

MANPOWER DEVELOPMENT AND EDUCATION SINCE INDEPENDENCE

U. KANN AND D. TAYLOR

Introduction

It is difficult for the old to remember and the young to visualize what life was like in the newly-independent Botswana of 1966. There were very few paid jobs in the modern sector within the country. Most people depended on their crops for food, and their cattle for cash income. Some went to work on the mines in South Africa. Lobatse and Francistown were larger than the new capital city, Gaborone, which had only just ceased to be one huge building site. Overall, the country was very much poorer than it is today, both in national income and in average personal incomes. The government was unable to cover its recurrent expenditure from domestic revenues and continued to rely on the annual grant-in-aid from Britain until into the 1970s. As a result, Botswana was immediately categorized by the United Nations as one of the 25 least developed countries in the world. Over the last twenty years of independence, however, there have been very many significant changes.

In this paper, we attempt to give an account of policies and achievements in the fields of education and manpower development since independence. We explain manpower planning and its relationship with national development planning and try to show how various policies in the educational sector have been related, or more often not related, to the manpower

planning process and projections arising from it.

The Role and Development of Manpower Planning in Botswana

At the time of independence, manpower planning was increasingly becoming the basis for educational planning in developing countries, though it took some time before it was firmly established in Botswana. The very beginning of manpower planning in Botswana can be traced back to the establishment of a Standing Advisory Committee (of officials) on Recruitment, Training and Localization Policy in 1961. The Committee produced a White Paper in 1962 proposing inter alia measures to improve teacher training, secondary and technical education as well as bursaries for post secondary education.

Other Committees of a similar nature soon followed. In 1963, there was a Localization and Training Committee and in mid-1964 an Advisory Public Service Commission. The establishment of these committees reflect concern with how to staff and manage the small government administration which had been run from Mafikeng, outside the borders of the Protectorate. A number of studies concerned with manpower needs of the country, particularly those of the Public Service, included the following:

1. The Development of the Bechuanaland Economy or the "Porter Report". This was the report of the Ministry of Overseas Development Economic Survey Mission in 1965.
2. Report on Localization and Training or the "Luke Report", dated 1965.
3. Secondary Level Teachers: Supply and Demand in Botswana or "the Michigan State Study" carried out by John W. Hanson of the American Council on Education from 1968.
4. Further Education in Botswana 1969 or the "Pickard Report". This was a report of a mission to study and make recommendations concerning technical, commercial and other vocational education and training in Botswana, Lesotho and Swaziland.

5. Report of the Academic Planner to the University of Botswana, Lesotho and Swaziland or the "Alexander Report", 1969.
6. "Memorandum to the Government of Botswana on the Mission of Dr. S.G.L. Nigam, ILO Regional Manpower Advisor for Africa from 19 April to 23 April 1970". or the "Nigam Memorandum". This consisted of general advice to government regarding manpower planning and stressed the need for "... a detailed establishment enquiry as early as possible both in the public and private sectors".
7. Report on the Commission on the Salaries and Conditions of Service of the Public Service and the Teaching Service or the "Okoh Report".

Concern with manpower needs can probably be explained by the fact that, at the time, there were very few Batswana with qualifications required to function in managerial, technical and professional positions. As a result, the Transitional Plan for Social and Economic Development (1966) emphasized localization and training for the administration of the country. The plan stated that, "the primary aim in the field of education is to create in the shortest possible time, with such financial means as may be available, a stock of trained local manpower capable of serving the country's economy" (Transitional Plan, 1966:52).

Government set targets to reach self sufficiency in high-level manpower by 1990 at a planned growth rate of six percent annually. This figure was closely tied to the anticipated overall rate of economic growth. All posts of a non-specialized administrative nature were to be localized by 1972. There was also some concern to retain teachers in the service, and it was proposed to remove discrepancies between the salary structure of the teaching service and that of the Public Service.

Unlike the Transitional Plan, the first National Development Plan (1968-73) was concerned with wider issues such as equitable distribution of income, the possibility of introducing a minimum wages policy and the need for a labour migration policy. The second National Development Plan

(1970-75), however, reintroduced the concern for local manpower. The Plan noted that only 10 percent of the jobs that required 680 people with diploma and degree qualifications were held by Batswana. It was estimated that category II manpower (i.e. people with a minimum of five years secondary education) would be fully localized in 10 to 15 years.

