li> <li>• Neo-liberal/Neo-structural</li> <li>• Transformative</li> </ul>
Policy Approaches	
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Cultural legitimizing</li> <li>• Recognition</li> <li>• Redistribution (educational improvement, financial support, quotas)</li> </ul>
Policy Tools	
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Mandates</li> <li>• Inducements</li> <li>• Capacity building</li> <li>• Systems changes</li> </ul>
Reasons in Support of Quotas	
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Compensatory measure for slavery and discrimination</li> <li>• State is responsible for ending racial equality</li> <li>• Increased racial diversity in higher education institutions</li> <li>• Society as a whole benefits</li> </ul>
Reasons Opposed to Quotas	
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Quotas disadvantage Whites</li> <li>• Inequality is not race based</li> <li>• Quotas weaken higher education institutions</li> <li>• Quota support is not germane to Brazil</li> </ul>

### *Semi-structured Interviews*

I conducted 15 semi-structured interviews with policy actors<sup>17</sup> during the total field research process. Potential participants were identified at the initial stage through a snowball sampling process (Berg, 2007). At that time, interviewees identified a number of additional potential participants. Participants included directors and administrators affiliated with the policies, professors and university administrators involved with the development of the policies, community activists who advocated for the development of these policies and administered programs, and students who were the beneficiaries of the policies. These interviews strengthened the understanding of the historical, social, and political contexts surrounding the policies at each level. The interviews also provided details as to how the policies and programs were administered.

The interviews, which ranged from thirty minutes to two hours, were conducted in English or Portuguese, depending on the preference of the interviewee. The interviews were semi-structured in nature, and organized in such a way as to allow the interviewee to provide an overview of the policy context as well as specific information about social inclusion policies and

---

<sup>17</sup> See Figure 4: Codelist (p. 44).

programs<sup>18</sup>. Prior to the start of each interview, the participants read and signed interview consent forms<sup>19</sup>. The consent forms and the interview protocols were approved by the Michigan State University Institutional Review Board<sup>20</sup>. The interviews were recorded with a digital recorder, transcribed with a word processor program, and analyzed using ATLAS.ti.

### *Observation*

I observed classes at the Steve Biko Institute, a grassroots organization that prepares Afro-Brazilian students in Salvador to take advantage of the social inclusion policies and programs at the universities. I selected this organization because it is one of the oldest and most influential educational organizations in the Black movement. To date, SBI has prepared over 1,000 students for entrance into the university. For seven months, I visited SBI weekly, attending classes and lectures, and even working with students on their conversational English skills. The observations, along with the interviews and policy documents, allowed for an understanding of the policy ideology, approaches, and tools found at the community level. The

---

<sup>18</sup> See Appendix C (p. 201) for interview protocols.

<sup>19</sup> See Appendices A and B (pp. 193 and 197) for consent forms.

<sup>20</sup> I also successfully completed the required IRB Human Subject Training course.

observations were used to supplement the formal interviews and the policy documents, and did not undergo the same method of

Figure 5: Research Methods

<i>In what ways are policymakers, researchers, educators and activists able to use the current policy climate to implement policies of social inclusion that impact the educational experiences of Afro-Brazilian students?</i>		
Research Question	Research Subject	Research Methods
1. What is the socio-historical context surrounding higher education social inclusion policies that target Afro-Brazilians?	policy developers and administrators policy documents	interview document analysis
2. What policy ideologies, approaches, and tools predominate at the federal level?	policy developers and administrators policy documents	interview document analysis
3 What policy ideologies, approaches, and tools predominate at the university level??	policy developers and administrators students policy documents	interview interview document analysis
	conferences and presentations	observation
3. What policy ideologies, approaches, and tools predominate at the community level?	Steve Biko courses teachers and students	observation interview
	policy documents	document analysis

analysis. Instead, the observations and visits were used, in addition to helping to frame the questions, to develop the connections needed in order to gain entry and access to SBI and its affiliates.

### *Data Analysis*

The first stage of data analysis occurred during the data collection process. During this process, I took analytic notes from the first interviews that I conducted in 2008 and during the beginning of 2010 field research process , using those notes to help me develop more specific questions for later interviewees. The policy context was evolving as I was in the field, so I was able to ask early interviewees to speculate on policy changes and later interviewees to reflect on policy changes.

Once all of the interviews were conducted, they were transcribed and inputted into the ATLAS.ti qualitative analysis software program. I then examined each interview document, looking for specific codes. I searched first for data that would help to describe the policies and programs at each level. I then looked for examples of policy ideology, searching specifically for where the interviewees described the rationale and overall goals of the policies and programs.



I initially coded the rationales and goals using analytic induction (Glasser and Strauss, in Berg, 2007). The analytic induction technique calls for the seeking out of commonalities in the data that support the description and explanation of the observed phenomena. Part of this process includes modifying the explanation as needed so that the explanation fits the cases being observed (Kratwohl, 1993). Using the conceptual framework, my initial description discerned the goals as either being indicative of neo-liberal, social justice, or social transformative policy ideologies. However, upon further analysis, I realized that the neo-liberal ideology definition did not apply to the policies that I was examining. Neo-liberalism policies are entrenched in a free-market ideology that discourages state social welfare provisioning (Misra & King, 2005).

Some of the policies that I examine do focus on the development of a strong market, but these policies also encourage the use of state social policy interventions in order to create a society capable of global competitiveness. I embarked upon an additional review of the theoretical literature and found that such policies were better categorized as neo-structural (Leiva, 2008). Neo-structural policies take a more holistic approach to economic development by "...coupling economic growth with social equity..." (Leiva, 2008; 3), in order to

promote greater social cohesiveness that will, ideally, lead to greater economic prosperity. I subsequently replaced the neo-liberal code with the more appropriate neo-structural code.

I examined the interview documents again, using analytic induction (Glasser and Strauss, in Berg, 2007) along with the conceptual framework, analyzing the data this time for policy approaches and instrumentations. As I analyzed the documents, I found that my initial conceptual code of redistribution needed to be further refined, and I developed the new codes of redistribution: educational improvement, redistribution: financial support, and redistribution: quotas. Using analytic induction allowed me to conduct an analysis process that was grounded within the conceptual framework, while building upon that framework as I discovered new data interpretations. Once I had coded the data using my revised conceptual framework, I analyzed the data again, to discern links that existed between the policy ideologies and the policy approaches and tools that were utilized. A similar method was used to analyze the policy documents, websites, and other related documents. These documents, however, were coded by hand, not using ATLAS.ti. For my final analysis of the total policy landscape the analytic induction method was again used, this time to discern connections among the three investigative levels.

## Chapter 4: The Changing Dynamic of Race in Brazil: From Slavery, to a Racial Democracy, to Social Inclusion

This chapter centers on the federal level of social inclusion higher education policies that target Afro-Brazilians. The chapter begins with a historical analysis of the Brazilian policy context, focusing first on the lives of Blacks in Brazil and the state and societal responses to the Afro-Brazilian population. Special attention is given to the formal and informal policies that regulated Afro-Brazilians to an unequal status, both during and after slavery. Included in the historical analysis is a discussion of the impact that the military regime had on democratization efforts. Following that is a discussion of the changes that occurred as a result of democratic rule finally being established, changes that paved the way for social inclusion initiatives to be developed for Afro-Brazilians. The next section of the chapter is an analysis of the Racial Equality Statute, followed by an analysis of the federal social inclusion programs that are being implemented in higher education institutions.

### *Section 1: Historical Analysis*

In order to understand the uniqueness of the Brazilian case, it is first necessary to examine the history of White and

Black encounters in Brazil. The original intent of the Portuguese colonizers was to develop a colony that would support the homeland, not to settle a new land. Money and resources were to be taken from Brazil and used to benefit Portugal. As a result, few women were brought to Brazil, and in fact, Portuguese women were barred, for a time, from settling in Brazil. There were fewer numbers of slave women, but the low numbers of women in Brazil, relative to the White men, made these women sexually vulnerable (Marx, 1998). This resulted in large numbers of children being born from these often involuntary couplings. The mixed raced children were not prescribed into inferior status as such children were in the United States, as Brazil had no hypo-descent rule that denoted that any amount of non-White blood made one non-White. Over time, this miscegenation and lack of a strict color line led to the tenuous nature of race that persisted for many years to come. As Degler states, it is not that Brazilians were and are not color conscious, but that they "...recognize a somewhat greater array of terms and gradations" (Degler, in Marx, 1998, p. 68).

In such a racially mixed society, not having an overt racial binary proved advantageous, at least to the ruling White elite. While Whiteness was privileged and denoted power and

superiority, a belief in a *mulatto escape hatch* made it appear possible to assimilate into an existence that was "close to White". While mobility may not actually have been attained by most mixed race or less Black appearing Brazilians, the myth of mobility lessened the potentiality for racial conflict (Marx, 1998).

Blacks in Brazil were relegated to the lowest rungs of society as a collective, while being kept fractured in such a way as to keep a massive Black uprising down. Whites were the ruling class, but were often minorities in their communities, so racial ambiguity aided in the divisions among afro-descendants, thereby lessening solidarity. Blacks were denoted by various names, such as negro locals, ladinos, crioulos, mulatos, pardos, and libertos. The Africans came from many different nations, while the Whites were almost all Portuguese.

Slaves fulfilled all types of jobs, mainly agricultural, but they also worked as skilled laborers, domestic servants, military positions, and slave supervisors. Female slaves in particular developed close ties to their masters and mistresses, a practice that continues to dominate Afro-Brazilian domestic workers' lives even today. Slave women were wet nurses, often being forced to give up their own children to become sustainers of life for White babies, whose mothers were seen as too

delicate for nursing in the tropical conditions. Slave women had little control of their sexual destinies, as the White male patriarchal system of dominance left them vulnerable to abuse, with no recourse. The racial divisions again were not stagnant, especially as it pertained to sexual relations, as White slave owners frequently made mistresses of their female slaves, bearing progeny that could be enslaved or freed (Meade, 2010).

Over time, a number of pressures forced Brazil to cease participation in the slave trade. One pressure was the British government, which only would formally recognize an independent Brazilian republic (from Portugal) in exchange for the end of Brazil's participation in the international slave trade. Brazil, which had become indebted to London banks while paying Portugal the fee for separating from the monarchy, agreed to cease trading slaves, at least on paper (Meade, 2010). In reality, it was *uma lei para ingles ver*<sup>21</sup> (Bethell & Carvalho, 1989) as the trade continued illegally, until the British threatened Brazil with force.

As trading continued illegally for many years, the population of Africans in Brazil surged. Coupled with this was the increasing domestic unrest, as slave revolts became more frequent. While slaves, often in the thousands, fled the

---

<sup>21</sup> A law for the English to see.

plantations and settled in quilombos, the Brazilian monarchy increased regulation of slavery, to the chagrin of planters who depended on slaves for their profits. Tensions rose between slaves and abolitionists, the monarchy, and slave-owning landowners (Andrews, 1991). Whites feared for the future of the country, increasingly discussing the possibility of expelling all Africans from Brazil lest having the country become overrun by Blacks. European immigrant labor was seen as preferable to African slave labor, but enslaved persons provided too much economic competition for Europeans. The situation was such that "...masters came to see slavery as a costly diversion of capital and as a constraint on attracting immigrant laborers wary of slave competition; resulting conflict was regarded as an impediment to further economic growth or to attracting foreign investment" (Marx, 1998, p. 53). Over time, the conflict intensified, and it became clear to Brazilian leaders that abolition by decree was preferable to the violent social revolutions that had taken place in Haiti and the United States (Marx, 1998).

The Paraguay War (also known as the War of the Triple Alliance) of 1865-1870 also contributed to the end of slavery, as the military became professionalized and developed as a social group without ties to the plantation system (Meade,

2010). Twenty thousand slaves participated in that war, and as a result of their service, they were later emancipated. In addition, the military ceased its earlier action of crushing slave rebellions and raiding quilombos (Marx, 1998).

A number of laws gradually went into effect, liberating slaves. The Rio Branco Law of 1871 (Law of the Free Womb), which freed all children born to slave women once they reached the age of adulthood (however, the child had to remain under the service of the mother's master until the age of 21), formally recognized the right of slaves to purchase their freedom (something that had been happening de facto before then), and freed all slaves owned by the state (Andrews, 1991 ; Skidmore, 1999).

The Law of the Sexagenarians, which was enacted in 1885, mandated the manumission of slaves aged 60 or older, and required the former slave owners to continue to provide some substance for the libertos for the next five years. This law may not have freed many people, as few slaves lived to the age of 60, due to the horrific working and living conditions. The average life expectancy of an adult male slave was 18 years (Skidmore, 1999). The Lei Aurea, or Golden Law, actually freed all slaves in 1888. However, according to Butler, only 5% of the Afro-Brazilian population was still enslaved by that time (Butler, in Covin, 2006).



In effect, there was emancipation without any real disruption to the Brazilian social order. Plantation owners continued to have laborers, in the form of Blacks and European immigrants, and Blacks were still at the bottom of the social order, as they had been "freed" but not integrated into the society in an equal way. Their subservient status continued, and like before, Blackness was construed as an inferior and malleable identity. Wealth, status, and a connection to Whiteness provided escape hatches to Black inferiority, to varying degrees. Emancipation was not a revolutionary act, but one of continuity that reified the superiority of the ruling elite, who had deemed it "better to give up the ring to save the hand" (Marx, 1998, p. 56).

While Blacks continued in the same economic and social state as before, the state developed laws and policies that supported European migration. Civil society implemented programs and practices that privileged White laborers over Black. While race was not explicitly referred to, the intent was apparent. According to Andrews, "...in fact by choosing to invest funds in European workers, and refusing to make comparable investments in Brazilians, the province's planters, and the state apparatus which they controlled, had made their ethnic and racial preferences in workers crystal clear" (Andrews, 1991, p. 59).

To some, emancipation was not something that would benefit the libertos, but what would lead to their demise, as immigrants came to take their place in the labor market. The beneficiaries, according to one Brazilian newspaper, would not be the libertos, but those "...appropriately educated and prepared to deal with the challenges posed by the new order of things. *The right man in the right place*...and that man clearly was not going to be Black" (Andrews, 1991, p. 59).

Elites and policy makers sought to Europeanize Brazil through the development of grand European *belle époque*, city street fronts, and open policies for European immigration. The amount of people immigrating to Brazil increased dramatically, starting in the late 1800s. In 1886, 33,000 immigrants arrived in Brazil. Two years later, 132,000 immigrants reached Brazil's shores. These massive numbers would increase until after WWI (Skidmore, 1999).

Most of the immigrants came from the Mediterranean (Italy, Portugal, and Spain) and had languages and culture that were similar to Brazil. These immigrants took advantage of opportunity, traversing Brazil, Argentina, and even the United States, working in different industries and regions, gaining skills and economic capital along the way. Their passage was sponsored by landowner organizations such as the Society for

Promoting Immigration. These laborers were more literate than the Afro-Brazilians, and through preferential treatment, were given opportunities to become more skilled. There was also an assumption that immigrants would be easier to control than Afro-Brazilians, a negative denotation of Blacks as vagabonds, and a sense that Europeans would improve the ethnic stock of Brazil (Skidmore, 1999).

White elites in Brazil were deeply invested in retaining their privilege over the poorer and darker masses. American style racism and White superiority would not be prudent, as the White elite were in a more vulnerable state due to the large numbers of afro-descendants relative to Whites. Miscegenation was a more useful tool for lessening the potentiality of Brazil becoming a Black nation. Also beneficial, from the perspective of the elites, was the high mortality rates of Afro-Brazilians.

Racial mixing was seen by White North Americans as horrific, but in Brazil it was deemed a transitory process through which the Black race would ultimately fade away. "In the course of another century the mixed bloods will have disappeared from Brazil. This will coincide with the extinction of the Black race within our midst" (Lacerda, in Skidmore, 1999, p. 78). These are the words of a leading Brazilian anthropologist and

doctor, spoken at the *First Universal Race Congress* held in London in 1911.

Blacks suffered as European immigrants and White Brazilians were favored. Blacks often lacked even basic schooling, as the state provided few social services. The 1891 Constitution actually rescinded a former provision in the Imperial Constitution of 1824 that mandated that the state fund public education (Andrews, 1999; Meade, 2010). Blacks did organize their own educational institutions, a topic that will be discussed further in subsequent chapters. During the first years of the republic, few social service supports, particularly in the areas of education and health, led to deepening social class inequality, especially for the already disadvantaged Afro-Brazilians (Meade, 2010).

White immigrants, who had been better educated in their home countries, were still in advantageous positions relative to Blacks. Afro-Brazilians were often regulated to the informal sector, working as handymen, street vendors, laundresses, prostitutes, and thieves. These groups lived outside of society's more formal structures, which was alarming to the ruling elite. Repression of informal sector workers, deemed, *dangerous classes*, was frequent (Skidmore, 1999).

Afro-Brazilians were forced to find other ways to support themselves. An early 20<sup>th</sup> century Afro-Brazilian recalling the times states, " they had to create various sources of work, as porters, gardeners, domestic servants, sweeping the sidewalks, washing cars...all those jobs that didn't exist before, the Blacks created-shoeshine boys, newspaper vendors, day laborers, all those jobs they created for their subsistence, because the *fazendeiros* wouldn't hire Blacks" (Andrews, 1999, p. 68).

Afro-Brazilian women were able to sustain entire households through domestic servitude, which was often the only work easily available to them as the urban economy expanded. Domestic work made Afro-Brazilian women sexually vulnerable to White men and more apt to be abused by the women of the house. These workers, with little recourse and because of the abundance of women available for such work, had to endure long hours and poor wages. To this day, this labor arrangement persists, with a common saying in Brazil being that *every Brazilian woman either has an empregada* (maid) *or is one* (Personal communication, 2006).

By the 1910s, Brazil's love affair with European immigrants had waned. Immigrants, often coming from countries with strong labor union traditions, began to organize and demand better wages and working conditions from the elite. By 1927, the

Brazilian state had ceased subsidizing European immigration, worried about the potentiality for social tension that a protesting and demanding immigrant population could cause (Andrews, 1999).

### *The Emergence of the Brazilian Educational System*

Brazil was a colony of Portugal until 1822, when a constitutional monarchy was established. The central government was in charge of education, actively controlling higher education while allocating responsibility for elementary and secondary education to states and municipalities, providing little oversight (McGinn & Pereira, 1992). The Imperial Constitution of 1824 declared access to free public primary education a right (Plank, 1990), but did little to ensure that people would be able to exercise that right. The state and municipal governments had few resources with which to fund schools, resulting in many of the schools continuing to be run by private agencies that serviced small numbers of students (McGinn & Pereira, 1992; Plank, 1996).

The fall of the monarchy and the establishment of a republican form of government changed little with regards to education. The federal government actively controlled higher education while delegating responsibility for elementary and

secondary education to states<sup>22</sup> and municipalities (McGinn & Pereira, 1992). Central administration simultaneously provided little oversight and uneven, insufficient subsidies to states. Wealthier states and citizens received more support, and were therefore poised to take advantage of the central government's emphasis on higher education, while the poorer states and citizenry received little support for their educational needs (Plank, 1996). Blacks, being at the fringes of society, were therefore not able to access quality elementary and secondary education.

While Brazilian intellectuals pondered ways to rid the country of its *problem population*, industrialization led to economic growth and the expansion of education reform (McGinn & Pereira, 1992; Plank, 1996). The Ministry of Education and Public Health was created in 1931, and the government expanded secondary and higher education institutions to new parts of the country (Bello, 2002). School reformers, influenced by Dewey and the progressive education movements in the United States and Europe, organized the Brazilian Education Association and spearheaded the development of the *escola nova*<sup>23</sup>. These *escolanovistas* published the Manifesto of the Pioneers of

---

<sup>22</sup> The federal government shared some responsibility for secondary education with the states.

<sup>23</sup> New school

National Education in 1932 (Plank, 1996). The Manifesto stated that every child ought to have the opportunity to access a free, government sponsored education. School control was to be decentralized in order to allow for community based adaptation of the educational experience.

In 1934 a new constitution formalized the rights of all citizens to a free and compulsory education (McGinn & Pereira, 1992). This constitution, the second in the republic's existence, was overturned at the onset of the dictatorship of Getúlio Vargas.<sup>24</sup> A third constitution was created in 1937, and the time of the *Estado Novo* (New State) began. This new era increased opportunities for the more marginalized sectors of society. While not everyone had a strong or equal voice, there was now some ideological space for the voices of women, Afro-Brazilians, trade unionists, and new intellectuals to be heard (Meade, 2010).

It was during this time that racial democracy became known as the official racial perspective of the nation. As racism was outlawed, ways to combat racism were also muted in society, and social programs focused on class inequalities, not race. Social reforms were made, and the *Estado Novo* ushered in an era of

---

<sup>24</sup> Vargas was elected president in 1930, but in 1937 spearheaded a military coup, subsequently becoming a dictator.



differentiation of educational opportunities after grade four, where students from the *less favored classes* were tracked into vocational training schools, while more privileged students attended secondary school (Plank, 1996). As governmental support for the public primary and secondary school system declined, the privileged classes began enrolling their children in private schools, leaving the public schools to the poor. This shift led to the differentiation in educational experiences in the public and private systems, a differentiation that remains to this day (Reiter, 2008).

Democratic rule returned to Brazil after the end of WWII, through the deposing of Vargas and the election of a new president. This was a period of economic growth, which also led to growth in the education sector. The aims of the 1946 Constitution were re-emphasized by the new administration; public funding for education increased and, as a result, enrollment rates increased substantially across the country, even in the poorer states of the Northeast (Plank, 1987). This period is referred to as *o milagre brasileiro* (Brazilian miracle). However, the economic improvements of the time were not benefiting the masses of Afro-Brazilians (Moore, 1989). Afro-descendants were still being denied equal access in the job market and in the educational system.

In 1961, the first national law on education was enacted. In 1962, the Federal Council of Education was established, and, also in 1962, the National Plan of Education and the National Literacy Plan was created, inspired by the work of Paulo Freire (Bello & Rangel, 2002).

Rifts between the left (comprised of rural workers, unionized workers, the poor, and Afro-Brazilians) and the traditional leaders of the country (the elites, the media, and the leaders of the Catholic Church) led to political and social instability. In March of 1964, the military was able to take advantage of this unrest and stage a coup, deposing then President João Goulart (Meade, 2010). According to Meade, "...the coup was an preemptive move, intent on cutting off debate, stopping disenfranchised and marginalized groups from bidding for power, and eliminating the possibility of meeting the demands of the rural and urban poor, as well as liberals and progressives" (Meade, 2010,p. 161). Various activist groups were shut down, intellectual discussion of inequality, particularly racial inequality, was forbidden, and intellectuals, artists, and musicians who used their public personas to speak out against the military regime were forced to live in exile (Meade, 2010).

