

for change and adaptation. Nevertheless the resettlement exercise evidently brought considerable turmoil to the communities involved.

Two contributions concern the problems faced by decaying urban communities: these concern Jamestown in New York State and the Craigmillar Estate in Scotland. The article on Jamestown traces the development of a co-operative effort between labour, management and government leaders in an area of severe industrial decline. Poor labour management relations were transformed after a combined effort by all concerned. Craigmillar, a sprawling housing estate catering to the poorer section of Edinburgh, suffered from typical inner-city deprivations and was characterised by despair. This was tackled by the development of a creative community arts programme which managed to provide an outlet for local residents. This in turn brought about a community awareness of local problems, which led finally to community action. A further contribution relates how several deprived communities in the USA managed through community action, drama and ingenuity, to establish their own electricity supply through the establishment of renewable energy resources, such as solar and wind energy, and in the process outwitting the exploitation of landlords and uncaring utility companies.

The prolific variety of this anthology may be seen with two further examples. One chapter describes the process of resettling traditionally nomadic Bedouins in planned settlements in southern Israel. Although political, economic and ecological changes have led to 'spontaneous sedentarisation', most attempts by the Israeli Government to resettle the tribes ended in failure. It was only when neighbourhoods and architectural house styles were designed to cater directly to the needs of the Bedouins (eg large, two-storied accommodation with space to keep livestock) that the resettlement exercise started to yield results. The second example concerns a small valley in the middle of Norway with a tradition of self-sufficiency - yet in decline due to uneconomic production. Following the efforts of a local entrepreneur and outside funding, a local community development programme helped sponsor action research into the various economic and social problems of the community. This generated a self-supporting development process where the local people appeared to take a common responsibility for the future of their own community.

A major theme that links these separate contributions is the contention that once people are convinced that certain conditions are intolerable a dynamic is set in motion that can lead to creative and constructive change. Indeed one of the discussion papers notes that a principal finding was that the success with which communities dealt with their crises depended on their recognition that they *were* indeed in crisis. This perspective is valuable as it reminds us that people have a right to define their own reality - perhaps to define their own crisis - and that development is something that should be shaped, defined and directed by those who are principally concerned, ie the local communities. Of course the other half of the equation - the structural inequalities, oppression, exploitation, governmental responsibilities to assist the poor and deprived and so on - is avoided, but at least we are reminded that people have the potential to bring about change if they so choose, and even in situations of poverty can create their own resources. As such, this anthology reminds us in a positive and optimistic way that constructive social development is indeed possible, even in seemingly depressing and hopeless situations.

Reviewed by N P Hall, School of Social Work, Harare.

Land Reform in the Making: Tradition, Public Policy and Ideology in Botswana, Richard P Werbner (ed), Rex Collings, London, 1982 (pp XV + 162, no price given).

It is a measure of the Botswana government's interest and perhaps faith in social research that this collection of articles criticising its policies is possible. Collections of diverse articles pertaining to a single developing country and based on field research are rather rare these days and, if for that reason alone, welcome.

That said, I found this collection disappointing for a number of reasons. All of the information it contains is at least ten years old (it doesn't help, of course, to be reviewing a book five years after its date of publication) and Werbner is careful to note that new ideas were already in the air as the papers went to press (p. i). Notwithstanding its title, this collection is not a coherent set of papers systematically examining changes in Botswana's land policy. Rather this is a collection of disparate papers whose only link is that they all deal with Botswana (and so might better have appeared separately in *Botswana Notes and Records*). The editor's introductory remarks appear to have been stimulated by the content of the papers, and thus seem rather to be a concluding round-up than an introduction. None of the contributors takes up Werbner's points about 'frontier processes' and the distinction between 'incorporative' and 'exclusive' tenurial ideologies. So the editor's claim that 'the unity of the collection emerges from the complimentary of the contributions to it' (p. ii), is, in my view, at best wishful thinking.

Indeed, the title of the collection itself misleads. Werbner's introduction provides the non-specialist with only a limited and selective guide to the history, content and relationships between the different land Acts addressed by some of the contributors, and little indication of what is to be regarded as 'land reform'. It does *not*, in my opinion, 'explore some of the available evidence on the making of land reform during the early phases of Botswana's transition from its colonial dependence...' (p. i). Of the seven papers, only those by Hitchcock and Comaroff are in *any* way related to issues of land reform. Two, by Roberts and Werbner, deal with the administration of land law and/or tenure in Kgatlang and North-East Districts respectively and make useful points about the differences between central intentions and local interpretations. Silitshena's paper, dealing with rural trade in Kweneng District, while interesting in itself, seems unrelated to any words in the book's title, except, that perhaps, 'public policy' — indirectly.

