

book even more serviceable. There are misprints on pages 13, 15, 54, 66, 94, 99, 120, 143, 149, 155, 178, 186, 187 and 202, and surely Tabora is in Tanzania, not Uganda (p. 61). Mulolani is given the different forenames of Emilio and Otmilio in the space of two pages (pp. 165, 167).

The book covers a wide area succinctly, and presents its fund of information in a balanced and orderly way. It achieves the author's stated aims admirably, and deserves a far wider readership than the students for whom it was originally intended.

*University of Zimbabwe*

P. GIFFORD

**Transnationals in Southern Africa** Edited by D. B. Ndlela, A. Seidman, R. Seidman and K. Makamure. Harare, Zimbabwe Publishing House, 1986, iv, 219 pp., Z\$12.50 (p/b), ISBN 0-949225-06-1.

*Transnationals in Southern Africa* is the result of a workshop held in Harare in 1982 and attended by scholars from America, East and West Europe, and Southern Africa on techniques Southern African countries can use to, 'maximise the benefits and minimise the disadvantages of transnational corporate investment' (p. 1). The book therefore examines a topic of considerable interest in a subcontinent where multinational corporations (MNCs), particularly South African multinationals, play an important role in almost every sector of the regional economy and dominate strategic economic sectors of some countries. While most countries in the region are suspicious of MNCs and often view heavy foreign corporate involvement in their economies as a threat to their sovereignty, most Southern African countries would also agree with the opening statement of Simbi Mubako, then Zimbabwe's Minister of Justice, that 'we need transnational corporations [because] we lack the capital, the knowhow, the technology and sometimes the initiative to exploit our own natural resources or market them in the world' (p. 11). The paradox of countries not-wanting-but-needing multinationals is a challenge both to leaders and to scholars who hope to aid the growth of Southern Africa and the freeing of majority-ruled countries from dependence on South Africa. It is doubtful if this challenge is met by the contributors to *Transnationals in Southern Africa*.

An edited book is designed to be more than the sum of its parts, so it is important to examine the book as a whole as well as to consider the worth of the individual papers. It is unfortunate that the book took four years to be published, as foreign corporate involvement in Southern Africa is a fast-changing topic that demands up-to-date information if it is to be persuasive. For example, the dramatic opening by Mozambique to foreign investment in the last two years would have influenced the authors, or at least called for comment by them. The book is also mistitled. It is not, except for the recommendations, about Southern Africa, as it is concerned almost solely with the anglophone countries of the region. Indeed, most of the empirical work is from Zambia and Zimbabwe. This is unfortunate as there were four Mozambican participants at the workshop, and

corporate involvement in lusophone Africa is important to understand. For instance, the relationship between Angola and foreign oil companies is arguably the most important host-country-MNC relationship in the region, given Angola's almost total dependence on oil exports for government revenue and foreign currency. The lack of a unified approach by the authors towards multinationals is also regrettable especially given that some of the papers were written after the workshop. However, in the light of the complexity of the issues, agreement on even fundamental assumptions regarding multinationals may not have been possible.

The essays vary somewhat in quality. The paper by Neva Makgetla, Ann Seidman and Robert Seidman, 'Toward a SADCC Investment Code', is arguably the best in the collection. After providing an interesting review of the history of investment codes and the experience other developing countries have had in developing institutional regimes towards foreign corporate involvement, the authors provide some guidelines on what a regional investment code should include. Unfortunately, the authors concentrate on the technical requirements of such a code and do not discuss the political preconditions necessary for SADCC countries to actually begin co-ordinating macro- and microeconomic policies at a regional level. There is little evidence, five years after this workshop, that national leaders in Southern African countries are willing to cede significant control over their economies to regional authorities.

Daniel B. Ndlela's article on technology transfer and Colin Stoneman's contribution on transfer pricing also provide important evidence and analysis from other parts of the world on the problems less developed countries face when there is significant foreign corporate involvement in their economies. Both conclude that regional centres should be set up to assist Southern African countries. Ndlela suggests a regional centre for information on science and technology while Stoneman argues for a 'Transfer-Pricing Commando Unit' (p. 113). Once again, while these are interesting suggestions, it is unclear whether the political will exists for countries to co-ordinate sensitive economic policies at a regional level.