Brazilian military rule established a national security regime instead of a single, strongman type of dictatorship. The focus of the regime was on developing national economic growth in a highly controlled environment. This allowed for no unsanctioned dissent or opposition. Already oppressed groups suffered under this rule.

During the military regime, a number of new constitutions were written; once in 1967 and again in 1969. Civil society institutions were suppressed or restricted in ways that supported the regime's agenda (Meade, 2010). The country was in turmoil, and over time, the masses began to rebel. The Worker's Movement began to gain strength in the late 1970s, and by the mid-1980s the military had acquiesced their hold over the government and democracy returned to Brazil.

A new constitution was written in 1988, one that remains to this day. Included in the current Constitution is a law criminalizing racism and calling for the preservation and celebration of Afro-Brazilian homelands and culture. In 1995, Cardoso, a former intellectual who had harbored left wing ideologies that had necessitated his temporary exile during the dictatorship, was elected president. While focusing his economic platform on neo-liberal principles, his administration began to earnestly examine social exclusion of the poor and Afro-

Brazilians and implement policies and programs to promote social inclusion for those groups. The next president, Luis Inacio Lula da Silva (commonly known as Lula), made the most revolutionary changes of all regarding the Brazilian governmental position on racial discrimination. These changes will be discussed shortly.

One important event in Brazil's recent history was the country's participation in the 2001 United Nations World Conference against Racism, Racial Discrimination, Xenophobia and Related Intolerance<sup>25</sup>. This conference, which was held in Durban, South Africa, had strong Brazilian representation. The General Rapporteur of the conference was Edna Roland, an Afro-Brazilian activist who later became part of the Human Rights Commission's Working Group of Experts on Peoples of African Descent (Martins, et al., 2004). The Durban Conference was the first time that Brazil had formally acknowledged the links between colonialism, slavery, and the continued oppression of Afro-Brazilians (Martins, et al., 2004). The official statement from the Brazilian delegation reads:

The consensus achieved by us here allows for the recognition of people of African descent and of indigenous peoples as victims of discrimination and historical misdeeds, and Brazil considers that the

---

<sup>25</sup> This conference will hereby be referred to as the Durban Conference.

outcome of our negotiations regarding the issues of the past provide us with a framework for the acknowledgement of the wrongs and the expression of adequate forms of remorse that call for national affirmative and positive policies of implementation, as well as for the enhancement of international cooperation in the field (United Nations, 2001).

Brazilian representatives publicly recommended that the country adopt affirmative action policies that would increase access to higher education for Afro-Brazilians (Htun, 2004). During the conference and shortly thereafter, new policies were announced from different parts of the Brazilian government. The Ministry of Agrarian Development announced an affirmative action program that sought to "adopt compensatory, special and temporary measures to accelerate the process of building racial equality in the countryside" (Martins, et al., 2004,p. 803).

These measures included implementing a quota system that gave between 20-30% of the civil servant positions to Afro-Brazilians. A presidential decree instituted a national affirmative action program that mandated inclusion in public administration positions for Afro-Brazilians, women, and the handicapped. And in November 2001, the Supreme Court stated that affirmative action programs were indeed constitutional (Martins, et al., 2004).

Brazil has continued to work with the United Nations to address issues of inequality within the country. In 2004, the

United Nations Committee on the Elimination of Racial Discrimination filed a report detailing the work that the Brazilian government was doing to achieve racial equality. The committee expressed satisfaction in the adoption of civil codes that supported the constitutional assertions against racism, as well as the development of numerous governmental positions that focused on promoting racial equality. The Committee, however, expressed concern over the persistent structural inequalities and the disparities in education between Black and White Brazilians. A recommendation was also made to change the racial classification methodology used by the Brazilian Geographic and Statistical Institute (IBGE) so that the differences in the population could be better interpreted (United Nations, 2004).

In October 2005, Doudou Diene, the Special Rapporteur on Contemporary Forms of Racism, Racial Discrimination, Xenophobia and Related Intolerance, visited Brazil. Diene recognized the work that the Brazilian government had done to combat racism and discrimination. The Rapporteur, like his colleagues before him, also had concerns about the level of inequality that persisted in Brazilian society. In his report, Diene outlined specific ways in which Brazilian officials could strengthen their initiatives. While not specifically discussing affirmative action education policies, Diene did suggest various educational

projects that would be more inclusive to Afro-Brazilians and indigenous Brazilians (United Nations, 2006).

Lula's administration centralized federal efforts to battle racial discrimination and exclusion through the development of the Special Secretariat for the Promotion of Policies for Racial Equality (SEPPIR) in 2003. SEPPIR oversees an intergovernmental forum that coordinates municipal and state level social agencies that are responsible for administering public policies according to the National Plan for the Promotion of Racial Equality (PLANAPIR).

PLANAPIR was developed in 2006, following the 1<sup>st</sup> National Conference for the Promotion of Racial Equality (CONAPIR I), which was held in 2005. PLANAPIR outlines the goals and objectives that the Brazilian state, in collaboration with civil society, have developed in order to fight racial inequality. The PLANAPIR working group was coordinated by SEPPIR, and consisted of representatives from 16 federal government ministries and a representative from the National Council for the Promotion of Racial Equality (CNPIR). The overriding goal of PLANAPIR is to institutionalize the development and implementation of social inclusion policies and programs that benefit Brazilians who have suffered because of racial inequality (Secretaria Especial de Política de Promoção da Igualdade Racial, 2006).

The first part of PLANAPIR consists of the decree, signed by President Lula and then cabinet member, now current president Dilma Rousseff. The decree outlines the functions of the inter-ministerial work group. PLANAPIR is seen as the next step in moving from a country with vast racial inequality to one that actively promotes racial equality. This plan is part of a long process, according to the decree, that started with Brazil's participation in the International Convention for the Elimination of all Forms of Racial Discrimination in 1968, and continued with the renewed focus articulated during the Durban Conference.

The working group members were charged with numerous tasks. They focused on developing a system of public policies that promote ethnic and racial equality, based on the resolutions of CONAPIR I. The propositions were to be in concert with the recommendations from CNPIR and were to indicate which ministries would be responsible for which initiatives. Additionally, a system of monitoring and implementation was to be established (Art. 1).

The working group consisted of representatives from a number of ministries as well as one representative from CNPIR. The SEPPIR representative served as coordinator of the group, which, in addition to the CNPIR representative, included the



following: the National Youth Secretary, the Undersecretary of Human Rights, as well as one representative from each of the following ministries: Education; Justice; Health; Urban Development; Agrarian Development; Anti-Hunger and Social Development; Planning, Budget, and Administration; Labor and Business; Foreign Relations; Culture; Energy and Mines; and Women's Policy. The working group also commissioned sub-groups, whose membership came from other governmental and non-governmental organization as well as the private sector (Art.3). PLANAPIR was the result of that working group.

The bulk of PLANAPIR focuses on the specific social inclusion policies and programs that each ministry is to be responsible for. Those policies and programs that are related to the inclusion of Afro-Brazilians in higher education institutions will be the focus of this analysis. A brief explanation of the data sources and the various organizations and councils and meetings that have contributed to the development of the plan is also included in PLANAPIR, and will be discussed.

CNPIR was established in 2003, under the coordination of SEPPIR, to begin to develop a structural base for the development of social inclusion policies and programs. CNPIR consists of activists, representatives from civil society, and

representatives from governmental ministries. The specific objectives of CNPIR are to:

- Defend rights
- Affirm the multi-ethnic character of Brazilian society
- Re-affirm that indigenous and Afro-Brazilian culture are integral parts of national development and national identity
- Acknowledge African derived religious traditions
- Establish school curriculum that reflects the plurality of races in Brazil, per Lei 10.639/2003 and Lei 11.645/2008
- Document historic quilombo sites, in order to protect those communities and protect the land
- Implement actions to prohibit discriminatory actions in the labor sector and the educational sector, that respect free will, and that allow for the expression of cultural rights and other fundamental rights
- Eliminate discriminatory barriers, direct or indirect, that lead to a lack of opportunities
- Articulate themes that focus on the intersection of race and gender
- Adopt policies to end human rights abuses
- Develop plans for CONAPIR II

(Secretaria Especial de Política de Promoção da Igualdade Racial, 2006)

The next section of PLANAPIR describes the actions taken in the early 2000s to solidify begin to solidify a national racial inclusion agenda. A number of sectors of society were involved in crafting what came to be known as PNPIR. Civil society organizations as well as representatives from the government worked together to develop the racial social inclusion agenda, which was initially articulated as the Durban Declaration and presented at the Durban Conference. Brazil publically acknowledged an intention to combat race based social exclusion at this international conference. Following this acknowledgement, a governmental structure was put into place to deal with the issue. That structure, as described earlier, was SEPPPIR.

Through SEPPPIR, PNPIR, a foundational statement of past, current, and future actions, was developed. PNPIR includes official documentation from the Durban Conference, including the Durban Declaration, and the governmental document *Brazil without Racism*. This document describes the programs developed to promote racial equality in the areas of labor and business, culture, communication, education, health, the quilombos, Black

women, youth, security, and international relations (Secretaria Especial de Política de Promoção da Igualdade Racial, 2006).

PNPIR also demonstrated how the fight against racial inequality would be waged throughout the society. Various departments of the federal government would be involved in this arena, but local and state governments would also be involved. Civil society and international organizations were to be included in this plan as well.

The state would create a structure, through the ministries and other governmental groups, to promote these policies and support the other entities involved in these policies and programs. One structure that was developed was the Intergovernmental Forum for the Promotion of Racial Equality (FIPIR). This forum consists of local and state government representatives, and provides a space for these governments to "... adhere to the action plan, share experiences, and define additional agendas that consolidate actions for the promotion of equal opportunities" (Secretaria Especial de Política de Promoção da Igualdade Racial, 2006, pp. 24-25). The other was the aforementioned CONAPIR I, which brought all of these entities together to help develop what later became PL 12.288/2010.

## *Section 2: Public Law 12.288/2010 (Racial Equality Statute)*

After years of public debate, demonstrations, media displays for and against quotas and other race based social inclusion measures, the Statute of Racial Equality was signed into law in July 2010. This next section examines the law, first by providing a general overview and then targeting specifically the area of higher education.

The Racial Equality Statute is Public Law No. 12.288, of July 20, 2010 (P.L.12.288/2010). It brings together, in one doctrine, all of the various federal laws and decrees that have been passed in the last 15 to 20 years. It also serves as a statement of the way the federal, state, and municipal governments, along with civil society and international organizations (and even foreign governments) are to collaborate to ensure the social inclusion of Afro-Brazilians (Presidency of the Republic, 2010).

The purpose of the law is: "...to assure to the Afro-Brazilian population the achievement of equal opportunities, the support of individual, collective, and diffuse ethnic rights and the struggle against discrimination and other forms of ethnic intolerance" (Art.1).

The preliminary provisions of the statute (Title I) first delineate racial or ethnic-racial discrimination as:

any distinction, exclusion, restriction or preference based on race, color, descent or national or ethnic origin which has the aim of nullifying or impairing...human rights and fundamental freedoms in the political economic, social, cultural or any other field of public or private life (Art.1 Sec.1).

Article 1 makes other clear definitions as well, including defining racial inequality as "...every unjustified situation of differentiation of access and enjoyment of goods, services, and opportunities in public and private spheres..." (Art.1 Sec.2), due to racial or ethnic-racial discrimination. Special mention is also given to the intersectionality of gender and racial inequality and its impact on Afro-Brazilian women. Afro-Brazilians are specifically defined as those who declare themselves to be Black and/or colored according to the IGBE definitions or other similar definitions (Art.1 Sec. 4), and affirmative actions are defined as "...programs and special measures adopted by the State and the private initiatives to correct racial inequalities and to promote equal opportunities" (Art. 1 Sec. 6).

Article 3 of the statute explicates that the statute goes beyond the constitutional norms to promote the inclusion of victims of ethnic-racial inequality. This is important to note, as many of the opponents to race based public policies have

argued against the constitutionality of said policies, particularly quota policies.

The statute specifies how Afro-Brazilians will be included into the economic, social, political, and cultural life of Brazil (Art. 4). Specific actions include:

- Inclusion in economic and social development public policies
- Adoption of affirmative action measures, programs, and policies
- Changing of state institutional structures
- Encouraging, supporting, and strengthening civil society through incentives and priority access to public resources
- Implementing affirmative action programs in a variety of arenas, including work, housing, health, and education (Art. 13)

The final article of the preliminary provisions section designates the establishment of the National System for the Promotion of Racial Equality (Sinapir). This national system is intended to be the coordinating center for the administration of the statute (Art.5). Sinapir will be discussed in more detail in the analysis of Title III of the statute.

Title 2 of the Racial Equality Statute describes in detail the fundamental rights of Afro-Brazilians as well as the governmental measures that are or will be put into place to assert those rights. The target areas are as follows: health, education, culture, sports and leisure, religion (particularly African based religions), land, housing, work, and media participation and representation. This discussion will focus on the education section of Title 2.

The first section of the Right to Education, Culture, Sports and Leisure chapter outlines the general provisions. Article 9 states that Afro-Brazilians have the right to participate in educational and other activities in order to contribute to that population's cultural heritage as well as Brazilian society. The measures that the federal, state, district, and municipal governments are to adopt include promoting actions to increase access to education, providing space for Afro-Brazilian social and cultural promotion, developing educational campaigns that connect the entire society to Afro-Brazilian culture, and implementing public policies that support Afro-Brazilian youth (Art.10 Secs. 1-4).



The next section deals specifically with education. Article 11 outlines the provisions of P.L. 10.639/2003-11.645/2008 which mandates the study of African and Afro-Brazilian history. More central to this investigation are articles 12-16. Article 12 charges the federal, state, and municipal systems with creating incentives for the study and research of ethnic relations, quilombos, and other issues relevant to Afro-Brazilian people.

Article 13 highlights the work that the federal government must do in the higher education realm. It reads as follows:

The Federal Executive Branch, through its competent authorities, shall encourage both public and private higher education institutions, without prejudice to existing legislation, to:

- Safeguard the principles of ethics in research and support groups and research centers in the various graduate programs to develop themes of interest to the Afro-Brazilian population
- Incorporate in the curriculum of the courses for teacher education issues that include values pertaining to the ethnic and cultural plurality of Brazilian society

- Develop university extension programs aimed at bringing young Afro-Brazilian people close to advanced technologies, ensuring the principle of proportionality between the gender of beneficiaries
- Establish technical cooperation programs in public, private and community schools, with preschools, elementary schools, high school and technical education, for teacher training based on principles of fairness, tolerance and respect for ethnic differences

The final three articles of the education section focus on the governmental role in education with regards to the Afro-Brazilian movement, affirmative action, and the monitoring and evaluation of said programs. The government is charged with the tasks of working with the Afro-Brazilian movement to develop social inclusion educational activities (Art.14) and adopting affirmative action programs (Art. 15). The executive branch of the federal government, in particular, is responsible for monitoring and evaluating the programs (Art. 16).

Title 3 of the statute deals with the National System for the Promotion of Racial Equality (Sinapir). Sinapir is the system through which all governmental, private sector, and civil

society racial inclusion policies and programs are to be coordinated. Specifically, the objectives of Sinapir are listed in Article 48 as:

- To promote racial equality and combat social inequality resulting from racism, including through adoption of affirmative actions
- To formulate policies to mitigate the factors of exclusion and promote social integration of afro Brazilian population
- To decentralize the implementation of affirmative actions by state, county, and municipal governments
- To articulate plans, actions, and mechanisms aimed at promoting racial equality
- To ensure the effectiveness of the means and tools developed for the implementation of affirmative actions and compliance with the goals to be established

The National Policy for the Promotion of Racial Equality (PNPIR) is discussed in Article 49 of the statute. This policy was initially developed in 2008. The Racial Equality Statute, which is more recent than PNPIR, acknowledges the plan that was done in 2008, but transfers the responsibility of PNPIR from SEPPIR to Sinapir (Art. 49).

Articles 56 and 57 focus on the funding sources of the social inclusion policies and programs. The federal government is to allocate funding specifically for these programs on a yearly basis. Such funding is to be transparent and easily traceable through budget reports and related documents (Art. 56). Funding sources, in addition to the federal, state, and local governments, include donations from individuals, private companies, non-governmental, national, or international organizations, as well as donations from foreign countries (Art. 57).

#### *Analysis of Policy Document One Using the Conceptual Framework*

In this section, I will use the conceptual framework to analyze the social inclusion ideologies, approaches, and tools that are utilized by the federal government to promote Afro-Brazilian inclusion in higher education. The section begins with a discussion of the policy ideologies (neo-structural, social justice, transformation) that drive Brazilian social inclusion policy. Next, I examine the approaches (cultural legitimization, recognition, redistributive) that are used to promote social inclusion. I also will examine the policy tools (mandates, inducements, capacity building, system changes) that are used by the federal government.

## *Policy Ideologies*

The second research question is: *to what degree are the social inclusion initiatives neo-structural, social justice, and/or social transformation oriented?* I argue that overall, the Racial Equality Statute can be seen as a social justice oriented policy. A number of the initiatives outlined in the statute have the potential to be transformative, particularly through the establishing of SINAPIR. But to date, sustained transformative system change has not occurred at the federal level. Likewise, there is language to suggest that the elimination of racism is a key part of the federal policy agenda. However, the policy tools and approaches that are outlined in the statute indicate that participation in the current structures and increased Afro-Brazilian engagement in higher education are the primary foci.

There are a number of ways in which access, one component of social justice oriented policy, is promoted in the statute. Article 9 asserts that Afro-Brazilians have the right to access education at all levels and Article 10 mandates that this right be enforced at all levels of government. Article 13 articulates that the federal government is to encourage higher education institutions to administer programs to promote access. One way that the federal government is to encourage higher education

institutions to administer these programs is through financial support, which is broadly addressed in Articles 56 and 57.

Social justice oriented policy ideology focuses not only on access, but also on engagement. This focus is evident in the Racial Equality Statute. The federal government is to work cooperatively with the Black movement to develop social inclusion educational initiatives. This includes the study of Afro-Brazilian history and culture at all educational levels and the development of affirmative action programs in higher education institutions.

#### *Policy Approaches*

Social inclusion policy approaches are used in a variety of the policy target areas. For the purpose of this study, only the approaches that pertain specifically to the higher education target area will be discussed.

*Cultural legitimization.* The Racial Equality Statute articulates the use of the cultural legitimization approach in a variety of areas. Article 12 incentivizes the study and research of Afro-Brazilian culture. Article 13 encourages higher education institutions to prepare teachers to teach students about cultural plurality. Article 14 states that the government shall encourage and support the educational activities carried

out by the Afro-Brazilian movement. Such activities typically have a cultural component.

*Recognition.* The statute does not specifically indicate any recognition approaches to be used in the social inclusion of Afro-Brazilians into higher education. This is not to say that such approaches are not intended to be carried out. Later discussions of specific federal programs being implemented will highlight such approaches.

*Redistribution: Educational improvement.* Educational improvement approaches include strengthening the quality of teacher education programs so that future teachers are prepared to teach all students about African and Afro-Brazilian history and developing university extension programs that target Afro-Brazilian youth. These are the only areas where such approaches for educational improvement are specifically delineated.

*Redistribution: Financial support.* The federal government does currently administer a number of scholarship programs designated to ensure that poor Afro-Brazilian students are able to access higher education, namely Prouni, but these programs are not mentioned in the statute. Specific programs will be discussed in the next section of the chapter.

*Redistribution: Quotas.* Quota policies, which have been highly contested, were not included in the federal statute, to the chagrin of the Afro-Brazilian movement and other quota policy proponents who aggressively campaigned for a federal quota policy. But this is not to say that quotas are not considered to be part of the overall Brazilian social inclusion policy plan. There are a number of places in the statute that provide space for quotas to be utilized as a policy approach.

Article 3 makes clear that the statute is to be used along with the Constitution to ensure that those suffering from racial and social exclusion are given opportunities to participate as full Brazilian citizens. This is important to note, as the Constitution had been used as a basis for fighting race based higher education quota policies in particular. The statute provides a legal guideline from which quota policies can then be developed and implemented.

Throughout the statute, the use of affirmative measures is specified. Quotas, again, are not mentioned; they are also not excluded in the language of the statute. The redress of historical discrimination and inequalities is stated as a policy target. This redress has been used as one rationale for quota policies. This is another example of how the statute addresses quotas without actually using the contentious term.



Another area where the statute allows for quota policies is in Article 13, which is part of the Education section. Specifically, the language reads that the higher education institutions are to develop programs, “without prejudice to existing legislation”. Many higher education institutions currently have quota policies in effect. Any measures undertaken as a result of the statute are not to negatively impact the current policies in place at these institutions. Therefore, those measures are safeguarded and can continue.

#### *Policy Tools*

*Mandates.* The entire statute can be read as a mandate, as it articulates the overarching rules of engagement. Programs are not specified, but the statute states that affirmative actions and policies are to be developed, implemented, supported, and monitored. Sinapir is designated as the central authority for the initiatives. The specific programs can be found in PNPIR and other policy documents.

*Inducements.* Language specific to inducements related to higher education can be found in Articles 12, 15, 56, and 57. Article 12, which is located in the education section of the statute, charges federal, state, and local governments with the task of incentivizing the study and research of issues related to Afro-Brazilians. Incentives targeted for the Afro-Brazilian

movement are discussed in Article 15. Article 56 discusses how the budgetary plans of the government and all its sectors must reserve monies specifically for social inclusion policies and programs. Article 57 acknowledges the fact that a significant source of funding for social inclusion programs comes from outside of the governmental domain, thereby providing a space for civil society to continue to engage in social inclusion work.

*Capacity building.* Capacity building is a particularly useful tool for social inclusion. The education section of the statute delineates specific capacity building activities that are currently underway, including university extension programs that target Afro-Brazilian populations and the development of culturally competent teachers (Art. 13). The Afro-Brazilian movement also benefits from capacity building, as a number of tools are specifically targeted to supporting the movement's implementation of social inclusion programs, including support, by the government, of exchanges and conventions, as well as technical cooperation (Art. 15). Oversight and evaluation systems are also capacity building tools. Article 16 states how the appropriate governmental administrative bodies will be responsible for providing such oversight.

*System changes.* The greatest system change component of the statute is the establishment of Sinapir as the umbrella governmental system for coordinating the social inclusion efforts of the country. Prior to the development of Sinapir, most of the race based or Afro-Brazilian targeted social inclusion programs under the federal purview were administered, either partially or totally, through SEPPIR. The statute does not mention SEPPIR at all, so it is not clear if Sinapir is somehow supposed to replace SEPPIR.