In 1973, Colclough carried out a manpower Employment Survey which introduced a wide basis for manpower planning. The "Colclough Report" was a pioneering study which recommended that: more attention be paid to localisation priorities not only in government but in the private sector as well. The report also recommended that "vigorous efforts should be made to increase the participation of women in the formal sector", and that a student counselling service be established to help avoid the unrealistic career aspirations of students and that adult education and the informal sector be given due attention.

The Employment Survey provided a lot of needed base-line data and what appears to have been well-founded recommendations. However, inadequate machinery existed for the implementation of the recommendations. In 1978, M. Lipton prepared the first (and only) report dealing with how to provide full employment in the country. Although many of the recommendations were apparently too radical for the time, the report led to the establishment of the Employment Policy Unit within the Ministry of Finance and Development Planning in 1980. This unit later (see especially NDP V) adopted many of the recommendations from previous studies. One of the first tasks of the unit was to reactivate the National Employment, Manpower and Incomes Council (NEMIC), a tripartite consultative body, for which the unit provides the secretariat.

The third National Development Plan (1973-78) was the first to contain long-term (1978 to 1988) estimates for cadres with different educational level requirements. Government had realized that the need for skilled manpower in the very rapidly growing economy of the country had been grossly underestimated

in previous plans. At last, manpower planning had (theoretically) become more fully integrated with economic planning; implementation, however, lagged behind.

The fourth National Development Plan (1976-81) reiterated government's policy to link post-primary education to manpower needs. In general, future requirements for skilled Batswana were shown to be greater than it had been forecast in the previous plans. Pressure for formal employment from large numbers of the population had become evident. A full-scale manpower study was to be undertaken in 1978. However, this apparently did not take place. Nevertheless, the plan cautioned that not more than 25 percent of the labour force could expect to be in formal employment by the year 2000. The employment strategy included:

- to maximise the rate of job creation associated with the growth of the modern sector, and to spread such employment to the villages as well as the towns.
- to provide increased opportunities for productive self-employment and informal sector employment, particularly in the rural areas and on the urban fringes.

The fifth National Development Plan (1979-85) contains a separate chapter on education which reflects to a large extent the 1977 White Paper on Educational Policy based on the recommendations of the National Commission on Education. The Plan recognizes the increasing need for skilled manpower, especially in maths and science. In 1983, the concept of a mid-term review was introduced and government took this opportunity to strengthen the manpower in the context of national development planning.

In the sixth (current) National Development Plan (1985-91), the manpower issues appear not to feature as prominently as could be expected, considering the trend of thinking in the preceding few years. Nevertheless, manpower planning issues are integrated within different sectors e.g. education, health,

agriculture etc.

The Development of the Educational System

At the time of independence, the educational system was underdeveloped. There were 250 primary schools and nine secondary schools including Gaborone Secondary School which had just opened in 1965 and was regarded with great pride by the departing colonial administration. The University of Botswana Lesotho and Swaziland (UBLS) had only recently been established at the Roma Campus in Lesotho as a regional secular institution serving the three countries. There were about 40 citizens who held a Bachelor's degree, and the majority of secondary school teachers were expatriates. Lobatse and Serowe TTC's were in existence to train primary school teachers, but there was no provision for training secondary school teachers except through the degree programme at UBLS. UBLS, however, had only a handful of Batswana students, most of whom were destined for non-teaching jobs anyway.

The Department of Education fell under the Ministry of Labour and Social Services with the former Headmaster of Moeng College, Mr. B.C. Thema, as the Minister. It occupied just a few rooms on the first floor of the present Ministry of Education building. There were no Community Junior Secondary Schools although Molefi, Seepapitso and Kgari Sechele schools were not dissimilar to the ill-equipped and poorly-staffed community schools of more recent times. Institutions such as the Polytechnic, Botswana Agricultural College, Institute of Development Management, National Institute of Health, Department of Non-Formal Education etc., did not exist.

Just before Independence, and shortly thereafter, a good deal of energy went into the determination of responsibilities and the formulation of laws and regulations governing the fledgling system of education. Primary schools were placed under the newly-formed Town and District Councils. The Botswana Teaching Service was established in 1966 after the enabling legislation

had been passed in 1964. The main piece of Educational legislation was passed in 1966 and came into effect in 1967. Regulations governing the registration of schools and the levels of school fees were promulgated in 1967. Regulations governing corporal punishment in schools came into effect in 1968. The Ministry of Labour and Social Services (which included the Department of Education) was re-named the Ministry of Education, Health and Labour in 1968. It was not until 1970 that the separate Ministry of Education was formed, with B.C. Thema as Minister of Education.