A second group of essays in the volume touch on interesting themes but are not persuasive in their application to Southern Africa. Stephen Zorn's essay on negotiating with transnationals mentions the specific problems of Southern Africa in only the most general way. A significant portion of this paper merely lists alternatives to transnational corporate investment which are familiar to anyone with any knowledge of present-day international economics. Zorn does, however, manage to list the wrong American agency providing export financing (p. 83). It is the Export-Import Bank and not, as is asserted, the Overseas Private Investment Corporation. Similarly, Bingu wa Mutharika provides scant analysis on some general problems and concludes with some unconvincing recommendations. It is true, as he says, that developing clear economic goals, a comprehensive information system, and local technical and managerial capabilities would help SADCC in collective negotiations with transnationals; but first there has to be some indication that Southern African countries actually want to co-ordinate their policies. It is somewhat ironic that many of the authors in this volume immediately recognize that foreign businesses have a political role but are unwilling to discuss the political requirements for a collective approach towards multinationals. Instead, they prefer to concentrate on basically technocratic

recommendations that are relatively simple to formulate but irrelevant in the absence of political commitment.

Gerhard Wittich and Andras Sajo have each contributed an article on the economic experience of socialist countries. Wittich's article on regional integration in the Council for Mutual Economic Assistance (CMEA) argues that regional co-ordination and state intervention have promoted economic growth. While he presents evidence not normally available to Southern African readers, he does not attempt to argue that conditions in this region are similar enough to Eastern Europe and the Soviet Union that the CMEA experience can be duplicated here. Nor does he isolate specific policies which would be particularly relevant to Southern Africa. Sajo's article on transnationals in socialist countries is more relevant to the problems discussed in the volume although the author admits that owing to the relatively low level of foreign investment in socialist countries the evidence presented is 'scanty' (p. 204). Remarkably, given the interests of the other authors in devising regional approaches towards transnationals, Sajo only discusses relations between foreign companies and individual socialist states. Whether this is because of an absence of a co-ordinated CMEA approach or simple analytic oversight is unclear, but reviewing the CMEA's collective policies towards foreign business would have been an important addition to the volume.

The other two essays in the volume are a paper on transnational corporations and poverty in Southern Africa by Ann and Robert Seidman and a paper on corporate taxation by Ann Seidman. The two papers should be considered together as the contribution on taxation is actually one suggestion as to how to end the impoverishing effects of MNCs. While in good part a restatement of work done by various members of the Seidman family, the papers contain some valuable evidence. Seidman's comparative presentation on corporate taxation is, for instance, a valuable treatment of a sorely-neglected topic. Unfortunately, both papers suffer from ideological overkill that renders them of doubtful value. In the Seidmans' quest to prove their point, highly complex situations are unpersuasively simplified and some evidence is distorted. For instance, the Seidmans group all economists who study foreign investment into two groups: 'neo-classical' theorists, who focus on factors of production, and 'transforming institutionalists', who focus on the institutional structures inherited by Third World countries (p. 26). The Seidmans argue that 'neo-classicists' believe that

by offering them sufficient goodies (tax incentives, subsidies and cheap credit, eased foreign exchange controls, guarantees against expropriation, etc.), governments can create the 'hospitable investment climate' needed to attract investment. Once the transnationals invest, production will rise. In sum, if government can induce foreign companies to invest, increased inputs will, necessarily, result in increased output — and the results will trickle down to the masses (p. 26).

These economists advise countries to throw 'wide the doors to transnational corporations' (p. 27). This is a gross simplification of the views of many economists who have radically different views on foreign investment, and the fact that the Seidmans cite exactly one 'neo-classical' source — Paul Samuelson's 1958 textbook — makes their argument even more unpersuasive. In fact, even the Seidmans' own source is much more nuanced than the academic parody they paint. Samuelson, in fact, does not see, even in 1958, foreign investment playing

the same kind of role which the Seidmans argue is a basic assumption of 'neo-classical' thought. He writes that 'for many reasons we moderns cannot expect great things from foreign investment'.<sup>1</sup> Of course, that was in 1958. By the ninth edition of Samuelson's textbook (published in 1973, fifteen years after the edition cited by the Seidmans but nine years before the workshop and available in the University of Zimbabwe library) Samuelson departs even further from the purported 'neo-classical' view: 'Local management must be trained to take over ultimately; local sharing in ownership of branch plants is a modern necessity'.<sup>2</sup> There are, of course, crucial disagreements among economists on the issues raised by the Seidmans but the simplicity of the analysis presented makes the authors unpersuasive.