### *Section 3: Federal Level Higher Education Policies and Programs*

This section of the chapter discusses the various federal programs that are currently or have recently been implemented. The focus of this analysis is on higher education programs that target Afro-Brazilian students. Included in this analysis is the Combined Affirmative Action Program for Blacks<sup>26</sup> (commonly known as Brasil Afroatitude), the University for Everyone Program<sup>27</sup> (ProUni), Knowledge Connections<sup>28</sup>, and the Scholarships for

---

<sup>26</sup> Programa Integrado de Ações Afirmativas para Negros

<sup>27</sup> Programa Universidade para Todos

<sup>28</sup> Conexões de Saberes

Scientific Initiation Institutional Program<sup>29</sup> Affirmative Action Project (PIBIC-AA).

### *Afroatitude*

Afroatitude was a program that was coordinated by various departments in the federal government and implemented at federal universities across the country. Its genesis, however, was in the Black community and the Black movement. Non-governmental organizations concerned about HIV-Aids and its impact in the Black community developed initiatives to inform Afro-Brazilians about the risks as well as about prevention and treatment measures (Ministry of Health, 2006).

Representatives from some of these same organizations were part of the 2001 Durban conference. The Ministry of Health was also represented in the delegation, and that ministry began to develop affirmative action initiatives. After the creation of SEPPIR, representatives from the Health, Education, and other ministries were given a space to come together along with civil society to develop cooperative plans for the social inclusion of Afro-Brazilians. In 2004, a scholarship program was developed for cotistas, enabling them to study, research, and conduct

---

<sup>29</sup> Programa Institucional de Iniciação Científica

community outreach related to HIV/Aids and racism (Ministry of Health, 2006).

Afroatitude was administered primarily by SEPPIR and the Ministry of Health. Also involved were the ministries of Education and Human Rights. The objective of the program was twofold: to provide financial support for cotistas and to develop a body of knowledge around the intersections of race, racism, and HIV/Aids (14). Specifically, the program was designed to:

- Develop multidisciplinary resources to support Black university students
- Develop and implement affirmative action programs that promote diversity
- Provide opportunities for Black students to engage in research
- Develop a research agenda, for students and professors, focused on issues relevant to the Black community
- Contribute to the development of Black students as health and HIV/Aids outreach workers

- Contribute to the implementation of "Health and Prevention in the Schools", a Ministry of Health and Ministry of Education initiative
- Strengthen the integration of teaching, research, and university extension
- Strengthen the connections across institutions and communities established by the university
- Contribute in a systemic manner to interdisciplinarity in the university curriculum
- Develop and strengthen the self-esteem of Black students (Ministério da Saúde, n.d.)

Universities that were currently implementing a quota system of affirmative action that reserved spaces for poor Afro-Brazilians were eligible to receive funding and programmatic support.

There were three primary components of the program: community intervention, scientific innovation, and student monitoring and support. Students, in conjunction with local organizations and other civil society institutions, developed and implemented prevention and advocacy projects. These projects

were brought together as part of the university's action plan<sup>30</sup>. Also part of the action plan were the research projects that students engaged in, with mentoring and support from university professors. In addition, the students and professors engaged in a number of interactive activities throughout the academic term, both within and among the universities (Ministério da Saúde, n.d.).

Official documentation was only found for the first year of the program. In 2005-2006, 10 universities across the country participated, including the Federal University of Bahia (UFBA). Each university had a program coordinator, who was remunerated with R\$ 600.00 (\$362.00 USD) each month. Fifty cotistas per university were accepted into the program, and each student received R\$241.51 (\$146.00) per month.

### *Knowledge Connections*

Knowledge Connections is a program administered by the Secretariat of Continuing Education, Literacy, and Diversity (Secad), part of the Ministry of Education. Knowledge Connections was a stand-alone program from 2004-2008. It is currently part of the Open School program, which focuses more on extension and outreach activities. This discussion focuses on

---

<sup>30</sup> See Chapter 5 for specific information about the university level programs.

the development and implementation of the program as it was initially defined.

Knowledge Connections is a program that focused on providing support to university students from poor communities<sup>31</sup>. Specifically, the objectives of the program are to:

- Stimulate more exchanges of knowledge and experiences between universities and poor communities
- Develop, in university students from poor areas, the capacity to create knowledge that can be used to impact their communities through the provision of financial and methodological support
- Carry out continuous study of the university structure and the specific needs of university students from poor communities
- Create conditions that improve access and retention of students from poor communities
- Develop methods, with the participation of students from poor communities to: study and evaluate the

---

<sup>31</sup> The language from the federal Knowledge Connections documents does not include a racial component, but race is discussed in the university level Knowledge Connection discourse, so I am including the program in the analysis.



impact of social policies; map economic, cultural, and educational conditions in poor areas; and develop projects that will benefit socially vulnerable groups, particularly children and adolescents (Ministério da Educação, n.d.)

The students, the university, and the community were all beneficiaries of Knowledge Connections. The students received, according to a report on the pilot program, R\$241 (\$145.00 USD) each month (Jacinto, n.d.). The students worked on individual or group projects, focusing on social, cultural, or technological issues, under the supervision of a professor or graduate student. The students' familiarity with the communities that they were studying aided the university, which got access to spaces that they may not have been able to access before.

According to the national coordinator of the program, Jailson de Souza e Silva, this exchange of ideas, experiences, and expertise is necessary. He states,

We want to promote the production of scientific work related to the favelas and urban areas and to assist in the adaption of students through this new area of study. There was a great authoritarian view of the university in relation to common spaces. It's necessary to promote a change, because the interaction of the two universes is fundamental for the development of public policies. We need to know, truthfully, the needs and rationales of each community (Souza e Silva, in Jacinto, n.d.).

In 2004, Knowledge Connections was implemented in five universities, with 75 students receiving support. The number of participating universities and students increased over the next four years, with 33 universities and 2,200 students participating by 2008. Again, after 2008, Knowledge Connections was incorporated into the Open School Program, thereby increasing the amount of students receiving assistance, but also broadening the focus of the program (Universidade Federal da Bahia, n.d.).

#### *ProUni*

ProUni is a federal scholarship program that has helped to finance university education for over 748,000 students since the program's inception in 2005<sup>32</sup> (Ministério da Educação, 2010b). Public school attendees and private secondary school scholarship recipients are eligible for ProUni if they have a family income of no more than three times the monthly minimum wage. A quota system is also in place, reserving spots for students with disabilities, afro-descendant students, and indigenous students. The amount of reserved spaces varies, depending on the demographics of each state. Students must take a national exam and receive a pre-determined minimum score set by the Ministry

---

<sup>32</sup> 2010 figures.

of Education. Students are still required to take the college or university specific vestibular.

The scholarships provide partial funding for 30% of the recipients and full funding for 70% of the recipients (Ministério da Educação, 2008). Scholarships can be used to pay for costs related to attending private and for profit higher education institutions, as public universities and colleges are free. Students receiving full scholarships are also eligible for additional funding through the maintenance program *Bolsa Permanência*. Full scholarship students enrolled in full time programs that are at least six semesters in duration receive a subsistence remittance of R\$ 300 (\$181.00 USD) a month (Ministério da Educação, 2010a).

#### *PIBIC-AA*

PIBIC-AA is a pilot project developed in 2009 by the Ministry of Science and Technology's National Council for the Development of Science and Technology, in conjunction with SEPPIR. The objective of PIBIC-AA is to "increase the opportunities for the development of science and technology through the granting of scholarships for students in higher education who enter the academic environment through vestibular affirmative action programs" (Conselho Nacional de Desenvolvimento Científico e Tecnológico, 2009). Public

universities that have quota systems in place are eligible to apply for funding. All eligible institutions that successfully completed the application process, which consists of providing information about their ongoing affirmative action initiatives, receive funding for their students. In 2009, 600 students at 49 public higher education institutions received scholarships (Conselho Nacional de Desenvolvimento Científico e Tecnológico, 2009).

#### *Analysis of Federal Programs Using the Conceptual Framework*

This section describes and explains the ideologies, approaches, and tools used by the federal government programs to increase the social inclusion of Afro-Brazilian students in higher education. I will detail which ideologies (neo-structural, social justice, and social transformation) approaches (cultural legitimization, recognition, and redistribution), and tools (mandates, inducements, capacity building, and systems changing) are utilized in the federal programs.

#### *Policy Ideologies*

The ProUni and PIBIC-AA social inclusion educational programs are framed by a neo-structural ideology. These two programs have Afro-Brazilian student access as the policy goal.

That goal is to be achieved through financial and, in the case of PIBIC-AA, educational support measures. Neither of the two programs focuses on community participation or engagement. The primary policy goal of ProUni and PIBIC-AA is to increase the number of Afro-Brazilian students enrolled in higher education institutions. PIBIC-AA has a secondary goal of increasing educational opportunities for affirmative action recipients.

Afroatitude and Knowledge Connections do focus on community participation and engagement. These social inclusion programs are framed by a social justice ideology. In addition to providing access through the use of financial support approaches, Afroatitude and Knowledge Connections provide students with opportunities to reach out, respectively, into Black and poor communities. The students partner with civil society organizations and develop projects that connect the community to university resources.

### *Policy Approaches*

*Cultural legitimization.* This social inclusion approach is used in Knowledge Connections and Afroatitude. Both programs include cultural study as a primary component of the program. In the case of Afroatitude, which developed from a need initially articulated in the Black community, the focus is on Afro-Brazilian culture. The students in Afroatitude conduct research

that focuses on various aspects of Black culture, such as life in the quilombos, Black teenage girls' attitudes concerning HIV/Aids, and race and ethnic relations in public schools (Ministério da Saúde, 2006). Knowledge Connections legitimizes the lived experiences of students from poor communities, and privileges the students' knowledge in the academy (Jacinto, 2004). ProUni and PIBIC-AA do not directly use the cultural legitimization approach.

*Recognition.* The recognition approach to social inclusion is evidenced most strongly in Knowledge Connections. A central purpose of this program is to develop a body of knowledge about poor students and their communities. Recognition of the social conditions of Afro-Brazilians through study and research is also used to promote social inclusion in Afroattitude. Recognition is not a central component of ProUni or PIBIC-AA.

*Redistribution: Educational improvement.* Unlike the Racial Equality Statute that outlines the general social inclusion educational goals of the federal government in a non-descript manner, the specific federal programs provide more details into how the state is involved in the improvement of the educational experiences of Afro-Brazilian students. Knowledge Connections and Afroattitude have built-in program components that provide educational support for the students being serviced. Both

programs provide students with mentors and study groups, as well as seminars and opportunities to present and publish their work (Jacinto, n.d.; Ministério da Saúde, 2006). Educational improvement is not a specific policy goal of ProUni, but while educational improvement measures are not specified in PIBIC-AA, this could become a part of the program in the future, as one of the central aims of this program is to improve the science and technology competencies of students.

*Redistribution: Financial support.* Financial support is a component of all the federal programs. The sole focus of Pro-Uni is to provide scholarships for students to attend private universities. *Bolsa Permanência*, a sub-component of Pro-Uni, provides supplemental funding for students who, even with their education being paid for, might still find attending school a financial hardship. PIBIC-AA is also singularly a scholarship program at this juncture. Afroatitude and Knowledge Connections provide monthly stipends for program participants. In addition, all four of the government programs provide financial resources targeted for the administrative costs of the universities hosting the programs.

*Redistribution: Quotas.* ProUni is the only program that has a quota system built into its structure. The amount of scholarships given to specific target groups is dependent on the

population percentages of each state. Therefore, in the case of Bahia, ...% of scholarships would be distributed to Afro-Brazilian students. Afroatitude and PIBIC-AA are both set up to support and supplement existing quota systems at public universities. Knowledge Connections does not have a direct connection to any quota systems.

Figure 6: Federal Social Inclusion Programs

SI/AA PROGRAM	ADMINISTRATIVE OFFICE	TYPE OF PROGRAM
Afroatitude	SEPPIR/Ministries of Education, Health, and Human Rights	Educational, Cultural, Financial
Knowledge Connections	Secad (Ministry of Education)	Educational, Cultural, Financial
ProUni	Ministry of Education	Quota, Financial
PIBIC-AA	SEPPIR/ National Council for the Development of Science and Technology (Ministry of Science and Technology)	Educational/Financial

### *Policy Tools*

*Mandates.* ProUni is the only program that in itself is a programmatic mandate. ProUni was formalized when it was written into Public Law 11.096 in 2005 (Heringer & Ferreira, 2009). The other federal programs do have specific provisions written into



them, but do not unto themselves constitute a mandate for the purpose of this analysis.

*Inducements.* All of the federal programs use inducements as a social inclusion policy tool. ProUni provides private higher education institutions with tuition, and provides eligible students with supplementary funding. Afroatitude provides funding to students and the public institutions that they attend, as does Knowledge Connections. PIBIC-AA, while providing supplementary funding to students, does not designate any institutional funding.

*Capacity building.* Afroatitude and Knowledge Connection are designed to develop academically stronger students and culturally responsive educational institutions. Another focus of these programs is to build the capacity of the communities that the students come from. The various programmatic structures of Afroatitude and Knowledge Connections facilitate capacity building. PIBIC-AA is designed to increase human capacity in science and technology in Brazil, but outside of providing financial support for students, the pilot project has no direct capacity building mechanisms in place. ProUni does not utilize capacity building policy tools.

*System changes.* With the creation of ProUni, the federal government created a system of financial provisions for higher

education that had not existed prior. ProUni provided an opportunity for higher education access for hundreds of thousands of students, many of them Afro-Brazilians. In 2006, over half of the students receiving scholarships through ProUni were Black (Heringer & Ferreira, 2009). This greatly increases the amount of Afro-Brazilians acquiring higher education.

Afroatitude, Knowledge Connections, and PIBIC-AA are creating system changes in the institutions that host the programs, particularly for Afroatitude and Knowledge Connections, while less so for PIBIC-AA. Afroatitude and Knowledge Connections, through the legitimization of the study of Afro-Brazilians and the poor by students who are part of those identity groups, give credibility to these populations in the academy. PIBIC-AA has a goal of changing the scientific community by "...increasing the participation of social groups in spaces that they traditionally don't occupy..." (Conselho Nacional de Desenvolvimento Científico e Tecnológico, 2009), but there is little in the documentation to suggest that the program has any concrete mechanisms in place to achieve such a system change.

### *Summary*

Brazil has gone through many changes. It started as a slave colony, was transformed to an independent, but vastly unequal, country, and through multiple democratization processes (coming

from the civil society and government and international spheres) has started to become more inclusive. In education in particular, this focus on racial social inclusion can be seen in the variety of policy activities. The federal government itself has been the slow to develop widespread social inclusion policies, as evidenced by the Racial Equality Statute that was just signed into law in 2010. The federal law, as written, primarily allows for all of the policy activity happening at the state, municipal, university, and civil society levels to be incorporated into a cohesive system. While it still remains to be seen how the federal system of Sinapir will change the policy landscape, it is definitely a move that is unprecedented in Brazilian history. Brazil has gone from a society that saw race as irrelevant to social progress to, at least as evidenced by the federal government action, a country that is actively focused on increasing social inclusion for Afro-Brazilians in the educational sphere.

The Racial Equality Statute is infused by social justice ideology, but is vague in specific policy and programmatic action. The language of the statute does allow for a variety of measures to come under its purview, including inducements and quotas and other affirmative measures, but the lack of specificity indicates that the majority of initiatives will be

shaped, not by the federal government, but by local governments, educational institutions, and civil society organizations.

Most federal focused programs were small and few numbers of students benefited until the creation of ProUni. These early federal programs were administered by universities, which were some of the early adopters of race focused social inclusion educational policies and programs. The next chapter provides a more detailed look at how the federal programs and university level programs have worked together to impact higher education social inclusion for Afro-Brazilians.

## *Chapter 5: Race Based Social Inclusion Higher Education in Brazil: The Case of the Federal University of Bahia*

This chapter focuses on the various social inclusion policies and programs targeting Afro-Brazilians that have been implemented at the Federal University of Bahia (UFBA). The chapter begins with a historical overview of Brazilian social inclusion policy activity at the university level. These policies are often referred to as affirmative action policies. Following is an account of the social and historical context surrounding the development of such policies in Bahia, focusing on UFBA. A discussion of the specific university policies and programs follows. The policy ideology, approaches, and tools are the foci of the latter part of the analysis.

### *Early University Social Inclusion Policy Activity*

An influx of policy activity surrounding the issue of the social inclusion of Afro-Brazilians in higher education institutions began starting in the early 2000's. Prior to that, the Ford Foundation had sponsored affirmative action initiatives at Brazilian universities and the federal government had sponsored small programs such as the Tutoring Project and Afroatitude. But after the 2001 United Nations World Conference against Racism, Racial Discrimination, Xenophobia and Related Intolerance (the Durban Conference), the Black movement, prominent scholars, and other advocates for social inclusion

began to target specific universities for social action and change.

In 2001, three state universities<sup>33</sup>, including the State University of Bahia (UNEB), adopted quota policies that mandated the reservation of spaces for Afro-Brazilians<sup>34</sup> in the incoming student class (Heringer & Ferreira, 2009). The first federal university to adopt a quota policy was the University of Brasília (UNB). That policy was implemented in 2003. The Federal University of Bahia (UFBA) and the Federal University of Paraná followed in 2004. By the end of 2009, 84 public universities (municipal, state, and federal) had implemented some type of race based social inclusion policy that included quotas (S. A. D. Santos, 2010).

The state and federal universities in Salvador da Bahia were early adopters of affirmative action initiatives that were designed to promote the social inclusion of Afro-Brazilians into the higher education system. As stated before, federal programs and programs sponsored by international NGOs were already being administered at UFBA and UNEB. At UFBA, the programs were

---

<sup>33</sup> Besides UNEB, the other universities to adopt quota policies in 2001 were the State University of Rio de Janeiro (UERJ) and the University of North Fluminense (UENF).

<sup>34</sup> The universities also adopted quota policies for other groups, including public school attendees and indigenous students.

carried out through the Center of African and Asian studies (CEAO). Researchers from the two universities collaborated regularly and developed joint research projects on affirmative action, often specifically focusing on the disparities between Afro-Brazilian and Whites in higher education (Queiroz & Santos, 2006; J. T. D. Santos & Queiroz, 2006).

### *The Community and the University Converge*

A number of factors allowed for these early initiatives to take place. Salvador, being the capital of Bahia, the Black Mecca of Brazil (Conceição, 2010) was a hotbed for Afro-Brazilian activism. Many of the participants of the Durban Conference had bases and connections in Salvador. The groundwork had already been done in the community to push for these initiatives.

The Black Student Movement was also instrumental. These students were not only university students, but also students of various pre-vestibular programs, including the Steve Biko Institute, who were demanding relief from the vestibular fee (Miranda, 2007). The fee was an additional barrier for impoverished students who wanted to take the university entrance exam, but could not afford to pay the required R\$90.00 (\$54.00 USD). In 2001 and 2002, the students demonstrated publically,

demanding that university officials reduce or get rid of the fee. The fee was later waived for poor students.

The Black Movement and the Black Student Movement joined forces with activists within UFBA to establish the Committee for Quotas in 2002 (Miranda, 2007). This organization was instrumental in pushing for social inclusion policies and programs at UFBA. The Committee developed a proposal that was later incorporated into the UFBA affirmative action program (Centro de Estudos Afro Orientais, 2002).

This incorporation did not happen without conflict. Students, members of the Committee for Quotas, and other community activists engaged in public demonstrations throughout 2003 and 2004. The Black community put pressure on the university from within the system as well as from the streets (Miranda, 2007). By 2004, this agitation was successful. The University Council at UFBA voted in favor of developing an institution-wide affirmative action program that included race based quotas.

A number of elements contributed to the policy climate in Salvador da Bahia. Politically, Salvador is the center of the Black Movement. Again, activists as well as universities had been supported by the activities of the Ford Foundation, and



this provided a foundation and favorable atmosphere for change. That change started with the State University of Bahia (UNEB).

Here in Bahia, the group that jumped ahead was the state University of Bahia, with Sacramento. She was the first person, one of the first persons to really publicize the idea of a system of quotas for the state University of Bahia. It got a lot of publicity; I think it was like 40%. (Interviewee 102, 2010)

UNEB was an early adopter of quota policies, pushed forward by Ivete Sacramento, the first Afro-Brazilian university president in the country. UNEB, like UFBA, is located in Salvador. UNEB, according to Interviewee 102, a university professor and research center administrator, already had a large Afro-Brazilian student population. According to this interviewee, the development of a quota policy was more symbolic than system changing.

And if you looked at the racial mixture of the state University of Bahia, it was already well above 40%. I mean it was... the 40% was not a really demanding criterion to me. I mean, the percentage of non-Whites in Bahia is around 80%, I think 82%, and in the state University of Bahia, the percentage was already well above 40%, but there was some sort of requirement that stated that at least 40% of the people who got into the state University of Bahia had to be Afro-Brazilian, even though it was already above that 40. But this got a lot of publicity. It made it a hot issue. (Interviewee 102, 2010)

Because of the close proximity of UNEB and UFBA and the interactive nature of the Black Movement in Salvador, activists who supported the work of UNEB were also focusing in on UFBA.

## *The Color of Bahia*

The Color of Bahia is a research program at UFBA. According to the program's website, The Color of Bahia:

...aims to carry out empirical research on racism, culture, and Black identity in Brazil, from the perspective of international comparison, to implement actions that envisage the democratization of higher education in Brazil, and to support the training of undergraduate and postgraduate studies on ethnic and race relations in Brazil. (A Cor da Bahia, 2011)

Researchers at the Color of Bahia had long been collecting data on Blacks in Brazil, and in the late 1990's they urged UFBA officials to start collecting demographic data on students who were sitting for the vestibular.

It was through this program that we asked the administration for the first time to include the color question in the socio-economic form that the students had to fill out before sitting for the exam for access to the university. We didn't have this information at our university, so the Color of Bahia asked the administration for the first time to include this information. In the beginning, they were not sure. They asked for advice from the law adviser because they were not sure. They wanted to be sure it was not racial prejudice or racist. But it was just so we could know better the population of the students, the color, and the characteristics of the population, the demographic and social. It's important information.

Then in 1997, we have this information for the first time. Then after that, the coordinator conducted research on five different states in five different universities, and for the first time we had this type of information about color of the students at five different public universities in Brazil. (Interviewee 206, 2010)

This groundbreaking information was later utilized to help make the case for the development of affirmative action programs at UFBA.