There was steady growth in both primary and secondary school enrolments in the late 1960's but few new institutions were set up by the government under its severe budgetary limitations. The three 'tribal' secondary schools (Kgari Sechele, Molefi and Seepapitso) were taken over by government in 1967, and Patrick van Rensburg opened his second school, at Tonota, in 1968. However, the increasing number of secondary school places was nowhere near the level of demand for places, especially in the climate of heightened expectations after independence. As a result, there emerged between 1968 and 1969, the first set of entirely-unaided private secondary schools in Kanye, Lobatse, Molepolole, Mochudi and Mahalapye (MOE, 1984). These schools were regarded as inferior and were largely ignored by government. They, nevertheless, absorbed significant numbers of candidates for secondary school places. Botswana Agricultural College was opened in 1967 and Francistown TTC in 1968. The Francistown TTC was established to provide the base for upgrading skills and qualifications of the many unqualified primary school teachers through a combination of correspondence tuition and vacation courses. The Francistown TTC, however, had no full-time students in its early years. In 1968, government approved the establishment of Maru-a-Pula as a prestigious independent school, however, controversy over this decision erupted in 1970.

In 1969, there were three significant developments in the education system; the introduction of a new primary school

curriculum, the establishment of the National Brigades Coordinating Committee and the opening of an office and activities of the Department of Extra-Mural Services of UBLs, which marked the very beginning of a university presence in Botswana. In 1969, Pickard (1969, para B12) made a projection of the output of Form 5 leavers up to the year 1985. These projections make an interesting comparison with actual outcomes (see Table 1).

The late 1960's were the heyday of Swaneng Hill School under the pioneering leadership of Patrick van Rensburg (Van Rensburg, 1974). The brigades, the diversified curriculum, the practical work, the community involvement and the student participation led to Swaneng being held up as a model of innovative and 'relevant' education for development, and a much-quoted example in conferences, reports and books outside Botswana. But the establishment of the Swaneng Board of Governors in 1970 led to diminishing vision and increasing bureaucratisation, and eventually to complete takeover by government in 1975. Much the same pattern was repeated at similar schools, notably Shashe River School, Madiba Educational Training Centre and Tutume Community College at different stages during the 1970s.

The first priority in the years immediately after independence was the training of high-level manpower and it was thought that this required emphasis on secondary and higher education. The limited funds available were therefore applied more to the expansion of secondary schooling than to the primary sector. Thus, total primary school enrollment increased at an average annual rate of 2.3 percent per annum (from 72,000 in 1966 to 82,000 in 1972) whilst enrollment in government and government-aided secondary schools increased at an average annual rate of 43 percent (from 1500 in 1966 to 5600 in 1972).

But, by the early 1970's it was increasingly recognized, not only in Botswana, that expansion at the secondary level depended on a sound base of primary schooling, that equality of

educational opportunity demanded a more extensive primary education system, and that primary education could have a more direct and immediate impact in such fields as agriculture and health than in manpower training. The emphasis accordingly shifted somewhat back from secondary towards primary education in Botswana as in many other developing countries.

Table 1: Number of Form 5 leavers

Projection (Pickard Report)		Outcome
1970	231	247
1971	304	270
1972	372	378
1973	490	503
1974	520	512
1975	565	686
1976	609	837
1977	654	841
1978	699	1017
1979	743	1148
1980	832	1182
1981	921	1424
1982	1011	1481
1983	1100	1557
1984	1189	1596

Source: Pickard, 1979. Education Statistics.

This shift in policy was embodied in the National Development Plan for 1973-78 and given most tangible form in the reduction of primary school fees from R6 to R3 in 1973. This resulted in a bigger increase in enrolments in that one year than in the six previous years combined. Since then, total primary enrollment has increased at a rate of approximately 10,000 pupils per year.