Similar problems are evident in the actual analysis. For instance, in Ann Seidman's study of taxation there is a case study of Zimbabwe in which the author examines what she calls 'unused investable surpluses' (p. 129). These surpluses are profits earned by corporations which could be, but are not, reinvested. Her technique in estimating the surpluses is simplistic as she ignores the fact that some of the money she calls unused is probably going into consumption. However, there is a more complex problem. In Zimbabwe, as Professor Seidman should know, corporations are accruing massive sums of money in blocked accounts which cannot be repatriated or be further invested because there are strict government controls on foreign companies investing outside their area of business. These regulations were adopted by the Government in order to prevent increased foreign control of the economy. As companies cannot invest further, they accumulate funds. Given that Professor Seidman would probably agree with government policy on preventing further foreign corporate involvement, it is logically inconsistent also to blame foreign companies for not investing. There are undoubtedly unused investable surpluses in Zimbabwe although at a lower level than the authors estimate. However, failure to examine the complexities of the situation renders the analysis less than compelling to the reader or to the government official looking for advice.

Unfortunately, there also appears to be some outright distortion of evidence on the part of the Seidmans. For instance, the authors claim that, while Zambia decreased its dependence on South Africa for a period of time, 'after 1978, however, the International Monetary Fund pressured it to increase purchases of South African products' (p. 38). The source cited is a March 1978 *Financial Mail* article.<sup>3</sup> In fact, the article, 'Zambia: IMF to the Rescue', does not even mention South Africa, much less IMF pressure to buy South African goods. It does suggest that the IMF pressured Zambia to open its southern border but makes clear that that border would be opened in order to trans-ship goods across Rhodesia to Mozambique. Of course, if the southern border were opened it might mean an increase in the purchase of South African goods but this assumption is so far from the actual reporting in the article as to be a clearly illegitimate extrapolation.

<sup>1</sup> P. Samuelson, *Economics: An Introductory Analysis* (New York, McGraw-Hill, 4th edn., 1958), 764.

<sup>2</sup> P. Samuelson, *Economics: An Introductory Analysis* (New York, McGraw-Hill, 9th edn., 1973), 781.

<sup>3</sup> *Financial Mail*, 24 Mar. 1978, 911.

The book concludes with an appendix containing the workshop's recommendations which are drawn mainly from the papers in the volume. While the recommendations on a technical level are often quite persuasive, there seems relatively little chance of them being adopted. Certainly, five years after the workshop was held, there seems to be very little movement in favour of a regional approach towards foreign investment. Perhaps a more sophisticated and nuanced analysis than what is available in *Transnationals in Southern Africa* would persuade policy-makers about the need for collective action towards multinational corporations.

University of Zimbabwe

J. I. HERBST

**Studies of Fishing on Lake Kariba** By M. F. C. Bourdillon, A. P. Cheater and M. W. Murphree. Gweru, Mambo Press, Mambo Occasional Papers — Socio-Economic Series 20, 1985, 185 pp., Z\$6.60.

**Inshore Fishing Co-operatives in the Kariba District** By M. F. C. Bourdillon. Gweru, Mambo Press, Mambo Occasional Papers — Socio-Economic Series 21, 1986, 34 pp., Z\$2.25.

Lake Kariba seems to fascinate most Zimbabweans, and it is almost impossible to find a popular book on this country which does not devote a great deal of space to it. Its ecology has also been studied in some detail and it is now best-known of the large African reservoirs; however, the social and economic aspects of the fisheries have generally been ignored, despite the fact that the fisheries were meant to compensate the displaced people for the loss of their traditional homes. Consequently, these books are a welcome and much-needed contribution to the literature on Kariba.

The first chapter of *Studies of Fishing on Lake Kariba* describes the history of fishing on the lake, and outlines the different management policies that were introduced on the southern and northern shores. Neither policy was particularly successful and both were unable to cope with the initial period of high productivity followed by a drastic decline which disrupted the fishery. This phenomenon has been noted in most other man-made lakes since Kariba was built and, to be fair, no other fishery administration seems to have been able to deal with it either. The history of the successful 'kapenta' fishery is also given in this chapter and the authors draw attention to the apparent lack of a joint Zimbabwean-Zambian approach to its management. Since this is a shared resource this is a matter for concern.

The Tonga-speaking fishermen of the Binga District are discussed by M. W. Murphree in Chapter 2, whilst M. F. C. Bourdillon considers the Shona-speaking ones in Chapter 3. In both chapters, the villages, the people who live in them, and the way they catch and market their fish are described, and this provides a fascinating insight into the hard and often unprofitable lives led by the fishermen. Some consideration of their attitudes and perceptions is included, especially in regard to officials of one sort or another and to the large company that has for