We had to have data to have something some information to describe the situation in terms of color and distribution of the students and the courses. So the Color of Bahia had a very important place Because well, we had the information we have the data we had the scientific stuff that people could use; the information for the debates and the discussions. (Interviewee 206, 2010)

But the participation of the Color of Bahia was the most important part was to have those data to show. When the data was necessary, when you were in need of that type of information, the Color of Bahia already had it. It's different if we compare it to other universities where people hadn't done the research before. Sometimes they have done the research after, but we need sometimes to start the process to conclude the research like that. So when the debate started, we already have the data coming from this research group. (Interviewee 206, 2010)

Indeed, the official proposals that were utilized and discussed by the working group and later the University Council included research and data compiled by the Color of Bahia Program. As stated in the 2004 UFBA proposal entitled *Affirmative Action Programs at the Federal University of Bahia:*

These data confirm that, along with the bankruptcy of public elementary and secondary education in the state and country, social exclusion occurs much before the

time of entering the university, making the social and racial / ethnic composition of the group of candidates to enter the UFBA quite different from the socio-demographic characteristics of Bahia. (Universidade Federal da Bahia, 2004)

The Color of Bahia research program was able to provide critical data to support the development of university wide social inclusion initiatives in the form of quotas, financial support, and academic support programs. The Color of Bahia, in keeping with the aforementioned goals of the program, also participated in a number of smaller impact social inclusion initiatives.

#### *Color of Bahia Programs*

In addition to conducting research that supported the push for university wide affirmative action initiatives, Color of Bahia also administrated a number of small affirmative action programs. These programs were financed by the federal government as well as by the Ford Foundation.

In Chapter 4, I described the specifics of the Afroattitude program that was sponsored by various departments in the federal government. UFBA was one of ten federal universities to participate in the program. Another program, the Tutoring Project, was coordinated by the Racial Equity in Brazilian Education Program or PPCor (Programa Políticas da Cor, 2009).

PPCor developed from the affirmative action activities at the State University of Rio de Janeiro (UERJ). The activities of PPCor, including the Tutoring Project, were financed by the Ford Foundation. The UFBA coordinator of Afroatitude and the Tutoring Project describes the initiatives.

I myself coordinated two different projects, affirmative action projects. The first one was the Project Tutoria. This project was one of twenty-seven projects in the whole country participating in the program called Politics of Color from UERJ. The Ford Foundation supported projects to help students prepare for the test, and to help poor students and Black students, university students, financial support and academic support. In Project Tutoria, we selected 20 students, Black and poor students, and we gave them financial support and academic support. It was a very successful project; today some of those 20 students are completing graduate studies, some are participating in the exchange programs, going to other countries. And the second project was Brazil Afroatitude. This was in 2006. The university had already created the affirmative action program and Afroatitude was part of an initiative from the Minister of Health. So the HIV/AIDS directory under the Minister of Health. So we again selected 50 students and they received financial support and academic support in the same format. (Interviewee 206, 2010)

A graduate student at UFBA describes past involvement with the Tutoring Project.

At the beginning I was a research assistant, and it is a way to put the students together with a research. Because at UFBA, it is a social representation of society. Because the richest students, they get better grades, because they have been studying at private schools, and then they get better grades, and they have no difficulty being in touch with the professors, and then they get better opportunities to be researchers. They have better opportunities to be

in touch to the knowledge production. But poor Black students, they have more difficulty getting in touch with these opportunities. The Color of Bahia is a program that tries to support students, poor Black students, and giving them opportunities to get in touch with research, and that's why I started being a research assistant there, and after about 1 1/2 years, I started being a coordinator assistant. My duties were to help (the coordinator) to organize a project with 30 students, undergraduate students, giving them money and also support to study. (Interviewee 201, 2010)

In addition to providing students with opportunities to conduct research and financial support, the Color of Bahia also gave select students in the Tutoring Project the opportunity to study abroad in the United States. Again, the UFBA graduate student describes that opportunity.

I was an assistant there and at this time (the coordinator) told me about this opportunity and then I went through a selection process and then I was selected and also a friend, she was also selected. She had more knowledge in English than I and so she went first in the spring and then I went during the next fall. It was really an agreement. They were looking for people like me, and then I went to the United States and I studied there for one semester. The college, Saint Mary's College, paid for meals and housing and everything there and one of the tickets to travel, and UFBA paid for one of the tickets and then they gave me money to go to Recife, which is another city to take the visa, passport, everything. They also gave me \$500 (USD), and I spent four months with \$500...It was the greatest opportunity for my life. I never thought I would have the opportunity to go to the United States because I am from the suburban area from Salvador, a very poor area from Salvador. I never thought that one day I would be out of my country, as an exchange student. Because in Brazil, the rich people do these kinds of things. Rich families, they pay for everything. But me, from the suburbs, from Paripe! (laughs) It was like incredible!

(Interviewee 201, 2010)

The Color of Bahia Research Program is currently functioning, but less as a change agent and center for social inclusion programs. Today, most of the researchers who developed, implemented, and administered the affirmative action initiatives have moved on to other areas in the university, including CEAO, which will be discussed shortly. According to one researcher who has worked with both programs, "I think the people moved around and CEAO had more stuff, more structure, more conditions to have those programs and so we migrated a little bit to this center" (Interviewee 206, 2010). The importance of the work that came out of the Color of Bahia is not to be understated. It was through this program that the university community was first able to see the impact that these types of initiatives could have.

Those projects Afroatitude and Tutoria, they were kind of pilot projects attending just a few students 20 or 50. But we could show to other people, our colleagues and the academic community, look, it's possible to do this a project like this. We can have good results. Look at those students who participated. Noting what happens, etc. We accumulated some experience with this type of project. (Interviewee 206, 2010)

Those experiences helped build the programs that have come out of CEAO and most recently, have been implemented across the university.

### *The Center for Afro-Asiatic Studies (CEAO)*

CEAO is part of the Philosophy and Humanities department of UFBA. Created in 1959, CEAO has long been the centralized location for research and activism with regards to Afro-Brazilians. According to the center's website, CEAO serves two missions, to be a conduit for dialogue between the university and the Afro-Brazilian community, and to provide linkages between Brazil and various African and Asian nations (Centro de Estudos Afro Orientais, 2011).

CEAO has a number of components, including an Afro-Brazilian museum, a library, a bookstore, and a number of educational and /or extension programs. These programs include: CEAfro, Uniafro, PosAfro, and the Factory of Ideas (Centro de Estudos Afro Orientais, 2011). Each of these programs will be discussed, but the analysis focuses on the aspects of the programs that pertain to social inclusion initiatives that target Afro-Brazilian students and higher education.

#### *CEAFRO*

CEAFRO is a program that is focused on racial and gender equality in Brazil. More so than the other CEAO programs, CEAfro is closely connected to the Black community and the Black movement in particular. CEAfro was the nucleus from which the



push for quotas and other social inclusion policies came forth. CEAFFRO partners with a number of community organizations, including Steve Biko Institute (SBI), Ilê Ayê Cultural Association, and the Women's Forum of Salvador (CEAFFRO, 2011).

CEAFFRO also receives institutional support from a number of entities. UNICEF, The Kellogg Foundation, and Save the Children have all supported various CEAFFRO programs. Governmental ministries and organizations provide support as well. These include: SEPPIR, the Ministry of Culture, and the Bahian State Secretariat for the Promotion of Equality (SEPROMI) (CEAFFRO, 2011). While the government has supported the work of CEAFFRO, the administrators of CEAFFRO still see the organization as being first and foremost part of the Black movement.

CEAFFRO has four main areas of activity: Educational Policies to Combat Racism and Sexism, Public Policies for Black Youth, Affirmative Action Policies in Higher Education, and Public Policies Related to Quilombo Communities (CEAFFRO, 2011). I examined the activities in each of the four areas and found that the only activities that related to the research topic were located within the area of Affirmative Action Policies in Higher Education.

CEAFFRO, as stated before, was directly involved in the discussions regarding the development of an affirmative action

program at UFBA. A member of CEAFFRO was the coordinator of the Pro-Quotas Committee that developed the proposal that was later developed into UFBA's affirmative action plan (Centro de Estudos Afro Orientais, 2002; Universidade Federal da Bahia, 2004). CEAFFRO also coordinates a small program that supports quota students. This program, The Quota Student Retention Project has three goals:

- To increase the retention of Afro-Brazilian, public school, and low income students
- To stimulate the development of pertinent academic skills
- To stimulate knowledge of Afro-Brazilian history and culture.

The project provides support for 30 students a semester. Ten of those students receive a scholarship of R\$300.00 (\$180.00 USD) a month for four months<sup>35</sup>. All 30 students participate in various activities such as English language courses, presentations by members of the Black movement and Black intellectuals, the reading and discussion of various texts and the viewing of films from and about the African Diaspora (CEAFFRO, 2011).

---

<sup>35</sup> The scholarships are given to the students with the most financial need, as evidenced by their family income statements.

## *Uniafro*

Uniafro is primarily a teacher professional development program that is administered by the Secretary of Education (Centro de Estudos Afro Orientais, 2010b). This program prepares teachers to teach African and Afro-Brazilian history and culture as mandated first by Law 10.639/2003-11.645/2008 and then by the Racial Equality Statute. A number of graduate students teach the courses in the professional development program. Since most of these graduate students are Afro-Brazilian, this program provides another way, albeit indirectly, to support students by employing them as teachers.

It's not the main focus, but I think it's important because it helps the student's preparation. It is important for them as graduate students (but) the focus here is the teachers that have this big responsibility, to apply and deal with this new curriculum. The main focus is not the university in itself, but we use our team of graduate students to involve them and it's possible to use this kind of people to organize and to give the courses. (Interviewee 206, 2010)

Uniafro also provided a small number of financial scholarships for quota students who self-identify as Afro-Brazilian. From April to December 2006, 16 students received monthly scholarships of R\$ 240.00 (\$144.00 USD) (Centro de Estudos Afro Orientais, 2010c). The students also attended English language classes and received tutoring on research methods and academic writing. The instructors were not only from

UFBA, but included leaders of various Black organizations. A second group of students participated in the program and received R\$ 260.00 (\$156.00 USD) a month from August 2006 to March 2007 (Centro de Estudos Afro Orientais, 2010d). According to the Uniafro website, the program no longer provides these scholarships (Centro de Estudos Afro Orientais, 2010a).

Most recently, Uniafro at CEAO has initiated a new program, running from August 2010 until February 2011, which provides pre-vestibular courses for students who are eligible for quotas as well as support once the selected students enter the university. The type of support given was not delineated on the program's website, so it is not clear whether or not this support is financial, educational, or some combination of the two (Centro de Estudos Afro Orientais, 2010b).

#### *Graduate Programs: Pos-Afro and Factory of Ideas*

Pos-Afro is the graduate studies program of CEAO. Students study courses related to African and African Studies and Race and Ethnic Relations. There are no scholarship or retention initiatives offered at this level. Similarly, there are no quota policies. The only financial support offered at this level are the scholarships that come from the federal government that all students are eligible for, regardless of race/ethnicity and family income (Personal communication, 2010).

The Factory of Ideas is also a graduate program, one that does explicitly try to provide opportunities to Black students. According to the website,

The course of the Factory of Ideas has always maintained a special attention to Black candidates and graduate students living in the North, Northeast and Central West (of Brazil). This experience has taught us that democracy and academic excellence can and should go part and parcel. (Fábrica de Idéias, 2011)

During the months of July and August, selected graduate students from across Brazil, and increasingly across the world, gather for intensive lecture and study. Well renowned scholars from Brazil and other countries lecture on issues related to Africa and the African Diaspora. These scholars also give public lectures that are well attended by the Black academic and activist communities in Salvador.

Students in the Factory of Ideas Program receive airfare, room and board, and all of the required reading materials. Most importantly, according to the website, the students are able to network with prominent international scholars as well as their fellow up and coming academics, developing connections that ideally will be maintained after the completion of the program (Fábrica de Idéias, 2011).

### *University-wide Initiatives*

The majority of the early social inclusion/affirmative action initiatives at UFBA were developed and administered by the Color of Bahia research group and CEAQ. The university has now developed an institution-wide affirmative action program, starting with the 2005 implementation of the quota system. In 2006, UFBA opened a new administrative office, the Office of Student Assistance<sup>36</sup> (PROAE). According to a university administrator, this is the first office of its kind in the Brazilian higher educational system (Personal communication, 2010). The mission of PROAE is to

Coordinate the management of social inclusion policies, student support and affirmative actions, with responsibility for managing programs and operating the necessary resources for the academic and administrative sustainability of institutional actions aimed at the student community of the university. (Pimentel, n.d.)

PROAE administers a number of financial support programs that target students with economic need. Working inside of PROAE is another office, the Office of Affirmative Action, Education, and Diversity. It is through this office that educational

---

<sup>36</sup> The full name of this office is now The Office of Affirmative Action and Student Assistance. It is not clear when this name change occurred.

support and financial support programs that target Afro-Brazilians are administered<sup>37</sup>.

A university administrator discusses the initiatives that are happening throughout the university, focusing on the ones coordinated by PROAE:

The current agenda of the university is to develop programs of affirmative action. Quotas, retention programs, and programs that train students to enter the work force. Knowledge Connections, Permanecer, Conviver, which produces articles and literary and scientific work of affirmative action students, ...today, the two most important programs are the scholarship program, Permanecer, and Knowledge Connections. Permanecer is funded through MEC and provides 600 scholarships. We also have a scientific program financed through MEC that provides scholarships for affirmative action students. We also have university specific programs, like Knowledge Connections, which does also have a connection to MEC. (Interviewee 204, 2010)

The administrator refers to Knowledge Connections<sup>38</sup>, a program which was discussed earlier in the federal policy section. The scientific program that the administrator refers to

---

<sup>37</sup> It appears that PROAE is currently undergoing a transition period. As stated in the footnote above, the office has a name change. Consolidation of the financial student assistance and race based affirmative action components of the office seem to be underway. As of 1/30/11, the PROAE website has limited information and states that the information that is there could possibly be outdated (<http://www.prograd.ufba.br/set.asp>).

<sup>38</sup> UFBA gives out 80 scholarships yearly through Knowledge Connections (Personal communication, 2010).

is PIBIC-AA<sup>39</sup>, which was also discussed earlier. The following section focuses on Permanecer and Conviver.

### *Permanecer and Conviver*

Permanecer is a program that is funded through the Ministry of Education. Its mission is twofold. First, the program provides funding and resources for projects generated by UFBA to assist students from low income backgrounds. These projects focus on three areas: extension, institutional development, and teaching. The extension projects build connections between the university and the community. The institutional projects focus on the development of technical and administrative resources, such as computer labs, libraries, day care facilities, creative expression outlets (dance groups, theater, symphony orchestra) (Universidade Federal da Bahia, 2008). The teaching projects focus specifically on the development of curriculum and teaching.

The second mission of Permanecer is to provide scholarships for low income students. It is interesting to note that nowhere in the description of Permanecer is race mentioned. According to one university administrator,

Those programs from the administration, they avoid

---

<sup>39</sup> UFBA gives out 35 scholarships yearly through PIBIC-AA (Personal communication, 2010).



trying to insist on this type of identification. I feel that they don't want to insist on this kind of division. They use this to hide an agenda. (Interviewee 206, 2010)

The administrator affirms that Permanecer still serves the same population, the quota students.

According to the official documentation, in order to qualify for a Permanecer scholarship, the student must "preferably have been approved by the vestibular Affirmative Action Program", must be low-income, cannot be employed, and must not have benefited from any other type of scholarship program. Recipients of the Permanecer scholarship receive R\$ 300.00 (180.00 USD) a month for an academic year. Five hundred of the scholarships are given to students at the main campus in Salvador, with the remaining 100 going to students at extension campuses throughout the region (Universidade Federal da Bahia, 2008).

The Conviver program is a book project that provides opportunities for students to publish their creative or academic work. Since its inception in 2009, Conviver has published four books; two anthologies of literary works (poems, stories, and autobiographical essays) and two journal style texts which consist of academic articles (Grupo Conviver, 2009a, 2009b; Universidade Federal da Bahia, 2010). In order to be eligible to

participate in Conviver, students must be participants or former participants in either Knowledge Connections or Permanecer.

### *Analysis of the Programs using the Conceptual Framework*

#### *Social Inclusion Ideology*

UFBA has been engaged in the development and implementation of race targeted social inclusion policy and practices since the 1990's. Over this time, the focus and ideologies that shape social inclusion activity have changed. Initially, the policy activity was framed by activism and scholarship, with increased participation in the academy as the goal. Over time, the focus has both narrowed and broadened, as the stakeholders involved in social inclusion policy activity have changed to include not only academics with research interests in Afro-Brazilians, but also university administrators and members of the Afro-Brazilian community. There are aspects of neo-structural, social justice, and social transformation ideologies encased in UFBA social inclusion policy.

Social inclusion policies framed by neo-structural ideology focus on processes and products that will provide increased access for socially excluded students. UFBA's university wide programs that are administered by PROAE, particularly Permanecer, are such policies. The goal of Permanecer is to

fund programs that support targeted students, ultimately increasing the university's capacity to serve these students while continuing to adhere to the university's academic mission. Financial support is given to students to help with the associated costs of school attendance and the opportunity cost of choosing to enroll in school instead of becoming a wage earner. The language of Permanecer does not include any discussion of racial inequality or of the need to specifically focus on Afro-Brazilian students. The program does target poor and Afro-Brazilian students, as evidenced by the preference given to participants in the affirmative action program. But the focus on Afro-Brazilians, explicit in the missions of many other UFBA social inclusion programs, is not explicit in Permanecer. The program also has no university outreach and engagement components. Overall, Permanecer has a narrow focus: to build structures in the university to absorb the new population of poor and Afro-Brazilian students.

Social inclusion policies that are framed by social justice ideologies focus not only on access but also on increased participation. These policies and programs, like neo-structural programs, engage in financial support activity for students. But in addition, social justice oriented programs develop partnerships with the target students and their communities.

Social inclusion policies that are within the social transformation framework look to not only increase access and participation of the target population, but to also dismantle racism in the institution and society.

CEAO and some of the programs that are administered by the center fall under the social justice ideology. CEAO as an entity provides outreach and engagement with the Afro-Brazilian community. The two graduate programs, Pos-Afro and the Factory of Ideas, focus on Afro-Brazilian student access and increased participation in the university. These programs are social justice programs in that they look to promote university engagement with the Black community, through the development of culturally relevant scholarship as well as the development of Afro-Brazilian scholars. While some of the professors and students are engaged in anti-racist work, the programs themselves are not designed to be socially transformative.

While the social justice programs Pos-Afro and the Factory of Ideas look to promote university engagement with the Black community, CEAO's social transformation programs are heavily imbued with actors from the Black movement. There is a sense, with the social transformation programs, that the Black community is actively entering into the university sphere, rather than having university actors reach out to the Black

community. The social transformation programs are CEAFFRO and Uniafro. Both of these programs administer social inclusion initiatives that promote Afro-Brazilian student access and participation. But they also engage in activities to develop Afro-Brazilian cultural knowledge and pride. This is an important component of social inclusion policies and programs that are developed under social transformation ideologies (Gidley, et al., 2010).

Uniafro and CEAFFRO use community activists who act as experts, teaching Black students about history and culture while promoting the idea of Afro-Brazilians being part of a larger African Diaspora. Additionally, it was through CEAFFRO that Black activists gained entry into university debates around social inclusion policy. Community members (students and Black movement leaders) were able to play a central role in shaping the university affirmative action policy.

The Color of Bahia can also be considered a program shaped by social transformation ideology. While the program is primarily a research program, the scholars that have participated in the program are heavily invested in transforming the university. The data gained from the early research projects helped to develop a climate conducive to the eventual discussions and activities around Afro-Brazilian social

inclusion. The Color of Bahia, in addition to conducting groundbreaking studies, also piloted small social inclusion programs, parts of which have since been replicated by CEAO and the wider university community. In that sense, the Color of Bahia developed new pathways for other social inclusion initiatives to be developed and implemented. This pathway development is another component of social transformation policy ideology (Gidley, et al., 2010).

### *Approaches*

In this next section I discuss the various social inclusion policy approaches undertaken at UFBA. To what degree do these policies and programs utilize cultural legitimization, recognition, and redistribution (of educational and financial resources and of access via quotas) approaches to achieve social inclusion for Afro-Brazilians?

*Cultural legitimization.* The cultural legitimization social inclusion approach is used by a number of UFBA programs. As discussed in Chapter 4, Knowledge Connections and Afroattitude provide opportunities for students to conduct research in poor and Afro-Brazilian communities. The Color of Bahia's research agenda focuses specifically on topics that pertain to Afro-Brazilians. The mission and activities of CEAO also focus on the production of knowledge about Afro-Brazilians as well as other

afrodescendents. CEA Afro, through its Quota Student Retention Project, educates students on Afro-Brazilian history and culture. Uniafro's teacher professional development program employs students from CEA O's African and Ethnic Studies graduate program, Pos-Afro, to teach courses. And the Factory of Ideas graduate seminar also provides opportunities for Afro-Brazilian history and culture to be examined. Cultural legitimization is explicitly used as a social inclusion mechanism at UFBA.

*Recognition.* A few of the social inclusion programs at UFBA use the recognition approach to social inclusion. This approach is most clearly evident in the early research agenda of the Color of Bahia, which took on the task of documenting the disparities between White and Black Brazilians in higher education. This documentation provided quota advocates the impetus to push the university to develop an affirmative action policy that took race into account. The research activities undertaken at CEA O and through the Conviver book project also focus on Afro-Brazilian social conditions, as do the aforementioned Knowledge Connections and Afroattitude programs.

*Redistribution: Educational improvement.* Afro-Brazilian students typically are entering the university after attending public primary and secondary educational institutions. These public schools often do a substandard job of preparing the

students for higher education. While the students who enter the university are often talented, they still benefit from continued academic support and enrichment. Educational improvement redistribution approaches are therefore part of a number of the social inclusion programs at UFBA.

Uniafro utilizes education improvement redistribution approaches in a number of programs. The teacher professional development program provides graduate students with opportunities to develop their teaching skills and subject area expertise while training public school educators. The discontinued program for quota students provided students with academic tutors. The more recent program provides academic support to secondary school students in the form of pre-vestibular courses. Once admitted into the university, the students receive additional support, but the type of support is not delineated.