Another significant development in the early 1970's was the growth of university teaching and buildings in Gaborone. The Department of Extra-Mural Services (DEMS) had been operating from the building which is now occupied by the National Institute of Development Research and Documentation (NIR). Teaching of full-time degree students in Gaborone began in 1971 after the decision to devolve most Part I (the first two years of University) teaching to each of the three countries (Botswana, Lesotho and Swaziland). The construction of the original buildings on the main campus took place between 1971 and 1973. DEMS ran the first major Radio Learning Group campaign "The People and the Plan" in 1973 and the Advanced Teachers' Certificate course was transferred from Francistown TTC to the university in the same year (and renamed the Diploma in Secondary Education five years later). The only UBLS graduation ceremony ever to be held in Gaborone took place in 1975, shortly after which the Lesotho government precipitately nationalized the university's buildings and other assets in Lesotho, after failing to reach agreement with Botswana and Swaziland on the further devolution of physical facilities, staff and teaching. The university was re-constituted as the University of Botswana and Swaziland in 1976.

In 1973, the Botswana Extension College was established to offer examination and non-formal courses by correspondence. In 1974, the National Centre for Vocational Training, later to become the Botswana Polytechnic, opened in Gaborone. Private, unaided, community secondary schools were included in the published Education Statistics for the first time in 1973, causing a jump in the figures for that year (see Appendix A). Fifteen of these schools were established in the first ten years after independence, plus seven senior secondary schools, making a total of 22 new schools, of which only two (Lobatse and Selebi-Phikwe) were directly initiated by government. This reflects, in part, the level of popular demand for secondary schooling and the extent of community initiative in satisfying the demand for schooling. It is also due partly to a deliberate policy of catering for expansion by enlarging

existing schools rather than creating new ones. But it is notable that the numbers of schools and of school places came about more as a result of historical forces than as a result of a carefully calculated response to either manpower needs or social demand. In 1974, B.C. Thema retired as Minister of Education and was replaced by K.P. Morake who has retained this portfolio in the Cabinet ever since.

Undoubtedly, the single most important report on education in Botswana to appear in twenty years of independence is the 1977 Report of the National Commission on Education, entitled 'Education for Kagisano'. By 1975, the government felt the need for a comprehensive review of the system and a blueprint for future policy. In December of that year, the President appointed the Commission of six men (no women), of whom two were Batswana, one American, one British, and one Ethiopian with the Swedish Torsten Husen as Chairman. Throughout 1976, the Commission got together several times, conducted some studies and commissioned others, held consultation meetings, received submissions, set up task forces on curriculum areas, and travelled the country for institutional visits, meetings and interviews. Their report, in two large volumes with 156 recommendations, was submitted in April 1977. Noting that "Education may have grown much, but it has changed little" (National Commission on Education, 1977:.1) since independence, the commission recommended a new strategy for educational development incorporating six major changes in policy:

1. "Immediate priority for quantitative and qualitative improvement in primary education;
2. Provision of nine years of schooling, with the last three years in day junior secondary schools, for all by about 1990;
3. A re-orientation of the curriculum;
4. Introduction of a national service scheme for Form V leavers;

5. Greatly increased emphasis upon part-time learning, out of school education and the combination of learning and work and
6. Elimination of major discontinuities in the present education system'. (National Commission, 1977; p.51).

The report had remarkably little to say about either manpower needs or vocational training. The government's response to these proposals was embodied in White Paper No. 1 of 1977, the 'National Policy on Education', which accepted the main thrust of the report and many of the specific recommendations, whilst expressing reservations about others and rejecting a few. But the importance of the National Commission lies less in the Report itself than in the base of information and analysis it has since provided and in the thinking and discussion it has stimulated. Educational debate in Botswana has been so much better-informed in the last ten years than it was in the first ten years after independence.

Following the Commission's proposals and the increasing availability of funds, both from domestic mining revenues and from external donors, the late 1970's were marked mainly by the establishment of new institutions, programmes and management structures. 1976 saw the establishment of the Unified Teaching Service, with responsibilities for the employment of primary school teachers taken over from the local councils. There was a big Radio Learning Group campaign on the Tribal Grazing Land Policy in June-July 1976. In that year, an agreement was made with the World Bank to provide their first education loan to Botswana, intended mainly to finance six new government secondary schools plus Matsha Community College in Kang as a centre for both formal and non-formal education for the peoples of the Kgagadi. The Boipelego Education Project was set up to administer these funds and see to the construction of the new schools. The Boipelego Education Project has since become the permanent implementation unit of the Ministry of Education for all major donor-funded development projects.

The Ministry's Department of Curriculum Development and Evaluation was set up in 1977 and the Department of Non-Formal Education in 1978, the latter incorporating the Botswana Extension College. A feasibility study was conducted in 1977 on the idea of establishing an Automotive Trades Training School and BRIDEC was established in 1978 to provide training and management support for the growing brigade movement.