Of the four contributors who discuss issues pertaining to land, if not 'land reform', only Hitchcock deals with the central 'Tswana model' (in this case, of the Ngwato) so often referred to by the others. The rest describe minority and perhaps peripheral systems (Almagor, the immigrant Namibian Mbanderu; Sutherland, the Yeyi of Ngamiland District; Comaroff, the peculiar case of the Barolong farms), whose specific relevance to any main argument I did not perceive.

Different authors also describe different land laws and policies in their different areas in different time periods, thus compounding the problems of comparison. Hitchcock presents a wealth of useful information to show why the Tribal Grazing Land Policy of 1975 was, in his view, misconceived (though it is easy - but often premature - to criticise a new policy in the earliest years of its implementation). In contrast, Comaroff focuses on the Tribal Land Act of 1968, and it argues that, in six years, it managed to create very dramatic 'class' differentiation in the unusual historical circumstances of the Barolong farms. I did not find his argument persuasive, in part because, like some of his fellow-contributors, Comaroff's paper tends frequently to the assertion rather than the provision of hard data.

The other two papers dealing with land virtually ignore new land legislation. In a badly constructed paper, Almagor, often contradicting himself, argues for what is in my opinion an irrelevant and distracting theoretical distinction between functional and substantive rationalities among the Mbanderu, who managed to acquire livestock and monopolise the grazing in the immediate hinterland of Lake Ngami. He does not tell us how they managed to displace their local Tswana hosts, nor precisely why they felt threatened by the 1975 Tribal Grazing Land Policy, nor indeed how the displaced Tswana regarded their expansionist neighbours. Sutherland's interesting comparisons of different ecological zones among the Yeyi do not pretend to deal with any land legislation at all, noting instead the potential for change built into the 'traditional' responses to differing production possibilities in different ecological circumstances.

Not being a Botswana specialist myself, I found this collection useful in its detail, which often

overwhelmed my capacity to absorb it: it is a source to return to in the future when further information is required. However, I was recurrently irritated by textual references to places and people that appear on none of the seven maps provided in this book. Moreover, it took me a long time to formulate a (probably deficient) idea of the background against which these papers would be assessed. Surely some concession should be made to the reader whose knowledge of the country's issues is, by definition, less than that of the writers of these papers. 'Land reform' is, after all, of comparative interest even to those who know nothing of Botswana's specific circumstances.

Reviewed by A P Cheater, Department of Sociology, University of Zimbabwe.

Social Attitudes and Agricultural Productivity in Central Africa, Jean Bonvin, Development Centre of the Organisation of Economic Co-operation and Development, Paris, 1986 (pp 135, no price given).

Actually this book presents the findings of research conducted in 1977 in **one** Central African country, Burundi, and its simultaneous publication in English as well as French is a very welcome addition to Anglophone knowledge of Francophone Africa. Perhaps its greatest use may lie not in any value its specific findings may have for policy purposes but rather in the areas of research methods, where it provides another textbook case of the problems of survey research on this continent.

Bonvin provides, at the very beginning, a brief description of Burundi which, apart from saying nothing about the country's social characteristics, is useful, as is his detailed map of the country's communes. He then proceeds to attempt to steer a middle course between the theoretical rocks of marxism and modernisation theory, in what he himself describes as more 'applied economics' than the development of new theory. This application assumes that different districts of Burundi may be ranked on an evolutionary scale in their incorporation into the contemporary international political economy. Bonvin is therefore interested to investigate the differences between Burundi's more and less effectively incorporated areas, in respect of their economic modernisation.

The idea is, in principle, interesting. Its execution was less satisfactory. While asserting that participatory observation would have been 'ideal' (p 84), Bonvin instead opted for a survey questionnaire, properly piloted, finally containing 395 questions, administered to 1 655 farmers in the two interior communes of Ruyigi and Ngozi, and four communes in the Rusizi plain area north of the capital, Bujumbura (where peasantisiation had been established under the Belgian colonial regime and was in the process of collapse post-Independence). His reasons for selecting the survey process rested on the excessive time needed for anthropological investigation, and the problem of generalising its results. Bonvin is now wiser, having realised that the survey and its processing took him ten years anyway, and that his results were not only unreliable in many respects, but also had a limited capacity for generalisation!

In the meantime, he experienced research that will undoubtedly have provided him with enormously funny stories with which to regale colleagues and students for years to come. He has realised that the statistical universe from which samples are drawn is, in third world countries at least, seriously defective at both central and local administrative levels, thus often necessitating the creation of the universe before the sample may be drawn, that 'in spite of its size, the questionnaire used in the quantitative enquiry failed to uncover many significant elements of the process of change in the rural structures' (p 102); that university students may be unreliable interviewers and coders, no matter how well trained, especially when they are physically uncomfortable in the countryside; and that officials may mislead about computing capabilities in developing countries, thus leading to enormous difficulties in processing data. There are still a