Other programs utilize education improvement approaches as well. Knowledge Connections, Afroatitude, the Tutoring Project, and CEAFFRO's Quota Student Retention Project all administer study group sessions to support the student participants. Permanecer provides funding for educational improvement projects throughout the university that benefit low-income students. Again, the implication is that Permanecer funded programs will



benefit a large amount of the Afro-Brazilian student population, but such an assertion is not specified in the official language of the program. Factory of Ideas provides educational support through the intensive study program in which the participants partake. Conviver provides students with the opportunity to develop their research and writing skills through engagement in the publication process.

*Redistribution: Financial Support.* A number of the analyzed social inclusion programs at UFBA provide financial support for students. Afroatitude, the Tutoring Project, the Quota Student Retention Project, Knowledge Connections, and Permanecer all provide monthly stipends for students. Factory of Ideas provides airfare, room and board, and study materials for seminar attendees. Uniafro's teacher professional development program provides paid teaching positions for graduate students. Uniafro's discontinued quota student support program provided financial support in the form of monthly stipends, but it is not clear whether or not the new program will provide similar financial support for student participants.

*Redistribution: Quotas.* UFBA has a university wide quota policy that started in 2005. This policy is part of the vestibular program. According to the UFBA Vestibular website, 36.55 percent of spots for the incoming class are reserved for

Afro-Brazilians (pretos and pardos) who attended public schools are reserved 36.55% of the spot. Public school attendees, regardless of ethnicity or color, are reserved 6.45% of the spots and 2% of the available spots are reserved for indigenous students who attended public schools. Fifty-five percent of available spots are open to all candidates regardless of ethnicity, color, or where they attended school. Additionally, if the spots for Afro-Brazilian public school attendees or the general public school attendees' spots are not filled, they are filled first by Afro-Brazilian students who attended private schools. Any remaining spots not filled, including those reserved for indigenous students, are open to all students.

This policy is used for phase 1 and phase 2 of the vestibular. An additional preferential system is put into place for phase 2. Two spots in each course of study are reserved for students who come from traditional indigenous communities and two are reserved for students who come from traditional Afro-Brazilian quilombo communities (Universidade Federal da Bahia, 2011).

A number of the other programs, while not quota systems themselves, serve as supports to quota students. These programs include CEAFFRO's Quota System Retention Project; Uniafro's discontinued support program, and Uniafro's most recent support

program. Permanecer articulates a *preference* for quota students, and Conviver accepts students who are participants of Permanecer.

Figure 7: UFBA Social Inclusion Policies and Programs

SI/AA PROGRAM	ADMINISTRATIVE OFFICE	TYPE OF PROGRAM
Vestibular Quota System	Selection, Orientation, and Evaluation Service	Quota
Afroatitude	Color of Bahia	Educational, Cultural, Financial
Tutoring Project	Color of Bahia	Educational, Cultural, Financial
CEAFRO	CEAO	Educational, Cultural, Financial,
Uniafro	CEAO	Educational, Cultural, Financial,
Factory of Ideas	CEAO	Educational, Cultural, Financial
PIBIC-AA	PROAE	Educational, Financial
Knowledge Connections	PROAE	Educational, Cultural, Financial
Permanecer	PROAE	Educational, Cultural, Financial
Conviver	PROAE	Educational, Cultural

### *Tools*

In this section I discuss the various social inclusion policy tools utilized at UFBA to achieve the goal of Afro-Brazilian social inclusion. How are mandates, inducements, capacity building and system changes used in the analyzed policies and programs?

*Mandates.* Each of the analyzed programs has specific mandates that govern their activities, but the overarching place where mandates are being used is within the quota system. Specific numbers of places are to be reserved for select groups of applicants. The quota system also mandates that these percentage determined spots be open in all academic programs, thereby impacting the entire university. The effect of the quota mandate is more widespread than the effects of the mandates of individual programs.

*Inducements.* All of the programs offer some type of inducement to students, with the exception of the quota system and the Conviver book project. Permanecer, in addition to providing stipends to students, also uses inducements as a tool for encouraging the development of extension programs, educational activities, and support services designed to help low income and quota students. University faculty and staff apply for Permanecer funds by submitting proposals detailing how the proposed program will contribute to the social inclusion goals of UFBA.

*Capacity building.* There are a number of areas in which capacity building is used as a tool for social inclusion. The educational support programs of Uniafro, CEAfro, Knowledge Connections, Afroattitude, and the Tutoring Project all are

tasked with increasing the intellectual capacity of the undergraduate student participants. The Factory of Ideas does the same at the graduate level. The Conviver book project promotes social inclusion by providing students with the opportunity to enter the privileged domain of published authorship. Permanecer uses capacity building tools along with inducements to provide institutional resources to support the programs that are funded.

*System changes.* UFBA has undergone profound system changes within the last 13 years. The Color of Bahia was instrumental in the development of a demographic profiling system for the vestibular that paved the way for the quota system. The development of the quota system in turn led to the increased need to develop financial and educational support services for the influx of non-elite and non-middle class students. As these support programs have matured, the university has recognized the need for a centralized support system, and the Office of Student Assistance, PROAE, has been created.

### *Summary*

UFBA has made a number of steps to promote the inclusion of Afro-Brazilians into the higher education system. From the recognition work done by the Color of Bahia research program in the 1990s to the development of a university wide affirmative

action system, the university has utilized a variety of social inclusion methods.

The development of social inclusion policies at UFBA benefited from the policy climate in the nation. The Durban conference of 2001 brought the social exclusion of Afro-Brazilians into the international spotlight. This marked the first time that the country officially recognized the deep racial disparities and acknowledged that the country was not the racial democracy that had long been purported. Energized by this new focus, activists were able to put continued pressure on university officials and demand that their voices be heard.

Concurrently, actors within UFBA had been at work developing and implementing policies and practices of social inclusion. CEAQ had been engaged in scholarship and outreach since its inception in the late 1950s. The Color of Bahia, in conjunction with the federal government, had run a number of small pilot social inclusion programs. These individual units, until 2005, comprised the totality of programs specifically targeting Afro-Brazilians.

After the 2005 development of the quota system, a new institutional wide system of affirmative action was enacted. This included the quota system, which designated a certain number of spots in the incoming classes be reserved for a number

of groups, including Afro-Brazilians. The university wide system also included a more extensive financial support system as well as capacity building and educational improvement programs. These latter programs, in keeping with the earlier focus on Afro-Brazilian inclusion, were primarily targeted at quota students. Any specific reference to race was glaringly omitted, leading some actors to believe that the university wide focus was trying to step away from making social inclusion a race based policy initiative.

Connections with the Black movement were inherent in the programs of UFBA, particularly within the programs supported by CEAQ. The graduate programs of PosAfro and the Factory of Ideas, as well as the more grassroots engagement initiatives of CEAQRO and Uniafro all, to varying degrees, support and are supported by the Black movement. The next chapter further highlights how the Black movement has been a crucial component in the social inclusion policy landscape.

## Chapter 6: Social Inclusion from the Outside In: Higher Education Social Inclusion and the Black Community: Steve Biko Institute

This chapter focuses on the ways in which one community organization, the Steve Biko Institute, has been able to impact the higher education social inclusion policy context in Salvador and throughout Brazil. The chapter begins with an overview of the role that the Black movement has historically played in the development of education policies and practices, focusing particularly on the pre-vestibular movement. Following is a discussion of the development of SBI and the programs and activities that the organization and its members engage in. The policy ideology, approaches, and tools are the foci of the latter part of the analysis.

### *The Black Movement as Change Agent in Education*

As stated in Chapter 4, the Brazilian educational system historically provided few opportunities for Afro-Brazilians. During slavery, some White landowners had provided education for Black servants, as that education benefited the master. The Rio Branco Law of 1871 mandated that the children of enslaved women be set free upon adulthood and also called for the children to receive some type of education to prepare them for life after slavery, but this part of the mandate was not enforced (Gonçalves & Gonçalves e Silva, 2000). Jesuit priests owned



plantations and slaves as well. These slave-owners often provided their slaves with basic reading and catechism instruction, in order provide them with an opportunity for "moral elevation" (Gonçalves & Gonçalves e Silva ,2000, pg. 135). The slaves were not educated in order to increase their own lots in life, but for the hereafter or them being appropriately acculturated to their status in Brazilian society. During and after slavery, most Afro-Brazilians, children and adults alike, were regulated to lives of servitude. While night classes and numerous civic associations did provide some educational opportunities for Afro-Brazilians and poor people outside of the still developing state run system of education, Black educational attainment was not the primary focus of the state or of White employers. The task of educating Blacks therefore rested upon the Black community itself.

Black newspapers started developing in the early 20<sup>th</sup> century. These first newspapers focused on cultural and educational issues. A major goal of the newspapers was to encourage Afro-Brazilians to become literate so that they could share information within the community. These newspapers publicized various educational programs run by Black cultural organizations and exhorted Blacks to take advantage of them. This was a difficult task, as so many Blacks lived lives of

servitude, not too different from the lives of slaves. Afro-Brazilians were not seen, by the society at large or by Blacks themselves, as belonging in the educational sphere. The Black newspapers and the Black organizations that developed had to tackle the deeply entrenched belief of Black inferiority.

In the 1930s and 1940s, a number of large Black organizations were created. Two important organizations were the Brazilian Black Front (FNB), which was started in 1931, and the Black Experimental Theater (TEN), which was started in 1944. The FNB had political and cultural components, but also focused heavily on educational issues. The FNB, which by 1935 had 60,000 members throughout the country, had started schools to develop literacy and numeracy in the population (Johnson, 2008). These schools served not only Afro-Brazilians, but White Brazilians and immigrants as well (Gonçalves & Gonçalves e Silva, 2000). The schools received no state support, and with few resources, closed after a few years. The FNB re-organized as a political party in 1936, but was soon thwarted by the military coup and subsequent dictatorship of Vargas which banned all political parties (Johnson, 2008).

TEN used cultural and artistic products to challenge racism and discrimination. With Afro-Brazilians having been shunned from most artistic avenues, TEN created the Black theater,

providing opportunities for Black writers and actors to practice their craft and to speak out against the social ills that plagued Brazilian society. TEN also provided literacy classes for Blacks. The organization folded after the leader, Abdias Nascimento, was exiled after the military coup of 1964.

As stated in Chapter 4, political and social action in Brazil was repressed during the 1960s. Black organizations did not begin to re-group until the 1970s as popular movements began to mobilize despite the military regime. The United Black Movement (MNU) started in São Paulo, soon becoming a national organization (Carvalho, 2006; Johnson, 2008). Primarily an activist organization focused on speaking up against the mistreatment of Blacks in Brazilian society, the MNU also had an educational focus. The organization rallied against curricular materials that depicted Afro-Brazilians negatively and asserted the need for a culturally relevant curriculum, increased educational access at all levels for Afro-Brazilians and the appropriate training of teachers in order to eliminate racism in the classroom (Gonçalves & Gonçalves e Silva, 2000).

The Black movement was revitalized during the 1970s and the 1980s. Before then, the military regime's suppression of civil society had forced many activists into exile in other countries or into inactivity within Brazil. With the transition to

democratic rule came the opportunity for Afro-Brazilians to reassert themselves and collectively push for inclusion into the larger democratic project. Activists took advantage of the opening of society.

Education again became a major focus of the Black movement. By the 1970s, small numbers of Afro-Brazilians had been able to access the higher educational system in Brazil and abroad (Gonçalves & Gonçalves e Silva, 2000). As a result, these Blacks were more aware of the mechanisms of the institution and the ways in which education could be used to fight against the oppression of Blacks. Cultural groups, which had been in existence throughout the military regime, focused their efforts on battling racism and improving the educational opportunities for Black youth.

Salvador da Bahia, as the Black cultural capital of Brazil, was uniquely positioned to become a center of Black activism. The population of Bahia, particularly within the urban Salvador metropolitan area, had long been engaged in community action. Salvador had many blocos afros, afoxés, Candomble houses, and quilombo communities. A number of these organizations took on a militant stance against racism (Gonçalves & Gonçalves e Silva, 2000). These cultural based organizations focused particularly on the reconstruction of Black identity for the purpose of

developing Black autonomy and confronting racial inequality in the educational sphere (Cardoso, 2005).

By the late 1980s and early 1990s, Black organizations had begun the process of institution building. Many organizations had become NGOs and began to receive financial support from international organizations such as the Ford Foundation and UNICEF (A. Nascimento, 2007). Some groups expanded and became internationally known, such as the Geledés Institute for Black Women, whose members would figure prominently in the Durban conference. Other groups began to develop their own schools. In Salvador, Ilê Aiyê, a bloco, opened the Mãe Hilda school in 1985, and the cultural group Olodum opened the Creative School in 1991 (Cardoso, 2005).

The focus of Black organizations has broadened over time. In the early 1900s, the literacy and numeracy of Blacks just out of bondage was of highest priority. In addition, activists focused on developing a sense of pride and self-worth in Afro-Brazilians. By the 1930s Blacks had begun to openly challenge racism, but those challenges were suppressed during the military coups of the 1930s and the 1960s. In the 1970s and 1980s, Black community organizations began to mobilize yet again, this time by not only dealing with cultural legitimization, actively protesting racism, and demanding a more inclusive democracy, but

also by building their own educational institutions. Some of these, like the aforementioned schools, were focused on primary education. Other community-based educational institutions were focused on preparing students for entrance into the higher educational system, a system that still had a paucity of Afro-Brazilians. These community based educational organizations were pre-vestibulares.

Pre-vestibulares are courses that post-secondary school students take in order to prepare for the vestibular, or college entrance examination. Traditionally, middle class and upper class students have enrolled in expensive *commercial pre-vestibulares* in order to pass the exams and gain access to the free and high quality state and federal higher education systems (P. S. Filho, 2004). Poor and Afro-Brazilian students, lacking the funds to pay for the pre-vestibulares and the educational foundation to pass the vestibular without the preparation courses, were effectively excluded from the higher education system<sup>40</sup>.

Black community organizations recognized that lack of access to higher education helped to reproduce the inequalities

---

<sup>40</sup> There is a private, for profit higher education system, but again, poor students often don't have the means to pay for university study, making public institutions a more viable option.

inherent in Brazilian society. As a result of the mass discontent with the unequal social hierarchy, a number of *popular pre-vestibulares*, serving Black students, began to form throughout the country (P. S. Filho, 2004; A. Nascimento, 2007). The first was the Steve Biko Institute, which formed in Bahia in 1992, followed by the Pre-Vestibular Program for Blacks and the Poor (PVNC) in Rio de Janeiro in 1993. In 1994, the Black Consciousness Study Group of the University of São Paulo was formed in São Paulo. Zumbi dos Palmares started operating in Rio Grande do Sul in 1995, and in 1997, EDUCAFRO, an offshoot of PVNC, was formed in São Paulo (A. Nascimento, 2007).

The purpose of these organizations was two-fold; to prepare students to enter the university and to deconstruct the idea of Black inferiority (Cardoso, 2005). Just as the Black organizations of the early 20<sup>th</sup> century had to deal with societal views of Blacks and the self-image of Blacks, so did these latter 20<sup>th</sup> century organizations. Additionally, the pre-vestibulares served as nesting grounds for educating and politizing young Afro-Brazilian students.

Pre-vestibulares became a central focus of the Black Movement. These courses engaged many parts of the community, from students and their families to teachers, university instructors, and traditional militants. With students passing

the vestibulares and enrolling in public universities, the Black movement had left the purview of the Black community and had pushed into a domain from which Blacks had been formerly excluded. Not only did the courses prepare students for the college entrance exams, pre-vestibulares served as an effective social inclusion strategy that originated in the Black community. Pre-vestibulares, in essence, engaged in social inclusion from the outside in.

In the 2000s the Black movement broadened its focus once again. It was not enough that the Afro-Brazilian community had developed initiatives to improve the educational outcomes of Black youth. The Black movement, encouraged by its growing international prominence and support, began to assert strongly the need for public policies, at all levels, which explicitly would promote social inclusion for Afro-Brazilians. Activists affiliated with pre-vestibulares were part of this contingency. Students and former students, in conjunction with other members of the community, banded together to put pressure on universities, and local, state, and federal government. This pressure, coupled with the scholar activism happening in the university and the successes of the liberal Cardoso and later Lula administrations, created a context in which social



inclusion policies and programs for Afro-Brazilians could be successfully developed and implemented.

Next I will discuss the work of Steve Biko Institute, which, as the first and oldest pre-vestibular program in Brazil, has been an integral part of the Black Movement's social inclusion formulation. This section of the chapter starts with a description and brief history of SBI. Next is a discussion of the various programs run at SBI. Following is an analysis of these programs using the social inclusion conceptual framework.

### *Steve Biko Institute*

#### *Description*

Steve Biko Institute is located near the historical Pelourhino neighborhood of Salvador. SBI sits at the top of a winding, cobblestone hill, across from a large church and convent called the Covento do Carmen, a major tourist attraction. Depending on the time of the year, you can hear the sounds of drum corps practicing for tourists or *pagode* music pumping from the radios of nearby homes or passing cars. During the festival seasons of Carnaval and St. João, you may hear the occasional firecrackers being shot in quick succession and louder more bomb-like contraptions being ignited.

During the rainy season, the steep cobblestone hills become slick and nearly impassable. While Brazil is rarely tormented with hurricanes, the torrential rains claim hundreds of lives via mudslides and flooding every year. Bahia is not spared these tragic occurrences. But in the old town area of Salvador, the festivities continue in good times and bad, during rainstorms or sunny days.

SBI is located on the top floor of a large building that also houses the Dutch Consulate and another community organization. Bikudos, as members of the Biko community are called, are found all along the area. Congregating around the building are young people dressed in school uniforms or Biko Institute shirts and wearing locks, afros and braids, older men and women of the Black movement, often adorned often with African prints or message t-shirts telling of their political alliances, and the occasional tourist, often African American or White American, interested in the work of SBI.

Upon entering the Institute, you must first climb two sets of steep steps; there is no accessibility for those unable to complete the climb. A barred door, manned by a security guard, must be buzzed and then opened. To the right there is a large open room with two or three computers and a number of cables for wired internet access. To the left is a receptionist desk and

staff work area, and beyond that, the main classroom. A water cooler, a few chairs, and men's and women's restroom facilities are along a narrow corridor, but basically, SBI consists of three rooms. Looking out the windows, which are screenless, as most in Brazil are, you can see the marina and lower city in one direction, and the neighborhood in the other. This high top ocean view gives a spectacular display at dusk; it is the only place where many of these students can see such an idyllic sight. While common for tourists and the middle and upper classes who predominate the area, the view is a sight to behold for the students who mostly live in the highly concentrated working class and poorer areas of the inner city, where for miles around you see favelas and, in the distance, the high rise apartments of the more well off. It is in this small space where the students are not only able to see a different vista, but where they are also given the opportunity to envisage life beyond their current circumstances. For the past 18 years, over 1,000 Afro-Brazilian students have been prepared to enter institutions of higher education at SBI.

Steve Biko Institute was founded in 1992 by young student activists in the Black Movement. These university students, a number pursuing graduate education, recalled the difficulties that they had encountered throughout their educational careers.

They realized also, that the paucity of Afro-Brazilians in higher education needed to be remedied and that that remedy would first have to come from the Black community. Using the South African anti-apartheid activist Steven Biko as their inspiration, the activists began offering free pre-vestibular training courses. Over the course of eighteen years, the work of SBI has expanded. Currently, there are numerous programs being offered at the SBI.

### *SBI Programs*

CCN. Citizenship and Black Consciousness (CCN) is an integral part of SBI. CCN pedagogy is seen throughout all of the SBI programs. The students are regularly engaged in discussions related to the "Black situation", including police brutality, African and African Diasporan history and culture, and racial discrimination (G. Nascimento, 2007).

CCN was developed as a curriculum to help educate Afro-Brazilians about their history and their place in society. Through CCN, Bikudos, the name given to students involved in SBI programs, are taught self-esteem and self-respect, and are given a voice with which to demand their rights as Brazilians and as humans (Cardoso, 2008). Formal CCN classes are held weekly, and are required parts of the pre-vestibular course curriculum. Throughout the year, students are provided with opportunities to

participate in debates, research, lectures, and the production of texts, all focused on aspects of Black consciousness raising. This curriculum is similar to the types of courses and curriculum provided in U.S. Afrocentric schools and grassroots educational programs. In fact, much of the focus of CCN is on the development of a pan-national, Black identity. Curricular topics include, in addition to Afro-Brazilian history and contemporary life, examinations of the U.S. Civil Rights and Black Power movements and the anti-apartheid struggles in South Africa.

The formal CCN classes are divided into four units. During Unit 1, Integration, Orientation, and Motivation, students are provided an orientation to institutional objectives, develop cooperative learning skills, engage in activities to build self-esteem, and begin to discuss prospective career paths. Unit 2 is titled Consciousness and Redemption of Afro-Brazilian Culture. Additionally, in this unit, Bikudos learn about the history of Africa and the African Diaspora, begin to critically analyze the history of Brazil, are introduced to various afro-descendant heroes and leaders, and specifically learn about the life of Steve Biko. There is also discussion of the use of religion as a form of resistance. Unit 3 is titled Citizenship and Human Rights. In this unit, students learn about racial legislation

through the history of Brazil, human rights, citizenship, the use of education as an emancipatory tool, racial inequality in Brazil, and other social issues that impact Blacks, including violence, drugs, health, gender, and sexuality. Unit 4 is the summary portion of CCN, where students present research projects and participate in various end of the course recreational activities (Dantas, 2001). An SBI administrator discusses the purpose for creating CCN:

We create a new discipline; the name is CCN, Citizenship and Black Consciousness. This discipline stimulates the students to ...it stimulates their self-esteem. So, you talk about the experience of the Black movement around the world, the US, you talk about the history of KKK, Malcolm X, you have people watch films, you talk about the status of the Black movement, the insurgency of the black movement during the slave trade, after the slave trade, you improve the students. You give back the humanity of these students. You attack our humanity, so we decide to give it back. How do you give it back? When you talk about the experience, our experience, when you talk about our ancestry, you open your mind, you open windows, for the new. So the process, you talk about the traditional material or disciplines, but you include the new discipline, CCN. (Interviewee 208, 2010)

A former student who was involved in the protests at UFBA describes how CCN motivated Bikudos to participate.

So I was taking classes. This was during the time that the students in Brazil decided to do a demonstration. We wanted affirmative action at the Federal University of Bahia. So it was a political group. We also had a class called Citizenship and Black Consciousness, CCN. I was in this class and we were talking about the social problems in Salvador.