The National Commission on Education was re-convened in 1979 to clarify, reconsider or elaborate on some of its earlier recommendations, notably those dealing with policy of English-Medium Primary Schools and on the transition from the 7-3-2 structure to the proposed 6-3-3- pattern. The National Development Plan 1979-85 was prepared during 1979 and incorporated many of the policy changes and new emphases derived from the National Commission's original and supplementary reports.

There were also conflicts and controversies in the late 1970's. Patrick van Rensburg was in public dispute with the government in late 1977, and the financial crisis of the Serowe brigade reached its peak in 1978. Government was publicly supportive of the brigade movement though widely seen as unofficially hostile. There was a bitter dispute between the Ministry of Education and Maru-a-Pula school over the issues of whether this school should be subject to or exempted from the Private Secondary Schools Regulations of 1978. There was also considerable controversy over the plans for the introduction of the national service scheme, which eventually got the name Tirelo Setshaba.

The late 1970's were also marked by efforts to improve the quality of education in various ways. A new primary school curriculum was in preparation, to be introduced from 1980, and the USAID-funded Primary Education Improvement Project was launched in 1981 to provide pre-service training for future leaders in the primary education sector. In line with a recommendation of the National Commission, government began to

provide professional support for the unaided private secondary schools, and the first financial grants (P20 per student) to these schools were made in 1980. The demise of the regional Examinations Council and the growth of the new Department of Curriculum Development and Evaluation stimulated professional development in subject panels, syllabus and test construction, materials production and related in-service training. Primary school enrollment increased from 83,000 in 1970 to 172,000 in 1980, secondary school enrollment increased from 3,900 in 1970 to 18,300 in 1980, and the number of Botswana university students increased from 200 in 1970 to nearly 1,000 in 1980.

Primary school fees were finally abolished in 1980, again in line with a recommendation of the National Commission. In the same year, the Serowe brigades collapsed (van Rensburg, 1984), the National Centre for Vocational Training was upgraded and renamed the Botswana Polytechnic, and the National Service Scheme, Tirelo Setshaba, was started as a pilot project but on rather different lines from those proposed by the National Commission. The National Literacy Programme was launched in 1981 and has since grown to a point where there are 40,000 adult learners in approximately 3,000 literacy groups spread all over the country. Also in 1981, the Botswana Training Centre, which had been established in 1962 to meet the public service need for training particularly in clerical, secretarial and bookkeeping skills, was transferred to the Office of the President and renamed the Botswana Institute of Administration and Commerce.

The Automotive Trades Training School opened in January 1982. In the same year, the University of Botswana and Swaziland was dissolved and the University College of Botswana was reconstituted as the University of Botswana, with Professor John Turner as the first Vice-Chancellor. Thus, UBBS begat UBLS which begat UBS which begat UCB which begat UB - all in a single generation of less than twenty years.

The major trend of the early 1980's has surely been the move towards universal access to secondary education through the Community Junior Secondary Schools (Swartland and Taylor, 1987). In 1983, with pressure mounting for more places in Form One, with a general election due the following year, and with some significant personnel changes in the Ministry of Education, there was renewed emphasis on the expansion of secondary education. This was to be achieved by partnership between government and the people. Communities were encouraged to start new junior secondary schools, councils were requested to make primary school classrooms available for secondary school use, and government agreed to provide more financial support, both for the capital costs of construction and for recurrent expenditure. Fifteen new Community Junior Secondary Schools opened in 1984, seven more in 1985 and six more in 1986, bringing the total of such schools to 45 - twice the number of government and government-aided mission schools. In January 1986, more Form One students were enrolled in community secondary schools than in the government and aided schools for the first time. Tshesebe village in North-East District now has a new secondary school, 55 years after K.T. Motsetse established the Tati Training Institution there which survived for only six years as the first secondary school in the country.

In 1983, there were two significant conferences in Botswana. In May, there was an important seminar on manpower planning at I.D.M. and in August, the week-long Botswana Society symposium on education for development brought together politicians, academics, teachers, planners and students for a wide-ranging debate (Crowder, 1984). In 1984, the Special Education Unit was established to cater for the special needs of the physically and mentally handicapped. It was also decided then that a Tirelo Setshaba Certificate was to be an additional requirement for entry to university and some other courses.

