Education and Social Control in Southern Rhodesia. *By T.J.S. Kumbula.* Palo Alto CA, R. & E. Research Associates, 1979, vi, 168 pp., US$7.00.

Independence without Freedom: The Political Economy of Colonial Education in Southern Africa. *Edited by A.T. Mugomba and M. Nyaggah.* Oxford, ABC–Clio, 1980, x, 289 pp., £14.65.

Since the publication of M.F.D. Young's influential article, 'Knowledge and Control', more than a decade ago, an increasing volume of research into the history and sociology of education has been directed to the apparent relationships between educational policy and the interests of dominant socio-economic groups in many countries. Against this background, Kumbula's study—which is based on a successful submission for a higher degree—represents a significant attempt to analyse the socio-political factors which determined the provision of secondary and higher education for Blacks in the former Colony of Southern Rhodesia, from the onset of the colonial period to the mid-1970s. Similarly the collection of essays by Mugomba and Nyaggah is timely, in two important respects. It represents a significant addition to the still far too slender body of literature on African response to colonial education policy in Southern Africa. And it provides useful data concerning several countries which have as yet received remarkably little attention from students of education, writing in the English language.

Kumbula's book makes stimulating and, in large part, convincing reading. Using an extensive body of documentary material, from both official and non-official sources, the author has built up a valuable picture of racial discrimination in a setting where—as he puts it—'Blacks . . . perceived education as one sure way of speeding their emergence from their deprived status' and 'whites used education to keep blacks subordinate to them and to ensure continued white domination' (p. 155). There is painstaking and, in places, incisive discussion of official White attitudes and of factors underlying Rhodesian educational policy, set against the wider background of British imperial educational policy in Africa. The author is particularly skilful in his treatment of developments during the post-Federation period, where he provides a convincing demonstration of the dichotomy between official protestations of 'meritocracy' and 'non-racialism' and the reality of racial discrimination in virtually every aspect of the public life of the Colony. As he points out, there was indeed little prospect of meritocracy in a situation where government spent on average more than eleven times as much money on the education of a White child than on that of a Black child, and where the expansion of secondary school facilities for Blacks was far from sufficient to keep pace with increases in the primary school population.

A rather striking weakness, nevertheless, is the absence of an attempt to analyse the various elements of White Rhodesian opinion, and to estimate the extent to which they influenced educational policy. Missionaries, farmers, businessmen, administrators and political leaders all had distinctive interests and attitudes, and these sometimes clashed in the determination of policy. Important conflicts in White opinion, which Kumbula does not consider, were the disagreement between missionaries and government, concerning the first government schools for Africans at Domboshawa and Tjolotjo, and the resignation of Harold Jowitt from his post as Director of Native Education because of disagreement with

his colleagues concerning his policy of community development. Indeed, the main principles of Jowitt's immensely influential work, and the motives which might have determined them, are not discussed at all in the study, although there is one brief mention of Jowitt's helper, Henry Alvord, whose teaching of agriculture to Blacks met with opposition from White farmers.

Like Young, and other writers of the New Sociology group, Kumbula sees socio-economic and political factors as the only significant determinants of educational policy. Some will dispute, accordingly, his assertion that among African educational systems, that of South Africa came closest to matching Southern Rhodesia 'In form, substance, philosophy, curricula content, and objectives' (p. 21). Although there were, undoubtedly, close relationships between South African and Southern Rhodesian education (perhaps notably in the importing of policies of community development by Jowitt from his mentor, L.G. Loram, in Natal) it is also pertinent to consider a movement away from South African and towards English educational practice by Southern Rhodesian administrators from the 1920s on. This movement was apparently due in part at least to a belief among White Rhodesians that the South African curriculum was insufficiently challenging, and did not provide the degree of moral and intellectual training needed by young people in a rapidly developing society. Again, some will regret that no qualification is added to Kumbula's conclusion that 'The whites and blacks viewed each other as antagonists where the victory of one side would lead to the subjugation of the other' (p. 155). A small series of achievements—perhaps most notably Manfred Hodson's struggle for a multiracial University College, Basil Fletcher's blueprint for Ranche House College, and the independent schools' bursary scheme for Black pupils—might have served to indicate the existence of traditions of non-racial idealism, contrasting vividly with the dominant racialism of colonial society.