And it was in this social context that the students were thinking about the need for affirmative action implementation at UFBA. The students from Steve Biko decided to go there and do a demonstration with the students at UFBA. So it was together that we did demonstration to go to the Federal University of Bahia and demand affirmative action. No professors from the Steve Biko Institute told us to go there, but because of taking CCN we realized that it was the right thing to do. (Interviewee 205, 2010)

Another former student, sharing in an interview published in the SBI newsletter, *Bikodisse*, describes the importance of the CCN classes:

The initial importance of CCN was my awakening from a dream called racial democracy in Brazil. Prior to this contact, I suffered certain actions that would lower my esteem, but I hesitated to unite against racism. Through the CCN, I was able to learn about the ancestral values of my people, discovering my true story and recovering my self-esteem. I also was able to strengthen their political struggle and the fight against racism. (Instituto Steve Biko, 2010b)

CCN is taught throughout the programs at SBI. As stated before, there is a component of CCN taught weekly in the Oguntec program. A teacher at SBI explains the importance of CCN for Oguntec students.

I think the main benefit is giving them self-esteem. They realize that we are not like the ones on the television shows. Because we have a history, we were robbed and they tried to keep us in the same place. We have to overcome this whole environment of domination and exclusion and it is more serious than we can think because this social exclusion kills people. It takes the air, it takes our opportunities. Being at Steve Biko gives them consciousness in terms of values. I think the second contribution is in terms of education because the Institute says all the time

that education is a way to be free in this society. These students are supported by the Institute to get a high education and also to come back and teach the others. (Interviewee 201, 2010)

*Pre-vestibular.* The pre-vestibular program is the first and the longest running of the Biko programs. Every January, SBI begins the process of selecting the pre-vestibular participants. Candidates must complete an application form, take a skills test, and undergo an interview process. For the most recent pre-vestibular class, 60 spaces were made available (Biko, 2011). The selected students attend classes six evenings a week for six months. The students receive instruction in Biology, Physics, Chemistry, Geography, History, English, Literature, Writing, and CCN (Biko, 2001).

A former student, who took part in the pre-vestibular but did not get accepted into UFBA or the state university that the student applied to, explains the challenges that SBI tries to help students overcome:

What happened is, because we have 12 years in the public educational system, we really don't learn much. All of these years we don't really learn what we're supposed to learn, so in one year, I learned so much. Everything that I was supposed to learn in high school and in middle school. We understand that it is not enough time, but Steve Biko Institute tries to close the gap of 12 years of the deficient public educational system. We have some good professors at Steve Biko Institute, professors who are dedicated to



teaching us, but you have to recognize that the time is not enough. You don't have enough time to learn everything that you were supposed to learn. We have deficiencies in math that start in 1st grade and continue on to 12th grade. So Steve Biko tries to close the gap. They do their best to try to make sure that when we take the exam, you're in a good position to compete with those who learned what they were supposed to learn from the first grade, those who went to private school. The Institute tries, taking into consideration that we're far behind. (Interviewee 205, 2010)

This interviewee was able to eventually overcome educational deficiencies and later became a math tutor at SBI. He received an undergraduate degree from an American college and is currently enrolled in an MBA program in the United States (Personal communication, 2010).

*Oguntec.* Oguntec is a college preparatory program at SBI. Students are selected from the Salvador area and participate in the program for three years; their 1st through 3rd years of high school. After their 3rd year, they are then able to continue on to the pre-vestibular course. The purpose of Oguntec is to prepare students for entrance into the STEM fields. One of the issues that Biko tries to deal with is the poor quality schools. Administrators realize that the pre-vestibular courses train the students for the entrance examination, but that it is often difficult to accomplish due to the poor quality of education in the public primary and secondary schools. So, the administrators decided to develop and implement a program that would enable

them to reach students earlier, thereby having to do less remediation later. Also, it was deemed necessary that Afro-Brazilian students study in the *high prestige* areas of medicine, engineering, business, and science. An administrator explains this focus:

We have helped send more than one thousand students to the university, in various areas. But, this is not enough. The majority of our students were sitting for the vestibular in humanities, geography, history, education. But we also want our students to go into engineering, medicine, chemistry, physical science. Because our students aren't given the foundation that they need in the public schools. In the middle school, when they really need to get preparation for the subjects, they don't have teachers in these subjects. They don't have quality teachers in math, science. So, if they don't have the teacher, what are they to do? They can't pass the vestibular in these areas. But, in this institute, we wanted to deal with this. So, we started Oguntec. (Interviewee 202, 2010)

The students take courses in physics, chemistry, biology, math, Portuguese, English, and history. They have classes for three hours every day, six days a week. This is in addition to their half day high school course load.

The students are selected after completing an application and undergoing an interview process. According to an Oguntec instructor, it is not always the most academically prepared student that is selected:

There is an application process. The students fill out the form. And then they are interviewed by the Institute, by some people in the Institute, and the

Institute tries to select the ones who really need it. They select the ones who really need the education and who really need to get their self-esteem improved. The Institute isn't looking at the educational level, sometimes they prefer to help the ones who really need it, in terms of self-esteem too. That is why I say sometimes it's hard to deal with them. Because if you get the best ones, you get more results, but on the other hand, the Institute prefers to work with the ones who really need it. As sometimes I talk about it during the teachers' meeting, how can we put these students in the university when we have half of them who aren't studying? We see they are not studying. But the Institute is not trying to select like the capitalists do, in terms of competing and only taking the best. The Institute is interested in helping those in terms of their needs. (Interviewee 201, 2010)

An administrator agrees confirms this assertion. When asked whether or not SBI seeks out the strongest students, the administrator responded:

No. No. For example, many of the students in Oguntec have problems. Right now, in the Black community, it is really sad because it is really difficult, because of the pessimistic views and identities of the youth. The most difficult problems are, for example, self-esteem, they don't believe in themselves. Plus, they don't know any adults who have ever sat for the vestibular. It's really serious. But they leave the Institute believing in their potential, believing in themselves. They believe that nothing can defeat them. (Interviewee 202, 2010)

Students are only allowed to remain in the program if they pass their public school classes and attend the Oguntec courses regularly. Attrition because of poor academic performance does occur. There are also those students who withdraw from classes

because of home situations or other issues. According to one administrator:

Many of the young people stop participating in the program because they have to help support their families. They have to make a choice between a job and the program. Or they don't have transportation. Or they are in a serious situation like hunger or malnutrition. Or they have lots of siblings; they are part of a large family and few finances. So they leave the program. (Interviewee 202, 2010)

An instructor recounts on such circumstance. "And also, there is one student (name redacted). She left the program because her mother told her, "You have to work. You must work for your living. You have to stop going to the Steve Biko Institute because you have to work during the afternoon" (Interviewee 201, 2010). But there are also success stories. An administrator shares one:

Three years is not enough, but three years you have a good performance. You have different changes in the students, in the family, and in the school. Because they continue their studies at the same time, so you have two students, three students back in the public school, helping others. A guy here who is 17 years old, he passed into two public universities, and we have another student, he's 16 years old, he passed into the electrical engineering (course) in the private school. In June he went to New York to talk about his experiences in front of an audience of four hundred people, because an organization supported his program, the World Fund, in New York. (Interviewee 108, 2008)

### *Other Courses at SBI*

SBI also runs a number of other projects. Open Doors, Open Minds (Pompa) was a project funded by the Kellogg Foundation that trained Afro-Brazilian university students to become public sector professionals. According to the SBI website:

(Pompa is a) program for the academic and professional development of young African descendants with the potential to exercise leadership, assuring them of their connection to ancient principles and preparing them for entry into careers in the public sector, third sector, and corporate sector in solidarity. The idea is that these young people are to become advocates of rights, influencing public policy makers and social actions that contribute to the development of the Black population. (Instituto Steve Biko, 2010d)

An administrator explains the history of the program:

We developed this program with Dr. Williams, an African American from Yale or Harvard. He developed this program and we have 70 students a year. We prepare the students to develop leadership. Students stay for a semester after graduation. Each session we have 21 students or so. It is so important because you talk about how you can speak in public, the economy, reality, we talk about the racial problem, not only in Brazil but around the Diaspora. We contact different professionals to come here like Edson Santos, Carlos Moore, and they give a class for these students. It opens minds. The idea is you prepare the students for NGOs, public service, and social entrepreneurship. This is the idea. It is a program to develop the leaders. (Interviewee 108, 2008)

A former Pompa student explains in a *Bikodisse* interview how Pompa benefited her:

Pompa gave me political leadership skills. It gave me the ability to think critically, a belief in collective dreams, tools for setting career goals, and

sparked in me the idea of creating a student group. Finally, it created in me a sense of unconditional loyalty to Black people and a social mission to demand not only racial equality, but also reparations, in response to the massacre of Africans. After the formation of Pompa, wherever I go, I take a black eye and bad temper against the colonial racism and its facets. (Instituto Steve Biko, 2010a)

An administrator shares another story of how Pompa students have been successful:

As a result of this program, some of the students formed the group *Media Etnica*, that works in the Black community. The directors are former students of Pompa. Some others are involved in various businesses or working with public officials. SEPROMI<sup>41</sup>, the Secretariat for Women, etc. (Interviewee 202, 2010)

The SBI Morehouse program is an ongoing partnership with Morehouse College, a historically Black men's college located in Atlanta, GA. To date, Morehouse has provided three students from SBI with full scholarships to attend. Those three students graduated in spring of 2010, and two of them are now pursuing graduate degrees at U.S. higher education institutions. In the fall of 2011, four more male Bikudos will be attending Morehouse.

In order to qualify for the scholarship competition, the students must have shown consistent participation in one or more of the SBI programs and be recommended for participation in the competition by a SBI staff member. The prospective students

---

<sup>41</sup> Bahian Secretariat for the Promotion of Equality

attend intensive English classes two to three times a week. The chosen students will not be required to sit for the TOEFEL test, the English test often given to students from other countries who want to attend U.S. higher education institutions. However, the chosen students must be able to demonstrate proficiency in written and spoken English.

SBI also ran an outreach program which taught Bikudos how to share their knowledge of CCN, through cultural activities, with young people in their communities. This program, titled Human Rights and Anti-Racism Youth Development (commonly referred to as Human Rights and Anti-Racism) was financed and supported by the Department of Justice. Seventy youth from SBI between the ages of 16 and 21 participated in the five month program, but a total of 300 Afro-Brazilian youth were impacted by the outreach mission (Personal communication, 2010). This program did not have a specific college preparation or support component.

SBI is an integral part of the Black movement both in Bahia and nationwide. SBI partners with other community educational organizations to form the group FOQUIBA, which is comprised of "educational quilombos". The goal of FOQUIBA is to provide a

network through which the seven member institutions<sup>42</sup> can act collectively to promote racial equality in the educational sphere and throughout society. To date, FOQUIBA has sponsored numerous seminars and conferences where participants are able to share best practices and related information (Fórum de Quilombos Educacionais da Bahia, 2011).

Figure 8: SBI Social Inclusion Programs

SI PROGRAM	OBJECTIVE	TARGET PARTICIPANTS
CCN	Develop a Black consciousness	Pre-vestibular students
OGUNTEC	Prepare students to study in STEM fields	High school students
Pre-Vestibular Program	Prepare students to take the vestibular	High school seniors and graduates
Pompa	Prepare students to become public sector professionals	University students
Morehouse Program	Prepare students to study at Morehouse College in Atlanta, GA	Male Bikudos
FOQUIBA	Develop a network of social inclusion oriented community educational organizations	Area <i>educational quilombos</i>

---

<sup>42</sup> The current Foquiba member institutions are: Curso Dom Climério de Vitória da Conquista-BA, Curso de Cruzdas Almas-BA, Curso Milton Santos, Curso Pré Vestibular Alternativo Coequilombo, Curso Alternativo Santa Terezinha, Curso Pré-Vestibular Irmã Bahkita, Instituto Cultural Steve Biko, Quilombo Asantewaa, and Quilombo do OROBU.



## *Analysis of Steve Biko Institute Programs using the Conceptual Framework*

In this section, I will use the conceptual framework to analyze the social inclusion ideologies, approaches, and tools that are utilized by the Steve Biko Institute. I will discuss to what extent Biko social inclusion programs are neo-structural, social justice or transformation focused. I will examine the approaches (cultural legitimization, recognition, redistributive) that are used to promote social inclusion. I will also examine which policy tools (mandates, inducements, capacity building, system changes) are used by SBI.

### *Policy Ideologies*

The three policy ideologies that are discussed in this project are neo-structural, social justice, and social transformation. While the federal government and UFBA social inclusion policies and practices encapsulated elements of neo-structural, social justice, and transformative ideologies, SBI's programs exemplify an explicit social transformation policy ideology. That ideology is encapsulated in CCN.

All of the programs are based in the philosophy of CCN. Using CCN, SBI is able to develop the self-esteem and positive self-identity of young, poor, Black students. They are able to

see themselves, and by extension, their community, in a positive light. From there, CCN connects the students to the greater African diaspora and the worldwide fight against racism and oppression. SBI uses CCN to cultivate a sense of pride and agency in young people. This is an important step, as this prepares Bikudos, psychologically and socially, to deal with entering into and being successful in higher education institutions. In this sense, SBI is not only interested in preparing students to access and participate in the current institutional structures. Bikudos, through CCN, are given the foundational tools necessary to begin to think critically about and to challenge these structures as they exist currently. Social inclusion policies and practices that focus (in addition to access and participation) on cultural relevancy, citizen engagement and empowerment, and institutional change, are guided by a social transformation ideology (Gidley, et al., 2010). It is through CCN that this ideology is articulated.

The academic programs of SBI are shaped by transformative ideologies as well, but outside of the CCN focus, these programs concentrate on preparing students to access and successfully participate in higher education institutions. Pompa, the Pre-vestibular Program, the Morehouse Program, and Oguntec focus on strengthening the academic skills of the student participants.

As the interviewees have stated, the students who come to SBI are often not academically strong, due to the substandard public education that the students have received. But SBI focuses on providing all of the academic support that the Institute can.

The students who become the most successful dedicate themselves to taking full advantage of the academic opportunities provided by SBI. They give credit to SBI with positively changing their lives and are often dedicated to providing assistance to SBI by becoming teachers and tutors themselves. Many of these former Biko students have also started study and activist groups in the higher education institutions that they attend, continuing in those institutions the social transformation process that started with SBI.

### *Policy Approaches*

In this section, I discuss the various social inclusion policy approaches (cultural legitimization, recognition, redistribution) undertaken at SBI. To review, cultural legitimization approaches affirm and/or support the development of cultural practices, spaces, and knowledge. Recognition approaches gather pertinent information about policy targets. Redistribution approaches restructure space, finances, materials, and other resources in order to benefit the socially

excluded. In this analysis, redistribution approaches take three forms: educational improvement, financial support, and quotas.

*Cultural legitimization.* Afro-Brazilian and African Diasporan cultural appreciation is an integral part of SBI. Students are introduced to these cultural materials in CCN and academic classes. Activists and academics regularly give lectures sponsored by SBI. In addition, SBI participates in Carnival by sponsoring a bloco. Carnaval blocos have different themes, and the SBI blocos merge the traditional Bahian carnival activities with social awareness activities. The theme for 2010 was "Steve Biko Institute: 18 years of Citizenship and Black Consciousness" (Instituto Steve Biko, 2010c).

*Recognition.* SBI is currently engaged in a documentation process. The campaign is entitled, "One Thousand Unbreakable Bikudos" (Instituto Steve Biko, 2011). The goal is to collect information on the current educational and employment situations of the more than 1,000 students who have participated in SBI programs throughout the past 19 years. Former students are asked to submit education and employment information using an online form. The administrators of SBI hope to use this data when grant writing to help secure additional funds from the government and international NGOs (Personal communication, 2010).

*Redistribution: Educational improvement.* SBI conducts a number of educational improvement programs aimed at helping Afro-Brazilian students to gain access to higher education institutions. The Pre-vestibular Program is the oldest program. This program provides six months' worth of classes and upon completion of the program, students take vestibulares for the institutions and the subjects that they chose. Oguntec is a more recent program that targets high school students. For three years these students take classes at SBI. The goal of this program is to prepare students to successfully take vestibulares in math, science, and technology fields. Pompa is a discontinued program that focused on preparing Afro-Brazilian university students for careers in the public sector. Students received career development training and coaching on public speaking, social entrepreneurship, and other leadership skills. The Morehouse Program provides students with English reading, writing and speaking classes so that they can potentially attend Morehouse College in the United States.

*Redistribution: Financial support.* SBI is not able to provide much financial support for students. Oguntec students used to receive a small stipend, but that is no longer provided. Oguntec students do receive money for transportation and lunch. According to one interviewee, a government agency provides

scholarships for pre-vestibular students who cannot afford the modest fees (Interviewee 202, 2010). Morehouse College provides all of the funding for the students selected to attend the college.

*Redistribution: Quotas.* SBI was very influential in the struggle for social inclusion policies and programs (particularly quotas) at UFBA and across the country. Students and former students were part of the Black Student Movement that protested at UFBA. A SBI administrator was part of the Committee for Quotas that drafted the current UFBA social inclusion program. That same administrator was also part of a Bahian delegation of activists that participated in the 2010 public hearing on affirmative action that was televised across Brazil.

### *Policy Tools*

In this section, I discuss the policy tools (mandates, inducements, capacity building, system changes) utilized by SBI to achieve the goal of Afro-Brazilian social inclusion in higher education. Mandates are the rules or procedures by which policy beneficiaries and targets are expected to comply. Inducements are monetary transfers that are administered to institutions or individuals in order to further the goal of social inclusion. Capacity building tools are used to invest in resources (material, intellectual, and/or human) for specific outcomes.

System changes alter the resource delivery system by changing or creating new pathways.

*Mandates.* SBI has a few mandates to which participants are expected to comply. All participants are expected to attend program sessions regularly and on time. Oguntec students have to pass their high school classes or else they will be dropped from the program. Morehouse program participants have to be involved in some other aspect of the SBI, either as a volunteer, a program participant, or a former participant.

*Inducements.* Because of the limited financial resources, SBI provides few inducements to further its social inclusion goals. Assistance from governmental agencies and NGOs allows for some financial resources to be distributed to staff and students, mainly to pay for food and transportation.

*Capacity building.* SBI uses the capacity building tool in a profound manner. Through CCN, the program develops in students the positive self-concept needed to realize their human potential. SBI invests in students' intellectual resources by providing them with a quality education, providing remediation as needed, but also challenging students and pushing them to attempt studies in the high prestige STEM areas. SBI also encourages students to study English, acknowledging it as a

language of power, a tool that can be used to help students reach future goals.

*System changes.* SBI acts as a system change agent by creating by a pathway in the educational landscape for poor Afro-Brazilian youth to receive the supplemental education necessary for them to be accepted into and succeed in higher education. SBI was one of the first community based pre-vestibular programs in the country. The work of SBI has been replicated in Bahia and throughout Brazil. SBI and the Bikudos have also influenced social inclusion policy at local higher education institutions, namely UFBA. As stated before, UFBA, being a pioneer of social inclusion initiatives has in turn influenced the policies and practices of higher education institutions throughout the country. The work of SBI has helped to influence the higher education social inclusion policy landscape around the country.

#### *Summary*

Initiatives that came from the Black community were critical to the development of social inclusion in Brazil. Long before universities or the federal government worked to get Afro-Brazilian students access to primary, secondary, or higher education institutions, the Black movement was making gains.



Education was seen as an imperative if Afro-Brazilians were ever going to move beyond subservient status in society.

The progress of Black organizations was negatively impacted by years of dictatorships, which severely dampened the ability of all civil society organizations, including ones that fought racism, to push their agendas. Only after the country's return to democratic rule in the 1980s did the Black movement begin to make considerable gains in numbers and influence.

For the past 20 years, the Black movement has been able to influence policy and impact the development of new educational initiatives at the community, the university, and the government levels. Most of this policy influence was gained through the development of pre-vestibular programs. These programs have worked to provide access to higher education by allowing Afro-Brazilian students the opportunity to take the pre-vestibular course necessary for successfully passing through the gate keeping vestibular exam. In this way, pre-vestibulares are system change agents, creating a new pathway for higher education social inclusion.

The influence of these pre-vestibulares is not only as a pathway. As the discussion of SBI indicates, pre-vestibulares work to politicize students and strengthen their self-esteem. These students then go on to enter the university not satisfied

with the status quo. They go in with a sense of purpose, expecting to not only receive an education and be successful personally, but to also open the doors of the ivory towers to other students, and to use whatever tools and knowledge that they acquire to work toward dismantling racism. The pre-vestibular programs have created a generation of young, educated, Black activists who see it as their mission to transform society.

This study has examined the higher education social inclusion policy landscape at the federal, university, and community levels. Throughout my investigation numerous people asked me which level I thought had influenced social inclusion the most. The goal of this research project was not to answer that question quantitatively, but to examine the ways in which each level had contributed to the policy climate. In the next chapter, I discuss the three areas in conjunction. In addition to this summary of findings, I offer implications for social inclusion policy research and practice as well as the limitations of the study and areas for future research in the Brazilian context.

## *Chapter 7: Conclusions*

The purpose of this study was to describe and explain the socio-historical context surrounding higher education social inclusion policies that target Afro-Brazilians, as well as to examine the policy ideologies, approaches, and tools that predominate at the federal, university, and community levels. Each area has a unique but connected policy trajectory that I wanted to analyze separately in order to ascertain the similarities and differences in the ways in which policy actors at each level were able to promote social inclusion.

I embarked on this investigation because I was interested in better understanding how a country with a long history of denying the racial inequalities embedded in society could so quickly change course and become a champion for celebrating the promotion of social inclusion. This was especially compelling to me as a citizen of a country whose society has yet to fully deal with its slave society past and has recently declared itself to be post-race, even as blatant racial inequalities persist. While I have not been able to encapsulate the totality of what has historically and recently occurred in Brazil, I have been able to provide an analysis of the situation to date, an analysis that can be expanded upon or applied to other contexts in Brazil

or other countries grappling with issues of race and inequality in education and other social spheres.

This is not to say that Brazil has solved the problems of the past. Vast inequalities are still evident throughout Brazilian society. In fact, one criticism of higher education social inclusion policies and programs is that only a select few are able to benefit from them. The majority of Afro-Brazilian youth still do not enter higher education institutions. In order for the society to become truly equitable, current social inclusion programs will have to continue. It is not clear whether this will happen, considering the amount of dissent coming from elite members of Brazilian society who see race based social inclusion measures as an intrusive and unwarranted import from North America.

While inequality still persists, it would be erroneous to discount the progress that has occurred in such a short amount of time. Brazil, in the past decade in particular, has shown that civil society and governmental focus will be given to the issue of social inclusion in general, and the inclusion of Afro-Brazilians into the realm of higher education in particular. There is an active push to include Afro-Brazilians into the larger democratic project.