In 1985, Tlokweneng TTC, built with funds from the World Bank, and Molepolole College of Education, built with funds from the African Development Bank, were opened. The USAID-funded Junior

Secondary Education Improvement Project was launched and a decision was made to standardize tuition fees for all secondary students at P170 per year, thus removing the previous anomaly of higher fees for lower quality provision in the community schools. The most notable events of 1986 include the increase in the grant paid to community schools from P40 to P80 per student per year and the introduction of the new two year Junior Secondary Curriculum, following on from the new primary curriculum (introduced a few years ago) to provide a continuous programme of nine-years basic education which was proposed by the National Commission.

Manpower Projections and Employment Outcomes

As indicated earlier, the manpower planning system was not very sophisticated initially. As a result, manpower requirements were underestimated. The number of new jobs created in the fast expanding economy was remarkable especially during the first half of the 1970's. However, the highest employment growth has taken place in the Government sector including education itself. Other fast developing sectors from an employment point of view have been Manufacturing, Construction and Trade (see Table 2). An important factor to take into consideration when noting this positive development regarding job-creation is that there has been a simultaneous decline in formal employment opportunities for Batswana in South Africa.

An analysis of manpower forecasts and actual employment for the fifth National Development Plan (1979-85) shows that actual employment turned out to be several thousand below projections throughout the period. It can partly be explained by problems with the base figures, but also with actual slower growth in certain sectors. It should be noted throughout that manufacturing had a growth rate of 14.2 percent as against the 7.7 percent projected.

Table 2: Formal Sector Employment, 1968 - 1986

Year	1968	1973	1977	1981	1984	1986*
Agriculture (freehold)	4,150	4,625	4,250	4,800	5,600	6,302
Mining	825	3,525	5,500	7,300	7,100	7,103
Manufacturing	1,700	3,000	4,150	6,400	10,700	12,656
Water & Electricity	-	325	975	1,600	2,000	2,407
Construction	1,575	7,225	6,950	15,200	11,500	13,340
Trade, Hotels	4,000	8,600	10,000	15,300	17,000	19,514
Transp. & Communications	1,125	1,350	1,850	3,900	4,200	4,708
Banking, Insur. & Bus. Serv)			(2,425)			
Social & Pers. Service	2,550	3,150	(2,100)	8,700	10,500	11,822
Gen. Gvt. & Education	8,825	15,175	24,175	34,200	43,200	49,873

* Forecast in NDP II.

Source: CSO Employment Surveys

The Role of Education in Employment Creation

At Independence, the role of education was seen in the context of localization and filling the gaps in the civil service. For certain areas where there is a profound manpower shortage the role of education is still seen in that context. However, the National Commission on Education widened the perspective by arguing for the importance of an educated population in a general sense in order to achieve the country's goal of sustained development. In contrast to this, Lipton's *Employment and Labour Use in Botswana* (1978) as well as the later Report of The Presidential Commission on Economic

Opportunities (1982), advocated that general education should be more closely related to vocational skills useful in self-employment. It is understandable that such views appear at a time, when it becomes obvious to many that there will not be formal employment opportunities for everyone in the labour force for many years to come. But it is a widespread fallacy that vocationalised education creates jobs. Unemployment is an economic problem, not an educational problem and can not be solved by curriculum reform. Overall, educational development since Independence has had the following positive effects on employment creation:

- a decrease in skill shortages which constituted bottlenecks/obstacles to new projects in both the public and private sectors.
- an increase in skill levels and possibly productivity, thereby opening up new options for investment and production.
- an increase in number of employees in the education/training sector itself.
- the creation of an improved labour/employment market where individuals find jobs and employers find staff more easily.

Education, Wages Policy and Income Distribution

One of the government's development planning objectives is "Social Justice". Incomes policy is a key variable in the discussion of manpower development and social justice. In his paper on labour and economic development, Ghai (1972) identified a number of concerns specific to an incomes policy for Botswana. The most important concerns were:

- to minimize income differentials between urban and rural areas.
- to minimize income differentials between government and private sector.
- the dependency on incomes policies within the Custom's Union.

- the dependency on 'international' policies because of the need for expatriates.
- to minimize income differentials between senior levels and e.g. industrial class staff.
- the question of a minimum wages policy and its impact on employment creation.