The study is well structured, carefully documented and written in an attractive discursive style. It makes a very useful addition to the significantly growing body of publications on the history of education in Zimbabwe.

Most of the papers in Mugomba and Nyaggah's collection were originally presented at an International Conference on Colonial Education and Contemporary Conflict in Southern Africa, held at the Santa Barbara campus of the University of California in 1977. As the editors explain in their Introduction, the intention has been to follow an uncompromisingly Reconstructionist theme. Europeans, they write, brought to Africa

> a new system of education which, like the colonial model of the political system, both subordinated and relegated to a peripheral role the African educational systems and the existing political, economic and social orders. The newcomers introduced alternative theories of education and imposed a new set of educational institutions which in some cases supplemented and in most others replaced previous forms of learning. The colonial schools required students of a specific age range to attend on a full-time basis rather than allowing them to be taught in the intervals between productive work, and on a lifelong basis (pp. 1–2).

In consequence, African countries, on the assumption of independence, found themselves 'saddled with an educational system unsuited to their requirements.

They needed people trained for responsibilities previously reserved for the colonial administrators. They also needed to foster a whole new spirit of self-reliance and experimentation' (p. 2). The various 'problems and contradictions' of the colonial educational legacy could be removed only by 'new philosophies and teaching methods' which must emerge from the distinctive circumstances of African life: 'just as the widening economic gap [between developed and developing countries] cannot be narrowed by importing solutions, the problem of basic education for the majority of Third World people cannot be solved by importing Western models (or even Eastern ones for that matter)' (pp. 3–4).

The theme of educational Reconstrucionism runs insistently through the four sections into which the papers have been grouped. In Part I, entitled 'Regional Perspectives', there are two contributions by Zimbabwean scholars teaching in the U.S. David Chanaiwa's study, 'African humanism in Southern Africa', represents an important re-assessment of the influence of early mission-educated élites, who, he suggests, 'created a utopian, universalist, and moralist world of their own to which they attempted to lead both the African and settler worlds' (p. 34). His conclusions are largely complemented by those of Agrippah Mugomba, whose contribution, 'African mind processing: Colonial miseducation and élite psychological decolonization', delivers a rejection of evolutionary educational change in post-colonial Africa. He considers that there is a 'desperate need to dismantle colonial institutions and structures in order to foster genuine political, economic, and social changes' (p. 53).

Part II contains three papers under the title of 'Philosophical Foundations', among which the most significant appears to be Mougo Nyaggah's study, 'Apartheid and second-class education in South Africa'. In Part III, concerned with 'Comparative Perspectives', there are five contributions, including two studies of educational development in Moçambique, by Mario Azevedo and Agrippah Mugomba. These contributions are supported by a small but well-chosen selection of documentary material as Appendices to the volume. Chanaiwa's 'Conclusion', presented as Part IV of the volume, impresses one as an able and well-structured synthesis of historical argument in the papers which have gone before. Without doubt he and his fellow-contributors have provided valuable new insight into many aspects of Southern Africa's educational history.

A concluding caveat on both works, however, is that historical evidence, though valuable in other ways, is never *per se* a reliable foundation for the determination of policy. One must necessarily look elsewhere to find support for the viability of any particular educational programme in current circumstances. The real case for Reconstructionism must ultimately stand or fall, less on consideration of the 'problems and contradictions' of the colonial past, than on the realistic appraisal of needs and possibilities in the Zimbabwe of today.

University of Zimbabwe N.D. ATKINSON