## *Summary of Findings and Implications for Research and Practice*

This research contributes to the ongoing study of social inclusion initiatives in Brazil and throughout Latin America. As the region becomes more influential on the world economic and political stage, increased attention and resources are being directed at lifting social excluded people out of poverty and into all aspects of society. As Bello and Rangel (2002) state, there is a growing understanding that:

...overcoming discrimination based on ethnicity and race is part of the task of building a citizenship option that can ensure respect for collective rights and bring better living conditions...the scale of the problems facing these [excluded] populations is a source of challenges not just for the market, but also for democracy and State reform, which means there needs to be active commitment by the region's governments. (Bello and Rangel, 2002, p. 76)

The governments of many Latin American countries recognize the "...uneasy co-existence of political democracy and social exclusion..." (Roberts, 2007; 10) and populist movements are affirming the need for more inclusive democracies (Recondo, 2008). The societal expectations of citizenship and state responsibility are increasing (Scalon & Cano, 2008), and groups such as Afro-descendants, indigenous people, women, youth, and the poor are participating in the states' policy development and implementation processes, not just as policy targets, but as stakeholders with voices and political power. This research project shows how these changes have occurred in Brazil, and how

Afro-Brazilians have taken advantage of the shifting political climate and are beginning to gain access as well as create social change.

The policy and programmatic change that has happened in Brazil represent a national system that started informally and disjointedly but has recently begun to more formally coalesce. Dani and Haan (2008) outline the general elements of a national social inclusion policy, which include: systems of recognition and inequality data collection, stakeholder participation, laws and programs targeting inclusion for specific groups, monitoring and evaluation systems, and institutional arrangements and cooperation. By focusing my research on higher education policy in Brazil, I am able contribute to the research on social inclusion in Latin America by illustrating one aspect of a national social inclusion policy as it has developed over a relatively short period of time.

The policy analysis portion of this study looked at three areas: the ideologies, approaches, and tools used to promote social inclusion for Afro-Brazilians in higher education. I found that in all three spheres, federal, university, and community, the overarching goals were similar. These goals, however, were encased in different ideologies and rhetoric. The necessity to develop and implement programs that specifically

targeted Blacks was explicit in the federal documentation and in the data collected from the Federal University of Bahia (UFBA) and the Steve Biko Institute (SBI). All the institutions expressed an understanding that racial exclusion and discrimination is a problem. There was no language to suggest that adopting class focused measures instead of race based measures would be advantageous. However, the ideology, approaches, and tools of the race based social inclusion measures did vary.

Neo-structural policies and programs attempt to level the playing field for specific groups that have been discriminated against because of the historical and contemporary structure of society. The policy goal for neo-structural policies and programs is to improve access for and the social capital of the policy targets, as well as economic growth for the country. A redistribution of resources is often the approach that such policies and programs take. Educational and financial resources are focused on the target group, and space is opened up so that the target group has access. This is evidenced by the policy activity at the federal level as well as at UFBA. Inducements were provided to Afro-Brazilian students and those institutions that serve them. Tutoring programs were a major part of the social inclusion agenda at both levels. Quota policies, also,

were utilized, leading to a system changing aperture in the higher educational system through which Afro-Brazilians gained access.

Social justice policy and programs attempt to engage with the target group as group members are brought into the educational system. The policy goal for social justice policies and programs analyzed in this study was to increase the participation and engagement of Afro-Brazilians in higher education. In addition to redistribution approaches, cultural legitimizing approaches were often used to attain this policy goal. The Racial Equality Statute used mandates as a tool for incorporating Afro-Brazilian history and culture into the national pedagogy. The Conviver Book Project at UFBA and a number of other programs (Afroatitude, Knowledge Connections, Permanacer) aimed to build the capacity of the students so that they could use their cultural knowledge and backgrounds as strengths as they engaged intellectually within the university.

Social transformation policy and programs came primarily from the Afro-Brazilian community. Instead of being policy targets, they acted as policy developers and implementers, demanding to be included into the higher education system. Social transformation policies and programs use all of the approaches and tools available to promote social inclusion.



Social transformation programs focus heavily on cultural legitimization, as evidenced by the Black Consciousness and Culture (CCN) curriculum at SBI and the use of Black intellectuals and activists as experts in UFBA's CEAfro and Uniafro programs.

Social transformation policies and programs use system change tools, not just to increase access, but to change the structure and climate of the university. The UFBA Color of Bahia research program used data, a recognition approach, to begin the system change process. Prior to the Color of Bahia's work, no data had been collected on student demographics. The Color of Bahia not only provided the pro-quota activists with the data needed to support their demands, the research program also provided other universities across the country with a blueprint with which other higher educational institutions could start their own social inclusion processes.

Understanding the ideologies, approaches, and tools encapsulated in social inclusion policies and programs is important as policy actors continue to work on development and implementation. Social transformation cannot be achieved without the active participation of the Afro-Brazilian community. Their involvement in policy and practice must not be at the periphery. In addition, the federal government and individual universities

and colleges must institutionalize inclusion measures through mandates and support these measures with inducements and capacity building inputs. There is no one level that is more important than the others when it comes to achieving Afro-Brazilian higher education social inclusion. All of the policy actors, coming from different ideologies and utilizing various tools and approaches, have a role to play in making the Brazilian racial democracy myth a social reality in the 21<sup>st</sup> century.

The conceptual framework used in this research study is unique, having been crafted from three different conceptual and theoretical frameworks. The policy ideology theoretical framework (Gidley, et al., 2010) is relatively new and has, to date, not been applied to many policy contexts. I was able to demonstrate the usefulness of the framework and its applicability to educational policy research. Combining Hopenhayn's social inclusion conceptual framework (2008), which has most often been applied to Latin American countries' contexts, with McDonnell and Elmore's policy tool framework (1987), which has most often been applied to U.S. educational contexts, allowed for a richly illustrative analysis of the ways in which Brazil has focused on specific goals (informed by the policy ideology) and utilized policies and programmatic action

to achieve those goals. This conceptual framework can be useful to other researchers interested in the connections between social inclusion policy articulation and actualization.

### *Limitations*

There are a number of limitations in this study. Even though I had intended to travel to Brasília, the capital of Brazil, in order to meet with federal officials and get additional information about the federal policy context, I was not able to do so. The bulk of my analysis at the federal level consisted of policy documents, and there is always risk when using official documents to explain a policy situation (look for citation).

I had a different limitation with regards to the analyses of UFBA and SBI. I was able to interview a number of policy actors, but there were limited official documents to procure. Both institutions are in the process of compiling more official data on their respective policies and programs. But as one interviewee stated, the focus has been on implementation, not on documentation. The compiling of data about these programs is seen as necessary, and both institutions are making efforts to procure better records of the work that is being done.

While there are a lot of similarities between the initiatives that are taking place in Salvador da Bahia and other cities across the country, the reality is that Salvador is unique in a number of ways. The nucleus of the Black movement is in Salvador, which allows for the work of SBI and UFBA to be better received and supported by the community. Race focused social inclusion initiatives have not been as well received in all parts of the country. The uniqueness of the Salvador context makes it hard to fully extrapolate to the country as a whole.

This is not to say that the study provides no insight to the development of Afro-Brazilian targeted higher education social inclusion throughout Brazil. I have shown that such initiatives are currently in place at universities and in community organizations throughout the country. The analysis of the federal Racial Equality Statute highlights the multitudes of governmental, civil societal, and other institutional social inclusion initiatives that are in place throughout Brazil, in education as well as other spheres. I do, however, acknowledge that context matters, and the Salvador vantage point is unique.

#### *Areas for Future Research*

The Brazilian higher education social inclusion policy context is fluid and fast moving. A number of new circumstances have come into place that could change the course of the current

initiatives. In January 2011, Dilma Rousseff became Brazil's first female president. As a former member of the Lula administration, it is widely believed that she will continue to follow the social justice path forged by her predecessor, but it remains to be seen. The Rousseff administration has a new federal policy, the Racial Equality Statute, with which to shape the racial social inclusion landscape of the country. Future research will uncover how this statute is interpreted and implemented throughout Brazil.

UFBA is undergoing change as well. The newly renamed Office of Affirmative Action and Student Assistance (PROAE) is rapidly become the center of social inclusion efforts at the university. While still providing special support to Afro-Brazilian students, this support is not explicit as it is in other parts of the university, namely the Center for Afro-Asiatic Studies (CEAO). Will UFBA, a trailblazing institution in the history of race based affirmative action measures in Brazil, begin to focus less on racial inclusion and more on economic inclusion? How will the programs administered by CEAO converge with or diverge from the overall university initiatives? Additionally, what will be the fate of UFBA's quota policy when the current one expires in 2015? Future research will be able to uncover the answers to these questions.

Steve Biko Institute (SBI) has been central to the development of Brazil's social inclusion initiatives. As the first community based popular pre-vestibular, SBI paved the way for similar institutions throughout the country. Pre-vestibulares are a mechanism through which the Black movement is able to affect change, to promote social inclusion from the outside in. The study highlighted the history of the institution and also discussed to some degree the impact that SBI has had on the policy landscape and the lives of students. As more data becomes available, through the 1000 Unbreakable Bikudos and other SBI initiatives, researchers will be able to better ascertain that impact.

At this point in history, Brazil is attempting to redefine what a racial democracy is and should be. 2011 is the United Nations Year of the Afro-Descendant, and Brazil has shown that it intends to be a regional leader in acknowledging and overcoming racial disparities. This is evidenced by such actions as the development of SINAPIR, a nationwide system to address race based social inclusion measures, the active participation in the U.S.-Brazil Joint Action Plan for Racial Equality and the government's support of a documentary series about afro-descendant struggles throughout Latin America. Brazil, in the

21<sup>st</sup> century, appears to be on the cusp of truly becoming a Brazil for everyone.

## APPENDICES



## Appendix A: Consent Form in English

### **Research Participant Information and Consent Form**

You are being asked to participate in a research project. Researchers are required to provide a consent form to inform you about the study, to convey that participation is voluntary, to explain risks and benefits of participation, and to empower you to make an informed decision. You should feel free to ask the researcher any questions you may have.

**Study Title:** Achieving a Brazilian Racial Democracy through Race Based Social Inclusion Educational Policy.

**Researcher and Title:** Monica A. Evans, MLIS

**Department and Institution:** Educational Policy, Michigan State University

**Address and Contact Information:** 219 Erickson Hall, MSU, East Lansing, MI 48824-1111

#### **1. PURPOSE OF RESEARCH:**

You are being asked to participate in a research study of the socio-political context surrounding affirmative action education policies at two universities in Bahia, Brazil. You have been selected as a possible participant in this study because you are involved with the development and implementation of such policies or you are part of the community that advocates for such policies. From this study, the researcher hopes to learn how these policies measure up to the democratic ideals of Brazil and how these policies allow for and subvert efforts of self-determination and social justice for Afro-Brazilians. Your participation in this study will take about one hour. If you are under 18, you cannot be in this study without parental permission.

#### **2. WHAT YOU WILL DO:**

You will be asked to answer questions about their involvement with affirmative action in Bahia and to suggest other people and/or institutions for the research to contact regarding

affirmative action. Once the results of the study are published, you will be notified.

### **3. POTENTIAL BENEFITS AND RISKS:**

You will not directly benefit from your participation in this study. However, your participation in this study may contribute to the understanding of the ways affirmative action education policies contribute to democracy and social justice in Brazil. There are no foreseeable risks associated with participation in this study.

### **4. PRIVACY AND CONFIDENTIALITY:**

The data for this project will be kept confidential. Only the researcher and the institutional review board will have access to the data. Personal information linking you to the data will be kept secure. Identifying information will be stored separate from the data. The results of this study may be published or presented at professional meetings, but your identity will remain confidential unless the researcher is given permission to use your name. Names will not be published without permission. Information about you will be kept confidential to the maximum extent allowable by law unless there is a danger to yourself or others.

I agree to allow my identity to be disclosed in reports and presentations.

☐ Yes                      ☐ No                      Initials\_\_\_\_\_

The researcher would like to make an audio recording of this interview. Audiotapes will be secured in a locked room until transcripts of the interviews are made and the results of the project are published. The audiotapes will then be destroyed.

I agree to allow audiotaping/videotaping of the interview.

☐ Yes                      ☐ No                      Initials \_\_\_\_\_

**5. YOUR RIGHTS TO PARTICIPATE, SAY NO, OR WITHDRAW**

Participation in this research project is completely voluntary. You have the right to say no. You may change your mind at any time and withdraw. Please feel free to contact the researcher at [evansmol@msu.edu](mailto:evansmol@msu.edu) if you wish to withdraw at any time. You may choose not to answer specific questions or to stop participating at any time. You will be told of any significant findings that develop during the course of the study that may influence your willingness to continue to participate in the research.

**6. COSTS AND COMPENSATION FOR BEING IN THE STUDY:**

You will not receive money or any other form of compensation for participating in this study.

**7. CONTACT INFORMATION FOR QUESTIONS AND CONCERNS**

If you have concerns or questions about this study, such as scientific issues, how to do any part of it, or to report an injury, please contact Dr. Reitumetse Mabokela, at 517-353-6676, or by email at [mabokela@msu.edu](mailto:mabokela@msu.edu), or Monica A. Evans, at 517-775-9204, or by email [evansmol@msu.edu](mailto:evansmol@msu.edu), or regular mail at 219 Erickson Hall, MSU, East Lansing, MI 48824. If you have questions or concerns about your role and rights as a research participant, would like to obtain information or offer input, or would like to register a complaint about this study, you may contact, anonymously if you wish, the Michigan State University's Human Research Protection Program at 517-355-2180, Fax 517-432-4503, or e-mail [irb@msu.edu](mailto:irb@msu.edu) or regular mail at 202 Olds Hall, MSU, East Lansing, MI 48824.

**8. DOCUMENTATION OF INFORMED CONSENT.**

Your signature below means that you voluntarily agree to participate in this research study.

\_\_\_\_\_

Signature

Date

**8. PARENT OR GUARDIAN PERMISSION FOR PARTICIPANTS UNDER THE  
AGE OF 18.**

Your signature below means that you grant permission for the  
child to participate in this research study.

\_\_\_\_\_

Signature

Date

You will be given a copy of this form to keep.

## Appendix B: Consent Form in Portuguese

### Informação e Forma de Consentimento para Participantes de Pesquisa

Estamos pedindo a participação no projeto para pesquisa. Os pesquisadores têm que proporcionar uma forma de consentimento para os participantes entenderem que a participação é voluntária, explicar os riscos e os benefícios da participação, e para os participantes tomarem uma decisão clara. Podem ficar a vontade para perguntar qualquer questão que tenham.

**Título do Estudo:** Achieving a Brazilian Racial Democracy through Race Based Social Inclusion Educational Policy.

**Pesquisador e Título:** Monica A. Evans, MLIS

**Departamento e Instituição:** Educational Policy, Michigan State University

**Endereço e Informação para Contacto:** 219 Erickson Hall, MSU, East Lansing, MI 48824-1111

#### 1. Objetivo da Pesquisa:

Estamos pedindo a participação no projeto do contexto socio-político em torno das ações políticas afirmativas em educação nas duas universidades na Bahia, Brasil. Você foi selecionado para participação porque você está envolvido com o desenvolvimento e a implementação das políticas ou é uma parte das comunidades que apoiam estas políticas. A pesquisadora espera aprender como estas políticas apoiam os ideais democráticos do Brasil e como estas políticas permitem ou impedem a auto-determinação e justiça social para afro-brasileiros. Sua participação será de uma hora. Se você tem menos de dezoito, você precisa da permissão de seus pais.

#### 2. Sua Ações:

Pediremos a você para responder questões sobre seu envolvimento com ações afirmativas na Bahia e sugerir outras pessoas e/ou instituições para a pesquisadora contactar sobre ações afirmativas. Quando os resultados forem publicandos, você será notificado.

### 3. Riscos e Benefícios Potenciais

Você não se beneficiará diretamente da sua participação no projeto. No entanto, sua participação neste projeto pode contribuir para compreensão das formas como as políticas de ações afirmativas contribuem para a democracia e justiça social no Brasil. Não há nenhum risco potencial relacionado com a sua participação no projeto.

### 4. Privacidade e Confidência

Os dados para este projeto serão mantidos em confidência. Somente a pesquisadora e a supervisão de revisão institucional terão acesso aos dados. Informações pessoais que o conecte com os dados ficarão seguras. Informações que o identifique ficarão separadas dos dados. Os resultados deste projeto poderão ser publicados ou apresentados nas conferências, mas sua identidade ficará anônima a menos que você dê sua permissão para usar seu nome. Os nomes não serão publicados sem permissão. Informações sobre você serão mantidas confidenciais tanto quanto possíveis de acordo com a lei, a menos que haja algum perigo para você ou outros.

Eu concordo em permitir que minha identidade seja divulgada nas apresentações e relatórios.

☐ Sim                      ☐ Não                      Iniciais / Rubrica \_\_\_\_\_

A pesquisadora gostaria de gravar esta entrevista com um gravador. As gravações serão protegidas até as entrevistas serem transcritas e o projeto ser publicado. Então, as gravações serão destruídas.

Eu concordo em permitir a gravação da entrevista.

☐ Sim                      ☐ Não                      Iniciais / Rubrica \_\_\_\_\_

5. Seus direitos de Participação, de declinar, e de desistência

Sua participação é voluntária. Pode dizer não. Pode se afastar a qualquer tempo. Nestes casos pode contactar a pesquisadora, [evansmol@msu.edu](mailto:evansmol@msu.edu). Pode não responder a perguntas específicas ou suspender a sua participação a qualquer tempo. Você será contactado sobre quaisquer resultados que possam influenciar o seu desejo de participação na pesquisa.

6. O Custo e a Compensação pela Participação

Você não receberá dinheiro or nenhum tipa de compensação pela participação no projeto.

7. Informação para Contato sobre Perguntas e Dúvidas

Se você tem dúvidas ou questões sobre este projeto, pode contatar Dr. Reitumetse Mabokela (517.353.6676; [mabokela@msu.edu](mailto:mabokela@msu.edu)), ou Monica A. Evans (517.775.9204; [evansmol@msu.edu](mailto:evansmol@msu.edu)). Se você tem questões ou dúvidas sobre seus direitos e sua função na participação do projeto, ou se você gostaria de fazer uma queixa sobre o projeto, contate, anonimamente se voce quer, MSU's Programa para a proteção da pesquisa humana, (517.355.2180, fax 517.432.4503, [irb@msu.edu](mailto:irb@msu.edu), 202 Olds Hall, MSU, East Lansing, MI 48824).

8. Assinatura de Consentimento

Sua assinatura significa que voçe concorda em participar do projeto.

\_\_\_\_\_  
\_\_\_\_\_

Assinatura

Data

9. Se você for menor de 18 o responsável, assine aqui.

Sua assinatura significa que ele/ela pode participar do projeto.

---

---

Assinatura

Data

Voçe receberá uma cópia deste formulário.



## Appendix C: Research Protocols

### Teacher Interview Protocol

1. Please describe your school, teacher placement, students.
2. How did you get involved with the CEAFFRO program?
3. Did you teach African, Afro-Brazilian studies before attending the course? How did you teach it? With what materials?
4. How long did / have you participated in the CEAFFRO course?
5. How is your participation funded?
6. Describe your experiences with the course.
7. Did you access the course at home, at school, at an Internet café?
8. What resources were you provided with during the course?
9. Have you been able to implement any other the curriculum in your classroom? Please describe.
10. Have you had any challenges to implementing the course? Please describe?
11. How have your students responded to the course?
12. What suggestions, comments, concerns do you have regarding the course?
13. Are there any other issues that you would like to raise?

### Policy Developer Interview Protocol

1. What is your official title?
2. In what ways are you involved with affirmative action/ social inclusion initiatives?
3. How long have you been involved with affirmative action / social inclusion initiatives?
4. Describe for me some of the early discussions about affirmative action / social inclusion in your institution.
5. What are some of the reasons/rationales that people have given for supporting or not supporting affirmative action / social inclusion initiatives?
6. How have administrators, faculty/ staff reacted to the initiatives?
7. Do you feel that the current presidential administration has influenced the affirmative action / social inclusion initiatives debate?
8. Describe the current affirmative action / multicultural curricular initiatives at your institution.

9. In what ways have the initiatives been beneficial or not beneficial at your institution?
10. Are there any potential problems with the policies that you foresee?
11. Are there any other issues that you would like to raise?

#### Student Interview Protocol

1. What year and field of study are you undertaking?
2. Please describe your secondary school?
3. How long have /did you participate in the Steve Biko program?
4. What courses did/ do you take at Steve Biko?
5. What benefits have you received from participation in the program?
6. What challenges have you had in participating in the program?
7. What comments, questions, or concerns do you have about the program?
8. Are there any other issues that you would like to raise?

#### Questões de Professores

1. Descreva sua escola, sua aula, seus estudantes.
2. Como você fica um parte de programa CEAfro?
3. Voce ensinou studios da Africa ou afro-brasileiro depois atendando no curso? Que methodlogia? Com que materiais?
4. Por quantos tempo você tem participado no curso de CEAfro?
5. Quem paga para seu participação?
6. Descreva suas experiencias com esse curso.
7. Onde você acceso este curso, na casa, na escola, na Internet café?
8. Que recursos você recebeu durante no curso?
9. Você tem implementado na curricula na sua aula ainda? Como?Descreva.
10. Você tem problemas com implementado? Descreva?
11. Como seus estudantes têm respondendo no curso?
12. Que sugestões, comentários, preocupados você tem sobre no curso?
13. Você tem outros assuntos para discussão?

#### Questões de administrativos das politicas

1. O que é seu título official?
2. Como você está envolvendo com ações afirmativas?
3. Quanto tempo você tem envolvendo com ações afirmativas?
4. Descreva alguns discussões sobre ações afirmativas.
5. O que os razões que as pessoas apoiem ou não apoiem ações afirmativas?
6. Como o administração, a faculdade, o pessoal têm reagindo das ações afirmativas?
7. Você acha que o administração do president (Lula) tenha influenciado o debate no ações afirmativas?
8. Descreva as ações afirmativas na seu instituição.
9. Como têm as ações afirmativas estavam em benefício ou não?
10. Você preve qualquer problemas na futura com ações afirmativas?
11. Você tem outros assuntos para discussão?

#### Questões para estudantes

1. O que é sua programa e año?
2. Descreva sua escola secundario.
3. Por quantos anos você tem participando na programa de Steve Biko?
4. Cual aulas você tem no Steve Biko?
5. Como tem a programa se benefício?
6. O que problemas você tem com participando na programa?
7. Que sugestões, comentários, preocupados você tem sobre na programa?
8. Você tem outros assuntos para discussão?