These concerns were taken into consideration in the White Paper No. 2 of 1972, National Policy on Incomes, Employment, Prices and Profits. The incomes policy as stated in 1972 remains the same. Its main aims are:

- to maximise the growth of new job opportunities
- to prevent a widening of the gap in living standards between those in formal sector jobs and those dependent on traditional agriculture.
- to prevent Government's scarce financial resources from being directly or indirectly pre-empted by the modern sector.

The policy as such appears fairly radical, and its implementation was fairly successful during its first years of existence. However, since 1974 it appears that successive salaries review commissions have not managed to enforce the policy to any greater extent. Colclough and McCarthy summarized the situation in 1978 stating that at that time "the interests of the more powerful and articulate groups within the civil service were beginning to win out. Earlier efforts to reduce differentials were reversed, and the further reduction of inequality was no longer the main criterion for Government in determining its own salary structure". (Colclough and McCarthy, 1978:187). Unfortunately, this statement is true even for 1986.

In relation to education, the main equity considerations are equality of access to educational opportunity and the impact of educational financing arrangements on income distribution. There has been very little serious study of these issues in Botswana - which may itself reflect that equity is not a high

priority. It is frequently argued or assumed that reducing school fees will promote equity by helping the poor. But this is only true where access is universal or near universal.

The reduction of primary school fees in 1973 and their abolition in 1980 were clearly egalitarian moves. But where education is selective and only a minority have access, where the select few are drawn disproportionately from the relatively advantaged population (e.g. urban, modern sector families), and where educational provision is the key to subsequent good jobs and high incomes, then public subsidy of education promotes greater inequality in income distribution.

Recognising this, the National Commission on Education recommended much higher fees at secondary school (combined with extra bursaries for those who really need them). Although this recommendation was accepted, it has not been acted upon and the real private costs of secondary schooling have fallen further. What this means is that the education of a privileged minority is being increasingly financed from resources which could be used for the benefit of the nation as a whole, or to put it more crudely, the poor are subsidizing the rich. This is not what most people mean by the phrase 'social justice'.

On the other hand, the government has been more conscious of other equity aspects of education. Specific measures to promote greater equality (of opportunity and/or income) through education have been the abolition of primary school fees (as noted earlier), the standardization of secondary school fees, the more extensive provision of bursaries, the redistribution of resources (e.g. qualified teachers) in favour of previously disadvantaged districts, the ending of public subsidies to English-Medium Primary schools and bursaries for Maru-a-Pula students, and the scheme which requires graduates to repay 5 percent of their salaries to government as a partial repayment of the cost of their education. The net effect of the various mechanisms for financing education on the distribution of income in Botswana is largely unknown and deserves much more

serious study and debate than it has hitherto received.

Conclusion

Although manpower needs have provided the official justification for educational expansion most of the time since Independence, the actual determinants have rather been population growth, political pressure, availability of qualified entrants at each level, and availability of funds. There has been little serious attempt to integrate manpower planning and educational development.

A machinery for the implementation and monitoring of the manpower plans is still inadequate. Furthermore, there has been little effort and consequently little success in relating the educational system to the declared goals and development strategy of the government. Thus, for example, little thought has been given to how education could or should contribute to rural development and employment creation. Similarly, issues in the financing of education, such as the level of school fees are not resolved by reference to the goal of social justice. Primary education and non-formal education, which would provide for more equity, have, for most of the time since Independence, been given low priority.

In general, over the past twenty years, there has been strong government commitment to education in the form of much increased expenditure, quantitative expansion and more systematic operation. But, inadequate attention to many long-term policy issues e.g. curriculum and financing as well as manpower needs and development goals has meant that the educational system has not had such a beneficial impact on production, employment, rural development and social justice as envisaged in the plans. The overall situation twenty years after independence is still of shortage of skilled and professional manpower and oversupply of unskilled manpower.

EDUCATIONAL EXPANSION, 1960-1986

	1961	1962	1963	1964	1965	1966
PRIMARY						
Schools		235	240	241	247	251
Teachers		1305	1343	1364	1651	1673
Pupils		46536	55551	62839	66061	71546
SECONDARY						
Schools		6	8	8	9	9
Teachers		50	60	61	66	89
Students		764	976	1036	1307	1531
TEACHER TRAINING						
Colleges		1	2	2	2	2
Students		117	172	211	271	293
UNIVERSITY						
Students	6	19	45	48	44	66
RECURRENT EXPENDITURE						
Rand/Pula (millions)					0.69	0.92

