

# TRANS FORM ATION

critical  
perspectives  
on  
Southern  
Africa

26



**EDITORS:**

Bill Freund, Gerhard Maré, Mike Morris (University of Natal),  
Vishnu Padayachee (University of Durban-Westville)

**CORRESPONDING EDITORS:**

Colin Bundy (University of the Western-Cape), Stephen Gelb, Shireen Hassim (University of Durban-Westville), Peter Hudson, Debbie Posel (University of the Witwatersrand), David Kaplan, Dave Lewis, Mary Simons (University of Cape Town), Francie Lund, Nic Amin (University of Natal), Mala Singh (CSD).

**INTERNATIONAL ASSOCIATE EDITORS:**

Henry Bernstein (SOAS, University of London), Gillian Hart (University of California, Berkeley), Mahmood Mamdani (Centre of Basic Research, Kampala), Martin Murray (SUNY Binghamton), Dan O'Meara (University de Quebec a Montreal), Terence Ranger (University of Oxford), John Saul (York University), Elling N Tjønneland (Christian Michelsen Institute, Norway), Gavin Williams (University of Oxford).

**LAYOUT BY :** Rob Evans

**PUBLICATION GUIDELINES:**

We ask contributors to submit two (2) typed copies, following the format (on such issues as references and notes) of articles in this issue of **TRANSFORMATION**. Whilst the journal will cater for work at any level of abstraction, or detail, a number of criteria will guide the editors in selection of material for inclusion. Articles should aim for academic rigour but also clarify the political implications of the issues discussed. We are concerned not to compete with other South African journals that may cover related ground but in different ways - this will govern our selection principles. All articles will be assessed anonymously by the referees. Contributions should preferably not exceed the following lengths:

**Analytical articles:** 7 000 words

**Debates and review articles:** 3 000 words

The views expressed in **TRANSFORMATION** do not necessarily reflect those of the editors.

**EDITORIAL AND CONTRIBUTIONS ADDRESS:**

**TRANSFORMATION**,  
c/o Economic History Department  
University of Natal  
King George V Ave  
4001 Durban South Africa

**SUBSCRIPTIONS RATES AND ADDRESS  
AT THE BACK OF THIS ISSUE.**

ISSN: 0258 - 7696

## CONTENTS

### Articles

*Three of our four lead articles in Transformation 26 are based on papers for the 1994 History Workshop. The theme of the workshop was democratisation.*

#### IDENTITY, DEMOCRACY AND POLITICAL RIGHTS: SOUTH AFRICA IN A COMPARATIVE PERSPECTIVE

**RAN GREENSTEIN** *proposes a rigorous comparative analysis of the discourse of liberation, majority rule, non-racialism and democracy in South Africa with that prevailing amongst Palestinians/Israelis. He argues that such comparisons rely on assessing specific historic configurations rather than any universal logic.*

#### THE AMBIGUITIES OF DEMOCRACY: THE DEMOBILISATION OF THE ZIMBABWEAN EX-COMBATANTS AND THE ORDEAL OF REHABILITATION, 1980-93

*What becomes of the insurgent army when the battle is won? This problem, which remains a sore point in the new South Africa, has represented a key issue in Zimbabwe since 1980. MUCHAPARARA MUSEMWA considers how and why demobilisation has been a failure to a large extent.*

**IN A STATE OF EMERGENCY: DEMOCRACY, POWER AND NATIONALIST DISCOURSE IN LESOTHO**

47

*Democratisation was the watchword amongst aid donors and pundits in Africa in the early 1990s and Lesotho was a prominent example of a country where military rule was replaced through free elections. What went wrong? DAVID B COPLAN insists that democratisation requires more than constitutional procedures with lessons for South Africa as well as Lesotho.*

**(RE)PRESENTING 'THE FAMILY' - FAMILIST DISCOURSES, WELFARE AND THE STATE**

63

*South Africa is awash with rhetoric about the restoration of family values and family structures. But 'familist' discourses that ignore the problems of women and place the burden of social stability on their shoulders may compound the collapse of the family, according to JACKIE SUNDE and VIVIENNE BOZALEK.*

## **Debates**

**UNRAVELING CHERRYL WALKER'S CONFUSION**

78

*ZARINA MAHARAJ responds to Cherryl Walker's critique.*

**HERE'S A FINE MESS; A RESPONSE TO BEN FINE'S 'ALTERNATIVE ASSESSMENT'**

84

*MATHEW BLATCHFORD defends Nicoli Natrass' assessment of ANC economic policies in response to Ben Fine.*

**A REPLY TO BEN FINE**

91

*by NICOLI NATRASS.*