## REFERENCES

## REFERENCES

- A Cor da Bahia (2011). A Cor da Bahia: Objetivos. Accessed from <http://www.acordabahia.ufba.br/objetivos.html> on January 29, 2011.
- Almeida, P. D. (2007). Defensive mobilization: Popular movements against economic adjustment policies in Latin America. *Latin American Perspectives*, 34(3), 123-139.
- Andrews, G. R. (1991). *Blacks and whites in São Paulo, Brazil: 1888-1988*. Madison, WI: University of Wisconsin Press.
- Bailey, S. (2004). Group dominance and the myth of racial democracy: Antiracism attitudes in Brazil. *American Sociological Review*, 69(5), 728-747.
- Behrman, J., Gaviria, A., & Szekely, M. (2003). Social exclusion in Latin America: Perception, reality and implications. In J. Behrman, A. Gaviria & M. Szekely (Eds.), *Who's in and who's out: Social exclusion in Latin America* (pp. 1-23). Washington D.C.: Inter-American Development Bank.
- Bello, A., & Rangel, M. (2002). Equity and exclusion in Latin America and the Caribbean: The case of indigenous and afro-descendant peoples. *CEPAL Review*(76), 39-53.
- Benedito, V. L. (2005). *The quest for Afro-Brazilians' equal opportunity: The articulations of affirmative action policies and programs by Afro-Brazilian Advocacy Organizations and the state in Brazil, 1990-2004*. Michigan State University, East Lansing, MI.
- Berg, B. (2007). *Qualitative research methods for the social sciences*. (sixth ed.). Boston: Pearson Education, Inc.

- Bethell, L., & Carvalho, J. M. d. (1989). 1822-1850. In L. Bethell (Ed.), *Brazil: Empire and republic 1822-1930*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Blom, A., Holm-Nielsen, L., & Verner, D. (2001). Education, earnings, and inequality in Brazil, 1982-1998: Implications for education policy. *Peabody Journal of Education*, 76(3&4), 180-221.
- Bonnett, A. (2006). The Americanisation of anti-racism? Global power and hegemony in ethnic equity. *Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies*, 32(7), 1083-1103.
- Bourdieu, P., & Wacquant, L. (1999). On the cunning of imperialist reasoning. *Theory, Culture, and Society*, 16(1), 41-45.
- Burdick, J. (1998). *Blessed Anastácia: Women, race, and popular Christianity in Brazil*. London: Routledge.
- Buvinic, M. (2003). *Social inclusion in Latin America and the Caribbean: Experience and lessons*. Paper presented at the Good Practices in Social Inclusion: A Dialogue Between Europe and Latin America and the Caribbean.,
- Buvinic, M. (2004). Introduction: Social inclusion in Latin America. In M. Buvinic & J. Mazza (Eds.), *Social inclusion and economic development in Latin America*. (pp. 3-31). Washington D.C.: Inter-American Development bank.
- Cardoso, N. (2005). Movimento negro pós-70: A educação como arma contra o racismo. Unpublished dissertation chapter. Universidade Estadual da Bahia.
- Cardoso, N. (2008). *Manual de anti-racismo e direitos humanos para jovens*. Salvador da Bahia: Instituto Steve Biko.
- Carvalho, J. C. (2006). Os cursos pré-vestibulares comunitários e seus condicantes pedagógicos. *Cadernos de Pesquisa*, 36(128), 299-326.

Cavanaugh, J., & Mander, J. (Eds.). (2004). *Alternatives to economic globalization* (2nd ed.). San Francisco: Berrett-Koehler Publishers, Inc.

CEAFRO (2011). CEAfro Online. Accessed from <http://www.ceafro.ufba.br/web/> on January 29, 2011.

Centro de Estudos Afro Orientais (2002). *Proposta para o acesso e permanência de negros na Universidade Federal da Bahia.* : Centro de Estudos Afro Orientais / Universidade Federal da Bahia.

Centro de Estudos Afro Orientais (2010a). Permanência. Accessed from <http://www.ceal.ufba.br/cursoensinoafro/conteudo.php?con=31> on January 29, 2011.

Centro de Estudos Afro Orientais (2010b). Programa preparatório para a promoção da igualdade étnico-racial na educação. Accessed from <http://www.ceal.ufba.br/cursoensinoafro/conteudo.php?con=1> on January 29, 2011.

Centro de Estudos Afro Orientais (2010c). Turma 2006. Accessed from <http://www.ceal.ufba.br/cursoensinoafro/conteudo.php?con=39> on January 29, 2011.

Centro de Estudos Afro Orientais (2010d). Turma 2006/2007. Accessed from <http://www.ceal.ufba.br/cursoensinoafro/conteudo.php?con=40> on January 29, 2011.

Centro de Estudos Afro Orientais (2011). Centro de Estudos Afro Orientais. Accessed from <http://www.ceao.ufba.br/2007/> on January 29, 2011.

Collins, P. H. (1998). *Fighting Words: Black Women and the Search for Justice*. Minneapolis, MN: University of Minnesota Press.

- Conceição, F. (2010). Power and Black organizing in Brazil. In B. Reiter & G. Mitchell (Eds.), *Brazil's New Racial Politics* (pp. 179-195). Boulder, CO: Lynne Rienner Publishers.
- Conselho Nacional de Desenvolvimento Científico e Tecnológico (2009). PIBIC-Ações afirmativas-projeto piloto, accessed at [http://www.cnpq.br/programas/pibic\\_afirm/index.htm](http://www.cnpq.br/programas/pibic_afirm/index.htm) on September 26, 2009.
- Dani, A., & Haan, A. D. (2008). Social policy in a development context: Structural inequalities and inclusive institutions. In A. Dani & A. D. Haan (Eds.), *Inclusive States: Social Policy and Structural Inequalities*. Washington D.C.: The World Bank.
- Dantas, C. (2001). CCN: Cidadania e consciência negra *Projecto Educacional Steve Biko: Prêmio Nacional de Direitos Humanos* (pp. 1-23). Salvador da Bahia: Secretaria de Estado de Direitos Humanos do Ministério da Justiça.
- Delgado, R., & Stefancic, J. (2001). *Critical Race Theory: An Introduction*. New York: New York University.
- Durham, E. (2005). Inequality in education and quotas for Black students in universities. *Novos Estudos CEBRAP*(66), 3-22.
- Dzidzienyo, A., & Oboler, S. (2008). Race, social justice, and the law in the Americas: Redefining the terms of the debate. *Latin American Studies Association Forum*, 39(1), 20-23.
- Educação e Cidadania de Afrodescendentes e Carentes. (2009) Info EDUCAFRO. Vol. 11. São Paulo, SP.
- Fábrica de Idéias (2011). Apresentação. Accessed from <http://www.fabricaideidia.br/apresentacao.php> on January 29, 2011.



- Filho, A., Mariano, A., Aggio, A., & Mello e Souza, A. (2006). Todos têm direitos na República Democrática. Accessed from [www.observa.ifcs.ufrj.br/carta/index.htm](http://www.observa.ifcs.ufrj.br/carta/index.htm) on January 8, 2009.
- Filho, N. A., Marinho, M. B., Carvalho, M. J. d., & Santos, J. T. d. (2005). *Ações afirmativas na universidade pública: O caso da UFBA*. Salvador da Bahia, Brazil: Centro de Estudos Afro-Orientais da UFBA.
- Filho, P. S. (2004). Cursos pré-vestibulares populares em Salvador: Experiências educativas em movimentos sociais. *Revista da Faced*(8), 109-126.
- Fórum de Quilombos Educacionais da Bahia (2011). Apresentação. Accessed from <http://www.foquiba.com.br> on March 1, 2011.
- Freyre, G. (1946). *The masters and the slaves*. New York: Knopf.
- Fry, P. (2007). *Divisões perigosas : Políticas raciais no Brasil contemporâneo*. Rio de Janeiro: Civilização Brasileira.
- Fry, P. (2008). Viewing the United States from a Brazilian perspective and vice-versa. . *Latin American Studies Association Forum*, 39(1), 13-15.
- Gidley, J., Hampson, G., Wheeler, L., & Bereded-Samuel, E. (2010). From access to success: An integrated approach to quality higher education informed by social inclusion theory and practice. *Higher Education Policy*, 23, 123-147.
- Goldemberg, J., & Durham, E. (2007). Cotas nas universidades públicas. In P. Fry (Ed.), *Divisões perigosas: Políticas raciais no Brasil contemporâneo*. Rio de Janeiro: Civilização Brasileira.
- Gonçalves, L., & Gonçalves e Silva, P. (2000). Movimento negro e educação. *Revista Brasileira de Educação*(15), 134-158.

- Grupo Conviver (Ed.). (2009a). *Diversidade e convivência: Em verso e prosa*. Salvador da Bahia, Brasil: Editora da Universidade Federal da Bahia.
- Grupo Conviver (Ed.). (2009b). *Diversidade e convivência: Vencendo desafios*. Salvador da Bahia, Brasil: Editora da Universidade Federal da Bahia.
- Guimaraes, A. (2002). *Classes, raças, e democracia*. São Paulo, SP: Fundação de Apoio à Universidade de São Paulo.
- Hanchard, M. (1999). *Racial politics in contemporary Brazil*. Durham [N.C.]: Duke University Press.
- Heringer, R., & Ferreira, R. (2009). Análise das principais políticas de inclusão de estudantes negros no ensino superior no Brasil no período 2001-2008. In M. de Paula & R. Heringer (Eds.), *Caminhos Convergentes: Estado e Sociedade na Superação das Desigualdades Raciais no Brasil* (pp. 137-194). Rio de Janeiro: Fundação Heinrich Boll and Action Aid.
- Hopenhayn, M. (2008). Recognition and distribution: Equity and justice policies for disadvantaged groups in Latin America. In A. Dani & A. de Hann (Eds.), *Inclusive States: Social Policy and Structural Inequalities* (pp. 145-174). Washington D.C.: World Bank.
- Htun, M. (2004). From "racial democracy" to affirmative action: Changing state policy on race in Brazil. *Latin American Research Review*, 39(1), 60-89.
- Instituto Steve Biko (2010a). Bikodisse entrevista: Carla Akotirene. Accessed from <http://blogdabiko.blogspot.com> on September 7, 2010.
- Instituto Steve Biko (2010b). Bikodisse entrevista: Jean Coutinho. Accessed from <http://blogdabiko.blogspot.com> on September 7, 2010.

- Instituto Steve Biko (2010c). Encontros com Biko. Accessed from [www.stevebiko.org.br](http://www.stevebiko.org.br) on June 3, 2010.
- Instituto Steve Biko (2010d). Principais projectos. Accessed from [www.stevebiko.org.br](http://www.stevebiko.org.br) on June 8, 2010.
- Instituto Steve Biko (2011). Campanha 1000 Bikudos inquebrantáveis. Accessed from [www.stevebiko.org.br](http://www.stevebiko.org.br) on February 27, 2011.
- Jacinto, S. (n.d.). *Projeto Conexão de Saberes começa a ser implantado em março*. Accessed from [http://portal.mec.gov.br/index.php?option=com\\_content&view=article&id=1850&catid=202](http://portal.mec.gov.br/index.php?option=com_content&view=article&id=1850&catid=202) on March 17, 2010.
- Johnson, O. (2008). Afro-Brazilian politics: White supremacy, black struggle, and affirmative action. In P. Kingstone & T. Power (Eds.), *Democratic Brazil Revisited*. Pittsburgh, PA: University of Pittsburgh Press.
- Kamel, A. (2006). *Não somos racistas : uma reação aos que querem nos transformar numa nação bicolor*. Rio de Janeiro, RJ, Brasil: Editora Nova Fronteira.
- Leiva, F. I. (2008). Toward a critique of Latin American Neostucturalism. *Latin American Politics and Society*, 50(4), 1-25.
- Love, P. (2003). Document analysis. In F. Stage & K. Manning (Eds.), *Research in the college context: Approaches and methods*. (pp. 83-96). New York: Brunner-Routledge.
- Lovell, P. (1994). Race, gender, and development in Brazil. *Latin American Research Review*, 29(3), 7-35.
- Martins, S. D. S., Medeiros, C. A., & Nascimento, E. L. (2004). Paving paradise: the road from "racial democracy" to affirmative action in Brazil. *Journal of Black Studies*, 34(6), 787-816.

- Marx, A. W. (1998). *Making race and nation : a comparison of South Africa, the United States, and Brazil*. Cambridge, U.K. ; New York: Cambridge University Press.
- McCallum, C. (2007). Women out of place? A micro-historical perspective on the Black Feminist Movement in Salvador da Bahia, Brazil. *Journal of Latin American Studies*, 39, 55-80.
- McCowan, T. (2007). Expansion without equity: An analysis of current policy on access to higher education in Brazil. *Higher Education*, 53, 579-598.
- McDonnell, L., & Elmore, R. (1987). Getting the job done: Alternative policy instruments. *Educational Evaluation and Policy Analysis*, 9(2), 133-152.
- McGinn, N., & Pereira, L. (1992). Why state change the governance of education: An historical comparison of Brazil and the United States. *Comparative Education*, 28(2), 167-180.
- Meade, T. (2010). *A brief history of Brazil* (2nd ed.). New York: Facts on File, Inc.
- Ministério da Educação (2008). ProUni: Bolsistas por raça. Accessed from <http://portal.mec.gov.br/index.php?option=comcontent&view=article&id=202Itemid300> on April 4, 2009.
- Ministério da Educação (2010a). Bolsa Permanência. Accessed from [http://prouniportal.mec.gov.br/index.php?option=com\\_content&view=article&id=125&Itemid=141](http://prouniportal.mec.gov.br/index.php?option=com_content&view=article&id=125&Itemid=141) on December 15, 2010.
- Ministério da Educação (2010b). ProUni: O programa. Accessed from [http://prouniportal.mec.gov.br/index.php?option=com\\_content&view=article&id=124&Itemid=140](http://prouniportal.mec.gov.br/index.php?option=com_content&view=article&id=124&Itemid=140) on December 15, 2010.

Ministério da Educação (n.d.). Conexões de saberes. Accessed from <http://portal.mec.gov.br> on December 18, 2010.

Ministério da Saúde (2006). *Brasil Afroatitude: Primeiro ano do programa*.

Ministério da Saúde (n.d.). *Brasil Afroatitude: Programa intergrado de Ações afirmativas para Negros*.

Miranda, N. (2007). *Ações afirmativas e descolonização do cohecimento*. Paper presented at the Conferência Internacional a Reparação e a Desconlonização do Conhecimento, Salvador da Bahia, Brazil.

Misra, J., & King, L. (2005). Women, gender, and state policies. In T. Janoski, R. Alford, A. Hicks & M. Schwartz (Eds.), *The Handbook of Political Sociology: States, Civil Societies, and Globalization*. New York: Cambridge University Press.

Moehleck, S. (2009). As políticas de diversidade na educação no governo Lula. *Cadernos de Pesquisa*, 39(137), 461-487.

Moore, Z. (1989). Out of the shadows: Black and brown struggles for recognition and dignity in Brazil, 1964-1985. *Journal of Black Studies*, 19(4), 394-410.

Nascimento, A. (2007). *Das ações afirmativas dos movimentos sociais às políticas públicas de ação afirmativa: O movimento dos cursos pré-vestibulares populares*. Paper presented at the II Seminário Nacional Movimentos Sociais, Participação e Democracia.

Nascimento, A., Gomes, A., Alves, A., & Sampaio, Á. (2006). Manifesto em favor da lei de cotas e do esatuto da igualdade racial.

Nascimento, G. (2007). *Cidadania e consciência negra no Instituto Cultural Steve Biko*. Fundação Visconde de Cairu, Salvador da Bahia.

- Nobles, M. (2000). *Shades of citizenship : race and the census in modern politics*. Stanford, Calif.: Stanford University Press.
- Oxhorn, P., & Ducatenzeiler, G. (1998). Economic reform and democratization in Latin America. In P. Oxhorn & G. Ducatenzeiler (Eds.), *What kind of democracy? What kind of market? Latin America in the age of neoliberalism*. (pp. 2-19). University Park, PN: Pennsylvania State University Press.
- Panizzi, W. M. (2003). Public universities: A benchmark for higher education in Brazil. *Higher Education Management and Policy*, 15(1), 43-56.
- Pimentel, Á. (n.d.). Políticas de ações afirmativas na UFBA (power point presentation).
- Plank, D. (1987). The expansion of education: A Brazilian case study. . *Comparative Education Review*, 31(3), 361-376.
- Plank, D. (1990). The politics of basic education reform in Brazil. *Comparative Education Review*, 34(4), 538-559.
- Plank, D. (1996). *The means of our salvation: Public education in Brazil, 1930-1995*. Boulder, CO: Westview Press, Inc.
- Presidency of the Republic (2010). *Statute of Racial Equality*.
- Programa Políticas da Cor (2009). Racial Equity in Brazilian Education Program. Accessed from [http://www.lpp-uerj.net/olped/acoesafirmativas/about\\_ppcor.asp](http://www.lpp-uerj.net/olped/acoesafirmativas/about_ppcor.asp) on January 12, 2011.
- Queiroz, D., & Santos, J. T. D. (2006). Sistema de cotas: um debate. Dos dados à manutenção de privilégios e de poder. *Educação & Sociedade*, 27(96), 717-737.
- Recondo, D. (2008). Local participatory democracy in Latin America: Lessons from Mexico and Colombia. In A. Dani & A.

- D. Haan (Eds.), *Inclusive States: Social Policy and Structural Inequalities*. Washington D.C.: The World Bank.
- Reichmann, R. L. (1999). *Race in contemporary Brazil : from indifference to inequality*. University Park, Pa.: Pennsylvania State University Press.
- Reiter, B. (2008). Education reform, race, and politics in Bahia, Brazil. *Ensaio*, 16(58), 125-148.
- Roberts, K. (2007). Re-politicizing Latin America: The revival of populist and leftist alternatives. Washington D.C.: Woodrow Wilson Center International Center for Scholars: Latin American Program.
- Rochetti, R. (2004). Not as easy as Black and White: The implications of the University of Rio de Janeiro's quota-based admissions policy on affirmative action law in Brazil. *Vanderbilt Journal of Transnational Law*, 37(5), 1423-1471.
- Sansone, L. (2009). Africa, Brazil, and the construction of trans-Atlantic identities: Lecture given at the MSU African Studies Center roundtable on April 7, 2009.
- Sansone, L., Soumonni, E., & Barry, B. (Eds.). (2009). *Africa, Brazil and the construction of trans-atlantic Black identities*. Trenton, NJ: Africa World Press.
- Santos, J. T. D., & Queiroz, D. (2006). Vestibular com cotas: Análise em uma instituição pública federal. *Revista da Universidade de São Paulo*(68).
- Santos, S. A. D. (2005). Introdução. In S. A. D. Santos (Ed.), *Ações afirmativas e combate ao racismo nas américas* (pp. 13-29). Brasília: Ministério da Educação.
- Santos, S. A. D. (2010). Universidades públicas, sistema de cotas para os estudantes negros e disputas acadêmico-

políticas no Brasil contemporâneo. *Política e Trabalho*(33), 49-73.

Scalon, M., & Cano, I. (2008). Legitimization and acceptance: How Brazilians survive inequalities. In E. Marió & M. Woolcock (Eds.), *Social Exclusion and Mobility in Brazil*. Washington D.C.: The World Bank.

Schwartzman, S. (2003). *The challenges of education in Brazil*.: University of Oxford Centre for Brazilian Studies.

Secretaria Especial de Política de Promoção da Igualdade Racial (2006). Plano Nacional de Promoção da Igualdade Racial. Accessed from <https://www.presidencia.gov.br/seppir> on April 8, 2009.

Silva, N., & Hasenbalg, C. (1999). Race and educational opportunity in Brazil. In R. L. Reichmann (Ed.), *Race in contemporary Brazil* (pp. 53-65): Pennsylvania State University Press.

Skidmore, T. (1993). *Black into white: race and nationality in Brazilian thought*. Durham, NC: Duke University Press.

Skidmore, T. (1999). *Brazil: Five centuries of change*. New York: Oxford University Press.

Telles, E. (2004). *Race in another America: the significance of skin color in Brazil*. Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press.

United Nations (2001). *Report of the world conference against racism, racial discrimination, xenophobia, and related intolerance*.

United Nations (2004). *Concluding observations of the committee on the elimination of racial discrimination: Brazil*. [www.unchr.ch/tbs/doc.nsf](http://www.unchr.ch/tbs/doc.nsf). Accessed April 9, 2006.



United Nations (2006). *Commission on human rights report of the Special Rapporteur on contemporary forms of racism, racial discrimination, xenophobia and related intolerance: Mission to Brazil*.

Universidade Federal da Bahia (2004). *Programa de Ações Afirmativas na Universidade Federal da Bahia*. Salvador da Bahia, Brasil: Universidade Federal da Bahia.

Universidade Federal da Bahia (2008). Programa Permanecer. Accessed from <http://www.permanecer.ufba.br/> on January 29, 2011.

Universidade Federal da Bahia (2010). Projeto Conviver 2010. Accessed from <http://www.icas.ufba.br/arquivos/pdf/EditalConviver2010.pdf> on January 29, 2011.

Universidade Federal da Bahia (2011). UFBA Vestibular 2011: Sistema de cotas. Accessed from <http://www.vestibular.ufba.br/cotas.htm> on January 29, 2011.

Universidade Federal da Bahia (n.d.). Programa Conexões de Saberes-UFBA: Diálogos entre a universidade e as comunidades populares. Accessed from <http://www.twiki.ufba.br/twiki/bin/view/ConexoesSaberes/Apresentacao> on March 17, 2010.

Van Cott, D. L. (2005). Building inclusive democracies: Indigenous peoples and ethnic minorities. *Democratization*, 12(5), 820-837.

Winant, H. (2004). *The new politics of race: Globalism, difference, justice*. Minneapolis, MN: University of Minnesota Press.

Zoninsein, J. (2001). *The economic case for combating racial and ethnic exclusion in Latin American and Caribbean countries*.: Inter-American Development Bank.

Zoninsein, J. (2004a). *Affirmative action and development in Brazil*. Paper presented at the Latin American Studies Association.

Zoninsein, J. (2004b). The economic case for combating racial and ethnic exclusion. In M. Buvinic, J. Mazza & R. Deutsch (Eds.), *Social inclusion and economic development in Latin America*. (pp. 41-53). Washington, D.C.: Inter-American Development Bank.

Zoninsein, J. (2009). Human rights, affirmative action, and development: An agenda for Latin America and the Caribbean. In C. Stokes (Ed.), *Race and human rights* (pp. 237-254). East Lansing, MI: Michigan State University Press.