	1967	1968	1969	1970	1971	1972	1973
PRIMARY							
Schools	252	257	280	282	286	311	308
Teachers	1713	1791	2037	2275	2404	2467	2698
Pupils	71577	78963	82214	83002	78442	81662	95511
SECONDARY							
Schools	9	10	10	11	13	15	26
Teachers	111	131	157	197	236	288	414
Students	1854	2299	3048	3905	5040	5564	8763
TEACHER TRAINING							
Colleges	2	2	2	3	3	3	3
Students	310	322	303	283	293	302	345
UNIVERSITY							
Students	103	121	146	204	254	N/A	264
RECURRENT EXPENDITURE							
Rand/Pula (millions)		2.2	2.47	2.92	3.56	4.15	6.27

	1974	1975	1976	1977	1978	1979	1980
PRIMARY							
Schools	316	323	335	349	376	394	415
Teachers	3047	3509	3921	4495	4641	4870	5316
Pupils	103711	116293	125588	137290	145459	156664	171914
SECONDARY							
Schools	29	29	32	32	35	36	38
Teachers	492	570	653	649	731	778	851
Students	10308	12098	13991	15325	16086	16716	18325
TEACHER TRAINING							
Colleges	3	3	3	3	3	3	3
Students	409	489	562	646	669	696	844
UNIVERSITY							
Students	365	465	537	520	762	860	928
RECURRENT EXPENDITURE							
Rand/Pula (millions)	6.16	8.69	12.02	15.92	20.98	27.48	N/A

	1981	1982	1983	1984	1985	1986
PRIMARY						
Schools	423	484	502	512	528	537
Teachers	5625	5767	6360	6794	6980	8324
Pupils	178107	188218	198328	209772	223608	235941
SECONDARY						
Schools	41	42	42	58	65	73
Teachers	921	984	1046	1216	1368	1619
Students	20168	20963	22252	27364	32172	34000
TEACHER TRAINING						
Colleges	3	3	3	3	4	4
Students	1020	984	948	999	1188	1317
UNIVERSITY						
Students	1022	1095	1195	1349	1773	2062
RECURRENT EXPENDITURE						
Rand/Pula (millions)	N/A	48.08	59.19	75.57	91.48	100

- Notes: Figures for teacher training include only full-time courses for primary teachers. (Secondary teacher training at Francistown TTC, the University, and Molepolole College of Education is not included.)
Figures for University students include all Botswana citizen students regardless of their country of study but the figures are not strictly comparable between years.
Education Statistics did not include private, community, and unaided secondary schools before 1973.
(This table therefore understates the number of secondary schools, teachers and students for the years 1968-72.)
Figures for recurrent expenditure are in current prices for each year - not adjusted for inflation.
- Sources: D. M. Lesetedi, A Summary of Education Statistics 1968-81 in M. Crowder (ed.), Education for Development in Botswana (Gaborone, Macmillan, 1984).
Education Statistics (Gaborone, Central Statistics Office, various years).
Report of the Education Department for the years 1965 and 1966 (Gaborone, Dec. 1966).
U. Kann, The Second University of Botswana - an evaluation of third country training (Gaborone, SIDA, 1980).
National Development Plan 1985-91.

REFERENCES

- Colclough C.
(1973) Manpower and Employment in Botswana; Ministry of Finance and Development Planning, Gaborone.
- Colclough C. and McCarthy S.
(1980) The Political Economy of Botswana; Oxford University Press, Oxford.
- Crowder M. (ed)
(1984) Education for Development in Botswana (Proceedings of a Symposium held by the Botswana Society); Macmillan Botswana.
- Ghai, D.
(1972) Labour and Economic Development in Botswana; Institute of Development Studies, Nairobi.
- Ministry of Education
(1984) Botswana Education in Brief; Government Printer, Gaborone.
- National Commission on Education
(1977) Education for Kagisano; Government Printer, Gaborone.
- Pickard O.G. (et al).
(1969) Further Education in Botswana; Ministry of Overseas Development, London.
- Swartland J.R. and Taylor D.C.
(1987) "Community financing of schools in Botswana - historical trends and contemporary issues" in Bray M. (ed.) (forthcoming) Community Financing of Education; Pergamon, Oxford.
- Van Rensburg, P.
(1974) Report from Swaneng Hill; Dag Hammarskjold Foundation, Uppsala.
- Van Rensburg, P.
(1984) Looking Forward from Serowe; Foundation for Education with Production, Gaborone.